

(1) Number of Pages.....8
 (2) Date of repair.....6-12-65
 (3) Initials of the Referencer.....*Mr.*

MADRAS RECORD OFFICE

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS

Revenue DEPARTMENT

G.O. No.	149	Press
B.P. No.		Mis.
Dated	24 - 1 - 1873	196 .

Not to be folded or roughly handled

Read the following letters :—

No. 409. From the Consulting Engineer for Railways, to the Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, dated Madras, 27th November 1872, No. 652.

With reference to the Order of Government, dated the 25th ultimo, No. 2,518, upon the subject of the site proposed for the passenger terminus of the Carnatic

Railway, I have the honour to submit the accompanying letter* from the Company's Agent, in which Mr. Fisher deals with the objections which have been raised against the proposal.

2. With regard to the inconvenience to street traffic which is apprehended from the proposed location of the terminus, I beg to refer the Government to the Resolution of the Municipal Commission, whose duty it is to guard jealously against interference with the interests of the public. Their Resolution is recorded in the Proceedings of Government to which I am now replying; and, with reference to the proposed over-bridge at Sydenham's Road, it will be seen that they approve of the design, and that, in their opinion, ample provision is made for the traffic. As regards the proposed over-bridge at Whannell's Road, the Municipal Commission have suggested certain modifications of the Railway Company's proposals, which, in my judgment, are decided improvements, though I still adhere to the opinion that the traffic along Whannell's Road is not sufficient to justify the cost of an over-bridge.

3. As regards the General Hospital, I think that all apprehensions of its inmates being inconvenienced by the proposed terminus are groundless. The distance between the two buildings will be nearly 300 yards, more than double the distance of the Madras Railway Terminus from the hospital; and as the Carnatic Terminus will be due west from the hospital, there is no possible danger of the sea-breeze being obstructed at any time of the year.

4. As regards the apprehended inconvenience to the Railway Company, I can add but little to what has been urged by the Agent. It may, however, be mentioned that the plot of ground near the Penitentiary is large enough to accommodate the new passenger terminus of the Madras Railway—a building far larger than will be required by the Carnatic Company, with its narrow gauge and smaller rolling stock.

5. As regards the blocking up of an existing open space, I beg to draw attention to the remarks made in paragraph 9 of the Agent's letter. I agree with Mr. Fisher in the opinion that no site suitable for the terminus could be selected which would be as free from objection on the score of interference with the populous parts of the town as is the site advocated by him.

6. The distance between the alternative sites for the passenger station has hitherto been spoken of as about three-quarters of a mile; but I now understand that it has been proposed to locate both the passenger and goods termini to the west of the Orphan Asylum, and if this proposal were carried out, the passenger terminus would be placed at least $1\frac{1}{4}$ miles from the site advocated by the Railway

Authorities. The bulk of the passenger traffic will, of course, come from the lowest classes of the public, to whom an additional distance of $1\frac{1}{4}$ miles is a very serious consideration; and, on this ground, I cannot too strongly deprecate the proposal to locate the passenger terminus to the west of the Asylum. Upon this point the experience of the Madras Railway has taught us many costly lessons; and I believe that this question of $1\frac{1}{4}$ miles will most materially affect, for good or ill, the passenger traffic between Madras and Sydapet, Saint Thomas' Mount, etc., from which great returns are expected by the Company.

7. I beg to enclose two drawings for the consideration of the Government; one showing the general arrangement of the proposed terminus, and the other the position which the building will occupy upon the site.

8. With regard to the estimate which has been called for showing the cost of land and compensation and road diversions to be paid by Government, I beg to observe that the preparation of such a return will take a very considerable time. To enable the Government to judge of the comparative cost of the various proposals, it will be necessary to prepare three estimates: the first showing the cost under these heads if both termini are placed near the Asylum; the second, if the Railway Company's proposals are carried out; and the third, if the Municipal Commission's suggestions are accepted. To prepare these estimates would occupy a professional Surveyor for a long time, and I trust that His Excellency in Council will not deem it necessary to insist on having them before coming to a decision. Both the Municipal Commissioners and the Railway Agent have recorded their opinions that the location of the two termini near the Asylum would entail a larger outlay under the head of compensation than would be necessary if the Penitentiary site were selected for the passenger terminus; but I respectfully beg that the question at issue may be decided upon broader grounds, and that the passenger terminus may be placed in the position where it will be of the greatest permanent advantage to the mass of the public, irrespective of any small economy in initial cost in one direction or the other.

From the Agent and Manager of the Carnatic Railway Company, to the Consulting Engineer for Railways, dated Madras, 26th November 1872, No. 641.

With reference to the Government Order, No. 2,518, dated the 25th October 1872, and to the interviews which we had the honour to have last evening with His Excellency the Governor and several other gentlemen on the ground proposed as our passenger station site, and in compliance with His Excellency's request which you conveyed to me, I respectfully submit the following further observations upon this subject.

2. The Government in their order under reference, while admitting many of the advantages which the Penitentiary site undoubtedly possesses, appear to have entertained the impression that inconvenience will be caused to the street traffic, to the General Hospital, and to the Railway Company themselves, and further that the blocking up of the locality is objectionable, while its area is too restricted to meet the probable future requirements of the Company.

3. Upon all these points I humbly think that the Government attach an importance which they do not really possess, and that they are not such as should induce them to withhold their sanction to the most central site that can be provided for the terminus of a railway which is intended, and I hope destined, to accommodate so large a proportion of the population of the Presidency.

4. As regards the street traffic, I venture to remind you that the Municipal Commissioners at their meeting held on the 30th August last "fully approved" of the suggestions made by their Executive Engineer in his report, dated 29th idem, which states, in paragraph 4, "the proposed work would effect a great improvement;" and again, in Clause 3 of paragraph 1, alluding to the removal of the old buildings at the corner of Sydenham and Poonamallee Roads, "it will give a straight sketch of road at a point where there is very great traffic, and will remove the only objectionable feature in this otherwise magnificent road from Fort St. George to the western suburbs of Madras," and they further, in submitting the report in question for the favourable consideration of Government, "strongly recommended its adoption on public grounds."

5. It would appear from this that the Commissioners of the Municipality, one of whose special duties I take it is to guard the interests of the public in respect of the street traffic, do not view with alarm the Company's proposals, and when it is remembered that by our arrangements the street traffic from the Pantheon and river side roads, on the one hand, and the Poonamallee road, on the other, will be provided with two good roads just at its most crowded part, instead of only one as at present, that the width of the over-bridge proposed to be erected is greater by several feet than either the Hospital Bridge or Law's Bridge, and that the grades of the approaches to it will be easier than in either of those cases, I cannot but think that the inconvenience which Government fear will never really be felt.

6. With respect to the inconvenience to the General Hospital, which it is supposed will be occasioned, I feel some difficulty in submitting observations upon this matter, being utterly at a loss to conceive what the inconvenience which is feared can possibly be; the station will be a greater distance from the hospital than the Madras Railway Company's Station; instead of approaching directly opposite its full front as in that case, our station will be opposite the west end of the hospital only, and between the two, in addition to the road leading to St. Mary's Bridge and Cochrane's Canal, there are some buildings and a considerable space of ground within the hospital compound, so that I have no hesitation in affirming that the patients in the hospital cannot be disturbed either by the sight or sound of our arriving and departing trains, which you are aware will be of a very much lighter character than those of the Madras Railway Company immediately opposite, our proposed building being some 300 yards distant and on the leeward side.

7. With respect to the alleged inconvenience to the Railway Company themselves, by the separation of the passenger terminus from the spare sidings for the rolling stock, I trust I may be excused for expressing a view decidedly different from that of the Government. I think you will agree with me in the opinion that wherever the passenger station is placed, it will be necessary to have a shed and spare sidings separate and apart from the station; it would, in my judgment, be improper to make the passenger station large enough to store away all the carriages which will be required for the equipment of the line, but which are not in daily use; a building of a different and less costly character would suffice for such a purpose, and must be provided, in which carriages may be lifted for the purpose of examining the axle-boxes and doing other small cleaning and repairing jobs such as it is not necessary to send them into the shops to have done; if the passenger station is placed on the Male Asylum site, accommodation of this character would probably not be found much nearer to the terminus than if placed at the Penitentiary, so that I do not apprehend the slightest inconvenience to the Company on this ground.

8. As regards the restricted area available for the extension of the railway premises, I have already expressed to you my opinion that the ground proposed to be occupied is quite capable of being laid out so as to admit of the efficient discharge of the terminal duties connected with a traffic quite as large as can be carried over a railway consisting of a single line only of narrow gauge; in fact, far more than that, and I am of opinion that should the traffic grow to such an extent as to render an enlargement of the premises necessary, the Government of that period, whoever may live to see it, will readily sanction arrangements by which it might be considerably enlarged; but before that day comes I think the Government may fairly contemplate the doubling of the line.

9. With respect to the blocking up of the existing open space, I trust when the Government re-consider this question they will no longer feel it to be objectionable in the circumstances; when it is remembered that on the north there is the large open space, the People's Park; on the east, but one building, the General Hospital, between it and the sea; on the south-east the whole extent of the island, and on the south and south-west the Napier Park and Cooum River, I think it must be admitted that no site could have been selected whereon the building could be placed with less obstruction to the ventilation of the surrounding neighbourhood; and which in this case our operations will improve rather than otherwise by the removal of the dirty old buildings and their surroundings on the opposite side of the road.

10. With respect to the cost of land and compensation, as you are aware I have not at my command any information to enable me to submit an estimate. I may remark, however, that I am of opinion that, leaving out of the question the value of the houses to be removed near Sydenham and Poonamallee Roads, the compensation for the land to carry out our proposal will not be so great as the cost of the additional land and houses near the Male Asylum site; and it will be conceded, I think, that the value of the improvement by the removal of the houses referred to will quite compensate for the outlay.

11. I will only further venture to remark that while I think it will be a great inconvenience to the 3rd class passengers (the bulk) to have to walk from one station to the other if placed at a distance of three-fourths of a mile apart, and who will not have the benefit of horse transit, the tolls to be received for the use of this little extra length will render it as profitable an outlay as any portion of the undertaking.

No. 409A. From the Chairman, Chamber of Commerce, to the Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, dated Madras, 7th December 1872.

THE Chamber have learnt from an Order of Government, which has appeared in the local newspapers, that His Excellency the Governor in Council is of opinion that the arrangement proposed for locating the passenger station of the Carnatic Railway between the Penitentiary and the river will not be accompanied by any advantage adequately compensating for the extra cost and inconvenience which its adoption would entail, and that His Excellency has deferred passing final orders on the question regarding the terminal site until the promoters of the Penitentiary project have been afforded an opportunity of answering the objections raised by the Government.

2. It does not appear to have been brought to the notice of the Government that in July of last year the Agent and Manager and Chief Engineer of the Carnatic Railway Company personally consulted the Chamber on the subject of the sites for the passenger and goods stations, and that the Committee of the Chamber pointed out—to quote from their report of the interview to the Members of the Chamber—that “the nearer the Carnatic Company could bring the goods station to the goods station of the Madras Railway Company at the Salt Cotaurs to the north of the People's Park, the better it would be for the mercantile community. They deprecated the necessity of breaking bulk and of employing carts for the transfer of goods from one goods station to the other, and they urged that the experience of the Madras Company showed the disadvantage that results in the long run from the location of stations on sites inconvenient to those who most

frequent them. The land in the neighbourhood of the Salt Cotaurs being of little value and of large area, the Carnatic Company ought to be able to obtain as large a site as they require without in any way inconveniencing the Madras Railway Company, and there was no risk therefore of any clashing of interests, such as is said to be frequently the case in joint-stations of very limited space in London and elsewhere. It was also proposed by the Committee that the passenger station should be near the Salt Cotaurs. The Committee further suggested that with a view to avoiding a trace through the town, which must in any case entail no small destruction of house property, and the depreciation of compounds to be traversed, it might be well for the Company to give Vepery a wide berth, by approaching the town by way of Perambore. The circuit would be necessarily longer than the more direct route proposed, but it was probable that as far less compensation would have to be paid to landlords ‘en route,’ the cost of the line would not be increased very greatly.”

3. To these opinions, I have the honour to inform you, the Chamber still adhere. The advantages of the Salt Cotaurs' site for the terminal station of the Carnatic Railway include the facility with which goods could be transferred from the Carnatic to the Madras lines (rails being laid to connect the two), and the convenience arising from the traffic of the two railways with the beach being in one direction. From past experience the Chamber conclude that if the Carnatic Company do not now build a station near the Salt Cotaurs, they will desire to do so as soon as the inconvenience of the Penitentiary have been forcibly demonstrated. It is observed that no great interchange of passenger traffic between the two lines is expected in Madras, as they will communicate more directly *via* Arcunum; but I am desired to submit that it would be a pity to bring the Carnatic Railway to a halt within a mile of the goods station of a line which would link it to the railway system of Northern India. Moreover, if the new Central Station of the Madras Railway is found to answer expectations, it seems to the Chamber that an arrangement by which passenger trains of the Carnatic Railway could conveniently be run into this station will ere long be called for. With a station at the Penitentiary this would be impossible, or nearly so; whereas if the suggestion for a station near the Salt Cotaurs, now made by the Chamber, be carried out, such arrangements could be made without difficulty. The Madras Railway, with its Administrative Department at Royapooram, its Traffic Department at John Pereira's, its Goods Department at the Salt Cotaurs, and its Locomotive Department at Perambore, affords a notable example of the necessity for guarding against initial errors in the localization and accommodation of the staff of a railway; and the Chamber would be glad to learn that the Carnatic Company have profited by the costly experience of its neighbour.

4. The papers forwarded to the Chamber with the Order of Government, dated the 27th ultimo, are herewith returned.

No. 410.

ORDER THEREON, 21st January 1873, No. 198.

RAILWAY, No. 45.

In their letter of the 7th December the Chamber of Commerce assume that their proposals for locating the termi-

terminus of the Carnatic Railway Company at the Salt Cotaurs have not been brought to the notice of Government.

2. These proposals however were fully discussed in the papers printed with G. O., No. 3,030, of 30th November 1871, which will now be communicated to them and to the Press. His Excellency the Governor in Council is not of opinion that the advantage to be expected from not breaking bulk or employing carts in the transfer of goods from one station to the other, anticipated by them, is likely to be such as in any way to counterbalance the engineering and other objections brought forward by Messrs. Dibblee and Fisher. Through goods from south to north, or vice versa, will for the most part take the direct line to Arconum, those that do not will in any case be transferred to carts for removal to merchant's godowns, where they will lie sometime before being forwarded.

3. The route that would have to be taken, *via* Perambore to the Salt Cotaurs site, has, moreover, been proved by the late floods to be most objectionable as to level. Altogether the Government are of opinion that the object proposed to be attained by the Chamber of Commerce in their selection of site, namely, the linking of the Carnatic Railway with the Railway system of Northern India, will be better attained by completion of the link between Chingleput and Conjeveram.

4. It remains now to decide whether a separate passenger terminus shall be conceded at the Penitentiary site. And considering that the Municipality have waived all objection to it on the score of obstruction to existing traffic (augmented as it doubtless will be by the railway itself and by the tramways lately sanctioned) caused by the over-bridges which it will be necessary to construct, His Excellency the Governor in Council is pleased to direct that the necessary ground and portion of road for carrying out the proposal of the Municipality be conceded.

5. It is remarked that a sum of Rupees 50,000 has been entered in the Railway Budget Estimate of 1872-73 in view to this concession.

6. The ground to be made over to the Civil Orphan Asylum will include a triangular portion east of its present boundary and north of Whannel's Road. And the Collector of Madras will be instructed in the Revenue Department, while making the necessary valuation of property, to include in it the whole of the cultivation south of the proposed new road.

(True Extract.)


Colonel, R.E.,
Secretary to Government.

To the Chairman of the Chamber of Commerce.

„ Consulting Engineer for Railways.

„ Revenue Department.

Revenue. *Off.*
H. 212.

Govt. of 1873 Madras.

PUBLIC WORKS.

To

THE CHAIRMAN OF THE CHAMBER

OF COMMERCE.

&c., &c., &c.

Dated January 21st.

Encl.

Recd. *u 21st.*

G. O., 21st January 1873, No. 198.

JANUARY.

Nos. 409-410

Site for the Terminal Passenger Station
of the Carnatic Railway. Passing orders
on papers relating to the site for the
Terminal Station. *H. 149.*

Comm. to the B. of Revs;
attention is called to para 6.

26th Jan/73. H. 25/1.

103 To the B. of Revs. 27 Jan 73