

Government of India

PUBLIC DEPARTMENT

1894
Special report

G.O. No. 467, 27th June 1894

Simultaneous Examinations in England and in India for the
Indian Civil Service

Resolving despatch from the Secretary of State to India from the Government of India
reporting as to the mode in which and the conditions and limitations under which it would be
possible to give effect to the Resolution of the House of Commons upon the holding of

BACK PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

FURTHER PAPERS

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

Government of Madras.

PUBLIC DEPARTMENT

Recd.

Enclosures

Regd.

1894.

Spare copies

G.O. No. 467, 27th June 1894.

Simultaneous Examinations in England and in India for the Indian Civil Service.

Recording despatch from the Secretary of State on letter from the Government of India reporting as to the mode in which and the conditions and limitations under which it would be possible to give effect to the Resolution of the House of Commons upon the holding of —.

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS.

PUBLIC DEPARTMENT.

READ—the following paper :—

Despatch—from His Majesty's Secretary of State for India.

To—His Excellency the Right Honourable the Governor-General of India in Council.

Dated—India Office, London, the 19th April 1894.

No.—37, Public.

I have considered in Council the letter from your Government, No. 62, Public, dated 1st November 1893, reporting, in accordance with my predecessor's instructions, as to the mode in which, and the conditions and limitations under which, it would be possible to give effect to the Resolution of the House of Commons, upon the holding of simultaneous examinations in England and in India for the Indian Civil Service. This question, which your Government had regarded as set at rest by the report made by the Public Service Commission in December 1887, and by the constitution of the new Provincial Services in pursuance of that Commission's recommendations, has now been very fully and carefully discussed afresh, both by the Local Governments and in your letter under reply.

2. In 1870, by the Statute 33 Vict., Cap. 3, section 6, it was provided that, subject to such rules as might be made with the sanction of the Secretary of State, Natives of India might be appointed to any of the offices reserved under the Act of 1861 for members of the Civil Service. The object of this provision was, at the time of its enactment, declared to be to facilitate the appointment of Natives of India of proved merit and ability to any high public employment for which they might be fitted by their qualifications. The Act in fact indicated and contained in itself the remedy which Parliament after full deliberation considered most appropriate for any disadvantages entailed on Natives of India by reason of the examinations for entrance into the Civil Service being held only in London. A prolonged inquiry ensued as to the best mode of applying the remedy thus devised, and it was not until 1879 that rules were promulgated, inaugurating what has been popularly known as the Statutory service. The appointments made under those rules failed to give satisfaction, and in 1886 a Commission of fifteen members was directed to investigate the whole subject. One of the principal issues referred to this Commission was whether there should be an examination in India similar to that held annually in London, and a large number of witnesses were examined regarding the advantages and disadvantages of introducing such a system. On a full consideration of all the evidence the Commission, which contained six Native members, came unanimously to the conclusion that "it is inexpedient to hold an examination in India for the Covenanted Civil Service simultaneously with the examination in London." Three of the Native members did not altogether accept the reasons which had led their colleagues to this conclusion, but they nevertheless concurred in the report, because they considered that the general scheme which had been recommended was "well calculated to secure the end which they had in view".

3. To the general scheme thus unanimously recommended substantial effect has now been given, although not in the precise shape formulated by the Commissioners. It has been deemed preferable to adhere to the procedure laid down in the Act of 1870, and to provide by means of rules that, at the discretion of the Local Government, any particular proportion or number of any of the offices reserved for the Civil Service may be entered in a list as open to the newly-created Provincial Service. Accordingly such a list has been prepared for each Province, and rules have been framed and

issued under the sanction of the Secretary of State, by which the Local Governments are empowered to bestow any of the reserved posts so "listed" upon Natives of India being members of the Provincial Service. And not only has this power been conferred; steps have been taken by which the Local Governments will be obliged to fill one-sixth of the reserved offices by members of the Provincial Service, when the claims of the Natives holding appointments under the Statutory Rules of 1879 have been satisfied. The number of officers annually recruited in England by examination has for several years been reduced by one-sixth, and will only suffice to fill five-sixths of the reserved appointments.

4. As is pointed out in the letter under reply, the present lists of appointments for which officers promoted from the newly organised Provincial Service are eligible have been prepared with reference only to proximate possibilities, and do not include more posts than those which the Local Governments expect to find provincial candidates qualified to occupy as soon as such posts become available. The Indian Civil Service contains 898 posts, of which 74 are in special or technical departments not concerned with the general administration of the country. In most of these departments—the chief exception being the Political Department, which deals with Native States and frontier tribes—the number of Covenanted Civilians is small, and of the remaining 824 posts all are not held by Covenanted Civilians. The lists already published of posts tenable by officers promoted from the Provincial Service contain 93, or over 15 per cent. of the 612 offices, for which alone provincial officers can at present be regarded as ordinarily qualified. In arriving at this number, the provinces of Burma and Assam are excluded from consideration, as also are the posts in the Punjab Commission reserved for military officers, and those high offices specified in paragraph 4 of your memorandum, but it is understood that, in the event of any provincial officer being found qualified for one of these higher offices, it is your intention to proceed under the special provisions of section 3 of the Statute of 1861. A full one-sixth of 612 posts would give only a slightly larger percentage (16.66) than that already conceded. In these calculations no account is taken of such Natives of India as may succeed at the open competition in England; and it should be remembered that in 1884 Lord Ripon's Government wrote that, as the proportion of Natives admitted under the Statutory Rules was one-sixth of the whole recruitment of the year, and as a certain number do from time to time obtain appointments through the open competition, "in fixing a percentage of the whole recruitment to be at once reserved for Natives we feel bound to recognise the effect of this double mode of admission, and, on a scrutiny of the results of past years, we think that this percentage may fairly be taken at 18 per cent."

5. The necessity for maintaining an adequate proportion of Europeans in the service is so generally admitted that it is unnecessary for me to dwell on the arguments on which that policy is founded. I will only refer to the fact that, as is pointed out by the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab, a European officer stands clear of all the sects and disputes, whether religious or not, which form a prominent feature in Indian life; and thus holds a position of complete and acknowledged impartiality as between different classes of Natives, to which few, if any, Natives of India can attain. Your Government and almost all the Local Governments are decidedly of opinion that the limit of one-sixth must be maintained for many years to come; the only exception is the Madras Government, who have expressed the view that that Presidency could be efficiently administered if two-thirds of the Civil servants attached to it were Europeans. You are also of opinion that "the proportion of Natives of India who succeed in entering the service by competition at the London examination requires to be closely watched; and that it may become necessary hereafter to restrict the total proportion of Indians in the Service, as Lord Ripon's Government proposed, to 18 per cent. or some similar figure." It is not, however, necessary at present to discuss this question. I entirely agree with your Government in regarding the maintenance of the Indian Civil Service in the highest efficiency attainable as a matter of supreme importance. This has been well shown in the following passage, with which the introductory portion of the letter under reply concludes :—

"Deducting the 93 posts assigned to the Provincial Service, the *cadre* of posts at present reserved for covenanted and military officers is 731. These are the officers on whose administrative capacity and fitness for rule depends the quiet and orderly government of 217½ millions of

people, inhabiting 943,000 square miles of territory. This bare statement of figures should, we think, be sufficient to convince any impartial mind of the supreme importance of obtaining the best material, in the best way, for the arduous duties which these officers have to perform. They represent the British Government in India; in the eyes of the people they are the British Government; it is to their personal influence, their impartiality, justice and efficiency, their physical and moral fitness, that the due administration of the Empire is entrusted; upon them, and not immediately upon military force, our strength rests; any weakening of their influence or deterioration in their efficiency would imply a relaxation of the restraints of Government, and a reversion *pro tanto* to the conditions from which the country emerged only when it came into British possession."

6. Another of the recommendations unanimously accepted by the Public Service Commission was that the limits of age prescribed for candidates at the London competition should be raised from 17 as a minimum to 19, and from 21 as a maximum to 23. This proposal was made in the interests of Native candidates, and in consideration of the evidence adduced that Natives of India were placed at a disadvantage, in competing with Europeans, by the lower limits. Full effect has been given to this recommendation.

7. On the whole I am convinced that the new rules framed under the Statute of 1870 retain all the important features of the scheme which, after full investigation, was accepted by the Public Service Commission as satisfying all the legitimate aspirations of the Natives of India. I have already intimated the opinion of Her Majesty's Government that an adequate proportion of the members of the Indian Civil Service must always be Europeans; and I agree in your Government's conclusion that any system of simultaneous examinations, identical in their nature, at which all who compete would be entitled to be classified in one list according to merit, would be incompatible with this condition which you, in common with Her Majesty's Government, regard as indispensable.

8. But it is not the European element alone which requires to be maintained. It is also indispensable, if the people are to be kept contented, and if large and important offices should be filled by Muhammadans, Sikhs, and others, who have evinced a large capacity for the practical work of administration, but little or no aptitude for passing examinations with success. Sir D. Fitzpatrick remarks that "if absolutely open competition would result," as he evidently thinks it must, "in setting one of two great hostile parties above the other, we must either have some sort of limited competition, or give up competition altogether." And his apprehensions are fully borne out by experience in Bengal, where, as shown in paragraph 15 of the letter under reply, it was found that the system of recruiting for the subordinate executive service by competition had absolutely excluded Muhammadans and Natives of Behar and of Orissa, and would speedily, if persisted in, have resulted in the entire service being given over to Bengali Hindus. From the enclosures contained in your letter under reply and from your letter of the 24th January 1894, it appears that the class of Natives of India who usually enter the Civil Service by competition are not considered suitable for service in Burma, the Punjab, the North-West Provinces, Oudh, or Sindh, and that the number of such Natives allotted to the province of Bengal has already approached a point beyond which it is thought unwise to allow it to go. So long as these conditions remain, it must be apparent that serious difficulties might be caused by the influx into the service of a large number of Natives recruited by competitive examination whether in England or India.

9. One of the most valuable features of the existing system is that a superior Provincial Service has been constituted for each province, comprising both the appointments newly "listed" (or which may hereafter be listed) as open to others than Indian civilians, and the higher posts in the judicial and executive departments of the old Uncovenanted Service. The object of this measure was to raise the status and tone of the old Uncovenanted Service by forming a superior service of considerable dignity, and by holding out to all members of that service who distinguish themselves by their ability and trustworthiness the prospect of promotion to posts ordinarily held by members of the Imperial Service. I attach very great importance to this consideration, and, even if these meritorious officers could equitably be deprived of the new prospects which have been unfolded before them, I should be most reluctant to sanction any step which would relegate them to their former position. The Provincial Service, as now

constituted, includes, besides a large number of lucrative and responsible appointments of a miscellaneous character, 1,827 posts, which involve the exercise of high judicial, magisterial, or executive functions, and carry salaries ranging from Rs. 200 to Rs. 1,000 *per mensem*. To these the 93 posts already "listed," rising in pay to Rs. 2,000 a month, will be added at the earliest moment compatible with due regard to the vested interests or reasonable expectations of others. Moreover, the dignity of the new Provincial Services has been distinctly enhanced by their separation from the subordinate services, which include, over and above the entire ministerial staff of the different Government offices and a large variety of miscellaneous posts, upwards of 1,900 appointments, also involving judicial or executive powers, and carrying salaries of from Rs. 100 to Rs. 250 *per mensem*. Both these divisions of the old Uncovenanted Service are manned almost entirely by Natives of India, and upon them devolves the bulk of the judicial and executive business of the country, the Imperial Service being restricted to the smallest number possible, and reserved for the superintendence of the administration, for the supervision of districts, and for such other work as must, as a rule, be discharged by European officers. It is evident that the prospect of rising by merit in the latter to the "listed" posts, must have the best effect on the tone of the entire staff, as well as on the quality of the recruits who join either of the two divisions. Sir Antony MacDonnell considers that this hope "has raised new aspirations and inspired new energy into the great body of Indian Native officials." "There has now," he says, "been infused throughout the Provincial Service, from the lowest grade to the highest, an improved tone and a higher sense of dignity and responsibility, which will continue to increase as the number of listed posts increases"; and in his opinion "it would be a public calamity if this improved tone in the administration were to be destroyed." Other Local Governments bear testimony to the same effect, and their reports leave no room for doubt that the Provincial Services, as now improved, hold out advantages sufficient to attract the best recruits that India can supply.

10. In paragraph 18 of your letter your Government thus summarise the reasons which have induced them to dissent from the proposal to establish a simultaneous examination in India:—

"(1) No such concession is necessary for the fulfilment of the so-called pledges upon which the claim has been founded.

"(2) The practical difficulties of introducing a system of simultaneous examinations would be extremely serious.

"(3) It is conceded that, in order to ensure the efficient government of the country, a minimum of European officials is indispensable. Such a minimum could not be maintained in the event of simultaneous examination being resorted to in this country.

"(4) It would be entirely out of the question to reduce the existing minimum of Europeans at the present time.

"(5) Open competition is not the best way of selecting Natives of the higher ranks of the service. It may be necessary in Europe in order to check nepotism, but in this case nepotism is impossible. Probation by actual employment forms a competitive examination of the best kind. Competitive examination in India would certainly have the effect of admitting a large number of competitors deficient in the qualifications necessary for the higher ranks of the service; and whose antecedents and origin would not be such as to command the confidence or the good-will of the classes for whose welfare they would be responsible; on the other hand, it would exclude the most valuable and capable assistance which the British Government could obtain from Natives of India, in the Sikhs, Muhammadans, and other races accustomed to rule and possessing exceptional strength of character, but deficient in literary education.

"(6) The proposed change would, unless the irreducible minimum of Europeans is to be diminished, involve the withdrawal of the appointments recently given, after the fullest consideration, to the Provincial Service, and would thus deprive that Service of the prizes promised to it, disappointing its hopes and lowering its efficiency by a sense of injustice."

11. Her Majesty's Government are most anxious that the Natives of the country should enjoy every facility, compatible with the maintenance of the efficiency of the administration and the safety of British rule, to enter the public service of India, and they have reconsidered the whole subject with a sincere desire to give full weight to the arguments in favour of a system of simultaneous examinations; but they have arrived at the conclusion that there are insuperable objections to the establishment of that system, and that by far the best method of meeting the legitimate claims and

aspirations of the Natives of the country is to bestow such of the higher posts as can be made available for them on those who distinguish themselves by their capacity and trustworthiness in the performance of subordinate duties.

12. Upon a careful review of the whole question, Her Majesty's Government agree with your Government that the system lately established is based on just and wise principles, and they are of opinion that, subject to such alterations in detail as experience may prove to be necessary, it should be maintained.

No. 1027.

Copy forwarded to the Government of Madras, with reference to the letter from that Government, No. 733, dated 7th September 1893.

(By order.)

HOME DEPARTMENT (PUBLIC),
Simla, the 11th June 1894.

L. M. THORNTON,
Offg. Depy. Secy. to the Govt. of India.

Order—No. 467, Public, dated 27th June 1894.

Recorded in continuation of G.O. Nos. 732-A, 733, dated 7th September 1893.

(True Extract.)

J. F. PRICE,
Chief Secretary.

India Office,
London, 19th April 1894.

Public,
No. 37.

To His Excellency the Right Honourable the Governor General
of India in Council.

MY LORD,

I HAVE considered in Council the letter from your Government, No. 62, Public, dated 1st November 1893, reporting, in accordance with my predecessor's instructions, as to the mode in which, and the conditions and limitations under which, it would be possible to give effect to the Resolution of the House of Commons, upon the holding of simultaneous examinations in England and in India for the Indian Civil Service. This question, which your Government had regarded as set at rest by the report made by the Public Service Commission in December 1887, and by the constitution of the new provincial services in pursuance of that Commission's recommendations, has now been very fully and carefully discussed afresh, both by the Local Governments and in your letter under reply.

2. In 1870, by the Statute 33 Vict., Cap. 3, section 6, it was provided that, subject to such rules as might be made with the sanction of the Secretary of State, Natives of India might be appointed to any of the offices reserved under the Act of 1861 for members of the Civil Service. The object of this provision was, at the time of its enactment, declared to be to facilitate the appointment of Natives of India of proved merit and ability to any high public employment for which they might be fitted by their qualifications. The Act in fact indicated and contained in itself the remedy which Parliament after full deliberation considered most appropriate for any disadvantages entailed on Natives of India by reason of the examinations for entrance into the Civil Service being held only in London. A prolonged inquiry ensued as to the best mode of applying the remedy thus devised, and it was not until 1879 that rules were promulgated, inaugurating what has been popularly known as the Statutory Service. The appointments made under those rules failed to give satisfaction, and in 1886 a Commission of 15 members was directed to investigate the whole subject. One of the principal issues referred to this Commission was whether there should be an examination in India similar to that held annually in London, and a large number of witnesses were examined regarding the advantages and disadvantages of introducing such a system. On a full consideration of all the evidence the Commission, which contained six Native members, came unanimously to the conclusion that "it is inexpedient to hold an examination in India for the Covenanted Civil Service simultaneously with the examination in London." Three of the Native members did not altogether accept the reasons which had led their colleagues to this conclusion, but they nevertheless concurred in the report, because they considered that the general scheme which had been recommended was "well calculated to secure the end which they had in view."

3. To the general scheme thus unanimously recommended substantial effect has now been given, although not in the precise shape formulated by the Commissioners. It has been deemed preferable to adhere to the procedure laid down in the Act of 1870, and to provide by means of rules that, at the discretion of the Local Government, any particular proportion or number of any of the

offices reserved for the Civil Service may be entered in a list as open to the newly created Provincial Service. Accordingly such a list has been prepared for each Province, and rules have been framed and issued under the sanction of the Secretary of State, by which the Local Governments are empowered to bestow any of the reserved posts so "listed" upon Natives of India, being members of the Provincial Service. And not only has this power been conferred; steps have been taken by which the Local Governments will be obliged to fill one-sixth of the reserved offices by members of the Provincial Service, when the claims of the Natives holding appointments under the Statutory Rules of 1879 have been satisfied. The number of officers annually recruited in England by examination has for several years been reduced by one-sixth, and will only suffice to fill five-sixths of the reserved appointments.

4. As is pointed out in the letter under reply, the present lists of appointments for which officers promoted from the newly organised Provincial Service are eligible have been prepared with reference only to proximate possibilities, and do not include more posts than those which the Local Governments expect to find provincial candidates qualified to occupy as soon as such posts become available. The Indian Civil Service contains 898 posts, of which 74 are in special or technical departments not concerned with the general administration of the country. In most of these departments—the chief exception being the Political Department, which deals with Native States and frontier tribes—the number of Covenanted Civilians is small, and of the remaining 824 posts all are not held by Covenanted Civilians. The lists already published of posts tenable by officers promoted from the Provincial Service contain 93, or over 15 per cent., of the 612 offices, for which alone provincial officers can at present be regarded as ordinarily qualified. In arriving at this number, the provinces of Burma and Assam are excluded from consideration, as also are the posts in the Punjab Commission reserved for military officers, and those high offices specified in paragraph 4 of your memorandum, but it is understood that, in the event of any provincial officer being found qualified for one of these higher offices, it is your intention to proceed under the special provisions of section 3 of the Statute of 1861. A full one-sixth of 612 posts would give only a slightly larger percentage (16.66) than that already conceded. In these calculations no account is taken of such Natives of India as may succeed at the open competition in England; and it should be remembered that in 1884 Lord Ripon's Government wrote that, as the proportion of Natives admitted under the Statutory Rules was one-sixth of the whole recruitment of the year, and as a certain number do from time to time obtain appointments through the open competition, "in fixing a percentage of the whole recruitment to be at once reserved for Natives we feel bound to recognise the effect of this double mode of admission, and, on a scrutiny of the results of past years, we think that this percentage may fairly be taken at 18 per cent."

5. The necessity for maintaining an adequate proportion of Europeans in the service is so generally admitted that it is unnecessary for me to dwell on the arguments on which that policy is founded. I will only refer to the fact that, as is pointed out by the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab, a European officer stands clear of all the sects and disputes, whether religious or not, which form a prominent feature in Indian life; and thus holds a position of complete and acknowledged impartiality as between different classes of Natives, to which few, if any, Natives of India can attain. Your Government and almost all the Local Governments are decidedly of opinion that the limit of one-sixth must be maintained for many years to come; the only exception is the Madras Government, who have expressed the view that that Presidency could be efficiently administered if two-thirds of the Civil servants attached to it were Europeans. You are also of opinion that "the proportion of Natives of India who succeed in entering the Service by competition at the London examination requires to be closely watched; and that it may become necessary hereafter to restrict the total proportion of Indians in the Service, as Lord Ripon's Government proposed, to 18 per cent. or some similar figure." It is not, however, necessary at present to discuss this question. I entirely agree with your Government in regarding the maintenance of the Indian Civil Service in the highest efficiency attainable as a matter of supreme importance. This has been well shown

in the following passage, with which the introductory portion of the letter under reply concludes:—

"Deducting the 93 posts assigned to the Provincial Service, the cadre of posts at present reserved for covenanted and military officers is 731. These are the officers on whose administrative capacity and fitness for rule depends the quiet and orderly government of 217½ millions of people, inhabiting 943,000 square miles of territory. This bare statement of figures should, we think, be sufficient to convince any impartial mind of the supreme importance of obtaining the best material, in the best way, for the arduous duties which these officers have to perform. They represent the British Government in India; in the eyes of the people they are the British Government; it is to their personal influence, their impartiality, justice and efficiency, their physical and moral fitness, that the due administration of the Empire is entrusted; upon them, and not immediately upon military force, our strength rests; any weakening of their influence or deterioration in their efficiency would imply a relaxation of the restraints of government, and a reversion *pro tanto* to the conditions from which the country emerged only when it came into British possession."

6. Another of the recommendations unanimously accepted by the Public Service Commission was that the limits of age prescribed for candidates at the London competition should be raised from 17 as a minimum to 19, and from 21 as a maximum to 23. This proposal was made in the interests of Native candidates, and in consideration of the evidence adduced that Natives of India were placed at a disadvantage, in competing with Europeans, by the lower limits. Full effect has been given to this recommendation.

7. On the whole I am convinced that the new rules framed under the Statute of 1870 retain all the important features of the scheme which, after full investigation, was accepted by the Public Service Commission as satisfying all the legitimate aspirations of the Natives of India. I have already intimated the opinion of Her Majesty's Government that an adequate proportion of the members of the Indian Civil Service must always be Europeans; and I agree in your Government's conclusion that any system of simultaneous examinations, identical in their nature, at which all who compete would be entitled to be classified in one list according to merit, would be incompatible with this condition which you, in common with Her Majesty's Government, regard as indispensable.

8. But it is not the European element alone which requires to be maintained. It is also indispensable, if the people are to be kept contented, and if large and important classes are not to be alienated from our rule, that a reasonable proportion of the higher offices should be filled by Muhammadans, Sikhs, and others, who have evinced a large capacity for the practical work of administration, but little or no aptitude for passing examinations with success. Sir D. Fitzpatrick remarks that "if absolutely open competition would result," as he evidently thinks it must, "in setting one of two great hostile parties above the other, we must either have some sort of limited competition, or give up competition altogether." And his apprehensions are fully borne out by experience in Bengal, where, as shown in paragraph 15 of the letter under reply, it was found that the system of recruiting for the subordinate executive service by competition had absolutely excluded Muhammadans and Natives of Behar and of Orissa, and would speedily, if persisted in, have resulted in the entire service being given over to Bengali Hindus. From the enclosures contained in your letter under reply and from your letter of the 24th January 1894, it appears that the class of Natives of India who usually enter the Civil Service by competition are not considered suitable for service in Burma, the Punjab, the North-West Provinces, Oudh, or Sindh, and that the number of such Natives allotted to the province of Bengal, has already approached a point beyond which it is thought unwise to allow it to go. So long as these conditions remain, it must be apparent that serious difficulties might be caused by the influx into the service of a large number of Natives recruited by competitive examination whether in England or India.

9. One of the most valuable features of the existing system is that a superior Provincial Service has been constituted for each province, comprising both the appointments newly "listed" (or which may hereafter be listed) as open to

others than Indian civilians, and the higher posts in the judicial and executive departments of the old uncovenanted service. The object of this measure was to raise the status and tone of the old Uncovenanted Service by forming a superior service of considerable dignity, and by holding out to all members of that service who distinguish themselves by their ability and trustworthiness the prospect of promotion to posts ordinarily held by members of the Imperial Service. I attach very great importance to this consideration, and, even if these meritorious officers could equitably be deprived of the new prospects which have been unfolded before them, I should be most reluctant to sanction any step which would relegate them to their former position. The Provincial Service, as now constituted, includes, besides a large number of lucrative and responsible appointments of a miscellaneous character, 1,827 posts, which involve the exercise of high judicial, magisterial, or executive functions, and carry salaries ranging from 200 to 1,000 rupees per mensem. To these the 93 posts already "listed," rising in pay to 2,000 rupees a month, will be added at the earliest moment compatible with due regard to the vested interests or reasonable expectations of others. Moreover, the dignity of the new Provincial Services has been distinctly enhanced by their separation from the subordinate services, which include, over and above the entire ministerial staff of the different Government offices and a large variety of miscellaneous posts, upwards of 1,900 appointments, also involving judicial or executive powers, and carrying salaries of from 100 to 250 rupees per mensem. Both these divisions of the old Uncovenanted Service are manned almost entirely by Natives of India, and upon them devolves the bulk of the judicial and executive business of the country, the Imperial Service being restricted to the smallest number possible, and reserved for the superintendence of the administration, for the supervision of districts, and for such other work as must, as a rule, be discharged by European officers. It is evident that the prospect of rising by merit from the subordinate to the provincial division of the old Uncovenanted Service, and in the latter to the "listed" posts, must have the best effect on the tone of the entire staff, as well as on the quality of the recruits who join either of the two divisions. Sir Antony MacDonnell considers that this hope "has raised new aspirations and inspired new energy into the great body of Indian Native officials." "There has now," he says, "been infused throughout the provincial service, from the lowest grade to the highest, an improved tone and a higher sense of dignity and responsibility, which will continue to increase as the number of listed posts increases"; and in his opinion "it would be a public calamity if this improved tone in the administration were to be destroyed." Other Local Governments bear testimony to the same effect, and their reports leave no room for doubt that the Provincial Services, as now improved, hold out advantages sufficient to attract the best recruits that India can supply.

10. In paragraph 18 of your letter your Government thus summarise the reasons which have induced them to dissent from the proposal to establish a simultaneous examination in India:—

- "(1) No such concession is necessary for the fulfilment of the so-called pledges upon which the claim has been founded.
- "(2) The practical difficulties of introducing a system of simultaneous examinations would be extremely serious.
- "(3) It is conceded that, in order to ensure the efficient government of the country, a minimum of European officials is indispensable. Such a minimum could not be maintained in the event of simultaneous examination being resorted to in this country.
- "(4) It would be entirely out of the question to reduce the existing minimum of Europeans at the present time.
- "(5) Open competition is not the best way of selecting Natives of the higher ranks of the service. It may be necessary in Europe in order to check nepotism, but in this case nepotism is impossible. Probation by actual employment forms a competitive examination of the best kind. Competitive examination in India would certainly have the effect of admitting a large number of competitors deficient in the qualifications necessary for the higher ranks of the service;

and whose antecedents and origin would not be such as to command the confidence or the good-will of the classes for whose welfare they would be responsible; on the other hand, it would exclude the most valuable and capable assistance which the British Government could obtain from Natives of India, in the Sikhs, Muhammadans, and other races accustomed to rule and possessing exceptional strength of character, but deficient in literary education.

- (6) The proposed change would, unless the irreducible minimum of Europeans is to be diminished, involve the withdrawal of the appointments recently given, after the fullest consideration, to the Provincial Service, and would thus deprive that Service of the prizes promised to it, disappointing its hopes and lowering its efficiency by a sense of injustice."

11. Her Majesty's Government are most anxious that the Natives of the country should enjoy every facility, compatible with the maintenance of the efficiency of the administration and the safety of British rule, to enter the public service of India, and they have reconsidered the whole subject with a sincere desire to give full weight to the arguments in favour of a system of simultaneous examinations; but they have arrived at the conclusion that there are insuperable objections to the establishment of that system, and that by far the best method of meeting the legitimate claims and aspirations of the Natives of the country is to bestow such of the higher posts as can be made available for them on those who distinguish themselves by their capacity and trustworthiness in the performance of subordinate duties.

12. Upon a careful review of the whole question, Her Majesty's Government agree with your Government that the system lately established is based on just and wise principles, and they are of opinion that, subject to such alterations in detail as experience may prove to be necessary, it should be maintained.

I have the honour to be,

My Lord,

Your Lordship's most obedient, humble Servant,

HENRY H. FOWLER.

No./027.

COPY forwarded to the *Government of Madras* with reference to *the letter from that Government No. 33, dated 7 September 1893.*

By order,

HOME DEPARTMENT,

(PUBLIC);

Simla, the 11th June 1894.

L. M. Thornton

Offg. Depy. Secy. to the Govt. of India.

Public Dept

6P

The Govt of India
Home Dept (Ptd)
Simla

N^o 1027

27 June 1894 N^o 467
order
Recorded in conf: of

P.O. 7 7. 9. 93. N^o 732.A/733

C.S.
19. VI.

21/6/94

Dated 11th
Recd 17th
Regd 18th } June 1894
encls. 7. S.C. of this current.

Note

G.O. 7. 9. 93 N^o 732.A-733 which has
been hitherto been treated as conf. will now be
sent out into the General records.

Subject

Simultaneous Examination
in England + India for the
Indian Civil Service :-

Forwarding, with reference to
his Govt. letter of 7th Sep 1893 N^o 733,
despatch from the Secretary of State
declining, from reasons stated therein,
to give effect to the Resolution of
the House of Commons upon the holding
of _____.

presented to S.A.
14/7
27/6.

ORDINARY, MS.

Pub DEPARTMENT.
G.O., DATED 27th June 1894
No. 467

INDEXED.

When given for copying.

[Despatch Abstract.]

According despatch from
Secretary of State
letter from the Govt
India reporting as to
mode in which and
conditions and limitations
under which it would
be possible to give effect
to the resolution of the
House of Commons upon
holding of Simultaneous
elections in England &c.
for the Indian
Civil Service

J. G. 1220-21/96
400 309/900

74

BACK PAPER, No.

FURTHER PAPER, No.

of 189

READ AGAIN ORDER OF GOVERNMENT, DATED
189 , No. , MISCELLANEOUS.

ENCLOSURES.

CURRENT No.

STATEMENT WITH DETO.

ORDER OF GOVERNMENT

A A

LETTER OF GOVERNMENT.

STATEMENT WITH DETO.

PAPER NOT FILED UP, BEING MEANT FOR DESPATCH
IN ORIGINAL (not pagged).

N.B.—

- A — Copy in full.
- B — Not to be copied.
- P — Copy abstract only.
- Q — Copy has ding only.

2

No. 467, PUBLIC, 27TH JUNE 1894.
GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS.
PUBLIC DEPARTMENT.

READ—the following paper :—

Despatch—from His Majesty's Secretary of State for India.

To—His Excellency the Right Honourable the Governor-General of India in Council.

Dated—India Office, London, the 19th April 1894.

No.—37, Public.

I have considered in Council the letter from your Government, No. 62, Public, dated 1st November 1893, reporting, in accordance with my predecessor's instructions, as to the mode in which, and the conditions and limitations under which, it would be possible to give effect to the Resolution of the House of Commons, upon the holding of simultaneous examinations in England and in India for the Indian Civil Service. This question, which your Government had regarded as set at rest by the report made by the Public Service Commission in December 1887, and by the constitution of the new Provincial Services in pursuance of that Commission's recommendations, has now been very fully and carefully discussed afresh, both by the Local Governments and in your letter under reply.

2. In 1870, by the Statute 33 Vict., Cap. 3, section 6, it was provided that, subject to such rules as might be made with the sanction of the Secretary of State, Natives of India might be appointed to any of the offices reserved under the Act of 1861 for members of the Civil Service. The object of this provision was, at the time of its enactment, declared to be to facilitate the appointment of Natives of India of proved merit and ability to any high public employment for which they might be fitted by their qualifications. The Act in fact indicated and contained in itself the remedy which Parliament after full deliberation considered most appropriate for any disadvantages entailed on Natives of India by reason of the examinations for entrance into the Civil Service being held only in London. A prolonged inquiry ensued as to the best mode of applying the remedy thus devised, and it was not until 1879 that rules were promulgated, inaugurating what has been popularly known as the Statutory service. The appointments made under those rules failed to give satisfaction, and in 1886 a Commission of fifteen members was directed to investigate the whole subject. One of the principal issues referred to this Commission was whether there should be an examination in India similar to that held annually in London, and a large number of witnesses were examined regarding the advantages and disadvantages of introducing such a system. On a full consideration of all the evidence the Commission, which contained six Native members, came unanimously to the conclusion that "it is inexpedient to hold an examination in India for the Covenanted Civil Service simultaneously with the examination in London." Three of the Native members did not altogether accept the reasons which had led their colleagues to this conclusion, but they nevertheless concurred in the report, because they considered that the general scheme which had been recommended was "well calculated to secure the end which they had in view."

3. To the general scheme thus unanimously recommended substantial effect has now been given, although not in the precise shape formulated by the Commissioners. It has been deemed preferable to adhere to the procedure laid down in the Act of 1870, and to provide by means of rules that, at the discretion of the Local Government, any particular proportion or number of any of the offices reserved for the Civil Service may be entered in a list as open to the newly-created Provincial Service. Accordingly such a list has been prepared for each Province, and rules have been framed and issued under the sanction of the Secretary of State, by which the Local Governments are empowered to bestow any of the reserved posts so "listed" upon Natives of India being members of the Provincial Service. And not only has this power been conferred, steps have been taken by which the Local Governments will be obliged to fill one-sixth of the reserved offices by members of the Provincial Service, when the claims of the Natives holding appointments under the Statutory Rules of 1879 have been satisfied. The number of officers annually recruited in England by examination has for several years been reduced by one-sixth, and will only suffice to fill five-sixths of the reserved appointments.

4. As is pointed out in the letter under reply, the present lists of appointments for which officers promoted from the newly organised Provincial Service are eligible have been prepared with reference only to proximate possibilities, and do not include more posts than those which the Local Governments expect to find provincial candidates qualified to occupy as soon as such posts become available. The Indian Civil Service contains 898 posts, of which 74 are in special or technical departments not concerned with the general administration of the country. In most of these departments—the chief exception being the Political Department, which deals with Native States and frontier tribes—the number of Covenanted Civilians is small, and of the remaining 824 posts all are not held by Covenanted Civilians. The lists already published of posts tenable by officers promoted from the Provincial Service contain 93, or over 15 per cent. of the 612 offices, for which alone provincial officers can at present be regarded as ordinarily qualified. In arriving at this number, the provinces of Burma and Assam are excluded from consideration, as also are the posts in the Punjab Commission reserved for military officers, and those high offices specified in paragraph 4 of your memorandum, but it is understood that, in the event of any provincial officer being found qualified for one of these higher offices, it is your intention to proceed under the special provisions of section 3 of the Statute of 1861. A full one-sixth of 612 posts would give only a slightly larger percentage (16.66) than that already conceded. In these calculations no account is taken of such Natives of India as may succeed at the open competition in England; and it should be remembered that in 1884 Lord Ripon's Government wrote that, as the proportion of Natives admitted under the Statutory Rules was one-sixth of the whole recruitment of the year, and as a certain number do from time to time obtain appointments through the open competition, "in fixing a percentage of the whole recruitment to be at once reserved for Natives we feel bound to recognise the effect of this double mode of admission, and, on a scrutiny of the results of past years, we think that this percentage may fairly be taken at 18 per cent."

5. The necessity for maintaining an adequate proportion of Europeans in the service is so generally admitted that it is unnecessary for me to dwell on the arguments on which that policy is founded. I will only refer to the fact that, as is pointed out by the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab, a European officer stands clear of all the sects and disputes, whether religious or not, which form a prominent feature in Indian life; and thus holds a position of complete and acknowledged impartiality as between different classes of Natives, to which few, if any, Natives of India can attain. Your Government and almost all the Local Governments are decidedly of opinion that the limit of one-sixth must be maintained for many years to come; the only exception is the Madras Government, who have expressed the view that that Presidency could be efficiently administered if two-thirds of the Civil servants attached to it

were Europeans. You are also of opinion that "the proportion of Natives of India who succeed in entering the service by competition at the London examination requires to be closely watched; and that it may become necessary hereafter to restrict the total proportion of Indians in the Service, as Lord Ripon's Government proposed, to 18 per cent. or some similar figure." It is not, however, necessary at present to discuss this question. I entirely agree with your Government in regarding the maintenance of the Indian Civil Service in the highest efficiency attainable as a matter of supreme importance. This has been well shown in the following passage, with which the introductory portion of the letter under reply concludes:—

"Deducting the 93 posts assigned to the Provincial Service, the cadre of posts at present reserved for covenanted and military officers is 731. These are the officers on whose administrative capacity and fitness for rule depends the quiet and orderly government of 217½ millions of people, inhabiting 943,000 square miles of territory. This bare statement of figures should, we think, be sufficient to convince any impartial mind of the supreme importance of obtaining the best material, in the best way, for the arduous duties which these officers have to perform. They represent the British Government in India; in the eyes of the people they are the British Government; it is to their personal influence, their impartiality, justice and efficiency, their physical and moral fitness, that the due administration of the Empire is entrusted; upon them, and not immediately upon military force, our strength rests; any weakening of their influence or deterioration in their efficiency would imply a relaxation of the restraints of Government, and a reversion *pro tanto* to the conditions from which the country emerged only when it came into British possession."

6. Another of the recommendations unanimously accepted by the Public Service Commission was that the limits of age prescribed for candidates at the London competition should be raised from 17 as a minimum to 19, and from 21 as a maximum to 23. This proposal was made in the interests of Native candidates, and in consideration of the evidence adduced that Natives of India were placed at a disadvantage, in competing with Europeans, by the lower limits. Full effect has been given to this recommendation.

7. On the whole I am convinced that the new rules framed under the Statute of 1870 retain all the important features of the scheme which, after full investigation, was accepted by the Public Service Commission as satisfying all the legitimate aspirations of the Natives of India. I have already intimated the opinion of Her Majesty's Government that an adequate proportion of the members of the Indian Civil Service must always be Europeans; and I agree in your Government's conclusion that any system of simultaneous examinations, identical in their nature, at which all who compete would be entitled to be classified in one list according to merit, would be incompatible with this condition which you, in common with Her Majesty's Government, regard as indispensable.

8. But it is not the European element alone which requires to be maintained. It is also indispensable, if the people are to be kept contented, and if large and important classes are not to be alienated from our rule, that a reasonable proportion of the higher offices should be filled by Muhammadans, Sikhs, and others, who have evinced a large capacity for the practical work of administration, but little or no aptitude for passing examinations with success. Sir D. Fitzpatrick remarks that "if absolutely open competition would result," as he evidently thinks it must, "in setting one of two great hostile parties above the other, we must either have some sort of limited competition, or give up competition altogether." And his apprehensions are fully borne out by experience in Bengal, where, as shown in paragraph 15 of the letter under reply, it was found that the system of recruiting for the subordinate executive service by competition had absolutely excluded Muhammadans and Natives of Behar and of Orissa, and would speedily, if persisted in, have resulted in the entire service being given over to Bengali Hindus. From the enclosures contained in your letter under reply and from your letter of the 24th January 1894, it appears that the class of Natives of India who usually enter the Civil Service by competition are not considered suitable for service in Burma, the Punjab, the North-West Provinces, Oudh, or Sindh, and that the

number of such Natives allotted to the province of Bengal has already approached a point beyond which it is thought unwise to allow it to go. So long as these conditions remain, it must be apparent that serious difficulties might be caused by the influx into the service of a large number of Natives recruited by competitive examination whether in England or India.

9. One of the most valuable features of the existing system is that a superior Provincial Service has been constituted for each province, comprising both the appointments newly "listed" (or which may hereafter be listed) as open to others than Indian civilians, and the higher posts in the judicial and executive departments of the old Uncovenanted Service. The object of this measure was to raise the status and tone of the old Uncovenanted Service by forming a superior service of considerable dignity, and by holding out to all members of that service who distinguish themselves by their ability and trustworthiness the prospect of promotion to posts ordinarily held by members of the Imperial Service. I attach very great importance to this consideration, and, even if these meritorious officers could equitably be deprived of the new prospects which have been unfolded before them, I should be most reluctant to sanction any step which would relegate them to their former position. The Provincial Service, as now constituted, includes, besides a large number of lucrative and responsible appointments of a miscellaneous character, 1,827 posts, which involve the exercise of high judicial, magisterial, or executive functions, and carry salaries ranging from Rs. 200 to Rs. 1,000 *per mensem*. To these the 93 posts already "listed," rising in pay to Rs. 2,000 a month, will be added at the earliest moment compatible with due regard to the vested interests or reasonable expectations of others. Moreover, the dignity of the new Provincial Services has been distinctly enhanced by their separation from the subordinate services, which include, over and above the entire ministerial staff of the different Government offices and a large variety of miscellaneous posts, upwards of 1,900 appointments, also involving judicial or executive powers, and carrying salaries of from Rs. 100 to Rs. 250 *per mensem*. Both these divisions of the old Uncovenanted Service are manned almost entirely by Natives of India, and upon them devolves the bulk of the judicial and executive business of the country, the Imperial Service being restricted to the smallest number possible, and reserved for the superintendence of the administration, for the supervision of districts, and for such other work as must, as a rule, be discharged by European officers. It is evident that the prospect of rising by merit from the subordinate to the provincial division of the old Uncovenanted Service, and in the latter to the "listed" posts, must have the best effect on the tone of the entire staff, as well as on the quality of the recruits who join either of the two divisions. Sir Antony MacDonnell considers that this hope "has raised new aspirations and inspired new energy into the great body of Indian Native officials. "There has now," he says, "been infused throughout the Provincial Service, from the lowest grade to the highest, an improved tone and a higher sense of dignity and responsibility, which will continue to increase as the number of listed posts increases"; and in his opinion "it would be a public calamity if this improved tone in the administration were to be destroyed." Other Local Governments bear testimony to the same effect, and their reports leave no room for doubt that the Provincial Services, as now improved, hold out advantages sufficient to attract the best recruits that India can supply.

10. In paragraph 18 of your letter your Government thus summarise the reasons which have induced them to dissent from the proposal to establish a simultaneous examination in India:—

"(1) No such concession is necessary for the fulfilment of the so-called pledges upon which the claim has been founded.

"(2) The practical difficulties of introducing a system of simultaneous examinations would be extremely serious.

"(3) It is conceded that, in order to ensure the efficient government of the country, a minimum of European officials is indispensable. Such a minimum could not be maintained in the event of simultaneous examination being resorted to in this country.

"(4) It would be entirely out of the question to reduce the existing minimum of Europeans at the present time.

"(5) Open competition is not the best way of selecting Natives of the higher ranks of the service. It may be necessary in Europe in order to check nepotism, but in this case nepotism is impossible. Probation by actual employment forms a competitive examination of the best kind. Competitive examination in India would certainly have the effect of admitting a large number of competitors deficient in the qualifications necessary for the higher ranks of the service; and whose antecedents and origin would not be such as to command the confidence or the good-will of the classes for whose welfare they would be responsible; on the other hand, it would exclude the most valuable and capable assistance which the British Government could obtain from Natives of India, in the Sikhs, Muhammadans, and other races accustomed to rule and possessing exceptional strength of character, but deficient in literary education.

"(6) The proposed change would, unless the irreducible minimum of Europeans is to be diminished, involve the withdrawal of the appointments recently given, after the fullest consideration, to the Provincial Service, and would thus deprive that Service of the prizes promised to it, disappointing its hopes and lowering its efficiency by a sense of injustice."

11. Her Majesty's Government are most anxious that the Natives of the country should enjoy every facility, compatible with the maintenance of the efficiency of the administration and the safety of British rule, to enter the public service of India, and they have reconsidered the whole subject with a sincere desire to give full weight to the arguments in favour of a system of simultaneous examinations; but they have arrived at the conclusion that there are insuperable objections to the establishment of that system, and that by far the best method of meeting the legitimate claims and aspirations of the Natives of the country is to bestow such of the higher posts as can be made available for them on those who distinguish themselves by their capacity and trustworthiness in the performance of subordinate duties.

12. Upon a careful review of the whole question, Her Majesty's Government agree with your Government that the system lately established is based on just and wise principles, and they are of opinion that, subject to such alterations in detail as experience may prove to be necessary, it should be maintained.

No. 1027.

Copy forwarded to the Government of Madras, with reference to the letter from that Government, No. 733, dated 7th September 1893.

(By order.)

HOME DEPARTMENT (PUBLIC)
Simla, the 11th June 1894.

L. M. THORNTON,
Offg. Depy. Secy. to the Govt. of India.

Order—No. 467, Public, dated 27th June 1894.

Recorded in continuation of G.O. Nos. 732-A, 733, dated 7th September 1893.
(True Extract.)

J. F. PAION,
Chief Secretary.

G.O. No. 467, 27th June 1894.

Simultaneous Examination in England and in India for the Indian Civil Service.

Recording despatch from the Secretary of State on letter from the Government of India reporting as to the mode in which and the conditions and limitations under which it would be possible to give effect to the resolution of the House of Commons upon the holding of —.

Returned for signature.

Form of return
required

Letter only

Order complete with Letter.

Despatched in Print

Despatch No. C. O. No.

DATE

Country No.

Enclosure to C. No.

Order of Government.

Letter of Government.

Statement with ditto.

Pay-ee not filled up, please insert for signature

A = Print in full.
B = Not to be printed.
C = Print abstract only.
D = Print heading only.

~~Press~~
Miscellaneous No. _____ dated _____ 189
~~Routine~~

offices reserved for the Civil Service may be entered in a list as open to newly created Provincial Service. Accordingly such a list has been prepared for each Province, and rules have been framed and issued under the sanction of the Secretary of State, by which the Local Governments are empowered to bestow any of the reserved posts so "listed" upon Natives of India, being members of the Provincial Service. And not only has this power been conferred; steps have been taken by which the Local Governments will be obliged to fill one-sixth of the reserved offices by members of the Provincial Service, when the claims of the Natives holding appointments under the Statutory Rules of 1879 have been satisfied. The number of officers annually recruited in England by examination has for several years been reduced by one-sixth, and will only suffice to fill five-sixths of the reserved appointments.

4. As is pointed out in the letter under reply, the present lists of appointments for which officers promoted from the newly organised Provincial Service are eligible have been prepared with reference only to proximate possibilities, and do not include more posts than those which the Local Governments expect to find provincial candidates qualified to occupy as soon as such posts become available. The Indian Civil Service contains 898 posts, of which 74 are in special or technical departments not concerned with the general administration of the country. In most of these departments—the chief exception being the Political Department, which deals with Native States and frontier tribes—the number of Covenanted Civilians is small, and of the remaining 824 posts all are not held by Covenanted Civilians. The lists already published of posts tenable by officers promoted from the Provincial Service contain 93, or over 15 per cent., of the 612 offices, for which alone provincial officers can at present be regarded as ordinarily qualified. In arriving at this number, the provinces of Burma and Assam are excluded from consideration, as also are the posts in the Punjab Commission reserved for military officers, and those high offices specified in paragraph 4 of your memorandum, but it is understood that, in the event of any provincial officer being found qualified for one of these higher offices, it is your intention to proceed under the special provisions of section 3 of the Statute of 1861. A full one-sixth of 612 posts would give only a slightly larger percentage (16·66) than that already conceded. In these calculations no account is taken of such Natives of India as may succeed at the open competition in England; and it should be remembered that in 1884 Lord Ripon's Government wrote that, as the proportion of Natives admitted under the Statutory Rules was one-sixth of the whole recruitment of the year, and as a certain number do from time to time obtain appointments through the open competition, "in fixing a percentage of the whole recruitment to be at once reserved for Natives we feel bound to recognise the effect of this double mode of admission, and, on a scrutiny of the results of past years, we think that this percentage may fairly be taken at 18 per cent."

5. The necessity for maintaining an adequate proportion of Europeans in the service is so generally admitted that it is unnecessary for me to dwell on the arguments on which that policy is founded. I will only refer to the fact that, as is pointed out by the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab, a European officer stands clear of all the sects and disputes, whether religious or not, which form a prominent feature in Indian life; and thus holds a position of complete and acknowledged impartiality as between different classes of Natives, to which few, if any, Natives of India can attain. Your Government and almost all the Local Governments are decidedly of opinion that the limit of one-sixth must be maintained for many years to come; the only exception is the Madras Government, who have expressed the view that that Presidency could be efficiently administered if two-thirds of the Civil servants attached to it were Europeans. You are also of opinion that "the proportion of Natives of India who succeed in entering the Service by competition at the London examination requires to be closely watched; and that it may become necessary hereafter to restrict the total proportion of Indians in the Service, as Lord Ripon's Government proposed, to 18 per cent. or some similar figure." It is not, however, necessary at present to discuss this question. I entirely agree with your Government in regarding the maintenance of the Indian Civil Service in the highest efficiency attainable as a matter of supreme importance. This has been well shown

311

3

India Office,

London, 19th April 1894.

Public,
No. 37.To His Excellency the Right Honourable the Governor General
of India in Council.

MY LORD,

I HAVE considered in Council the letter from your Government, No. 62, Public, dated 1st November 1893, reporting, in accordance with my predecessor's instructions, as to the mode in which, and the conditions and limitations under which, it would be possible to give effect to the Resolution of the House of Commons, upon the holding of simultaneous examinations in England and in India for the Indian Civil Service. This question, which your Government had regarded as set at rest by the report made by the Public Service Commission in December 1887, and by the constitution of the new provincial services in pursuance of that Commission's recommendations, has now been very fully and carefully discussed afresh, both by the Local Governments and in your letter under reply.

2. In 1870, by the Statute 33 Vict., Cap. 3, section 6, it was provided that, subject to such rules as might be made with the sanction of the Secretary of State, Natives of India might be appointed to any of the offices reserved under the Act of 1861 for members of the Civil Service. The object of this provision was, at the time of its enactment, declared to be to facilitate the appointment of Natives of India of proved merit and ability to any high public employment for which they might be fitted by their qualifications. The Act in fact indicated and contained in itself the remedy which Parliament after full deliberation considered most appropriate for any disadvantages entailed on Natives of India by reason of the examinations for entrance into the Civil Service being held only in London. A prolonged inquiry ensued as to the best mode of applying the remedy thus devised, and it was not until 1879 that rules were promulgated, inaugurating what has been popularly known as the Statutory Service. The appointments made under those rules failed to give satisfaction, and in 1886 a Commission of 15 members was directed to investigate the whole subject. One of the principal issues referred to this Commission was whether there should be an examination in India similar to that held annually in London, and a large number of witnesses were examined regarding the advantages and disadvantages of introducing such a system. On a full consideration of all the evidence the Commission, which contained six Native members, came unanimously to the conclusion that "it is inexpedient to hold an examination in India for the Covenanted Civil Service simultaneously with the examination in London." Three of the Native members did not altogether accept the reasons which had led their colleagues to this conclusion, but they nevertheless concurred in the report, because they considered that the general scheme which had been recommended was "well calculated to secure the end which they had in view."

3. To the general scheme thus unanimously recommended substantial effect has now been given, although not in the precise shape formulated by the Commissioners. It has been deemed preferable to adhere to the procedure laid down in the Act of 1870, and to provide by means of rules that, at the discretion of the Local Government, any particular proportion or number of any of the

in the following passage, with which the introductory portion of the letter under reply concludes:—

"Deducting the 93 posts assigned to the Provincial Service, the cadre of posts at present reserved for covenanted and military officers is 731. These are the officers on whose administrative capacity and fitness for rule depends the quiet and orderly government of 217½ millions of people, inhabiting 943,000 square miles of territory. This bare statement of figures should, we think, be sufficient to convince any impartial mind of the supreme importance of obtaining the best material, in the best way, for the arduous duties which these officers have to perform. They represent the British Government in India; in the eyes of the people they are the British Government; it is to their personal influence, their impartiality, justice and efficiency, their physical and moral fitness, that the due administration of the Empire is entrusted; upon them, and not immediately upon military force, our strength rests; any weakening of their influence or deterioration in their efficiency would imply a relaxation of the restraints of government, and a reversion *pro tanto* to the conditions from which the country emerged only when it came into British possession."

6. Another of the recommendations unanimously accepted by the Public Service Commission was that the limits of age prescribed for candidates at the London competition should be raised from 17 as a minimum to 19, and from 21 as a maximum to 23. This proposal was made in the interests of Native candidates, and in consideration of the evidence adduced that Natives of India were placed at a disadvantage, in competing with Europeans, by the lower limits. Full effect has been given to this recommendation.

7. On the whole I am convinced that the new rules framed under the Statute of 1870 retain all the important features of the scheme which, after full investigation, was accepted by the Public Service Commission as satisfying all the legitimate aspirations of the Natives of India. I have already intimated the opinion of Her Majesty's Government that an adequate proportion of the members of the Indian Civil Service must always be Europeans; and I agree in your Government's conclusion that any system of simultaneous examinations, identical in their nature, at which all who compete would be entitled to be classified in one list according to merit, would be incompatible with this condition which you, in common with Her Majesty's Government, regard as indispensable.

8. But it is not the European element alone which requires to be maintained. It is also indispensable, if the people are to be kept contented, and if large and important classes are not to be alienated from our rule, that a reasonable proportion of the higher offices should be filled by Muhammadans, Sikhs, and others, who have evinced a large capacity for the practical work of administration, but little or no aptitude for passing examinations with success. Sir D. Fitzpatrick remarks that "if absolutely open competition would result," as he evidently thinks it must, "in setting one of two great hostile parties above the other, we must either have some sort of limited competition, or give up competition altogether." And his apprehensions are fully borne out by experience in Bengal, where, as shown in paragraph 15 of the letter under reply, it was found that the system of recruiting for the subordinate executive service by competition had absolutely excluded Muhammadans and Natives of Behar and of Orissa, and would speedily, if persisted in, have resulted in the entire service being given over to Bengali Hindus. From the enclosures contained in your letter under reply and from your letter of the 24th January 1894, it appears that the class of Natives of India who usually enter the Civil Service by competition are not considered suitable for service in Burma, the Punjab, the North-West Provinces, Oudh, or Sindh, and that the number of such Natives allotted to the province of Bengal, has already approached a point beyond which it is thought unwise to allow it to go. So long as these conditions remain, it must be apparent that serious difficulties might be caused by the influx into the service of a large number of Natives recruited by competitive examination whether in England or India.

9. One of the most valuable features of the existing system is that a superior Provincial Service has been constituted for each province, comprising both the appointments newly "listed" (or which may hereafter be listed) as open to

others than Indian civilians, and the higher posts in the judicial and executive departments of the old uncovenanted service. The object of this measure was to raise the status and tone of the old Uncovenanted Service by forming a superior service of considerable dignity, and by holding out to all members of that service who distinguish themselves by their ability and trustworthiness the prospect of promotion to posts ordinarily held by members of the Imperial Service. I attach very great importance to this consideration, and, even if these meritorious officers could equitably be deprived of the new prospects which have been unfolded before them, I should be most reluctant to sanction any step which would relegate them to their former position. The Provincial Service, as now constituted, includes, besides a large number of lucrative and responsible appointments of a miscellaneous character, 1,827 posts, which involve the exercise of high judicial, magisterial, or executive functions, and carry salaries ranging from 200 to 1,000 rupees per mensem. To these the 93 posts already "listed," rising in pay to 2,000 rupees a month, will be added at the earliest moment compatible with due regard to the vested interests or reasonable expectations of others. Moreover, the dignity of the new Provincial Services has been distinctly enhanced by their separation from the subordinate services, which include, over and above the entire ministerial staff of the different Government offices and a large variety of miscellaneous posts, upwards of 1,900 appointments, also involving judicial or executive powers, and carrying salaries of from 100 to 250 rupees per mensem. Both these divisions of the old Uncovenanted Service are manned almost entirely by Natives of India, and upon them devolves the bulk of the judicial and executive business of the country, the Imperial Service being restricted to the smallest number possible, and reserved for the superintendence of the administration, for the supervision of districts, and for such other work as must, as a rule, be discharged by European officers. It is evident that the prospect of rising by merit from the subordinate to the provincial division of the old Uncovenanted Service, and in the latter to the "listed" posts, must have the best effect on the tone of the entire staff, as well as on the quality of the recruits who join either of the two divisions. Sir Antony MacDonnell considers that this hope "has raised new aspirations and inspired new energy into the great body of Indian Native officials." "There has now," he says, "been infused throughout the provincial service, from the lowest grade to the highest, an improved tone and a higher sense of dignity and responsibility, which will continue to increase as the number of listed posts increases"; and in his opinion "it would be a public calamity if this improved tone in the administration were to be destroyed." Other Local Governments bear testimony to the same effect, and their reports leave no room for doubt that the Provincial Services, as now improved, hold out advantages sufficient to attract the best recruits that India can supply.

10. In paragraph 18 of your letter your Government thus summarise the reasons which have induced them to dissent from the proposal to establish a simultaneous examination in India:—

- "(1) No such concession is necessary for the fulfilment of the so-called pledges upon which the claim has been founded.
- "(2) The practical difficulties of introducing a system of simultaneous examinations would be extremely serious.
- "(3) It is conceded that, in order to ensure the efficient government of the country, a minimum of European officials is indispensable. Such a minimum could not be maintained in the event of simultaneous examination being resorted to in this country.
- "(4) It would be entirely out of the question to reduce the existing minimum of Europeans at the present time.
- "(5) Open competition is not the best way of selecting Natives of the higher ranks of the service. It may be necessary in Europe in order to check nepotism, but in this case nepotism is impossible. Probation by actual employment forms a competitive examination of the best kind. Competitive examination in India would certainly have the effect of admitting a large number of competitors deficient in the qualifications necessary for the higher ranks of the service;

and whose antecedents and origin would not be such as to command the confidence or the good-will of the classes for whose welfare they would be responsible; on the other hand, it would exclude the most valuable and capable assistance which the British Government could obtain from Natives of India, in the Sikhs, Muhammadans, and other races accustomed to rule and possessing exceptional strength of character, but deficient in literary education.

- (6) The proposed change would, unless the irreducible minimum of Europeans is to be diminished, involve the withdrawal of the appointments recently given, after the fullest consideration, to the Provincial Service, and would thus deprive that Service of the prizes promised to it, disappointing its hopes and lowering its efficiency by a sense of injustice."

11. Her Majesty's Government are most anxious that the Natives of the country should enjoy every facility, compatible with the maintenance of the efficiency of the administration and the safety of British rule, to enter the public service of India, and they have reconsidered the whole subject with a sincere desire to give full weight to the arguments in favour of a system of simultaneous examinations; but they have arrived at the conclusion that there are insuperable objections to the establishment of that system, and that by far the best method of meeting the legitimate claims and aspirations of the Natives of the country is to bestow such of the higher posts as can be made available for them on those who distinguish themselves by their capacity and trustworthiness in the performance of subordinate duties.

12. Upon a careful review of the whole question, Her Majesty's Government agree with your Government that the system lately established is based on just and wise principles, and they are of opinion that, subject to such alterations in detail as experience may prove to be necessary, it should be maintained.

I have the honour to be,

My Lord,

Your Lordship's most obedient, humble Servant,

HENRY H. FOWLER.

No. . .

COPY forwarded to the
with reference to

By order,

L. M. THORNTON,

HOME DEPARTMENT,
(PUBLIC);
Simla, the June 1894.

Offg. Depy. Secy. to the Govt. of India.