Secti. I (1)-I—10,006—7-10-70.

(1) Number of pages 110

(2) Date of repair 15/7/72

(3) Initials of the Referencer FR

TAMIL NADU ARCHIVES

GOVERNMENT OF TAMIL NADU

Public Works DEPARTMENT

G.O. No. 2223-24 W Press Mis.
~~B.P. No.~~

Dated 21 July 1888 ~~1885~~.

1888

t .o be folded or roughly handled

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

General Establishment.

Read—the following paper:—

From G. H. D. WALKER, Esq., Under-Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department (General), to the Secretary to the Government of Madras, Public Works Department, dated Simla, 15th June 1888, No. 1432 G.:—

In the report issued by the Public Service Commission, copy of which has already been forwarded to you by the Home Department, the following recommendations are made regarding the Engineer establishment of the Public Works Department in chapter X, paras. 91—98 of the report:—

(1) That the Engineer establishment of the Public Works Department should consist of an Imperial Branch and of Provincial Branches.

(2) That the Imperial Branch should consist of such a number of Royal Engineers as may be required as a reserve for military purposes over and above the officers employed in the Military Works Branch and of Civil Engineers recruited in England.

(3) That the strength of the Imperial Branch should not be greater than is necessary for purposes of control and direction, and for the execution and repair of works calling for high engineering skill, and that the recruitment from the Coopers Hill Royal Engineering College, which appears at present excessive, should be regulated accordingly.

(4) That the conditions of service in the Imperial Branch should be fixed with a view to secure the necessary qualifications in England, and should, as far as possible, be uniform for all officers employed in it.

(5) That the Provincial Branches should be of a strength adequate for the construction and maintenance in the several provinces of works not ordinarily calling for high engineering skill.

(6) That the recruitment for the Provincial Branches should be made by the direct appointment to the lowest grades of qualified Engineers from the Indian Engineering Colleges, and in exceptional cases by promotion from the Upper Subordinate grades.

(7) That there should be at least one college in India thoroughly well equipped for providing a high education for Engineers for the Provincial Branches, and that such college should be open to all classes of Her Majesty's subjects.

(8) That the conditions of service as to pay, furlough and pension should be fixed for the Provincial Branches without reference to those of the Imperial Branch.

2. I am directed to request that these recommendations may be considered by the Government of Madras in the light of the suggestions put forward in the accompanying memorandum, which has been prepared in this office as a basis for carrying out in their practical application the recommendations of the Commission.

3. The chief points on which definite proposals are required are enumerated in the first paragraph of the memorandum, and are fully discussed and proposals suggested in the succeeding paragraphs.

4. In regard to the first point, the recommendations of the Government of Madras are particularly requested as to the number of charges, if any, that must be held by men of the Imperial establishment in Madras; in other words, what figures are recommended for the establishment of Madras to be placed in column D of table A in substitution of those tentatively inserted by this office.

I am also to inquire whether, in your opinion, the Engineers of the Railway Branch should be wholly Imperial, or whether there might be a mixture of Provincial men.

To Madras, Bombay, Bengal, North-Western Provinces, Punjab and Burmah only.

5. An equally important question is whether, in the opinion of His Excellency the Governor in Council, a Provincial Service should be created between the proposed Imperial Service and the existing Subordinate Service, or whether the present Upper Subordinate Staff, if increased in numbers and perhaps improved in training, would suffice to perform the duties of the Provincial Service.

6. I am further to inquire whether, with reference to the 7th recommendation quoted above, the Government of Madras is satisfied with the training of the Indian College * from which it now receives such of its recruits as are educated in this country, or would desire any other mode of recruitment for the Provincial Service, or any alteration in the system of education pursued in the college with which the province is connected.

* Madras.

7. On these as well as on the other subjects mentioned in the memorandum, and also on any other points touched upon by the Public Service Commission, the views and recommendations of His Excellency the Governor in Council are solicited by the Government of India, and I am to request that a reply to this inquiry may be furnished at the earliest possible date, and that, if possible, its return to this office may not be delayed beyond the 15th July.

Enclosure.

Scheme for a separate Imperial and Provincial Establishment, Public Works Department, prepared with reference to proposals by the Public Service Commission.

Assuming that separate Imperial and Provincial establishments are to be organised, as recommended by the Public Service Commission, the points which have to be authoritatively settled are the following:—

1*st*.—What, looking into the far future, is to be the respective strength of each establishment? Does table A (see paragraph 2) give a fair distribution for the two services, and is the future Railway Branch to be wholly Imperial?

On this decision depends the rate of recruitment to be now ordered in substitution for the present rate.

2*nd*.—What are the rates of pay and promotion for the Provincial establishment to be?

3*rd*.—Are the superior appointments to be on one scale of pay and open by selection to Imperial and Provincial men alike?

4*th*.—In distributing the present establishment between Imperial and Provincial, at what grade are we to draw the line of separation in regard to men who are classed as "Indian Engineers;" and how far are we to give better prospects as regards pay to the men now in Government employ who may be placed in the Provincial establishment than to men in future entering the establishment?

5*th*.—Looking to the smallness of the numbers in each service (as in statement A) in even the largest provinces, and still more in the smallest, is it possible to work them as separate and independent services, or should they be placed as regards promotion on a general list for all India, though without liability to transfer from one province to another, except in the cases of the Local Administrations?

These points are discussed with tentative suggestions in detail below.

Sub-head 1.—*Strength of each Establishment.*

2. In order to illustrate what may be taken as a possible distribution of the present (revised) charges and posts of the several Provincial lists of the Public Works Department between an Imperial and Provincial establishment, a table marked A has been prepared.

3. Columns B and C show the revised strength as far as it has been settled and the number of Executive charges on these lists, which include all but the Railway and Military Works Department lists.

4. The important columns upon which the rest are based are columns D and E. These distribute the Executive charges between Imperial and Provincial Engineers. The distribution must be more or less arbitrary. In provinces where, as in Bombay and Madras, there is no marked line between Buildings and Roads and Irrigation and there is a good deal of irrigation, a slight preponderance is given to Imperial. For Bengal Buildings and Roads, only three Imperial charges are allowed, viz., for the Presidency divisions and Under-Secretary; the Irrigation establishment is equally divided between the two so as to give a good leaven of Imperial. For Buildings and Roads Branch in the North-Western Provinces, Punjab, and Burma, there must probably be for some considerable time a good proportion of Imperial men, and the charges are divided equally. For the purely Irrigation charges of the North-Western Provinces and the Punjab, a slight preponderance is given to Imperial. The Buildings and Roads charges of the smaller administration are assigned wholly to Provincial.

5. In fixing the total strength of the Imperial establishment, it is necessary to provide that there should always be a sufficient number of Assistants in training for the Imperial Executive charges, the number of which is suggested in column D. It has long since been laid down as an axiom that this training in the Assistant class should not last more than 8 to 10 years, and to induce this rate of advancement the proportion of Assistant to Executive Engineers must be as 2 to 3. The total effective strength, as in column F, and the distribution of the whole strength, including allowance for absentees, as in columns H and I, are deduced accordingly from the number of Executive charges in column D by allowing the necessary proportion to induce this rate of promotion.

6. The balance of the establishment, according to the revised strength in column B, must be Provincial, and this establishment must fill the balance of Executive posts which remain after providing for the Imperial establishment, and the rest must be Assistant Engineers. This is worked out in columns J to N. It will be observed that in the Provincial establishment the Assistants greatly exceed the Executives, that is, we sacrifice the Provincial to the Imperial. It is reasonable that the rate of promotion in responsibility and pay (which depends on this distribution) for the Provincial establishment should be slower than for the Imperial, but probably some device would be necessary to accelerate it.

7. The general result of the table, however, is that for these Provincial lists we require the following establishment of Executive and Assistant Engineers, including allowances for absentees:—

	Executives.	Assistants.	Total.
Imperial	95	66	161
Provincial	126	213	339

8. There then remain the Railway and Military Works Department lists, the former of which, we may tentatively assume, must be manned wholly by Imperial Engineers, viz., Coopers Hill and Royal Engineers, and the latter by Royal Engineers. If we assume that these lists must be manned throughout by Imperial Engineers, we may neglect the question of charges, and assume that, irrespective of the charges held, they must be divided into Executive and Assistant classes in the proportion necessary to give the proper flow of promotion.

9. The actual present strength calculated for the Railway Branch is 145, and 52 for the Military Works Department; and adding 15 per cent. to each for absentees, the establishment will be—

	Executives.	Assistants.	Total.
Railway	99	67	166
Military Works Department	36	24	60

and adding all the lists as above together we get as the total strength of Executives and Assistant Engineers for India—

Imperial	230	157	387
Provincial	126	213	339
Grand Total ...	356	370	726

10. Next, as to the superior posts above the rank of Executives and Assistants which may be taken as 80. The distribution by classes of lists for these posts may be taken as follows:—

Provincial lists—Buildings and Roads and Irrigation	46
Railway Branch	27
Military Works Department	7

And assuming, solely for purposes of establishing the strength, that these posts would fall to Imperial and Provincial in proportion to their strength in the several lists, we should have—

	Imperial.	Provincial.	Total.
Provincial lists	15	31	46
Railway	27	...	27
Military Works Department	7	...	7
	49	31	80

or, in round numbers, 50 superior posts fall to Imperial and 30 to Provincial.

11. Allowing again 15 per cent. for absentees in these posts, the strength for Imperial and Provincial would be—

	Executives and Assistants.	Superior posts.	Total.
Imperial	387	58	445
Provincial	339	35	374
			819

12. Now the above total strength is not far off the number (800) to which our present rate of recruitment is understood to be leading us; but there is considerable difference in the distribution of the Imperial and Provincial element, which at present is as follows:—

	Recruits.	Ultimate strength.
Imperial—		
Coopers Hill	15	400
Royal Engineers	6	160
Provincial—		
Indian Colleges	9	240
	30	800

That is, instead of tending to an establishment of 430 Imperial and 370 Provincial, as approximately worked out above, we are tending to one of 560 Imperial and 240 Provincial.

13. Again, if we take our present establishment of about 1,000 men, we find that it consists of 745 European Engineers, who answer to the Imperial, and of 255 Indian Engineers, who answer to the Provincial establishment.

If, then, we intend to take steps to remodel the establishment in the direction indicated, we must modify our rate of recruitment.

14. Our present rate of recruitment is confessedly a reduced one, the full rate being 33 for a strength of 880 men, and the reduction was obtained by decreasing the number of Royal Engineer recruits from 9 to 6. It will probably be considered inadvisable, under present circumstances, to increase the total recruitment; but in making any modification we should recruit (if we can) up to the full ultimate Royal Engineer strength of about 250, as arranged with the Military Department in communication with the Home Government. The revised recruitment and strength according to the accepted estimates would then be—

	Recruits.	Estimated strength.
Imperial—		
Coopers Hill	7	190
Royal Engineers	9	240
Provincial—		
Indian Colleges	14	370
	30	800

15. According to this proposal, Coopers Hill, which began some years ago with an annual number of 40 or 45 appointments to the Public Works Department, now reduced to 15, would come down to 7.

16. The above conclusions and proposals may be summed up as follows:—

1st.—That, according to present estimates of strength and requirements of the different lists, we might work the Public Works Department with 430 Imperial (European) and 370 Provincial (Indian) Engineers.

2nd.—That we should so organise the Imperial establishment rearranged under the first proposal as to give what is considered the essential rate of promotion in the Executive grades.

3rd.—That if we decide to take this step, we should considerably increase the Indian recruitment and reduce the Coopers Hill element.

17. It is assumed that the Local Governments will be content to supply their Provincial services by recruits from the four Indian Colleges (Rurki, Sibpur, Poona, Madras), but if any

other source of recruitment is advocated, or if any change should be made in the system there pursued so as to provide a higher education for Provincial Engineers than they now get, its nature should be explained in the reply to this memorandum.

Sub-head 2.—*Rates of Pay and Promotion of the Provincial Establishment.*

18. The Provincial establishment, according to the suggestions made above, will be organised on the following main lines:—

Superior posts	30
Executive posts	127
Assistants	213
	370

The above ratio between Executives and Assistants would give promotion from one class to the other in about the 16th or 17th year of service.

19. Then as to the rate of pay for this establishment, the Public Service Commission recommends that it should be fixed without reference to that of the Imperial establishment.

As we shall have to commence the establishment with a very few men all in the lower grades, and as it will gradually increase to a considerable strength under the influence of an increased number of recruits, it will probably be better to give an incremental scale; in fact, the only alternative to this would be a graded scale adjusted periodically to give approximately the same rate of promotion as that which the incremental scale will give.

20. If the rate of pay of the Provincial Service is fixed on the same sort of scale as has hitherto been current, then the salaries of the Executive and Assistant grades might be as follows; but this is merely put forward as a suggestion on which to work, and because some definite proposals are required:—

	Period in grade.	Promotion possible at end of
Apprentice on Rs. 100	1 year	1st year.
Assistant Engineer Class—		
2nd grade, Rs. 125—25—250	5 years	6th year.
1st do. Rs. 275—25—400	5 „	11th „
Executive Engineer Class—		
2nd grade, Rs. 450—30—600	5 years	16th year.
1st do. Rs. 600—30—750	5 „	21st „
An increment of Rs. 50 after two years...	2 „	23rd „
Do. of „ 50 do.	2 „	25th „

The maximum pay thus obtainable by men in the 1st grade of Executives would be Rs. 850, and they would attain this about the end of the 47th year of their age at the earliest, that is, after passing through the grades as fast as they could. The above arrangement of grades would distribute Executives and Assistant Engineers in about equal proportions, and would perpetuate the present anomaly of giving men the pay and rank of Executives and the work of Assistants. If the ratio of 127 Executives to 213 Assistants, as in para. 18, is to be maintained, the period of service in the class of Assistant Engineer must be considerably enlarged; temporary promotions from class to class should be allowed only for change of duties.

21. It is probable, however, that some instructions of a general character may be issued by the Government of India regarding the scale of salaries to be allotted to the Provincial Service in all departments; and as the question of the pay of this branch of the Public Works Department does not press so urgently for a solution as does that of the number of posts to be set apart for them on which an early decision as to future recruitment depends, it may perhaps be convenient if an answer on this sub-head be deferred till the Government of India has declared its opinion on the general question.

22. It is possible, moreover, that Local Governments may hold that it is not necessary to create a new Provincial Service between the Imperial and the present Subordinate Service, but that all the work for which the Imperial Service is not required can be effectually performed by an enlargement of the upper ranks of the present Subordinate Service and without alteration of their present salaries. If this view is entertained, it is hoped that definite proposals as to the number, grades, and recruitment of this Upper Subordinate Service will be submitted in replying to this memorandum.

Sub-head 3.—*Whether the Superior Appointments are to be on one scale of Pay and open without distinction to Imperial and Provincial men.*

23. Another question to be decided is whether the superior appointments above the Executive grade should carry the same pay, whether held by Provincial or Imperial men, and

whether men of each establishment should be appointed by selection to these posts, or whether there should be any reservation of a proportionate share of the posts for each establishment.

24. It would be easier to allow a separate scale of pay for these posts if there were any prospects of working Provincial establishments without any admixture of Imperial men; for there may be some difficulty in making an Imperial Executive Engineer on Rs. 1,000 work under a Provincial Superintending Engineer on Rs. 900, or an Imperial Superintending Engineer on Rs. 1,600 under a Provincial Chief Engineer on Rs. 1,500. It would be probably equally difficult to arrange that Provincial men shall only serve under Provincial, and Imperial men under Imperial, when men of both services are employed in the same branch.

25. This will be seen at once from the figures below, which are based on the supposition that the superior posts are divided between Imperial and Provincial men approximately according to the numerical proportion of each:—

	Chief Engineers.	Superintending Engineers.
Buildings and Roads Branch—		
Imperial	6	5
Provincial	2	21
Irrigation—		
Imperial	3	3
Provincial	...	6
Total ...	11	35

That is to say, in the Buildings and Roads Branch the bulk of the Superintending Engineer appointments would be held by Provincial men who would thus come into contact with Imperial men, while it would be difficult to prevent the Chief Engineers of the Provincial establishment from being placed over Imperial men. In the Irrigation Branch, the Provincial and Imperial appointments would be about equally divided, and the Imperial men would generally hold the Chief Engineerships. On the whole, the probable conclusion seems to be that unless an establishment can be wholly worked by Provincial or by Imperial men, it will be simpler to have only one scale of pay for the superior appointments. This uniformity of pay is irrespective of the question whether a fixed proportion of the superior appointments should be given to Provincial men, or whether no proportion of the whole number of superior appointments dependent on the strength of each should be laid down for either establishment, but the best men should be selected from either class with due regard to the claims of seniority.

Sub-head 4.—*Distribution of the present Establishment between Imperial and Provincial, and transition from the present to the new organisation.*

26. The present distribution of the establishment between European and Indian Engineers, which two classes are ultimately to correspond with the Imperial and Provincial, is as follows:—

	European.	Indian.	Total.
Chief Engineers and officers ranking as such ...	24	...	24
Superintending Engineers and officers ranking as such	49	7	56
Executive Engineers	354	106	460
Assistant Engineers	318	142	460
As compared with our ultimate scale of ...	745	255	1,000
	430	370	800

It may be calculated roughly that if we alter the rate of recruitment as suggested in para. 14, we should increase the Indian establishment to the revised number of 370 by about the year 1905, and that similarly the European establishment would be considerably reduced by the same period and would be approximating to the ultimate number.

27. The difficulty is where and how to start the Indian establishment as a separate organisation to the European; when and where to draw the line.

28. The position is that we have now one establishment of European and Indian Engineers on one scale of pay, and we want to divide this establishment into two separate establishments, one of which will be on a lower scale of pay. It is also very desirable, in order to hasten the new organisation, that the separation should include some of the present establishment.

29. The problem is how to make this separation equitably. In the first place, the line between each class, the European and Indian Engineers, though clearly marked in the lower grades, which are filled by men recruited in definite proportions from Coopers Hill and from Indian Colleges, is not so clearly marked in the upper grades; and the men in these upper grades would look upon it as a very great grievance and slur upon them to be placed in a class

which must inevitably be looked upon as the inferior class. Some of them, though not a very large number, are men whose domicile is in England. It is thought therefore, irrespective of any question of altering the rate of pay of present incumbents, that none of the men now in the higher grades can be placed in the inferior service. It is suggested, however, that the line may be drawn below either the 3rd or the 4th grade of Executive Engineers, and that all the Indian Engineers may be placed below this line in a separate list, which will be the commencement of our Provincial establishment. All the men below the line, with very few exceptions, if any, are Natives, Eurasians, or Europeans whose domicile is in India.

30. It does not follow, however, that relegation to the inferior establishment must of necessity mean decrease of even prospective pay to all. The following compares the present rates common to the whole establishment with the rate proposed for the new class:—

	Present scale.	Suggested Provincial.
	Rs.	Rs.
Apprentice	100	100 to 125
Assistant Engineer, 4th grade	250	250 to 275
Do. 3rd do.	350 to 400	275 to 400
Do. 2nd do.	500	400 to 450
Do. 1st do.	600	450 to 600
Executive Engineer, 4th do.	700	600 to 600
Do. 3rd do.	800	600 to 850
Do. 2nd do.	950	850 to 1,000
Do. 1st do.	1,100	1,000 to 1,200

31. The proposal is that men below the present 3rd grade, that is, men on Rs. 600, Rs. 500, Rs. 350, Rs. 250 and Rs. 100 should pass over to the new Provincial establishment; but to prevent inequitable reduction in their prospective pay, it might be provided that two additional increments of Rs. 50 each should be allowable to men of the present 4th-grade Executive and 1st and 2nd grade Assistant so as to bring their pay ultimately up to Rs. 950. Meanwhile all would pass into the new grades, that is, the 4th-grade Executive Engineer, after completing five years on Rs. 600, would be eligible for promotion to the Rs. 600—850 grade, and by further periodical increments might rise to Rs. 950. Similarly, the 1st-grade Assistant would pass into the new Rs. 450—600 grade, and would receive increments and be eligible for promotion in due course. The 2nd-grade Assistant would pass into the Rs. 275—400 grade, and would rise on the same principle. The 3rd-grade Assistant should be promoted to the Rs. 275—400 grade on the same conditions as they would have been promoted to the present 2nd grade on Rs. 350, and should then go on regularly through the new grades; but there is no need, it is thought, to give them increments beyond the new scale as in the case of the other two grades.

32. Summarising, the proposals are as follows:—

(1) To place about 80 men of the 1st, 2nd, and 3rd grades of Executives, notwithstanding that they are Indian Engineers, in the Imperial list of Engineers, and to place them on exactly the same footing as regards pay as the European Engineer. Their pensions to follow the same rules as now.

(2) To place 23 4th-grade Executives, 98 1st grade and 29 2nd grade Assistants, who are Indian Engineers, in the new Provincial list, but to allow them to draw up to Rs. 950 in the 1st grade.

(3) To put 15 3rd-grade Assistants and apprentices wholly on the new rates of pay proposed for the Provincial establishment; in other words, to deal with them as with the recruits.

33. The effect of the above proposals would be to modify the immediate distribution of the Imperial and Provincial establishments as follows:—

	Imperial.	Provincial.	Total.
Chief Engineers and officers ranking as such ...	21	...	24
Superintending Engineers and officers ranking as such	56	...	56
Executive Engineers	437	23	460
Assistant do.	318	142	460
	835	165	1,000

Sub-head 5.—*Whether the several Lists can be worked as separate and independent Services.*

34. The Provincial establishment being at present so small would have probably to be organised for some years to come as one list. Its distribution at the present moment, as

compared with the ultimate Provincial establishment estimated for each list as in table A, would be as follows :—

	Engineers, 4th grade.	Assistants.	Total.	Ultimate total.
Bombay	1	15	16	40
Madras	1	5	6	47
Bengal—Buildings and Roads	3	11	14	14
Do. Irrigation Branch	2	5	7	28
North-Western Provinces—Buildings and Roads ...	2	16	18	28
North-Western Provinces—Irrigation Branch	3	9	12	35
Punjab—Buildings and Roads	...	18	18	28
Do. Irrigation Branch	2	10	12	34
Burma	2	8	10	29
Assam	2	3	5	15
Rajputana and Central India	1	7	8	10
Hyderabad	...	2	2	18
Central Provinces	...	6	6	12
Coorg	...	...	..	1
	19	115	134	339
Railways	4	27	31	..
	23	142	165	339

35. It would be hardly possible, it is thought, with these small numbers to give each list a graded scale on which promotions might be made; but the scale of pay proposed would obviate many difficulties likely to arise on this score. Care would have to be taken, however, by the central authority, that is the Government of India, that the distribution of Executives and Assistants to each list should be reasonable.

36. Summarising again, the proposed organisation would be as follows for some years to come :—

1*st*.—An Imperial establishment on separate lists as at present, consisting of all the present European and about 80 Indian Engineers.

This list on the present rate of recruitment being altered from 21 to 16 would gradually decrease from its present number of 835 to 430.

2*nd*.—A Provincial establishment on one list, but under the control of the Local Governments, on scale of pay fixed as suggested in para. 18.

37. Eventually, as the strength of the Imperial establishment diminished and that of the Provincial increased under the influence of the altered rate of recruitment, the Provincial list might be split up, and each list made over wholly to the Local Governments, while the Imperial establishment should be consolidated into one list.

38. In the above proposals nothing has been said about the promotion of Upper Subordinates to the Provincial establishment which has been recommended by the Commission (para. 96, Chapter X). Such promotions would perhaps not be numerous, and they would not materially affect the strength; in fact, at first they would probably be an assistance to the efficiency of the establishment. The men promoted would come in to some suitable place in the Provincial scale and would rise in it.

39. As regards furlough and pension, it will probably be held that each class of Engineers now in the department should retain the furlough and pension rules to which they are now liable; that is to say, those who are now classed as European Engineers and have the more favorable leave and pension rules, or the pension rules only, as the case may be, will retain those rules intact. At the same time those Indian Engineers who, it is suggested, should be classed on special grounds as Imperial Engineers would retain their present rules, which are those of the Uncovenanted Service.

40. The rest of the Indian Engineers now in Government employ whom we propose to class as Provincial would retain their present rules—those, viz., of the Uncovenanted Service.

41. In regard, however, to the men to be hereafter recruited into the Provincial establishment, the suggestions of Local Government are invited as to whether they should be pensionable or not; and if pensionable, whether they should come under the present rules of the Uncovenanted Service or under modified rules; and, lastly, whether those who rise to the superior appointments should be eligible, as now, to the superior scale of pensions for European Engineers.

Table A.

Province or List.	Revised strength, exclusive of absentees.	Total number of Executive charges.	Distribution of charges. Imperial.	Distribution of charges. Provincial.	Imperial Strength. Present on duty D+F.	Imperial Strength. Total strength F+15%.	Provincial Strength. Present on duty H—F.	Provincial Strength. Allowance for absentees @ 10%.	Provincial Strength. Total J+K.	Provincial Strength. Executive Engineer H+10%.	Provincial Strength. Assistant Engineer L—M.
A.	B.	C.	D.	E.	F.	G.	J.	K.	L.	M.	N.
Bombay	64	33	17	16	28	32	36	4	40	18	22
Madras	68	29	15	14	25	29	43	4	47	16	31
Bengal—Buildings and Roads.	18	9	3	6	5	6	13	1	14	7	7
Do. Irrigation Branch ...	37	14	7	7	12	14	25	3	28	8	20
North-Western Provinces—Buildings and Roads ...	33	16	5	5	8	9	25	3	28	6	22
North-Western Provinces—Irrigation Branch	47	18	9	9	15	17	32	3	35	8	27
Punjab—Buildings and Roads.	40	18	9	9	15	17	25	3	28	10	18
Do. Irrigation Branch ...	46	17	9	8	15	17	31	3	34	9	25
Burma	43	20	10	10	17	20	26	3	29	11	18
Assam	13	11	...	11	...	...	13	2	15	12	3
Rajputana and Central India ...	9	4	...	4	...	...	9	1	10	5	5
Hyderabad	10	7	...	7	...	...	16	2	18	8	10
Central Provinces	11	6	...	6	...	...	11	1	12	7	5
Coorg	1	1	...	1	...	...	1	...	1	1	...
Total Mixed List ...	446	195	84	111	140	161	306	33	339	126	213

Order—dated 21st July 1888, No. 2223 W., Public Works.

Ordered that the following reply be sent:—

(Here enter No. 2224 W., dated 21st July 1888.)

(True Extract.)

(Signed) J. O. HASTED Colonel, R.E.,
Secretary to Govt., P.W.D.

Letter—to the Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department, dated Ootacamund, 21st July 1888, No. 2224 W.

With reference to your letter No. 1432 G., dated 15th June 1888, I am instructed to offer the following observations, referring in succession to the sub-heads into which the "Scheme for a separate Imperial and Provincial establishment, Public Works Department," submitted with your letter is divided:—

Sub-head 1.—Including the lately-formed new division in the Kistna and the temporary divisions of Rushikulya; Ramnad and Periyár, there are 30 divisions in the Madras Presidency; the Ramnad division will, however, be abolished next year, leaving 29 divisions, which agrees with the number given in the statement accompanying the scheme; two of these probably being retained for the next five years only. The utmost care has been taken in distributing the divisions between Imperial and Provincial, and the accompanying statement gives the result finally determined. With the exception of the Nílgiris, all the divisions, classed as Imperial, contain either very important irrigation works or large military buildings, and in some cases both, and it would be objectionable, in the opinion of this Government, to entrust their charge to officers of the Provincial Service. On the Nílgiris there are Government House and Military head-quarters, and there are other obvious reasons why this station should be kept for officers recruited in England. The Buckingham Canal has been classed as Provincial, but until the completion estimates are worked out, it must be an Imperial charge. Madura must become an Imperial charge when the Periyár project is completed and absorbed in it, but by that time there will probably be some other temporary division and possibly there may be some Provincial officer competent to hold one of the charges now classed as Imperial. This Government will certainly do their best to provide for the Provincial men. The figure in column D of table A, from which the figures in subsequent columns are deduced, is therefore 20 instead of 15.

This Government concurs in the view that Assistant Engineers in the Imperial class should be promoted to Executives in 8 or 10 years at latest; but they are of opinion that Assistants in the Provincial class should attain their promotion before they are 16 years in the service; otherwise, in many instances, a man will be past his prime before he is promoted, and an Executive Engineer should possess considerable energy and activity.

As regards the source from which the Provincial service should be recruited, this Government are of opinion that, as a rule, Assistant Engineers should be obtained from the Civil Engineering colleges in India, but that, in special cases, it will be advisable to promote from the subordinate grade. They are of opinion, however, that in view of the present facilities for travelling in India considerable economy may be effected by confining the higher education necessary for Provincial Engineers to a single college in India, and they would suggest Poona, being the most centrally situated, as its most convenient location. The other colleges would then be restricted to the course of education necessary for admission to the upper subordinate grades.

Sub-head 2.—As regards the rates of pay and promotion of the Provincial establishment, this Government are of opinion that the pay of Assistant Engineers and Executive Engineers may be fixed without reference to that of the Imperial establishment, but that the scale given in para. 20 of the "Scheme" commences too low, with the exception of the apprentice grades, which, it is presumed, corresponds with that of men under practical training; and the system of yearly increments does

not commend itself to them. If, as suggested above, upper subordinates are, in special cases, to be promoted as Engineers, the grade from which they would be promoted would probably be that of Supervisor, 1st grade, which would contain men of considerable experience, and yet not too old for advancement, and in that case the pay of Assistant Engineer, 2nd grade, must be at least equal to that of Supervisor, 1st grade. If yearly increments are given, the pay might commence at Rs. 200, but if, as this Government would prefer, no increments are given, the pay of Assistant Engineer, 2nd grade, should be Rs. 250. An Assistant Engineer, 1st grade, would then receive Rs. 350, and there might be four grades of Executive Engineers, each step of promotion giving an increase in pay of Rs. 100. After two years in the highest grade an addition of Rs. 50 might be made, and after another two years, a further addition of Rs. 50 as suggested.

Sub-head 3.—The superior appointments above the grade of Executive Engineer are always made by this Government by selection, and this being the case, the Government are of opinion that these appointments should be open without distinction to men on Imperial and Provincial lists, and that there should be one scale of pay for them.

Sub-head 4.—Without interfering with the prospects of men who entered the service with certain expectations, it will be extremely difficult to effect the transition to the new organisation. To those, however, who have lately entered the service, the prospect of some reduction has not probably appeared uncertain. This Government are therefore of opinion that the pay above the rank of Assistant Engineer on the Provincial service might be fixed on the new scale, and that there is no reason why the Provincial should not be at once separated from the Imperial list, so long as present incumbents in grades above Assistant Engineer are secured the present scale of pay up to date of retirement.

Sub-head 5.—The suggestion in the scheme is apparently to form an amalgamated Provincial list, which would be retained while the numbers on the list are small, but when the numbers are much increased to split it up, making over the portions to the Provincial Governments, while the Imperial lists, which would then be reduced, should be amalgamated. On the subject of amalgamating the Imperial lists, this Government has already expressed an opinion in letter No. 3391 W., dated 12th December 1887, and they are willing to defer further consideration of the subject until the Imperial lists are very considerably reduced; but they are of opinion that it will be best in every way to start and continue the Provincial establishment under the Provincial Governments, who would work it as one list with the existing Imperial establishment.

As regards the question whether the men on the Provincial establishment should be pensionable or not, this Government entertain no doubt that they must receive pensions, and that the rules of the Uncovenanted Service should apply to them.

2. In the above the questions asked in paras. 2 to 7 of your letter under reply have been answered, with the exception of that in the latter part of para. 4, with respect to which I am to say that this Government inclines to the opinion that, for some time to come at all events, the Engineers of the Railway Branch should be wholly Imperial. There are, however, only three, the Consulting Engineer and two Deputies, under this Government.

(Signed) J. O. HASTED, Colonel, R.E.,
Secretary to Govt., P.W.D

Exd. F. R. Bantleman.
Spare Copies

IMPERIAL.

	Divisions.		Divisions.
Godávari	3	Chingleput	1
Kistna	3	Presidency	1
Nellore	1	Presidency Workshops ...	1
Rushikulya	1	Tanjore	1
Bellary	1	Negapatam	1
West Coast	1	Consulting Architect ...	1
Periyár	1		20
Nílgiris	1		
North Arcot	1		
South Arcot	1		

PROVINCIAL.

	Divisions.		Divisions.
Ganjam	1	Tinnevelly	1
Vizagapatam	1	Buckingham Canal	1
Cuddapah	1	Coimbatore	1
Kurnool	1		9
Trichinopoly	1		
Madura	1		

GENERAL.
ESTABLISHMENT.

Govt. of {1888} Madras.

PUBLIC WORKS.

Dated July, 21*st*.

Recd. *Encl.*

G.O., 21st July 1888, Nos. 2223, 2224 W.

JULY.

Public Works Department Establishment

Offering certain observations with regard to the proposed "Scheme for a separate Imperial and Provincial establishment, Public Works Department."

No. 1432 G.

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

GENERAL.

To

THE GOVERNMENTS OF MADRAS, BOMBAY, BENGAL, THE NORTH-WESTERN PROVINCES AND OUDH, AND THE PUNJAB.

THE CHIEF COMMISSIONERS OF THE CENTRAL PROVINCES, BURMA, AND ASSAM.

THE RESIDENT AT HYDERABAD.

THE AGENT TO THE GOVERNOR-GENERAL FOR CENTRAL INDIA AND RAJPUTANA.

Simla, the 15ht June, 1888.

SIR,

In the report issued by the Public Service Commission, copy of which has already been forwarded to you by the Home Department, the following recommendations are made regarding the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department in Chapter X, paragraphs 91—98 of the Report:—

(1).—That the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department should consist of an Imperial Branch and of Provincial branches.

(2).—That the Imperial Branch should consist of such a number of Royal Engineers as may be required as a reserve for military purposes over and above the officers employed in the Military Works Branch and of Civil Engineers recruited in England.

(3).—That the strength of the Imperial Branch should not be greater than is necessary for purposes of control and direction, and for the execution and repair of works calling for high engineering skill, and that the recruitment from the Coopers Hill Royal Engineering College, which appears at present excessive, should be regulated accordingly.

(4).—That the conditions of service in the Imperial Branch should be fixed with a view to secure the necessary qualifications in England, and should, as far as possible, be uniform for all officers employed in it.

(5).—That the Provincial branches should be of a strength adequate for the construction and maintenance in the several provinces of works not ordinarily calling for high engineering skill.

(6).—That the recruitment for the Provincial branches should be made by the direct appointment to the lowest grades of qualified engineers from the Indian Engineering Colleges, and in exceptional cases by promotion from the Upper Subordinate grades.

(7).—That there should be at least one college in India thoroughly well equipped for providing a high education for Engineers for the Provincial branches, and that such college should be open to all classes of Her Majesty's subjects.

(8).—That the conditions of service as to pay, furlough and pension should be fixed for the Provincial branches, without reference to those of the Imperial Branch.

2

2. I am directed to request that these recommendations may be considered by the Government of Madras in the light of the suggestions put forward in the accompanying memorandum, which has been prepared in this office as a basis for carrying out in their practical application the recommendations of the Commission.

3. The chief points on which definite proposals are required are enumerated in the first paragraph of the memorandum, and are fully discussed and proposals suggested in the succeeding paragraphs.

4. In regard to the first point, the recommendations of the Government of Madras are particularly requested as to the number of charges, if any, that must be held by men of the Imperial Establishment in Madras

in other words, what figures are recommended for the establishment of Madras to be placed in column D of Table A, in substitution of those tentatively inserted by this office.

I am also to enquire whether, in your opinion, the Engineers of the Railway Branch should be wholly Imperial, or whether there might be a mixture of Provincial men.

To Madras, Bombay, Bengal, North-Western Provinces, Punjab and Burma only.

5. An equally important question is, whether, in the opinion of H.E. the Governor in Council a Provincial Service should be created between the proposed Imperial Service and the existing Subordinate Service, or whether the present Upper Subordinate Staff, if increased in numbers and perhaps improved in training, would suffice to perform the duties of the Provincial Service.

6. I am further to enquire whether, with reference to the 7th recommendation quoted above, the Government of Madras is satisfied with the training of the Indian College* from which it now receives such of its recruits as are educated in this country, or would desire any other mode of recruitment for the Provincial Service, or any alteration in the system of education pursued in the College with which the Province is connected.

* Cooper's Hill, Madras, Poona.

7. On these as well as on the other subjects mentioned in the memorandum, and also on any other points touched upon by the Public Service Commission, the views and recommendations of the Hon'ble His Excellency the Governor in Council are solicited by the Government of India; and I am to request that a reply to this enquiry may be furnished at the earliest possible date, and that, if possible, its return to this office may not be delayed beyond the 15th July.

I have the honour to be,

SIR,

Your most obedient Servant,

G. H. Walker

Under-Secretary.

Documents accompanying.
Memorandum referred to.

Govt. C. Press, Simla.—No. 148 P. W. D.—16-6-88—265.

To The Secretary to the Government of Madras
Public Work department

Scheme for a Separate Imperial and Provincial Establishment, Public Works Department, prepared with reference to proposals by the Public Service Commission.

Assuming that separate Imperial and Provincial Establishments are to be organised, as recommended by the Public Service Commission, the points which have to be authoritatively settled are the following:—

1st.—What, looking into the far future, is to be the respective strength of each establishment? Does table A (see paragraph 2) give a fair distribution for the two services, and is the future Railway Branch to be wholly Imperial?

On this decision depends the rate of recruitment to be now ordered in substitution for the present rate.

2nd.—What are the rates of pay and promotion for the Provincial Establishment to be?

3rd.—Are the superior appointments to be on one scale of pay, and open by selection to Imperial and Provincial men alike?

4th.—In distributing the present establishment between Imperial and Provincial, at what grade are we to draw the line of separation in regard to men who are classed as "Indian Engineers;" and how far are we to give better prospects as regards pay to the men now in Government employ who may be placed in the Provincial Establishment than to men in future entering the establishment?

5th.—Looking to the smallness of the numbers in each service (as in statement A) in even the largest provinces, and still more in the smallest, is it possible to work them as separate and independent services, or should they be placed as regards promotion on a general list for all India, though without liability to transfer from one Province to another, except in the cases of the Local Administrations?

These points are discussed with tentative suggestions in detail below.

Sub-head 1.—STRENGTH OF EACH ESTABLISHMENT.

2. In order to illustrate what may be taken as a possible distribution of the present (revised) charges and posts of the several Provincial lists of the Public Works Department between an Imperial and Provincial Establishment, a table marked A has been prepared.

3. Columns B and C shew the revised strength as far as it has been settled, and the number of Executive charges on these lists, which include all but the Railway and Military Works Department lists.

4. The important columns upon which the rest are based are columns D and E. These distribute the Executive charges between Imperial and Provincial Engineers. The distribution must be more or less arbitrary. In provinces where, as in Bombay and Madras, there is no marked line between Buildings and Roads and Irrigation, and there is a good deal of irrigation, a slight preponderance is given to Imperial. For Bengal Buildings and Roads, only three Imperial charges are allowed, *viz.*, for the Presidency Divisions and Under-Secretary; the irrigation establishment is equally divided between the two, so as to give a good leaven of Imperial. For Buildings and Roads Branch in the North-Western Provinces, Punjab, and Burma, there must probably be for some considerable time a good proportion of Imperial men, and the charges are divided equally. For the purely Irrigation charges of the North-Western Provinces and the Punjab, a slight preponderance is given to Imperial. The Buildings and Road charges of the smaller administration are assigned wholly to Provincial.

5. In fixing the total strength of the Imperial Establishment, it is necessary to provide that there should always be a sufficient number of Assistants in training for the Imperial Executive charges, the number of which is

suggested in column D. It has long since been laid down as an axiom that this training in the Assistant class should not last more than 8 to 10 years; and to induce this rate of advancement, the proportion of Assistant to Executive Engineers must be as 2 to 3. The total effective strength, as in column F, and the distribution of the whole strength, including allowance for absentees, as in columns H and I, are deduced accordingly from the number of Executive charges in column D by allowing the necessary proportion to induce this rate of promotion.

6. The balance of the establishment, according to the revised strength in column B, must be Provincial, and this establishment must fill the balance of Executive posts which remain after providing for the Imperial Establishment, and the rest must be Assistant Engineers. This is worked out in columns J to N. It will be observed that in the Provincial Establishment the Assistants greatly exceed the Executives—that is, we sacrifice the Provincial to the Imperial. It is reasonable that the rate of promotion in responsibility and pay (which depends on this distribution) for the Provincial Establishment should be slower than for the Imperial, but probably some device would be necessary to accelerate it.

7. The general result of the table, however, is that for these Provincial lists we require the following establishment of Executive and Assistant Engineers, including allowances for absentees:—

	Executives.	Assistants.	Total.
Imperial	95	66	161
Provincial	126	213	339

8. There then remain the Railway and Military Works Department lists, the former of which, we may tentatively assume, must be manned wholly by Imperial Engineers, namely, Coopers Hill and Royal Engineers, and the latter by Royal Engineers. If we assume that these lists must be manned throughout by Imperial Engineers, we may neglect the question of charges, and assume that, irrespective of the charges held, they must be divided into Executive and Assistant classes in the proportion necessary to give the proper flow of promotion.

9. The actual present strength calculated for the Railway Branch is 145, and 52 for the Military Works Department; and adding 15 per cent. to each for absentees, the establishment will be—

	Executives.	Assistants.	Total.
Railway	99	67	166
Military Works Department	36	24	60

and adding all the lists as above together we get as the total strength of Executives and Assistant Engineers for India—

Imperial	230	157	387
Provincial	123	213	339
Grand Total ...	356	370	726

10. Next, as to the superior posts above the rank of Executives and Assistants, which may be taken as 80. The distribution by classes of lists for these posts may be taken as follows:—

Provincial lists—Buildings and Roads and Irrigation	46
Railway Branch	27
Military Works Department	7

And assuming, solely for purposes of establishing the strength, that these posts would fall to Imperial and Provincial in proportion to their strength in the several lists, we should have—

	Imperial.	Provincial.	Total.
Provincial lists	15	31	46
Railway	27	...	27
Military Works Department	7	...	7
	49	31	80

or, in round numbers, 50 superior posts fall to Imperial and 30 to Provincial,

11. Allowing again 15 per cent. for absentees in these posts, the strength for Imperial and Provincial would be—

	Executives and Assistants.	Superior Posts.	Total.
Imperial	357	58	415
Provincial	339	35	374
			819

12. Now the above total strength is not far off the number (800) to which our present rate of recruitment is understood to be leading us; but there is considerable difference in the distribution of the Imperial and Provincial element, which at present is as follows:—

	Recruits.	Ultimate strength.
Imperial—		
Coopers Hill	15	400
Royal Engineers	6	160
Provincial—		
Indian Colleges	9	240
	30	800

That is, instead of tending to an establishment of 430 Imperial and 370 Provincial, as approximately worked out above, we are tending to one of 560 Imperial and 240 Provincial.

13. Again, if we take our present establishment of about 1,000 men, we find that it consists of 745 European Engineers, who answer to the Imperial, and of 255 Indian Engineers, who answer to the Provincial Establishment.

If, then, we intend to take steps to remodel the establishment in the direction indicated, we must modify our rate of recruitment.

14. Our present rate of recruitment is confessedly a reduced one, the full rate being 33 for a strength of 880 men; and the reduction was obtained by decreasing the number of Royal Engineer recruits from 9 to 6. It will probably be considered inadvisable under present circumstances to increase the total recruitment; but in making any modification we should recruit (if we can) up to the full ultimate Royal Engineer strength of about 250, as arranged with the Military Department in communication with the Home Government. The revised recruitment and strength according to the accepted estimates would then be—

	Recruits.	Estimated strength.
Imperial—		
Coopers Hill	7	190
Royal Engineers	9	240
Provincial—		
Indian Colleges	14	370
	30	800

15. According to this proposal, Coopers Hill, which began some years ago with an annual number of 40 or 45 appointments to the Public Works Department, now reduced to fifteen, would come down to seven.

16. The above conclusions and proposals may be summed up as follows:—

1st.—That, according to present estimates of strength and requirements of the different lists, we might work the Public Works Department with 430 Imperial (European) and 370 Provincial (Indian) Engineers.

2nd.—That we should so organise the Imperial Establishment re-arranged under the first proposal as to give what is considered the essential rate of promotion in the Executive grades.

3rd.—That if we decide to take this step, we should considerably increase the Indian recruitment and reduce the Coopers Hill element.

17. It is assumed that the Local Governments will be content to supply their Provincial services by recruits from the four Indian Colleges (Rurki, Sibpur, Poona, Madras), but if any other source of recruitment is advocated, or if any change should be made in the system there pursued so as to provide a higher education for Provincial Engineers than they now get, its nature should be explained in the reply to this memorandum.

Sub-head 2.—RATES OF PAY AND PROMOTION OF THE PROVINCIAL ESTABLISHMENT.

18. The Provincial Establishment, according to the suggestions made above, will be organised on the following main lines:—

Superior posts	30
Executive posts	127
Assistants	213
	370

The above ratio between Executives and Assistants would give promotion from one class to the other in about the 16th or 17th year of service.

19. Then as to the rate of pay for this establishment, the Public Service Commission recommends that it should be fixed without reference to that of the Imperial Establishment.

As we shall have to commence the establishment with a very few men all in the lower grades, and as it will gradually increase to a considerable strength under the influence of an increased number of recruits, it will probably be better to give an incremental scale; in fact, the only alternative to this would be a graded scale adjusted periodically to give approximately the same rate of promotion as that which the incremental scale will give.

20. If the rate of pay of the Provincial Service is fixed on the same sort of scale as has hitherto been current, then the salaries of the Executive and Assistant grades might be as follows; but this is merely put forward as a suggestion on which to work, and because some definite proposals are required:—

	Period in grade.	Promotion possible at end of
Apprentice on Rs. 100	1 year	1st year.
Assistant Engineer class—		
2nd grade, Rs. 125—25—250	5 years	6th „
1st „ Rs. 275—25—400	5 „	11th „
Executive Engineer class—		
2nd grade, Rs. 450—30—600	5 „	16th „
1st „ Rs. 600—30—750	5 „	21st „
An increment of Rs. 50 after two years ...	2 „	23rd „
„ „ „ ...	2 „	25th „

The maximum pay thus obtainable by men in the 1st grade of Executives would be Rs. 850, and they would attain this about the end of the 47th year of their age at the earliest, that is, after passing through the grades as fast as they could. The above arrangement of grades would distribute Executives and Assistant Engineers in about equal proportions and would perpetuate the present anomaly of giving men the pay and rank of Executives and the work of Assistants. If the ratio of 127 Executives to 213 Assistants, as in paragraph 18, is to be maintained, the period of service in the class of Assistant Engineer must be considerably enlarged; temporary promotions from class to class should be allowed only for change of duties.

21. It is probable however that some instructions of a general character may be issued by the Government of India regarding the scale of salaries to be allotted to the Provincial Service in all Departments; and as the question of the pay of this branch of the Public Works Department does not press so

urgently for a solution as does that of the number of posts to be set apart for them, on which an early decision as to future recruitment depends, it may perhaps be convenient if an answer on this sub-head be deferred till the Government of India has declared its opinion on the general question.

22. It is possible moreover, that Local Governments may hold that it is not necessary to create a new Provincial Service between the Imperial and the present Subordinate Service, but that all the work for which the Imperial Service is not required can be effectually performed by an enlargement of the upper ranks of the present Subordinate Service and without alteration of their present salaries. If this view is entertained, it is hoped that definite proposals as to the number, grades, and recruitment of this Upper Subordinate Service will be submitted in replying to this memorandum.

Sub-head 3.—WHETHER THE SUPERIOR APPOINTMENTS ARE TO BE ON ONE SCALE OF PAY, AND OPEN WITHOUT DISTINCTION TO IMPERIAL AND PROVINCIAL MEN.

23. Another question to be decided is whether the superior appointments above the Executive grade should carry the same pay whether held by Provincial or Imperial men, and whether men of each establishment should be appointed by selection to these posts, or whether there should be any reservation of a proportionate share of the posts for each establishment.

24. It would be easier to allow a separate scale of pay for these posts if there were any prospects of working Provincial Establishments without any admixture of Imperial men; for there may be some difficulty in making an Imperial Executive Engineer on Rs. 1,000 work under a Provincial Superintending Engineer on Rs. 900, or an Imperial Superintending Engineer on Rs. 1,600 under a Provincial Chief Engineer on Rs. 1,500. It would be probably equally difficult to arrange that Provincial men shall only serve under Provincial, and Imperial men under Imperial, when men of both services are employed in the same branch.

25. This will be seen at once from the figures below, which are based on the supposition that the superior posts are divided between Imperial and Provincial men approximately according to the numerical proportion of each:—

	Chief Engineers.	Superintending Engineers.
Buildings and Roads Branch—		
Imperial	6	5
Provincial	2	21
Irrigation—		
Imperial	3	3
Provincial	...	6
Total ...	11	35

That is to say, in the Buildings and Roads Branch the bulk of the Superintending Engineer appointments would be held by Provincial men, who would thus come into contact with Imperial men, while it would be difficult to prevent the Chief Engineers of the Provincial Establishment from being placed over Imperial men. In the Irrigation Branch, the Provincial and Imperial appointments would be about equally divided, and the Imperial men would generally hold the Chief Engineerships. On the whole, the probable conclusion seems to be that, unless an establishment can be wholly worked by Provincial or by Imperial men, it will be simpler to have only one scale of pay for the superior appointments. This uniformity of pay is irrespective of the question whether a fixed proportion of the superior appointments should be given to Provincial men, or whether no proportion of the whole number of superior appointments dependent on the strength of each should be laid down for either establishment, but the best men should be selected from either class with due regard to the claims of seniority.

Sub-head 4.—DISTRIBUTION OF THE PRESENT ESTABLISHMENT BETWEEN IMPERIAL AND PROVINCIAL, AND TRANSITION FROM THE PRESENT TO THE NEW ORGANISATION.

26. The present distribution of the establishment between European and Indian Engineers, which two classes are ultimately to correspond with the Imperial and Provincial, is as follows :—

	European.	Indian.	Total.
Chief Engineers and officers ranking as such ...	24	...	24
Superintending Engineers and officers ranking as such	49	7	56
Executive Engineers	354	106	460
Assistant Engineers	318	142	460
	745	255	1,000
As compared with our ultimate scale of ...	430	370	800

It may be calculated roughly that, if we alter the rate of recruitment as suggested in paragraph 14, we should increase the Indian Establishment to the revised number of 370 by about the year 1905, and that similarly the European Establishment would be considerably reduced by the same period, and would be approximating to the ultimate number.

27. The difficulty is where and how to start the Indian Establishment as a separate organisation to the European; when and where to draw the line.

28. The position is that we have now one establishment of European and Indian Engineers on one scale of pay, and we want to divide this establishment into two separate establishments, one of which will be on a lower scale of pay. It is also very desirable, in order to hasten the new organisation, that the separation should include some of the present establishment.

29. The problem is how to make this separation equitably. In the first place, the line between each class, the European and Indian Engineers, though clearly marked in the lower grades, which are filled by men recruited in definite proportions from Coopers Hill and from Indian Colleges, is not so clearly marked in the upper grades; and the men in these upper grades would look upon it as a very great grievance and slur upon them to be placed in a class which must inevitably be looked upon as the inferior class. Some of them, though not a very large number, are men whose domicile is in England. It is thought therefore, irrespective of any question of altering the rate of pay of present incumbents, that none of the men now in the higher grades can be placed in the inferior Service. It is suggested, however, that the line may be drawn below either the 3rd or the 4th grade of Executive Engineers, and that all the Indian Engineers may be placed below this line in a separate list, which will be the commencement of our Provincial Establishment. All the men below the line, with very few exceptions, if any, are Natives, Eurasians, or Europeans whose domicile is in India.

30. It does not follow, however, that relegation to the inferior establishment must of necessity mean decrease of even prospective pay to all. The following compares the present rates common to the whole establishment with the rate proposed for the new class:—

	Present scale. Rs.	Suggested Provincial. Rs
Apprentice	100	100
Assistant Engineer, 4th grade ...	...	125 to 250
„ „ 3rd „ ...	250	
„ „ 2nd „ ...	350 to 400	275 to 400
„ „ 1st „ ...	500	
Executive Engineer, 4th grade ...	600	450 to 600
„ „ 3rd „ ...	700	
„ „ 2nd „ ...	800	600 to 850
„ „ 1st „ ...	950	

31. The proposal is that men below the present 3rd grade, that is, men on Rs. 600, Rs. 500, Rs. 350, Rs. 250, and Rs. 100, should pass over to the new Provincial Establishment; but to prevent inequitable reduction in their prospective

pay, it might be provided that two additional increments of Rs. 50 each should be allowable to men of the present 4th grade Executive and 1st and 2nd grade Assistant so as to bring their pay ultimately up to Rs. 950. Meanwhile all would pass into the new grades; that is, the 4th grade Executive Engineer, after completing five years on Rs. 600, would be eligible for promotion to the Rs. 600—850 grade, and by further periodical increments might rise to Rs. 950. Similarly, the 1st grade Assistant would pass into the new Rs. 450—600 grade, and would receive increments and be eligible for promotion in due course. The 2nd grade Assistant would pass into the Rs. 275—400 grade, and would rise on the same principle. The 3rd grade Assistant should be promoted to the Rs. 275—400 grade on the same conditions as they would have been promoted to the present 2nd grade on Rs. 350, and should then go on regularly through the new grades; but there is no need, it is thought, to give them increments beyond the new scale as in the case of the other two grades.

32. Summarising, the proposals are as follows:—

(1) To place about 80 men of the 1st, 2nd, and 3rd grades of Executives, notwithstanding that they are Indian Engineers, in the Imperial list of Engineers, and to place them on exactly the same footing as regards pay as the European Engineer. Their pensions to follow the same rules as now.

(2) To place 23 4th grade Executives, 98 1st grade, and 20 2nd grade Assistants, who are Indian Engineers, in the new Provincial list, but to allow them to draw up to Rs. 950 in the 1st grade.

(3) To put 15 3rd grade Assistants and apprentices wholly on the new rates of pay proposed for the Provincial Establishment: in other words, to deal with them as with the recruits.

33. The effect of the above proposals would be to modify the immediate distribution of the Imperial and Provincial Establishments as follows:—

	Imperial.	Provincial.	Total.
Chief Engineers and officers ranking as such ...	24	...	24
Superintending Engineers and officers ranking as such	56	...	56
Executive Engineers ...	437	23	460
Assistant Engineers	318	142	460
	835	165	1,000

Sub-head 5.—WHETHER THE SEVERAL LISTS CAN BE WORKED AS SEPARATE AND INDEPENDENT SERVICES.

34. The Provincial Establishment being at present so small would have probably to be organised for some years to come as one list. Its distribution at the present moment as compared with the ultimate Provincial Establishment estimated for each list as in table A would be as follows:—

	Engineers, 4th grade.	Assistants.	Total.	Ultimate Total.
Bombay	1	15	16	40
Madras	1	5	6	47
Bengal—Buildings and Roads ...	3	11	14	14
„ Irrigation Branch	2	5	7	28
North-Western Provinces—Buildings and Roads	2	16	18	28
North-Western Provinces—Irrigation Branch	3	9	12	35
Punjab—Buildings and Roads ...	...	18	18	28
„ Irrigation Branch ...	2	10	12	34
Burma	2	8	10	29
Assam	2	3	5	15
Rajputana and Central India ...	1	7	8	10
Hyderabad	...	2	2	18
Central Provinces	...	6	6	12
Coorg	...	...	...	1
	19	115	134	339
Railways	4	27	31	...
	23	142	165	339

35. It would be hardly possible, it is thought, with these small numbers to give each list a graded scale on which promotions might be made; but the scale of pay proposed would obviate many difficulties likely to arise on this score. Care would have to be taken, however, by the central authority, that is the Government of India, that the distribution of Executives and Assistants to each list should be reasonable.

36. Summarising again, the proposed organisation would be as follows for some years to come:—

1st.—An Imperial Establishment on separate lists as at present, consisting of all the present European and about 89 Indian Engineers.

This list on the present rate of recruitment being altered from 21 to 16 would gradually decrease from its present number of 835 to 430.

2nd.—A Provincial Establishment on one list, but under the control of the Local Governments, on scale of pay fixed as suggested in paragraph 18.

37. Eventually, as the strength of the Imperial Establishment diminished and that of the Provincial increased under the influence of the altered rate of recruitment, the Provincial list might be split up, and each list made over wholly to the Local Governments, while the Imperial Establishment should be consolidated into one list.

38. In the above proposals nothing has been said about the promotion of Upper Subordinates to the Provincial Establishment which has been recommended by the Commission (paragraph 96, Chapter X). Such promotions would perhaps not be numerous; and they would not materially affect the strength; in fact, at first they would probably be an assistance to the efficiency of the establishment. The men promoted would come in to some suitable place in the Provincial scale, and would rise in it.

39. As regards furlough and pension, it will probably be held that each class of Engineers now in the Department should retain the furlough and pension rules to which they are now liable; that is to say, those who are now classed as European Engineers, and have the more favourable leave and pension rules, or the pension rules only, as the case may be, will retain those rules intact. At the same time those Indian Engineers who, it is suggested, should be classed on special grounds as Imperial Engineers would retain their present rules, which are those of the Uncovenanted Service.

40. The rest of the Indian Engineers now in Government employ whom we propose to class as Provincial would retain their present rules—those, namely, of the Uncovenanted Service.

41. In regard, however, to the men to be hereafter recruited into the Provincial Establishment, the suggestions of Local Governments are invited as to whether they should be pensionable or not; and, if pensionable, whether they should come under the present rules of the Uncovenanted Service or under modified rules; and, lastly, whether those who rise to the superior appointments should be eligible, as now, to the superior scale of pensions for European Engineers.

Table A.

Province or List	Revised strength, exclusive of absentees.	Total Number of Executive charges.	Distribution of charges. Imperial.	Distribution of charges. Provincial.	Imperial Strength reduced from D. Present on duty D+3.	Provincial Strength. Present on duty D—3.	Allowance for absentees @ 10%.	Total J+K.	Executive Engineer E+10%.	Assistant Engineer L—M.
A.	B.	C.	D.	E.	F.	J.	K.	L.	M.	N.
Bombay	64	35	17	16	25	36	4	40	18	22
Madras	68	29	15	14	25	43	4	47	16	31
Bengal—Buildings and Roads ...	18	9	3	6	5	13	1	14	7	7
,, Irrigation Branch ...	37	14	7	7	12	25	3	28	8	20
North-Western Provinces—Buildings and Roads ...	33	10	5	5	8	25	3	28	6	22
North-Western Provinces—Irrigation Branch	47	16	9	7	15	32	3	35	8	27
Panjab—Buildings and Roads... ...	40	18	9	9	15	25	3	28	10	18
,, Irrigation Branch ...	46	17	9	8	15	31	3	34	9	25
Burma	43	20	10	10	17	20	3	29	11	18
Assam	13	11	...	11	...	13	2	15	12	3
Rajputana and Central India ...	9	4	...	4	...	9	1	10	5	5
Hyderabad	16	7	4	7	...	16	2	18	8	10
Central Provinces	11	6	...	6	...	11	1	12	7	5
Coorg	1	1	...	1	...	1	...	1	1	...
Total mixed list ...	446	195	84	111	140	306	33	339	126	213

Govt. Central Press, Simla.—No. 232 P. W. D.—19-6-93.—271.

Para 4

The Jurisdiction between is about ½ Parliament ½ Provincial Judging from the case that has come before Indian Affairs and taking into consideration the circumstances of the Division in Manitoba 17 of which are unfortunate irrigation ones and 2 of which are Domestic Jurisdiction of Parliament shd be 3 & 1 Provincial ~~50~~ and certainly not less than 3 & 2, this last would in any Division be too small a Jurisdiction

---

With regard to the Railway Branch, I cannot see any reason why if advisable & practicable it the other Branches (Irrigation especially) & certainly Provincial should the same shd not be done in that Branch

---

Para 5

In any Division the present Official Subordinate Staff (if increased in numbers and if not selected) with the Irrigation Engineer ~~not~~ [illegible] to Special Officer in charge of Irrigation would suffice to perform

This duties pertain to the Chief is if the members of the Provincial are indeed the new Provincial Law the Parliament may be which is the Power ranks is for the Power Consider the attorney-general as to allow them to take the position of Asst Eng as they shd do.

The training at Mr Brendon C Eng & College is entirely theoretical and I cannot see as much that we can learn if shd I obtain as an Asst Eng in which ch is the Allen Subordinate until the time served him by actual work: the lower grades as go action and practical

[illegible]
27/8/1890

Letter obtain to A Ry who desires it & he and obtain it Col Haskell He does not think the Imp Parliament the Provincial Asst Eng the Board

[illegible]

Notes on

Scheme for a Separate Imperial & Provincial Police

Subhead 1. - Strength of each Police

In the Scheme as illustrated by Table A it is proposed to allot 15 Imperial Divns & 14 Prov Divns to Hundred - County the new Divs only formed in the Police Force are known only 27 Divs but with the Contingency Divs of Northumberland - Durham & Penrith Force will be 30 - Allowed this however, it is understood to form Standard over other Districts - which will make the number of Charges agree with that given in Table A - The List of the Permanent Divisions is standard & must not be less than the Selection of Men which shall be classed as Imperial and it does not seem possible to allot any of these Men classed as Imperial to Provincial Duty. The Imperial Police system included in Yorkshire, Lincoln, Essex - Kingston - Hampshire Forces it is considered always be Imperial - Belong. Head Quarters, Presidency & Cinque Ports Police Military Building Grants in the case of the first & last named limited Limits of Grant in Particular. Reference to the Sum of £5 for Grant of the year - Building Head Quarters,

Roads &c. : & Public Works have very important bearings upon, such as Canals & channels and Line of the largest Tanks in the Presidency. and the Presidency Water Supply & Sanitary Architects Drainage should always be in the Public Works & Buildings Imperial & Provincial Services alike Imperial & be thus here 20 Appts & Provincial appointed 15 & 10. and this is among Municipal and the classes as Provincial which among should not be done until the Canal is completed.

That Assistant Engineers in the Imperial class should be promoted after 8 years in Service 10 years is quite agreed in, but it is considered that if an Assistant after Provincial Class is confirmed the result on Executive Appt he should not have passed 16 or 17 years for the promotion. Most of the Provincial ones, it is proposed to retain the higher Grade of Assistant Engineers and a man should be at his best in Executive Appointments as Exec: Engrs

The Provincial Service should be considered as recruited from the Public Colleges, but there is one point in connection with these Colleges which has not been brought to notice. They should have more than one College for Engineers in India any more than in England? Secondly is India a days Easy & not Expensive

Natives who seek the higher appointments must be able to afford it. & they may be called upon during their time to go to any part of India. He is taught for examination whether the Roorkee College or Poona would not meet the requirements of the whole of India, the other colleges educating only up to the upper Subordinate Standard. His decision that such an arrangement would be economical & would not affect any of the present pay objectionable. Arrangement by which the highest standard in the class is made an Executive Appointment which the second rate not one or two less marks in Exam. to bring another himself into. merit if he can obtain an appointment as 3rd Asst Engineer without having seen marks for it.

Sub Head 2. Rates of Pay & Promotion of Imperial Establishment.

Suggesting that Subordinate Rates to remain as it is the Scale of pay for Appointments in Class 20 rupees too low. An Appointment in first class pay as an 1st grade Assistant 2nd grade rupees a lower pay than a Superintendent 2nd grade & an E. E. 1st grade on lower pay than a Sub. Engr 2nd grade. The double rates of pay for the Superintendent Establishment does not

however seem a good arrangement.
In a person subsisted by the
intelligent Lunatic Asylum, a depression
was made depending the pay that an
assistant should carry when
hired by a native and by a
European. In one person of six
the Scale of pay as for natives
at. day - $\frac{2}{3}$ of the pay for European
the rate of pay for the Establish-
ments being fixed on the native
Scale and an 'Extra allowance'
of one half more from to the European
holding the same appointment. How
is he paid whether that a native
or Goods a unit is very much
better off than an European on
Goods & the only question is
whether the European is sufficiently
compensated by getting half as
much again as the native. The
difficulties which beset the actual
rate of pay would vanish if this
suggestion was carried out, but if
this is cannot be the Assistant
rate of pay must be furnished
from Imperial & Provincial Estab.
Where the Provincial Scale of pay
should be small, Assam Cachar, Aspired
a less the Provincial Superior Service
is recruited. It has also been
suggested that it should be recruited
locally from Superior Colleges

but it is considered that some
Provision should also be made
for promoting specially deserving
Inferior Subordinates to the Superior
class. and this might be done by
promoting from the 1st grade Superior
occasionally. Men would not obtain this
Grade until several years Experience
in the Dept & would not then be too
old to commence as active Superiors.
Col Reid has indeed suggested that
the Provincial Insp. Genl should be
recruited entirely from deserving Subordi-
nates, but unless Subordinates are
duly trained up to the Superior Standard
it is considered that promotion from
Subordinates should be the exception &
not the rule - It was also calculated
further that 1/10 part of Subdl. Superiors
i.e. 200 Rs it follows that the Salary of
2nd Grade should not be less
than 250 Rs & subsequent promotions
should be considered for an increase
of 100 Rs per month or half annual
as would bring the Salary of the Grade to
2/3 of the Second Salary.

Sub. Head 3. Whether the Superior
appointments are to be on an Estab
of Pay &c. The Inspecting Officers
charge made by the Indian Govt &
they should be, by Selection, and
this being the case; the appointments should

be open which determine to Lieut.
& Provincial Rem, the following shall
have been laid down, the key of the
latter should be only $\frac{2}{3}$ of the former.

Sub Head 4. Distribution of Present
Salary ... & Pension (Civil Commr.)
Ireland. Referring to the prospects
of those who entered the Service into
certain expectations it will be advisable
to provide for the transition to the
new organization. To those who
who have lately entered the Service
the prospect of some future Reduction
must have appeared more or less
a matter of certainty. The key therefore
should be such as Lieut. Lieut. after
Provincial Service might be found
after few years, and here seems the
reason why the Provincial should
not be otherwise less valuable
than Imperial Lieut, so long as present
incumbents in Provincial should
have equal or nearly equal present
salary after deduction of retirement
Key should be classified with reference
to which he receives the present salary
key as a personal allowance.

Sub Head 5. Whether the Provincial Lieut
can be worked as Lieut. ...
in different Services. This is
a large Subject but as it includes

the practice of an amalgamated Imperial list for the Indies & the Imperial assembly: & make an amalgamated Provincial list to be retained while the numbers on the list are small, but when the numbers are much increased the Provincial list shall split up & the Indians have over their Provincial lists while the Imperial lists which must in the mean time be amalgamated. A proposal of the Pope I think ought amalgamation of the Imperial lists are taken under consideration & in case?
notice delayed it was elected that annual separation of the higher ranks since L.L was beginning at the very end & that the former object should have expression of different heads of India in the printed blanks. As matters stand at present a beginning has been made in giving effect to the Ec: Ass: proposals respecting different Provinces. Indians have had & still have several offices from their Provinces filling temporary appts & might at present other Provinces do not, as a matter of course, pick up the names of their best men, but seems that so least an object in future not only should the separate list applying in

Lahore is a Province under the
Command in Chief, the Exchanges
be made duly in the principal Ranks which
alone are susceptible of advantage
by Officers of Artillery by the Prov.
That Quarterly an Prov.d List for the
Block of Lists with a precise &
advantageous is admitted and the
only question seems the Method
it should be an Imperial List only
the Provincial Lists being separate
& under the Provincial Govt. Many
Details Arguments in favor of this
arrangement might be adduced, but
it seems best until the time comes
for making the amalgamation. The
question had not be considered.
Meanwhile the Imp.l & Prov.l Lists
both being under the Prov.l Govt. can
it is considered be best carried
together as one List.

As regards the question whether the
men in the Provincial Regt. should
be pensionable or not, it is considered
best they must be pensionable. The
Game of transferring Employment should
may cause a small saving in, in
a Country where all came attached
to the taking of titles, the Imperial
& a man in power & addl Pay
gains influence. The pensionable
Service is the strongest inducement
whereby, as dismissal for dishonesty

K5

Subsidy the loss of Duty during the Currency of the Contract as the Scale of pleasure it is considered must of Course allow different rates for different Services & that any Shock a Case of the Unconnected Service and in dealing with the future the tendency should be to reduce not increase the pleasure Should Right in Consequence Means of the Belt in value of the Rupee, they cannot one hears to much of as insufficient, case it is considered as a matter to liberal a Scale, and therefore the Rules of the Unconnected Service should apply to all appointments

Jou
9/7/88.

For orders

To J

My latest advice states that Colonel Haslid will be leaving Bangalore towards the end of the week - day not fixed - It would be safer, perhaps, to send the papers to meet him at Madras - where such information as may be necessary could be got ready?

K.A
25-11-54

Ops Main sent to Madras if in order

1130

Please send my Note
and a copy of Gov of I
letter & not to Col Hustead
at once.

Also a copy of the letter
and Note of Gov of I
to H Rn and HE
with a note that it has
been sent to Col Hustead.

[illegible]
[illegible]

Imperial 5

	Divisions
Fort David -	3
Cuddalore -	3
Tellicherry -	1
Anjengo -	1
~~Bombay Castle~~ -	1
Bombay -	1
Fort St George -	1
~~Fort~~ Ft St David -	1
Vizagapatam -	1
Fort St George -	1
Fort St George -	1
Anjengo -	1
Presidency -	1
Presidency Writers Office -	1
Tanjore -	1
Negapatam -	1
Cuddalore -	1
	20

Provincial

Ganjam -	1
Vizagapatam -	1
Rajahmundry -	1
Fort St George -	1
Trichinopoly -	1
Madura -	1
Tinnevelly -	1
	7
[illegible]	1
Cuddalore -	1
	9

Lev: 64 of 7

Wt reference to from Collr
No 1432. G. dated 15th June 186
I am instructed to offer the
following observations ~~relating~~ referring in
connection to the Sub. heads into
which the Scheme for a Supreme
Imperial and Provincial Salt
P. W. Dept' submitted with from
Collr is divided.

Sub. head 1. Including the Calcutta
Provincial Div: in the Presidency
and the Chittagong Division of
Orissa Circle, Rangoon & Pegu
Circle are 30 Divisions in the Madras
Presidency, ~~and~~ the Rangoon
Division will however ~~probably~~ be
abolished next year leaving 29
Divisions, which agrees with the
number given in the Statement
accompanying the Scheme. 2 of these
probably may be retained for the
next 5 years only. The removal
case has been taken in distributing
the Divisions between Imperial &
Provincial and the accompanying
Statement gives the details finally
determined. The three Divisions classed
as Imperial contain salaries of Superintendents, & large Military
buildings or P. Stores & in some
cases both & it would, in the opinion

of this Pvt. to submit here
charge sheets of the Provincial
service. The Buckingham Canal
has been classed as Provincial in
the Appropriation but the scheme cannot
be fully implemented at present, while
the Cuddalore Estimates are worked
out it must be an Imperial charge.
The figures in Column D of Table
A form which the figures subsequent
columns are entered in therefore
20 instead of 15.

This Pvt. enacts in the view that
all the Imperial class
Assist Supts should be promoted to
Executive in 8 or 10 years at latest,
but they are of opinion that
Assistants in the Provincial class
should obtain their promotion before
they are 16 years service, otherwise,
in many instances a man will be
past his prime before he is promoted,
and in Govt. Supt should be a man
of Provincial energy & activity.

As regards the Courses from which
the Provincial Service should be
recruited, this Pvt. are of opinion
that as a rule Assist Supts should
be obtained from the C.E. College in
India, but that in special cases
it will be advisable to promote from
the Subordinate Pvt. They are
of opinion however that Assistants
present
the facilities for travelling in India

Considerable Economy may be effected by confining the higher Education necessary for Provl Appointments to one College alone in India, and that suitable Poona as being the most centrically situated, & its most convenient location; the other Colleges would then be restricted to the Course of Education necessary for admission to the lowest Subordinate Grades.

Subhead 2. As regards the Native of this Presidency the Civil Service, the first case of appointment to the I.C.S. may be filled either by Competition in England or by nomination in India at the discretion of the Supreme Govt. but the Scale fixed in para 20 of the 'Scheme' commences too low, and with the Exception of the Uncovenanted Service which is sometimes entered by men of Practical training, and the system of yearly increments does not commend itself to them. As expressed above, the Subordinate are filled in special cases nominated as beginners but the field from which they could be nominated would probably be that of Left 10th Grade which would contain many of considerable Education & yet not too old for the Department & in most cases the Beng. must be at least Equal to that of Left 10th Grade. If

58

Yearly increments are five the prog
inject commence at 200 Rs, incr £, a
this Rs will prefer, bd increments
are five, the beg of A.S 2nd finds
shall be 250 Rs. An clerical Supt
12th grade shall the receive 350 Rs
and there inject be 4 grades of
pay: Supt shall after of promotion
fixing an increase in pay of Rs 100.
after 3 years in the highest grade
an addition of Rs 50 inject be made
& after another 2 years a further
addition of Rs 50 is sanctioned.

Subhead 3 The Superior establ
above the grade of Executive Supt
are always made by selection by
selection, and this being the case
the Govt are of opinion that these
appointments should be open without
distinction of race or Provincial limits and that
there should be one scale of pay
for them.

Sub head 4. Natives entering
into the prospect of less who
selected in Europe into certain
expectation it will be retrenching
obligations & after the fundation
Blue Book agreement. Natives
however who have only selected
the Service the prospect of some
reduction, but not probably abolished
altogether. This for the benefit of

Opinion that the Key shown
the rate of Canal Light on the
Provincial Service might be raised
after the Season, and that then it
be made only the Light Dues
should not on the one hand exceed
Montreal Port Light, be high as
present incumbents in order that
Canal Ships may be induced to prefer
Seals of Key ports subject of retaliation
Labelled 5. The Objection to
the Scheme is chiefly to form
an Amendment Provincial Act
that would be retaining Light Dues
numbers of the Act on Small, Coal
Slow Vessels on such
increased to Speed of 4 p.m. entering
over the Harbors the Provincial
Light Dues while the Provincial Light
Dues would not be increased those
of Amendment. Other Objects
of an Opposite Key the Port Light
Dues fixed by Act of Parliament
in Opinion is that the Act
and they ~~would~~ ought to
Belong to Corporation Quebec.
Ports of the Light Dues the
Provincial Light Dues may Conveniently
Retained: but they are of Opinion
that it will be best in Every
Way to Abolish & Retain the

Provincial Right under the Provincial
as we did
Govt who would work it into
the existing Govt Scheme.

As regards the fines the Chairman
has seen on the Govt Coll should
be pensioned or not, this Govt
are very slow of opinion that
they should become pensions, and
that rules of the Concord Service
should apply thereto.

2. In the event the questions asked
in paras 2 & 3 of Your letter under
reply have been answered, with
the exception of that in the latter
part of para 4, with respect
thereof I am to say that the
Govt is of opinion that for political
reasons, for some time to
come at least, the Engineers of
the Railway Branch should
be wholly European.

Yours
14/7/05

No. 1432 G.

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

GENERAL.

To

THE GOVERNMENTS OF MADRAS, BOMBAY, BENGAL, THE NORTH-WESTERN PROVINCES AND OUDH, AND THE PUNJAB.

THE CHIEF COMMISSIONERS OF THE CENTRAL PROVINCES, BURMA, AND ASSAM.

THE RESIDENT AT HYDERABAD.

THE AGENT TO THE GOVERNOR-GENERAL FOR CENTRAL INDIA AND RAJPUTANA.

Simla, the 15ht June, 1888.

SIR,

In the report issued by the Public Service Commission, copy of which has already been forwarded to you by the Home Department, the following recommendations are made regarding the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department in Chapter X, paragraphs 91—98 of the Report:—

(1).—That the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department should consist of an Imperial Branch and of Provincial branches.

(2).—That the Imperial Branch should consist of such a number of Royal Engineers as may be required as a reserve for military purposes over and above the officers employed in the Military Works Branch and of Civil Engineers recruited in England.

(3).—That the strength of the Imperial Branch should not be greater than is necessary for purposes of control and direction, and for the execution and repair of works calling for high engineering skill, and that the recruitment from the Coopers Hill Royal Engineering College, which appears at present excessive, should be regulated accordingly.

(4).—That the conditions of service in the Imperial Branch should be fixed with a view to secure the necessary qualifications in England, and should, as far as possible, be uniform for all officers employed in it.

(5).—That the Provincial branches should be of a strength adequate for the construction and maintenance in the several provinces of works not ordinarily calling for high engineering skill.

(6).—That the recruitment for the Provincial branches should be made by the direct appointment to the lowest grades of qualified engineers from the Indian Engineering Colleges, and in exceptional cases by promotion from the Upper Subordinate grades.

(7).—That there should be at least one college in India thoroughly well equipped for providing a high education for Engineers for the Provincial branches, and that such college should be open to all classes of Her Majesty's subjects.

(8).—That the conditions of service as to pay, furlough and pension should be fixed for the Provincial branches, without reference to those of the Imperial Branch.

2. I am directed to request that these recommendations may be considered by the in the light of the suggestions put forward in the accompanying memorandum, which has been prepared in this office as a basis for carrying out in their practical application the recommendations of the Commission.

3. The chief points on which definite proposals are required are enumerated in the first paragraph of the memorandum, and are fully discussed and proposals suggested in the succeeding paragraphs.

4. In regard to the first point, the recommendations of the are particularly requested as to the number of charges, if any, that must be held by men of the Imperial Establishment in ;

in other words, what figures are recommended for the establishment of to be placed in column D of Table A, in substitution of those tentatively inserted by this office.

I am also to enquire whether, in your opinion, the Engineers of the Railway Branch should be wholly Imperial, or whether there might be a mixture of Provincial men.

To Madras, Bombay, Bengal, North-Western Provinces, Punjab and Burma only.

5. An equally important question is, whether, in the opinion of a Provincial Service should be created between the proposed Imperial Service and the existing Subordinate Service, or whether the present Upper Subordinate Staff, if increased in numbers and perhaps improved in training, would suffice to perform the duties of the Provincial Service.

6. I am further to enquire whether, with reference to the 7th recommendation quoted above, satisfied with the training of the Indian College* from which now receive recruits as are educated in this country, or would desire any other mode of recruitment for the Provincial Service, or any alteration in the system of education pursued in the College with which the Province is connected.

* Rurki, Sibpur, Madras, Poona.

7. On these as well as on the other subjects mentioned in the memorandum, and also on any other points touched upon by the Public Service Commission, the views and recommendations of the are solicited by the Government of India; and I am to request that a reply to this enquiry may be furnished at the earliest possible date, and that, if possible, its return to this office may not be delayed beyond the 15th July.

I have the honour to be,

SIR,

Your most obedient Servant,

G. H. D. WALKER,

Under-Secretary.

Documents accompanying.

Memorandum referred to.

Govt. C. Press, Simla.—No. 345 P. W. D.—20-6-93—10.

62

Scheme for a Separate Imperial and Provincial Establishment, Public Works Department, prepared with reference to proposals by the Public Service Commission.

Assuming that separate Imperial and Provincial Establishments are to be organised, as recommended by the Public Service Commission, the points which have to be authoritatively settled are the following:—

1st.—What, looking into the far future, is to be the respective strength of each establishment? Does table A (see paragraph 2) give a fair distribution for the two services, and is the future Railway Branch to be wholly Imperial?

On this decision depends the rate of recruitment to be now ordered in substitution for the present rate.

2nd.—What are the rates of pay and promotion for the Provincial Establishment to be?

3rd.—Are the superior appointments to be on one scale of pay, and open by selection to Imperial and Provincial men alike?

4th.—In distributing the present establishment between Imperial and Provincial, at what grade are we to draw the line of separation in regard to men who are classed as "Indian Engineers;" and how far are we to give better prospects as regards pay to the men now in Government employ who may be placed in the Provincial Establishment than to men in future entering the establishment?

5th.—Looking to the smallness of the numbers in each service (as in statement A) in even the largest provinces, and still more in the smallest, is it possible to work them as separate and independent services, or should they be placed as regards promotion on a general list for all India, though without liability to transfer from one Province to another, except in the cases of the Local Administrations?

These points are discussed with tentative suggestions in detail below.

Sub-head 1.—STRENGTH OF EACH ESTABLISHMENT.

2. In order to illustrate what may be taken as a possible distribution of the present (revised) charges and posts of the several Provincial lists of the Public Works Department between an Imperial and Provincial Establishment, a table marked A has been prepared.

3. Columns B and C shew the revised strength as far as it has been settled, and the number of Executive charges on these lists, which include all but the Railway and Military Works Department lists.

4. The important columns upon which the rest are based are columns D and E. These distribute the Executive charges between Imperial and Provincial Engineers. The distribution must be more or less arbitrary. In provinces where, as in Bombay and Madras, there is no marked line between Buildings and Roads and Irrigation, and there is a good deal of irrigation, a slight preponderance is given to Imperial. For Bengal Buildings and Roads, only three Imperial charges are allowed, *viz.*, for the Presidency Divisions and Under-Secretary; the irrigation establishment is equally divided between the two, so as to give a good leaven of Imperial. For Buildings and Roads Branch in the North-Western Provinces, Punjab, and Burma, there must probably be for some considerable time a good proportion of Imperial men, and the charges are divided equally. For the purely Irrigation charges of the North-Western Provinces and the Punjab, a slight preponderance is given to Imperial. The Buildings and Road charges of the smaller administration are assigned wholly to Provincial.

5. In fixing the total strength of the Imperial Establishment, it is necessary to provide that there should always be a sufficient number of Assistants in training for the Imperial Executive charges, the number of which is

suggested in column D. It has long since been laid down as an axiom that this training in the Assistant class should not last more than 8 to 10 years; and to induce this rate of advancement, the proportion of Assistant to Executive Engineers must be as 2 to 3. The total effective strength, as in column F, and the distribution of the whole strength, including allowance for absentees, as in columns H and I, are deduced accordingly from the number of Executive charges in column D by allowing the necessary proportion to induce this rate of promotion.

6. The balance of the establishment, according to the revised strength in column B, must be Provincial, and this establishment must fill the balance of Executive posts which remain after providing for the Imperial Establishment, and the rest must be Assistant Engineers. This is worked out in columns J to N. It will be observed that in the Provincial Establishment the Assistants greatly exceed the Executives—that is, we sacrifice the Provincial to the Imperial. It is reasonable that the rate of promotion in responsibility and pay (which depends on this distribution for the Provincial Establishment should be slower than for the Imperial, but probably some device would be necessary to accelerate it.

7. The general result of the table, however, is that for these Provincial lists we require the following establishment of Executive and Assistant Engineers, including allowances for absentees:—

	Executives.	Assistants.	Total.
Imperial	95	66	161
Provincial	126	213	339

8. There then remain the Railway and Military Works Department lists, the former of which, we may tentatively assume, must be manned wholly by Imperial Engineers, namely, Coopers Hill and Royal Engineers, and the latter by Royal Engineers. If we assume that these lists must be manned throughout by Imperial Engineers, we may neglect the question of charges, and assume that, irrespective of the charges held, they must be divided into Executive and Assistant classes in the proportion necessary to give the proper flow of promotion.

9. The actual present strength calculated for the Railway Branch is 145, and 52 for the Military Works Department; and adding 15 per cent. to each for absentees, the establishment will be—

	Executives.	Assistants.	Total.
Railway	99	67	166
Military Works Department	36	24	60

and adding all the lists as above together we get as the total strength of Executives and Assistant Engineers for India—

Imperial	230	157	387
Provincial	126	213	339
Grand Total ...	356	370	726

10. Next, as to the superior posts above the rank of Executives and Assistants, which may be taken as 80. The distribution by classes of lists for these posts may be taken as follows:—

Provincial lists—Buildings and Roads and Irrigation	46
Railway Branch	27
Military Works Department	7

And assuming, solely for purposes of establishing the strength, that these posts would fall to Imperial and Provincial in proportion to their strength in the several lists, we should have—

	Imperial.	Provincial.	Total.
Provincial lists	15	31	46
Railway	27	...	27
Military Works Department	7	...	7
	49	31	80

or, in round numbers, 50 superior posts fall to Imperial and 30 to Provincial.

11. Allowing again 15 per cent. for absentees in these posts, the strength for Imperial and Provincial would be—

	Executives and Assistants.	Superior Posts.	Total.
Imperial	387	58	445
Provincial	339	35	374
			819

12. Now the above total strength is not far off the number (800) to which our present rate of recruitment is understood to be leading us; but there is considerable difference in the distribution of the Imperial and Provincial element, which at present is as follows:—

	Recruits.	Ultimate strength.
Imperial—		
Coopers Hill	15	400
Royal Engineers	6	160
Provincial—		
Indian Colleges	9	240
	30	800

That is, instead of tending to an establishment of 430 Imperial and 370 Provincial, as approximately worked out above, we are tending to one of 560 Imperial and 240 Provincial.

13. Again, if we take our present establishment of about 1,000 men, we find that it consists of 745 European Engineers, who answer to the Imperial, and of 255 Indian Engineers, who answer to the Provincial Establishment.

If, then, we intend to take steps to remodel the establishment in the direction indicated, we must modify our rate of recruitment.

14. Our present rate of recruitment is confessedly a reduced one, the full rate being 33 for a strength of 880 men; and the reduction was obtained by decreasing the number of Royal Engineer recruits from 9 to 6. It will probably be considered inadvisable under present circumstances to increase the total recruitment; but in making any modification we should recruit (if we can) up to the full ultimate Royal Engineer strength of about 250, as arranged with the Military Department in communication with the Home Government. The revised recruitment and strength according to the accepted estimates would then be—

	Recruits.	Estimated strength.
Imperial—		
Coopers Hill	7	190
Royal Engineers	9	240
Provincial—		
Indian Colleges	14	370
	30	800

15. According to this proposal, Coopers Hill, which began some years ago with an annual number of 40 or 45 appointments to the Public Works Department, now reduced to fifteen, would come down to seven.

16. The above conclusions and proposals may be summed up as follows:—

1st.—That, according to present estimates of strength and requirements of the different lists, we might work the Public Works Department with 430 Imperial (European) and 370 Provincial (Indian) Engineers.

2nd.—That we should so organise the Imperial Establishment re-arranged under the first proposal as to give what is considered the essential rate of promotion in the Executive grades.

3rd.—That if we decide to take this step, we should considerably increase the Indian recruitment and reduce the Coopers Hill element.

17. It is assumed that the Local Governments will be content to supply their Provincial services by recruits from the four Indian Colleges (Rurki, Sibpur, Poona, Madras), but if any other source of recruitment is advocated, or if any change should be made in the system there pursued so as to provide a higher education for Provincial Engineers than they now get, its nature should be explained in the reply to this memorandum.

Sub-head 2.—RATES OF PAY AND PROMOTION OF THE PROVINCIAL ESTABLISHMENT.

18. The Provincial Establishment, according to the suggestions made above, will be organised on the following main lines:—

Superior posts	30
Executive posts	127
Assistants	213
	370

The above ratio between Executives and Assistants would give promotion from one class to the other in about the 16th or 17th year of service.

19. Then as to the rate of pay for this establishment, the Public Service Commission recommends that it should be fixed without reference to that of the Imperial Establishment.

As we shall have to commence the establishment with a very few men all in the lower grades, and as it will gradually increase to a considerable strength under the influence of an increased number of recruits, it will probably be better to give an incremental scale; in fact, the only alternative to this would be a graded scale adjusted periodically to give approximately the same rate of promotion as that which the incremental scale will give.

20. If the rate of pay of the Provincial Service is fixed on the same sort of scale as has hitherto been current, then the salaries of the Executive and Assistant grades might be as follows; but this is merely put forward as a suggestion on which to work, and because some definite proposals are required:—

	Period in grade.	Promotion possible at end of
Apprentice on Rs. 100	1 year	1st year.
Assistant Engineer class—		
2nd grade, Rs. 125—25—250	5 years	6th „
1st „ Rs. 275—25—100	5 „	11th „
Executive Engineer class—		
2nd grade, Rs. 450—30—600	5 „	16th „
1st „ Rs. 600—30—750	5 „	21st „
An increment of Rs. 50 after two years ...	2 „	23rd „
„ „ „ ...	2 „	25th „

The maximum pay thus obtainable by men in the 1st grade of Executives would be Rs. 850, and they would attain this about the end of the 47th year of their age at the earliest, that is, after passing through the grades as fast as they could. The above arrangement of grades would distribute Executives and Assistant Engineers in about equal proportions and would perpetuate the present anomaly of giving men the pay and rank of Executives and the work of Assistants. If the ratio of 127 Executives to 213 Assistants, as in paragraph 18, is to be maintained, the period of service in the class of Assistant Engineer must be considerably enlarged; temporary promotions from class to class should be allowed only for change of duties.

21. It is probable however that some instructions of a general character may be issued by the Government of India regarding the scale of salaries to be allotted to the Provincial Service in all Departments; and as the question of the pay of this branch of the Public Works Department does not press so

urgently for a solution as does that of the number of posts to be set apart for them, on which an early decision as to future recruitment depends, it may perhaps be convenient if an answer on this sub-head be deferred till the Government of India has declared its opinion on the general question.

22. It is possible moreover, that Local Governments may hold that it is not necessary to create a new Provincial Service between the Imperial and the present Subordinate Service, but that all the work for which the Imperial Service is not required can be effectually performed by an enlargement of the upper ranks of the present Subordinate Service and without alteration of their present salaries. If this view is entertained, it is hoped that definite proposals as to the number, grades, and recruitment of this Upper Subordinate Service will be submitted in replying to this memorandum.

Sub-head 3.—WHETHER THE SUPERIOR APPOINTMENTS ARE TO BE ON ONE SCALE OF PAY, AND OPEN WITHOUT DISTINCTION TO IMPERIAL AND PROVINCIAL MEN.

23. Another question to be decided is whether the superior appointments above the Executive grade should carry the same pay whether held by Provincial or Imperial men, and whether men of each establishment should be appointed by selection to these posts, or whether there should be any reservation of a proportionate share of the posts for each establishment.

24. It would be easier to allow a separate scale of pay for these posts if there were any prospects of working Provincial Establishments without any admixture of Imperial men; for there may be some difficulty in making an Imperial Executive Engineer on Rs. 1,000 work under a Provincial Superintending Engineer on Rs. 900, or an Imperial Superintending Engineer on Rs. 1,600 under a Provincial Chief Engineer on Rs. 1,500. It would be probably equally difficult to arrange that Provincial men shall only serve under Provincial, and Imperial men under Imperial, when men of both services are employed in the same branch.

25. This will be seen at once from the figures below, which are based on the supposition that the superior posts are divided between Imperial and Provincial men approximately according to the numerical proportion of each:—

	Chief Engineers.	Superintending Engineers.
Buildings and Roads Branch—		
Imperial	6	5
Provincial	2	21
Irrigation—		
Imperial	3	3
Provincial	...	6
Total ...	11	35

That is to say, in the Buildings and Roads Branch the bulk of the Superintending Engineer appointments would be held by Provincial men, who would thus come into contact with Imperial men, while it would be difficult to prevent the Chief Engineers of the Provincial Establishment from being placed over Imperial men. In the Irrigation Branch, the Provincial and Imperial appointments would be about equally divided, and the Imperial men would generally hold the Chief Engineerships. On the whole, the probable conclusion seems to be that, unless an establishment can be wholly worked by Provincial or by Imperial men, it will be simpler to have only one scale of pay for the superior appointments. This uniformity of pay is irrespective of the question whether a fixed proportion of the superior appointments should be given to Provincial men, or whether no proportion of the whole number of superior appointments dependent on the strength of each should be laid down for either establishment, but the best men should be selected from either class with due regard to the claims of seniority.

Sub-head 4.—DISTRIBUTION OF THE PRESENT ESTABLISHMENT BETWEEN IMPERIAL AND PROVINCIAL, AND TRANSITION FROM THE PRESENT TO THE NEW ORGANISATION.

26. The present distribution of the establishment between European and Indian Engineers, which two classes are ultimately to correspond with the Imperial and Provincial, is as follows :—

	European.	Indian.	Total.
Chief Engineers and officers ranking as such ...	24	...	24
Superintending Engineers and officers ranking as such	49	7	56
Executive Engineers	354	106	460
Assistant Engineers	318	142	460
	745	255	1,000
As compared with our ultimate scale of ...	430	370	800

It may be calculated roughly that, if we alter the rate of recruitment as suggested in paragraph 14, we should increase the Indian Establishment to the revised number of 370 by about the year 1905, and that similarly the European Establishment would be considerably reduced by the same period, and would be approximating to the ultimate number.

27. The difficulty is where and how to start the Indian Establishment as a separate organisation to the European; when and where to draw the line.

28. The position is that we have now one establishment of European and Indian Engineers on one scale of pay, and we want to divide this establishment into two separate establishments, one of which will be on a lower scale of pay. It is also very desirable, in order to hasten the new organisation, that the separation should include some of the present establishment.

29. The problem is how to make this separation equitably. In the first place, the line between each class, the European and Indian Engineers, though clearly marked in the lower grades, which are filled by men recruited in definite proportions from Coopers Hill and from Indian Colleges, is not so clearly marked in the upper grades; and the men in these upper grades would look upon it as a very great grievance and slur upon them to be placed in a class which must inevitably be looked upon as the inferior class. Some of them, though not a very large number, are men whose domicile is in England. It is thought therefore, irrespective of any question of altering the rate of pay of present incumbents, that none of the men now in the higher grades can be placed in the inferior Service. It is suggested, however, that the line may be drawn below either the 3rd or the 4th grade of Executive Engineers, and that all the Indian Engineers may be placed below this line in a separate list, which will be the commencement of our Provincial Establishment. All the men below the line, with very few exceptions, if any, are Natives, Eurasians, or Europeans whose domicile is in India.

30. It does not follow, however, that relegation to the inferior establishment must of necessity mean decrease of even prospective pay to all. The following compares the present rates common to the whole establishment with the rate proposed for the new class :—

	Present scale. Rs.	Suggested Provincial. Rs.
Apprentice	100	100
Assistant Engineer, 4th grade ...	...	125 to 250
" " 3rd " ...	250	
" " 2nd " ...	350 to 400	275 to 400
" " 1st " ...	500	
Executive Engineer, 4th grade ...	600	450 to 600
" " 3rd " ...	700	
" " 2nd " ...	800	600 to 850
" " 1st " ...	950	

31. The proposal is that men below the present 3rd grade, that is, men on Rs. 600, Rs. 500, Rs. 350, Rs. 250, and Rs. 100, should pass over to the new Provincial Establishment; but to prevent inequitable reduction in their prospective

pay, it might be provided that two additional increments of Rs. 50 each should be allowable to men of the present 4th grade Executive and 1st and 2nd grade Assistant so as to bring their pay ultimately up to Rs. 950. Meanwhile all would pass into the new grades; that is, the 4th grade Executive Engineer, after completing five years on Rs. 600, would be eligible for promotion to the Rs. 600—850 grade, and by further periodical increments might rise to Rs. 950. Similarly, the 1st grade Assistant would pass into the new Rs. 450—600 grade, and would receive increments and be eligible for promotion in due course. The 2nd grade Assistant would pass into the Rs. 275—400 grade, and would rise on the same principle. The 3rd grade Assistant should be promoted to the Rs. 275—400 grade on the same conditions as they would have been promoted to the present 2nd grade on Rs. 350, and should then go on regularly through the new grades; but there is no need, it is thought, to give them increments beyond the new scale as in the case of the other two grades.

32. Summarising, the proposals are as follows :—

(1) To place about 80 men of the 1st, 2nd, and 3rd grades of Executives, notwithstanding that they are Indian Engineers, in the Imperial list of Engineers, and to place them on exactly the same footing as regards pay as the European Engineer. Their pensions to follow the same rules as now.

(2) To place 23 4th grade Executives, 98 1st grade, and 29 2nd grade Assistants, who are Indian Engineers, in the new Provincial list, but to allow them to draw up to Rs. 950 in the 1st grade.

(3) To put 15 3rd grade Assistants and apprentices wholly on the new rates of pay proposed for the Provincial Establishment: in other words, to deal with them as with the recruits.

33. The effect of the above proposals would be to modify the immediate distribution of the Imperial and Provincial Establishments as follows :—

	Imperial.	Provincial.	Total.
Chief Engineers and officers ranking as such ...	24	...	24
Superintending Engineers and officers ranking as such	56	...	56
Executive Engineers ...	437	23	460
Assistant Engineers ...	318	142	460
	835	165	1,000

Sub-head 5.—WHETHER THE SEVERAL LISTS CAN BE WORKED AS SEPARATE AND INDEPENDENT SERVICES.

34. The Provincial Establishment being at present so small would have probably to be organised for some years to come as one list. Its distribution at the present moment as compared with the ultimate Provincial Establishment estimated for each list as in table A would be as follows :—

	Engineers, 4th grade.	Assistants.	Total.	Ultimate Total.
... ...	1	15	16	40
Bombay	1	5	6	47
Madras	3	11	14	14
Bengal—Buildings and Roads ...	2	5	7	28
" Irrigation Branch	2	16	18	28
North-Western Provinces—Buildings and Roads	3	9	12	35
North-Western Provinces—Irrigation Branch ...	...	18	18	28
Punjab—Buildings and Roads ...	2	10	12	34
" Irrigation Branch ...	2	8	10	29
Burma	2	3	5	15
Assam	1	7	8	10
Rajputana and Central India ...	...	2	2	18
Hyderabad	...	6	6	12
Central Provinces	...	...	...	1
Coorg	19	115	134	339
	4	27	31	...
Railways	23	142	165	339

35. It would be hardly possible, it is thought, with these small numbers to give each list a graded scale on which promotions might be made; but the scale of pay proposed would obviate many difficulties likely to arise on this score. Care would have to be taken, however, by the central authority, that is the Government of India, that the distribution of Executives and Assistants to each list should be reasonable.

36. Summarising again, the proposed organisation would be as follows for some years to come:—

1st.—An Imperial Establishment on separate lists as at present, consisting of all the pre-sent European and about 80 Indian Engineers.

This list on the present rate of recruitment being altered from 21 to 16 would gradually decrease from its present number of 355 to 130.

2nd.—A Provincial Establishment on one list, but under the control of the Local Governments, on scale of pay fixed as suggested in paragraph 18.

37. Eventually, as the strength of the Imperial Establishment diminished and that of the Provincial increased under the influence of the altered rate of recruitment, the Provincial list might be split up, and each list made over wholly to the Local Governments, while the Imperial Establishment should be consolidated into one list.

38. In the above proposals nothing has been said about the promotion of Upper Subordinates to the Provincial Establishment which has been recommended by the Commission (paragraph 96, Chapter X). Such promotions would perhaps not be numerous; and they would not materially affect the strength; in fact, at first they would probably be an assistance to the efficiency of the establishment. The men promoted would come in to some suitable place in the Provincial scale, and would rise in it.

39. As regards furlough and pension, it will probably be held that each class of Engineers now in the Department should retain the furlough and pension rules to which they are now liable; that is to say, those who are now classed as European Engineers, and have the more favourable leave and pension rules, or the pension rules only, as the case may be, will retain those rules intact. At the same time those Indian Engineers who, it is suggested, should be classed on special grounds as Imperial Engineers would retain their present rules, which are those of the Uncovenanted Service.

40. The rest of the Indian Engineers now in Government employ whom we propose to class as Provincial would retain their present rules—those, namely, of the Uncovenanted Service.

41. In regard, however, to the men to be hereafter recruited into the Provincial Establishment, the suggestions of Local Governments are invited as to whether they should be pensionable or not; and, if pensionable, whether they should come under the present rules of the Uncovenanted Service or under modified rules; and, lastly, whether those who rise to the superior appointments should be eligible, as now, to the superior scale of pensions for European Engineers.

Table A.

Province or List.	Revised strength, exclusive of absentees.	Total Number of Executive charges.	Distribution of charges.		Imperial Strength deduced from D.				Provincial Strength.				
			Imperial.	Provincial.	Present on duty D + 5.	Total strength F + 15%.	Executive Engineers.	Assistant Engineers.	Present on duty B—F.	Allowance for absentees @ 10%.	J + K	Executive Engineers E + 10%.	Assistant Engineers L—M.
A.	B.	C.	D.	E.	F.	G.	H.	I.	J.	K.	L.	M.	N.
Bombay	64	33	17	16	28	32	19	13	36	4	40	18	22
Madras	68	29	15	14	25	29	17	12	43	4	47	16	31
Bengal—Buildings and Roads ...	18	9	3	6	5	6	4	2	13	1	14	7	7
„ Irrigation Branch	37	11	7	7	12	11	8	6	25	3	28	8	20
North-Western Provinces—Buildings and Roads	33	10	5	5	8	9	5	4	25	3	28	6	22
North-Western Provinces—Irrigation Branch	47	16	9	7	15	17	10	7	32	3	35	8	27
Punjab—Buildings and Roads... ...	40	18	9	9	15	17	10	7	25	3	28	10	18
„ Irrigation Branch	46	17	9	8	15	17	10	7	31	3	34	9	25
Burma	43	20	10	10	17	20	12	8	26	3	29	11	18
Assam	13	11	...	11	...	...	...	...	13	2	15	12	3
Rajputana and Central India	9	4	...	4	...	...	...	...	9	1	10	5	5
Hyderabad	16	7	...	7	...	...	...	...	16	2	18	8	10
Central Provinces	11	6	...	6	...	...	...	...	11	1	12	7	5
Coorg	1	1	...	1	...	...	...	...	1	...	1	1	...
Total mixed list ...	446	195	84	111	140	161	95	66	306	33	339	126	213

Govt. Central Press, Simla.—No. 222 P. W. D.—13-6-88.—271.

Copy submitted for the information of the Hon. Mr. F. S. Mr. Cohen, C.S.I., with reference to that the papers have been sent to Colonel Hastie for disposal.

C. C. R. G.
Pol. Secy to Govt. Mad.

For orders

Note on

Scheme for a separate Imperial and Provincial Establishment

Read letter from the Govt. of India No. 1632-G. dy 15 June 1885.

Sub-head I. Strength of each Establishment.—

In the scheme as illustrated by Table A it is proposed to allot 15 Imperial Divisions and 14 Provincial Divisions to Madras. Counting the new Division lately formed in the Kistna there are however only 27 Divisions, but with the temporary Divisions of Rajahmundry, Ramnad & Periyar there will be 30. Ramnad will however, it is understood be soon handed over to the Zamindar, which would make the number of charges agree with that

given in Table A. A list
of the permanent divisions
is attached and great care
has been given to the selection
of those which should be
classed as Imperial and it
does not seem possible to
allot any of those therein
classed as Imperial to a
Provincial Establishment.
The large Delta systems
included in Godavari, Kistna,
Nellore, Tungbhadra & Nagapatam
must it is considered always
be Imperial. Bellary, West
Coast, Presidency & Chingleput
contain important military
buildings, besides, in the
case of the first and last
mentioned, irrigation works of
great importance. Nilgiris is
the seat of Government for
part of the year and Military
Head Quarters. North Arcot
and South Arcot have very
important irrigation works, such
as anicuts and channels and some
of the largest tanks in the
Presidency, and the Presidency
Workshops and Consulting
Architects' Division must always
be Imperial, the Kurnool Cuddapah
and Periyar works until completion
must also be Imperial. We
thus have 20 Imperial and
9 Provincial against 15 & 14,
and this is allowing Buckingham
Canal to be classed as Provincial
which certainly should not be
done until the canal is
completed.

Asst Assistant Engineers

in the Imperial class should be promoted to Executive in 8 or 10 years is quite agreed in but it is considered that if an Assistant in the Provincial C class is ever fit to be made an Executive Engineer he should not have to wait 16 or 17 years for the promotion. Most of the Provincial Staff will, it is presumed be natives who begin to grow old earlier than Europeans and a man should be at his best in bodily vigour when an Executive Engineer.

The Provincial service should it is considered be recruited from the Indian Colleges, but there is no point in connection with these Colleges which has not been

brought to notice. Why should there be more than one College for Engineers in India any more than in England? Travelling is now-a-days easy and not expensive. Natives who seek the higher appointments must be able to afford it, and they may be called upon during their service to go to any part of India. It is a matter for consideration whether an Engineer College at Poona would not meet the requirements of the whole of India, the other Colleges educating only up to the Upper Subordinate standard. It is believed that such an arrangement would be economical and we should

get rid of the present very objectionable arrangement by which the highest student in the class is made an Assistant Engineer while the second with but one or two less marks in examination may consider himself fortunate if he can obtain an appointment as 3d grade Overseer after waiting some months for it.

Sub-head 2. Rates of Pay and Promotion of Inferior Establishment.—

Supposing our Upper Subordinate Establishment to remain as it is, the scale of pay suggested in para 20 begins too low - an apprentice is given the same pay as a 1st grade Overseer on first

Engineer 2d grade begins on lower pay than a Superintendent 2d grade, and an Assistant Engineer 1st grade on lower pay than a Sub Engineer 2d grade. The double rates of pay suggested for the Engineer Establishment does not however seem a good arrangement.

In a paper submitted by the undersigned some time ago, a suggestion was made regarding the pay that an appointment should carry when held by a native and by a European. It was proposed to fix the scale of pay for natives at pay - 1/3d of the pay for Europeans, the rates of pay for all establishments being fixed on the native scale and an

'Indian allowance' of one half more given to all Europeans holding the same appointment. There is no doubt whatever that a native on 400 Rs a month is very much better off than an European on 600 Rs and the only question is whether the European is sufficiently compensated by getting half as much again as the native. The difficulties which beset the dual rate of pay would vanish if this suggestion was carried out, but if it cannot be, separate rates of pay must be provided for Imperial and Provincial Establishments.

What the Provincial scale of pay should be must, to some extent, depend on how the Provincial Engineer service is recruited. It has above been proposed that it should be recruited from the Indian Engineer College, but it is considered that some provision should also be made for promoting specially deserving Upper Subordinates to the Engineer class, and this might be done by promoting from the 1st grade Supervisors — occasionally — men would not attain this grade without several years experience in the Department and would not then be too old to commence as Assistant Engineers. Colonel Mead has indeed

suggested that the Provincial Engineer service should be recruited entirely from persons subordinate, but unless men entering the Subordinate service are all educated up to the Engineer standard it is considered that promotions from Subordinate should be the exception and not the rule. If men are in special cases selected from the 1st grade of Supervisors whose pay is 200 Rs it follows that the pay of 2d grade Assistants should not be less than 250 Rs and subsequent promotion should it is considered give an increase of 100 Rs per mensem or such amount as would bring the pay of the grade to ⅔ of the present

pay.

Subhead 3. Whether the superior appointments are to be open without distinction to Imperial and Provincial men, or one scale of pay &c. Not

The superior appointments above the executive grade are now always made by the Madras Government, as they should be, by selection, and this being the case, the appointments should be open without distinction to Imperial and Provincial men, but following what has been paid above, the pay of the latter should be only ⅔ of the former.

Subhead 4. Distribution of the present establishment between Imperial and Provincial, and transition from the present to the new

organisation.

Without interfering with the prospects of men who entered the service with certain expectations it will be extremely difficult to effect the transition to the new organisation. To those however who have lately entered the service the prospect of some future reduction must have appeared more or less a matter of certainty. The pay therefore above the rank of Assistant Engineer on the Provincial service might be fixed on the new scale, and there seems to be no reason why the Provincial should not be at once separated from the Imperial List,

so long as present incumbents in grades above Assistant Engineers are secured the present scale of pay up to date of retirement. They would be classified on the new lists but receive the difference between the new and present scale of pay as a personal allowance.

Subhead 5. Whether the several lists can be worked as separate and independent services. This is a large subject as it includes the question of an amalgamated Imperial list for all India and the suggestion apparently is to make an amalgamated Provincial list pro tem to be retained while the numbers

on the list are small, but when the numbers are much increased the Provincial list to be split up and the portions made over to the Provincial Governments while the Imperial lists which would then be reduced should be amalgamated. A proposal of the Govt of India tending to the amalgamation of the Imperial lists was lately under consideration and in a note on the subject it was stated that amalgamation of the higher ranks above Executive Engineer was beginning at the wrong end, and that the junior officers should have experience of different parts of India in the first place.

The papers on this subject are being found—

As matters stand at present a beginning has been made in giving officers of the Executive Engineer grades experience in different Provinces. Madras has had and still has several officers from other Provinces filling temporary appointments and though at present other Provinces do not as a matter of course, give up the services of their best men, there seems to be no reason why in future not only should the super-abundant supply in one Province meet the demand in another, but exchanges be made in the junior ranks which could not fail to be of advantage to the officers and ultimately

to the Government. That
eventually one P.W.D. List
for the whole of India will be
possible and advantageous is
admitted, and the only question
seems to be whether it shall be
an Imperial List only - the
Provincial Lists being refunded
and under the Provincial Govts.
Many arguments in favor of
this arrangement might be
adduced, but it seems that
until the time comes for
making the amalgamation, the
question need not be considered.
Meanwhile the Imperial
and Provincial lists both
being under the Provincial
Governments can it is considered
be best worked together as

one List. 75

As regards the question
whether the men on the Provincial
Establishment should be pensionable
or not, it is considered that
they must be pensionable.
The bane of temporary
employment which may cease
at a months notice is, in a
country where no shame
attaches to the taking of
bribes, the temptation to a
man in power to add to his
gains indirectly - but pensionable
service is the strongest induce-
ment to honesty, as dismissal
for dishonesty entails the loss
of everything in the future.
As to the scale of pensions,
it is considered most ——

objectionable to have different rules for different services and that they should be those of the Uncovenanted Service, and in dealing with the future the tendency should be to reduce not to increase the pensions which, though in consequence mainly of the fall in value of the Rupee, one bears so much of an unfriendly, are it is considered on a rather too liberal a scale, and therefore the rules of the Uncovenanted Service should apply to all appointments.

Jolly
10/7/68.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE MADRAS GOVERNMENT.

UNDER date the

READ the following

From the Government of India (P.C. No. 1432 G dated June 15. 1868)

Ordered that the following reply be sent:—

(P.C. No. dated)

To,

The Secretary to the Government of India P.D.

Sir,

With reference to your letter No. 1432 G dated 15th June 1868, I am instructed to offer the following observations, referring in succession to the paragraphs into which the scheme for a separate Imperial and Provincial Establishment P.W. Dept submitted with your letter is divided.

P.S. We probably like to see this before it issues. Do subsidies the results of a consultation after last council

17/7

Subhead 1. Including the lately formed new Divisions in the Kistna and the temporary Divisions of Nuslikelya, Nanmad and Sonar there are 30 Divisions in the Madras Presidency; the Nanmad Division will however be abolished next year, leaving 29 Divisions, which agrees with the number given in the statement accompanying the scheme, two of these probably being retained for the next five years only. The utmost care has been taken in distributing the Divisions between Imperial and Provincial and the accompanying statement gives the result finally determined, with the exception of the Belgaum Division. All these Divisions classed as Imperial contain either very important irrigation works or large Military buildings ~~Government Farms~~, and in some cases both, and it would be objectionable in the opinion of this Govt. to entrust their charge to Officers of the Provincial

On the Nilgiris there are Govt. House & Military Headquarters and there are obvious reasons why this station should be kept for Officers recruited in England.

Madura must become an Imperial charge when the Periar project is completed & executed in it, but by that time there will probably be some other Division & possibly temporary Provincial Officer competent to hold one of the charges now classed as Imperial. This Govt will certainly do their best to provide for the Provincial man.

service. The Buckingham Canal has been classed as Provincial on the supposition that the scheme cannot be fully introduced at present, but until the completion estimates are worked out it must be an Imperial charge. The figure in column 2 of Table A from which the figures in subsequent columns are deduced is therefore 20 instead of 15.

This Government concurs in the view that Assistant Engineers in the Imperial class should be promoted to Executives in 8 or 10 years at latest, but they are of opinion that Assistants in the Provincial class should attain their promotion before they are 16 years in the service, otherwise, in many instances a man will be past his prime before he is promoted, and an Executive Engineer should be a man of considerable energy and activity.

As regards the source from which the Provincial Service should be recruited, this Government are of opinion that as a rule Assistant Engineers should be obtained from the Civil Engineering Colleges in India, but that in special cases it will be advisable to promote from the Subordinate grades. They are of opinion however that in view to lowering the present facilities for travelling in India considerable economy may be effected by confining the higher education necessary for Provincial Engineers to a single College in India, and they would suggest Poona, being the most centrally situated, as the most convenient location. The other Colleges would then be restricted to the course of education necessary for admission to the Upper Subordinate grade.

Subhead 2. As regards the rates

of pay and promotion of the Provincial Establishment, this Govt are of opinion that the pay of Assistant Engineers & Executive Engineers may be fixed without reference to that of the Imperial Establishment, but that the scale given in paras 20 of the 'Scheme' commencing two low, with the exception of the Apprentice grades, which, it is presumed, corresponds with that of new under practical training; and the system of granting yearly increments does not commend itself to them. If, as suggested above, Upper Subordinates are to be in special cases promoted as Engineers the grade from which they would be promoted would probably be that of Superior 1st grade, which would contain men of considerable experience and

and yet not too old for advancement, and in that case the pay of Assistant Engineer 2d. grade must be at least equal to that of Supervision 1st grade. If yearly increments are given the pay might commence at 200 Rs, but if, as this Government would prefer, no increments are given, the pay of Assistant Engineer 2d. grade should be 250 Rs. An Asst. Engineer 1st grade would then receive 350 Rs, and there might be four grades of Executive Engineers, each step of promotion giving an increase in pay of Rs 100/- After two years in the highest grade an addition of Rs 50 might be made, and after another two years a further addition of Rs 50/, as suggested.

Subhead 3. The superior appointments above the grade of Executive Engineer are always made by this Govt by selection, and this being the case the Govt are of opinion that these appointments should be open without distinction to men of Imperial and Provincial Lists, and that there should be one scale of pay for them.

Subhead 4. Without interfering with the prospects of men who entered the service with certain expectations, it will be extremely difficult to effect the transition to the new organization. To those however who have lately entered the service the prospect of some reduction has not probably appeared uncertain. The Govt are therefore of opinion that the pay above the grade of Assistant Engineer on the Provincial service might

be fixed on the new scale, and that there is no reason why the Provincial should not be at once separated from the Imperial List, so long as present incumbents in grades above Assistant Engineer are secured the present scale of pay up to date of retirement.

Subhead 5. The suggestion in the scheme is apparently to form an amalgamated Provincial list which would be retained while the numbers on the List are small, but when the numbers are much increased to split it up, making over the portion to the Provincial Governments while the Imperial lists which would then be reduced should be amalgamated. On the subject of amalgamating the Imperial List this Govt has already expressed an opinion in letter No 33916 of 6th Dec 1887 and they are willing to defer the further consideration of the subject until the Imperial Lists are very considerably reduced - but they are of opinion that it will be best in every way to start and continue the Provincial Establishment under the Provincial Govts who would work it as one List with the existing Imperial Establishment.

As regards the question whether the men on the Provincial Establishment should be pensionable or not, this Govt entertain no doubt ~~are very clearly of opinion~~ that they must receive pensions, and that the rules of the Uncovenanted Service should apply to them.

2. In the above the questions asked in paras 2 to 7 of your letter, under reply have

been answered, with the exception
of that in the latter part of
para 4, with respect to
which I am to say that this
Govt ~~is of~~ sidering the opinion that, for
~~putting by pence of~~ some time
to come at all events, the
Engineer of the Railway
Branch should be still
superior. Hence however only
time, the consulting Superior
two Deputies, under the Govern

Dec
1873

2117

Imperial	Veterinary
Godavari	3
Kistna	3
Nellore	1
Anchikulya	1
Bellary	1
West Coast	1
~~Peacock~~ (Peninsular)	1
Nilgiris	1
North Arcot	1
South Arcot	1
Chingleput	1
Presidency	1
Presidency Workshops	1
Tanjore	1
Negapatam	1
Consulting Architect	1
	20.

Provincial	
Ganjam	1
Vizagapatam	1
Cuddapah	1
Kurnool	1
Trichinopoly	1
Madura	1
Tinnevelly	1
Buckingham Canal	1
Coimbatore	1
	9

H.M. 16.VII.88

(11)

21 Ja Ly 2223/2224 W

Public Works Department
Establishment

Branch

Subject matter permanent
Selected for Separate Imperial
and Provincial Establishment
Public Works Department

Public Works Department
Establishment

Branch

Section contains branch letters
letter and date prefixed
Selected for Separate
Imperial and Provincial
Establishment. Public
Works Department.

Last Completed
[illegible]
[illegible]/92