5205, &c &c

Govt. of 1895 Madras.

PUBLIC WORKS.

2/3/95

Inland

Recd. Encl.

G.O. 4/3 1895, No. 506 W

Engineer Establishment

~~[illegible]~~

Submitting

~~[illegible]~~ certain

proposals on the subject

~~the~~ recruitment of the

the Madras P.W

Ca... 28/2

C...

4th March 1895, No. 506 W., Public Works.

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

General.
Establishment.

Read—again the following paper:—

G.O., dated 2nd July 1894, No. 1641 W., Public Works.

Read—the following note by the Chief Engineer, Public Works Department, dated Ootacamund, 25th June 1894.

The question of bringing the establishment of this department up to the sanctioned scale requires, I think, the consideration of Government.

2. At present we have on the permanent list, including Lieutenant-Colonel Campbell whose engagement in Mysore will terminate next month and Mr. Whiteley whose engagement in the same State will not terminate till December 1897, a total of seventy-seven officers against a sanctioned strength of eighty.

3. One of these (Mr. Furnivall) is undergoing practical training in England, and before he arrives Colonel Fraser will retire, so that at no time during the present year shall we have more than seventy-five present for duty and absent on leave against the sanctioned strength of eighty.

4. The only way in which the permanent establishment can be brought up to its proper strength, which it must be emphatically noted is by no means in excess of the requirements of the department, is by the appointment of officers of the Royal Engineers, of Engineers from Cooper's Hill, or by local appointments to the Provincial establishment.

5. Men of the first named class are, it is believed, not available at all, and none of the second, except the one mentioned in the 3rd paragraph of this note, will be available until October 1895.

6. Moreover, it is in my opinion very undesirable to appoint more men of these two classes than is absolutely necessary to keep up the supply of Chief and Superintending Engineers of the future; one of the chief causes of the widespread discontent which undoubtedly prevails throughout the department at present is the length of time which elapses before the administrative grades are reached, a period which can only be reduced by increasing the proportion which the number in these grades bears to the number from whom they are filled; in other words, by reducing the latter number, as it is useless to consider any proposal for increasing the former.

7. We have amongst our upper subordinates, and shall have amongst our locally trained Engineers, many men who are amply competent to fill the lower grades of the Engineer establishment, though it is exceedingly doubtful whether any considerable number of them will ever be fit for the higher grades.

8. Leaving out of consideration men having no other qualifications than those of long service and practical experience, we have amongst our upper subordinates no less than thirteen who have either passed the Madras College examination for Assistant Engineers or taken the University degree of Bachelor of Civil Engineering and have had in addition from ten to twenty years of practical experience. Nearly all

of these men are at least as well qualified to perform the duties of an Assistant Engineer and as likely to become qualified to perform those of an Executive Engineer as any of the men appointed to the Imperial establishment under the guarantee of 1884.

9. I think therefore that from any point of view the public interests will be well served by appointment to the Provincial establishment on a somewhat more extensive scale than that contemplated in the orders of the Government of India printed with G.O., No. 2232 W., dated 12th August 1892.

10. I would therefore suggest that the Government of India be asked to authorise this Government to make at once four appointments to the Provincial establishment and in future to make, in place of the strictly limited number provided by clause III of the rules referred to above, such appointments as may be necessary to keep the strength of the establishment up to the sanctioned scale after reserving vacancies for (*a*) the annual appointment from the local college under the guarantee of 1884, (*b*) the appointments made by the Secretary of State from Cooper's Hill, and (*c*) such appointments of officers of the Royal Engineer as may be considered desirable.

11. No difficulty is likely to arise under (*a*) and (*b*), as the number of appointments to be made is known in good time, and as to (*c*) I am bound to say that I do not believe that any arrangements that are within the limits of probability will induce Royal Engineer officers to join the department in any appreciable number.

(Signed) J. PENNYCUICK, Colonel, R.E.,
Chief Engineer, P.W.D.

Order—dated 2nd July 1894, No. 1641 W., Public Works.

The Government concurs in the views expressed by the Chief Engineer, Public Works Department, and the Government of India will be addressed on the subject.

(True Extract.)

(Signed) J. PENNYCUICK, Colonel, R.E.,
Secretary to Govt., P.W.D.

Letter—from the Secretary to the Government of Madras, Public Works Department, to the Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department, dated 2nd July 1894, No. 1642 W.

I am directed to submit, for the consideration of the Government of India, an extract from the Proceedings of this Government embodying a note by the Chief Engineer, Public Works Department, on the subject of the recruitment of the Engineer establishment of this department, the views expressed in which have the concurrence of His Excellency the Governor in Council, and to request the sanction of the Government of India to the immediate appointment of four Assistant Engineers on the Provincial establishment by selection from the upper subordinates who are considered qualified for such posts, and that future appointments to this establishment may be made to the extent proposed in paragraph 10 of the Chief Engineer's note.

2. I am to state that considerable inconvenience is now being felt owing to the paucity of officers available for duty; the permanent establishment is short by six (allowing for the absence of Lieutenant-Colonel Campbell, Mr. Whiteley and Mr. Furnivall) of its proper strength, and no less than eighteen officers are on leave, other than privilege leave, three officers having broken down from ill-health during the last three months. It is therefore desirable that the vacancies on the permanent establishment should be filled up as soon as possible.

Read—also the following papers:—

From G. H. D. WALKER, Esq., Under Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department (General), to the Secretary to the Government of Madras, Public Works Department, dated Simla, 23rd June 1894, No. 2031 G.

Superior officers	9
Executive and Assistants	68
Allowance for absentees	7
Total ...	84

With reference to Public Works Department letter No. 2444 G., dated the 6th September 1890, sanctioning the Engineer cadre noted on the margin, I am directed to state that, in revising the cadres of the several lists of the Engineer establishment for submission to the Secretary of State, it was thought expedient to provide, first, that the number of Executive and Assistant Engineers respectively on the permanent cadre should in future be equal so as to accord with the present organization of grades, and, secondly, that any deficiency of Assistant Engineers that might be caused by the adoption of the reorganization should be made up by the appointment of temporary Engineers in cases where it might be considered that upper subordinates were not fit to hold those sub-divisional charges for which under this arrangement Assistant Engineers would not be available.

2. Following this principle the cadre for Madras would be adjusted as follows:—

Superior post	9
Executive Engineers	31
Assistant do.	31
Allowance for absentees	9
Total ...	80
Temporary staff	4
Grand Total ...	84

and I am to enquire whether His Excellency the Governor in Council is willing to accept the above as a basis for the future organization of the Engineer establishment in Madras, or whether His Excellency desires to make any alternative suggestion on the subject.

Letter—from the Secretary to the Government of Madras, Public Works Department, to the Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department, dated 12th July 1894, No. 1748 W.

In reply to your letter No. 2031 G., dated 23rd June 1894, I am directed to state that His Excellency the Governor in Council is willing to accept the total of the cadre given in paragraph 2 as a basis for the future organization of the Engineer establishment in Madras subject to the condition that the number of eighty officers forming the permanent staff be increased to eighty-two in the event of the execution of Military Works being transferred to Madras as suggested in my letter No. 1086 W. of 30th April 1894.

2. I am, however, to point out that the number of superior posts should be eight instead of nine and that of Executive and Assistant Engineers seventy-two instead of seventy-one.

3. The nine superior posts sanctioned in letter No. 2444 G. of 6th September 1890 included a Superintending Engineer for the Periyár Project, a post which has not been filled up since December 1890 and is not likely to be required again.

4. It is understood that the Consulting Architect is considered to be, as he has been for some years past, extra to the normal scale of establishment.

5. I am to invite attention to the proposals contained in my letter No. 1642 W. of 2nd July 1894.

From G. H. D. WALKER, Esq., Under Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department (General), to the Secretary to the Government of Madras, Public Works Department, dated Simla, 27th July 1894, No. 2367 G.

No. 1642 W., dated 2nd July 1894.
No. 1748 W. „ 12th „ „

I am directed to acknowledge the receipt of your letters marginally noted and, in reply, to state that the Government of India regret that they are unable to accord sanction to the appointment of more upper subordinates to the Provincial Engineer service of the Madras Public Works Department than that allowed in Government of India Public Works Department Resolution No. 2112 G., dated 19th July 1892. There is, however, no objection to temporary Engineers being entertained to supplement the existing staff as proposed in Public Works Department letter No. 2031 G., dated 23rd June 1894, or to upper subordinates being utilised as temporary Engineers, as a temporary measure, in accordance with Government of India Public Works Department Resolution No. 1146 G., dated 23rd August 1883.

2. I am to add, in explanation of the above remarks, that irregular recruitment of a permanent establishment, even to make up a staff at present deficient, is to be deprecated. The Government of India will, however, endeavour to supply the Government of Madras with some extra recruits (one or two additional yearly) from some other source, or if the number of appointments on some other list falls short of the numbers allowed in Public Works Department Resolution No. 2112 G., dated 19th July 1892, they will be prepared to allow the Madras Government to make up the total number of annual recruits, permissible under the Resolution, by making one or two additional appointments on their list.

Letter—from the Secretary to the Government of Madras, Public Works Department, to the Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department, dated 20th August 1894, No. 2072 W.

I am directed to request a reconsideration of the decision conveyed in your letter No. 2367 G. of 27th July 1894 on the following grounds.

2. The permission to employ temporary Engineers is of very little value, as it is found by experience that temporary men fit to do the ordinary work of the divisions in this presidency are almost impossible to obtain in the market; it is moreover the permanent establishment of the department which is deficient and it should be brought up to its proper strength by permanent appointments and not by temporary ones.

3. This Government entirely agrees in the view expressed in paragraph 2 of your letter under reply that irregular recruitment of a permanent establishment is to be deprecated; but in this case such recruitment has become necessary by the fact that the strength of the establishment has fallen, from causes for which this Government is not responsible, below the point at which it can be restored by any normal rate of recruitment; unless therefore it is to remain deficient for an indefinite period, irregular recruitment in some form is unavoidable, and the only question is the source from which that recruitment is to be derived.

4. One or two extra recruits yearly would be of little use, as it would take three or four years to bring the establishment up to its proper strength. Moreover, if the "other source" pointed to in paragraph 2 of your letter under reply is Woolwich or Cooper's Hill, I am to say that such recruitment would be the worst form of the irregular recruitment which the Government of India itself deprecates, would increase the risk of a future block in promotion, and would perpetuate the evils alluded to in paragraph 6 of the Chief Engineer's note recorded with the Proceedings forwarded with my former letter, the removal of which evils is one of the main objects of the proposal of this Government by the adoption of the special form of recruitment advocated.

From G. H. D. WALKER, Esq., Under Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department (General), to the Secretary to the Government of Madras, Public Works Department, dated Simla, 2nd November 1894, No. 3347½ G.

In reply to your letter No. 2072 W., dated 20th August 1894, requesting a reconsideration of the orders regarding the recruitment of the Madras Engineering establishment, conveyed in Public Works Department letter No. 2367 G., dated 27th July 1894, I am directed to state that, after further consideration, the Government of India regret that, owing to the present conditions of appointment to the Provincial Engineer service (*vide* Public Works Department Resolution No. 2112 G., dated 19th July 1892), they are unable to sanction the request of the Government of Madras to appoint four additional upper subordinates at once to the Madras Provincial Engineer service. But in consideration of the special grounds put forward by the Madras Government, it is proposed to address the Secretary of State, with the view of increasing the number of Provincial service recruits in Madras from one subordinate in alternate years to two subordinates annually. If this proposal is sanctioned, the Government of India will have no objection to four subordinates, or two years' supply of recruits, being appointed to the Madras Provincial establishment in the first year, provided that no recruits are appointed the following year and on the understanding that not more than one Cooper's Hill Engineer shall be appointed to Madras annually.

2. In the meanwhile, as there is an appointment in the Provincial service from the upper subordinate staff on the Government of India list still available, I am to state that the Government of India are pleased to allow that vacancy to be utilised on the Madras list and to the appointment of an upper subordinate of the Madras establishment to fill it.

3. I am to enquire whether the Madras Government is willing to accept the above proposals, and to say that if they are considered suitable they will be referred to the Secretary of State for his sanction.

From G. H. D. WALKER, Esq., Under Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department (General), to the Secretary to the Government of Madras, Public Works Department, dated Calcutta, 1st December 1894, No. 3582 G.

With reference to paragraph 2 of Government of India Public Works Department letter No. 3347½ G., dated 2nd November 1894, I am directed to state that as there is another appointment in the Provincial service from the upper subordinate staff on the Government of India list available, the Government of India are pleased to allow that vacancy to be also utilised on the Madras list and to the appointment of an upper subordinate of the Madras establishment to fill it.

2. I am to request that the names of the upper subordinates promoted against these two vacancies may be reported to the Government of India.

Letter—from the Secretary to the Government of Madras, Public Works Department, to the Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department, dated 30th January 1895, No. 211 W.

With reference to paragraph 2 of your letter No. 3582 G., dated 1st December 1894, I am directed to state that the names of the two upper subordinates promoted to the Provincial Engineer establishment against the two vacancies which have been allotted to the Madras list are as follows:—

S. Krishnamachariyar, B.C.E., Sub-Engineer, 3rd grade.
T. T. Ragavachariyar, B.A., B.C.E., Sub-Engineer, 2nd grade, and Honorary Assistant Engineer.

A further communication on the general question of the recruitment of the Provincial service will be reported shortly.

Letter—from the Secretary to the Government of Madras, Public Works Department, to the Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department, dated 4th March 1895, No. 506 W.

I am directed to acknowledge the receipt of your letters Nos. 3347½ G. of 2nd November 1894 and 3582 G. of 1st December 1894 and to express the thanks of His Excellency the Governor in Council for the manner in which the wishes of this Government as regards appointments to the Provincial establishment have been met by the Government of India.

2. It is not quite clear what number of appointments this Government is at liberty to make, but it is believed to be the intention of the Government of India that a total of six appointments may be made before the end of 1895.

3. Acting on this supposition, two appointments, already reported in my letter No. 211 W. of 30th January 1895, have already been made, and it is proposed to make two more immediately and such further number, not exceeding two, during the current year as may be necessary to bring the establishment of the department up to its sanctioned strength.

4. I am, however, with reference to the last sentence of paragraph 1 of your letter No. 3347½ G. of 2nd November 1894, to ask for a reconsideration of the decision to appoint only one officer annually from Cooper's Hill to the establishment of this Presidency; in the opinion of His Excellency the Governor in Council this will not give a sufficient number of officers capable of filling the higher posts in the department.

5. Owing to the frequent changes in the organization and strength of the establishment and to the special retirements of 1879 and 1894, it is not easy to calculate the exact annual number of recruits required to keep the establishment up to its sanctioned strength, but the following calculation is, it is believed, as nearly accurate as the conditions allow.

6. It has been found from an examination of records that the total number of casualties of all kinds during the twenty-five years from 1870 to 1894 inclusive was one hundred and twenty; this number includes the special retirements of 1879 and 1894. No deduction need be made on account of the former, as all the men who retired then would in any case have left the service before the end of 1894, but a deduction of six must be made for the latter, leaving one hundred and fourteen or 4·56 per annum as the normal number of casualties.

7. The strength of the establishment during the period in question has varied from eighty to ninety-two; taking the average at eighty-seven, the annual loss to be met by recruitment is 5·24 per cent., or 4·19 for the present strength of eighty, which is not likely to be materially altered for some years to come.

8. In the opinion of this Government it is necessary, in order to provide a sufficient number of men capable of filling the higher posts of the department, that about 60 per cent. of the establishment at any one time should be officers appointed from England; it is not, however, necessary that the proportion of recruits should be quite so large as this.

9. It will be explained hereafter that it is proposed that the greater part of the men appointed to the Provincial establishment shall pass through the subordinate grades, and as they will, save in very rare cases, never rise to the rank of Superintending Engineer, they will ordinarily have to retire at fifty, while the men appointed from England can serve till fifty-five; the superior physique of the latter will also render them less liable to break down from ill-health. They will therefore join earlier and serve longer than the locally appointed men, and the proportion serving at any one time will be somewhat higher than that due to the proportion of recruits.

10. For these reasons this Government is of opinion that the number of men appointed from England should be one-half of the total recruitment, that is, that the appointments from Cooper's Hill should not be less than two annually.

11. It is assumed that the supply will be entirely divided between the Provincial establishment and Cooper's Hill, for the third source of supply (the Royal Engineers) need hardly be taken into account; only one Royal Engineer officer has joined this department since 1874 and none since 1884.

12. With regard to the source of supply of the Provincial service, I am to state that, in the opinion of this Government, all men appointed to that service should pass through the subordinate grades. The practice of appointing Assistant Engineers direct from the local college has not been found to give satisfactory results, while (as not more than one appointment at the most can be given each year) the difference in the prospects of the first and second students of the year is altogether out of proportion to the difference in their merits.

13. For these reasons this Government proposes to abolish the practice of appointment direct from the college in 1897, when the present guarantee expires, and, in place of the single appointment of Assistant Engineer now given, to make at least two appointments annually as supervisor of men who have qualified in all respects as Assistant Engineers.

14. Subject to the claims of subordinates already in the service, future appointments to the Provincial establishment will be made entirely by selection from the men thus appointed to the subordinate grades.

15. It does not seem necessary to fix any limit to the number of men to be thus promoted except that fixed by the total strength of the establishment; it will usually be two or three, but to prevent any excessive number of appointments, this Government would be willing to undertake that not more than three should be made in any one year without the special sanction of the Government of India.

16. I am to add that, in the opinion of this Government, it will not be possible, within any period to which we can at present look forward, to reduce the strength of the Engineer establishment below the present sanctioned scale of eighty.

GENERAL.
ESTABLISHMENT.

Govt. of {1895} Madras.

PUBLIC WORKS.

Dated March, 4th.

Recd. Encl.

G.O., 4th Mar. 1895, No. 506 W.

MARCH.

Engineer Establishment

Submitting certain proposals on the subject of the recruitment of the — of the Madras Public Works Department.

Note by the Chief Engineer P. W. Dept:—

The question of bringing the establishment of this Department up to the sanctioned scale requires, I think, the consideration of Government.

2 At present we have on the permanent list, including Lieut: Colonel Campbell whose engagement in Mysore will terminate next month and Mr. Whiteley whose engagement in the same State will not terminate till Dec. 1897 a total of 77 officers against a sanctioned

strength of 80.

3 One of these (Mr Furnivall) is undergoing practical training in England, and before he arrives Colonel Fraser will retire, so that at no time during the present year shall we have more than 75 present for duty and absent on leave against the sanctioned strength of 80.

4 The only way in which the permanent establishment can be brought up to its proper strength, which it must be emphatically noted is

of the requirements of the Department is by the appointment of officers of the Royal Engineers, of Engineers from Cooper's Hill, or by local appointments to the Provincial Establishment.

5 ~~None~~ Men of the first named class are it is believed not available at all, and none of the second, except the one mentioned in the third paragraph of this note will be available until October 1895.

6 Moreover it is in my opinion very undesirable to appoint more men of these two classes than is absolutely necessary to keep up

the supply of Chief and Supdg Engineers of the future; one of the chief causes of the wide spread discontent which undoubtedly prevails throughout the Dept at ~~the~~ present is the length of time which elapses before the Administrative grades are reached, a period which can only be reduced by increasing the proportion which the number in these grades bears to the number from whom they are filled, in other words by reducing the latter number, as it is useless to consider any proposal for increasing the

7. We have amongst our upper subordinates, and shall have amongst our locally trained Engineers many men who are amply competent to fill the lower grades of the Engineer establishment though it is exceedingly doubtful whether any considerable number of them will ~~even~~ ever be fit for the higher grades.

8. Leaving out of consideration men having no other qualifications than those of long service, and practical experience we have amongst our upper subordinates no less than thirteen

who have either passed the Madras College examination for Assistant Engineers or taken the University degree of Bachelor of Civil Engineering, and have had in addition from ten to twenty years of practical experience. Nearly all of these men are at least as well qualified to perform the duties of an Assistant Engineer and as likely to become qualified to perform those of an Executive ~~Assistant~~ Engineer as any of the men appointed to the Imperial establishment under the guarantee of 1884.

9. I think therefore

that from any point of view the public interests will be well ~~secured~~ served by appointment to the Provincial Establishment on a somewhat more extensive scale than that contemplated in the orders of the Govt. of India printed with G.O. No. 2232W dated 12 August 1892.

10 I would therefore suggest that the Govt. of India be asked to authorise this Government to make at once four appointments to the Provincial establishment, and in future to make, in place of the strictly limited number provid

The suggestions in the note approved.
W
27 June

by clause III of the rules referred to above, such appointments as may be necessary to keep the strength of the establishment up to the sanctioned scale, after reserving vacancies for (a) the annual appointment from the local College under the guarantee of 1884, (b) the appointments made by the Secy of State from Cooper's Hill, and (c) such appointments of officers of the Royal Engineers as may be considered desirable.

11. No difficulty is likely to arise under (a) & (b) as the number of appointments to be made is known in good time, and as to (c) I am bound to say that I do not believe that any arrangements that are within the limits of probability will induce Royal Engineer officers to join the Department in any appreciable number.

Ew

Ootacamund
25th June 1894

CWRS
25.6.94

Nos. 1641-42 W. d/ 2nd July 1894.

3/12 B. VIII ~~HE. 14/8~~

Statement shewing Sancd. and existing No. of Engineers.

G.O 1641 W $\frac{8745}{d/ 2/7/94}$

	Sancd.	Existing
Chief Engineers.	2.	2.
Supdg. Engineers	6.	6.
Ex: Engineers.	36.	(a) 38.
Asst Engineers.	36.	(b) 31.
	80	(c) 77

(a) The 2 in excess are in room of Col: Campbell and Mr Whiteley on other duty.

(b) Includes Mr Heinig recently appointed, and Mr Furnivall who will join in Decr next.

(c) This number will be reduced to 76 by the retirement of Col: Fraser on the 19th August next.

F. J.
18. 6. 94

W

Submitted for information.

It will be seen from para 9 of the G. of I. Resolution recorded with G.O 2602 W d/ 13. Oct. 93 that all the Cadre numbers are to be reconsidered at the end of the present year. If the Madras Govt. works so much below its sanctioned scale the fact will probably be noted by the Govt. of I. in the next revision of numbers.

In the present year only one Cooper's Hill Engineer is coming out to Madras. A more liberal assignment might be asked for in the next distribution which is usually made towards the close of the year.

C. S.

21 June 94

This is just what we don't want. My prime object is to reduce the period occupied in attaining the administrative grades, and as this depends upon the proportion between the numbers in these grades (a) and the whole number (b) of men from whom the C. E's and S.Es are drawn, the period can only be reduced by increasing this proportion, i.e. either by increasing the former number (a), or diminishing (b); the former course is obviously impossible, and the latter is therefore the only one open to us.

The establishment of the Provincial service gives us the opportunity of doing this, as it is morally certain that the S.Es of the future will hardly ever be drawn from this branch, but entirely from the R.E. and Coopers Hill men. I want to keep the proportion of these down as much as possible in future years.

Col. Campbell will retire from the department before Col. Trevor leaves it, so fortunately we shall have 76 names on the permanent list at the end of the year – including Mr Whiles –

I am prepared to ask Govt to appoint two more men to the provincial establishment at once – Can this be done now, or must the sanction of the G of I be obtained?

22/6

W

Under the orders of the G. of I now put up, the Madras Govt is at liberty to appoint one College Student every year, and one Upper Subordinate in alternate years to the Provincial Establishment. Commencing with the year 1892. One appointment was made from the College and one from the U. S. Establt.

In 1893 – one from the College.

" 1894 one from Each Source

No new appointments can therefore be made this year without the sanction of the Govt of India; and, under present rules, only one College Student and no Upper Subordinate can be appointed in 1895 –

R.S.

22 June 94

READ the following :—

Note by the Chief Engineer P. W. D.
dated 25th June 1894.

FOR ORDERS.

25.6

CWH
25.6.94

B/6

Recruitment of the Engineer Establishment

A S N. VI
C. 3/6

B
From orders

No. 1641 W. d/ 2d July 1894

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE MADRAS GOVERNMENT.

READ the following

69

Note by the Chief Engr. P.W.D. dated June 25, 189

The Government concurs in the views expressed by the Chief Engineer P.W. Dept., and the Government of India will be addressed on the subject.

(H.E. No. 1642 W d/ 2d July 9

To,
The Secy: to the Govt of India
P.W. Dept.

Sir,

I am directed to submit for the consideration of the Government of India an extract from the Proceedings of this Government embodying

No. 1641 W d/ 2d July 1894

(40—1,000—21-4-94.)

a note by the Chief Engineer P.W. Dept on the subject of the recruitment of the Engineer Establishment of this Department, the views expressed in which have the concurrence of His Excellency the Governor in Council, and to request the sanction of the Govt of India to the immediate appointment of four Assistant Engineers on the Provincial Establishment, by selection from the upper subordinates who are considered qualified for such posts, and that future appointments to this Establishment may be made to the extent proposed in para 10 of the Chief Engineer's note.

2. I am to state that considerable inconvenience is now being felt owing to the paucity of officers available for duty; the permanent establishment is short by six (allowing for the absence of Lieut: Colonel Campbell, Mr Whiteley and Mr Furnivall) of its proper strength, and no less than 18 officers are on leave, other than privilege leave, ~~these~~ three officers ~~being~~ having broken down from ill health during the last three months. It is therefore desirable that the vacancies on the permanent

tablishment should
e filled up as soon
possible

I have &c.,

Despd with G.O.
No 1641 W of 2-7-94
2/7/9

Recruitment of the
Engineer Establishment

Nos. 1641-42 W. d/ 2d July 1894

To be returned to Ooty
to await reply from
India

4/7. 5/7

No. 2031 G.

All communications should be addressed to the Secretary.

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.
PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.
GENERAL.

8

To

The Secretary to the Government of Madras,
Public Works Department.

Simla, the 23rd June 1894.

Sir,

With reference to Public Works Department letter No. 2444 G., dated the 6th September 1890 sanctioning the Engineer cadre noted on the margin, I am directed to state that in revising the cadres of the several lists of the Engineer Establishment, for submission to the Secretary of State it was thought expedient to provide first that the number of Executive and Assistant Engineers respectively on the permanent cadre should in future be equal, so as to accord with the present organization of grades and secondly that any deficiency of Assistant Engineers that might be caused by the adoption of the re-organization should be made up by the appointment of temporary

S.O. 2661 W
10.10.90.

Superior Officers	9
Executive and Assistants	68
Allowance for absentees	7
Total	84

P. W. CURRENT No. 5205

temporary Engineers in cases where it might be considered that Upper Subordinates were not fit to hold those subdivisional charges for which under this arrangement Assistant Engineers would not be available.

2. Following this principle the cadre for Madras would be adjusted as follows:-

Superior Posts	9 − 1 = 8	
Executive Engineers	31	71 + 1 = 72.
Assistant Engineers	31	
Allowance for absentees	9	
Total	80	
Temporary staff	4	
Grand Total	84	

and I am to enquire whether His Excellency the Governor in Council is willing to accept the above as a basis for the future organization of the Engineer Establishment in Madras or whether His Excellency desires to make any alternative suggestion on the subject.

I have the honour to be,
Sir,
Your most obedient servant,

Recd 4.7.94.
Regd: 12.7.94

G. W. Walker

Under Secy. to the Govt. of India.

Documents accompanying:

O.S. $\frac{C}{7}$

No: 1748 W. d/ 12th July 1894

To,
The Secy: to the
Government of India,
P. W. Deptt

Sir,

In reply to your letter No. 2031 G dated 23rd June 1894 I am directed to state that His Excellency the Governor in Council is willing to accept the total of the cadre given in para 2 as a basis for the future organisation of the Engineer Establishment in Madras, subject to the condition that the number of 80 officers ~~joining~~ forming the permanent staff be increased to by eighty ~~two~~ in the event of the execution of Military Works being transferred

W
7 July

to Madras as suggested in my letter No. 1086 W of 30th April 1894.

2. I am however to point out that the number of Superior Posts should be eight instead of nine and that of Executive and Assistant Engineers seventy-two instead of seventy-one

3. The nine superior posts sanctioned in letter No. 2444 G of 6th September 1890 included a Supdg Engineer for the Periyar Project, a post which has not been filled up since December 1890 and is not likely to be required again.

4. It is understood that the Consg: Architect is considered to be, as he has been for some years past extra to the ~~nominal~~ normal scale of establishment.

5. I am to invite attention to the proposals contained in my letter No. 1642 W of 2d July 1894.

× regarding appointments to Provincial Estabt (papers at Madras)

I have &c.

5.7 W

Desptd 13/7

C.5448 6.7.94

No. 1748 W. d/ 12th July 189

To be returned to the
Ooty office
A.C.

Returned
17-7-94

20.14/2

All communications should be addressed to the Secretary.

No. 2367 G.

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

GENERAL.

118

To

The Secretary to the Government of Madras,
Public Works Department.

Simla, the 27th July 1894.

Sir,

I am directed to acknowledge the receipt of your letters marginally noted, and in reply to state that the Government of India regret that they are unable to accord sanction to the appointment of more Upper Subordinates to the Provincial Engineer service of the Madras Public Works Department than that allowed in Government of India Public Works Department Resolution No.2112 G. dated 19th July 1892. There is however no objection to temporary Engineers being entertained to supplement the existing staff as proposed in Public Works Department letter No.2031 G. dated 23rd June 1894, or to Upper Subordinates being utilised as Temporary Engineers, as a temporary measure, in accordance with Government of India Public Works Department Resolution No.1146 G. dated 23rd August 1883.

No.1642 W. dated 2nd July 1894.
No.1748 W. dated 12th July 1894.

× 2232 W a/ 12-8-92

θ With No: 1748 W a/ 12-7-94

× 2502 W a/ 6-9-83

2. I am to add, in explanation of the above remarks that irregular recruitment of a permanent establishemnt even to make up a staff at present deficient, is to be deprecated. The Government of India will however endeavour

to

P. W. CURRENT No. 6200

to supply the Government of Madras with some extra recruits (one or two additional yearly) from some other source; or, if the number of appointments on some other list falls short of the numbers allowed in Public Works Department Resolution No.2112 G. dated 19th July 1892, they will be prepared to al- low the Madras Government to make up the total number of annual recruits, permissible under the Resolution, by making one or two additional appointments on their list.

2232 W a/12-8-92

I have the honour to be,

Sir,

Your most obedient servant,

G H D Walker

Under Secretary to the Govt. of India.

Documents accompanying:-

Nil.

Regd. ... 8.

Recd. 6. 8. 94

W

No orders

No. 2072 W. d/ 20" August 1894

To,

The Secretary to the

Government of India

Public Works Dept

12

Sir,

I am directed to request a reconsideration of the decision conveyed, in your letter No. 2367 G of 27 July 1894, on the following grounds.

W / 16 Aug

2. The permission to employ temporary Engineers is of very little value, as it is found by experience that temporary men fit to do the ordinary work of the Divisions in this Presidency are almost impossible to obtain in the market; it is moreover the permanent establishment of the

Department which is deficient and it should be brought up to its proper strength by permanent appointments and not by temporary ones.

3. This Government entirely agrees in the view expressed in para 2 of your letter under reply, that irregular recruitment of a permanent establishment is to be deprecated; but in this case such recruitment has become necessary by the fact that the strength of the establishment has fallen, from causes for which this Government is not responsible, below the point at which it can be restored by any normal rate of recruitment; unless therefore it is to remain deficient for an indefinite period, irregular recruitment in some form is unavoidable, and the only question is the source from which that recruitment is to be derived.

4. One or two extra recruits yearly would be of little use as it would take three or four years to bring the establishment up to its proper strength. Moreover, if the "other source" pointed to in para 2 of your letter under reply is Woolwich or Cooper's Hill, I am

to say that such recruitment ~~being~~ would be the worst form of the irregular recruitment which the Government of India itself deprecates, would increase the risk of a future block in promotion, and would perpetuate the evils alluded to in para 6 of the Chief Engineer's note recorded with the proceedings forwarded with my former letter, the removal of which evils is one of the main objects of the proposal of this Government ~~to~~ by the adoption the special form of recruitment advocated.

I have &c,

DESPATCHED
20 AUG. 94

W 14/8 17/8 14.8 W

CHM 14/8/94

Recruitment of the Engineer Establishment

G.O. No. 2072 W. d/ 20th August 18

R.K.

To be returned to C soon.

22/8

M.O. 17/8/94

A.C / O Returned — D.S. 22-8-94

I.C. 22/8

All communications should be addressed to the Secretary.

No. 3347½ G.

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

GENERAL.

To

The [Joint] Secretary to the Government of Madras,
Public Works Department, [Railway Branch.]

Simla, the 2nd November 1894.

Sir,

In reply to your letter No.2072 W.dated 20th August 1894,requesting a reconsideration of the orders regarding the recruitment of the Madras Engineering Establishment, conveyed in Public Works Department letter No.2367 G.dated 27th July 1894, I am directed to state that, after further consideration the Government of India regret that,owing to the present conditions of appointment to the Provincial Engineer service (vide Public Works Department Resolution No.2112 G.dated 19th July 1892),they are unable to sanction the request of the Government of Madras to appoint four additional Upper Subordinates at once to the Madras Provincial Engineer Service. But in consideration of the special grounds put forward by the Madras Government,it is proposed to address the Secretary of State,with the view of increasing the number of Provincial service recruits in Madras, from one subordinate in alternate years,to two subordinates annually. If this proposal is sanctioned the Government of India will have no objection to four subordinates,or two years supply of recruits,being appointed to the Madras Provincial Establishment in the first year,provided that no recruits are appointed the following year,and on the

⊗ G.O. No. 2072 W / 20-8-94

× G.O. No. 2232 W / 12-8-92

P.W. CURRENT No. 8745

20.8.94 No. 2072 W
12.7.94 " 1748 W
2.7.94 " 1641-2 W
12. 92 " 2232 W
12-7-93 - 1828 W
10-10-90 - 2661 W
10-12-94 - 3992 C
29-1-95 - 316 C
30-1-95 - 211 W

the understanding that not more than one Cooper's Hill Engineer shall be appointed to Madras annually.

2. In the meanwhile, as there is an appointment in the Provincial service from the Upper Subordinate staff on the Government of India list still available, I am to state that the Government of India are pleased to allow that vacancy to be utilised on the Madras list, and to the appointment of an Upper Subordinate of the Madras Establishment to fill it.

3. I am to enquire whether the Madras Government is willing to accept the above proposals, and to say that if they are considered suitable they will be referred to the Secretary of State for his sanction.

I have the honour to be,

Sir,

Your most obedient servant,

G. M. Walker

Under Secretary to the Govt. of India.

Documents accompanying:-

Nil.

Recd: [illegible] 11.94

Transferred to W.

14.11.94

No. 3347½ G

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

GENERAL.

To

THE Secy to the Govt. of
Madras

Calcutta, the 17th Jany 1895.

The undersigned is directed to invite attention to the letter noted below, and to request ~~that the~~ a very early reply ~~may be expedited~~.

G. M. Walker

Under-Secretary.

P. W. D. No. 3347½ G, dated 2nd Nov: 1894 regarding the recruitment of the Madras Engineer Establishment

17.1.95

506 W of 4-3-95

Cur 8745 with W

22-1-95

4

G. I. C. P. O.—No. 682 P. W. D.—27-6-89.—1,000

P. W. [illegible] No. 398

[illegible] Madras

Recd: 21.1.95

698 W
18-3-95

2101
W

W/

For orders

P. W. DEPARTMENT.

READ the following:—

Letter from the Govt. of India No. 3347½ – G, d/ 2/11/94.

FOR ORDERS.

I think the Govt. of India's proposals might be accepted. We can make one appointment to the Provincial Service at once under para 2; we must apparently await the reply of the Secretary of State before making appointments under para 1, and it is not very clear what "the first year" is, i.e. when we can make the four appointments sanctioned but we can ascertain this while the reference to the Secretary of State is being made.

There will be plenty of time to find this out.
W

2. If the appointment of two men annually from the subordinate establishment

is to be the rule, it will be convenient to supply a means of recruitment by the appointment as Supervisors of one or more men who have passed the Assistant Engineer's examination but have failed to obtain the guaranteed appointments; my objection (as Chief Engineer) to such appointments was that the men so appointed would block the promotion of experienced Overseers, but this will almost disappear if the men in question are removed from the subordinate establishment after a few years service.

3 If the acceptance of the Govt of India's proposals be approved I will submit proposals for the appointment of a subordinate in accordance with para 2.

19.11

W

FOR ORDERS

Recruitment of the Engineer Establishment

all the better for the Engineering College

We have not apparently much choice. We must accept India's proposals and express our gratitude for the favour shown!

W
22 Nov

W
4 Dec

I am not well acquainted with the subject of the recruitment of the establishment of the P.W.D. but it seems to me that, if we are to accept the proposal to receive only one recruit from Cooper's Hill annually, we are running a very considerable risk of a complete failure, after 15 or 20 years, of a sufficient supply of men to fill the appointments which, for the public good, ought to be filled by men of the very best professional training procurable. It seems to be admitted that it is hopeless to get R.Es to enter the Dept in future. If so, what number of men to fill the appts of Chf. Engrs, Supt Engrs and a fair number of Exve Engrs in charge of the more important works, will a recruitment of one man per annum give us at the end of 15, 20, 25 & 30 years from this date? This is an actuarial question with which I don't feel competent to deal — but I should like to know that it had been considered & had been answered in a satisfactory manner.

In this connection, I desire to draw attention to the fact that none of the earlier papers in this file have been previously circulated. I haven't at hand the Rules for the conduct of business framed by H.E. under the Statute, so cannot say that the non-circulation of the earlier papers in question is not in accordance with those rules. But I submit that the non-circulation of papers of such nature and ~~[illegible]~~ permanent

To,

The Secretary to the
Government of India
P.W.D.

Sir,

In reply to your letter No 3347½ G of 2d November 1894 I am directed to state that H.E. the Governor in Council is willing to accept the proposals therein made, and to request that the Secretary of State's sanction thereto may be obtained at as early a date as possible, the dearth of Assistant Engineers in this Presidency being a very serious inconvenience.

2. The appointment mentioned in para 2 of your letter under reply will be made at once;

CWB
2094
11

it is presumed that the four appointments mentioned in para 1 can be made immediately on receipt of the Secretary of State's sanction; if this view is incorrect, I am to request that this Government may be advised accordingly.

I have &c.

1/12

cwd 1/12/94

Recruitment of the Engineer Establishment

2

importance as these papers which deal with the organization of one of our most ~~four~~ important departments, and their disposal by a single member of the Govt., is not in accordance with the principles on which the Govt. of this Presidency is organized and is supposed to be conducted. The practice of keeping back ~~fr~~ important ~~[illegible]~~ papers and first circulating them to the members of Govt. other than the member in charge of the particular dept., does not prevail in the Revenue, Judl., Public and other depts.; and I submit that it should not prevail in the P.W.D.

WS 6/12/94

Circ =

I agree

JG 7/12

P. W. D

Note for the Honorable Mr Bliss

A copy of the rules is submitted - please see para 3 (a) and (b). A discretionary power is vested

(1) in the Honorable member in charge of the Dept. and

(2) in the Secretary

The papers go to His Excellency first, and when His Excellency considers it desirable that they should circulate, he usually notes accordingly. His Excellency did not mark the present papers to circulate. It may thus be assumed that he did not consider it necessary; nor did the Secretary see any such necessity.

Rule 4 (1) provides for any Hon: member instructing

(2)

I am strongly of opinion that if H.E. did not mark these particular papers for circn. it was simply because he did not happen to think of doing so, not because he was of opinion that a matter of so great and enduring importance was not worthy of consideration by all the members of Govt. It is unnecessary, however, to speculate on the subject, as H.E. will no doubt now state how this was.

As to the Secretary's not seeing any necessity to mark such papers for circn., it appears from the rules now put up that he was within his discretion - but in my opinion he exercised his discretion unwisely, and I consider he should be told so.

WS

instructing the Secretary to circulate any paper or papers to the said Hon: Member. When any such instructions are received, as recently in the case of the Periyar Progress Reports, they are carefully noted in the office for guidance.

Appointments, &c, are circulated in all cases under Rule 5.

With reference to the first portion of the Hon: Member's note, attention is invited to para 6 of the Chief Engineer's note of the 25th June 1894 embodied in Proceedings No. 1641 W dated 2nd July

The limitation of the numbers from which the higher appointments are to be filled is in my opinion of the very highest importance as increasing the prospects of each individual to the chance of succeeding to one of these offices; the establishment of the Provincial service has given us the means of removing in the future one of the chief causes of the wide spread discontent that prevails throughout the Department, especially among the men of from ten to twenty years' service and it would be a fatal mistake not to take full advantage of it.

It may be observed that the number of men appointed from Coopers Hill to Madras in the present and ~~the~~ two previous years is only four, so the reduction to one annually is not so very extensive after all

W

Yes - I read this & am quite in accord with the C.E. as to the object to be attained. The only question is as to the means. It appears from this note that the question of the ultimate effect of the annual appt. of one officer only from Coopers Hill has not been actuarily ~~[illegible]~~ considered - I think it should be. I am not an actuary but, so far as I can judge, the effect of so limited a recruitment will be to leave this Govt. at the end of 20 to 30 years with nothing like enough men to fill the superior appts, which must be filled by men of the best professional education procurable (who should also be men of suitable social position), and which cannot possibly be filled by locally-educated men without the gravest risk of injury to the public interests. The points to be determined are (1) the proportion of the total establishment of 80 men who should be procured from other than local sources of supply, and (2) the recruitment necessary to supply vacancies in that proportion. As to (1), I presume that the C.E. would not desire that less than half of his men should be of the ~~[illegible]~~ best class procurable. As to (2), I believe that, on refce to the Public Dept., the calculations can be obtained on which the recruitment of the Civil Service is regulated; and I should say that the same rates as applied in the case of the Civ. Serv. might safely be applied in the case of the P.W. Estt. - If there is any difference, it would be against the P.W. Estt., for their work as a rule entails more exposure ~~than~~ than that of the Civ. Service, and may therefore (though I don't say it does) lead to more rapid mortality & earlier retirement. On the other hand, of course, the C.S. pension rules give every Civilian the strongest possible inducement to remain in the service for full 25 years. A recruitment of 1 annually to an establishment of 40 is 2½ % - I don't affirm that this is insufficient, but I should like to know that it is sufficient. This is a matter easily susceptible of Eq. D.P.W.

C.O.D.S.
7.94

proof; & what I ask is that
it may be proved.

H.S.
10/12/94

Circ:

~~The Hon. Mr. J.H.S. Bliss~~
C.I.E.

Recruitment of the
Engineer Establishment

P.W.D.

Letter from the Govt. of India P.W.D. No. 3347½ G dated 2/11/94

Submitted for the perusal of His Excellency the Governor with reference to the Hon. Mr. Bliss' remarks.

2. With regard to the question raised by the Honorable Member as to the ultimate effect of the annual appointment of one officer only from "Coopers Hill," it is questionable whether any useful result would be obtained from an actuarial calculation.

3. Such calculations to be of any value must be based upon data which remain fairly constant for a series of years, and which may be expected

I must admit that the propriety of circulating these papers did not occur to me at the moment, and I regret that I did not mark them as I am well aware of their importance. I also regret that the Secretary did not exercise his discretion & circulate them without my having marked them. I hope he will in future watch this point, as it may very possibly happen that I may omit to have papers so marked, wh. all the same ought to go in circulation.

As regards the particular point in question the Chief Engineer shows that from the different changes wh. have occurred so frequently in the regulations laid down for the recruitment & establishment of the D.P.W. in the last 20 years, it would be difficult if not impossible to work out an actuarial calculation wh. would be a safe guide for the immediate future. He has therefore taken the actual facts wh. have occurred in the last 10 years - taking also into account the to remain fairly constant in the future; unfortunately these data do not exist in the P.W. Dept. owing to the frequent changes both in the organisation of the Dept. and in the mode of recruitment.

4. In the Civil Service during the thirty four years over which my personal recollection extends there have been no changes of any importance in the organisation of the service; a few new appointments have been created, and a few old ones abolished, but the general distribution of duties and scale of salaries has remained unaltered. The mode of recruitment has remained absolutely unaltered except for the introduction in 1880 of the "Statutory Civilian" class to which however only six officers now in the service belong so that the effect of this innovation upon the requirements of the service as regards recruitment must have been very slight.

5. Compare this with the P.W. Dept.; since 1860 there have been no less than four radical changes in organisation of the establishment and the distribution of duties, namely in 1863, 1873, 1878 & 1893; the mode of recruitment has been seriously altered by the appointment of the "Stanley Engineers" in 1865-68, by the establishment of Cooper's Hill in ~~1872~~ 1871, by the guarantee of an annual appointment from the local college in 1884 and by the establishment of the "Provincial Service" in 1893, as well as by the gradual

establishment of the Provincial Service in 1893. From these facts it would appear that our requirements from Cooper's Hill will amount to six men every 5 years – so that at the end of 30 years, we should be six men short of what we ~~should~~ ought to have of officers so trained for the upper establishment. This is not a very large number – but still it is in the wrong direction – and I think we might point it out to India – But, as the note points out, Mr. Lyall's Committee on the subject has not yet issued its report – and I think it would be wiser to await it, in case it may make suggestions wh. would make it possible for R.E.'s to enter the service – & so get us out of the difficulty.

W
2 Jan

I am sorry that I am not convinced by the Secretary's note. If it were really only a matter of one man in 5 years, perhaps it might be possible to trust to chance or to the outcome of Mr. Lyall's Committee; but it seems to me a much more serious matter.

It is no doubt true that, after the many reorganisations ~~[illegible]~~ which the P.W.D. Establishment has undergone and the successive special retirement schemes which have been applied to it, an actuary would not find materials in the past for the calculation of the rate of retirement in the future. But this is not the only question an actuary would have to consider for the purposes of the question now before us. He would also have to calculate the rate of mortality and for such a calculation he would find ample materials, both in the history of the P.W.D. itself & in that of the Covenanted Civil Service. I have not the materials at hand for making the calculation but I can show, I think, how it could be made.

We do not know & cannot calculate the average length of service which P.W. men will attain before retirement. Let us therefore assume – and the assumption is an exceedingly, almost a wildly, favourable one for the C.E.'s scheme – that on the average every man admitted from Cooper's Hill to the P.W.D. will serve out full 30 years. Then consider the rate of mortality – The only mortality table there is that on pp. 357 & 358 of Whitaker's Almanac for 1894 – Take the 1871-80 column & we find that, assuming the men to enter at the age of 21, the following numbers will be left, out of the 1 entering each year, at the end of the following periods:—

cessation of the establishment of R. E. officers, the last of whom joined the Dept in 1884.

6. The scale of establishment has been violently changed ~~since then~~ more than once; in 1879 it was reduced from a total of 89 to one of 69 by a number of compulsory retirements on special terms, and by the compulsory grant of "special leave" to the officers; in 1881 the total was raised to 92; in 1890 it was fixed at 84, and in 1895 at 80 at which it now stands. While during the last year special inducements to retirement have been held out, the result of which has been to deprive the department of the services of a number of experienced executive officers and to render necessary an abnormal number of fresh appointments to fill their places.

7. For these reasons I think it doubtful whether any calculations which can be properly called "actuarial" would repay the labour bestowed upon them, but without going into elaborate detail an attempt may be made to forecast the number likely to be required in the immediate future. From 1883 to 1892 inclusive, the conditions and requirements of the Dept have remained fairly constant, as the abnormal number of appointments required by the expansion of 1881, ceased in the following year and the appointment to the Provincial Service was not made till 1893. During

At the end of 30 years ·69144
——— 29 — ·70583
——— 28 — ·71989
and so on –

The meaning of these figures is that of 3 men entering the service in 1895-7, 2·11716 only would be left in 1925; and of course a similar, though a proportionately smaller, decrement in number would be caused by death among those entering in the years 1898–1924. This is on the basis of the English mortality tables, which are ~~[illegible]~~ most likely unduly favourable for European residents resident in the Tropics, carefully selected lives though they may be.

But in fact it is not necessary to deal with the question actuarially. The C.E. says he wants 60% of his establishment to be of the Coopers Hill class, in which I fully agree with him. Now 60% on 80 = 48. But if 1·2 men per annum were to enter, and not one of them ever died while in the Service or retired before 30 years service, at the end of 30 years we should only have (1·2 × 30) 36 men ~~[illegible]~~ instead of the 48 required. In my opinion, this is more than the mere making of an inadequate provision for the future. It is a policy which is certain in a very few years to lead to the most serious embarrassment. I doubt if even 2 recruits per annum from Coopers Hill[×] will suffice. I certainly would not consent to taking fewer.

JW
7/1/95

× or from the R.E., if we can anyway make sure of getting any of that most desirable class.

The grounds on which the C.E. calculates on the experience of 1883-92 that an annual recruitment of 2·4 from all sources is sufficient for the full engineering estabt. seem satisfactory, but there must be some condition not taken into account. On the whole I gather that the strength of the estabt. for 1883 to 18~~92~~ 89 was 92, & for 1890 to 1892, 84 so that the average was ~~about~~ nearly 90. Now, if no one died & all [illegible] served 30 years (as the Hon Mr Bliss suggests) a recruitment of 2·4 a year would only give 72 men at the end of 30 years, so the ten years in question a total number of twenty four appointments were made to the engineer establishment, and this number was sufficient to keep the staff to its regular strength. It may then be assumed that in normal years a total recruitment of 2.4 men from all sources is required.

8. I agree with the Hon: Mr. Bliss that "at least half" (I should say rather more, about 60 per cent) of our men should be of the best class procurable_ i.e. either Coopers Hill men or Royal Engineers. The latter may be left out of consideration for the present as there is no immediate prospect of any becoming available.

9. Sixty per cent of 2.4 is 1.44 or say three men in two years, assuming that all classes remain in the service for the same time; but this will not be the case. The majority of the men appointed to the "Provincial Establishment" will pass through the subordinate ranks, and will join the Engineer Establishment four or five years later than those appointed direct from England; the great majority, I may say the overwhelming majority will never be fit to become Supdg Engineers and will under a most salutary rule, which I hope will never be relaxed, have to retire at fifty

---

so it must have been, so far as I can see, insufficient under present conditions.

Again, the C.E.'s estimate of 50% of the total recruitment art. 2 as sufficient to keep the Service manned by 48 men from Coopers Hill is a mere guess & is contradicted by the figures cited by the Hon Mr. Bliss. Like him, I have no Mortality tables at hand which gives the rates of Mortality of Englishmen serving in India but I calculate on such data as I have got that there wd not be more than 25 or 26 men ~~left at~~ accumulated at the end of 30 years if one man aged 21 was recruited each year. Accordingly I am of the same opinion as the Hon Mr. Bliss, and that one man a year is insufficient. To accumulate 48 men in 30 years we must recruit about 2 men a year, I think further inquiry seems to be necessary & if we are right India shd be addressed on the subject.

J.G.
7/1

while the great majority of the Cooper's Hill men will be able to serve till 55. The superior physique of the imported men will also render them less liable to break down from ill health, real or imaginary. From these three causes combined the total number of men belonging to the latter class in the service at any time, will bear a somewhat higher proportion to the whole staff than the proportion of annual recruits. In other words in order that the establishment may at any time contain the necessary 60 per cent of this class it will not be necessary that it should supply 60 per cent of the annual recruitment; probably fifty per cent will be about the right proportion.

10. In other words it seems from the data available that the proper number of men to be appointed from Cooper's Hill is about 1.2 annually or six in five years, instead of one per annum.

11. It is questionable whether it is worth while to raise the question of an appointment of one additional officer once in five years. In any case it would I think be better to await the result of the report of Mr Lyall's Committee before raising it. It may be, though at present it seems unlikely, that this Committee may

establishment up to its regular strength of 80.

2. I do not think it is worth while to go into the question of death rates, partly because the number of casualties from deaths is small compared ~~with~~ to that from other causes, and partly because the actual death rate of the department is much smaller than that of the general population between the same limits of age, owing no doubt to the fact that a large number of men when their health begins to fail, retire, and their deaths do not swell the death rate of the department. As a fact the average proportion of deaths during the last twenty five years has only been 14 per thousand, a rate probably considerably less than that derived from tables of mortality.

3. It will probably be more convenient to consider only the total number of casualties from all causes, deaths resignation and dismiss together.

4. As far as I can ascertain from records, in the twenty five years from 1870 to 1894 the total number of casualties was 120; this number includes the abnormal retirements of 1879 and 1893; the former need

not I think be deducted, as all the men who retired then, would in any case have retired before the end of 1894; for the latter a deduction of five must be made from the total, making the total number of normal casualties 115 or 4.60 per annum. The average strength of the department during this period has been 87 so that for the present strength, which will probably not be greatly altered for some years to come the number would be 4.23 per annum.

5. For the reasons stated in para 8 of my note of the 21st December, in order that sixty per cent of the establishment at any one time may be men appointed from England, the annual appointments of this class should be fifty per cent of the total; i.e. we ought to have 2.11 men appointed from England per annum.

6. I think therefore, with the Hon: Mr Bliss, that we should ask for a normal recruitment of two men annually from Coopers' Hill; the extra .11 may represent the chance of an occasional R.E. officer or other special appointment.

7. The question of the manner in which the remaining appointments should be made is one

of some importance.

8. At present one appointment per annum to the Imperial establishment is guaranteed to the Madras College up to 1st January 1897; the appointment is made to the "old 3rd grade" and the man appointed is brought in to the establishment of the "new 3rd grade" after one year's service, subject to passing the professional examination prescribed in para 12, Chap. II, Volume I P. W. Code

9. I am strongly of opinion that this annual appointment should cease, and that no men should be appointed locally to the Imperial Establishment, while all men appointed to the Provincial Establishment should pass through the

subordinate grades. In place of the one annual appointment as Assistant Engineer I would give two annually as Supervisors to men who had passed through the Engineering class, and were fully qualified as Assistant Engineers, and would announce that subject to the claims of qualified men already in the subordinate ranks, all future appointments to the Provincial Establishment would be made by selection from such of these men as were found fully qualified for the duties of an Assistant Engineer.

10. We have still ~~three~~ two vacancies on the permanent establishment, the total number of men on our

list being seventy ~~seven~~ eight against a sanctioned total of eighty; this number seventy ~~seven~~ eight includes one Cooper's Hill man (Mr. Edge) on practical training in England, and an Assistant Engineer (Mr. Ragavachariar) the minute of whose appointment to the Provincial Establishment is now in circulation

11. According to my reading of the Government of India's letters No. 334½ G of 2nd November 1894 and No. 3582 G + of 1st December 1894 this Government is at liberty to appoint ~~one~~ six ~~more~~ men to the Provincial Establishment at once, and two more during the current year. As yet only two have been appointed (Messrs. Krishnamachariar and Ragavachariar) and I would suggest the immediate appointment

× ~~Sent in Circ: to H.E.~~
~~the Govr. on 23/1/95~~

of two more, and that the Government of India should be informed that this has been done, and that it is proposed to to appoint during the current year such additional number, not exceeding four as may be necessary to bring the establishment up to its sanctioned strength of eighty. If this proposal be approved I will submit the names of two subordinates for immediate appointment

12. To sum up: I would recommend that the Government of India be informed

(a) that while thanking it for the manner in which it has met the wishes of this Government with regard to appointments to the Provincial Estab-

-lishment, the latter does not consider one appointment annually from Cooper's Hill to be sufficient, and requests (explaining the calculations on which the request is based) that arrangements may be made for the appointment of two men annually;

(b) that we have already appointed two men to the Provincial Establishment under the sanction given in letters No. 3347-2 G of 2 November 1894 and No. ×3582 G dated 1st Decr 1894 and propose to appoint two more immediately, and during the year 1895 such additional number not exceeding four as may be necessary to keep up the establishment to its sanctioned strength;

(c) that in future we

× ~~Sent in Cover to HE the Govr~~
~~23/1/95~~

propose to adopt the mode of recruitment indicated in ~~your~~ para 9 of this note, and request sanction to the appointment from time to time of such number of men as may be necessary to keep the establishment up to its sanctioned strength, with the proviso that not more than three men will be appointed in any one year without the special sanction of the Government of India.

13 To prevent misunderstanding I think it would be as well to add that in the opinion of this Government it will not be possible, within any period to which we can at present look forward, to reduce the strength of the Engineer

establishment below
its present sanctioned
scale of eighty.

24.1 W

~~H.E. the Governor~~
~~The Hon. Mr Bliss C.I.E.~~
~~The Hon. Mr Grose~~

~~Recruitment of the~~
~~Engineer Establishment~~

All communications
should be addressed
to the Secretary.

No. 3582 G.
GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.
PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.
GENERAL.

15 P

To

The Secretary to the Government of Madras,
Public Works Department.

Calcutta, the 1st. December 1894.

Sir,

With reference to paragraph 2 of Government of India Public Works Department letter No.3347½ G., dated 2nd. November 1894, I am directed to state that as there is another appointment in the Provincial service from the Upper Subordinate staff on the Government of India list available, the Government of India are pleased to allow that vacancy to be also utilised on the Madras list, and to the appointment of an Upper Subordinate of the Madras establishment to fill it.

2. I am to request that the names of the Upper Subordinates promoted against these two vacancies may be reported to the Government of India.

I have the honour to be,
Sir,
Your most obedient servant,

G. H. Walker

Under Secy. to the Govt. of India.

Documents accompanying:-
Nil.

A.S.

9401

No. 2232W of 12-8-92

Recd 10.12.94

P. W. DEPARTMENT.

READ the following:—

Letter from the Govt of India No. 3582 G of 1/12/94

FOR ORDERS.

× Sent in Circn to S.E.

One subordinate has already been appointed under the sanction given in para 2 of India's letter No. 3347½ × G of 2d November 1894, and if our reading of para × of that letter is correct we shall be able to appoint four more during 1895, making, with the one now sanctioned, six in all. This will be rather more than we shall want, but it is presumed that we are not bound to utilise the whole number unless it is considered desirable

I suppose we must be guided by events - but I am not quite sure whether this new man is not included in this years' allowance of four. I think if we have to make up as many as six - we shall have to ask India to clear it up.

W
6 Jan

43-500-6-8-94.

to do so.

2. Before submitting the name of a subordinate to fill the post now mentioned I wish to consult the Chief Engineer for Irrigation and Supdg. Engineers, as to the merits of some subordinates with whom I have not much personal acquaintance

21/1 W

CWBS 2/12

L.O. for the present

8/1

EP. 9/1/6

H.S. 3/4 R 5/1.

---

(69)

FOR ORDERS.

Provincial Engineer Establishment.

168

P/A. No. 211 W d/ 30 January 1895. P.W.D.

To the Secy to the G. of I. P.W.D.

Sir,

With reference to para 2 of your letter No. 3582 G dated 1st Decr 1894, I am directed to state that the names of the two upper subordinates promoted to the Provincial Engineer estab against the two vacancies which have been allotted to the Madras list, are as follows—

S. Krishnamachariyar, B.C.E. Sub Engineer 3rd Grade.

T.T. Raghavachariyar, B.A., B.C.E., Sub Engineer 2nd Grade & Honorary Asst. Engr.

I have &c

2. A further communication re the present system of the recruitment of the Provincial service will be submitted shortly—

19/1

W

CWBS 28/1/95

Lc 211 W. d/ 30th January 189

S.a.W.
E.F.J.

x. 4/2

INDEXED. 4/2

Note for His Excellency the Governor:—

On looking into the Government of India's letter again I think the intention is that only four men (in addition to the two already appointed) and not six as stated in para 11 of my note of the 24th January should be appointed during 1895. The draft letter provides for this correction; with the exception of this it is in accordance with the note, the proposals in which have already been approved by His Excellency and his honorable colleagues

I believe this is the right view
W

J
6/2
W

Recruitment of the Engineer Establishment

(1). H.E. the Governor

W.
11 Feb

27/2/95
This took 16 days in travelling from H.E. since

J.G. 27/2

No. 506 W dd 4 March/95

~~Establishment~~

To,

The Secretary to the
Government of India,
P. W. Dept.

Genl Establt

170

Sir,

I am directed to acknowledge the receipt of your letters No. 3347½ G of 2nd November 1894 and 3582 G of 1st Decr. 1894 and to express the thanks of His Excellency the Governor in Council for the manner in which the wishes of this Government as regards appointments to the Provincial Establishment have been met by the Government of India.

2. It is not quite clear what number of appointments this Government is at liberty to make,

but it is believed to be the intention of the Govt of India that a total of six appointments may be made before the end of 1895.

3. Acting on this supposition two appointments, already reported in my letter No 211 W of 30th Jan 1895 have already been made, and it is proposed to make two more immediately, and such further number, not exceeding two, during the current year, as may be necessary to bring the establishment of the Department up to its sanctioned strength.

4. I am however with reference to the last sentence of para 1 of your letter No 3347½ G of 2nd November 1894 to ask for a reconsideration of the decision to appoint only one officer annually from Cooper's Hill to the establishment of this Presidency; in the opinion of His Excellency the Governor in Council this will not give a sufficient number of officers capable of filling the higher posts in the Department.

5. Owing to the frequent changes in the organisation and strength of the establishment, and to the special retirements of 1879 & 1894, it is not easy to calculate the exact annual number of recruits required to keep the establishment up to its sanctioned strength, but the following calculation is, it is believed

as nearly accurate as the conditions allow.

6. It has been found from an examination of records that the total number of casualties of all kinds during the twenty five years from 1870 to 1894 inclusive, was one hundred and twenty; this number includes the special retirements of 1879 and 1894. No deduction need be made on account of the former, as all the men who retired then would in any case have left the service before the end of 1894, but a deduction of six must be made for the latter, leaving one hundred and fourteen or 4.56 per annum as the normal number of casualties

7. The strength of the establishment during the period in question has varied from eighty to ninety two; taking the average at eighty seven the annual loss to be met by recruitment is 5.24 per cent, or 4.19 for the present strength of eighty, which is not likely to be materially altered for some years to come.

8. In the opinion of this Government it is necessary, in order to provide a sufficient number of men capable of filling the higher posts of the Dept., that about sixty per cent of the establishment at any one time should be officers appointed from England; it is not however necessary that the proportion of recruits should be quite as larg

as this.

8.9. It will be explained hereafter that it is proposed that the greater part of the men appointed to the Provincial Establishment shall pass through the subordinate grades, and as they will, save in very rare cases, never rise to the rank of Suptg Engineer, they will ordinarily have to retire at fifty, while the men appointed from England can serve till fifty five; the superior physique of the latter will also render them less liable to break down from ill health. They will therefore join earlier and serve longer than the locally appointed men, and the proportion serving at any one time will be somewhat higher than that due to the proportion of recruits.

9.10. For these reasons this Government is of opinion that the number of men appointed from England should be one half of the total recruitment, that is that the appointments from Cooper's Hill should not be less than two — annually.

11. It is assumed that the supply will be entirely divided between the Provincial Establishment and Cooper's Hill, for the third source of supply (the Royal Engineers) need hardly be taken into account; only one R. E. officer has joined this Department since

1874, and none since 1884.

11. With regard to the source of supply of the Provincial service I am to state that in the opinion of this Government all men appointed to that service should pass through the subordinate grades. The practice of appointing Assistant Engineers direct from the local college has not been found to give satisfactory results, while (as not more than one appointment at the most can be given each year) the difference of the prospects of the first and second students of the year is altogether out of proportion to the difference in their merits.

12. For these reasons, this Government propose to abolish the practice of appointment direct from the College in 1897 when the present guarantee expires, and in place of the single appointment of Assistant Engineer now given, to make at least two appointments annually as Supervisors, of men who have qualified in all respects as Assistant Engineer.

13. Subject to the claims of subordinates already in the service, future appointments to the Provincial establishment will be made entirely by selection from the men thus appointed to the subordinate grades.

15. It does not seem necessary to fix any limit to the number of men to be thus promoted, except that fixed by the total strength of the establishment; it will probably be two or three, but to prevent any excessive number of appointments this Government would be willing to undertake that not more than three should be made in any one year without the special sanction of the Government of India.

16. I am to add that in the opinion of this Government it will not be possible, within any period to which we can at present look

forward, to reduce the strength of the Engineer establishment below the present sanctioned scale of eighty.

220

I have &c.,

14.2.95

1880
6.95

D [illegible]ED
[illegible] MAR. 95

To
The Hon the Chief Secretary
for favour of counterinitials
with reference to para 13
the proposal in which has
already been approved
by all Hon: members.

D
12.2
W

26/2)

Note for the Honorable Mr.
Bliss, C.I.E.

With reference to the
Honorable Member's Note
on the accompanying draft
letter to the Government
of India on the subject
of appointments to the
~~Provincial~~ Establishment
of the P.W. Dept., it is
submitted that there
has been no delay in
this office

The papers returned
from His Excellency on
the 12' February. They were
sent to the Chief Secretary
for counterinitials on
the 13th; they came back
on the 26th and were
sent on again in circu-
lation the same day.

CHWS
28/2 95 DW

N.S.

attention of the C.S.
h. be drawn to this, I
think

W
1/3/95