(1) Number of pages 6

(2) Date of repair 7-8-1984

(3) Initials of the Referencer

TAMIL NADU ARCHIVES

GOVERNMENT OF TAMIL NADU

REVENUE DEPARTMENT

G.O. No. / ~~B.P. No.~~	1607	Press. / Mis.
Dated	3-10-1878	~~197~~ .

Not to be folded or roughly handled

Archives I—5,806—24-2-78.

1607

REVENUE DEPARTMENT,
OOTACAMUND,
3rd October 1878.

No. 1,607.

No. 29.

To

THE CHIEF SECRETARY TO THE GOVERNMENT OF BOMBAY.

Miscellaneous.

Procs. of Govt., 3rd October 1878, No. 1,606.

SIR,—I am directed by His Grace the Governor in Council to forward the accompanying copy of the Proceedings of this Government placing the services of Mr. W. R. Robertson, Superintendent of Government Farms, at the disposal of the Bombay Government to advise on the proposed organization of Agricultural Education in that Presidency.

I have the honor to be,

Sir,

Your most obedient servant,

(Signed) C. G. MASTER,
Acting Chief Secretary.

Exd. W. H. French.

Govt. of 1878! Madras.

REVENUE.

To

THE CHIEF SECRETARY TO THE GOVERNMENT OF BOMBAY.

Dated October 3rd.

Printed 7th.

Recd. Encl.

Letter, 3rd October 1878, No. 1,607.

OCTOBER.

No. 29.

FORWARDING copy of Government Proceedings placing the services of Mr. W. R. Robertson, Superintendent of the Government Farms, at the disposal of the Bombay Government to advise on the proposed organization of Agricultural Education in that Presidency.

1607/1

Minute

My minute of the 27th May 1878 is a careful and official review of the famine Census returns in course of Submission to the Govt. of India with the Proceedings of this Govt.; and must therefore be brought on record with the papers to which it relates for Submission therewith to Superior authority, under the Law and rules of procedure in Council

I believe the

In the course of that review, I had incidentally to make remarks on the papers put in circulation by His Grace the President with the Census returns such as the unreliable Register of Births and Deaths for some years in Famine Districts - now transmitted as I understand to the Govt. of India and also Sir M. Kennedy's official review of the same returns - intended, as I hold, very properly, to form an Enclosure to the despatch to the Govt. of India.

His Grace the Governor has, I understand, been pleased

1607/2

pleased to withdraw this latter official paper - a matter quite within His Graces competence as respects his Personal Assistants proceedings - but this in no way affects my minute or the prescribed course of procedure in respect to it. The Law and rules of Council Procedure forbid its Exclusion from Submission, with the Census returns to which it relates, to Superior authority -

If my Humble Colleagues fail to see their way to allow ordinary procedure to take its course, I propose to telegraph tomorrow to His Excellency the Viceroy and Governor General

I believe the - co

somewhat in the terms of the annexed draft.

I am constrained to adopt this unusual course from the experience of a somewhat analogous traverse of procedure, as it appears to me, in regard to the Despatch of this Govt. of 24th Novr. 1876 - the appeal against which procedure has for 18 months been kept back from superior adjudication; and I shall hope to justify the course, which I propose to adopt, if required to do so by superior authority.

I regret that I am unable

1607/3

unable to accept His Grace the Presidents proposal to withdraw my minute from its proper place with the despatch to the Govt. of India, submitting with observations the Census returns together with certain registers of Births and Deaths and to refer it to the Sanitary Commissioner for Early report.

Nor can I acquiesce in the modification of procedure proposed by Mr. Hudleston, who, writing from memory, has

I believe the - [illegible]

has apparently no complete recollection of my minute. I have discussed the Census returns & recorded my views by official minute & this I wish to accompany the papers to which it relates -

I shall be glad to have Dr. Cornish's further report - which I submit should have preceded the transmission of these returns, which had already been long in the hands of the Members of Government when formally put in circulation - but I do not desire to delay the submission of my minute to the Govt: of India pending

1607/4

that reference and decline to join in the proposed telegram (vide P. S of Mr Hudleston's note) to the Government of India

J. Robinson
30 June 1878.

I believe the

1607
5

From
Sir Wm Robinson - K.C.S.I.
Senior Member in Council
Ooty

To
His Excellency
the Viceroy and
Governor General
Simla.

My minute of review of the famine Census returns has not been allowed to accompany this Government's despatch of the 1st Instant, from which I have recorded my dissent - kindly call for it, before dealing with despatch. His grace the President has been duly advised.

I believe the - co

2 1607/6

Minute

The Rule for the Conduct of Official business which is in Course of Communication by a Council in India to superior authority is as follows:-

"In transacting the "business of your "Department, it is an "Order, that you Enter "with the utmost "perspicuity & Brevity "upon Consultations, "or Minutes of Council, "all your Proceedings "Whatsoever, and all "Dissents, if such "should at any time

be

I believe the

"be made by any
"member of your
"Board, together with
"all letters received
"and sent in the course
"of your correspondence"

Rule xxxvii. Honble Court's Despatch dy 13 April 1774

and I hold that when Communications are made to superior authority they are Entitled to have the whole of such proceedings placed before them.

The Course followed in Submitting the Famine test Census returns and other papers connected with their discussion before this Govt: together with the Covering Despatch dy 1st Instant has, I believe, traversed this rule in as much as no formal proceedings

1607/7

proceedings in Council have been recorded, and my minute of review and of dissent from the Despatch in question has not been transmitted to superior authority. I simply desire that the rule and prescribed practice of Procedure be followed and the mistake rectified without delay; at all Events as respects my minute of dissent dy 27 May 1878 and I trust that this will now be done.

I am constrained respectfully to decline the proposal of His Grace

I believe the - co

"to [illegible]

Grace the President which, as I understand it, is to inform the Govt: of India by letter that I have prepared a Minute &c on the subject matter of the despatch in question, which will not be brought on official record or forwarded to them until a report &c now first called for from the Sanitary Commissioner can be submitted. The anticipated Report had no existence when my minute

1607/18

minute was written and may have none for some time to come. Ex post facto matter of this description has no connection with the subject under consideration and will be dealt with by me in its proper time and place by farther minute, should the necessity arise. In the meantime I know of no rule or precedent for the suggested course and should not willingly accede to what appears to me unusual. I have no personal wishes in the matter whatever. It is purely of an

I believe the [illegible]

Official character, and I simply seek observance by the Govt. of which I am a member of the prescribed rule and practice of business.

As I understand His Grace the President's note, he still hesitates to permit Rule and ordinary Procedure to take this course. I should however be grateful to be distinctly informed on this point, because I can scarcely describe the reluctance with which I shall beg

His

1607/9

His Excellency the Viceroy by telegram to call for that minute, in respectful variance with His Graces Verbo, But the question has already been practically before His Grace for many months in my appeal to the Govt. of India against what appears to me an analogous traverse of rule & procedure. And I am unwilling to run the risk of such delay as has been permitted to characterize that matter in respect

I believe the

to one of the pressing nature of that before us.

5/6 W Robinson

The cover containing this was brought to Govt House about Church time yesterday & being marked "in circulation" & not marked urgent was not opened by me until this morning the 10th.

The reply of G. of Sark be dealt with in due course when received ~~but with the experience of the [illegible] of telegram [illegible] [illegible] [illegible] [illegible] [illegible] [illegible] [illegible]~~

[illegible] 10/6

REVENUE DEPARTMENT.

No. 1607/10

Minute

From By The Hon. Sir W R Robinson

Dated June 5th 1878.

FOR ORDERS.

The question is one purely of rule & practice

There is no desire or suggestion to withhold any thing —

I do not see how a minute can properly be brought on proceedings ~~[illegible]~~ before the documents to which it refers have been brought before Council —

I believe the — [illegible]

Suggested by Mr Huddleston

first note after my

first would be a

correct one —

but if Sir W. R. wishes

his minute to go — in

advance of the report on

the Census & my colleagues

concur — I see no objection

to a copy being sent to V. R.

with the letter I suggested

and the additional remarks

[illegible] it is in no way an

[illegible] of the opinion

[illegible] Govt. [illegible] but the

[illegible] opinion —

[illegible] this sd go to all

[illegible] Council

[illegible] 6/6

I do not object to the

course suggested by H. G.

but I wd. add to the letter

that the Recd. of Govt in

Dr. Sir W. R. minute will

fall to be recorded. will

not be held until the

Sanct Commt. remarks on

the Census returns have

been recd. & considered

The rule of 1774 [illegible]

[illegible] refers. [illegible]

remark as being more

than a century old

might not improbably

require some modification

is I hold satisfied by

1607
11

the record of the Sec's

letter sending the return

to the G. I.

The Govt have

not yet held Recd. on

the returns. & when they

do so will consider

by the perspective to

record Sir W. R. minute

The system of sending in [illegible]

to the G. I. [illegible]

by Sec's letter — in [illegible]

of Recd. on the subject is one of [illegible]

standing

[illegible]

8.6.78

I wish by obeyed [illegible]

Dr. Despatch of 3 April [illegible]

Sr. Lt. W. R. quotes —

Office

[illegible]

Sir W. Robinson's second Minute.

FOR ORDERS.

1607
12

Minute

I waited till
midday of to-day
for some notice of
my minute of the
5th Instant, and then
despatched the following
telegram to His Excellency
the Viceroy:-

"My official minute of
"revised of Famine test
"Census returns for
"this Presidency & of
"dissent from despatch
"of 1st June forwarding
"same to Government
"of India, has not been
"submitted as required.
"I respectfully beg it
"may be called for by
"Government of India. North
"Colleagues advised of this
"Telegram"

Sir W. Robinson

The despatch of the 1st Instant probably reached Simla today.

Late in the afternoon I found these further notes on my table. I have still to submit that the minute of a member of Govt. cannot be withdrawn from the proceedings of Govt. to which it relates and therefore to repeat respectfully that the minute which is the subject of this discussion may be forwarded to the Govt. of India to complete proceedings of the 1st Instant, without delay.

With reference to His Grace the President's

1607

1607/13

remark in Para 2 of his note, I beg respectfully to observe that the Census returns and other papers (amongst them a note by General Sir Michael Kennedy also proposed to be submitted with this Govt. despatch) which were in course of submission to the Govt. of India together with the Draft covering Despatch were officially before me, when my minute of review of those papers and of dissent from the Despatch was recorded. All these proceedings of Govt. – Sir M. Kennedy's note, which His Grace the

forward to which [illegible]

them

President has withdra[illegible]
Excepted, have gone
forward; but without
the minute recorded
by me as a member
of Govt: on the discussion
then before Council - in
circulation in the first
instance and finally
in the Council Chambers
on Friday the 31st May,
I respectfully submit
that no documents
could be more deliberately
brought before Council,
no proceedings could
be more complete,
than were these
important papers,
by His Grace the President's
Draft, Mr. Hudleston's
full

1607
14

[illegible] dissenting Member
full and thoughtful
note and my minute.
Those proceedings have
been formally disposed
of by submission to the
Govt. of India; but
without the completeness
required. They simply
need to be supplemented
as submitted by me.
As regards the
proposal to relegate
the minute of a member
of Council on a then
current discussion
before Council, to some
future proposed
proceedings to be held
on a report of some kind
which has still to be
called for, while the
important papers go
forward to which the
then

Sir W.

President has withdra

then full discussi
in Council (for al
members took a thoro
share, by record, in this
discussion) and the
minute of a member
relate - and on which
the Govt: of India
naturally look for the
deliberate views of
Govt: - I respectfully
demur to the proposed
arrangement because
I know neither rule,
precedent nor reason
for it.

No letter covering
my minute is, as it
seems to me, necessary
in order to explain to
the Govt: of India that
the minute of a reviewing

1607

1607/15

and dissenting member
of Govt: is an individual
opinion - I am perfectly
satisfied by the simple
completion of the Pro=
=ceedings by submission
of any or all minutes
according to rule, altho'
in isolation as regards
personal views. -
However, if my Hon'ble:
Colleagues desire it,
I can offer no objections
and I shall be glad
to consider the draft
letter when circulated.
All that I desire is
to see the formal Pro=
=ceedings of this Govt:
laid before Superior
authority in that
completeness

Sir W.

completeness the
is presented by rules
and practice - that is -
with the minutes of
Members of Govt, if
such have been
recorded - for I would
not myself consent
for one moment to the
omission from proceedings
of the minute of any
Member of Govt., however
widely I might personally
differ from his views.

I do not understand
my Honble: Colleague
Mr. Huddleston's proposal
to inform the Govt. of
India when he intends
to consider the Census
returns already formally
submitted by this Govt. & the Governments of Bombay

1607

1607
16

they seemed bound to
have discussed with admirable
ability in his note recorded
on this discussion. I think
that it is a matter for
regret that his review
has not been signed
as a minute for the
information of the Govt.
of India

I have already recorded
the sincere reluctance
- indeed grief - with which
I have asked His Excellency
the Viceroy direct both
for my minute and order
to complete the proceedings
of this Govt. as submitted
on the 7th Instant. But
the fact is that this is
not the first time I have
had to question procedure
when deference of

1607
19

an enclosure to the letter of this Govt. despatched ~~[illegible]~~ by yesterday's post proposing in the event of his wishes not being acceded to to inform the Viceroy by telegram of the fact of his minute having been recorded but not transmitted

3/6/28 [illegible]

Not so as I understand until we have before us Dr. Cornish's remarks on the test Census results

Then in my opinion will be the proper time for bringing on record Sir W. R. Minute & the note of Sir M. K. & Dr. it exclusively relates Sir that Dr. it Dr. so far as I recollect. be scarcely appreciable.

Sir W. R. Minute is not yet recorded in Foreign — To transmit it at the present stage wd. possibly mislead the G. I. as to the deliberate judgement of the Govt. in Council on the results obtained by the test Census.

6.78

returning late I only read this this morning —

I think the same indicated by Mr. Heddleston as to the record is correct — but ~~The same~~ as Sir W. R. denies his dissent from the despatch covering the Census report to be communicated to Govt. of I I have no objection to a letter being sent stating that fact ~~[illegible]~~ at his request — and that he has prepared a minute upon the subject and on a memo. of Sir M. Kennedy which will be transmitted as soon as the ~~[illegible]~~ Dar Com. report upon the Census return & registration return ~~[illegible]~~ has been received & the papers

I think the telegram I suggested in framing G. I. that our Foreign on the Census returns will follow the Secs. letter. Transmitting the Returns thus closes had better be despatched
[illegible]

FOR ORDERS.

Brought regularly on
the proceedings in with the
opinion of Jos. Thomson

B.C. 4/6.

circ. to Huddleston

I have no objection
to the adoption of the
course suggested by
H.G. the Govr.

W.B. 4/6

REVENUE DEPARTMENT.

1607
20

As Sir W.R. has seen
fit to despatch his
telegram. we can
only wait for the G.I.
action on it.

I will only at present
add to my former
remarks (with refl.
to what Sir W.R. says
in his last ~~note~~ minute
of my note on the Census
returns) that I do
not by any means

consider the discussion
on them closed. or
the matter in a position
for Excess. of Govt. to be
recorded. I await
Dr. Cornish's remarks.
the idea of obtaining
Dr. originated of
remember rightly
with Sir W. R. himself
but had my entire
concurrence

[illegible]
10.6.78

1607

Sir W. Robin's 3rd minute

c/8 June 1878
with Hon. Chamberlain's
remarks

Minute No 4

1607
22

I have to urge most respectfully that the request Sub:mitted in my minute dated 8: Instant be at once complied with viz that these minutes and papers together with those connected with the analogous traverse of rule and procedure, as it seemed to me, which occurred in November 1876 may be forwarded at once

to the Government of
India: my formal
appeal against the
latter matter to the
Government of India
has I venture to submit
been kept back from
Superior decision —
beyond all reason
~~of~~ precedent.

The Govt: of India
are Entitled, I hold,
to know with all despatch
what has led to my
telegraphing direct
to the Viceroy in the
matter of the Munshi
which was the subject

160/23

of that Communication.
They are, I hold, entitled
to be fully informed
why records, which the
ordinary course of
business prescribes
should be laid before
them by this Government,
do not accompany the
despatches to which
they relate, & occurred
in 1876 and more than
once since - The Govt:
of India are Entitled
to be made aware of
and to pronounce on, —
matters which affect
the Entirety of proceedings
and discussions in the

local Council as placed before that Controlling authority; and I think that this information should be submitted with all despatch.

And finally I respectfully submit that a member of Council cannot reasonably be denied the arbitrament of the Govt: of India on an important matter of procedure as respects business in course of being placed before them. I have been seeking this for a year to

1607/24

to 18 months without success

As respects my minute of the 27th May 1878. on the subject of Famine Census returns the rule requires that it be sent forward with the despach to which it relates and I would wish to see it conformed to.

12/6 [illegible]

Local Comm...

REVENUE DEPARTMENT.

No. 1607/25

From A fourth Minute by Sir W. Robinson

Dated June 12th 1878.

FOR ORDERS.

The matter must await G. of I action

Anth. Dr Cornish's report when the proceedings will be duly completed on its receipt by review of Govt. or decision thereon — [illegible] 12/6

FOR ORDERS.

d/12 June 1878
With His Grace's Notes
Circ. at 1.30
P.A. 12/6/78

Received from the Govt House on 27/12/80.

1607/27

My dear Lord Duke

I give cover to a note put on the Famine Census papers of that I enclose a copy.

It seems true that Dr. Crombie's paper on the Pathology of famine might well be disposed of with these papers — I contains a note by Dr. Porter.

In order that no time may be lost I have sent

On the papers in Circulation
to Messrs Hudleston & Com
Mitchell & will send my
further minute when ready
Jame [illegible] Grace
Yrs Sincerely & respectfully
[illegible]
7/60

Revenue Department

1607
29

Note

I received these
papers on Friday, 5th
Instant incomplete
— as will be shown
by my D. O. Note to the
Secretary Famine
Department — as it seems
to me.
Practically my
Hon'ble Colleagues are
in possession of my
views on the results of
the trial famine
Census and as I think
that the Members of
Govt. have reason

1607/30

I have received printed copies of both reports from D. Cornish and shall prepare my further observations on the causes of incredulity & the real mortality from famine and its effects on administration on the causes of death & on the relief of child life, on the "test" (as they are called) of relief; and on the Village & camp relief and of the points which they suggest and I will circulate them with the least possible delay.

In the meantime I think that D. Cornish's very remarkable reports on

deeply to regret that the trial Canals operations were not placed ab initio in the scientific and skilled hands, which this Govt. have at its Command as well as that delay that has occurred in laying these most important Reports dated 20th June & 8th July respectively before them, I pass the papers on at once to my Hon'ble Colleague Mr. Middleton, who has reserved his disposal for this occasion.

on the pathology of famine - which I conceive has been already received in the famine Depart.t should be at once brought on record and circulated for consideration. It places, as it seems to me, before us the all-important fact that when famine has established itself in a country, large and increasing sections of the population affected pass into a condition of decline & atrophy as evidenced by abnormal mortality & loss of reproductive powers and

1607/31

and it seems to me that papers of this kind cannot be dealt with as impartially & scientific men will require, or the lives of the administration of relief be adequately judged of except in the light of this fact. The matter cannot be laid, I hold, before the Govt. of India and Secretary of State in a complete form without the accompaniment which I here suggest.

W. W. Robertson

Copy.

1607/32

My dear Garstin.

I have received the bundle containing Dr Cornish's reports.

On the Order paper (J 12/7) Sir Michael Kennedy has put a foot note.

"See Memo on Separate paper "by Sir Michael Kennedy J 18/7/78"

This paper is not in the bundle (Sir M. Kennedy's J 11: May is with the papers), as I have received it would

Would you kindly ask His Grace whether he has any objection to place this paper in circulation, as I conceive Sir Michael has had my minute and it seems to me that in the interest of thorough discussion, it would be an advantage if the Members of Council were in possession of all the light that can be thrown on this important discussion. The paper would be returned to His Grace with the notes of Members which he has called for.

Yours sincerely
Sd/ W. Robinson

5/10/78

1607
33

1607
34

Note.

I received these papers on Friday 5th Instant incomplete - as will be shown by my D.O. note* to the Secretary famine Department - as it seems to me.

Practically my Honble. Colleagues are in possession of my views on the results of the trial famine Census and I think that the Members of Govt. have reason deeply to regret that the trial Census operations were not placed ab initio

* Copy put up.

in the Scientific and Skilled hands which this Govt. have at a Command as well as that delay that has occurred in laying these most important Reports dated 20th June and 8th July respectively before them. I pass the papers on at once to my Honble. Colleague Mr. Hudleston who has reserved his disposal of them for this occasion

I have received printed Copies of both reports from Dr. Cornish and shall prepare my further observations on the causes of incre=dulity as to the real

1607/35

mortality from famine & its effects on administration; on the causes of death &c; on the relief of child life; on the "tests" (as they are called) of relief; & on the village & camp relief and other points [illegible] I will circulate this with the least possible delay.

In the meantime I think that Dr. Cornish's very remarkable report on the pathology of famine — which I concerne has been already received in the famine Department — should be at once brought on record & circulated for

for consideration. It
places, as it seems to
me, before us the
all important fact
that when famine has
Established itself in
a country, large and
increasing sections
of the population affected
pass into a condition
of decline & atrophy
as evidenced by abnormal
mortality and loss of
reproductive power
and it seems to me
that papers of this kind
cannot be dealt with
as impartial & scientific
men will require, or the
lines of the administration
of relief be adequately
judged

1607
36

judged of excepting
the light of this fact.
The matter cannot be
laid, I hold, before the
Govt. of India and
Secretary of State in
a complete form without
the accompaniment
which I here suggest.

[illegible]

Note by Sir W. R
of 7 Oct 1878

R D

Revenue Department

No. 1607

1607/2

To

The Chief Secretary to the
Government of Bombay.

Sir,

I am directed by His Grace the Governor in Council to forward the accompanying copy of the Proceedings of this Government placing the services of Mr. W. R. Robertson Superintendent of Govt. Farms at the disposal of the Bombay Government to advise on the proposed organization of Agricultural Education in that Presidency.

Progs of Govt. 3d October 78
No. 1606.

[illegible]

3d October 1878

36/3

To Gerty Bunbury

Mr Robertson

Ac 29

Dec