M.R.O. 1—38,000—16-10-29.

MADRAS RECORD OFFICE.

Government of Madras.

Revenue **DEPARTMENT.**

G.O. No. 3019 Press ~~Mis.~~

254-256

Dated 23rd November 1868

Not to be folded or roughly handled

17-3-20

Proceedings of the Madras Government, Revenue Department.
23rd November 1869.

Read the following papers :—

No. 254. From the Acting Superintending Engineer, 4th Division, to the Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, dated Madras, 7th September 1869, No. 2,991.

One letter, dated 3rd September 1869.
One map.

AT the request of Mr. R. J. Lowry, Assistant Engineer in charge of the Chembrumbaukum Tank Works, I have the honour to forward a letter in reply to the comments of Colonel Walker, R. E., Superintending Engineer, 7th Division, on a road traced by Mr. Lowry on the Annamallay Hills.

From R. J. LOWRY, Esq., Assistant Engineer, Chembrumbaukum Tank Project, to the Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, dated 3rd September 1869.

Sketch Map of part of the Annamallay Hills.

I HAVE just been furnished by the Forest Department with a copy of Colonel Walker's report on the road-work executed by me on the Annamallay Hills, on which Government were pleased to pass the Order, No. 2,284, dated 6th August. I have the honour respectfully to request that I may be allowed to defend myself and my work against the assertions made in that report, and I further beg that you will be good enough to submit what is here said with that end for the further consideration of Government as regards the decision conveyed in the Order quoted above. I hope to be able to show that Colonel Walker made this report without a sufficient inspection of the locality in question, and that, except with reference to a short portion of the road in the valley, he has written either under wrong information or in complete ignorance of my ghaut trace and the road below, both of which he condemns in no measured terms, and that his report is unfair to me and likely to mislead Government.

2. All it is necessary to say as to why I failed to get the trace cleared or meet Colonel Walker at the time appointed by him, is that I could not absent myself for more than five days of the Christmas holidays from the very important works which are placed in my charge.

3. In paragraph 4 of his report, Colonel Walker gives a fair-enough valuation of the work done from the Ooliar river to the head of the ghaut, a distance of about three-and-a-half miles; but he objects to, or doubts, the expediency of the zigzags that occur thereon. There is but one zigzag, and, had he seen more of the ground over which the road passes, he would have been convinced that this could not be dispensed with. I believe Colonel Walker did walk over a portion, and only a portion, of those three-and-a-half miles, and that this is the only part of either ghaut or road he has seen.

4. He states that there are but two-and-a-half miles of the upper portion of the ghaut on which work has been executed, leaving the lower two miles untouched: this is not so, there is nearly half a mile of the lower part of the ghaut all but completed, and the lower two miles were cleared of trees and brush.

5. Mr. Nisbet, (who was then my assistant,) to whom the Colonel states he is indebted for so much information about the trace and the road, could have informed him that I spent a month on the face which he (Colonel Walker) states to be the proper one for the road, trying to find some way of avoiding the precipices which met me which ever way I turned, and I was obliged to give it up as it would have taken at least a lac of rupees to make a good ghaut on that side and I had not that amount of funds at command.

6. The zigzags on my trace, of which Colonel Walker states that there are so many that he cannot show them on a map on a small scale, are shown in the accompanying sketch plan (which is a portion of the Trigonometrical Survey Map sheet 62, enlarged to a scale of one mile to the inch.). It will be seen by this that there are but six turns or zigzags in all, which cannot be said to

be many in rising 2,500 feet on the most difficult hill-face to get a road up that I have met with. Colonel Walker is pleased to say that I have had no previous experience in ghaut-tracing. I could refute this by the testimony of at least one officer in Madras, but it is beside the question ; and I pass on to his statement that the foot of my ghaut is two-and-a-half miles further back than it should be, and that the road below is lengthened by that distance. A reference to the sketch plan will show that this is not so : on the contrary, it will be seen that the distance from the foot of the ghaut to Pollachy by the line proposed by Colonel Walker, which is marked by black dots coloured yellow, is nineteen miles or more, while by the red line which is mine it is but fourteen miles. This difference of distance of five miles is so great that Colonel Walker's road, if completed to-morrow, would not be used twice in a twelve-month by either carts or passengers going either to the Teak Valley or the Coffee Estates.

7. Had Colonel Walker walked over the north-west face and then down my trace, he must have changed his opinion both as to which side was best for the road and as to the ability shown in tracing it, and also as to the value of the work done. Evidently he has never seen either except at a distance too great to enable him or any other person to judge the nature of the ground.

8. What he says about the combination of an Elephant Slip and road being my reason for choosing the line I did is also without foundation, as the face he recommends affords a better slip and one easier made than does the other. What proves this is that all the timber that has as yet been slipped from this forest by either the Forest Department or myself has been taken down by the north-west face.

9. In paragraph 7 of his report Colonel Walker says, "But this mistake has extended to "the line which he adopted on to Pollachy, on which the Collector was induced by his representation "to lay out Rupees 2,218 of District Funds in 1867 and 1868." He goes on to say that "this line "involves the crossing of three formidable streams, the Toracadavoo," (by which he must mean the Toracadoo, as the Toracadavoo is in an entirely different locality, some twenty-five miles to the north-west of any portion of my line, where the Forest Department have their station in the old Annamallay Forest), the Palaur, and the Oopaur. The mistake is the Colonel's, not mine ; the Oopaur which he places on my line will be seen by the map to be on the one he proposes to adopt near the village of Annamallay. It will be evident from the sketch-map that my line crosses only one considerable stream, the Toracadoo, or Perryaur as it is called, after it debouches from the hills. This is a formidable stream when in flood, which it is liable to be for about three months of each year. Fortunately there is an excellent ford and site for a ferry where my road crosses, which might be made passable at all seasons with very little expense ; the other nine months it is fordable for carts which are daily crossing it.

10. I would add that, in a period of nearly four years during which I constantly resided on those hills, I never found the ferry impassable ; but once when I was compelled to go round by Annamallay village, a trip I will not soon forget as I nearly lost my servant and horsekeeper and did lose half my baggage in the attempt to cross the jungle stream close to the foot of the ghaut at the place marked in brown, I had to swim for it and had a narrow escape of being swept down by the current but fortunately got across with my horse, leaving all else behind. I had a similar task at the Oopaur before reaching Annamallay. I mention this to show that there are two very difficult streams to deal with in the line advocated by Colonel Walker, while the Palaur, which is the only stream besides the Perryaur on the other line, is never impassable, or, at least, in all the hundreds of times I have crossed it during every month of the year I have never been detained a moment by it. Carts, however, have to wait an hour sometimes until a sudden fresh runs off.

11. The red line, as will be seen by the map, has the additional advantage of opening communication between the large market town and Cusbah station of Pollachy and the five large villages of Kottur, Anglecoorchey, Chittoor, Oopellipalium, and Sumathoor, and would have been necessary as far as Anglecoorchey if the Annamallays had never been in existence. It has been inexpensive to make as witness the outlay of Rupees 2,218 : the land is waste for the greater part of its length and the soil hard and gravelly, whereas the line proposed by Colonel Walker must be taken over

Proceedings of the Madras Government, Revenue Department,
23rd November 1869.

rice-fields from where it leaves the hills until it reaches the village of Annamallay, a distance of more than nine miles. This land is very valuable, and the compensation to the owners, the cost of numerous culverts that will be necessary to pass the irrigation water and the drainage, together with bridges for the two considerable streams beforementioned, will render this a very expensive piece of road to make, and, when made, it will not be used except on rare occasions, as no one will go round a distance of nineteen miles to get to the hills when they can go by a practicable road of fourteen miles in length.

12. I may mention that the reason that the Palaur and the other small streams on my line get so poor a supply of water is that they do not rise in the main chain of the Annamallays. The Toracadoo drains the northern face of the hills, and those streams merely take the drainage of a detached hill and a portion of the north-eastern face which is comparatively dry, very little rain falling on this part of the range.

13. I would most respectfully beg to point out that in this matter of the Teak Forest and the road I have from the first been hardly dealt with, inasmuch that the Government having decided on not allowing me to get up a company to work the timber in the forest, called upon the Conservator of Forests, Major Beddome, to report what sum should be given me for the felled timber and in compensation for my giving up the forest. This gentleman having been previously reprimanded for having given me the grant of the timber, would in such report naturally be induced to make the amount to be paid me as small as possible, in order that the loss accruing to the Government by his action on this matter might be inconsiderable.

14. Again, Colonel Walker, who is well-known to have an animus against me, (this the records of Government will show,) was called upon to report on my road, and I hope I have shown herein that his report is not a fair one either of the work done or line selected. I do not for a moment mean to infer that Government in appointing these gentlemen knew of there being any objection to the appointment.

I mention these points as I consider it due to myself and those interested with me, who have been such heavy losers by this transaction, (as we are still Rupees 19,000 out of pocket,) that every thing should be stated in order that Government may have the whole facts before them in case they are graciously pleased to re-consider their decision with reference to the compensation to be paid me for the road.

15. In conclusion, I would ask that, when perusing this, you will be pleased not to consider it as being the letter of an inferior officer of the department writing to his superiors but rather as the words of a man defending his property and his professional skill against a report likely to lower the value of the former and to give a false impression of the latter. Nothing is further from my purpose than offence to, or disrespect to, Colonel Walker.

TRANSFERRED to the Revenue Department, with reference to the orders in that department, dated 6th August 1869, No. 2,284.

FORT SAINT GEORGE,
9th September 1869.

(Signed) CHARLES A. ORR, Colonel, R. E.,
Secretary to Government, P. W. D.

FORWARDED to the Superintending Engineer, 7th Division, for any remarks he may desire to offer.

FORT SAINT GEORGE,
24th September 1869.

(Signed) R. A. DALYELL,
Acting Secretary to Government.

No. 255. From Colonel G. W. WALKER, R. E., Superintending Engineer, 7th Division, to the Acting Secretary to Government, Revenue Department, Fort Saint George, dated Coonoor, 11th October 1869, No. 109 :—

I HAVE the honour to submit the following remarks on the subject of the letter forwarded with your endorsement of 24th September and herewith returned.

One letter from Mr. Lowry to the Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, dated 3rd September 1869.
One letter from the Acting Superintending Engineer, 4th Division, to the Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, dated 7th September 1869, bearing endorsement of the Secretary to Government of 24th idem, Revenue Department.
One map.

2. I need say nothing more on the subject of the road from the head of the Ponnachy Ghaut into the Teak Forest, as Mr. Lowry in his third paragraph admits that I have given "a fair-enough valuation of the work done." It is singular that I should have been so fortunate in my estimate on so superficial and partial an examination as Mr. Lowry alleges me to have made.

3. I need say little either as to the details of Mr. Lowry's ghaut, as I condemn its position entirely. I will only remark that, to ascend 2,500 feet in a length of four-and-a-half miles as he professes to do, involves a gradient of one in nine-and-a-half throughout. The assertion alone suffices to stamp his value as a Ghaut Engineer. Mr. Lowry never laid out ghaut work either in Canara or Coimbatore, the only districts he has served in as a Public Works Sub-Engineer.

4. With reference to paragraph 6, the measured distance from Pollachy by the Marchenaiken Bridge to Annamallay (head-quarters of the Forest Department and of a Sub-Magistrate) by a made-road is eight miles, from which I have no doubt of getting to the foot of my proposed ghaut in nine miles more at most, making seventeen miles in all, while it is at least fifteen miles from Pollachy to Mr. Lowry's crossing of the Toracadavoo river, and two miles thence to foot of his ghaut by his own admission, total seventeen miles also. But his line crosses the Toracadavoo river where it is unbridged, besides two nullahs of larger size than any thing encountered between Annamallay and the foot of my ghaut. Moreover, Mr. Lowry's road does not pass through two of the five villages named by him, as, indeed, his map shows, on which I have drawn the old track which should never have been left, being perfectly passable by carts to the present day, which the supposed improved road is far from being. The wet cultivation under the Colaputty Anicut need not be crossed on my line as imagined by Mr. Lowry, but disproved by the Collector's letter submitted to Government with Revenue Board's Proceedings, No. 7,202, of 28th September.

5. In his ninth paragraph Mr. Lowry has called me to account for confounding the river which drains the Annamallay Hills with that which drains the old Annamallay Forest. We both mean the same river, only he calls it the Toracadoo and I have written it Toracadavoo. I am ignorant of Tamil, and know not which is right; but Mr. Lowry ought to know that it is the Toracadavoo which drains the old forest. As to other local names of lesser streams, I mean by the Palaur the nullah shown on his map as crossed by his road at Ooplianoor, and by the Oopaur that crossed at Shanmatoor. That was the name the Tahsildar of Pollachy gave the latter when conversing about it with me.

Proceedings of the Madras Government, Revenue Department,
23rd November 1869.

6. I cannot condescend to answer Mr. Lowry's insinuations that I performed the duty committed to me by Government imperfectly, except so far as hindered by Mr. Lowry's not having fulfilled his repeated promises of having the line cleared for me. Mr. Roberts, the Assistant Engineer in charge of Coimbatore Range, and Mr. Nisbet, whom Mr. Lowry calls his assistant, will no doubt bear witness that the cause of my report not being so favourable as Mr. Lowry could have wished was that I had reconnoitred my ground in the effectual manner that only an experienced Ghaut Engineer is capable of doing. And, if I may not claim so much credit, then indeed my value as professional adviser to the Government must be small.

No. 256. ORDER THEREON, 23rd November 1869, No. 3,019.

Forests, No. 15.

IN their Order, dated 23rd January 1868, No. 197, the Government informed Mr. Lowry that they could not decide on his claim for the road-work executed by him until they had obtained the Superintending Engineer's opinion regarding it, and that the latter officer would be instructed to inspect the work in question as soon as Mr. Lowry signified his acceptance of the terms offered in the said Order, which also related to a lease held by Mr. Lowry of certain forests on the Annamallays.

2. Mr. Lowry accepted the terms offered by Government in his letter to the Officiating Conservator of Forests, dated 24th February 1868; and by G. O., dated 7th April 1868, No. 917, the Superintending Engineer, 7th Division, was directed to personally inspect the road-work alluded to above. The Order of Government, dated 6th August 1869, No. 2,284, in which Rupees 3,000 were awarded to Mr. Lowry, was passed after due consideration of Colonel Walker's report and in accordance with his opinion.

3. Mr. Lowry now objects to the decision thus passed on his case. The Government have considered the grounds of his objection and see no reason to modify their former order.

(True Extract.)

(Signed) R. A. DALYELL,
Acting Secretary to Government.

To the Public Works Department.
,, the Board of Revenue.
,, the Officiating Conservator of Forests.

Exd. A. S. Rodgers.

Govt. of {1869} Madras.

REVENUE.

To

THE PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT,

&c., &c., &c.

Dated November, 23rd.

Recd.

Encl.

G. O., 23rd November 1869, No. 3,019.

NOVEMBER.

Nos. 254—256.

Mr. Lowry's road on the Annamallays.—Passing orders on Mr. Lowry's objection to the Order granting him an award in connexion with this road.

is not so, on the contrary it will be seen that the distance from the foot of the Ghaut to Pollachey by the line proposed by Colonel Walker, which is marked by black dots Colored Yellow is 19 miles or more, while by the red line which is mine, it is but 14 miles. this difference of distance of 5 miles is so great that Colonel Walker's road if completed tomorrow, would not be used twice in a twelvemonth by either carts or passengers, going either to the Teak Valley or the Coffee Estates.

7. Had Colonel Walker walked over the North west face and, thrw down my trace, he must have changed his opinion both as to which side was best for the road, and as the ability shown in tracing it and also to the value of the work done, evidently he has never seen Pathen, except at a distance too great to enable him or any other person to judge the nature of the ground.

8. What he says about the Combination of an Elephant Slip and road being my reason for choosing the line I did, is also without foundation

Memo: for Orders on Nos 3072 & 3521.

In an order dated 6th Augt 1869 No 22 & 4 the Govt sanctioned the disbursement to Mr Lowry of Rs 3000 as payment for a Ghaut road which he had constructed on the Annamallays.

Mr Lowry's estimate of the value of his work was Rs 7,500, but Colonel Walker on being ordered to pay a visit of inspection to the Annamallays with the object of checking that estimate, reduced it to Rs 3,000 (including cost of Mr Lowry's supervision) and

Sent with Mr Phillips
No.

and in consequence of Col. Walker's report, the last order above referred to was passed.

2 The main cause of this large reduction which Col. Walker objected was his opinion that out of the sum (Rs. 7,500) which Mr. Lowry alleged that he had expended, Rs. 3,300 was altogether thrown away, because Mr. Lowry had carried his ghaut track down the north east instead of the northwest face of a ridge. Mr. Lowry in his letter dated 2nd September 1869 which was forwarded to Col. Walker for any remarks which he might have to offer, still maintains that

that the line of ghaut which he selected was the best that could be chosen, and Colonel Walker in his communication dated 11th October 1869 (now immediately before Govt.) also adheres to his former opinion. The remaining are minor points of difference.

3. It is impossible in this Deptt. to pronounce decisively on the merits of the question at issue, which is purely one of Engineering. But on perusal Col. Walker appears to have the best of the argument, and his opinion is partially supported by the Asst. Collector of Coimbatore

(vide

(vide Board's Proc.d/28th Sept.r 1869, No. 7202) that is to say, the Mr. Collr. minimizes the superior situation of the line of road which Col.o Walker has selected through the low country, although he is perhaps not in a position to pronounce on the relative merits of the ghaut roads.

4. "Col.o Walker in his letter now before Govt. states that Mr. Lowry's assertion that his road ascends 2,500 feet in a length of 4½ miles alone suffices to stamp his views as a ghaut Engineer."

5. "Here it must be observed that the Govt. in their Order dated 23rd January 1868 laid down with reference to Mr. Lowry's claim on account of this very road, that they could not decide on it without first obtaining the opinion, after personal inspection, of the Superintending Engineer. Mr. Lowry accepted these terms in his letter recorded with G.O. 17th April 1868, No. 917.

6. It is therefore submitted that Mr. Lowry may with justice be informed that the Government see no reason

reason to modify their
order dated 6th Augt
1869, No 2284.—

I would adhere,
as here proposed,
to the G.O 6 Augt 69.
The Govr must, of course,
rely on the opinion of
their professional adviser
what steps may be the
Lowry's opinion
work executed by himself

AA.

Received Department
No. 3019

Proceedings of the Madras Government,

Under date the 23rd November 1869

Read the following paper

From the Asst Supt Engineer 4th Divn
Forwarding letter from Mr Lavery regarding road traced by him in the Shunamallay Hills.
(R. & T. Sept 1869 No. 2991.)

D ..... D ..... T. Divn
Submitting remarks on the subject of Mr Lavery's letter regarding the Road traced on the Shunamallay Hills.—
(R. & T. Oct 1869 No. 109.)

In Their Order dated 23rd January 1868, No. 197, the Government informed Mr Lavery that they could not sanction any charge for the road work executed by him until they had obtained the Superintending

Received
Read
Ordered
Forward
Superintending

C. 23 Nov/69

Superintending Engineer's
opinion regarding it,
such that the latter
officer would be instruc-
ted to inspect the work
in question as soon as
Mr. Lowry signified
his acceptance of the
terms offered in the
said order, which also
related to a lease held
by Mr. Lowry of certain
forests on the Annamallays.

2. Mr. Lowry accepted
the terms offered by Govt.
in his letter to the Offg.
Conservator of Forests
dated 24th February 1868,
and by G. O. dated 7th
April 1868, No. 917, the
Superintending Engineer
7th

10

7th Division, was directed
to personally inspect the
road work alluded to
above. The order of Govt.
dated 6th August 1869,
No. 2284, in which Rs. 3,000
were awarded to Mr.
Lowry was passed after
due consideration of
Colonel Walker's report
and in accordance with
his opinion.—

3. Mr. Lowry now
objects to the decision thus
passed on his case. The
Govt. have considered the
grounds of his objection &
see no reason to modify
their former order.—

21 Fds. D. Sec. Dec. 1869
14— B. & Revs.
13— Offg. Conservator Forests

Mr Lowry's plant
used on the Clarence
railways.