

(1) Number of pages 22(2) Date of report 1/10/1919

(3) Initials of the Referencer _____

MADRAS RECORD OFFICE.

Government of Madras.

DEPARTMENT

CO. No.	File No.
Date	1/10/1919

Not to be folded or roughly handled

1

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS.
PENSION DEPARTMENT.

25th April 1878, No. 138.

Service Books.

Read the following papers :—

From Major L. CONWAY-GORDON, R.E., Examiner of Public Works Accounts, to the Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, dated Chempak, 9th March 1878, No. 224-W.

I have the honor to request an expression of the opinion of Government as to the nature of the entries to be made in Column 8 of the Service Books prescribed in Section 72 of the Civil Pension Code to be maintained by all the non-gazetted officers in Government employ.

2. From the last sentence of paragraph 3 of Section 72 of the Civil Pension Code, which runs as follows:—"No entries need be made in Column 8 except when there is anything especially good or bad to be recorded"—I gather that the entries in this column are to be exceptional and to be limited to such brief remarks as will enable Government, when finally granting the pension, to decide under Section 68 of the Code whether the full pension or gratuity is to be given. That is, that the entries in Column 8 are to be made with strict reference to the object for which the Service Book itself is maintained, *i.e.*, to decide whether claims for pension are admissible or not.

3. From the Service Books I have seen that are maintained in the Public Works Department, I have come to the conclusion that the general impression throughout the department is that Column 8 is intended to serve as a record of every conduct certificate, whether especially good or bad, or not, that may be given to a non-gazetted officer by any of his immediate superiors.

At any rate, as a matter of fact, the Service Books in the Public Works Department are generally cumbered up with certificates of no practical value whatever in deciding claims for pension, and which, for all the useful purpose they otherwise serve, might perhaps with advantage never have been written.

4. But if Government is of opinion that such certificates of conduct should be given by officers and should be recorded in this official and permanent form, I would suggest that some precautions be taken to insure these certificates being given only after a careful consideration of the facts of the case, that they should be made only in the presence of the officer concerned, and if animadverting on the officers' conduct, that they should be subject to some appeal or investigation by higher authority. I further think that they should not be made at all except by officers of the Engineer Establishment, or by officers ranking as such.

5. My object in making these suggestions is to avoid the violent fluctuations of opinion, with regard to the conduct of a Government servant, such for example, as are recorded in the accompanying Service Book of one of the Accountants now employed in this office. Between two excellent certificates, Government will observe sandwiched a statement of utter incompetency.

6. In this case, the entry condemnatory of conduct was made by an officer of the upper subordinate establishment with regard to an Accountant, who in the department also ranks as an upper subordinate, and I hardly think that the mere fact of the peculiar system obtaining in this Presidency under which an upper subordinate of

the Executive Branch often holds charge of a division justifies a system under which such sweeping condemnations can be passed subject apparently to no appeal.

7. The Accountant has twice applied officially to me either to have the entry reversed or the matter investigated. I have investigated the matter sufficiently to satisfy myself that the case is one of those unfortunate ones in which two people, both excellent in their way, are brought together who do not suit, and that in this particular case the misfortune was much aggravated by neither of the parties concerned having the tolerant self-command, which a good education alone can bestow.

8. Personally, from my knowledge of the Accountant's work, I quite agree with the opinions expressed by _____ and _____. I cannot of course object to the formation of any opinion to the contrary by _____, but I do object to the official expression by upper subordinates to upper subordinates of such sweeping censure, without apparently there being any appeal. I wish in fact, if certificates of conduct are to be entered in the Service Book at all, that the entries made should be fenced round by all the precautions thought necessary with regard to entries in the defaulter's books.—See P. W. Code IV. I. 24.

No. 1241.

Transferred to the Financial Department.

(Signed) E. A. FOORD, Colonel, R.E.,
Secretary to Government, P.W.D.

12th March 1878.

No. 453.

Referred to the Accountant-General for his opinion.

Fort St. George, (Signed) D. F. CARMICHAEL,
15th March 1878. Chief Secretary.

From L. C. PROBYN, Esq., Accountant-General, to the Chief Secretary to Government, dated Fort St. George, 20th March 1878, No. 1606.

Audit Department.

With reference to the letter from the Examiner of Public Works Accounts, No. 224-W, dated 9th instant, referred to me for opinion under your endorsement of the 15th idem, I have the honor to state that Column 8 in the Service Book is often wrongly used for conduct certificates, whereas, in my opinion, it should be strictly reserved for the entry of any breaks, &c., in service with the cause or causes thereof, and for the record of such remarks, either specially good or specially bad, as the head of the office may consider ought to be before the Government when it determines the amount of pension with reference to Section 68 of the Pension Code. Precise rules can scarcely be laid down, but ordinarily a fault would not, under these circumstances, be recorded, unless it were of sufficient gravity to merit severe punishment; while good service would only be stated when it was of sufficient importance to entitle the servant to formal recognition, and when its record might lead to the avoidance of a penalty which might perhaps otherwise be inflicted under Section 68 of the Code.

2. In the particular case which has given rise to this general reference, I can find no trace of actual degradation though Mr. _____ has recorded that fact in the Service Book which, as it stands, seems to me to be open to question.

3. The Examiner's letter and the Service Book which accompanied it are herewith returned.

ORDER THEREON, 25th April 1878, No. 138.

These papers will be communicated to all Departments with the intimation that a Service Book should be a record of facts not of opinions.

2. Entries in Column 8 will in future be made only by the officer empowered to dismiss or appoint the subordinate concerned and will in ordinary course be open to revision by higher authority.

3. The remarks of the Examiner of Public Works Accounts on the entry that has given rise to this reference will be referred for consideration in the Public Works Department.

(True Extract.)

L. A. CAMPBELL,
Under Secy. to Govt.

To the Accountant-General.
„ the Examiner of Public Works Accounts.
„ the Controller of Military Accounts.
„ the Public Works Department.
„ the Military Department.
„ the Revenue do.
„ the Financial do.
„ all Heads of Departments.

Edw. T. O'Connor.

Some Books - Corresponding with the
house, certain papers concerning articles to be
made in the name of Simon Books.

APRIL

622.254.4.1158.10.198

Book 1/2
Book 2/2
Book 3/2

THE ACCOUNTANT-GENERAL

PENSION.

6001 of 1878 31/12/1878

For C. No. 58/4

MEMORANDUM.

REQUESTED for reference the under-mentioned papers :-

The Permer Books forwarded with
Chrgs Endt. No 1248 of 12 March 1878
Recorded in G.O. No 138 of 25th Apr 1878 in Dept

GOVERNMENT OFFICE,
Public Works Department.

10 May 1878.

To

The Registrar of the

Pub. & W. Dept

Registrar.

Audit, DEPARTMENT.

No. 1606

Fort Saint George
Accountant General's Office,
20th March 1878.

FROM THE ACCOUNTANT GENERAL
TO THE GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS,

To THE *Chief Secretary*
to Government
Pension Department.

Sir,

With reference to the letter from the
Examiner of Public Works Accounts &c. dated 9th Instant referred to me for opinion and
your endorsement of the 15th Idem, I have the
honor to state that column 8 in the Service Book
is often wrongly used for conduct certificates
whereas in my opinion it should be strictly
reserved for the entry of any breaks &c. in
service with the cause or causes thereof, and
for the record of such remarks, either specially
good or specially bad, as the head of the office
may consider ought to be before the Govern-
ment when it determines the amount of
pension with reference to section 68 of the
Pension Code. Precise rules can scarcely
be laid down, but ordinarily a fault would
not, under these circumstances, be recorded, unless
it were of sufficient gravity to merit severe
punishment while good service would only
be stated when it was of sufficient importance
to entitle the servant to formal recognition,
and when its record might lead to the award
of a penalty which might perhaps otherwise
be inflicted under section 68 of the Code. In

In the particular case which has
given rise to this general reference I could
find no trace of actual degradation though
Mr. Sub Engineer Ottomaw has recorded
that fact in the Service Book which as it
stands seems to me to be open to question.

The Examiner's letter and the Service
Book which accompanied it are
herewith returned.

I have the honor to be,

Sir
Your most Obedt Servant,

W. B. Rogers

Accountant General.

184

FROM THE EXAMINER, P. W. ACCOUNTS,

MADRAS.

TO THE SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT,

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT,

GENERAL BRANCH.

NO. 224/11.

CHEPAK, 9TH MARCH 1878.

SIR,

I HAVE THE HONOR TO REQUEST AN EXPRESSION OF THE
OPINION OF GOVERNMENT AS TO THE NATURE OF THE ENTRIES TO
BE MADE IN COLUMN 8 OF THE SERVICE BOOKS PRESCRIBED IN
SECTION 72 OF THE CIVIL PENSION CODE TO BE MAINTAINED BY
ALL THE NON-GAZETTED OFFICERS IN GOVERNMENT EMPLOY.

2. FROM THE LAST SENTENCE OF PARAGRAPH 3 OF SECTION 72
OF THE CIVIL PENSION CODE, WHICH RUNS AS FOLLOWS :- 'NO
ENTRIES NEED BE MADE IN COLUMN 8 EXCEPT WHEN THERE IS ANY-
THING ESPECIALLY GOOD OR BAD TO BE RECORDED', I GATHER
THAT THE ENTRIES IN THIS COLUMN ARE TO BE EXCEPTIONAL AND
TO BE LIMITED TO SUCH BRIEF REMARKS AS WILL ENABLE GOVERN-
MENT, WHEN FINALLY GRANTING THE PENSION, TO DECIDE UNDER
SECTION 68 OF THE CODE WHETHER THE FULL PENSION OR GRATUITY
IS TO BE GIVEN. THAT IS, THAT THE ENTRIES IN COLUMN 8 ARE
TO BE MADE WITH STRICT REFERENCE TO THE OBJECT FOR WHICH

11

Handwritten notes and signatures on the left page, including names like 'J. H. ...' and 'J. H. ...'.

THE SERVICE BOOK ITSELF IS MAINTAINED, I.E. TO DECIDE WHETHER CLAIMS FOR PENSION ARE ADMISSIBLE, OR NOT.

3. FROM THE SERVICE BOOKS I HAVE SEEN THAT ARE MAINTAINED IN THE P.W. DEPARTMENT, I HAVE COME TO THE CONCLUSION THAT THE GENERAL IMPRESSION THROUGHOUT THE DEPARTMENT IS THAT COLUMN B IS INTENDED TO SERVE AS A RECORD OF EVERY CONDUCT CERTIFICATE, WHETHER SPECIALLY GOOD OR BAD, OR NOT, THAT MAY BE GIVEN TO A NON-GAULTY OFFICER BY ANY OF HIS IMMEDIATE SUPERIORS.

AT ANY RATE, AS A MATTER OF FACT, THE SERVICE BOOKS IN THE P.W. DEPARTMENT ARE GENERALLY CHARGED WITH CERTIFICATES OF NO PRACTICAL VALUE WHATSOEVER IN RESPECTING CLAIMS FOR PENSION, AND WHICH, FOR ALL THE USEFUL PURPOSE THEY OTHERWISE MIGHT PERHAPS WITH ADVANTAGE NEVER HAVE BEEN WRITTEN.

4. BUT IF GOVERNMENT IS OF OPINION THAT SUCH CERTIFICATES OF CONDUCT SHOULD BE GIVEN BY OFFICERS AND SHOULD BE RECORDED IN THIS OFFICIAL AND PERMANENT FORM, I WOULD SUGGEST THAT SOME PRECAUTIONS BE TAKEN TO INSURE THESE CERTIFICATES BEING GIVEN ONLY AFTER A CAREFUL CONSIDERATION OF THE FACTS OF THE CASE, THAT THEY SHOULD BE MADE ONLY IN THE PRESENCE OF THE OFFICER CONCERNED, AND IN ANIMADVERTING ON THE OFFICER'S CONDUCT, THAT THEY SHOULD BE SUBJECT TO SOME APPEAL OR INVESTIGATION BY HIGHER AUTHORITY. I FURTHER THINK THAT THEY SHOULD NOT BE MADE AT ALL EXCEPT BY OFFICERS OF THE ENGINEER ESTABLISHMENT, OR BY OFFICERS RANKING AS SUCH.

5. MY OBJECT IN MAKING THESE SUGGESTIONS IS TO AVOID THE VICIOUS FLUCTUATIONS OF OPINION, WITH REGARD TO THE

CONDUCT OF A GOVERNMENT SERVANT, SUCH FOR EXAMPLE, AS ARE EXPRESSED IN THE ACCOMPANYING SERVICE BOOK OF ONE OF THE ACCOUNTANTS NOW EMPLOYED IN THIS OFFICE. BETWEEN TWO EXCELLENT CERTIFICATES, GOVERNMENT WILL OBSERVE SANCTIONED A STATEMENT OF UTTER INCOMPETENCY.

6. IN THIS CASE, THE ENTRY CONFIRMATORY OF THE SAME WAS MADE BY AN OFFICER OF THE UPPER SUBORDINATE ESTABLISHMENT WITH REGARD TO AN ACCOUNTANT, WHO IN THE DEPARTMENT ALSO SERVED AS AN UPPER SUBORDINATE, AND I HARDLY THINK THAT THE CASE PART OF THE PARTICULAR SYSTEM OBTAINING IN THIS ESTABLISHMENT UNDER WHICH AN UPPER SUBORDINATE OF THE LOWER DIVISION OF THE DEPARTMENT CHARGE OF A DIVISION JUSTIFIED A CERTIFICATE WHICH SUCH SUPERIOR CONFIRMATIONS CAN BE PASSED ON SUCH APPARENTLY TO NO APPEAL.

7. THE ACCOUNTANT HAS TWICE APPLIED OFFICIALLY TO ME EITHER TO HAVE THE ENTRY REVERSED OR THE MATTER INVESTIGATED. I HAVE INVESTIGATED THE MATTER SUFFICIENTLY TO SATISFY MYSELF THAT THE CASE IS ONE OF THOSE UNFORTUNATE ONES IN WHICH TWO PEOPLE, BOTH EXCELLENT IN THEIR WAY, ARE BROUGHT TOGETHER WHO DO NOT SUIT, AND THAT IN THIS PARTICULAR CASE THE MISFORTUNE WAS MUCH AGGRAVATED BY NEITHER OF THE PARTIES CONCERNED HAVING THE NECESSARY SELF-COMMAND, WHICH A GOOD EDUCATION ALONE CAN BESTOW.

8. PERSONALLY, FROM MY KNOWLEDGE OF THE ACCOUNTANT'S WORK, I WRITE AGREE WITH THE OPINIONS EXPRESSED BY MR. [REDACTED] AND MR. [REDACTED] CHOUILLIER. I CANNOT OF COURSE OBJECT TO THE FORMATION OF ANY OPINION TO THE CONTRARY BY MR. [REDACTED] BUT I DO OBJECT TO THE OFFICIAL

EXAMINATION BY UPPER SUBORDINATES TO UPPER SUBORDINATES OF
SUCH SWEEPING CENSORSHIP, WITHOUT APPARENTLY THERE BEING ANY
APPEAL. I WISH IN FACT, IF CERTIFICATES OF CONDUCT ARE TO
BE ENTERED IN THE SERVICE BOOK AT ALL, THAT THE ENTRIES MADE
SHOULD BE FENCED ROUND BY ALL THE PRECAUTIONS THOUGHT
NECESSARY WITH REGARD TO ENTRIES IN THE DESAULTER'S BOOKS-
SEE P.W. CODE IV. 1. 24.

I HAVE THE HONOR TO BE,

SIR,

YOUR MOST OBEДИENT SERVANT,

Lowry-Jordan.

EXAMINER, P.W. ACCOUNTS AND MAJOR R.E.

List showing the distribution of the Proceedings of Government,
dated 25th April 1878 No. 138

Revenue Department, for information and for communication to Subordinate Officers	...	...	...	100
Public Works Department	do.	do.	...	100
Military Department	do.	do.	...	100
Whole				1

JUDICIAL.	Honorable the Judges of the High Court, for information and for communication to			
	Subordinate Officers	...	...	50
	Inspector-General of Madras Police	do.	do.	50
	Inspector-General of Jails	do.	do.	50
	Magistrates of the Town Police Court	...	...	30
	Do. of the Egmore Police Court	...	...	30
	Judges of the Madras Court of Small Causes	...	...	30
	Advocate-General	...	...	10
	Government Solicitor	...	...	10
	Administrator-General	...	...	10
SPECIAL.	Coroner of Madras	...	...	25
	Inspector-General of Registration	...	...	25
	Surgeon-General, Indian Medical Department, for information and for communication to			
	Subordinate Officers	...	...	20

PEACIC.	Sanitary Commissioner	...	...	20
	Health Officer	...	...	20
	Committee for the Examination of Assistants	...	...	20
	Private Secretary to His Excellency the Governor	...	...	20
	Government Astronomer	...	...	20
	Superintendent, Government Central Museum	...	...	20
	Chemical Examiner	...	...	20
	Superintendent of Stationery	...	...	20
	Supervisor of the Government Press	...	...	20
	Protector of Emigrants	...	...	20
POLITICAL.	Tamil Translator to Government	...	...	20
	Teloogoo do. to do.	...	...	20
	Malayalam do. to do.	...	...	20
	Canarese do. to do.	...	...	20
	Hindustani do. to do.	...	...	20
	Postmaster-General	...	...	20
	Superintendent, Electric Telegraphs	...	...	20
	Examiner of Medical Accounts	...	...	20
	Resident in Travancore and Cochin	...	...	20
	Government Agent at Chepnuk	...	...	20

ECCLESIASTICAL.	Government Agent at Tanjore	...	...	20
	Political Agent at Poodocottah	...	...	20
	Collector in charge of the Special Agent's Department at Cuddalore	...	...	20
ECCLESIASTICAL.	Officer in charge of the Stipend Pay Office at Vellore	...	...	20
	The Right Reverend the Bishop of Madras	...	...	20
	Venerable Archdeacon of Madras	...	...	20
ECCLESIASTICAL.	Senior Chaplain of the Church of Scotland	...	...	20

Transferred to the
Financial Dept.

Financial Department
(Service Books)

EA and 1000

Secy of Govt and

12 Maps

245

Referred to the
Accountant General
for his opinion.

Refd 13-

Chief Secretary

H. K. S. George
15th February 1878

Accountant General

Accountant General
Recd 16 8 1878

Accountant

Referred

MARINE

{ Master Attendant, Madras, for information and for communication to Subordinate Officers.

22

FINANCIAL

{ Accountant-General
Commissioner of Paper Currency

6

EDUCATIONAL

{ Director of Public Instruction
Commissioner for the Uncovenanted Civil Service Examinations

13

Indian Department.

PROCEEDINGS of the MADRAS GOVERNMENT.

READ the following letter *Papers*

From the Examiner of M. & P. dated 9th March 1898
Accountant General dated 20th March 1898 N. 1606.

Order thereon 25th April 1898 N. 138.

These papers will be
communicated to all Departments
with the intimation that a
service book should be a record
of facts not of opinions.

Entries in Column 8
will in future be made only by the
Officer empowered to dismiss or
appoint the Subordinate
concerned and will in ordinary
cases be open to revision by
higher authority.

3. The remainder of the

Order N. 138

Quit the service in
Major J. P. L. L. L. L.
L. L. L. L.

The Examiner of Public Works
 Accounts on the entry that has
 given rise to this reference will
 be referred for consideration
 in the Public Works Department.

W

To
 The Accountant General
 Examiner of Public Works Accounts
 Comptroller of Public Accounts
 Public Works
 Public Works
 Public Works
 Public Works

Recd 9/5/78

2390650

Genl. of 1873
Advocates.

Lucas

To
All friends of Abolition

Dated 25th 2nd 1878.
 Recd. 1878, No. 135.

THE

Science-Books. Common
meating with those
kind, contain books
concerning subjects
to be made in volume
of Science-Books.