21-9-14

Public Works (1898) Department.

G.O., No. 1871-72 S

DATED 25th July 1898

[Despatch Abstract.]

Memorial. Ordered that the —— from Mr. A.S. Russell, Ex: Engr., 1st grade, praying for the grant to him of a special retiring pension of Rs 1000 in addition to the pension of Rs 4000 per annum he can claim under the ordinary rules, be forwarded to the Govt. of India.

Memorial: Forwarding, with remarks, a —— from Mr. A.S. Russell, E.E. 1st grade, praying for the grant to him of a special retiring pension of Rs 1000 in addition to the pension of Rs 4000 per annum he ~~Cla~~ can claim under the ordinary rules, for the favorable consideration of the Govt. of India.

Indexed.

[P. W. 26. 1,000—12-2-98.]

GENERAL.
ESTABLISHMENT.

Government {1898} of Madras.

PUBLIC WORKS.

Recd. } 1898. *Enclosures*
Regd. } *Spare copies*

Letter, No. 1872 W., 25th July 1898.

JULY.

Memorial

Forwarding, with remarks, a — from Mr. A. S. Russell, Executive Engineer, 1st grade, praying for the grant to him of a special retiring pension of Rs. 1,000 in addition to the pension of Rs. 4,000 per annum he can claim under the ordinary rules, for the favourable consideration of the Government of India.

and energy of its *officers*, to offer the same terms of retirement now asked for by Mr. Russell, to those of the remaining men of the years 1874—77 who have a good record of service, and to make promotions in place of those who accept the offer. To admit of the latter being done, it will be necessary to abolish the time rule imposed in resolution of the Government of India, No. 2523 G., dated 28th September 1893, which is felt to be a great hardship by officers generally. I am accordingly to commend these proposals to the favourable consideration of the Government of India.

I have the honour to be,
Sir,
Your most obedient servant,

(Signed) W. B. DEWINTON,
Secretary to Government.

OOTACAMUND,
25th July 1898.

Exd. T. K. Narayana Aiyangar.

GENERAL.
ESTABLISHMENT.

Government {1898} of Madras.

PUBLIC WORKS.

Recd.	1898.	*Enclosures*
Regd.		*Spare copies*

G.O., No. 1871 W., 25th July 1898.

JULY.

Memorial

Ordered that the — from Mr. A. S. Russell, Executive Engineer, 1st grade, praying for the grant to him of a special retiring pension of Rs. 1,000 in addition to the pension of Rs. 4,000 per annum he can claim under the ordinary rules, be forwarded to the Government of India.

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

General.
Establishment.

READ—the following paper:—

Memorial from Mr. A. S. RUSSELL, Executive Engineer, 1st grade, Madras Public Works Department, praying for the grant to him of a special retiring pension of Rs. 1,000 in addition to the pension of Rs. 4,000 per annum he can claim under the ordinary rules.

ORDER—No. 1871 W., dated 25th July 1898.

Ordered that the memorial be transmitted, through the Government of India, to the Right Honourable the Secretary of State.

[Here enter No. 1872 W., dated 25th July 1898.]

(True Extract.)

(Signed) W. B. DEWINTON,
Secretary to Government.

To A. S. Russell, Esq.

Extd. T. K. Narayana Ajyangar.

Public Works DEPARTMENT.

Papers to be read in Proceedings:—

A in G.O., dated 189 , No.

Again G.O., dated 189 , No.

Current No. of 189 , dated , from

" " " 189 , " , "

" " " 189 , " , "

Memorial from Mr. A. S. Russell, Executive Engineer 1st grade, Madras P.W.D., praying for the grant to him of a special retiring pension of Rs. 1,000 in addition to the pension of Rs. 4,000 per annum he can claim under the ordinary rules.

Read & Extd

Quote

His Excellency the Governor.

A.14 22.7.98

ORDER.

No 1871 W 25 July 98

Ordered that the Memorial be transmitted through the Government of India to the Right Honourable -- the Secretary of State.

No 1872 W 25 July 98

TO

The Joint Secretary to the Government of India, P.W. Department.

Sir,

I am directed to forward for -- transmission to the Right Honourable the Secretary of State for India the accompanying Memorial, dated 31st May 1898, from Mr. A. S. Russell, Executive Engineer 1st grade, Madras P.W.D. on the subject of his position and --- prospects in the service, and praying for the grant to him of a special retiring pension of Rs. 1,000 added to the pension of Rs. 4,000 per annum he can draw under the Ordinary --- rules, i.e. Rs. 5,000 in all, in which event he binds himself to retire -- before

A.14

31

To A. S. Russell Esqr. C 6/8/98

P. W. 4.
500—24-3-98.

HE 21.7.98 R 22.7.98

before the close of the current year.

2. The grounds on which Mr. Russell bases his request are -- briefly as follows:-

(1)That Coopers Hill men of the years 1874-77 inclusive were induced to enter the P.W.D. by certain stated prospects of pay and promotion.

(2)That these prospects have never been, even approximately, fulfilled.

(3)That men of ages varying between 42 & 47 are, therefore, still -- employed in subordinate positions, quite unsuited to their age and length of service.

(4)That the men so situated are thoroughly disheartened by the failure of their career, and are, therefore, incapable of devoting their best energies to the service of the state.

(5)That the block in promotion -- caused by over-recruitment in 1874-77 will tend to intensify as years go on, and that it is greatly to the interest of the State to remove it, a discontented staff being especially fatal to an Engineering service.

(6)That the simplest and speediest method of removing the block is to offer adequate terms of retirement to those senior officers willing to accept them.

(7)That where promises have been -- made, and have been unfulfilled, it is a matter of simple justice to give adequate compensation, and that there are precedents for so doing.

(8)That the special terms of retirement offered in 1893 entirely failed of their purpose, because they were altogether inadequate to induce the senior men to retire.

3. With regard to (1) and (2) above His Excellency the Governor in Council is of opinion that the facts are correctly stated, in corroboration of which special attention is invited to Sir G. Chesney's letter of 29th October 1892 quoted in Appendix A to the Memorial.

4. With regard to (3) it seems -- only necessary to point out that, if the prospects held out to the officers in question had been fulfilled, all the men of the years 1874-77 would have reached the Chief Engineer or Superintending Engineer --- classes, whereas two of 1874 and all of the 1875-77 ~~men~~ period are now only in the 1st grade of Executive Engineer. Each step in rank has taken them -- nearly 5 years instead of the two mentioned in the Prospectus. His Excellency

Excellency the Governor in Council fears that the block in promotion is having the effect described in clause (4) above. To be doing exactly the same work at the age of 45 as at 25 cannot but be disheartening. The energetic, conscientious workman who has never spared himself through all these years, finds that, after 40, he is incapable of standing the hard out-door work, constant travelling, and exposure which are the lot of the Executive Engineer who does his duty, and he is induced to neglect his work and leave it to his subordinates, to its very serious detriment. As a matter of sound policy, it seems, to His Excellency in Council, fatal to allow a department, whose operations are of such inestimable benefit to the state and on whose efficiency so much of the future of the country depends, to drift into a state of apathy. The necessity for a speedy remedy thus becomes apparent.

5. With regard to (6), there are at present 8 officers in the service of the years 1875-77. Of these, one, Mr. Carless, has already proceeded on furlough with the view, it is understood, to retirement owing to broken health, and it is believed that

that of the remaining seven, five would be willing to accept the terms now asked for by Mr. Russell, viz, a pension of Rs. 5,000 a year. Nearly all have already qualified for a Rs. 4,000 pension, and the rest will shortly do so. The terms asked for are, therefore, tantamount to an increased pension of Rs. 1,000 per --- annum.

6. As showing the moderation of this demand, attention is invited to para 39 of despatch No. 15 P. W. dated 21st April 1884 printed in Appendix B of the Memorial, wherein the Government of India proposed to give Superintending Engineer pensions (i.e. Rs. 6000 per annum) to Executive Engineers of the 1st grade who were proved to have suffered hardship from retarded promotion.

7. The special terms of retirement referred to in clause (8) are contained in the Resolution of the --- Government of India No. 2873 G dated 2nd November 1893. They were intended to remove the block in promotion caused by over recruitment in the --- earlier years of Cooper's Hill College, and they were unacceptable, it is believed, because the concessions offered to the senior were regarded as inadequate, and to be very unequal as between the senior and

junior

junior men affected. If, as proposed by Sir.G.Chesney, an addition of 5 years to each man's service for pension had been offered, to be taken at a time when it would -- benefit him most, it would, it is believed, have been accepted by a large number of senior men, and the relief would have been instantaneous and effective. The terms actually offered amounted to an average of only one year's additional service for the senior men, and they were given, in the first instance, only 3 months to decide upon a step which to them had most momentous consequences. The senior men therefore refused the concession almost unanimously, and the block in the earlier years remained unrelieved.

8. Mr. Russell is, I am directed to say, an officer with an exceptionally good record throughout his service, and he has thus deserved the fullest enjoyment of the prospects held out to him on entering the department, and as he has suffered acute disappointment, he is, in the opinion of His Excellency the Governor in Council, fully entitled to the very moderate compensation which he now prays for. I am accordingly to forward the Memorial with the fullest support of His Excellency the Governor in Council.

9. Finally, as regards the general question of blocked promotion in this Presidency, His Excellency in Council is of opinion that it would be the soundest policy and add --- greatly to the efficiency of the service, which depends almost --- entirely on the zeal and energy of its officers, to offer the same --- terms of retirement now asked for by Mr. Russell, to those of the remaining men of the years 1874-77 who have a good record of service, and to make promotions in place of --- those who accept the offer. To admit of the latter being done, it will be necessary to abolish the time -- rule imposed in Resolution of the Government of India No. 2523 G dated 28th September 1893, which is felt to be a great hardship by officers generally. I am accordingly to commend these proposals to the favourable consideration of the Government of India.

I have etc.,

W. 21-7-96

Public Works DEPARTMENT.

C. No.

(3) HIS EXCELLENCY THE GOVERNOR.
(2) THE HON'BLE SIR HENRY BLISS, K.C.I.E.
(1) THE HON'BLE MR. GROSE, C.I.E.

SUBJECT.

Memorial from Mr. A. L. Russell, Under Secy to Govt. P.W.D., for enhanced pension.

FOR ORDERS.

Mr. Russell's memorial seems to me to make out an unanswerable case, & I agree with the opinions expressed by the C.E. in paras 7 & 8 of his Note.

JG
21/6/98.

8/6/98

C.S.H
19.7.98

whether Mr. Russell's request, made in the last paragraph of his Memorial, for an enhanced pension of Rs 5000, may be recommended to the favourable consideration of the Govt of India & Secretary of State -

The grounds on which he bases his request are briefly as follows

(1) That Covenanted Civil men of the years 1874-77 inclusive were induced to enter the P.W.D by certain stated prospects of pay & promotion

(2) That these prospects have never been, even approximately, fulfilled.

(3) That men of age ranging between 42 & 47 are, therefore, still

4.6.98 19.7.98

employed in subordinate positions, quite unsuited to their age & length of services.

(4) That the men so situated are thoroughly disheartened by the failure of their career, & are, therefore, incapable of devoting their best energies to the service of the State.

(5) That the block in promotion caused by non-recruitment in 1874-77 will tend to intensify as years go on, & that it is greatly to the interest of the State to remove it, a discontented staff being especially fatal to an Engineering Service.

(6) That the simplest & speediest method of removing the block is to offer adequate terms of retirement to those Senior officers willing to accept them.

(7) That where promises have been made, & have been unfulfilled, it is a matter of simple Justice to give adequate compensations, & that there are precedents for so doing.

C. No.

DEPARTMENT.

SUBJECT.

HIS EXCELLENCY THE GOVERNOR.
THE HON'BLE SIR HENRY BLISS, K.C.I.E.
THE HON'BLE MR. GROSE, C.I.E.

FOR ORDERS.

(8) That the special terms of retirement offered in 1893 entirely failed of their purpose, because they were altogether inadequate to induce the Senior men to retire.

2. With regard to (1) & (2) above. I think the facts as stated are indisputable, & need no further proof - I would invite, on this point, special attention to Sir G. Chesney's letter dated 25 Oct 1892 (Appendix A). No one here living could speak on the subject with anything like the authority of the first President of the College, who was also intrusted with the task of drawing up the original

Prospectus, & y reorganising the College. But for his untimely & lamented death, the rights of Coopers Hill men y the earlier years would have been recognised long ago -

3. With regard to (3) it is unnecessary to limit ourselves. if the prospects held out to them had been fulfilled, all the men y the years 1874-77 would have reached the Chief Engr or Superintending Engr class. Whereas two y 1874 & all y the 1875-77 men are only in the 1st grade y Exec: Engr. Each step in rank has taken them nearly 5 years instead y the two mentioned in the Prospectus.

4. I fear there is little doubt that the block in promotion is having the effect described in para 1 (4) above. To be doing exactly the same work at 45 as at 25 is not only very disheartening to a man, but very demoralising - The energetic, conscientious work -man

.....DEPARTMENT.

C. No.....

SUBJECT.

HIS EXCELLENCY THE GOVERNOR.
THE HON'BLE SIR HENRY BLISS, K.C.I.E.
THE HON'BLE MR. GROSE, C.I.E.

FOR ORDERS. 3.

Who has never spared himself through all these years, finds that, after 40, he is incapable y standing the hard out-door work, constant travelling, & responsibility which are the lot y the Exec: Engr. who does his duty, & he begins to neglect his work & leave it to his subordinates, to its very serious detriment. As a mere matter y sound policy it seems fatal to allow a Dept, whose operations have been y unlasting general benefit to the State to have three y all the remaining Depts y State combined, & on whose efficiency so much y the future y the country depends, to drift into such

[P. W. 48. 500—27-1-18.]

a state of apathy, & I would strongly urge the necessity for speedy remedy.

5. With regard to 1 (6), there are at present 6 officers in the service of the years 1875-77; of these one, Mr Carlew, has already proceeded on furlough with a view to retirement, owing to broken health, and I understand that of the remaining seven, five would be willing to accept the terms now asked for by Mr Russell - viz a pension of Rs 5000 a year. Nearly all have already qualified for a Rs 4000 pension, & the rest will shortly do so. The terms asked for are therefore not amount to an increased pension of Rs 1000 per annum. I would here point out that the Govt of India proposed to give eight Engl. pensions (at Rs 6000 per annum) to Execv Engrs of the 1st grade who were proved to have suffered hardship from retarded promotion - vide Para 39 of Despatch No 15 P.W of 21 Sep. 1876. (Appendix B of Memorial), and

DEPARTMENT.

C. No.

SUBJECT.

HIS EXCELLENCY THE GOVERNOR.
THE HON'BLE SIR HENRY BLISS, K.C.I.E.
THE HON'BLE MR. GROSE, C.I.E.

4.

FOR ORDERS.

although the proposal has not approved by the Secy of State, I think it shows how moderate is the request now made for a pension of Rs 5000.

6. The special terms of retirement referred to in Para 1 (6) will be found in G.O No 2939 of 15 Nov: 93. They were intended to remove the block in promotion caused by the non-recruitment in the earlier years of Coopers Hill, & they proved wholly inadequate to effect that object because the concessions offered to the senior men were to meagre, & were to unequal as between the senior & junior men affected.

Flag M.

[P. W. 43. 500—27-1-98.]

If, as proposed by Sir G. Chenney, an addition of 5 years to each man's service for pension had been allowed, to be taken at a time when it would benefit him most, it would have been accepted by a large number of senior men, & the whole would have been instantaneous & effective. The terms actually allowed amounted to, on an average, 3 years additional service for the senior men, & they were given 3 months to decide upon a step which had such momentous consequences for them! It is not surprising, therefore, that the senior men represented the circumstances, almost to a man, & the block, in the earlier years remained unrelieved.

7. Mr. Russell is an officer with an exceptionally good record from first to last. He has deserved the fullest employment of the prospects held out to him to enter the service, & as they have been to lamentably unfulfilled, he is, I submit, fully entitled

.....DEPARTMENT.

C. No.....

SUBJECT.

HIS EXCELLENCY THE GOVERNOR.

THE HON'BLE SIR HENRY BLISS, K.C.I.E.

THE HON'BLE MR. GROSE, C.I.E.

5.

FOR ORDERS.

to the very moderate compensation now claimed, and I trust that Govt. will be willing to forward his Memorial with a strong expression of opinion in its favour.

8. With regard to the general question of blocked promotion in this Presidency, I think it would be the soundest policy, & add greatly to the efficiency of the service, which depends almost entirely on the zeal & energy of its officers, to allow the same terms of retirement now asked for by Mr. Russell to those of the remaining men of the years 1875-77 who have a good record of service.

I think this should be done.

A.H.
19.7.98

[P. W. 43.
500—27-1-98.]

make
& from tiers ~~for~~ in lieu
of those who accepted the offer.
To enable this latter to be done
it will be necessary to ask the
Govt of India to abolish the
Lime-salts imposed in G.O
No 2604 W of 13 Oct 93; which Flag N.
I have always considered not
only a very great hardship, but Flag W.
a distinct breach of faith.
I beg for orders in this
respect

W Bds
3.6.98

Settled

Public Works (1898) Department.

CURRENT No. 6216

From A. S. Russell Esqre
Exc: Engineer 1st Gde
Madras P.W.D.

No.

Dated 30th May 1898
Received 4th June 1898
Registered 25-7-98
Enclosures 4
Spare copies

SUBJECT.

Submitting a memorial for transmission to the Secretary of State for India for enhanced pension.

Ans 43

BACK PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.
1664 W	8.7.95		
1739 W	11.7.94		
2939 W	15.11.93		
2604 W	13.10.93		
267 W	18.6.77		
315 W	27.6.75		
Public 1350-502	5.10.87		
Report Coast Sudra (Civil Service)			

FURTHER PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

Ootacamund, Dated 30 May '98

From

A. S. Russell,

Executive Engineer, 1st grade,

Madras P.W. Department

To

The Secretary to Government,

Public Works Department,

Madras.

Sir,

I have the honour to forward the accompanying Memorial for transmission to the Secretary of State for India, and request that you will be good enough to move the Madras Government to recommend me for the special pension asked for in the concluding para thereof.

2. I have not ~~quoted~~ made use of in the Memorial any documents other than those already made public, and I forward copies of the marginally noted papers, which will enable the main argument to be readily followed.

x Letter from Sir. G. Chesney, d/29th October 1892, to the Under Secretary of State.

Despatch from the Secretary of State to the Government of India, No. 5 P.W. dated 21st February 1895.

3. The Memorial deals with the question of my blocked promotion in the past, present and future, other points being only referred to in so far as they affect the general tenour of my prayer, viz, that compensation shall be given in consideration of my whole career having been so inferior to that held out to me as an inducement to enter the service.

4. The Memorial will be found to disclose ample facts affording ground for a re-consideration of the reply given in Despatch No. 5 P.W., dated 21st February, 1895, from the Secretary of State to the Government of India, regarding the blocked promotion of myself and my contemporaries from Cooper's Hill.

Hill.

I have the honour to be,

Sir,

Your most obedient servant,

A. S. Kinnell

Sec. Eng!