Proceedings of the Madras Government, Revenue Department,
27th November 1873.

No. 164. Read the following Proceedings of the Board of Revenue, dated 14th October 1873, No. 2,096:—

Read the following letter from R. W. BARLOW, Esq., Acting Collector of the Chingleput District, to H. E. STOKES, Esq., Acting Secretary to the Board of Revenue, dated Saidapet, 18th September 1873, No. 422 :—

I HAVE the honour to forward a letter (to be returned) from Mr. Smith, the Treasury Deputy-Collector, which he respectfully requests may be laid before Government together with a copy of Mr. Dalyell's letter, No. 69, dated 17th February 1872, bringing to my notice that the rates at present paid for unloading, weighing, and forming a 20-garce heap of salt at the Madras Kotaurs, approximate to those which Mr. Grainger represented as extravagantly high in his letter to the Board, printed with their Proceedings, dated 7th December 1870, No. 6,976.

2. The marginal statement exhibits the rates which were condemned, those which prevail, and those which Mr. Grainger stated would be sufficient with his machine.

	Rs.	A.	P.
Old rate per 20-garce heap ...	19	3	10
Present do.	15	0	0
Mr. Grainger's rate	6	10	0

3. Mr. Grainger's rates, I feel bound to remark, have been found, in practice, to be altogether insufficient, and that those now obtaining at the Madras Kotaurs somewhat nearly approach those condemned, if the profits of contractors, not now employed, be taken into account. I think, too, that, when certain other improvements are introduced, the present rate of Rupees 15 per 20-garce heap will be inadequate, and that it may possibly touch Rupees 16 or 17, or pretty much what was ascertained,* from Mr. Plunkett's experiments, to be the actual cost under the old system; the fact being that, though the new machines are admirably adapted for unloading, weighing, and storing salt, yet, as it has been found impossible to store wet direct from the boats owing to the heavy wastage† resulting (though the machines are well *capable* of doing so), the saving anticipated from the avoidance of the double operation of unloading and relifting became impossible.

* *Vide* paragraph 6 of my letter, dated 23rd June 1871, No. 269, printed with Board's Proceedings, dated 25th July 1871, No. 3,104.

† *Vide* my letter, No. 410, dated 13th September 1873.

4. The Board are aware that severe censures were passed on Mr. Smith's late administration of the Salt Department, in consequence of Mr. Grainger's representations and calculations which, so far as the savings resulting from the use of the new machines are concerned, have not been realized in practice; and I therefore forward Mr. Smith's explanation for the favourable consideration of his request, that he may be relieved from the censure passed by the Board.

ENCLOSURE No. 1.

From A. SMITH, Esq., Deputy-Collector, in charge of the Treasury, to R. W. BARLOW, Esq., Acting Collector of Chingleput, dated Sydapet, 26th August 1873, No. 406A.

I HAVE the honour to bring to your notice that the charge for cooly-labour in connection with the storage of salt at the Madras Kotaur is very much in excess of that estimated under the

Paragraph 4, Proceedings, dated 7th December 1870, No. 6,976.

experiments made with Mr. Grainger's machine, and bids fair to approximate to the old rate, which, in his letter to the Board, recorded in their Proceedings marginally noted, he emphatically and unhesitatingly declared to be "extravagantly high."

2. The following statement exhibits the old rate, that at present obtaining at the Madras Kotaur, and that shown to be sufficient in the statement appended to paragraph 20 of Mr. Grainger's letter, recorded in the Proceedings above quoted :—

Operations.	Old rate for a 20-garce Heap.	Present rate for a 20-garce Heap.	Experimental rate.	Remarks.
	RS. A. P.	RS. A. P.	RS. A. P.	
Unlading, weighing, etc	19 3 10	15 0 0	6 10 0	The old rate included the profits of four contractors, through whose agency coolies were procured, but whose services have since been dispensed with.

3. Mr. Grainger affirmed (paragraph 21 of his letter) that, if his new machine is employed in the storing of twenty lakhs of maunds (the produce of good seasons), "a net saving of Rs. 10,512-2-4 would be effected *every year*" at the Madras Kotaur; but experience having demonstrated the impossibility of storing a 20-garce heap, at even double the rate experimentally shown to be sufficient, his calculations of annual profit, based on that rate, fall, of course, to the ground.

4. If I may venture to express an opinion, founded on a practical experience of ten years, I firmly believe that even Rupees 15, the rate now required for a 20-garce heap, is by no means a high charge, and that it will eventually be found necessary to increase it to Rupees 17 per heap if the operation of storing is to be completed before the setting in of the north-east monsoon,—a point of considerable importance in avoiding wastage and smuggling at the pans during the continuance of the rains. Be this, however, as it may, the Board are probably under the impression that a large saving is being effected at the Madras Kotaur under Mr. Grainger's system of unlading and storing, and it is but due to them to explain how matters stand, and to obtain their sanction for the present charge of Rupees 15 per heap of 20 garce.

5. Looking to the animadversions which have been passed on my late administration of the Salt Department consequent on Mr. Grainger's representations as to the extravagancy of the rates which formerly obtained, I trust that I shall be pardoned if I venture to allude to the *practical results* which have followed the introduction of his machine into the Salt Department, so far as the Madras Kotaur is concerned.

Board's Proceedings, dated 7th Dec. 1870, No. 6,976.
" " " 24th April 1871, " 1,712.
" " " 25th July " " 3,104.
Official Memorandum, " 13th Feb. 1872, " 237.

6. It will be seen from a glance at the statement appended to paragraph 2 of this letter that the present charge far exceeds the experimental rate, and approximates to that which was so severely condemned. Either the old charges were just and fair, including as they did the profits of four different contractors, or they were "extravagantly high," as alleged by Mr. Grainger. If the present charge of Rupees 15, arrived at after the use of Mr. Grainger's machine for upwards of two years, be admitted and sanctioned, it will evidence the incorrectness of the experimental rates; if not admitted, it will confirm the representations made as to the extravagant rates formerly paid for labour.

7. In coming to a decision as to which of the above alternatives should be accepted, it would not be amiss to consider what have been the results of Mr. Grainger's scheme as a whole, and whether any of its parts has fallen through from want of adaptation, from precipitate action, and deficiency of experience as to the requirements of the department. "The Whipping frame," from

Proceedings of the Madras Government, Revenue Department,
27th November 1873.

the introduction of which a saving* of Rupees 3-0-10 per heap of 20 garce was anticipated, was given up almost as soon as tried; while the plan for "the correct and simple determination of the quantity of water in excess in the salt," briefly styled "corrections for water," and elaborately described in paragraphs 13 to 17 of his letter, was abandoned after a very short trial as an unsafe guide and leading to confusion, which, even up to the present time, has not been got over, and is likely to lead to payments of large sums in the shape of compensation to wholesale purchasers of salt. As to the experimental rates, experience has shown them to be totally insufficient, and with respect to the large savings based on those rates it will be seen that they are as far from realization as ever.

Vide Extract A, appended to paragraph 3 of his letter.

8. Another result of a very grave nature, which the introduction of Mr. Grainger's system of unlading and weighing salt has produced, is the enormous wastage which has occurred in the outturn of heaps at the Madras Kotaur. The operations of unlading and weighing, which were before separately performed and paid for, were doubled up and performed simultaneously for the purpose of effecting a saving of labour. The salt thus unladen and weighed at one and the same time, instead of being unladen, dried, and afterwards weighed, as was the practice formerly, was received into store in a wet state, and the result has been a large and unprecedented wastage, amounting, during the last fasli, to 1,33,570 maunds as shown below, and entailing a loss on Government far exceeding the trifling saving effected by the arrangement:—

Fasli.	No. of Heaps.	Quantity in the Heaps.	Outturn.	Wastage.
		MDS.	MDS.	MDS.
1282.	446	10,85,685	9,52,115	1,33,570

9. Deducting from the above wastage of 1,33,570 maunds, the *maximum* wastage of 5 per cent. allowed by the rules, viz., 54,284 maunds, there remain a wastage in *excess* of the maximum of 79,286 maunds, which, at Rupees 2 per maund, has entailed a loss on Government, during a single fasli, of Rupees 1,58,572.

10. With these facts before you, it will not be difficult to decide as to the value of Mr. Grainger's scheme for unlading and weighing salt into store; and looking to the present rate of Rupees 15, which experience has demonstrated to be necessary for working Mr. Grainger's machine, and to the rate, viz., Rupees 17, which Mr. Deputy-Collector Plunkett reported* to be necessary for working the old platform machine, and contrasting both rates with the charge formerly made for working the old machine, viz., Rupees 19, I respectfully submit that, so far from the latter rate being "extravagantly high," as alleged by Mr. Grainger, it was a most correct and reasonable charge, seeing that it also included the profits of contractors, which find no place in the 15 and 17 Rupees rates above alluded to.

* *Vide* paragraph 6 of letter from Collector to Board, dated 23rd June, and recorded in Board's Proceedings, dated 25th July 1871, No. 3,104.

11. To show this has been the principal object of this letter, and I venture earnestly to beg that, as a matter of simple justice to myself, you will be so good as to lay this letter before the Board of Revenue, in order that, if they see sufficient grounds, they will be pleased to absolve me from the censure which they have passed on my late administration of the Salt Department, and do me the favour of submitting my letter to Government, as they did the Proceedings in which my conduct was represented in an unfavourable light, together with Mr. Dalyell's letter† to their address, expressive of his opinion of my management of that department, founded on his knowledge of me and of my work during the long period of ten years.

† Dated 17th February 1872.

In 1870 the cost of unloading salt from the boats at the Madras Kotaurs and storing came under the consideration of the Board. Under the system then

Proceedings of the Madras Government, Revenue Department,
27th November 1873.

in vogue, the salt was stored by contract at the rate of Rupees 19-3-10 per 20-garce heap. By the use of new weighing machines and an apparatus for lifting the salt from the boats, Mr. Grainger, Superintendent of Public Works Stores, demonstrated that it was possible to perform the same operation for Rupees 6-10-0. Experience, however, showed that the lifting apparatus was unsuitable, and so far from the rate of Rupees 6-10-0 per 20-garce heap being maintained, it is now found that the operation costs Rupees 15. Mr. Smith was subject to a certain amount of censure for the high rates which had prevailed under his management, and he now prays that, as it has been shown by experience that his rates were not so very high after all, that the censure may be removed. The Board think him entitled to relief from censure in so far as Mr. Grainger's rates, on which the censure was grounded, have been shown not to be applicable in practice.

No. 165. ORDER THEREON, 27th November 1873, No. 1,311.

Separate Revenue, No. 14.
Salt.

ORDERED to be recorded.

(True Extract.)

D. F. CARMICHAEL,
Secretary to Government.

To the Board of Revenue.

G.O. 18 Law 71 N° 258-56
11 May " 133-4
15 Law 72 N° 83 Mar

Rev 1873 Dept
N° 3349

1873.

Board of Revenue,
MADRAS.

PROCEEDINGS, 14TH OCTOBER 1873, No. 2,096.

Dup. 20 Oct 73.
Encl.

Received 22nd Oct 73

OCTOBER.
No. 2,096.

Salt.—Letter from Collector of Chingleput forwarding one from Deputy-Collector Mr. Smith, requesting that censure passed on him for high rates allowed for unloading salt, while he was in charge of Salt Department, may be removed, as experience has shown that rates were not too high, submitted to Government, and removal of censure recommended.

Recorded

Engd. F. R. Bantleman.

14 Rd. Rev. dr. 28 Nov

C. 4 Nov 73 N° 19 Nov

Govt. of {1873} Madras.

REVENUE.

To

THE BOARD OF REVENUE.

Dated November 27th.

Recd. *Encl.*

G. O., 27th November 1873, No. 1,311.

NOVEMBER.

Nos. 164-165.

Mr. Smith, Deputy-Collector of Chingleput.—Recording Proceedings of the Board of Revenue considering — entitled to relief from censure for high rates allowed for unloading salt while he was in charge of the Salt Department.