Sectt. II-48—23,368—9-2-20.

Revenue (1920) Department.

(Special-war)

Ordinary SERIES.

~~G.O. No.~~ Letter No. 280

DATED 10— 9—20.

Indexed

17

[Despatch Abstract.]

BACK PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

FURTHER PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

War/

No. 445-War.

War Ct 1383
Rgd: 20.4.20.

Government of India.

HOME DEPARTMENT.

19 APR 1920

From

F.J.Nobes, Esquire,

Additional Under Secretary to the Government of India,

To

The Secretary to the Government of Madras,

Revenue (Special-War) Department.

Home Department
(War)

Simla, the 14th April 1920.

Sir,

x Return requested.

I am directed to forward (x in original) the accompanying representation from Captain C.Carroll (I.S.M.D. retired), who was in medical charge of the Civil Camp at Yercaud, in which he makes certain requests in respect of his pay and rank. I am to request that the Government of India may be favoured with an expression of the views of His Excellency the Governor in Council on the representation.

I have the honour to be,

Sir,

Your most obedient servant,

J Nobes 14/4/20.

Additional Under Secretary to the Government of India.

ECS

Scott. II—10 (a)—36,003—21-1-18. (6)

20

Law (Medical) DEPARTMENT.

3

READ AGAIN G.O. No. ...., dated .... 191 .

" " " " .... " .... 191 .

READ ALSO:—

C. No. 12332 Medl From ~~the~~ Rev Secy (War) G.O. No. 13836-1, dated 1. 5. 1920.

" " .... " " .... " .... " .... 191 .

" " .... " " .... " .... " .... 191 .

Memo ~~ORDER~~.

No. 1233-1 Medl, dated 5–5–1920.

5/5

Referred to the Surgeon-General for remarks.

4.5.20

4/5

5.5.20

6-5-20

To

6/5

The Surgeon-General (g & memo)
with the Current in original
to be returned with reply.

Call noted

8-5-20

C.V.Y. 6/5

21.

C.F.—29

Local and Municipal **DEPARTMENT.**

Received -7 JUN 1920 191 . Registered ~~7-6-~~ 1920. C. no. 1701 med

SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT ... AND MUNICIPAL DEPARTMENT

Subject.

Captain C. Carroll, I.M.D. (retired).

Returning the correspondence regarding the appointment etc., of ------------------------------- with remarks.

ENCLOSURES
No. Current file
Spare copies

No. 32 M/F.227

Station Ootacamund, Dated the 5th June 1920.

From (Name) The Honourable Major-General G.G.Giffard, C.S.I., K.H.S., I.M.S.,

(Designation) Surgeon-General with the Government of Madras.

To The Secretary to the Government of Madras,

Local and Municipal (Medical) Department.

Sir,

p20.

In returning herewith the correspondence regarding Captain C. Carroll, I.M.D. (Retired), referred for remarks with Government Memorandum No.N.C.1233-1 Medical, dated 5th May 1920 I have the honour to state that the Surgeon-General's Office knows nothing about the appointment of Captain Carroll or of the merits of the case.

I have the honour to be
Sir,
Your most obedient servant,

GGiffard

Major-General, I.M.S.,
Surgeon-General with the Government of Madras.

MD 7/6

Rev. Spl. War

nw
29/4

Petition from Captain C. Carrol,
(I.S.M.D. retired), medical officer,
Civil Camp, Trivandrum.

REGISTRAR
LOCAL & MUNICIPAL SECRETARIAT
-1 MAY 1920

(Cl. 1383) From the Govt. of India, Home
Dept., No 445-War of 14-4-20

Submitted that the Loc. (Medical) Dept may be requested to offer their remarks on the representation of Captain Carrol in consultation with the Surgeon General if necessary.

VNS
27.4.20.

KRV
28.4.20

LSM
29.4.20

Rev. Chl War No. 1383 W-1
1-5. 20.

C. No. 1233 Medl. W.S.
4-5-20

HSM
3/5

Loc. (Medical)

The remarks of the S. G. may be invited. A draft memo is submitted for approval.

HSM
4.5.20

K
4/5

LAC
5.5.20

W.S.

CMO OM No. 1233-1 Medl dated 5. 5. 20

CMO 1701 Medl from the S.G. No. 32M/T.227 d 5 6/20

Please see S.G.'s letter on p 21 cf. The

6 2

Wad
no
24/6

Case may now be returned to Revenue (Special) wo

Lww
21.6.20.

Ul
23/6

D/o
23/6

Rev Spl (w.o)

Ltr no no. 1701-1 Medl
23-6-20

Nva
24/6/20

Cr M. 2003 War
28/6/20

Rev Spl) war depth

Dr Carrol was appointed medical officer to the Jercaud camp in file (W) 1066 Pub d 29. 11.18. with the concurrence of Land on (medical) depth vide page 35-36 (W) of file 1066 Pub d 29.11.18. Presumably that depth did not consider it necessary to consult the Surgeon General then about the appointment. The Land on (medical) depth may be requested to state whether taking the services of Dr Carrol ~~into~~ in the Camp into consideration, his request may be favourably passed on to India.

Ref U.O. 2003 War-20-1
8.7.20

Su
6.7.20

Dp (l)

8.7.20

C. no. 2192 Medl
9-7-20

DP
9/7

8 JUL 1920

1 L & M (Medl)

vd/Sely

Captain Carroll's requests are contained in paras 2 and 3 of his memorial on p 15 C.F.

(E) 2 In their letter on p 5 of G.O. 343 Pub. dated 8th March 1915, the Govt. of India sanctioned the following concessions to retired officers of the I.S.M.D who are reemployed in the Civil Depts:- (a) Pension plus pay and privileges admissible under existing rules in the grade in which granted new employment. This grade should ordinarily be that in which the officer retired

(b) Period of ~~re~~employment terminable by either party at three months notice

(c) Reemployed service not to count for additional pension

(d) Free passages to place of employment.

3 Under the above orders two retired officers were reemployed in the grade of civil asst surgeons and granted a salary of Rs 100 + Rs 30 p.m. in addition to their pension (cf G.O. 77 Pension dated 2nd March 1915). (B) If Captain Carroll had similarly been appointed as a civil asst surgeon he would probably have been paid only Rs 100 + 30, the minimum pay of a civil asst surgeon. But he was not re-employed as a civil asst surgeon but

Ⓦ
p10 of G.O. 1066 Pub 29.11.18

only on piece work. In his letter dated 3rd. Augt 1918, the Dist. Magte Salem referre to Capt Carroll as a retired Railway Medl officer and recommended a fee of Re on per head of the camp population. In May 1918 there were 141 prisoners in the camp and the number was reported to be on the increas subsequently. The D.M's proposal was sanctioned in G.O. No 1066 Pub dated 29.11.18 and captain Carrol would have received allowance no less than what he would have received if he were re employed on monthly salary.

p4 ibid

p10 ibid

Ⓝ

4 It may be noted that Dr. P. M. Mathai who was medical officer of the Prisoners of War Camp Bellary was paid Rs 400 p.m. (G.O. 1256 Pub d 23.8.15) But probably the Bellary camp was much larger than the one at Yercaud.

Ⓢ

5 In regard to the promotion in rank requested by Capt Carroll, so far as this Dept is aware no such promotion has been allowed in the case of officers re-employed in the Civil Depts.

p15 cf.

6 In the above circumstances Captain Carrole dos not seam to have any real cause for grievance - As regards Captain Carroll's work in camp neither the S.G

nor this Dept. ~~was aware of~~ have any idea about it. In the absence of this information it does not seem possible to make a specific recommendation on behalf of Captain Carrol in this Dept. With these remarks the case may now be returned to Rev (Spl) Wo.

for 30/7/20 ✓ Sec

YL 30.7.20

A Wasn't Mr C.W. Legh Collector of Salem during the period Capt Carroll served at Yercaud? If so, the papers shd go to him now.

B. Is there no precedent regarding Capt Carrolls request at p. 15.? He says all other ISMD men re-employed as he was obtained the conclusion he now asks for

for 2/8/20

YL 1.8.20

WO Secy.

With reference to 'A' above it is submitted that Mr Legh was at Salem from 6.11.14. to 8.2.19 from which date he went on leave. Captain Carroll's appointment was approved only in the end of November 1918 and Mr Legh could know about ~~Captain~~ his

(W)
Go 1066 Pub.
29.11.18

work in the camp for only two months. His successor, Mr E. A. Davis is now on furlough. Capt Carrol's appointment ceased in the beginning of this year; so the present Collector, Mr Macqueen, who took charge only on 9.1.20, is also not likely to know much about the officer's work.

Mr Legh is the one who knows most about Capt Carrol and his claim. The papers may be sent to him u.o.

2 As regards 'B' on the previous page, Capt Carrol's requests are:-

1) Pay. He says that re-employed officers draw pay at the same rate as those of their rank on the active list. This is permissible under the orders on page 5 of G.O. 343 dy 8.3.15, but precedents are against him. Captains White and Monisse who were reemployed under these orders were paid only Rs 130 a month each. The latter was till lately is still employed in charge of the Lawrence Memorial School, Lovedale, and ~~draws~~ drew Pay Rs100, Ch. allce Rs30, Local allce Rs50. Major Lynsdale whose re-employment was recently sanctd in G.O. 78 R dy 8.6.20 draws only two ~~Local~~ allowances of Rs 200 and Rs 100 a month in addition to his pension. Capt. Carrol's request to be given Rs 450 (Pay of a Captain on the active list) is thus not supported by precedents.

Ⓔ

Ⓑ
G.O. 77 Rev
2.3.15

No 31 on p 27 of Rly Civil List.

Ⓣ

He has drawn at the rate of Rs 144 a month – p 9 cf.

2) Rank. Capt Carrol asks for promotion

to the rank of Major under Army Instruction 312 of 2-4-18. It is gathered from the Army List that he was promoted to the rank of Captain in 1904 and retired in 1907. With his subsequent service in the Yircaud Camp, he has completed 3 years' service in the rank of Captain and therefore seems eligible for promotion to the rank of Major if duly recommended. There are no papers on record in this office regarding the grant of this concession to any other officer but it is observed from the Civil Med list that Mily asst Surgeon Monisee, who was a Captain when first re-employed, is now styled Major.

p 17 C.F.

No 31 on p27 of Civil Med list.

KNR
7.8.20.

See

[illegible]
7/8/20

E. W. Legh Esq ICS [illegible]
for favour of remarks

7.8.20

Letter no. 2192-1 Med
9. 8. 20.

(Op C [illegible] only)

7/8.

P.T.O.

W
12/8

Resubmitted.

(2) The simple answer to the Request of Capt Carroll seems to me to be that he has never been "reemployed" in the sense intended by the orders on the subject and hence does not come within the concessions offered.

(3) By " reemployment " is intended I suppose the reengagement of the officer by the Government, he ~~placing~~ placing his full time at the disposal of the Government for a given salary.

(4) There has never been any such reengagement by the Government. On the other hand Capt Carroll undertook for a given rate per head to attend the prisoners in the Yercaud Camp being free to attend his ordinary work and other patients at other times.

(5) The arrangement was made between the District Magistrate and the officer and was only referred to Government as the charges to be incurred on be-half of the Camp had to be passed by them.

(6) Had the officer been reemployed his services would have been engaged through the Surgeon General in the ordinary course.

(7) Captain Carroll having been merely offered by us a very remunerative addition to his private practice in the place where he was living at the time, is in no sense to be held to have been reemployed or entitled to any concessions on that account.

R W Leigh
11/8/20.

C Revenue & P.M.

W
14.8.20

Reply to C.No 2003 War
3.7.20

P
14/8

C.No 2643 Medl.
16.8.20

L & M (Medl) Dept.

Submitted that this Dept may concur in ~~with~~ Mr Leigh's remarks above and return the case to Rev (Spl) U.O.

LAC
18.8.20

L&M U.O. No. 2643-1 Medl

24 AUG 1920

KRS
17.8.20

See
Rev. (Spl) U.O

W
20.8

Read in M.O. on 26.8.20

9

(Rev (spl) deptt

Draft letter to the Govt of India is submitted

6 SEP 1920
SPECIAL DEPARTMENT

5.9.20.

BRR
7/9

7.9

	Initials.	Date.
Received in Fair-copying Section.		
Copied ..		
Examined ..	Mg	8/9
Signed ..		
Despatched ..	CR	10/9/20

FRK

14 Revr Spl) war depth

Letter ~~[illegible]~~
mis No 280 d 10-9-20

To

The Secy to the Govt of
India Home Deptt
(with pp2-19CF in orgl)

To be given a mis No. & written despd /

Sir,

With reference to Mr Nobes' letter No 445 war d 14.4.20. I am directed to return the application of Captain C. Carroll (I.S.M.D retired) with the following observations:—

p1CF

Dphea 7/9

p17CF

Under Army Instruction (India) No 312 d 2.4.18 a re-employed Senior Asst Surgeon of the Indian Subordinate Medical Deptt who has completed three years' service in the rank of Captain is eligible for promotion to the rank of major. It is understood that Captain Carroll was promoted to the rank of captain in 1904 and that he retired in 1907. ~~With his subsequent~~

p2MF

If his service at ~~in~~ the Yercaud Camp is ~~taken into consideration~~ counted, he has completed three years' service in the rank of Captain and will therefore ~~seems~~ be eligible for promotion to the rank of major ~~if he is taken to have been re-employed~~. But I am to state that he was not regularly re-employed for ~~as~~ he did not place his full time at the disposal of Govt nor was he ~~re~~ in receipt of ~~in consideration of a given salary~~ a fixed salary. He ~~merely~~ undertook ~~for~~ at a ~~given~~ certain rate per head to attend ~~to~~ on the prisoners in the Yercaud Camp, ~~being~~ and was quite free ~~to attend~~ to attend to his ordinary work. ~~and other patients at other times. He This arrangement was merely an addition to his private practice.~~ This was merely an ~~purely private~~ arrangement between the Dt. Magistrate & the officer, ~~If he had been re-employed, the Surgeon-General would have issued the necessary order.~~ in which the Surgeon-General was not concerned. If he had been regularly re-employed, the S. G. would have issued the necessary order.

p. 8 N.F.

As he was not re-employed A.E. the Governor-in-council considers that he is not entitled to any of the privileges laid down in the Army Instruction (India) referred to above.

So
5.9.20

BRR
7.9

War 2714
23-9-20

No. 1784.

The undermentioned paper is forwarded to the Government of Madras in continuation of the Home Department letter No. 445-War, dated the 14th April 1920.

By order,

14/9/20.

Under Secretary to the Government of India.

p1 of letter 2280
10.9.20

(L)

HOME DEPARTMENT
20 SEP 1920
GOVT. OF MADRAS

Home Department,
(Police).

Simla, the 14th September 1920.

Letter from Captain C. Carroll, dated the 30th August 1920.

Lodged
So
23.9.20
29.9.20

(Our reply to India has already been despatched — Vide letter No 280 of 10-9-20)

(L)

Yercaud Shevaroys. S. India
Dy 30th August 1920

HOME DEPARTMENT
Br.
Regr. No.
Dy. No.
Recd.
INDIA

HOME DEPT.
Br. Police
Regr. No. 3501
Recd. 10.9.20.

Police

1679

From

Captain C. Carroll I.M.D. Retired

To

The Secretary to the Govt. of India
Simla

Sir

I would respectifully beg to ask what has been the result of my petition submitted to you on the 27th March 1920 together with other correspondence under cover of my letter dy 26th March 1920 but to which I have received no reply. As it is now five months since the petition was sent I have again ventured to address you on the subject trusting that no offence is being given and that you will kindly take my case into favourable consideration

I have the honor to be
Sir
Your most obedient servant

C Carroll
Capt I.M.D.
Ret.

When given for copying
When copied
When examined
When signed
192 .

READ AGAIN G.O. No. , DATED
192

17

CURRENT No.

ENCLOSURES TO C. No.

ORDER OF GOVERNMENT	A	A	A	A	A	A	A
LETTER OF GOVERNMENT.							
STATEMENT WITH DITTO.							
PAPERS NOT FILLED UP, BEING MEANT FOR DESPATCH IN ORIGINAL.							

N.B.—
A = Copy in full.
B = Not to be copied.
P = Copy abstract only.
Q = Copy heading only.