M.R.O. 14—18,000—27-9-24

MADRAS RECORD OFFICE.

Government of Madras.

Revenue **DEPARTMENT.**

G.O. No. 2058 A Press ~~Mis.~~

1087.1088

Dated 8—11—1864.

Not to be folded or roughly handled

Proceedings of the Madras Government, Revenue Department, 8th November 1864.

No. 108A. Read the following papers:—

From W. G. McIVOR, Esq., Superintendent Government Chinchona Plantations, to J. D. SIM, Esq., Secretary to Government, Revenue Department, Fort Saint George, dated Ootacamund, 11th October 1864, No. 155.

SIR,

1. I have the honor to acknowledge the receipt of the Order of Government No. 1,794, dated 28th ultimo, directing the removal of the Chinchona plants from the Pykara avenue, and henceforth restricting myself and laborers to the use of the path.

2. With reference to paragraph 1, while waiving the direct permission of His Excelleney the Governor obtained on a proposal which clearly defined what was intended, and what has literally been carried out in cutting the avenue leading past the Pykara falls, to the "Wood" plantation, I do with due deference and respect most distinctly and emphatically disavow that, in forming the road, I knowingly departed "from a plain and positive order issued by His Excellency in Council after full consideration," no order to the above purport ever having reached me. Hence it may be possible that the Memorandum of the Honorable A. J. Arbuthnot has induced the Government to place on their Minutes on this subject an interpretation originally never intended, as their orders refer specifically to felling within sight of the falls, and not in any way restricting me from making roads to the plantations. All orders from the Government on this subject having been correctly and literally carried out, according to the best of my judgment. The Telegram and Order noted in the margin were the first I had the honor to receive, and beg to observe that the fringe of wood along the banks of the river has not been interfered with, and that the felling of the avenue cannot be seen from either the upper or lower water-fall. In my letter under date 7th January 1863, No. 80, paragraph 3, I brought to the notice of Government, my intention to form roads to the plantation, passing the water-falls, and as these roads could not be cut without felling a portion of the forest, I submit that had such been opposed to the views of Government, I should have been instructed to that effect, their silence on the subject being naturally interpreted by me into an approval, I am therefore at a loss to know on what grounds the charge has been brought against me of having disobeyed the orders of Government, in carrying out a work so essential to the maintenance of the plantation. The avenue in question, had the Government permitted it to be completed, would have added greatly to the attractions of the falls and the beauty of the scenery, inasmuch as it is the grandeur of nature combined with art, which conveys the most pleasing impressions to the mind. This is well understood by all artists of note, and is in fact the secret upon which their reputations have been built, as what would be the effect, or value, of a picture of the Swiss Alps were it not for the cottage judiciously introduced into the scene, the green patch of cultivation, and the goats grazing in the foreground. These objects form the life of the picture, and the reason of their introduction is to convey the pleasing impression that in combination with the grandeur of nature it contributes to the comforts of the human race; while scenery however grand and majestic, without these attractions is dead, and leaves upon the mind the painful impression of desolation, the eye vainly endeavoring to rest upon an object, conveying the idea of comfort and happiness to mankind.

Telegraph Message No. 3, dated 6th January 1863.
Proceedings Madras Government, No. 7, dated 6th January 1863.

3. What has been done in opening out this avenue is already appreciated by the community, as, within the last two months since the road has been finished, there has been more visitors to the falls than in the twelve previous months. The average number of visitors to the falls during 1862 and 1863 varied from 32 to 40.

4. Immediately on receipt of the Government Order, and in obedience to paragraph 2, I proceeded to the "Wood" plantation and placed every available hand to remove the Chinchona plants (upwards of 8,000, many of which had been planted for more than six months) from the avenue to the nursery beds on the eastern side of the hill. While I do not presume to solicit the favor of a re-consideration of this portion of the Minute under reply, I feel confident that I

shall not incur the displeasure of Government, by bringing to their notice my conscientious conviction, that this part of their order directs the removal of plants, which shortly would have formed one of the most valuable, beautiful, and interesting avenues in the world, permitting in its stead a growth of noxious weeds, this conviction being formed on the following facts, first that several species of Chinchona stand pre-eminent as the most valuable of all vegetable products, and the avenue in question was planted with the best of these; second that in point of beauty the Chinchona tree is inferior to none, Mr. Markham describing it as the most "beautiful and fragrant tree" of South America, Mr. Spruce as the "queen of the forest," and every traveller in South America from the time of Humboldt up to this date being unanimous in this opinion. What then could exceed the beauty of an avenue, nearly two miles in length, composed of such trees? third, that the cultivation of these plants being in its infancy is one in which all scientific men take a great interest, and this avenue, extending as it does from an elevation of 6,500 to 3,400 feet, would have shewn, within a comparative short distance, the varied effects of altitude upon the different species, and thus practically illustrate a most important and interesting fact; fourth, that the forests on these hills when once felled and burned, if "left to nature," not one tree in a hundred will ever grow again, the ground becoming covered by a growth of Strobilanthes and weeds, principally composed of the noxious Solanum Giganteum.

5. The Government observe that the Chinchonas "will not harmonize with the surrounding forest;" I am not aware of the arguments adduced to cause this impression on the Government, but submit that in point of fact, nothing can be more erroneous, inasmuch as the indigenous forests on the Neilgherries are composed principally of Chinchonaceous plants, so identical in their general resemblance with the Chinchona Uritusinga, C. Crespilla, and C. Condamenia, that it requires the experienced eye of a Botanist upon close examination to distinguish the one from the other; hence, had the cause of the removal of the plants been attributed to too great harmony it might have been tenable, on the ground that this similarity would amount to monotony in the scenery, were it not that the leaves of the 'red' and 'grey' barks are larger and richer in color than the majority of jungle trees, and in planting the avenue this was taken advantage of in such a manner as would have produced an effect for richness and beauty altogether unequalled in Neilgherry scenery.

6. From the date of the introduction of the Chinchona plants, objections tending to impede our progress, have been continually advanced without reason or reflection, these hitherto I have cheerfully combated, being confident in the correctness of my own views, and in the hope that when I had developed these to the satisfaction of Government, as has already been done, I should be secure in their confidence and protection against further interference. The wording of the order under reply has deprived me of this hope, and I see with apprehension objections arising from the Government itself, of so potent a nature as to destroy in a few days the labor of years; to explain my meaning I would observe that had I literally carried out the restrictions conveyed in paragraph 3 of the Government Order, I would have had to report to-day a loss of about 40,000 plants. Truly a more effectual plan for the destruction of the plantation could not have been conceived, for the reason that any attempt on my part to restrict my laborers to the path would cause their immediate desertion from the plantation, as the men have hitherto been allowed to diverge from the path to obtain water, collect firewood, and other innocent purposes; to deprive the laborers of these privileges is to deprive us of their services, and at the present moment we have a newly formed nursery of about 40,000 plants depending for their existence on the attendance of these laborers, and great as would be the damage and loss in this respect, in other ways the restrictions reduce to a certainty the total destruction both of the plantation and nursery, from the fact, that no water originates on the eastern side, the water for the irrigation of the nurseries and plantation being brought from the Pykara river in a channel through the forest on the western side of the hill; this channel becomes frequently chocked up by accident, such as the falling of wood, passing of wild animals, &c., and although this water is indispensably necessary for the daily existence of the plants in the nurseries and for the

preservation of the plants in the plantation during the dry season, yet the order of Government clearly indicates that if I was to direct the men to deviate from the path to clear out this water course, and thus obtain that which is necessary to the very existence of the plantation, I would be guilty of a trespass, to be visited by "the serious displeasure of Government," hence restrictions productive of such consequences greatly discourages me, especially as the conviction is forced upon my mind, that the more perfectly I develope the success of this undertaking, the more serious will be the opposition I shall have to encounter in consequence of its arising principally from a covert feeling of class prejudice; another cause exists among the admirers of natural scenery, who conceive that Chinchona cultivation will spoil the beauty of the Neilgherries, while an equally erroneous impression exists among the members of the service who take an interest in sporting pursuits that Chinchona cultivation will drive away the game, hence their opposition. The Memorandum of the Honorable A. J. Arbuthnot, Chief Secretary to Government, owes its origin to at least one of the above influences, that gentleman having frequently asserted that the Chinchona would be the ruin of the Neilgherries, by causing the felling of the natural forests. Holding such to be the case, it is to the Right Honorable the Secretary of State for India in Council that the onus of the introduction of these plants is to be attached, and I submit it would have been more dignified in Mr. Arbuthnot to have brought his accusation direct against that Honorable body, they being in a much better position to vindicate their proceedings than a humble individual like myself.

7. In January last Mr. Arbuthnot was aware of the opening out of the avenue and road in question, and it is much to be regretted that it was not at the time brought to the notice of Government, and thus have saved considerable expense and great waste of labor.

8. The road in question has been roughly cut out and passable for laden bullocks for the last three months, it is now finished (with the exception of 70 yards in one place and 20 in another), effectually drained, and bridged, and near the falls laid out in garden style with grass borders, &c., before this road was opened we could neither obtain labor nor supplies for the plantation, now we can command abundance of both; this road was further intended to connect the Nedoivuttum plantations by bridging the river, and this would have enabled us to draw labor and supplies for the Neddivuttum plantations from the eastern side during the western monsoon, as at this season communication with the Neddivuttum plantations is cut off; this road also when connected would much reduce the labor of superintendence and cost of working the plantations.

9. I refrain from troubling the Government with farther details of the injury their restrictions will cause to the plantations, submitting it to be understood that unless I possess the power of maintaining in good order, the roads and water-courses connected with the same, diverting and altering the latter when necessary, it is impossible for me to keep up laborers and establishments, or to perform the works either to the satisfaction of the Government or myself. Under these circumstances I hold myself released from the responsibility originally placed upon me by the Government in connection with the Chinchona operations.

10. The restrictions placed upon me and my laborers in paragraph 3 are such as the Government have never placed upon the common native traveller on their highways, and I feel this the more when applied to myself and laborers on a road constructed for our sole benefit, combined with the fact that in carrying out these instructions there is no object to be gained, as either myself or my laborers diverging from the path into a waste forest could not be productive of injury, I am therefore at a loss to comprehend the meaning of the severity of the restrictions, except indeed it be to render their violation inevitable, and thus subject me at any moment to dismissal with disgrace on a plea of disobedience of orders, and however unwilling I am to detach myself from this important undertaking at the present interesting and in some respects still critical period of operations, I see with concern and apprehension that my professional reputation demands it, I therefore most respectfully solicit the permission of your Honorable Government and the Secretary of State for India in Council to retire from the service, on such gratuity, pension or award, as I may be considered entitled to after seventeen years' arduous and successful

labor, much of which has been of a special nature, and for which I have had the honor to receive the highest testimony to my zeal, ability, and integrity, from your Honorable Government, the Governor General, and the Right Honorable the Secretray of State for India.

MEMORANDUM.

Letter from Mr. W. G. McIvor, Superintendent Government Chinchona Plantations. (Dated 11th October 1864.)

1. It is desirable that this letter, in which Mr. McIvor has thought fit to make remarks with reference to the course taken by me in bringing to the notice of Government what I conceive to have been his disregard of the orders prohibiting the felling of the forest on the western side of the hill above the Pykara waterfall, should be accompanied by observations from me on one or two points.

2. In the 6th paragraph Mr. McIvor states, on what authority I am not aware, that I have "frequently asserted that the Chinchonas would be the ruin of the Neilgherries by causing the "felling of the natural forests." Any remarks I have made on this subject have been made in the freedom of private conversation; and they were certainly not open to the construction which Mr. McIvor has put upon them, and which implies that I am opposed to the cultivation of the Chinchona. This is altogether a mistake. No one is more sensible than I am of the importance of the work on which Mr. McIvor is engaged, and no one has been more ready to acknowledge the skill with which Mr. McIvor has conducted it. What I have said is that if Mr. McIvor was not kept in check, serious mischief would be done by the indiscriminate felling of the hill forests, the more especially as Mr. McIvor has recently propounded what I conceive to be a most mischievous theory that felling the forests tends to increase the water supply. I have always considered it a matter of regret that the site of the Pykara waterfalls, which is the most beautiful spot within easy reach of Ootacamund, should have been selected for a plantation; and I hold, and have expressed, a very strong opinion as to the impropriety of Mr. McIvor's conduct in setting at nought the orders of Government which prohibited the felling of the forest on the western side of the hill so completely as he has done.

3. The other assertion which I think it right to notice is that in paragraph 7, where Mr. McIvor states that in January last I was aware of the opening out of the avenue and road. This is not the case. I heard nothing of it until March or April, and it was not until I visited the spot in July that I had any conception of the extent of the mischief.

(Signed) A. J. ARBUTHNOT.
Chief Secretary.

MINUTE BY THE HONORABLE E. MALTBY.

1. I am a stranger to the locality in question, but assented to the order of which Mr. McIvor complains because it appeared to me that an express order of the Government passed with the President's concurrence had been disregarded, and that this must be noticed unless all control over Mr. McIvor's proceedings was to be abandoned. The tone of Mr. McIvor's present letter supports the view I took of the necessity of noticing his conduct, and is in my opinion highly censurable. I cannot suppose that Mr. McIvor would have ventured to write in such a style unless he looks on his services as too necessary to Government to be dispensed with, or his circumstances render him independent of public employ. Had there been really an indecision to make between Chinchona plantations and pleasing scenery, I should have considered the former as of too paramount importance to be sacrificed to the latter, but it cannot be said that this has been the case. The Neilgherry plateau affords abundant sites for plantations at different degrees of elevation, and Mr. McIvor has been allowed a free selection. On his wishing to try a plantation at Pykarah a suitable piece of ground was given him, under the sole restriction that the forest on the side of one hill was not to be interfered with. This restriction did not impede the formation of the plantation, and was imposed to preserve the scenery of a favorite place of resort.

2. What Mr. McIvors writes about restrictions which "greatly discourage" him, and about "a covert feeling of class prejudice" against Chinchona cultivation is as simply preposterous as it is unbecoming. Private plantings have been numerous, and the Government records amply show that the success which has attended the experiment is as much owing to the support which Mr. McIvor has received as to his own professional skill. This skill the Government has both acknowledged and rewarded, but it is impossible for Government to permit one of its servants to address it in the manner which Mr. McIvor has now done.

3. I consider that Mr. McIvor should be informed that his resignation will be accepted unless he recalls this letter and engages to comply with the instructions which Government may from time to time issue; that his threat of retiring from "this important undertaking" on so trivial a ground, at what he describes as "the present interesting and in some respects still critical period of operation" is viewed with disapprobation, and that any "gratuity, pension or award" on account of past services which he may look for from the benevolence and liberality of Government will be affected by the conduct which he pursues on this occasion.

4. If Mr. McIvor persists in his intention of resigning, he should be required to state whether he is prepared to continue in charge of the Department until a successor arrives from England. Should he decline to do so, the Government can, I doubt not, make due arrangements for the temporary care of the plantations and nurseries, and Mr. McIvor will, in my opinion, have forfeited any claim to the liberality of Government by thus abruptly quitting its service.

5. Even if Mr. McIvor continues in the public service, it seems to me essential that steps should be taken to obtain from England an Assistant or Deputy competent to take his place in case of need. The value of the Chinchona plantations is already great and increases yearly, and steps should be taken to guard against the effects of the Superintendent's possible illness or death. Government should also be relieved from its present comparatively helpless position, and be able to act promptly if Mr. McIvor should again presume to conduct himself as in the present instance.

6. In assenting to the removal of the Chinchonas from the avenue planted by Mr. McIvor on the forbidden hill to the adjacent plantation, I was not actuated by any idea that the line of trees would spoil the forest scenery, but by a desire to show Mr. McIvor that the instructions of Government must be obeyed. My impression was that the Chinchona plants might be 100 or at most 200 in number, but under the information now given in Captain Beddome's letter of 15th instant (circulated with these papers), I consider that these trees should remain, and that other Chinchonas and some Australian trees should be planted to fill up the gap. I am prepared to assent to Captain Beddome's suggestion that the avenue should be placed under the Chinchona Superintendent, due precaution being taken against further felling of the forest.

22*nd October* 1864. (Signed) E. MALTBY.

MINUTE BY THE HONORABLE THE PRESIDENT.

1. I have seen, for the first time, the Proceedings of Government of 28th September 1864, and have now to deal with matters arising out of these Proceedings. Had these been forwarded to me previous to publication a good deal of trouble and difficulty would have been spared, and I should not have been compelled to bring the subject again under the consideration of the Government.

2. There are two matters involved in the papers before me: first, the Proceedings of the Government above alluded to; second, the letter from Mr. McIvor arising out of these Proceedings. I will deal with the two in the order above stated. In order, however, to bring the matter in all its bearings clearly before the Government, I must enter into some little preliminary detail. When the Government commenced the experiment of cultivating Cinchona, it entrusted the general arrangement of the plantations entirely to Mr. McIvor. He laid out the land, cleared it, made all the roads, &c., and the Government has not, except in the present instance, had any reason to complain that the confidence placed in that Officer has been abused.

3. Even in the present instance I do not think that I should be justified in saying that confidence had been abused.

4. Mr. McIvor was permitted to commence a plantation in the immediate vicinity of the Pykara Falls. The Government did not ask for any plan of the ground, or for any description of the mode of access to the plantation; it gave Mr. McIvor, by implication at all events, the same latitude, and the same discretion, which it had heretofore done, and he accordingly acted according to his judgment and taste. After a time, however, the Government was informed that the ground by the side of the river was being denuded of timber; upon this, after some correspondence with the Collector, an order was issued to the following effect: "The Government are glad to find that the plantation will not affect the scenery about the Pykara "Falls, *within sight of which felling will not be allowed.*" No plans, however, were asked for; no enquiry made as to the extent of the plantation; the mode of getting access to it, &c., all was left to the discretion of Mr. McIvor. On 8th August the Chief Secretary, having visited the Pykara Water Falls, pointed out to the Government that Mr. McIvor had cut a large gap in the wood, in direct disobedience to the orders from Government; upon which he was called upon for an immediate explanation of his conduct. This Mr. McIvor did by quoting a letter written by me, in answer to a description given by him of the mode in which he proposed to complete the communication to the plantation, in which I gave a general approval of the scheme; and he explained that he did not consider the Order of Government forbade opening a road through the wood without which the plantation could not have been worked.

5. This paper was sent to me, and I pointed out that Mr. McIvor was not justified in interpreting the assent given by me to a proposal stated by him, unaccompanied by any plan or sketch, as an order to him. I gave some opinion as to the character of the road which he had made, having visited the plantation in the interval, and I stated that I could not approve of a suggestion of Mr. Pycroft, that the Cinchonas should be removed, or that an attempt, which must prove unsuccessful, should be made to restore the forest to its original state.

6. On the 28th September 1864, an order was given to the effect that the injury to the forest could not be repaired by planting Australian, or other trees, but had better be left to nature; that the Cinchonas should be removed to the plantation; that the western side of the hill should be handed over to the Conservator of Forests, who would leave a sufficient breadth of pathway for the labourers, and restricting Mr. McIvor to the use of the path for himself and his laborers. Had this order been sent to me before publication, I should have pointed out that the damage having been done, and the expense of clearing the forest and planting the Cinchonas incurred, it would be very bad policy, on the part of the Government, to go to the further expense of removing the plants, and re-planting them elsewhere, at the risk of the loss of a good number; that to leave the restoration of the forest in nature's hands would be, as stated by the Conservator of Forests, to create a mere dense, thorny jungle, which would not harmonize in any way with the forest on each side of it. That, as also suggested by the Conservator, Mr. McIvor, might as well be allowed to fill the cleared land with Cinchona, a fast growing and very handsome tree.

7. I may as well state that I do not consider the beauty of the Falls to be so irreparably injured as is inferred by some. Neither indeed do I agree with those who seem to think that every sacrifice should be made by the Government for the purpose of maintaining the landscape in its original form. I should not have sanctioned the cutting down of the forest had I seen a plan of the work intended previous to its commencement; but I think that a great deal more has been made of the damage to the scenery than is necessary.

8. Looking, then, to the fact that the Conservator of Forests is of opinion that the presence of about 25 acres of kumiry jungle will not add to the appearance of the scenery; that the Government has incurred the cost of clearing the ground, which would be lost if it were allowed to return to forest; that the Cinchona is said to be a handsome tree, and that at all events it is a profitable one; that the land in question will contain 20,000 trees, and be worth in the course of a few years at least 1,500 or 2,000£ per acre, I propose that the Order of the Government of 28th September

should be re-considered, and that the land cleared should be planted with Cinchona and left in the hands of the Director of the Cinchona Plantations.

9. I do not propose to exonerate Mr. McIvor from blame. Indeed, I should be dispose d to have dealt with his conduct more directly, but as the opinion of the Government have already been communicated to him, I shall deal only with his letter in reply.

10. I strongly object to the tone of this letter, and am of opinion that Mr. McIvor should be told that the Government is not to be addressed in such a tone or manner by its subordinates, whose business it is to obey instructions issued to them; or, if they conceive their instructions likely to be injurious to the interests of Government, to submit their views in a proper manner for consideration.

11. With reference to Mr. McIvor's tender of his resignation, he should be informed of course that he is under no obligation to remain in the service of the Government; but that he has no shadow of a claim to either pension or gratuity, should he choose to resign his appointment merely on the ground that he has been reprimanded for disobedience of orders.

12. Some inconvenience has evidently arisen from the amount left to the discretion of Mr. McIvor It would be worthy of consideration whether he should not for the future be called upon to submit rough sketches of the mode in which he proposes to lay out the plantation. It may also be a matter worthy of consideration whether he should not be provided with an Assistant or Deputy at a salary of, say, 300 Rupees per month. At present there is no one between Mr. McIvor and the Superintendents of Gardeners in charge of the different plantations.

(Signed) W. T. DENISON.

26th October 1864.

MINUTE BY THE HONORABLE T. PYCROFT.

1. There seem to me to be two matters for consideration in connection with Mr. McIvor's late proceedings on the western side of the Pykara falls, and with his recent letter. First, how the tract denuded by Mr. McIvor should be dealt with, and secndly, the tone of his recent letter and the position which he has therein assumed towards the Government.

2. As to the first, unhappily, we have but a choice of difficulties. The original forest has been laid low, and cannot be replaced in its pristine state. We must either leave the clearing to nature, in which case, as would appear from the Conservator's letter, it would become overgrown with dense thorny jungle, or have it planted with Chinchona and perhaps some other trees. I do not know that the latter course is preferable to the former. The Chinchona may be a handsome tree in its native forests, and standing singly or in clumps, but planted in stiff formal lines, as it is in the Government Plantations, and as it was by Mr. McIvor on the sides of the gap which he cut in the forest, it certainly has not an ornamental appearance. However as His Excellency the President and Mr. Maltby seem in favor of the latter mode of proceeding I do not object. I am certainly reluctant that Mr. McIvor should have any thing more to do with the tract after the way in which he has behaved, and under any circumstances before he is allowed to meddle with it, we should know exactly how he proposes to proceed; he should work only on the plan that we may sanction, and measures should be taken for preventing any further felling on that side of the river under any pretext whatsoever.

3. With regard to the tone of Mr. McIvor's letter of the 11th ultimo, and the attitude which he has assumed in it, I entirely agree with my colleagues. A more arrogant and disrespectful document, I do not remember to have seen. I would particularly draw attention to the concluding paragraph, in which he insinuates that the late orders of Government, to which he gives a meaning which he must well know they could not and were not meant to bear, were made purposely stringent so as to entrap him into disobeying them, and actually makes this the ground of his desire for retiring from the charge of the plantations. If a public servant, because his proceedings are not approved and are to some extent ordered to be reversed, is to write in this manner there must be an end of all subordination. I would tell Mr. McIvor that the Govern-

ment strongly censure the objectionable style of his last letter; that if he chooses to retire from the charge of the Chinchona plantations he may do so, but that pensions or gratuities are not bestowed on men who throw up their appointments because they cannot have their own way, and quarrel with the orders of the paramount authority. I would warn him further that if he again addressed Government in such a tone they would at once remove him from his post. This might cause some inconvenience, but would be preferable to tolerating such language from Mr. McIvor. Moreover I do not deem his services quite so indispensable as he evidently considers them. I do not doubt that the Forest Department with the aid of the subordinate servants in the Chinchona plantations would keep matters going fairly enough, until a skilled gardener and arboriculturist could be procured from England.

4. Reprehensible as is the style of Mr. McIvor's letter throughout, that part of it is most especially censurable, in which he has made a most wanton and groundless personal attack upon the Chief Secretary, charging him with exaggerated representations made from narrow-minded motives, and indeed accusing him of disingenuous conduct in the matter. Mr. Arbuthnot's Memorandum contains full explanation on both these charges. In noticing the objectionable nature of Mr. McIvor's letter, the Government should, I conceive, mark with their peculiar displeasure that part of it which contains these injurious and unfounded imputations on their chief officer.

5. During my late visit to the Neilgherries I had not an opportunity of going to the Pykara Falls. Had I foreseen the turn which this discussion has taken, I would have made a point of visiting them. I may however mention that more than one gentleman, with whom I conversed on the subject, and whose names, were it necessary for me to give them, would be deemed a sufficient guarantee, told me that Mr. Arbuthnot's description was by no means overcharged. It will be observed that the Officiating Conservator of Forests in his letter of 15th October, speaks of the extent of clearing as being *very large*.

6. I concur with my colleagues that it is desirable to apply to the Secretary of State for an Assistant to the Chinchona Superintendent of a higher order than his present subordinates, one who could take his place in the event of his death, absence from sickness, or of his relinquishment of or removal from his appointment under what we must now consider a not impossible contingency. At present there is reason to believe that, as observed by Mr. Maltby, Mr. McIvor is either independent of Government employ from private sources, or considers that he is too valuable to be spared, and is therefore emboldened to act as he has done. I would not, as I have already noticed, hesitate to undeceive him in this last view, if necessary. Still the presence on the spot of an Assistant in all respects qualified to perform his duties would be a check on him and strengthen the hands of Government.

7. As Mr. McIvor maintains in his letter that in making the clearing on the west side of the falls he did not violate any express order of Government, I annex an abstract of the correspondence which took place on the subject in 1863.

On the 2nd January 1863 Lieutenant-Colonel Hamilton brought to the notice of Government that the site recently selected for Chinchona operations in the Pykara valley was in the hanging wood over the falls of the river. He objected to this as mainly affecting one of the most picturesque and beautiful spots on the Neilgherries; mentioned that a large portion of the same Shola at the back of the hill on the *eastern slope* seemed equally well adapted for the purpose, and suggested that the whole of the forest within sight of the falls might be preserved intact.

The Government G. O. 6th January 1863—desired the Collector to inspect the locality in company with Mr. McIvor, and to select a site for the plantation sufficiently remote from the river not to interfere with the scenery about the falls.

Mr. McIvor on the 7th January 1863, in reference to a Telegram ordering him to suspend felling near the Pykara falls, said that not a tree had been felled near the falls since the previous November and then only one acre for a nursery. This spot had been selected

because it was *considerably removed from the forest which was intended to be felled for the Chinchona plantations*, and the plants would not be damaged by the fire whilst the forest was being burnt. *It was never intended to fell another tree on the water fall face of the hills.* The forest on the water fall side faced west and south, *being an exposure unsuited for the growth of Chinchona.*

In his letter of 15th January 1863, Mr. Grant reported that the plantation would not be within the sight of the falls but on the *eastern slope of the hill*, the locality in fact *pointed out by Colonel Hamilton as best suited for the purpose.* No further felling was contemplated when the nursery had been formed.

The Government—G. O. 23rd January 1863—expressed their satisfaction that the Plantation would not affect the scenery about the Pykara falls, within sight of which felling would not be allowed.

Unless these papers be understood as assuring the Government that the Chinchona planting operations would be confined to the eastern slope of the hills, and that Mr. McIvor understood them in that sense and promised to act up to them, it is difficult to say what meaning is to be extracted from them.

Again, if cutting a gap at least forty yards wide on the western side of the hill, where Mr. McIvor had assured Government that "it never was intended to fell another tree" and that "the exposure was unsuited to the growth of Chinchona," was not an infraction of the Government orders, it is hard to tell what disobedience of orders is.

(Signed) T. PYCROFT.

4th November 1864.

From W. G. McIVOR, Esq., Superintendent Government Chinchona Plantations, to J. D. SIM, Esq., Secretary to Government, Revenue Department, Fort Saint George, dated Ootacamund, 3rd November 1864, No. 172.

SIR,

1. With reference to the Order of Government, 28th September 1864, No. 1,794, and my letter of the 11th ultimo, No. 155, I have the honor most respectfully to bring to the notice of Government that as an unusually severe drought has set in, and the plants upon the upper portion of the Wood plantation near Pykara are already suffering severely from want of water, and if the drought continues for a fortnight more the greater portion of them will be dead, unless immediate steps are taken to turn the water-course at a higher level in order to admit of irrigation. I would therefore solicit the favor of being advised by telegraph as to what steps I am to adopt in reference to this matter.

2. Further supplies of grain are also necessary for the establishment on the plantation, this I have delayed getting in as long as possible, as the loaded bullocks and men in charge of them would certainly cause an infringement of paragraph 3 of the Government Order above noted; I would therefore esteem it a favor my being instructed as to how to proceed in this respect.

3. I would also observe that although I explained the orders of Government to my establishment with as much leniency as possible, since doing so I have lost one Maistry with forty-three of my best trained men, and I much fear that if immediate steps are not taken to remove these restrictions, at least so far as they affect my establishment, we will shortly not have a man upon the plantation, and as the dry weather is now setting in, this would prove its total destruction.

4. I have been most unwilling to trouble the Government on this subject, and have delayed doing so in daily expectation of our usual rains, but as there is still no appearance of these, it becomes imperative that I should bring these facts to their notice.

No. 108B. ORDER THEREON, 8th November 1864, No. 2,058A.

Forests, No. 6A.

1. In his letter above recorded the Superintendent of Chinchona Plantations submits a further explanation of his conduct in cutting an avenue through the forest in the immediate neighbourhood of the Pykara Falls.

2. As Mr. McIvor maintains that this act was not an infringement of their orders, the Government will briefly notice the correspondence on the subject.

3. On the 2nd January 1863 Colonel Hamilton brought to notice, that the site selected for Chinchona operations in the valley of the Pykara river would "materially affect one of the most picturesque and beautiful spots on the Neilgherries, the hanging woods over the falls of the river being doomed to destruction, thereby utterly depriving the scene of its chief ornament." At the same time he mentioned that a large portion of the same Shola, at the back of the hill on the *eastern* slope, seemed equally adapted for Chinchona cultivation, and suggested that the whole of the forest within sight of the falls should, if possible, be preserved intact.

4. Mr. McIvor was directed, by Telegraph, to stop felling the wood until further orders, and the Collector was instructed to visit the locality with him, and "select a site for the plantation sufficiently remote from the river, not to interfere with the scenery about the falls."

5. Mr. McIvor immediately replied to the Telegram, and stated that "not a tree had been felled near the Pykara Falls since November, and then only a space of one acre for a nursery;" that "it never was intended to fell another tree on the water fall face of the hills," and that the plantation was "not within sight of the water falls, being on the opposite face of the hills, viz., north and east, while the forest on the water fall sides faces west and south, being an exposure unsuited for the growth of Chinchona; and consequently it never was intended to fell this forest for a Chinchona plantation."

6. The Collector's report was much to the same effect, and the Government Order was in the following terms:—"The Government are glad to find that the plantation will not affect the scenery about the Pykara Falls, within sight of which felling will not be allowed." These papers can be regarded in no other light than as evincing the desire of Government that the forest on the western sides of the hill should be preserved in their natural beauty, and as conveying an assurance from Mr. McIvor that this wish should be scrupulously respected. Yet it is through these very woods that Mr. McIvor has cut an avenue at least 40 yards wide.

7. Mr. McIvor argues that in paragraph 3 of his letter of the 7th January 1863, he signified his intention to form roads to the plantation, passing the water falls, and that as Government did not notice this matter he concluded that they approved of it. Mr. McIvor in the letter referred to certainly did mention the intended formation of roads, but not in such a manner as to lead Government to suppose that they were to pass through the very Shola in which, in the same letter, he stated "it never was intended to fell another tree." His expression was "the roads formed for the plantations will render the falls easily accessible." But independent of this, it must be observed that even had the allusion to roads been more definite, the Government would never have supposed that Mr. McIvor meant cuttings of the width of 120 feet. They would naturally have imagined that roads of 12 or 15 feet in width were all that Mr. McIvor contemplated.

8. In paragraphs 6 and 10 of his letter of the 11th ultimo, Mr. McIvor alludes to the restrictions placed upon him in paragraph 3 of the Order of Government as unprecedented and of ruinous tendency. The paragraph limited Mr. McIvor "to the use of the path for himself and his laborers," and the evident intention of the order was simply to restrain him from further felling and other interference with the forest or road. Mr. McIvor's idea that he is expected to forbid his laborers "to diverge from the path to obtain water, collect firewood, and other innocent purposes," is simply absurd.

9. The Government learn that the Forest Department cannot conveniently take charge of the avenue, and that as the trees have been burnt, others are not likely to spring up, if the opening be left to nature. Under these circumstances the Government resolve to cancel so much of their Order of the 28th September last, as transfers the avenue to the Forest Department. Mr. McIvor will accordingly resume charge of it, and will complete the formation of the road and keep it in repair, but he is distinctly to understand that not another tree is to be felled on any account. As Mr. McIvor assures the Government that Chinchonas will harmonize with the rest of the forest, he may plant these in the opening, but it would be well to do this in a less formal manner than as an avenue. This, as well as the introduction of other suitable trees is, however, left to his judgment.

10. The only point remaining to be noticed is the tone of Mr. McIvor's letter, and the position he therein assumes towards the Government.

11. The Government are well aware of the valuable services which Mr. McIvor has rendered the State in connection with the introduction of the Chinchona; they have repeatedly expressed their appreciation of his exertions, and they attribute the success of the experiment mainly to his skill. From first to last they have reposed entire confidence in him, and afforded him the fullest support. It is with much regret, therefore, that the Government feel compelled to record their serious dissatisfaction with the tone and tenor of the letter under consideration. A more improper letter in every sense could scarcely be addressed by a subordinate to his Government. Not content with bringing against the Chief Secretary unfounded charges of making exaggerated representations and being actuated by unworthy motives, Mr. McIvor accuses the Government of imposing on him restrictions, the severity of which is incomprehensible unless designed "to render their violation inevitable," and so subject him at any moment to dismissal "on a plea of disobedience of orders," or in other words, that this part of the Order of Government is simply a device to entrap him. Throughout the letter in fact Mr. McIvor assumes an attitude towards the Government wholly subversive of all subordination.

12. The Government cannot permit their subordinates to address them in this reprehensible manner, or thus to ignore their authority.

13. Mr. McIvor is under no obligation to continue in the service of Government, but officers who suddenly resign their appointments, endangering the interests entrusted to them, because they cannot have their own way in any particular matter, forfeit all claim to pension or gratuity.

14. Mr. McIvor will now be called upon to re-consider his letter of 11th ultimo, and to inform the Government whether he adheres to his wish to be relieved and, if so, from what date.

15. With regard to Mr. McIvor's second letter, the Government observe that their Order of the 2nd September last makes no allusion to water courses at all. These involve no feeling of the forest, and Mr. McIvor is quite at liberty to divert them when necessary as well as keep them in repair. As regards the use of the road, it has already been pointed out that the order of Government was not intended to bear, and in fact does not bear the construction put upon it by Mr. McIvor, the loss of laborers is consequently entirely due to his mis-interpretation of the order.

Ordered that the following Telegram be despatched to Mr. McIvor:—

Telegram.

"Your letter of 3rd instant, No. 172. You may alter the water courses and use the road freely, but there must be no more felling. The road and avenue on this understanding are re-placed in your charge.

(Signed) C. G. MASTER,
Under Secretary to Government.

Office Government Gardens
Ootacamund 11th October 1864

From,

W. H. Mc. Ivor Esqre
Superintendent Govt Chinchona Plantations

To,

J. D. Sim Esqre
Secretary to Govt Rev: Depart.
Fort St George Madras

Sir,

I have the honor to acknowledge the receipt of the Order of Government No. 1794 dated 20th Ultimo, directing the removal of the Chinchona plants from the Pykara avenue, and henceforth restricting myself and Labourers to the use of the path.

2. With reference to para 1 while waiving the direct permission of His Excellency the Governor obtained on a proposal which clearly defined what was intended, and what has literally been carried out in cutting the avenue leading past the Pykara falls, to the "Wood" plantation; I do with due deference and respect most distinctly and emphatically disavow that, in forming the road I knowingly departed "from a plain and positive order issued

ipused by His Excellency in Council after full consideration"
no Order to the above purport ever having reached me. How
it may be possible that the Memorandum of the Hon'ble
A. J. Mebuthnot, has induced the Government to place
on their minutes on this subject an interpretation
originally never intended, as their orders refer specifically
to felling within sight of the Falls, and not in any way
restricting me from making roads to the plantations.
All Orders from the Government on this subject having
been correctly and literally carried out, according to
the best of my judgement. The Telegram and Order
noted in the margin were the first I had the honor to
receive, and beg to observe that the fringe of wood along
the banks of the river has not been interfered with, and
that the felling of the avenue cannot be seen from
either the upper or lower water fall. In my letter under
date 6th January 1863 No. 80. para 3. I brought to the
notice of Government my intention to form roads to
the plantation, passing the water falls, and as these
roads could not be cut without felling a portion of
the forest. I submit that had such been opposed to
the views of Government, I should have been instructed
to that effect, their silence on the subject being naturally
interpreted by me into an approval. I am therefore
at

Telegraph message No. 3 dated 6th January 1863.
Govt. No. 27 dated 6th January 1863.

at a loss to know on what grounds the charge has been
brought against me of having disobeyed the Orders of
Government in carrying out a work so essential to the
maintenance of the plantation. The Avenue in question
had the Government permitted it to be completed would have
added greatly to the attraction of the Falls and the beauty
of the scenery, inasmuch as it is the grandeur of nature
combined with art, which conveys the most pleasing
impressions to the mind. This is well understood by
all artists of note, and is in fact the secret upon which
their reputations have been built, as what would be
the effect, or value of a picture of the river Alpo were
it not for the cottage judiciously introduced into the
scene, the green patch of cultivation, and the goats
grazing in the foreground. These objects form the life
of the picture, and the reason of their introduction is
to convey the pleasing impression that in combination
with the grandeur of nature it contributes to the
comforts of the human race, while scenery however
grand and majestic, without these attractions is dead
and leaves upon the mind the painful impression
of desolation, the eye vainly endeavoring to rest upon
an object, conveying the idea of comfort and happiness
to mankind.

3. That has been done in opening out this Avenue is already appreciated by the community as, within the last two months since the road has been finished, there has been more visitors to the Falls than in the twelve previous months. The Average number of visitors to the Falls during 1862 and 1863 varied from 32 to 40.

4 Immediately on receipt of the Government Order and in obedience to para 2. I proceeded to the "Wood" plantation and placed every available hand to remove the Chinchona plants (upwards of 8000 many of which had been planted for more than 6 months) from the Avenue to the nursery beds on the Eastern side of the Hill. While I do not presume to solicit the favor of a reconsideration of this portion of the minute, under reply, I feel confident that I shall not incur the displeasure of Government, by bringing to their notice my conscientious conviction, that this part of their order directs the removal of plants, which shortly would have formed one of the most valuable, beautiful and interesting Avenues in the world, permitting in its stead a growth of noxious weeds, this conviction being formed on the following facts. 1st. that several species

species of Chinchona stand preeminent as the most valuable of all vegetable products, and the Avenue in question was planted with the best of these; 2nd that in point of beauty the Chinchona tree is inferior to none, Mr. Markham describing it as the most "beautiful and fragrant tree" of South America, Mr. Spruce as "the queen of the forest" and every traveller in South America from the time of Humboldt up to this date being unanimous in this opinion. What then could exceed the beauty of an Avenue nearly two miles in length, composed of such trees? 3rd that the cultivation of these plants being in its infancy is one in which all scientific men take a great interest, and this Avenue extending as it does from an elevation of 6500 to 3400 feet, would have shewn, within a comparatine short distance, the varied effects of altitude upon the different species, and thus practically illustrate a most important and interesting fact; 4th that the forests on these Hills when once felled and burned, if "left to nature", not one tree in a hundred will ever grow again, the ground becoming covered by a

This can be done on the other side of the Hill at present

growth

growth of Strobilanthes and weeds, principally composed of the noxious Solanum giganteum.

5. The Government observe that the Chinchonas "will not harmonize with the surrounding forest". I am not aware of the arguments adduced to cause this impression on the Government, but submit that in point of fact, nothing can be more erroneous, inasmuch as the indegenous forests on the Nilgherries are composed principally of Chinchonaceous plants, so identical in their general resemblance with the Chinchona Ledgeriana, C. Crispilla and C. Condaminia, that it requires the experienced eye of a botanist upon close examination to distinguish the one from the other; hence, had the cause of the removal of the plants been attributed to too great harmony it might have been tenable on the ground that this similarity would amount to monotony in the scenery, were it not that the leaves of the 'red' and 'grey' barks are larger and richer in color than the majority of jungle trees, and in planting the avenue this was taken advantage of in such a manner as would have produced an effect for richness and beauty

beauty altogether unequalled in Nilgherry scenery.

6. From the date of the introduction of the Chinchona plants, objections tending to impede our progress, have been continually advanced without reason or reflection, these hitherto, I have cheerfully combated, being confident in the correctness of my own views, and in the hope that when I had developed these to the satisfaction of Government as has already been done, I should be secure in their confidence and protection against farther interference. The wording of the order under reply has deprived me of this hope, and I see with apprehension objections arising from the Government itself, of so portent a nature as to destroy in a few days the labor of years; to explain my meaning I would observe that had I literally carried out the restrictions conveyed in para 3 of the Government order, I would have had to report to-day a loss of about 40,000 plants. Truly a more effectual plan for the destruction of the plantation could not have been conceived, for the reason that any attempt on my part to restrict my laborers to the path would cause their immediate desertion from the plantation,

as

as the men have hitherto been allowed to diverge from the path to obtain water, collect firewood, and other innocent purposes, to deprive the laborers of these privileges is to deprive us of their services, and at the present moment we have a newly formed nursery of about 40,000 plants depending for their existance on the attendance of these laborers, and great as would be the damage and loss in this respect, in other ways the restrictions reduce to a certainty the total destruction both of the plantation and nursery, from the fact, that no water originates on the Eastern side, the water for the irrigation of the Nurseries and plantation being brought from the Pykara river in a Channel through the forest on the western side of the Hill; this Channel becomes frequently choked up by accident such as the falling of wood, paping of wild animals &c., and although this water is indispensably necessary for the daily existance of the plants in the Nurseries and for the preservation of the plants in the plantation during the dry season, yet the Order of Government clearly indicates that if I was to direct the men to deviate from the path to

clear

clear out this water course and thus obtain that which is necessary to the very existance of the plantation, I would be guilty of a trespass to be visited by "the serious displeasure of Government" hence restrictions productive of such consequences greatly discourage me, especially as the conviction is forced upon my mind that the more perfectly I develope the success of this undertaking, the more serious will be the opposition I shall have to encounter in consequence of its arising principally from a covert feeling of class prejudice; another cause exists among the admirers of natural scenery, who conceive that Chinchona cultivation will spoil the beauty of the Nilgherries, while an equally erroneous impression exists among the members of the Service who take an interest in sporting pursuits that Chinchona cultivation will drive away the game, hence their opposition. The Memorandum of the Honble A. J. Arbuthnot Chief Secretary to Government owes its origin to at least one of the above influences, that gentleman having frequently asserted that the Chinchonas would be the ruin of the Nilgherries by causing the felling of the natural forests. Holding such to be the case it is to

the

the Right Honorable the Secretary of State for India
in Council that the onus of the introduction of these
plants is to be attached, and I submit it would
have been more dignified in Mr Arbuthnot to
have brought his accusation direct against that
Honorable body they being in a much better
position to vindicate their proceedings than
a humble individual like myself.

7. In January last Mr Arbuthnot was
aware of the opening out of the Avenue and road in
question and it is much to be regretted that it
was not at the time brought to the notice of
Government and thus have saved considerable expense
and great waste of labor.

8. The road in question has been
roughly cut out and passable for laden bullocks
for the last three months, it is now finished, with
the exception of 70 yards in one place and 20 in another
effectually drained, and bridged and near the
Falls laid out in garden style with grass borders &c.
before this road was opened we could neither
obtain labor nor supplies for the plantation, now
we can command abundance of both; this road
was further intended to connect the Seddiventtum
plantations

plantations by bridging the river, and this would have
enabled us to draw labor and supplies for the Seddiventtum
plantations from the Eastern side during the western
monsoon, as at this season communication with the
Seddiventtum plantations is cut off, this road also when
connected would much reduce the labor of Superintendence
and cost of working the plantations.

9. I refrain from troubling the Government
with farther details of the injury their restrictions
will cause to the plantations, submitting it to be
understood that unless I possess the power of
maintaining in good order the roads and water
courses connected with the same diverting and
altering the latter when necessary, it is impossible
for me to keep up laborers and establishments, or
to perform the works either to the satisfaction of
the Government or myself, under these circumstances
I hold myself released from the responsibility
originally placed upon me by the Government in
connection with the Chinchona operations.

10. The restrictions placed upon me
and my laborers in para 3 are such as the
Government have never placed upon the common
native traveller on their highways, and I feel this
the more when applied to myself and laborers on a

road

road constructed for our sole benefit, combined with the fact that in carrying out these instructions, there is no object to be gained, as either myself or my laborers diverging from the path into a waste forest could not be productive of injury, I am therefore at a loss to comprehend the meaning of the severity of the restrictions, except indeed it be to render their violation inevitable, and thus subject me at any moment to dismissal with disgrace on a plea of disobedience of Orders, and however unwilling I am to detach myself from this important undertaking, at the present interesting and in some respects still critical period of operations, I see with concern and apprehension that my professional reputation demands it, I therefore most respectfully solicit the permission of your Honble Government and the Secretary of State for India in Council to retire from the service, on such gratuity, pension or award as I may be considered entitled to after 17 years arduous and successful labor, much of which has been of a special nature, and for which I have had the honor to receive the highest testimony to my zeal, ability and integrity, from your Honble Government, the Governor General, and the Right Honble the Secretary of State for India.

I have the honor to be
Sir
Your most Obedt Servant

J. W. Walker

Superintendent Govt Chinc: Plantns

Memorandum

Letter from Mr. W. G. McIvor, Supt. Govt. Cinchona Plantations. } Dated 11th October 1864

It is desirable that this letter, in which Mr. McIvor has thought fit to make remarks with reference to the course taken by me in bringing to the notice of Government what I conceive to have been his disregard of the orders prohibiting the felling of the forest on the Western side of the Hill above the Pykara Waterfall, should be accompanied by observations from me on the two points.

2. In the 6th paragraph Mr. McIvor states, on the authority

Rec'd 1864. Oct. 20th. From Supt. Govt. Cinchona Plants. Dated 11th Oct. 1864. Recd. 19th Oct. 1864. No. 2748. Forwarding his explanation in reply to the G.O. directing the removal of the Rickoria and Plants from the Pykara Avalanche and requesting that the Govt. may be informed of the result of the Enquiry to be made by a Committee to be appointed to report from the spot.

R.O. 6 January 63 No. 72-13.
- 25th " " 292-294
- 13th July 1864 " 2453-2114
- 28th Sept. " 4485-4486

Copy in a letter to Govt. 1st January 65. No. 1 Forwarded

No 1085 S.

authority I am not aware, that I have "frequently asserted "that the Chinchonas would "be the ruin of the Neilgherries "by causing the felling of "the natural forests." Any remarks I have made on this subject have been made in the freedom of private conversation; and they were certainly not open to the construction which Mr. McIvor has put upon them, and which implies that I am opposed to the cultivation of the Chinchona. This is altogether a mistake. No one is more sensible than I am of the importance of the work on which Mr. McIvor is engaged, and no one has been more ready to acknowledge the skill with which Mr. McIvor has conducted it. What I

I have said is that if Mr McIvor were not kept in check, serious mischief would be done by the indiscriminate felling of the Hill forests, the more especially as Mr McIvor has recently propounded what I conceive to be a most mischievous theory that felling the forests tends to increase the water supply. I have always considered it a matter of regret that the site of the Pykara waterfalls, which is the most beautiful spot within easy reach of Ootacamund, should have been selected for a plantation; and I hold, and have expressed, a very strong opinion as to the impropriety of Mr McIvor's conduct in setting at nought the orders of

of Government which pro-
hibited the felling of the
Forest on the Western side
of the Hill so completely
as he has done.

3. The other portion which
I think it right to notice
is that in paragraph 7, where
Mr. McIvor states that in
January last I was aware
of the opening out of the
Avenue and road. This is
not the case. I heard nothing
of it until March or April,
and it was not until I
visited the spot in July
that I had any conception
of the extent of the mischief.
[redacted]

C. J. Cubitt

Minute

- I am a ~~stranger~~ stranger to the locality
in question, but ~~conversant in part~~ apprised to the
order of which Mr McIvor complains because
it appeared to me that an express order of the
Govt had been disregarded, and that the
present with the President's concurrence
must be noticed unless all control over
Mr McIvor's proceedings was to be abandoned.

- The tone of Mr McIvor's present letter supports
of the necessity of noticing his conduct
the view I took and is in my opinion
highly censurable - I cannot suppose
that Mr McIvor would have ventured
to write in such a style unless [redacted]
he looks on his
services as too necessary to Govt to be
dispensed with, & his circumstances render
him independent of public employ -
really
- And there being any decision to make
between Cinchona plantations & pleasing
scenery, I should have considered the former
as of too paramount importance to be sacrificed

to the latter - but it cannot be said that at this has been the case - The Neelgherry plateau affords abundant sites for plantations at different degrees of elevation and Mr. McIvor has been allowed a free selection - On his wishing to try a plantation at Pykarah a suitable piece of ground was given him, under the sole restriction that the forest on the side of one hill was not to be interfered with - This restriction did not impede the formation of the Plantation, & was imposed to preserve the scenery of a favorite place of resort -

- What Mr McIvor writes about restrictions which "greatly discourage" him, and about "a covert feeling of class prejudice" against Cinchona cultivation is as simply preposterous as it is unbecoming - Private plantings have been numerous & the Govt accounts amply show that the success which has attended the experiment is as much owing to the support which Mr McIvor has received as to his own professional skill - Thus skill the Govt has to be acknowledged & rewarded but it is impossible for Govt to permit one of its servants to address it in the manner which Mr McIvor has now done -

I consider that Mr MacIvor should be informed that his resignation will be accepted unless he recalls the letter and engages to comply with the instructions which from time to time Govt may give - that his threat of retiring from "this important undertaking" at so critical a period, at what he describes as "the present interesting & in some respects critical period of operations" is viewed with disapprobation, and that any claim for "gratuity, pension or reward" on account of past services which he may look for from the benevolence & liberality of Govt will be affected by the conduct which he pursues on this occasion -

- If Mr McIvor persists in his intention of resigning, he should be required to state whether he is prepared to continue in charge of the Dept until a successor arrives from England - Should he decline to do so, the Govt can I doubt not make due arrangements for the temporary care of the plantations & nurseries, and Mr McIvor will in my opinion have forfeited any claim to the liberality of Govt by the unhappily

quitting its service

Even if Mr McLean continues in the public service, it seems to me essential that steps should be taken to obtain from England an assistant or Deputy competent to take his place in case of need. The value of the Cinchona plantations is already great & increasing yearly, and steps should be taken to guard against the effects of the Superintendent's illness or death. Govt should also be relieved from its present ~~helpless~~ compromising position and be able to act promptly if Mr McLean ~~should~~ again ~~leave~~ absents himself ~~from~~ & is in the present instance conducted.

In assenting to the removal of the Cinchona trees from the avenue planted by Mr Hickson on the forbidden hill to the adjacent plot, I was not actuated by any idea that the line of trees would spoil the present scenery but by a desire to show Mr Hickson that the only reason why the Cinchona plants might be 100 or almost 200 in number but for instructions of Govt must be obeyed. Under the instructions now given in Captain Bellairs letter of 15th Inst, (circulated with these papers) I consider that these trees should remain & that others in chess & some Australian trees should be planted to fill up the gap. I am prepared to assent to Mr B's suggestion that the avenue should be placed under the Cinchona & due precautions have been taken

Minute 14

I have seen for the first time the proceedings of Govt of 28 Septr ult and have now to deal with matters arising out of those proceedings had there been forwarded to me previous to publication a good deal of trouble & difficulties would have been spared, and I should not have been compelled to bring the subject again under the consideration of the Govt. There are two matters involved in the papers before me, first the proceedings of the Govt above alluded to - second the letter from Mr Mr Soon the latter arising out of those proceedings. I will deal with the two in the order above stated - in order however to bring the matter in all its bearings clearly before the Govt I must enter into some little preliminary detail when the Govt commenced

the experiments of cultiva-
-tion Anchors, &c &c
-tended the general
arrangements of the Plan-
-tations entirely to Mr
McIver. He cleared out the
land, cleared it, made
all the roads &c, and
the Govt has not, except
in the present instance,
had any reason to com-
-plain that the confidence
placed in that Officer
has been abused.
Even in the present in-
-stance I do not think
that I should be justi-
-fied in saying that
confidence had been
abused. —
If Mr McIver was permitted
to commence a Planta-
-tion in the vicinity
of the Pyhara Falls. the
Govt did not ask for
any plan of the ground
or for any description
of the works accepted the
Plantation - it gave
Mr Mc Iver, by implication

at all events, the same latitude
and the same discretion,
which it had heretofore done,
and he accordingly acted
according to his judgment
&c &c — after a time
however the Govt was
informed that the ground
by the side of the River was
being denuded of timber;
upon this, after some
correspondence with the
Collector, an order was
issued to the following
effect — "The Govt are glad
to find that the plantation
"will not affect the scenery
"about the Falls of Pyhara Falls
"within sight of the hotel
"felling will not be allowed"
No Plans however were
asked for, no enquiry
made as to the extent of
the Plantation, the mode
of getting access to it &c.
All was left to his dis-
-cretion. Mr Mc Iver. —
On 8th August the Chief
Secy having visited the
Pyhara Falls,
pointed out to the
Govt that Mr Mc Iver
had cut a long path

in the wood, indirectly
disobedience to the
order from Govt,
upon which he was
called upon for an
immediate explana-
tion of his conduct.
This Mr Mc Soon did
by sending a ~~copy~~ letter
written by me, in
answer to a description
given by him of the
mode in which he
proposed to complete
the communication
to the Plantation, in
which I gave a general
approval of the scheme,
and he explained that
he did not consider
the order of Govt forbade
opening a road through
the wood ~~without~~ without
which the Plantation
could not have been
worked -
This paper was sent to
me and I pointed out
that Mr Mc Soon was not
justified in interfering
in any event by
mere a proposal stated

by him, unaccompanied
by any plan or sketch,
as an order to him - I
gave some opinion as to
the character of the road
which he had made, ~~which~~
having visited the Plan-
tation on the interval,
and I stated
~~[illegible]~~ that I could
not approve of a supposed
plan. I certified that the
Cinchona should be
removed, & that an
attempt, which must
prove unsuccessful,
should be made to re-
move the Forest to the upper
slate -
On the 28 Sept order as
order was given - to the
effect that the upper to
the Forest could not be
repaired by planting
Cinchona or otherwise
but had better be left to
nature - That the Cinchona
should be removed to
the Plantation -
That the Western side of
the Hill should be handed
over to the conservator of
Forests - who would

leave a sufficient breadth
of pathway for the labourers,
and restricting Mr McIvor
to the use of the Path to
himself & his labourers.
had this order been sent
to me before publication
I should have pointed
out that the damage having
been done, and the expense
of clearing the Forest &
planting the Anchovas
incurred - it would be
very bad policy on the
part of the Govt to go to
the further expense of
removing the Stumps,
& replanting them elsewhere
- when, at the risk of the
loss of a good number -
that to leave the
restoration of the Forest
to natures hands would
be, as stated by the Con-
servator of Forests, to
create a mere dense
thorny jungle - which
which would not har-
monize in any way
with the Forest - on each
side of it - that, as also
suggested by the Assist-
ant, Mr McIvor

might as well be
allowed to fill the cleared
land with Anchovas a
fast growing & very
handsome tree -
I may as well state that
I do not consider the
beauty of the Falls to be
so irreparably injured
as is inferred by some,
as in fact neither indeed do I
neither indeed do I
agree with those who
seem to think that
every sacrifice should
be made by the Govt
for the purpose of preserv-
ing the Landscape
in its original form -
When I obtained out-door
sanctioned the cutting
down of the Forest, had
I seen a Plan of the
work intended to
precede its com-
mencement, but I
think that a great
deal more has been
made of the damage
to the scenery than
is necessary, and I
would have
looking them to the path -

that the Conservator of
Forests is of opinion that
the Premises of about
25 Acres running
parallel will not add
to the appearance of the
Scenery, that the Govt
has incurred the Cost
of clearing the ground.
which would be lost
if we were allowed to
return to Forest - that
the Cinchona is hard
& beautiful Tree,
and that at all events
there appears to be
that the Land in question
will contain 20000
Trees - and be worth
in the course of ten
years at least 1500 or
2000 £ per Acre - I
propose that the
orders of the Govt of 28th
Sept - should be
reconsidered, & that
the Land cleared should
be planted with Cinchona
& left in the hands of
the Director of the Cinchona
Plantations -

[illegal]

I do not propose to dis-
-pute the Conclusion
plainly indeed I should
be disposed to have
dealt with his conduct
more directly - but as
the opinions of
the Govt have already
been communicated
to him, I shall deal
only with his letter in
reply. -
I strongly object to the Tone
of this letter, and am of
opinion that Mr Wilson
should be told that the
Govt is not to be addressed
in such a tone or manner
by its subordinates,
whose business it is to
obey its instructions when
given to them, or if they conceive
them inconsistent to submit
to Govt at the same time
their views in a proper manner
for consideration -
with reference to Mr Wilson's
letter of his resignation

he should be informed
= plainly that he is under
no obligation to remain
in the service of the Govt
but that he has no shadow
of claim to either pension
or patronage should he
choose to resign his
appointment merely
on the ground that he
has been reprimanded
for disobedience of
orders. —
Some inconvenience
has evidently arisen
from the amount of
left to the discretion of
Mr M'Ivor. It would
be worthy of consideration
whether he should
not for the future be
called upon to submit
rough sketches of the
models which he pro-
poses to lay out the
Plantation — it may
also be a matter worthy
of consideration whether
he should not be
provided with an
assistant or deputy

at a salary of £300
per month — at present
there is no one between
Mr M'Ivor & the Superin-
tendents of Gardens
in charge of the different
Plantations —

J Dennison

26 October

the gap. — I am prepared to agree —

Private

10

I have seen the Editor on
the matter presented in
connection with Mr Doris
late proceedings on the western
Lids of the Pykan Valley, and
with his recent letter - first
how the tract demanded by
Mr Mc Jan should be dealt
with - and secondly the
tone of his recent letter &
the position which he has
taken & assumed ~~in~~
towards the Govt -

2. As to the first unhappily we have but a choice
of difficulties - The original forest has been laid
low, and cannot be replaced in its pristine
state - We must either leave the clearing in a bare
state, in which case, as would appear from the Governor's
letter, it would become an eyesore with dead stumps
& timber - or have it planted with Chinese or perhaps
some other trees - I do not know that the latter course
is preferable to the former - The Chinese grow to a
handsome tree in its native forests and flourishing
mingly or in clumps - but planted in distinct spots
as it is in the fort plantations, and as it was
in Mr Doris on the sides of the gap which he cut
in the forest, it certainly has not an ornamental
appearance - However as HE the President and Mr
Smith seem in favor of this latter mode of proceeding

[illegible] object - I am certainly reluctant that Mr
I should have anything more to do with the task
in any way in which he has behaved, and under any
circumstances depend he is abound to meddle with it,
after he
has not known exactly how he proposes to proceed, or
how work only on the plan that we may sanction,
should be taken for preventing [illegible]
and in case there should be taken for preventing [illegible]
-ther delay on that side of the case in question
whatever -

I expect this from Mr Talbot's character
and the attitude [illegible]
letting a pupil [illegible]
ultimately [illegible]
it, I entirely [illegible]
and as regards [illegible]
have no [illegible]
an [illegible]
he could, is to [illegible]
an end of all [illegible]
to [illegible]
Last letter - that if he [illegible]
of the Chinsura Plantations he may do so, but that
persons or patricia are not to be touched on [illegible]
know in his appointment because they cannot be
this one way and pranced with the orders of this par
-mount authority - I would warn him further that
if he again addressed [illegible] such a tone they would
at once remove him from his post - This might cause
some inconvenience but would be preferable to toler
-ting such language from [illegible]
his station [illegible]
considerations - I do not [illegible]
aid of the subordinate servants in the Chinsura Plan
-tations would take me [illegible]
going
[illegible]
spikenard [illegible]

from Mr Pearce -

Representation as is the style of the Mr Jones's letter through
-out, that part of it is most especially contrasted in
which he has made a most wanton & pointless
personal attack upon the Chief Secretary - charging
him with exaggerated representations made from
narrow minded motives - and indecent accusing
him of disingenuous conduct in the matter - In strikt-
-ness this memo contains full explanation on both these
charges - In noticing the objectionable nature of Mr
letter, I first should I conceive mark in this pec..
-liar displeasure that part of it which contains
the injurious & unfounded imputations on the
Chief Officer -

During my last visit to the Hooghly I had
not an opportunity of going to the Bykaun Jaki - Had
I presumed the time which this discussion has taken I may -
I would have made a point of visiting them -
I cannot mention that more than one Gentleman
to whom I consulted on the subject and whose
names - until necessary for me to give them - would
be deemed sufficient guarantee - told me that Mr
Talbot's dismissal was by no means unexpected
& with a observed that the Offg Controller of [illegible]
letter of 15 Oct speaks of the extent of clearing as being
very large.

I concur with my Colleagues that it is desirable
to apply to the Secretary of State for an Asst to the Superi-
-intendent of a higher order than his present subordinate
-ion who could take his place in the event of his death,
absence from sickness - or of his relinquishment of or
removal from his appointment and under what we must

how consider a not impossible contingency. At present there is reason to believe that, as observed by Mr McIver is either independent of, or complying with, the Chinchona or considers that he is too valuable to spare - and it is hoped can be induced to act as he has done. I would beg as I have already noted, hesitate to undertake him in this 2nd necessary - but to place on the spot of an Assistant in all respects qualified to perform his duties would be a check on him, and stimulate the hands of first -

As Mr McIver maintains in his letter that in making the clearing on the west side of the Pyke he did not violate any express order of first, I annex an abstract of the correspondence which took place on the subject in 1863.

On the 2d Jan 1863 Lieut Col Hamilton brought to the notice of first that the site recently selected for Chinchona operations in the Pykara valley was in the hanging wood on the Pyke side of the river. He objected to this as marring a striking one of most picturesque and beautiful spots on the Pykara - mentioned that a large portion of this forest shown at the back of the Hills on the eastern slope seemed equally well adapted for the purpose, and suggested that the whole of the forest within sight of the Pyke might be preserved intact -

The Govt G O 6 Jan 1863. directed Col Cotton to inspect the locality in company with Mr McIver and to select the site for the plantation sufficiently remote from the view not to interfere with the scenery about the Pyke -

Mr McIver on the 7 Jan 1863, in reference to Telegram ordering him to suspend felling near the Pyke, said that a portion had been felled near the Pyke Falls for the purposes and that only an area of 4 acres - This portion had been selected because it was considerably removed from the forest which was intended to be felled for the Chinchona plantations and the plan would not be damaged by the time whilst the Forest [illegible] bunds

It was now intended to fell another tree on the western face of the Hills - The forest on the western face of the Hills - The forest on the western face of the Hills being an exposure unsuited for the growth of Chinchona -

In his letter of 15 Jan 1863 Mr Mc Iver reported that the plantation would not be visible from the Pyke, but on the eastern slope of the Hill the locality in fact pointed out by Col Hamilton as best suited for the purpose

No further felling was contemplated when the nursery had been formed -

The Govt G O 23 Jan 63 - expressed their satisfaction that the Plantation would not affect the scenery about the Pykara falls within sight of the felling would not be

assuming

Unless the papers be understood as ~~confirming~~ the Govt that the Chinchona planting operations would be confined to the eastern slope of the Hills - and that Mr McIver ~~understood~~ from in that sense and promising ~~it~~ to act up to them, it is difficult to say what meaning is to be extracted from them -

Again if cutting a gap at least 40 yards wide on the western side of the Hill where Mr McIver had assumed first that "it was only intended to fell another" and when the exposure was considered "the growth of Chinchona" was not an infraction of the orders - it is hard to tell what the orders is -

J Hyndman

4 Nov 64

Nº 172

Government Gardens
Ootacamund 3rd Novr 1864

From,

W. G. McIvor Esqre
Superintendent Govt Cinchona Plantations
Ootacamund

To,

J. D. Sim Esqre
Secretary to Govt Rev. Dept
Fort St. George Madras

Sir,

With reference to the order of Government
Nº 1794 and my letter of the 11th Inst:
Nº 155, I have the honor most respectfully to bring
to the notice of Government that as an unusually severe
drought has set in, and the plants upon the upper
portion of the Wood plantation near Pycarra are
already suffering severely from want of water, and if
the drought continues for a fortnight more, the greater
portion of them will be dead, unless immediate steps
are taken to turn the water course at a higher level
in order to admit of irrigation. I would therefore
solicit the favor of being advised by telegraph as to
what steps I am to adopt in reference to this matter

2 Farther supplies of grain are also necessary

for

for the Establishment on the plantation, this I have delayed getting in as long as possible, as the loaded bullocks and men in charge of them would certainly cause an infringement of Para 3 of the Government Order above noted; I would therefore esteem it a favor my being instructed as to how to proceed in this respect.

3. I would also observe that although I explained the Orders of Government to my establishment with as much leniency as possible, since doing so I have lost one Mistry with forty three of my best trained men, and I much fear that if immediate steps are not taken to remove these restrictions, at least so far as they affect my establishment, we will shortly not have a man upon the plantation, and as the dry weather is now setting in, this would prove its total destruction.

4 I have been most unwilling to trouble the Govt. on this subject and have delayed doing so in daily expectation of our usual rains, but as there is still no appearance of these, it becomes imperative that I should bring these facts to their notice.

I have the honor to be
Sir
Your most Obed.t Servt.

W. McEwen

No. 2058 A.

Revenue Department

Proceedings of the Madras Government under date the 8th November 1864.

Read the following papers.

~~From the Supdt Govt Cinchona Plantations~~ ~~Memo. from the Chief Secy to Govt~~ } (Here enter 11th Octr 1864 No 155)

Memo. from the Chief Secy to ~~Govt~~ ~~from the Supdt Govt Cinchona Plantations~~ } (Here enter 11th Octr 1864 ~~No 156~~)

From the Offg Conservator of Forests } (Here enter 15th October 1864 No 1102)

Minute by the Honorable Mr Maltby } (Here enter 22d Octr 1864)

Minute by H. E. the Governor (Here enter 26th Octr 1864)

Minute by the Honble Mr Arbuthnot ~~from the Supdt Govt Cinchona Plantations~~ } (Here enter 4th Novr 1864 ~~No 171~~)

~~From the Supdt Govt Cinchona Plantations~~ ~~Minute by the Hon. Mr Arbuthnot~~ (Here enter 3d Novr 1864 No 172)

In his letter above recorded the Superintendent of Cinchona Plantations submits a further expla-nation of his conduct in cutting an Avenue through the forest in the immedi-ate neighbourhood of the Pykara Falls.

As Mr McIvor maintains that this act was not an infringement of their orders the Govt will briefly notice the correspondence on the subject.

On

WD

EM

JP

Telegraph

Your letter of 3rd instant No 172

You may alter the water courses and use the road freely but there must be no more felling. The road and avenue on this understanding are replaced in your charge.

It seems to me that this copy of the Minute is owing to Mr McIvor misinterpretation of a very simple rule, and he must be warned that the Govt will hold him answerable for failure arising out of such misinterpretation.

WD

EM

JP

Pro: 28 September/64 No. 425-426

C No. 2748 of 1864

Copy in a letter to Curr 11th January/65 No 1 Rev Forests.

No 1083

Revenue 1864 Septr

Proof Govt for November No. 2904.

From the Supdt Govt Cinchona Plantations.

Dated 3rd } Received 7th } November 1864.

No. 172.

Bringing to notice that an unusually severe drought has set in and requesting instructions for turning the water course at a higher level to the Wood plantation at Pycarrah, for bringing supplies to his estate, and for removing certain restrictions imposed by Govt so far as they affect his Estate.

Deposited with an Order

On the 22nd January 1863 Colonel Hamilton brought to notice that the site selected for Cinchona operations in the valley of the Sykara river would "materially affect one of the most picturesque and beautiful spots on the Neilgherries, the hanging woods over the falls of the river being doomed to destruction thereby utterly depriving the scene of its chief ornament." At the same time he mentioned that a large portion of the same shola at the back of the Hill on the Eastern slope seemed equally adapted

adapted for Cinchona cultivation and suggested that the whole of the forest within sight of the falls should, if possible, be preserved intact.

Mr. Mc Ivor was directed by Telegraph to stop felling the wood until further orders & the Collector was instructed to visit the locality with him and "select a site for the plantation sufficiently remote from the river not

not to interfere with the scenery about the falls."

Mr. McIvor immediately replied to the Telegram and stated that "not a tree had been felled near the Cykard Falls since November and then only a space of one acre for a nursery." that "it never was intended to fell another tree on the waterfall face of the Hills" and that the plantation was "not within sight of the Water falls being on the opposite face of the hills viz North and East, while the forest on the water fall sides faces West and South, being an exposure unsuited for the growth of Cinchona; and consequently it never was intended to fell this forest for a cinchona plantation."

The

The Collectors
report was much
to the same effect
and the Government
order was in the fol-
-lowing terms." The
Government are glad
to find that the
plantation will not
affect the scenery
about the Pykara
falls, within sight
of which felling
will not be allowed."
These papers can
be regarded in no
other

other light than as
evincing the desire of
Government that
the Forest on the
Western sides of
the Hill should be
preserved in their
natural beauty and
as conveying an as-
-surance from Mr
Mr Ivor that this
wish should be
scrupulously res-
-pected. Yet it
is

is through these very words that Mr. Mc. Ivor has cut an avenue at least 40 yards wide.

Mr. Mc. Ivor in para 3 of his letter of the 7th Jan.y/53 argues that he signified his intention to form roads to the plantation, passing the water falls ~~six paras of his letter of the 7th Jan.y 1863~~ and that as Govt. did not notice this matter he concluded that they approved of it. Mr. Mc. Ivor in the letter referred to certainly did mention the intended formation of roads but not in such a manner as to lead Government to suppose that they were to pass through the very shola in which, in the same letter, he stated "it never was intended to fell another tree." His expression was "the roads formed for the plantation will render the falls easily accessible." But independent of this, it must be observed that even had the allusion to roads been more definite, the Government would

would never have
supposed that Mr.
Mc. Ivor meant cuttings
of the width of 120 feet.
They would naturally
have imagined that
roads of 12 or 15 feet
in width were all that
Mr. Mc. Ivor contemplated.

In paras 6 and 10
of his letter of the 11th ult.
=imo Mr. Mc. Ivor al=
=ludes to the restrictions
placed upon him in para
3 of the order of Government
as unprecedented and of
ruinous tendency. The
paragraph limited Mr.
Mc. Ivor "to the use of
the path for himself
and his laborers" and

the

the evident intention of
the order was simply
to restrain him from fur=
=ther felling and other in=
=terference with the forest
or road. Mr. Mc. Ivor's
idea that he is expected
to forbid his laborers "to
diverge from the path to
obtain water, collect fire=
=wood and other innocent
purposes" is simply
absurd.

The Government learn
that the Forest Depart=
=ment cannot conveniently
take charge of the Avenue
and that as the trees have
been burnt, others are not
likely to spring up, if the
opening be left to nature.
Under these circumstances
the Government resolve to
cancel so much of their

order

order of the 28th September
last, as transfers these
Avenue to the Forest
Department. He will ac-
cordingly resume charge
of it and will complete
the formation of the road
and keep it in repair
but he is distinctly
to understand that
not another tree is
to be felled on any
account. As Mr. McIvor
assures the Government
that Cinchonas will
harmonise with the
rest of the Forest,
he may plant these
in the opening but
it would be well to
do this in a less in-
formal manner than
as

This is the order on 2747

as an avenue. This as
well as the introduction
of other suitable trees
is however left to his
judgment.

The only point
remaining to be noticed
is the tone of Mr. McIvor's
letter and the position he
therein assumes towards the
Government.

The Government are
well aware of the valuable
services which Mr. McIvor
has rendered the State in
connection with the intro-
duction of the Cinchonas
they have repeaterly ex-
pressed their appreciation
of his exertions and they
attribute the success of
the experiment mainly to
his skill. From first to
last

last they have reposed entire confidence in him and afforded him the fullest support. It is with much regret therefore that the Govt. feel compelled to record their serious dissatisfaction with the tone and tenor of the letter under consideration. — & &

& A more improper letter in every sense could scarcely be addressed by a subordinate to his Govermt. — Not content with bringing against the Chief Secy. unfounded charges of making exaggerated representations and being actuated by unworthy

unworthy motives, Mr. McLeod accuses the Govt. of imposing on him restrictions, the severity of which is incomprehensible unless designed "to render them violation inevitable" and so subject him at any moment to dismissal" on a plea of disobedience of orders" — or in other words that this part of the order of Govt. is simply a device to entrap him. Throughout the letter in fact Mr. McLeod assumes an attitude towards the Government wholly subversive of all subordination. — The

The Govt. cannot permit their subordinates to address them in this reprehensible manner or thus to ignore their authority.—

Mr. McIver is under no obligation to continue in the service of Govt. but officers who suddenly resign their appointments, endangering the interests entrusted to them, because they cannot have their own way in any particular matter forfeit all claim to pension or gratuity

Mr. McIver will now be called

upon to reconsider his letter of 11th Ultimo and to inform the Govt. whether he adheres to his wish to be relieved and, if so, from what date—(The papers will meanwhile be submitted for the consideration of the Secretary of State.)

It is reported to Gen. McLaws and letter the Govt. observe that their order of the 20 Sept. last makes no allusion to water courses at all. These include the felling of the Forest and. Mr. McLaws

is quite at liberty
to divert them when
necessary as well as
keep them in repair.
As regards the use
of the road it has
already been limited
but that the order of
Govt. was not intended
to bear and in fact
does not bear the con-
struction put upon it
by Mr McLean: the
loss of laborers is
consequently entirely
due to his mis-in-
terpretation of the order.
I shall trust the follg
telegram be despatched
to Mr McLean.

W. S.

To the Supt Post Chinchaga Elandahamia
Dept 12 Nov 64

Telegram.

Your letter of 3rd Inst. No 172.
You may alter the water courses
and use the road freely - but
there must be no more felling.
The road Avenue on this
understanding are replaced
in your charge. —

Revenue 1864 Departt

Proc.s of Govt. for November

N.o 2058 A

Proc.s the Madras Govt.

D.d 8.th November 1864.

Passing orders on the explanation of Mr. McIvor Asstt. Superintendt. Sirsahora Plantation of his conduct in cutting an avenue through the forest in the neighbourhood of the Pycara Falls.

N.o 108-A- & 1058