C.F. 73.

Date taken out.	For what purpose.			Initials of clerk taking the paper or of attender.	Date returned.	Initials of attender.
	Department.	C. No.	Year.			

Revenue (1897) Department.

G.O., No. 1575 Mis.
Confidential No. 923.
Dated 23 March 1897

[Despatch Abstract.]

Passing orders on the question of transfer of certain Forest appointments from the Imperial to the Provincial service.

BACK PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.

FURTHER PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.
Mis	4873-44	Rev	15-9-97			
Mis	3153-B156	Rev	23-6-97			

Revenue (1897) Department.

CURRENT No. 193

From M. R. Ry.
V. Alwar Chetty Esqr.

Order

No.

Dated 7-1-97
Received 8-1-97
Registered 9-1-97.
Enclosures
Spare copies

Lodge
LP 197
QS

SUBJECT.

Praying for the post of a Dy. Conservator.

Bnn
21.1.97

Rec'd 9-1-97

BACK PAPE

G.O.	No.	Department.

FURTHER PA

G.O.	No.	Department.

REVENUE DEPT.
0032
SECT. GOVT. MADRAS. 18 JAN 97 REV. DEPT.

PETITION

To

HIS EXCELLENCY THE GOVERNOR IN COUNCIL,
OF FORT SAINT GEORGE,
MADRAS.

Through

THE DISTRICT FOREST OFFICER AND THE COLLECTOR OF SALEM,
AND
THE CONSERVATOR OF FORESTS AND THE BOARD OF REVENUE,
MADRAS.

The Humble Memorial of V. Alwar Chetty, Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, respectfully sheweth :—

That your Memorialist is a graduate of the Madras University and a Forest Officer of over 10 years' standing.

2. That your Memorialist was trained in the Imperial Forest school at Dehra Dun and passed first on the list of his year in 1889, and was the only student who was granted Certificate of Honor in that year.

3. That for about 6 years of his service, your Memorialist was District Forest officer, and served as such in Kistna, Bellary, Vizagapatam, Tanjore, Trichinopoly, North Arcot and Chingleput.

4. That your Memorialist's work in all these districts was approved of and appreciated by his superiors as the following references will show :—

(a) In the District of Kistna, the then Collector, the Honourable Mr. A. T. Arundel, remarked that your Memorialist did his work 'efficiently and intelligently'. The Board also in recording the Inspection notes on the Kistna District Forest office remarked* that the result of the inspection reflected credit on your Memorialist. When your Memorialist left that District Mr. J. N. Atkinson wrote to him in letter dated 24th February 1893 :— "I hope for the sake of these Forests that you will not leave this District permanently. Your services are too valuable to be lost without regret."

* B. P., No. 233 Misc: dated 16th February 1891.

Your Memorialist's successor Mr. A. W. Lushington remarked in letter dated 16th February 1893, "I am exceedingly sorry to lose you. If there is one thing more than another that I congratulate you for with regard to your work in this District, it is its thoroughness; and I know I am losing the services of a most reliable officer".

(b) In Vizagapatam, Mr. Wolfe-Murray considered that great credit was due to your Memorialist on account of his work (*vide* the Vizagapatam District Forest administration report for 1893-94).

(c) In Bellary, Mr. J. H. A. Tremenheere considered that much credit was due to your Memorialist for his work (*vide* the Forest administration report for 1894-95). In forwarding the Conservator's Inspection notes on the Bellary District read in Board's Proceedings Forest No. 133, dated 11th April 1896,

Mr. Tremenheere said, "I was very sorry to lose Mr. Alwar Chetti who materially increased the revenue of the District, and who, I think, might have succeeded with the leased Forests." Your Memorialist increased the Forest revenue of the Bellary District by more than 50 per cent. and more than quadrupled the receipts from grazing and *Tangedu*.

5. That, as regards his work in connection with sandalwood felling, on the Chitteris, the District Forest Officer, Mr. Brasier, was pleased to remark that he "was much obliged to the Extra Assistant Conservator for the prompt and energetic manner in which he supervised this work."

6. That, recently your Memorialist conducted an enquiry into certain charges of corruption and other malpractices against Forest subordinates in the Uttangarai Taluk and that both the District Forest Officer and the Collector have been pleased to record their appreciation of the manner, in which he performed that duty, as will be seen from the following extracts of the Proceedings of the Collector.

"The District Forest Officer states that the Extra Assistant Conservator has carefully and conscientiously carried out the investigation spending 25 days in camp alone to do so and examining 500 ryots; that he accepts his conclusions.

* * * * *

"The Collector thanks the Extra Assistant Conservator for his patient and impartial enquiry, which has been the cause of bringing guilt home to no fewer than 8 subordinates and which will, doubtless, operate as a warning and preventative to many others, who might be tempted to take to similar evil courses."

7. That your Memorialist learns that Mr. Brougham, Deputy Conservator of Forests, is shortly retiring from the service.

8. That your Memorialist learns from the Government of India Resolution published at page 465 of the Indian Forester for December 1895, that that Government is prepared to throw open the post of Deputy Conservators to the Provincial Forest service, if your Excellency's Government is pleased to recommend such a step.

9. That your Memorialist further learns from the official Gazette that a number of Provincial service officers have been appointed Extra Deputy Conservators in Burma.

10. That your Memorialist therefore most respectfully prays that the post of Deputy Conservator, now about to be vacated, may be made available to the Provincial service and that your Memorialist as a trained Forest Officer of over 10 years' standing, whose work has earned the good opinion of all his official superiors and as the first in the list of Provincial Forest officers eligible, under section 34 of the Madras Forest Code for promotion to the grade of Extra Deputy Conservator, may be appointed to it.

And your Excellency's Memorialist will, as in duty bound, ever pray.

Signed V. Alwar Chetty

Salem,
7th December 1896.

Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests.

Provincial Forest Service

True copy.

The memorial has been submitted through the proper channel.

V. alwar chetty
Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests

Salem
7.1.97

Revenue (1897) Department.

CURRENT No. 435

From The Board of Revenue. Land Revenue, Madras.

Order Forest No. 27 Mis,

Dated 14th January 1897.

Received 16th 1897

Registered 17th

Enclosures / Rm. E

Spare copies

SUBJECT.

Submitting for the orders of Government with remarks Memorial from K. R. Ry. V. Alwar Chetty garu, Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, Salem, requesting that the vacancy in the Class of Deputy Conservators which will shortly be caused by the retirement of Mr. Bromfield, may be transferred to the Provincial Service and that the step may be given to him.

Rm 06/1897.

BACK PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

FURTHER PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

DISTRICT FOREST OFFICE
RECEIVED
6 DEC. 96
SALEM.

To

HIS EXCELLENCY THE GOVERNOR IN COUNCIL,

OF FORT SAINT GEORGE,

MADRAS.

Through

THE DISTRICT FOREST OFFICER AND THE COLLECTOR OF SALEM,

AND

THE CONSERVATOR OF FORESTS AND THE BOARD OF REVENUE,

MADRAS.

The Humble Memorial of V. Alwar Chetty, Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests, respectfully sheweth :—

That your Memorialist is a graduate of the Madras University and a Forest Officer of over 10 years' standing.

2. That your Memorialist was trained in the Imperial Forest school at Dehra Dun and passed first on the list of his year in 1889, and was the only student who was granted Certificate of Honor in that year.

3. That for about 6 years of his service, your Memorialist was District Forest officer, and served as such in Kistna, Bellary, Vizagapatam, Tanjore, Trichinopoly, North Arcot and Chingleput.

4. That your Memorialist's work in all these districts was approved of and appreciated by his superiors as the following references will show :—

(a) In the District of Kistna, the then Collector, the Honourable Mr. A. T. Arundel, remarked that your Memorialist did his work 'efficiently and intelligently'. The Board also in recording the Inspection notes on the Kistna District Forest office remarked* that the result of the inspection reflected credit on your Memorialist. When your Memorialist left that District Mr. J. N. Atkinson wrote to him in letter dated 24th February 1893 :— "I hope for the sake of these Forests that you will not leave this District permanently. Your services are too valuable to be lost without regret."

* B. P., No. 233 Misc : dated 16th February 1891.

Your Memorialist's successor Mr. A. W. Lushington remarked in letter dated 16th February 1893, "I am exceedingly sorry to lose you. If there is one thing more than another that I congratulate you for with regard to your work in this District, it is its thoroughness; and I know I am losing the services of a most reliable officer".

(b) In Vizagapatam, Mr. Wolfe-Murray considered that great credit was due to your Memorialist on account of his work (*vide* the Vizagapatam District Forest administration report for 1893-94).

(c) In Bellary, Mr. J. H. A. Tremenheere considered that much credit was due to your Memorialist for his work (*vide* the Forest administration report for 1894-95). In forwarding the Conservator's Inspection notes on the Bellary District read in Board's Proceedings Forest No. 163, dated 11th April 1896,

Mr. Tremenheere said, "I was very sorry to lose Mr. Alwar Chetti who materially increased the revenue of the District, and who, I think, might have succeeded with the leased Forests." Your Memorialist increased the Forest revenue of the Bellary District by more than 50 per cent. and more than quadrupled the receipts from grazing and *Tangedu*.

5. That, as regards his work in connection with sandalwood felling, on the Chitteris, the District Forest Officer, Mr. Brasier, was pleased to remark that he "was much obliged to the Extra Assistant Conservator for the prompt and energetic manner in which he supervised this work."

6. That, recently your Memorialist conducted an enquiry into certain charges of corruption and other malpractices against Forest subordinates in the Uttangarai Taluk and that both the District Forest Officer and the Collector have been pleased to record their appreciation of the manner, in which he performed that duty, as will be seen from the following extracts of the Proceedings of the Collector.

"The District Forest Officer states that the Extra Assistant Conservator has carefully and conscientiously carried out the investigation spending 25 days in camp alone to do so and examining 500 ryots; that he accepts his conclusions.

* * * * *

"The Collector thanks the Extra Assistant Conservator for his patient and impartial enquiry, which has been the cause of bringing guilt home to no fewer than 8 subordinates and which will, doubtless, operate as a warning and preventative to many others, who might be tempted to take to similar evil courses."

7. That your Memorialist learns that Mr. Brougham, Deputy Conservator of Forests, is shortly retiring from the service.

8. That your Memorialist learns from the Government of India Resolution published at page 465 of the Indian Forester for December 1895, that that Government is prepared to throw open the post of Deputy Conservators to the Provincial Forest service, if your Excellency's Government is pleased to recommend such a step.

9. That your Memorialist further learns from the official Gazette that a number of Provincial service officers have been appointed Extra Deputy Conservators in Burma.

10. That your Memorialist therefore most respectfully prays that the post of Deputy Conservator, now about to be vacated, may be made available to the Provincial service and that your Memorialist as a trained Forest Officer of over 10 years' standing, whose work has earned the good opinion of all his official superiors and as the first in the list of Provincial Forest officers eligible, under section 34 of the Madras Forest Code for promotion to the grade of Extra Deputy Conservator, may be appointed to it.

And your Excellency's Memorialist will, as in duty bound, ever pray.

V. Alwar Chetty

Salem,
7th December 1896.

Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests.

Ref no 1719 Dated 9.12.96

Forwarded in forwarding this memorial I have much pleasure in again testifying to the careful & conscientious work of Mr. V. Alwar Chetti. As I have every reason to be satisfied with his work during the period – about a year – that he has worked in the District with me.

C. H. Tremenheere
A. Collector
Salem
7. 12. 96.

Forwarded to the Conservator C. C.
Since I took charge of the district in April last Mr. Alwar Chetty's work as E. A. C. has been on the whole very satisfactory.

T. Cowley-Brown
A. D. F. O.

8/12/96

Tro. 932

Forwarded. The Conservator endorses the commendatory remarks of the various officers. Mr. Alwar Chetty has ability, is energetic and takes an active and intelligent interest in his work.

E. Wood
Conservator of Forests
Central Circle

Camp Tarakyan
12 Dec 1896

DESPATCHED
16 DEC. 96

OFFICE OF THE CHIEF CONSERVATOR OF FORESTS, MADRAS.
Current No. 1317
10 DEC. 96

1897
REVENUE DEPARTMENT.
Enclosure No 2
To Current No. 4772

REVENUE BOARD OFFICE
MADRAS.

Proceedings of the Board of Revenue

(Land Revenue),

Dated 14th January 1897.

Forest No. 27 ——— Miscellaneous.

READ Endorsement of the Conservator of Forests, Central Circle, dated 12th December 1896, No. 852 forwarding with remarks, M. R. Ry. Alwar Chetty's Memorial for promotion to the grade of Extra Deputy-Conservator.

———

Resolution

Submitted for the orders of Government.

2. Mr. V. Alwar Chetty, Extra Assistant Conservator 2nd grade, requests that the vacancy in the class of Deputy Conservators, which will shortly be caused by the retirement of Mr. Brougham, may be transferred to the Provincial Service, and that the step may be given to him — (Mr. Alwar Chetti) as the senior Extra Asst. Conservator who is qualified under the terms of

Section 34

Section 34 of the Code for promotion to an Extra Deputy Conservator's post.

3. The Board does not fully understand the manner in which the transfers from the Imperial to the Provincial Service are to be regulated, but it appears from the terms of the Government of India Resolution, communicated in Government Order No. 680 dated 1st December 1896 that future transfers will be ordered by the Government of India as Extra Assistant Conservatorships of the 2nd grade becomes available. It would also seem from para 4 of the letter from the Secretary to the Government of India dated 28th October 1895 Cir. No. 21 / 72-10 that so long as the claims of officers on the Imperial List are duly considered, promotion may be given in special cases to Extra Assistant Conservators already in Service.

4. The Board considers that no transfer of an appointment in the Deputy Conservator's class should be made until all the Assistant Conservators who joined the Department in 1891 have received promotion. There are two such officers. viz- Messrs. Cowley Brown & Mac O'Leary- in the Assistant Conservators' class. In 1892 no Assistant Conservator was appointed, and the men of 1893 and subsequent years cannot complain if one at least of the Extra Assistant Conservators appointed in 1891 is given promotion to the rank of Deputy Conservators before them. The Board would therefore suggest the transfer to the Provincial Service of one Extra Deputy Conservatorship as soon as Messrs. Cowley Brown & Mac O'Leary have been promoted.

Names who came out in 1894 were nominated in 1891

5- As regards the respective claims of Messrs. Eber Hardie and Alwar Chetti, the Board would invite the attention of Government to its Proceedings No. 23 dated 8th January 1896 and 287 dated 24th February 1896. The Board remains of opinion that Mr. Eber Hardie, who is the senior officer on the Extra Assistant Conservators' list, should receive the first appointment thrown open in the Extra Deputy Conservators' class.

6. The Board is not aware whether separate instructions have been received from

from the Government of India as to the regulation of the pilot appointments to be transferred from the Punjab to Madras.

(True Extract)

Reclam

Secretary

To.

The Secretary to Government, R.D.
and Endorsements
with Memo in original

D 4 1,000--11-6-96.

Provincial Forest Service
(MRR. Alwar Chetty's memorial)

REVENUE DEPARTMENT.

C. No. 435 of 99

From the Board of Rev: Land Rev:

Dated 14th Jany 1899.

To H.E. the Governor
The Hon: Mr Grose C.S.I.
The Hon: Mr Bliss C.S.I.

FOR ORDERS.

I understand this G of I when they command attention to their prior claims of officers who came out to India before and by 1896 to mean that they must be promoted first if they are fit for promotion & there is no valid objection to their being promoted. Accordingly the 11 Assts. Conservators must all be promoted if they are fit before the Extra-assists. Can be promoted and they after Controlling Conservators. This is hard on our Assist Conservators who can not expect promotion to the class of Extra. Deputy Conservators till 1902 or later, but we brought this matter to the Notice of India in our letter of the 11.2.95, & it was after considering it that they passed their Ref. of the 4.11.96, & we can do nothing more. So Mr Conry-Brown× flagged A must be appointed now. When the G of I

C. 26/1/99 I Letter we may make

The Board submits with its remarks the memorial received from MRR. Alwar Chetty a duplicate of which has been already submitted to Govt. on the subject of his promotion to the grade of extra. Dy Conservators in other the vacancy caused by Mr Broughton's retirement.

2. A note on the subject was called for by H.E. a few days ago but its submission was delayed as it was understood at the time that the memorial in question was under consideration in the Board's Office and would be submitted to Govt shortly.

3. The Board now in forwarding the memorial states that it has not clearly understood the recent Circular of the Govt

4

of India regarding the recruitment of the Provincial Forest Service but that as far as it understands it, future transfers from the Imperial to the Provincial Service are to be "ordered by the Govt of India as Extra(ex) "Asst Conservatorships of the 2nd Grade "become available" and that "so long "as the claims of ~~the~~ Officers on the "Imperial list are duly considered, "promotion may be given in special "cases to Extra Asst Conservators "already in Service". The Board also expresses its opinion that no such transfers should be made until all the Officers who joined the Dept in and before 1891 are provided for and suggests that after Messrs Cowley Brown and O'Leary of the 1891-batch are promoted, a transfer of a Dy Conservatorship from the Imperial to the Provincial list may be made.

4 As regards MR Alwar Chetty's contention that he, as the Senior qualified Extra Asst, should get promotion to the Extra Dy Conservator's Grade in preference to any other officer in the list, the Board says that it sees no reason to modify

and explains, assists, and assists. It will be for their Excellencies to decide between both claims of MR Chetty, as reference being made to the date of MR Alwar Hardie is chosen.

JG
28.1.97

Note: The word "Extra" has evidently been added here by mistake and should apparently be omitted; ~~if not the words "become available" should be omitted~~

I find this a difficult question to solve, the question being whether the promotion caused by Mr. Broughton's retirement should be given to the Imperial or to the Provincial Service. As no pressure advised, I cannot quite follow the Hon. Mr. Grose when he says that Mr. Cowley-Brown must be appointed now.

The grounds for not giving the promotion to Provincials seem to be:-

(i) That the Govt. of India contemplates making the transfers to Provincial gradually and from the bottom:- not by a jump straight into a Deputy-Conservatorship (Letter 8 in Flag F)

(ii) That the Govt. of India anticipates "a "reasonable regard for the due expectations "of the Indian Staff to", i.e. the existing Imperial Staff (passage marked red in Flag F)

The grounds for giving the promotion to Provincial seem to be:-

(a) That the Madras Govt. pointed out (in (in Flag E) that it might be necessary to promote Provincial men sooner than the rules seemed to anticipate; if provincial men were to get promotion, as the Proposed steps (Flag U), before they were grey-headed.

(b) That the Madras Govt. (in the same Flag E) pointed out that Imperial Officers, recruited subsequent to the date of Sir E. Buck's Circular of July 1891, could have no legitimate grievance if this were done, - that indeed, it would be hard not to do it.

(c) That (a) and (b) above were expressly accepted by the Govt. of India in para. 4 of their letter in Flag E, and in para 6 of the Resolution, and in para 6 of the second letter in that Flag, and that India would it would reiterate recommend action to that effect.

(d) That, as the Table in para. 1 of the Indian Resolution in Flag A shows, ~~flagged~~ most of the other Provinces of India started with certain appointments

flagged B.

already transferred to the Provincial Service; while Madras had none.

(e) That in 1891, the appointments open

3

modify the opinion expressed by it in its (second) Prop: under G.O. 2062 dy 28th May 1896, and that MR Alwar Hardie should receive promotion first. The Board also takes this opportunity to enquire whether "instructions "have been received from the Govt "of India as to the regulation of "the pilot appointments to be trans- "ferred from the Punjab to Madras".

5. As regards powers not ~~delegated by the Board~~, the orders issued by the Govt of India on the subject of the recruitment of the Provincial Forest Service are it is submitted rather inadequate and sometimes slightly inconsistent. The first order in which it was decided that 40 appointments out of the total 193 in the Upper Controlling Staff should be thrown open to Provincial men was issued in July 1891 (G.O. 793 dy 27th Augt 1891). In the subsequent communication sent out in October 1896, the Supreme Govt pointed out that the ~~above~~ order could not be given and 1855-

and

until the legitimate claims have been satisfied of all members of the ~~former~~ Imperial service who were recruited before the transfer of the forty posts was decided upon and the home recruitment actually reduced accordingly". He added that "this reduction in the recruitment has been made with effect from the current year" and that as "Officers recruited in 1896 will arrive "in India in 1897" x x "before an "appointment is transferred from the "Imperial to the Provincial Service "the prior claims of all home recruited officers who commenced their "service before the close of the year 1896 "must be carefully considered".

Previous to 1891, the number of Conservators and Dy Conservators in Madras was 2 and 14 respectively while at the reorganisation of the Dept in that year this number was raised to 3 and 21 respectively. ~~The number of Asst Conservators from 10 to 12~~ The question as to what claims the officers recruited from England previous to 1891 should be considered to ~~to~~ any ~~th~~ in respect of these says that appointments was not

open to the Imperial Staff in Madras were increased 50 p.c. [Deputy-Conservators being increased from 14 to 21], and that the Imperial men having received the benefit of this large and unexpected increase, have no right to complain if a portion of the benefit is allotted to Provincial.

(7) Mr. Cowley. Brown whom the Hon. Mr Gross proposes for promotion came to India in Dec. 1891.

The above considerations seem to me to show that a step might now, with justice, be taken to the Provincial Service. Perhaps the Hon. Mr. Gross would look into the question once again, as illustrated by the considerations I have set forth.

A.S.H

7.2.97

Having gone through the papers again I think it would be fair to give two appointments to the Provincial Service, & that it

x vide pp of 1.05 flagged C and D

would be unjust both not to do so.

JG

23/2/97

---

x flagged E

+ What is meant by the expression recruited from England has been causing us this month: A Forest officer who is selected in England does not come to India for 3 years. Thus a man who was recruited in England in 1891 before the change went to India in 1894 would fairly be entitled to Consideration.

24/2/97

@ flagged F

not considered at the time. This Govt., however pointed out that the transfer of the forty appointments from the Imperial to the Provincial list having been decided upon in Sir Ed Buck's Cir: of July 1891, no officer recruited from England subsequent to the date of the issue of that Cir: could have any legitimate grievance if the above decision was given effect to. It also expressed its opinion that subject to the proviso that all Officers recruited before that date should have their claims carefully considered the promotion of deserving officers should be left "at the discretion" of local Govts.

6. In its Cir: of Oct 1896 and the draft of a general Circular therewith forwarded, the Govt of India reviewed the whole position, stated that "on a consideration of the Indian list in 1890 it was decided that it was possible, consistently with all due regard for the interests of the existing staff to transfer 12 appointments to the Provincial list between 1891 and 1895 and

and the home recruitment was re-adjusted ~~on~~ on this basis" and asked the local Govts to submit proposals, as it would "be possible without injury to vested interests to make some 8 or 10 transfers at once". These circulars and the Board's report thereon have been ~~fully~~ noted on in the notes stitched with G.O. 2062 dy 28th may 1896 to which attention is solicited. Both in the B.P. and in the Office note, however, the point on which stress was laid was that there would be no retirements in Madras in consequence of the concession of the more favourable pension rules and consequently there would be no vacancy; and the statement that ~~the~~ of the Govt of India that the home recruitment between 1891-95 was so adjusted as to throw open 12 Imperial appointments to Provincial men was overlooked or rather not clearly understood at the time. In letter No. 2063 dy 28th May 1896 India was in these circumstances merely informed that no early retirement was anticipated then and that when vacancies actually occurred "H.E. the Governor in Council would in filling them up give due regard to the claims of the Indian and Provincial Services".

7. The 12 Imperial appointments available for the Provincial men throughout India has since been increased in rank ~~should apparently be considered to have been raised~~ to 15 by the creation (recently) of 17 additional appointments in the Upper Controlling Staff of Burma ~~and by providing that three of these should~~ of which three are to be transferred to the Provincial Service. Of these 15 appointments 12 have been already transferred. The question however whether any of the remaining three can be transferred to Madras can it is submitted be (only) decided by the Govt of India which adjusts the home recruitment without consulting (except in a general way) the local Govts in the matter. As already stated in para 6 of the present

present note,
as the question as to how far the
Officers recruited in 1891 and pre-
viously should be considered to have
claims in respect of the additional
appointments ~~has~~ was ~~nowhere~~
created in that year has nowhere
been definitely discussed. It will
be seen that while the strength
of the staff of Conservators and Dy
Conservators in this Pres.y was
both increased in that year by
50 p.c. ~~the~~ the increase in the number
of Asst Conservators ~~was only 20~~
~~p.c.~~ It seems therefore that the
Officers of 1891 and of the years
immediately preceding can hardly
be considered to have a legitimate
claim to all the appointments which were
not in existence at the time of
their recruitment but which were
subsequently created. In these
circumstances it seems open to
this Govt, if it deems it necessary
or desirable, to address the Govt of
India ~~and get~~ an Imperial ap-
pointment ~~transferred~~ to the Provincial Service.

	Before 1891	after 1891
Conservator	2	3
Dy Conservator	14	21
Asst Conservator	~~10~~ 10	~~12~~ 10
	26	~~36~~ 34

* including 2 supera

8. As regards the
relative claims of Messrs Eber
Hardie and Alwar Chetty, the
point

~~point has~~ has already been ~~already~~ discussed
in the notes stitched with G.O.
2062 dy 28th May 1896. The only
rule that only ~~extra~~ such of
the Extra Asst Conservators as
have got the D.D.R certificates
should be promoted to the grade
of Extra Dy Conservators was
laid down by the Govt of India
in consultation with the several
local Govts (vide G.O. 1018 dy 3rd
Oct 1892) and any departure
therefrom will require the sanc-
tion of that Govt.

9. The Office was
and the Board seems to be still
under a misapprehension in
regard to the transfer of the
two appointments of ~~Extra~~ Asst
Conservators ~~appointment~~ from
the Punjab to Madras. From paras
3 and 4 of the Circular printed
in G.O. 680 dy 1st Dec.r 1896 it
will be seen that the Govt of India
takes upon itself the responsibility
of transferring all appointments
from the Imperial to the Pro-
vincial list and from the in-
formation therein given it is clear
that

12/3/97

that local govts can at no time say how or when the pilot appointments are to be created. This is: is it is submitted clear enough and it seems therefore unnecessary now to ask the govt of India as to the regulation of the pilot appointments to be transferred from the Provincial

W.M.M. 21.1.97

10. The actual transfers of appointments from the Imperial to the Provincial Service apparently require the sanction of the Govt of India; the question who shall hold an appointment so transferred is one for the sole consideration of H.E. the G. in C. - unless, as in the case of Mr Eber Hardie, the officer whom it is proposed to appoint is not eligible under the rules approved by the Govt of India to hold the appointment. The first question for consideration is whether the appointment vacated by Mr Brownlow shd be filled by an officer of the Imperial Service or whether that appointment shd be transferred at once to the Provincial Service as an Extra Dy Conservatorship. - Such a transfer could not be made in the ordinary course in pursuance

† Mr Eber Hardie tells me privately that these rules are laid down only after he joined the Dept and apparently after these appts are thrown open by lowering his class. Mr Eber Hardie was always I believe known as speaking of his own class. Excellent work for forest as a distr Forest Officer.

17/6/97

of the Resolution of the Govt of India, for that Resolution contemplates an initial transfer from the lowest grade - that of second grade Assistant Conservator - not to an initial appointment or transferred rises in the list to the level of the last fourth grade Dy Conservatorship that an Extra Dy Conservatorship created to the Provincial Service.

Now in Madras according to the list for the month of December, the Imperial & Provincial Services were constituted as under, the ultimate strength after all transfers have been effected being shewn in red ink:—

	Imperial		Provincial	
Conservators.	3	3	nil	—
Dy Conservators & selected Dy Conservators	21	15	nil	6
Asst Conservators & Extra Asst Conservators	11	8	11	15

The junior Asst Conservator is now No. 35 on the Imperial list (Mr Dawson), the junior Dy Conservator (Mr Bryant) is number 24. - It seems clear that no reduction in recruitment for Madras has been effected with a view to facilitating the transfer of

ch appointments to the Provincial Dist.
sc The keep so, ~~to transfers to the~~
en ~~posts~~ ~~to the~~ no fresh extra-
is Asst. Conservatorships can be
a created to fill up vacancies due to
en short recruitment; two such appointments
to may be created when the Govt. of India
ap transfers to Madras the two Passed
etc appointments in that grade which are
"eventually" to be transferred; vacancies
25. may arise in a third way, however,
fro namely by the death or retirement
app of officers in the Imperial service.
God Mr. Broughton's retirement does not
hot however create such a vacancy, for as
one it appears necessary in the ordinary
the course to promote Mr. Cowley-Brown
Mr (No. 25) to the grade of Dy Conservator
ap - the Mr. Cowley-Brown's promotion
and only reduces the number of Imperial
of Asst. Conservators to 10 - i.e. 2
the more than their ultimate strength
wh as regards (a) Mr. Cowley-Brown
Mr was recruited in England by examination
Offc in June 1888 & actually appointed to
wh the Forest Dept. in Dec. 1891. His
transf recruitment having taken place long
Serv before it was decided to transfer appoint-
- Sa - ments from the Imperial to the
an Provincial Service, it would seem that

he has prior claims within the meaning of para 4 of Mr. Ribbon's letter No. 80 J/11. 2. 91. As to the nature of these claims it may however be urged that as Mr. Cowley Brown is a Madras officer the rules of July 1891 cannot be regarded as other than advantageous to him, even if the Dy Conservatorship be transferred to the Provincial Service. For, on July 1891, the number of Dy Conservator-ships in Madras was raised from 14 to 21. There was thus an actual increase at the time of 7 appointments of which 6 was proposed ultimately to transfer 6 to the Provincial Service. - In the end of 1891 however four Officers including Mr Cowley-Brown were appointed to Madras - which seems to shew that the recruitment has designed & increased to provide for the increase in the strength of the service. - ~~The question whether the appointment from extra Dy Conservatorship to Mr Broughton's vacancy~~ Dy. It is thus an arguable question whether or not the transfer of Mr Broughton's appointment to the Provincial Service would be inconsistent with

12/3/97

ch appointments to the Provincial dist.
sc The being so, ~~to transfer to the~~
en ~~grade to be no~~ no fresh extra-
is Asst. Conservatorships can be
a created to fill up vacancies due to
en short recruitment; two such appointments
to may be created when the Govt. of India
ap transfers to Madras the two Punjab
ch appointments in that grade which are
"eventually" to be so transferred; vacancies
21 may arise in a third way, however,
fro namely by the death or retirement
app of officers in the Imperial service.
God Mr. Broughton's retirement does not
he however create such a vacancy, for (a)
one it appears necessary in the ordinary
the course to promote Mr. Cowley-Brown
Mr (No. 25) to the grade of Dy. Conservator
ap - the Mr. Cowley-Brown's promotion
and only reduces the number of Imperial
of Asst. Conservators to 10 - i.e. 2
the more than their ultimate strength
wh As regards (a), Mr. Cowley-Brown
Mr was recruited in England by examination
Offi in June 1888 & actually appointed to
wh the Forest Dept. in Dec. 1891. His
tran recruitment having taken place long
Serv before it was decided to transfer appoint-
- Sa - ments from the Imperial to the
on Provincial Service, it would seem that

he has prior claims within the meaning of para 4 of Mr. Gibson's letter No. 80 ~~of~~ 11. 2-91. As to the nature of these claims it may however be urged that as Mr. Cowley Brown is a Madras officer the orders of July 1891 cannot be regarded as other than advantageous to him, even if the Dy. Conservatorship be transferred to the Provincial Service. For, ~~on~~ since July 1891, the number of Dy. Conservatorships in Madras was raised from 14 to 21. There was thus an actual increase at the time of 7 appointments of which it was proposed ultimately to transfer 6 to the Provincial Service. - In the end of 1891 however four officers including Mr. Cowley-Brown were appointed to Madras - which seem to show that the recruitment was designed & increased to provide for the increase in the strength of the service. - ~~The~~ Dy. ~~question whether the appointment from Extra Dy. Conservatorship to Asst. Conservancy~~ It is thus an arguable question whether or not the transfer of Mr. Broughton's appointment to the Provincial Service would be inconsistent with

R 22/3/91

appointments to the Provincial dist.
so. The keep so, ~~to transfer to the~~
~~grade to trans~~ no fresh extra-
ord. Conservatorships can be
created to fill up vacancies due to
short recruitment; two such appointments
may be created when the Govt. of India
transfers to Madras the two Imperial
appointments in that grade which are
"eventually" to be so transferred; vacancies
may arise in a third way, however,
namely by the death or retirement
of officers in the Imperial service.
But Mr. Broughton's retirement does not
however create such a vacancy, for as
it appears necessary in the ordinary
course to promote Mr. Cowley-Brown
(No. 25) to the grade of Dy. Conservator
- the Mr. Cowley-Brown's promotion
only reduces the number of Imperial
Asst. Conservators to 10 - i.e. 2
more than their ultimate strength
As regards (a), Mr. Cowley-Brown
was recruited in England by examination
in June 1888 & actually appointed to
the Forest Dept. in Dec. 1891. His
recruitment having taken place long
before it was decided to transfer appoint-
ments from the Imperial to the
Provincial Service, it would seem that

he has prior claims within the
meaning of para 4 of Mr. Ribbon's
letter No. 80 of 11. 2. 92. As to
the nature of these claims it may
however be urged that as Mr
Cowley Brown is a Madras officer
the orders of July 1891 cannot be
regarded as other than advantageous
to him, even if the Dy. Conservatorship
be transferred to the Provincial Service.
For, on July 1891, the number of Dy. Conserva-
-tors on Madras was raised from
14 to 21. There was thus an actual
increase at the time of 7 appointments
of which it was proposed ultimately
to transfer 6 to the Provincial
Service. - In the end of 1891 however
four officers including Mr Cowley-
Brown were appointed to Madras
- which seems to shew that the
recruitment has designed increased
to provide for the increase in the
strength of the service. - ~~It is~~
~~questionable whether to appointment~~
~~from which Dy. Conservatorship~~
~~as Broughton's vacancy~~ It is
thus an arguable question whether
or not the transfer of Mr. Broughton's
appointment to the Provincial
Service would be inconsistent with

15/3/91

"a scrupulous regard for the due
"expectations of the Indian Staff".
It is difficult to say what Mr Cowley
Brown's "due expectations" are. When
he was appointed to Madras in December
1891, the circular of July 1891 was out
& he cannot have been aware that
transfers to the Provincial Service would
soon be effected. When he was first
recruited in June 1888, there was nothing
to prevent Extra Asst. Conservators
being appointed to the Imperial Service
in Madras; Mr Marshall was within
an ace of appointment. viz; at the
same time (1888) an officer promoted
to Madras had only 16 higher appointments
to look to for promotion; in 1891
the number was raised to 24.
If, however, Govt. & Govt. consider that
Mr Cowley Brown has no prior
claim to Mr Broadhurst's vacancy,
it will seem possible, with reference
to para 4 of Mr Hobhouse's letter
of 28.10.95 in Govt. No 4599 of 15.
11.95, to recommend to the Govt of India
a deviation from the ordinary rule
that transfers to the Provincial
Service shall begin at the
bottom with second grade Asst.
Conservatorships, & to request
sanction for the immediate creation
of an Extra Dy Conservatorship in
consequence of Mr Broadhurst's retire-
ment, for the benefit of either
Mr Eber Bardie or Mr Alwar
Chetty, whose case it will be
necessary to set out at length. —
If this course is not adopted &
Govt consider that all officers
recruited in England prior to July
1891 must become Dys Conservators
before a Provincial Extra Dy
Conservatorship can be created, &
the Extra Asst Conservators can
hope for no promotion until
more vacancies have arisen &
No. 31 (Mr Batchelor) is a Dy
Conservator. The
Dy
26.1.97

[illegible]

15 22/3/97

Office of the Board of Examiners,

MADRAS,

2nd Feb. 1897.

My dear Sir

With reference to our conversation yesterday you will see that in B.P $\frac{27}{14\text{-}1\text{-}97}$ the Board reiterated its opinion that Eberhardie had the first-class extra Deputy Conservatorship.

From B.P $\frac{287}{24\text{-}2\text{-}96}$ you will see the good opinion formerly expressed of his work by Col. Campbell Walker Conservator of the Southern Division.

(b) In Vizagapatam, Mr. Wolfe-Murray
due to your Memorialist on account of his wo
Forest administration report for 1893-94).

Mr. Tremenheere said, "I was very sorry to lose Mr. Alwar Chetti who materially increased the revenue of the District, and who, I think, might have succeeded with the leased Forests." Your Memorialist increased the Forest revenue of the Bellary District by more than 50 per cent. and more than quadrupled the receipts from grazing and *Tangedu*.

5. That, as regards his work in connection with sandalwood felling, on the Chitteris, the District Forest Officer, Mr. Brasier, was pleased to remark that he "was much obliged to the Extra Assistant Conservator for the prompt and energetic manner in which he supervised this work."

6. That, recently your Memorialist conducted an enquiry into certain charges of corruption and other malpractices against Forest subordinates in the Uttangarai Taluk and that both the District Forest Officer and the Collector have been pleased to record their appreciation of the manner, in which he performed that duty, as will be seen from the following extracts of the Proceedings of the Collector.

"The District Forest Officer states that the Extra Assistant Conservator has carefully and conscientiously carried out the investigation spending 25 days in camp alone to do so and examining 500 ryots; that he accepts his conclusions.

* * * * *

"The Collector thanks the Extra Assistant Conservator for his patient and impartial enquiry, which has been the cause of bringing guilt home to no fewer than 8 subordinates and which will, doubtless, operate as a warning and preventative to many others, who might be tempted to take to similar evil courses."

7. That your Memorialist learns that Mr. Brougham, Deputy Conservator of Forests, is shortly retiring from the service.

8. That your Memorialist learns from the Government of India Resolution published at page 465 of the Indian Forester for December 1895, that that Government is prepared to throw open the post of Deputy Conservators to the Provincial Forest service, if your Excellency's Government is pleased to recommend such a step.

9. That your Memorialist further learns from the official Gazette that a number of Provincial service officers have been appointed Extra Deputy Conservators in Burma.

10. That your Memorialist therefore most respectfully prays that the post of Deputy Conservator, now about to be vacated, may be made available to the Provincial service and that your Memorialist as a trained Forest Officer of over 10 years' standing, whose work has earned the good opinion of all his official superiors and as the first in the list of Provincial Forest officers eligible, under section 34 of the Madras Forest Code for promotion to the grade of Extra Deputy Conservator, may be appointed to it.

And your Excellency's Memorialist will, as in duty bound, ever pray.

Salem,
7th December 1896.

Signed V. Alwar Chetty
Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests.

True Copy.

The memorial has been submitted through the proper channel.

V. Alwar Chetty
Extra Assistant Conservator of Forests

Salem
7.1.97.

Transfers to the Provincial Forest Service.

v. Hon'ble Mr Grose C.I.E
v H.E the Govr

I have passed the 2 papers. It is for H.E. to choose between Mr Eber Hardie & Alwar Chetty. My own opinion is in favour of the former but of I consider the want of a 2nd cant for whom promotion is getting too long I think Alwar Chetty should get it.

JG
18/2/97

I should like to see a full expression of the Forest Member's opinion on the merits of these two officers. Mr Hardie has no Dehra Doon certificate; Mr Alwar Chetti has one.

A.G.H
22.2.97

Attached is a draft order regarding the transfer to the Provincial Forest Service of an extra Deputy-Conservator-ship in consequence of Mr. Brougham's retirement. I have not drafted a letter to the Govt. of India for want of information as to whether it is proposed to make Mr. Eber Hardie or Mr. Alwar Chetti an extra Deputy-Conservator. Had a vacancy in the Provincial Service arisen in the ordinary course, the question who should be promoted to it would have been one solely for the discretion of H. E. the Governor in Council. But in this case, it is proposed to create a special appointment of extra Deputy-Conservator and the sanction of the Govt. of India to which creation is necessary. In para. 4 of Mr. Ibbetson's letter in G.O. No. 4599 d 15-11-'96, flagged F, the Govt. of India desires that if it is considered expedient to make such an extraordinary promotion in the case of any extra Assistant Conservator of exceptional ability, a full statement of the facts may be submitted

2. It appears, therefore, necessary in writing to the Govt. of India to point out the special claims to promotion possessed by the officer selected whether Mr. Eber Hardie, or Mr. Alwar Chetti. The

C. 18/2/97.
R 22/3/97.

respective claims of these two officers are discussed in the notes in G.O. No. 2062 Rev. d/ 25th May '96, flagged G & in para 5 of the Current itself (No. 435 of '97.) In the sealed white envelope a further statement of the Hon. Mr. Sturrock's views will be found. The sealed brown paper enclosed contains the Board's proposals regarding the promotions to be made in consequence of Mr. Brougham's retirement. In para 2 of the Demi-official accompanying the draft minutes, the Board invites attention to the fact that the extra Assistant Conservator, Mr. Ember Hardie & Mr. Alwar Chetti have themselves held the present appointment only since '91, when the Controlling staff was reorganised.

3. I regret the delay in preparing the draft order & this note. It was due to the fact that the Godavari resettlement file has occupied almost the whole of my time during the past few weeks & that I have been compelled to lay aside a few troublesome papers (including this) until my note on that subject was completed.

D
15-3-97

17-2-87.

D
5 1,000—5-2-95.

Hon'ble W. Grose
H.E. the Govt.

REVENUE DEPARTMENT.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE MADRAS GOVERNMENT.

Read C.'s 193 & 435.

Order. 1575, d/ 23.3.97.

The Govt cannot agree with the Board in considering that to the Provincial service no transfer of an appointment in the class of Deputy Conservators should be made, until all the Assistant Conservators who joined the Department in 1891 have received promotion to that class. It is true that in the ordinary course transfers from the Imperial to the Provincial service must be made from the lowest class of Assistant Conservator, but the Govt of India has, in para 4 of Mr. Ibbetson's letter no. 21 F 72-10 dy 28-10-95, signified that in exceptional circumstances there is no objection to the immediate transfer of an officer of a higher grade, provided that such a transfer be not inconsistent with

JS
18/3/97

A.Sit
22.3.97

"a scrupulous regard for the
"the expectations of the Indian
"staff." The questions which now
calls for consideration is whether
~~the appointment of Deputy Conservator~~
~~reserved by the Brougham cannot~~
stopped
be transferred to the Provincial Service,
or whether Mr Cowley Brown
has a legitimate prior claim to promotion
to that rank. - Now, Mr Cowley
Brown was recruited prior to
the issue of Sir E. Back's circular
of the 29th July 1891, that is to say,
before it was decided to make
exclusive transfers from the
Imperial to the Provincial
Service. But, on the other hand the
Imperial Service in Madras
received during the same year
a large accession in
strength, the number of Deputy-
Conservators being increased from
14 to 21. The prospects of
promotion in the Imperial Service
were thereby so materially improved
that, in the opinion of Govt., the
officers recruited prior to 1891
cannot reasonably complain of the

In consequence of Mr Broughan's retirement, a fourth grade Deputy Conservatorship ~~[illegible]~~

(Mr Marshall was then a Sub. Asst Conservr & had he been appointed as an Asst Conservator wd have taken precedence of Mr Cowley Brown, who had not actually arrived in the Country)

to the Provincial Service

immediate transfer of one or two appointments in the grade of Dpty Conservator, more especially in view of the fact that at the time of their recruitment there was a possibility of their promotion in the Imperial service being restricted by the appointment ~~as Dpty Conservr~~ to selected officers, in the subordinate forest service ~~of Conservator~~. Mr Marshall, as the Board will doubtless remember, ~~was also~~ narrowly escaped promotion to the rank of ~~Dpty~~ Assistant Conservator

2. The foregoing ~~considerations~~ reasons lead Govt to the conclusion that an immediate transfer of the Provincial Service shd be effected by the creation of an Extra Dpty Conservatorship of the fourth grade. This conclusion is confirmed by the consideration that in other provinces Extra-Dpty Conservatorships have already been created, whereas in Madras the prospects of promotion in the Provincial Service ~~have~~ have been altered for the worse rather than for the better by

the ~~accd~~ resolution finally promulgated by the Govt of India.

3. The Govt of India will accordingly be addressed for sanction to the creation of an extra D.C. Conservatorship with effect from the date of Mr Broughton's retirement

4. With refce to para 6 of its Proceedings the Board will be informed that no instructions have been received ~~from the Govt~~ regarding the regulation of the pilot appointments to be transferred from the Punjab to Bombay. From the terms of paras 3 & 4 of the circular printed in P.D. no. 180 Rev. dy 1. 12. 96. the Govt presumes that the Govt of India will itself decide when it is possible to make the transfers in question, & intimate the date from which the Madras pilot appointments are to be created.

LD
15-3-97

The Board (LR) @ 10.

Secy. 21/3/97

Lee

D.O. official to the Secy to the Board of Revenue. L.R.

My dear Carr

With refce to G.O. No 1575 dy 23 March '97 (now issuing) regarding the transfer of a Deputy Conservatorship to the Provincial Service, I am directed to request that a full expression of the Forest Member's opinion of the respective merits of Messrs Eber Hardie & Alvar Chettiar may be furnished at an early date in order to enable Govt to decide which of those two officers to recommend for the post of Extra D.C. Conservator.

Yours sincerely

LD
23-3-97

Secy 23/3/97

Lee

The G.O. may issue simultaneously. The letter to Govt of India cannot go until the Board's orders on the D.O. is received

LD
23.3.97

...ress.

...re.

NUMBER OF COPIES REQUIRED. { Order complete. / Letter only. / Order complete with Letter.

DATED

Spare Copies.

Struck .. ..

Issued .. ..

Total ..

In hand ..

.. .. ..

MEANT FOR DESPATCH

n full.
be printed.
bstract only.
eading only.