

Sec
Revenue (1897) Department.

G.O., No. 3155 & 3156

Confidential No. 948.

DATED 23 June 1897.

[Despatch Abstract.]

Ordering that a letter be despatched to the Government of India on the subject of the transfer to the Provincial Forest Service of an appointment in the class of Dy Conservator

BACK PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.
Gen	1575	Rev	23-3-97				

FURTHER PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.
Miss	4457	Rev	26-8-97				

Revenue (1897) Department.

Transfers to the Provincial Forest Service

CURRENT No. 49

From R. B. C. Carr Esq. J.C.

W.E. the Governor

Order

This do contains the full expression of the Forest Member's opinion of the respective merits of Messrs Eber Hardie & Alvan Chelti, called for in W.E.'s note flagged A. (in G.O. 15-75 25.3.97)

No. 32.

Dated 26 March 1897

Received

Registered

Enclosures

Spare copies

SUBJECT.

Submitting a note by the Forest Member regarding the merits of certain Forest officers.

The Forest Member considers Mr. Eber Hardie's claim the stronger, and the Collector, Mr. Stewart, speaks well of Mr. Eber Hardie. The question is whether the necessity of going through the course at Dehra Dun School of Forestry is so great as to entitle Mr. Alvan Chelti to pass over Mr. Eber Hardie. It is noted that the condition requiring the course at Dehra Dun was made after Mr. Eber Hardie had practically lost all chance of going there. His things con.

considered, I think Mr. Horner's name
should be submitted to the Govt. of India,
his case being somewhat fully stated.

R.H.
23.5.97

2

BACK PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

FURTHER PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

To.

His Excellency the Governor in Council
Fort Saint George
Madras.

Thro.

The Collector of

2

BACK PAPERS.

G.O.	No	Department.	Date.

FURTHER PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

D. O. No. 32

3

Revenue Board Office,
(Land Revenue),
MADRAS,

26th March 1897.

My dear Mr. Stokes

In compliance with your D.O. of the 23rd instant I am directed to submit for the information of His Excellency the Governor the accompanying note by the Forest Member containing a full expression of the Member's opinion as to the respective merits of Messrs Eber Hardie and Shwar Chetti.



Note by Forest Member

With reference to G.O. No. 1575 M.S., dated 23rd March 1897, I am asked for a full expression of my opinion of the respective merits of Messrs Eber Hardie and Shwar Chetti.

Both officers are well spoken of by the collectors and conservators under whom they have served, and so far as their work is concerned they both merit promotion when opportunity offers. Mr. Eber Hardie was entertained in March.

To.

His Excellency the Governor in Council
Fort Saint George
Madras.

Thro. The Collector of
Bellary.

The humble memorial of Mr. A. Eber Hardie Extra Assistant Conservator of Forest 1st grade, and Acting District Forest officer Bellary.

Most humbly shews:—

That the humble memorialist entered the Forest Department in 1883, strongly recommended by Mr. Hannington, British Resident Travancore, Major Hetcher Commandant Nair Brigade Travancore, and Mr. Pennington Collector of Tennevelly, as these gentlemen had known the memorialist as a hard working practical man, which reputation the memorialist has striven to maintain up to the present. Prior to ~~the~~^{or} entering the Forest Department the memorialist was a Planter and Engineering Contractor in Ceylon and Travancore and his knowledge of Engineering and Surveying

considered, I think Mr. Eber Hardie's name should be submitted to the Secy. Govt. of India, his case being stated fully stated.

R.9H
23.5.97

2

BACK PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

FURTHER PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

D. O. No. 31

3

Revenue Board Office,
(Land Revenue),
MADRAS,

26th March 1897.

My dear Mr. Stokes

In compliance with your D.O. of the 23rd instant I am directed to submit for the information of His Excellency the Governor the accompanying note by the Forest Member containing a full expression of the Member's opinion as to the respective merits of Messrs Eber Hardie and Shwar Chetti.



Note by Forest Member

With reference to G.O. No. 1575 M.S., dated 23rd March 1897, I am asked for a full expression of my opinion of the respective merits of Messrs Eber Hardie and Shwar Chetti.

Both officers are well spoken of by the collectors and conservators under whom they have served, and so far as their work is concerned they both merit promotion when opportunity offers.

Mr. Eber Hardie was entered in the March

28

L.

His Excellency the Governor in Council
Fort Saint George
Madras.

Thro. The Collector of
Bellary.

The humble memorial of Mr. A. Eber Hardie Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests 1st grade, and Acting District Forest officer Bellary.

Most humbly sheweth:-

That the humble memorialist entered the Forest Department in 1883, strongly recommended by Mr. Hannington, British Resident Travancore, Major Hetcher Commandant Nair Brigade Travancore, and Mr. Pennington Collector of Tinnevely, as these gentlemen had known the memorialist as a hard working practical man, which reputation the memorialist has striven to maintain up to the present. Prior to ^{or} entering the Forest Department the memorialist was a Planter and Engineering Contractor in Ceylon and Travancore, and his knowledge of Engineering and

new Scheme stopped such promotion. The
Madras Government did not send up the
name of any officer as there was no
vacancy in the grade of Extra Deputy
Conservator then, and besides it preferred
to deal with each case on its merits as it arose.

II That the case of the memorialist
comes exactly under the conditions con-
templated by the Government of India

III That there is only one single technical
point which can possibly be held to
stand in the way of the promotion of the
memorialist to the grade of Extra Deputy
Conservator, and that is that he does
not hold the Higher Standard certificate
in Forestry of the Shera Dan Forest School -
as per para 34 of the Forest Code new edition.

IV That this section was introduced
into the new code subsequent to the memorialist's
entering the Forest Department and should
not therefore be given retrospective effect;
to the prejudice of the memorialist, as
it stands in the way of the concession
held out by the Government of India
in the resolution above referred to,
and works an injustice to the memorialist.

IX

IX

That as a fact when the new code came
out, the memorialist pointed out to the Conservator
Mr. Cherry the new condition introduced into
para 34, and the Conservator replied that
it referred only to persons more recently
entrained and young enough to be sent
to the Forest School, and would not have
retrospective effect in the case of ~~the~~
memorialist.

X That the memorialist cannot believe
that the Madras Government would on
such a mere technicality refuse to reward
the memorialist's long and faithful service
of 14 years - more than 10 years of which
is as District Forest Officer, and stop all
further promotion in the face of the good
intentions of the Government of India
as set forth in its resolution.

XI That it is no fault of the memorialist
that he was not sent to the Forest School.
He asked to be sent, but the Tinnevely
District was then in such a backward
state that he was retained there to work it up.
The Conservator states that the memorialist
would not be affected by his not being
deputed, as long as he continued to
do good work, and advised him to learn

Forestry

M^r Eber Hardie's Case

15

640-10-4-96.

Revenue Board Office,

(Land Revenue),

MADRAS,

Chumy
Mocamund

14th May 1897

My dear Sir,

I send on herewith Eber
Hardie's Memorial and H. A. Stuart's
covering letter. I think I have already
put my opinion very definitely on
record, and I do trust that
Eber Hardie's claims will be
regarded by His Excellency in the
same light as they are by the Officers
of his own Department, by Collectors.

M^r Eber Hardie's Case

13

efficient District Forest Officer,
but on this point I can
give no personal testi-
mony as I have been
here such a short time
and have been unable
to pay much attention to
Forest matters. From the
little I have seen of his
work I should say that
he possesses the invaluable
quality of common sense,
which I venture to place
even higher than the

M^r Eber Hardie's Case

14
D.D.R. certificate.

Yours sincerely
H. Althwart

P.S. I should add that if
Alwan Chette is now put
over his head the super-
session will be a very
keen disappointment to
Eber Hardie who will have
nothing more to look for,
and an incentive to good
work will thus be taken
away.

Officers recruited in 1894
will arrive in 1897.

In my note of 26.1.97
on page 5 of the notes to
the Draft G.O. of the 23rd
March 1897 I expressly
draw attention to
the matter of "recruitment,"
but from para 6 of
H.E.'s note on the opposite
page I am not sure
that H.E. was free from
misapprehension on the
point when he decided
that the vacant Dy
Commissionership shd go
to the Provincial Service
& not to Cowley Brown.

As the point is all-
important I ^{think} request you
to bring it to H.E.'s notice
& obtain early order.

Wrote
25/5/97
To P.S. with file.
25/5/97

26

FOR ORDERS.

Note
The P.S. calls this a Draft
G.O. The G.O. has issued
But of course can be
reconsidered if H.E.
decision was given under
misapprehension
We
15/5/97

the argument, with you
please look it up and
have the point settled
before despatching the
G.O.

Yours sincerely,
H. S. Long

that I meant was that
1st July '91, a no. of new appointments
were suddenly added to the list;
& then for men who "arrived"
after July '91 could not complete
much of an occasional intake
was put in above their heads -
I have shown you
what the papers again to this
satisfaction, & he wishes me to
write to you, as above, and to
ask you to send up the Handbook



GOVERNMENT HOUSE,

My dear Stokes,
 When I said "recruited," I
 should have said "appointed in India."
 The places I have flagged 1-2-3-4-5.
 show that Gov. knew "recruitment"
 meant passing the home exam,
 and that they expected to waiting
 the full time, & proposed to make
 exceptional promotions of Provincial
 men in anticipation of it. Hence
 the Harrier's "raising".

30.1.1897



GOVERNMENT HOUSE,

Ad. Amund.

24. May 1897.

My dear Stokes,

With reference to
 the enclosed, which His Excell-
 ency has now disposed of,
 please look at the place
 marked blue on Davidson's
 draft. G.O. of 25. of March '97.
 There Davidson says that
 "Cowley Brown was recruited
 prior to the issue of Sir Ed-
 ward Buck's circular of July
 91," but in the Forest list Cowley
 Brown is entered as recruited
 in December 91, i.e. after the
 date of ^{his} circular. As this
 has a good deal to do with

W.H.
25/5/97

29

H.E. the Govt

Appd. A.H.
20.6.97

Issue
1897
23/9/97

Lead G.O. No 1575 dt 23.3.97

G.O. of 23rd June 1897 No 3155
 The following letter with 4
 despatches to the Govt of India

W.H.
2.6.97

Letter No 3156 Res.

To the Secy to the Govt of India
 Dept of Rev & Agri

Hi

With reference to the
 Correspondence luding with the
 Circular No 17. of 17. 11. 96
 Sublens ^{17. 11. 96} ^{20.6.97} dates
 4. Nov 96 & in continuation of our airmails letter No 2063 dt 20.6.97
 through Law directed to
 address the Govt of India as the
 subject of the transfer to the
 Provincial Forest service
 of an appointment of the
 class of Dz - Conservator.

2. H.E. the Govt

Recognises that it is the intention
 of the Govt of India that
 transfer from the Imperial
 to the Provincial service
 must be ordinarily made
 from the lowest class viz
 that of Asst Conservator. but
 observes at the same time
 that the Govt of India has in



para 4 of Mr Robertson's
Circular No. 21 F D 28. Oct. 95
~~letter dated above~~ signifies

that in exceptional circumstances there is no objection to the immediate transfer of an appointment of a higher grade provided that such a transfer be not inconsistent with "a scrupulous regard for the expectations of the Indian staff."

3. In consequence of the retirement of Mr Brougham, a Dy-conservatorship of the 4th grade is at present vacant. The senior officer in the grade of Asst conservator is Mr Cowley Brown. Mr Cowley Brown was recruited in England in 1888 but arrived in India in Dec 1891. After the issue of Sir E. Bunch's circular of the 29th July 91. moreover the Imperial service in Madras received during the same year a large accession in strength, the number of Dy Conservators being increased from 14 to 21.

prospects of promotion in the Imperial Service thereby so materially improved that, in the opinion of the Government, it would be prior to 1891 most reasonably to consider the immediate transfer of the Provincial service of one or two appointments of the grade of Dy Conservator, most especially in view of the fact that at the time of recruitment their possibilities of promotion in the Imperial Service being restricted by the limitation thereto of officers in the late Forest Service for going upwards in the grade to Junior that immediate transfer of Provincial service is justified by the creation of a Deputy Conservatorship of the fourth grade. Consideration is being given to the fact that



20

GOVERNMENT HOUSE

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS
26 MAY 1897Stamamund
May 1897.

para 4 of Mr Roberts
Circular no 21 F of 28. Oct. 95
letter quoted above, signifi-
cant in exceptional cir-
cumstances there is no
objection to the immediate
transfer of an appointment
of a higher grade from
that such a transfer
be not inconsistent
with "a scrupulous regard
for the expectations of the
Indian Staff."

3. In consequence of the
retirement of Mr Brough
a Dy-conservatorship of the
4th grade is at present
vacant. The senior officer
in the grade of Asst Conserv
is Mr Conley Brown. Mr
Conley Brown was recruited
in England in 1888 but
arrived in India in Decr
1895. After the issue of Sir
E. Boucher's circular of the
29th July 91. moreover the
Imperial service in Madras
increased during the same year
a large accession in strength
the number of Dy Conservators
being increased from 14 to

My dear Stokes,

The enclosed
letter might perhaps be added
to the record connected
with Eber Hardie's promotion
to the post of Extra Deputy
Conservator of Forests.

Yours sincerely,

L. S. M.

Aldrich Bangalore

22

Bromount 004

14th May 97.

GOVERNMENT OF MYSORE

Dear Mr. Eber Hardie

I am in receipt of
yours of 7th inst. and wish you every
success in your candidature for the extra
deputy Conservatorship for life.
I quite well remember the Christmas
you refer to which we spent at Kanakalli
Odeai under somewhat trying and
disagreeable circumstances but almost
after such a lapse of time call to
mind the conversation you refer to -
I have however no doubt that your
memory serves you well and being in
mind all the circumstances of the time
I am willing to accept and confirm
your statement that I did say that

31

The prospects of promotion
in the Imperial Service
were thereby so materially
improved that, in the
opinion of ^{the Govt} the Officer
recruited prior to 1891
cannot reasonably complain
of the immediate transfer
to the Provincial service
of one or two appointments
of the grade of Dy Conserv,
more especially in view of
the fact that at the time
of men recruitment there
was a possibility of their
promotion in the Imperial
service being restricted
by the appointment thereto
of selected officers in the
subordinate forest service.

4. The foregoing reasons
lead to the conclusion that
the conclusion that
an immediate transfer
to the Provincial service
should be effected by the creation
of an Extra Deputy Conservatorship
of the fourth grade.
This conclusion is confirmed
by the consideration that

These provinces, such as
Conservatorships have already
been created, whereas in
Madras the prospects of
the members of the Provincial
Service are not likely to
benefit by transfer in the
ordinary course from the
Imperial service for
~~many~~ years to come.

5. I am therefore to
quest the sanction of the
Govt of India to the
transfer of the Dy Conservator
ship vacated by Mr Braughan
to the Provincial Service,
as an Extra Dy Conservator
ship of the forests.

6. For this appointment
H.E. the Govt, after careful
consideration of the claims
of the various ^{officers} in the Forest
Controlling Staff, nominates
Mr C.A. Eber Hardie, the
senior ^{of grade} Dy Conservator.
Mr Eber Hardie has ^{an approved} service
of 14 years during eight of
which he has held the
post of a District Forest Officer.
Mr Eber Hardie does not now

uniformly acquit himself well.
He has a service

no statement that I had any

a Dehra Doon certificate
which is prescribed as a
qualification for promotion
in S.E. Border Circular
of the 29 July 1891 No 18 F. H.E.
The Govt consider however
that the want of this
certificate cannot in justice
be held to debar Mr Eber
Hardie from promotion, as
as he had for ~~an~~ ~~for some~~
~~an~~ ~~for some~~ years previous
as, at the time when this
qualification was prescribed,
Mr Eber Hardie had already
served for some years as
a District Forest Officer
was practically prevented
by the exigencies of the
service from obtaining
attempts to qualify for such
a certificate. H.E. the Govt
observes moreover that in
these provinces officers ~~without~~
who do not possess this
certificate have been promoted
to Extra Deputy Conservator
ships, viz Mr Mullanah in
the Central Provinces & Berar
(in 1883)
Allmark in Burmah (in 1886).

These circumstances his
the E m C books that his
Sent 7 India with ~~seats~~
has accept the nomination has
made.

Wht
2687
3/6/87

24

Press.

Signature.

atched.

HAD AGAIN G.O., N.
189

DATED

NUMBER OF COPIES
REQUIRED. { Order complete.
Letter only.
Order complete with Letter

Spare Copies.

Struck
Issued

Total ..

In hand ..

CLOSURES TO C. No.

EDS OF GOVERNMENT

ETER OF GOVERNMENT.

WITH DITTO

NOT FILED UP, BEING MEANT FOR DESPATCH
IN ORIGINAL.

N.B.-

A = Print in full.
B = Not to be printed.
P = Print abstract only.
Q = Print heading only.