179-181
22.7.1872

Proceedings of the Madras Government, Revenue Department,
22nd July 1872.

Read the following papers:—

No. 179. Endorsement of the Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, dated Ootacamund, 28th June 1872.

Read the following Proceedings of the Government of India, Public Works Department, (Irrigation,) dated Simla, 14th June 1872, No. 465-I.

Madras Water-supply Project.

Read the following despatch from the Secretary of State, No. 35, dated 18th April 1872.

ORDER.—Ordered that extract paragraphs 6 and 7 thereof be forwarded to the Government of Madras in the Public Works Department for report.

(Signed) G. SKIPWITH, Captain, R.E.,
for *Deputy-Secretary to the Government of India.*

EXTRACT Paragraphs 6 and 7 of Despatch from Secretary of State, No. 35, dated 18th April 1872.

6. The misleading character of the original estimates is acknowledged by the Madras Government to reflect more or less discredit on all who were concerned in their preparation, but, though the engineer officers who designed the project are justly censurable for heedlessly omitting from their calculations some necessary and heavy items, it is Mr. Thornhill, who was at the time Collector of the Madras District, who chiefly misled the local Government, and to whom the larger share of blame belongs. According to a statement put in by this gentleman in 1868, the extent of land irrigable from the projected works was about 15,000 acres, with an assessment of Rs. 33,385, susceptible possibly of increase to Rs. 82,160. Two years afterwards it was pointed out by Mr. Thornhill's successor in the Collectorate that the above estimate of land was in excess by no less than 11,096 acres, the real extent being under 4,000 acres; and it was added that the difference was owing to Mr. Thornhill's having been a "rough estimate," and to its having included every acre of unoccupied assessed land, "on the supposition that there would be an unlimited supply of water, and that the whole of the land would be converted into wet," without reference to level or other circumstances.

7. I desire to be informed in what manner the displeasure with which this culpable negligence on Mr. Thornhill's part must needs have been regarded by the Madras Government, has been notified.

TRANSFERRED to the Revenue Department.

(Signed) G. W. WALKER, Colonel, R.E.,
Secretary to Government, P.W.D.

REFERRED to Mr. Thornhill for any explanation he may desire to offer.

(Signed) W. HUDLESTON,
29th June 1872. *Secretary to Government.*

No. 180. From G. THORNHILL, Esq., Acting First Member of the Board of Revenue, to the Officiating Chief Secretary to Government, dated Madras, 8th July 1872.

I HAVE the honour to acknowledge the receipt of the Order of Government dated 29th June 1872, forwarding for my explanation an extract from a despatch from the Secretary of State, No. 35, dated 18th April 1872, in which it is stated, with reference to a report on the Madras Water Works Scheme, that "it is "Mr. Thornhill who chiefly misled the Madras Government, and to whom the "larger share of the blame belongs," and which concludes with an inquiry as to the manner in which my "culpable negligence" has been notified.

2. I am assumed to have misled the Government by putting in a statement to the effect that the extent of land irrigable by the projected works was about 15,000 acres, whereas it was pointed out two years later by my successor in the Collectorate that the above estimate was in excess of the real extent by no less than 11,096 acres.

3. In order to clear myself of this very severe and, as I hope to show, totally undeserved censure, I must beg to be allowed to submit a brief account of the origin of the statement alluded to.

4. In October 1868, when I was Acting Collector of the Madras District, I received a demi-official note from Colonel Anderson, R.E., then Chief Engineer for Irrigation under the Madras Government, asking me to obtain for him a statement showing the entire area of land to which water could be led from the Red Hills and Sholaveram Lakes when completed, *supposing the supply of water in them to be unlimited.* He said as there was no regular survey of the land he wished the statement framed in communication with the cultivating ryots who were generally pretty good judges of level, and particularly urged it was to be on the supposition that the water-supply would be unlimited. I much regret that Colonel Anderson's note has not been preserved, but I am quite certain as to its tenor, and I am fortunately able to submit the original memorandum of instructions which I issued to the head of my office immediately after its receipt, and which shows distinctly the nature of Colonel Anderson's communication and the basis on which the statement alluded to was framed.

5. I shortly afterwards proceeded to the locality myself, and directed the inquiry in person, explaining to the men employed what I required.

6. The reports of the officials employed were examined and the statement prepared in my office and submitted to Colonel Anderson.

7. The statement showed, according to the opinion of the taluq officials, confirmed by the cultivating ryots, the entire extent of assessed land, whether classed as wet or dry, whether occupied or not, whether belonging to Government or to Inamdars, to which water from the Red Hills and Sholaveram Lakes would flow, *supposing the supply of water in those lakes to be unlimited,* and supposing the requisite works of distribution to be constructed.

8. I believe the statement to be as nearly accurate as such a statement could be expected to be, and it is perfectly patent to any one who knows the locality that the entire tract of country lying between the high northern road, which

passes just to the eastward of the lakes on the west, and Cochrane's Canal on the east, and between the Cortilliar River on the north, and the Kooum on the south, together with a considerable tract between the high mound of the Red Hills on the north and the Kooum on the south, must be commanded by the lakes in question.

9. It was the cultivable land within these boundaries which was entered in my statement, and supposing the water-supply in the lakes to be unlimited I believe the whole of this land might be watered from them. Unfortunately, however, it has been found that the supply of water is anything but unlimited, and that, after meeting the requirements of the Madras Water Works, but little will remain for extended irrigation.

10. This is the history of the statement; that the Government were not misled by it, either in sanctioning the works or at any other time, will, I think, be clear from the following:—

11. In the first place the works were sanctioned and commenced in October 1866. I was not appointed to the Madras District until May 1867, and the statement was not submitted until December 1868, having been called for only in the previous October when the works were well advanced.

12. In the second place the Madras Government could not have been misled by my statement, because it was never placed before them. What Colonel Anderson's object may have been in calling for it I do not know (though it was probably to ascertain whether the profits would be limited by want of water or want of irrigable land); but I certainly was not given to understand by him that he contemplated laying it before Government, and I have ascertained from the Government Office that the document was not laid before Government or printed; it was simply forwarded to the Executive Engineer in charge of the works.

13. It was, indeed, never before Government until it was quoted by Mr. Blair in his letter of the 9th December 1870. Mr. Blair finding the statement on record in his office not unnaturally alluded to it, and he described it truly, except in one point, viz., that it had been framed without reference to level or other circumstances; now it had special reference to the supposed level of the land, and in that respect as in all others is, I believe, a fairly correct statement of what it professed to be.

14. It is easy to understand why neither the Board nor Government took any notice of Mr. Blair's mention of this statement; although not formally before them, the nature of the inquiries on which it was based was sufficiently well known to render any notice of it unnecessary. Moreover, by that time it had been ascertained that it was immaterial how much land was commanded by the tanks because the supply of water was only sufficient to irrigate a portion of it.

15. I trust that the above explanation will suffice to convince His Excellency in Council that I cannot fairly be charged with the blame of misleading the Government; and if so, I respectfully beg that the Government will so represent the case to the Secretary of State that His Grace may be induced to recall the charge of culpable negligence which has been made in consequence of a total misapprehension of the facts.

Proceedings of the Madras Government, Revenue Department,
22nd July 1872.

No. 181. ORDER THEREON, 22nd July 1872, No. 1,099.

Irrigation No. 2.

ORDERED that Mr. Thornhill's explanation be forwarded to the Supreme Government with the request that it may be transmitted to the Secretary of State with the opinion of this Government that no blame whatever attaches in this matter to Mr. Thornhill in whom the Government of Madras have thorough confidence, and that the censure passed on him should be withdrawn.

(True Extract.)

(Signed) W. HUDLESTON,
Secretary to Government.

2

Rev 2291/72

Transferred to the Revenue Department

Chamberlain Coll 82.
Secy to Govt PWD

Golacaman Coll
28th June 1872

Approved Mr. Thornhill to frame any explanation he may desire to offer.

W. Hudleston
Sec. to Govt

29.6.72 No. 179

Rev. 1872 Depart
No. 3080

From. No 2178
The Government of India
Rev.

Dated 14th } June/72
Recd/22nd 29th No 465 J.

Encl: 1.

S.O. No 1099 - 22nd July 1872

an extract from a Despatch from the Secy: of State regarding the Madras Water Supply Project and the proceedings of Mr Thornhill in connection with the scheme -

Rank Forrest

Read the following papers:-

No 179

From

G. Thornhill Esqre
Acting First Member of the
Board of Revenue.

To The Honorable W. Hudleston
Officiating Chief Secretary
to Government.

Sir

I have the honor to acknowledge
the receipt of the Order of Govern-
-ment, dated 29th June 1872, forwarding
for my Explanation an Extract
from a Despatch from the
Secretary of State, No. 35 dated
18th April 1872, in which it is stated,
with reference to a Report on the
Madras Water Works Scheme,
that "it is Mr Thornhill who
"chiefly misled the Madras Govern-
"ment and withdrew the larger
Share

"share of the blame belongs" and which concludes with an Enquiry as to the manner in which my "Culpable negligence" has been notified"

I am assumed to have misled the Government by putting in a Statement to the Effect that the Extent of land irrigable by the projected Works was about 15,000 Acres; whereas it was pointed out two years later by my Successor in the Collectorate that the above Estimate was in Excess of the real Extent by no less than 11.096 acres.

In order to clear myself of this very severe, and, as I hope to show totally undeserved, Censure I must beg to be allowed to Submit a brief account of the origin of the Statement alluded to

to.

In October 1868, when I was acting Collector of the Madura District, I received a demi-official note from Colonel Anderson R.E. then Chief Engineer for Irrigation under the Madras Government asking me to obtain for him a Statement shewing the Extent of land to which water could be led from the Red Hills and Sholaveram Lakes when Completed supposing the Supply of water in them to be unlimited. He said as there was no regular Survey of the land he wished the Statement framed in Communication with the Cultivating Ryots who were generally pretty good judges of Level and particularly urged it was to be on the Supposition that the water Supply would be unlimited

unlimited. I much regret that Colonel Anderson's note has not been preserved, but I am quite certain as to its tenor and I am fortunately able to submit the original Memorandum of instructions which I issued to the Head of my Office immediately after its receipt, and which shows distinctly the nature of Colonel Anderson's Communication and the basis on which the Statement alluded to was framed.

I shortly afterwards proceeded to the locality myself and directed the Enquiry in person, Explaining to the men Employed what I required.

The reports of the Officials Employed were Examined and the

the Statement prepared in my Office and submitted to Colonel Anderson.

The Statement Showed, according to the opinion of the Talook Officials Confirmed by the Cultivating Ryots the Entire Extent of Assessed land, whether classed as wet or dry, whether occupied or not, whether belonging to Government or to ryots, which water from the Red Hills and Sholaveram Lakes would flow - supposing the supply of water in those Lakes to be unlimited and supposing the requisite works of distribution to be Constructed.

I believe the Statement to be as nearly accurate as such a Statement could be Expected to

be

be, and it is perfectly patent
to any one who knows the localityy
that the Entire track of Country
lying betweenn the High Northern
road,- which passes just to the
Eastward of the Lakes,- on the west
and Cochranes Canal on the East
and betweenn the Cottilliau River
on the North and the Knowns on the
South, togetherr with a Considerable
track betweenn the high mound
of the Red Hills on the North and
the Knowns on the South, must be
Commanded by the Lakes in question.

It was the Cultivable land
within these boundaries which
was Entered in my Statement
And supposing the water Supply
in the Lakes to be unlimited I
believed the whole of this land

might

might be watered from them.
Unfortunately however it has been
found that the Supply of water
is anything but unlimited and that
after meeting the requirements of the
Madras Water Works but little
will remain for Extended irrigation
This is the history of the State=
=ment; that the Government were
not misled by it Either in
sanctioning the Works or at any
other time will I think be clear
from the following:-

In the first place the Works
were Sanctioned and Commenced
in October 1866. I was not appointed
to the Madras District until May
1867 and the Statement was not
Submitted until December 1868.
having been called for only in the
previous October when the Works

were

were with advantage.

In the second place, the Madras Government could not have been misled by my Statement because it was never placed before them; What Colonel Anderson's object may have been in calling for it I do not know (though it was probably to ascertain whether the profits would be limited by want of water or want of irrigable land) but I certainly was not given to understand by him that he contemplated laying it before Government and I have ascertained from the Government office that the document was not laid before Government or printed; it was simply forwarded to the Executive Engineer in charge of the Works.

It was indeed never before Government

Government until it was quoted by Mr Blair in his letter of the 9th December 1870. Mr Blair finding the Statement on record in his office not unnaturally alluded to it and he described it truly except in one point viz. that it had been framed without reference to level or other Circumstances; now it had special reference to the supposed level of the land and in that respect as in all others is I believe a fair correct Statement of what it professed to be.

It is easy to understand why neither the Board nor Government took any notice of Mr Blair's mention of this Statement; although not formally before them, the nature of the Enquiries on which it was based was

was sufficiently well known to render any notice of it unnecessary. Moreover by that time it had been ascertained that it was immaterial how much land was commanded by the tanks because the supply of water was only sufficient to irrigate a portion of it.

I trust that the above explanation will suffice to convince His Excellency in Council that I cannot fairly be charged with the blame of misleading the Government and if so I respectfully beg that the Government will so represent the case to the Secretary of State that His Grace may be induced to recall the charge of Culpable negligence which

192

has been made in consequence of a total misapprehension of the facts.

I have the honor to be
Sir
Your Most Obedient Servant
J. Montaile

Madras
8th July 1872

Revenue 1872 Sept.
No. 2291.

From
G. Thornhill Esqre
Ag. 1st Member of the
Bd: of Revenue

Dated 8th } July 1872.
Recd 11th }

Encs: 2.

Affording explanation as to his freedom from blame attached to him in connection with the Madras Water Supply Project.

No 180

S.O. No 1099 - 22 July/72

C. 12: July 1872 19: July

C. 12. July 1872 19. July.

Chief Engineer for Irrigation
Order to me officially to
advise me to ascertain for
him the future area, with its
assessment, of the lands which
the Red Hills & Shoalhaven valleys
would command. When fully
completed. according to native
computation and supposing
that the supply of water could
be authenticated. He remarked
that the natives are generally
tolerably good judges of land,
& he wished to know what, in
their view, to be the extent to

which the Public from the Lakes
could be availed of. suppose
it to be carried to cultivation also.
I am very sorry that I could not
procure his will but it may be
in record in the Colonial Office.
he complained. I sent out to the
Red Hills & examined a good deal
of the Country myself. I employed
a Native Instructor to go on
all the villages & after procuring
communication with the Villages
to point out Estimate of what
was required - He sent in

for
P.O.
D.

C.12: Cadiz 1872 19. July.

1 [illegible] Mission to Morocco

The statement which I have
posted & often carefully going
over it with Mr Talbot Lodge. I
sent it to Colonel Anderson
demi-officially. I believe it is
a present quite faithfully what
it was intended to represent.
This is the sum of the collected
evidence with which I came
charged. Any time of the
Deshatch almost is based on
some inaccuracy.
I was not called when the
work was designed for it was
half finished before the Natter

2 2a

work was prepared & before
I came near the District.
The Local Government was
not officially assisted by me
in the work nor was I consulted from
beginning to end of any
part of the statement to which for
publish the statement to which
the Secretary of State alludes
it was written before the Govt. of
Cadiz. The statement was
come to me in the Customs
Collectors office & was read
aloud to by Mr. Blanc in
his report. His statement was

27a

C. 12: Lady 1872 19: July

based on different data
altogether. & Lastly to see
from any statement of the
area cultivated by the Lakes having included
the Govt. it has been well
known from the first that
there was barely enough to
take any amount of water.
If it is the quantity of water
that is deficient. & the
quality of the land which
is unfavourable liable to
bearing the high assessment

which the early promoters
of the scheme labelled it-
realize from it.-
I fancy the reason why the
Govt. never noticed the
discrepancy between the
Blains statement & mine
must have been the fact
that Colonel Mc Kenzie de-
liver his 1865? D. P. W. was
aware of the nature of
his accounts which should
furnished & knew that there
was nothing misleading

C. 12: July 1872 19: July

about them. I shall write
to me right in this matter
ance with the Madras Govt.
ment & trust when in receipt
my Official report. you will
be able to procure the order.
but by the Communication which
has been passed on me with
so little right in return.

Yours
Yours sincerely
J. Humble

W. Huddleston
Lt C.G. Fort
C. 12: July 1872

77

Letter from the Government of
India dated 14th June 1872. No. 465 of.

I would transfer the
letter to the Revd. Dobe
in which Mr Thornhill's
proclamation should be
kept. as in it he
has the address date

L.D.

P.W.D.
Ootacamund
June 1872

A.A.

Circulated for
orders.

G. Gunther Col. R.E.
Secretary to Govt.
P.W.D.

Rev. 2178/72

C. No. 2178 + 2291

Revenue Department.

No. 1099

PROCEEDINGS of the MADRAS GOVERNMENT.

Under date the 22 July 1872.

Read the following papers

Govt of India. P. W. Dept forwarding an extract from a Dispatch from the Secy: of State regarding the Madras Water Supply Project & the proceedings of Mr Thornhill in connection with the Scheme.	H. L. 14 June 1872, No 465.
From G. Thornhill Esq: Submitting explanation with reference to the above.	H. L. 8 July 1872.

Ordered that Mr Thornhill's explanation be forwarded to the Supreme Govt with the request that it may be transmitted to the Secretary of State with the opinion of this Govt

Govt that no blame what-
= ever attaches in this matter
to Mr Thornhill in whom
the Govt of Madras have
thorough confidence and
that the censure passed
on him should be with-
= drawn

To
1 G. Thornhill Esqr Dec 30th July/72
21 " P. W. Deptt — "
14 " Board of Revenue "

60
4

Eq. O. 31C

Mr Thornhill for—
—Drugs in connection with
the Madras Native Troops
Depot—

(2/6/88)

C. 12 July 1872 R 19 July