Secrt. I (1)-3—10,000—7-10-70.

(1) Number of pages 10

(2) Date of repair 7-3-73

(3) Initials of the Referencer

TAMIL NADU ARCHIVES

GOVERNMENT OF TAMIL NADU

Revenue DEPARTMENT

G.O. No. / B.P. No.	1630	Press / Mis.
Dated 3rd	May	1977 ~~197~~

Not to be folded or roughly handled

e Department,

Famine Relief.

No. 80. Read the followi[ng] ARD, Esq., C.S.I., Secretary to
Sir RICHARD TEMPLE, dditional Secretary to Government,
Revenue Department, [dated] 1877, No. 191 :—

By direction of Sir Richard Temp[le] o forward copy of a Minute recorded by him respecting passages in the report o[f the] missioner of Madras, dated the 6th April.

ENC

Minute by Sir RICHARD TEM[PLE]. Cuddalore, 18th April 1877.

IT is necessary for me to make a few brief pon the Minute of the 6th April by the Sanita[ry] Commissioner of Madras regarding th[e] wage for the relief laborers of Madras, inasmuch as this Minute refers to some of my evious Minutes on the subject. Having regard to the importance of the subject, I refra[in] naking the objections which might ordinarily be made to the tone of some parts of the S[ani]ommissioner's Minute as an official paper.

2. In order to show the uncertainty of m[edi]emical dicta regarding such a matter as relief wages, I pointed out certain discrepancies [in] the Sanitary Commissioner's opinion and the Madras Manual of Hygiene on a particular p[oint]. The Sanitary Commissioner now says that the Manual of Hygiene is wrong on this point. ssibly it is.

3. It is not necessary, however, to pursu[e] point or any such like points, because I understand that the medico-chemical theories u[pon] ch the Sanitary Commissioner of Madras seems still to rely are not implicitly accepted by [the] iest Sanitary authorities in India, and do not entirely coincide with the newest developmen[ts] ntific thought regarding the carbonaceous and nitrogenous elements necessary for the nutr[ition] he human frame. Nor is it practically necessary to discuss further the Sanitary Co[mmissioner's] r's opinion regarding the sufficiency or otherwise of the reduced wage, because in his inute he admits that, as now applied, it is sufficient. His previous objections appear t[o be] diminished by the granting of the wage on Sundays as well as week days, and by the gran[t] of a small allowance for the support of the young children of persons employed on the works.

4. I had myself always contemplated that educed wage should be allowed on Sundays. As regards the very young children, their case d[id] t at first suggest itself for consideration, as all children, from seven years and upwards, wer[e] mitted to relief. But soon as the case of the children under seven years of age was brought to notice, I recommended that they also should receive a small allowance. I found, however, th[at] this had been already ordered by the Madras Government.

5. Though I do not undertake to pronounce [an] pinion upon a medico-chemical point, yet I do undertake to say whether thousands of relief l[a]s inspected by me are physically in fair working condition or not. And I adhere to the o[pi]n previously expressed that the many gangs which I inspected working on the reduced wage in such condition, regard being had to the condition of such persons in ordinary times. In opinion, I was confirmed by the experienced medical officer on my staff, who had seen the rea[l] of famine in other parts of India. But in order that no doubt might remain upon the po[int] sked for and obtained the opinion of the Sanitary Commissioner with the Government of I[ndia]. And after inspecting in different parts of the country some thirty-five thousand relief la[bo]he pronounced them to be, with some individual exceptions, in fair physical condition. hen is the true test of the sufficiency or otherwise of the reduced wage to which I have a[lr]ppealed and still appeal. According to this test the wage appears to be sufficient at present any time any marked deterioration of the physical condition were to indicate that the redu[ce] is insufficient, then I shall be the first to make a revised recommendation.

6. But I must advert for a moment to cer[tain] f the argument of the Sanitary Commissioner of Madras, which seem to amount to ecause there is mortality among the recipients of gratuitous relief who are admitted relief camps, therefore the wages of relief laborers must be insufficient. Whether ary Commissioner intends to convey this idea I know not, but something of the sort woul[d] rehend, be gathered by ordinary readers of that which he has written. Therefore I hav[e] ain that there is no connection whatever between recipients of gratuitous relief on the on[e] and the recipients of relief wages on the other. The gratuitous rations allowed to the inm[a] relief camps have nothing whatever to do with the wages paid on relief works. The inma[tes] se camps who are admitted there as being unable to work are a class totally different fron[t] who are admitted to the relief works as being able to work. Inferences deduced from t[he] ition of the recipients of gratuitous relief are wholly irrelevant if attempted to be applied to conditions of relief laborers. If, unhappily, there be mortality among the inmates of relief amps, it by no means follows that there is

any mortality among relief labor
except from cholera, small-pox, c
and dispersed large gangs of relie
scourge arose from want of foo
condition of the inmates of relief ca
by raising the wages of relief labore
never gone to relief works at all. I
is this, that they are incapable of g
indisposed to work have wandered
wandered to a distance.

7. Being thus helpless for one rea
when picked up they are often beyond
from these persons can possibly be ap
with any sort of parallelism and in any
and other misapprehension.

8. If, indeed, persons who were pal
and thinner and weaker and weaker, till a
as unfit to work, then that would be a rea
not occurred, and is not occurring.
should be the first to move. Many relief
not so much, however, because the wage
or because the scene of labor was remove

9. How it happens that so many of
gratuitous relief is a question which
however, that the proper remedy lies in t
the distressed districts, and from the tim
to urge upon the Government and the loc
indeed, this visitation has generally bee
carried out is proved by the mortality wi
camps.

relief laborers
olera has stricken
son to suppose that the
ifically arranged diets the
ion whatever could be afforded
lass. These poor inmates have
eir admission to the relief camps
are diseased or infirm, or being
eans of relief close at home, have

they are picked up and taken care of, but
uman aid. No analogy, therefore, drawn
f laborers, and to mention the two cases
ction would be to produce confusion of ideas

admitted to relief works were to become thinner
had to be drafted off to gratuitous relief camps
nsidering the wage ; but this is just what has
knew of any signs of it occurring, then I
eed, have left the works of their own accord,
but rather because task-work was enforced,
e from their homes.

e poor sank so low before being taken up for
liscussed in this Minute. I may reiterate,
n of a house-to-house visitation throughout
ng the Madras Presidency I have never ceased
ies the necessity of such a visitation. And,
But that it has not always been perfectly
, or still occurs, in some of the relief

RICHARD TEMPLE.

No. 81. ORDER THEREON, ay 1877, No. 1,630.

Miscellaneous.

COMMUNICATED to the Sanitary Commissioner
h the request that he will state his opinion
ther Sir Richard Temple's hypothesis in para-
raph 8 is correct or not.

tract.)

(Signed) J. H. GARSTIN,
Additional Secretary to Government.

To the Sanitary Commissioner.
,, the Board of Revenue.
,, the Financial Department.

Exd. F. R. Bantleman.

1630

1630/3

No. 191.

From

C. BERNARD, Esq., C.S.I.,

Secretary to Sir Richard Temple,

To

J. H. GARSTIN, Esq.,

Additional Secretary to the

Government of Madras,

Dated CUDDALORE, 10th April, 1877.

Sir,

By direction of Sir Richard Temple, I have the honor to forward copy of a Minute recorded by him, respecting passages in the report of the Sanitary Commissioner of Madras, dated the 6th April.

I have the honour to be,

Sir,

Your most obedient Servant,

C. BERNARD,

Secretary to Sir Richard Temple.

Govt. of (1877) Madras.

R.

REVENUE.

The SANITARY COMMISSIONER, Madras,

Dated May,

Rect.

&c.

Sir,

&c.

MAY.

Nos. 80-81.

FAMINE RELIEF, No. 1070

Sir Richard Temple's Minute on the Sanitary Commissioner's Report.—Requesting the Commissioner to state his opinion whether Sir Richard Temple's hypothesis in paragraph 8 is correct or not.

Minute by Sir Richard Te
lore, 18th April,

It is necessary for me to m
remarks upon the Minute of t by the Sanitary Commissioner of Madras, regarding the reduced wage for the relief labourers of Madras, inasmuch as this Minute refers to some of my own previous Minutes on the subject. Having regard to the importance of the subject, I refrain from making the objections which might ordinarily be made to the tone of some parts of the Sanitary Commissioner's Minute as an official paper.

2. In order to shew the uncertainty of medico-chemical dicta regarding such a matter as relief wages, I pointed out certain discrepancies between the Sanitary Commissioner's opinion and the Madras Manual of Hygiene on a particular point. The Sanitary Commissioner now says that the Manual of Hygiene is wrong on this point. Very possibly it is.

3. It is not necessary, however, to pursue this point, or any such like points, because I understand that the medico-chemical ries upon which the Sanitary Commi r of Madras seems still to rely are not implicitly accepted by the highest Sanitary authorities in India, and do not entirely coincide with the newest development of scientific thou re-garding the carbonaceous and nitrogeno ele-ments necessary for the nutrition of the nan frame. Nor is it practically necessary dis-cuss further the Sanitary Commissior pi-nion regarding the sufficiency or ise of the reduced wage, because in hi ent Minute he admits that, as now appli is sufficient. His previous objections ap to have been diminished by the granting of the wage on Sundays as well as week days, and by the granting of a small allowance for the support of the young children of persons employed on the works.

4. I had myself always contemplated that the reduced wage should be allowed on Sundays. As regards the very young children, t did not at first suggest itself for all children from seven years admitted to relief. But soon a children under 7 years of age wa my notice, I recommended that they also should receive a small allowance. I found, however, that this had been already ordered by the Madras Government.

5. Though I do not undertake to pronounce any opinion upon a medico-chemical point, yet I do undertake to say whether thousands of relief labourers inspected by me are physically in fair working condition or not. And I adhere to the opinion previously expressed that the many gangs which I inspected working on the reduced wage, were in such condition, regard being had to the condition of such persons in ordinary times. In this opinion I was confirmed by the experienced medical officer on my staff, who had seen the realities of famine in other parts of India. But in order that no doubt might remain upon the point, I asked for and obtained the opinion of the Sanitary Commissioner with the Government of India. And after inspecting in different parts of the country some thirty-five thousand relief labourers, he nounced them to be, with some individual exce ons, in fair physical condition. This then is the true test of the sufficiency or otherwise of the reduced wag to which I have always appealed and still appeal. According to this te the wage appears to be sufficient at preser ar If at any time any marked deterioration o cl physical condition were to indicate that t duced wage is insufficient, then I shall be the to make a revised recommendation.

6. I must advert for a moment to certain p of the arguments of the Sanitary Commissioner of Madras, which seem to amount to this,—that because there is mortality among the recipients of gratuitous relief who are admitted to particular relief camps, therefore the wages of relief labourers must be insufficient. Whether the Sanitary Commis-

sioner intends to convey this idea I know not, but something of the sort would, I apprehend, be gathered by ordinary readers of that which he has written. Therefore I h
there is no connection wha
cipients of gratuitous relief
and the recipients of relief wa
The gratuitous rations allowed
of relief camps have nothing
with the wages paid on relief works. The inmates of these camps who are admitted there as being unable to work, are a class totally different from those who are admitted to the relief works as being able to work. Inferences deduced from the condition of the recipients of gratuitous relief are wholly irrelevant if attempted to be applied to the conditions of relief labourers. If, unhappily, there be mortality among the inmates of relief camps, it by no means follows that there is any mortality among relief labourers. In point of fact there is no mortality among relief labourers except from cholera, small-pox, or other diseases, and when sometimes cholera has stricken and dispersed large gangs of relief labourers, there has never been any reason to suppose that the scourge arose from want of food. Again, if notwithstanding scientifically arranged diets the condition of the inmates of relief camps continues bad, no amelioration whatever could be afforded by raising the wages of relief labour
a totally different class. These p
have never gone to relief works at all. Indeed the very reason of their admission to the relief camps is this, that they are incapable of going to relief works. They are diseased
or being indisposed to work have
about, or passing by means of reli
home, have wandered to a distance

7. Being thus helpless for o
another they are picked up and t
but when picked up they are often
reach of human aid. No analogy, therefore, drawn from these persons can possibly be applicable to relief labourers, and to mention the two cases with any sort of parallelism and in any kind of connection, would be to produce confusion of ideas and other misapprehension.

8. deed persons who were pale on being
admitt relief works were to become thinner and nner and weaker and weaker, till at last
fted off to gratuitous relief
work, then that would be a
dering the wage, but this is
just w curred, and is not occurring.
If I s f any signs of it occurring,
then I hould be the first to move. Many relief laburers indeed have left the works of their ow accord, not so much however because the wag was reduced, but rather because task-work wa enforced, or because the scene of labour ws removed to a distance from their homes.

9. low it happens that so many of the destitute por sank so low before being taken up for gratitous relief is a question which need not be discussed in this Minute. I may reiterate, howeve that the proper remedy lies in the institutio of a house-to-house visitation throughout the istressed districts, and from the time of entering the Madras Presidency, I have never ceased to urge upon the Government and the local authorities the necessity of such a visitation. And indeed this visitation has generally been instituted. But that it has not always been perfectly carried out is proved by the mortality which has occurred, or still occurs, in some o relief camps.

RICHARD TEMPLE.

F. No. 2,748.

Revenue {1877} Department.

From

C. E. BERNARD, Esq., C.S.I.,

Secretary to Sir Richard Temple.

Dated 19th } April, 1877.
Received 20th }

No. 191.

Forwarding copy of a Minute by Sir Richard Temple, respecting passages in the report of the Sanitary Commissioner of Madras of 6th April 1877.

*Lawrence Asylum Press—1877.

No. 1830

C 25-4-77 R 1-5-77