

Govt. of (1889) Madras.
EDUCATIONAL.

Order thereon

No. 1927 of 17th July 189

Communicated to
Officers of the P. W. Dept
for information.

16/ R.A.B.

Issued

Recd.

Encl.

G.O., 20th June 1889, No. 351.

JUNE.

Upper Secondary Examination.

Passing orders relative to the constitution of
the new — and the continuance of the Middle
School Examination under the name of the Lower
Secondary Examination.

Ch. Engr for the
C. E. Engrs
Supdt Engrs
Ch. to Engr
Engr P. W. Engrs
Engr by Engrs.

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS.

EDUCATIONAL DEPARTMENT.

READ—again the following papers :—

G.O., dated 24th August 1887, No. 458, Educational.
" 11th July 1888, " 401, "
" 22nd Sept. " " 556, "
" 24th " " " 557, "

READ—also the following papers :—

No. 528-D.

The accompanying note by Captain Baddeley who, as member of the Civil Engineering College Board of Examiners, has had considerable experience of the educational tests required for entrance to the Public Works Department, is forwarded with reference to paragraph 3 of G.O., No. 401, Educational, dated 11th July 1888.

2. It appears to the undersigned that the proposed exemption from passing in the vernaculars can have but little effect so far as the Public Works Department is concerned and may therefore as well be omitted.

3. Under the new rules for education in the Civil Engineering College of upper subordinates, paragraphs 99, 100 and 109 of the Public Works Department Code will need considerable modification, if not omission. In fact it can only be in very rare cases that any outsider can be appointed to the upper subordinate grade of the department. The only question is whether, to meet these very rare cases, it is advisable to retain section ii (b) of article 21 of the notification. The undersigned is of opinion it is not.

OOTACAMUND,
14th August 1888.

(Signed) J. O. HASTED, Colonel, R.E.,
Secretary to Govt., P.W.D.

To the Educational Department, with note by Captain W. L. C. Baddeley, R.E.

ENCLOSURE.

NOTE by Captain W. L. C. BADDELEY, R.E., dated 11th August 1888.

The notification attached to G.O., No. 401, Educational, of 11th July 1888, appear so far as the Public Works Department is concerned, to have been framed without sufficient knowledge of the manner in which the department is recruited.

2. With the exception of Royal Engineers and Civil Engineers appointed from England, the Public Works Department is recruited entirely from the Madras College of Engineering, the numbers taken on yearly being on an average—

One Assistant Engineer.

Upper subordinates as required to fill vacancies.

3. Most of the upper subordinates are appointed first as temporary overseers, and gradually work their way into the permanent ranks of the department.

4. The Assistant Engineers do not pass in any vernacular while at the college, but after joining the department they have to pass the third-class test in the vernacular of the district they are serving, before they can be promoted to Executive Engineer, fourth-grade, and prior to this, they have to pass the lower standard in some vernacular before they can be promoted to the first-grade of Assistant Engineer.

5. So far then as the Assistant Engineers appointed from the college are concerned, there will not be many cases in which the concession in paragraph 21 will apply, as but few of the students will have passed the High School examination, and, in any case, I think it would be inadvisable to make any difference between the Assistant Engineers appointed from the college here, and those appointed from England. It is far better that all Assistant Engineers in the department should pass the examinations laid down in the Public Works Code.

6. As regards upper subordinates, these pass no examination in the vernacular after joining the department; but the college course includes a vernacular examination.

7. It is not probable that many of the students in the college will pass the High School examination before entering the college, and I would therefore make no change in the present system, under which the vernaculars form part of the college course for upper subordinates.

8. To sum up: I would make no change in the present rules regarding examinations in the vernacular for the members of the Public Works Department.

9. As regards technical subjects there appears to be considerable misunderstanding, partly the fault of the code.

10. Paragraph 99 would lead one to suppose that there would be no difficulty in substituting the high school certificate for certain portions of the college course; but as a matter of fact, this would lead to great confusion and difficulty and would be unsatisfactory in every way.

11. Quite recently Government have laid down elaborate rules for the education in the college of upper subordinates, and I am convinced that it would be a fatal mistake to attempt to carry out the concession proposed in clause ii of paragraph 21.

12. What is meant by the *lower standard tests* I do not know; there is no such test in the Public Works Department for upper subordinates.

13. In short, paragraph 99 of the code should be amended to accord with the revised scheme of education in the College of Engineering.

14. Lastly, I wish to refer to the special appointments made from time to time in the upper subordinate grades. It might be held that the fact of having passed the High School examination should give a man a claim to such appointment; but I would submit that these appointments are only made in the Public Works Department on account of some special qualification, such as mechanical engineering including diving, well-sinking, &c., and other special classes of work. In these cases theoretical examinations should have no weight at all; now this principle is clearly recognized in paragraph 100 of the code.

15. Paragraph 107 of the code should be amended as all soldiers now have to pass through the college and obtain certificates.

16. It will be seen that so far as the Public Works Department is concerned, I would recommend that none of the proposals in the notification be given effect to. The new scheme at the college has only just commenced to work, and if the department is to be recruited from some source outside the college, we should look for our upper subordinates among the sub-overseers, many of whom have had considerable practical experience.

17. This last point is, I think, one of great importance: a large amount of theory is not required in the department, most certainly not in the upper subordinate establishment; and I am convinced that the effect of allowing a pass in the High School examination to take the place of the examinations now prescribed for the college courses, would have a bad effect upon the department.

From the Superintendent, Government Central Museum, dated Madras, 16th August 1888, No. 492.

ABSTRACT.—Stating that he has no remarks to offer on the subjects dealt with in Public G.O., No. 401 of the 11th July (High School examination scheme).

Proceedings of the Board of Revenue (Separate Revenue), dated 17th August 1888, No. 395, Press.

Read—G.O., Revenue Department, dated 7th August 1888, No. 4643.

Resolution—dated 17th August 1888, No. 395.

The Board, in this department, have no objection to the exemption of persons who have passed in optional subjects Nos. 3, 6 or 7, from the corresponding tests. No. 3 corresponds with D iii, No. 6 with D iv and No. 7 with D i and ii.

2. There is nothing in the High School examination which in any way corresponds with test E, Linguistic, of the Salt tests. The 2nd branch of this test consists of "reading an Arzi badly written in a difficult hand and badly spelt." If a passed candidate is really acquainted with a language to the extent required by the test E, it can be no hardship to call upon him to pass. If he is unable to do so, he may fairly be required to learn the language to the extent required. The Board would not therefore exempt passed candidates from test E.

(True Extract.)

(Signed) HERBERT BRADLEY,
Secretary.

To the Secretary to Government, Revenue Department.

Mis. G.O., No. 5135.

Transferred to the Educational Department with an expression of concurrence in the opinion of the Board.

(True Extract.)

Ootacamund,
29th August 1888.

(Signed) C. A. GALTON,
Ag. Secretary to Government.

To the Educational Department.
" Commissioner of Salt, Abkari and Separate Revenue.

From M. A. LAWSON, Esq., Government Botanist and Director of Cinchona Plantations, Nilgiris, to the Secretary to Government, Revenue Department, dated Ootacamund, 23rd August 1888, No. 51.

With reference to G.O., No. 401, dated the 11th July 1888, Education, communicated to me under G.O., No. 4643, of 7th August 1888, Revenue, I have the honor to inform you that it would be useful for the clerks in this department to know something of book-keeping before entering upon their duties, but that beyond this being made compulsory, I think candidates might select for themselves the other two subjects from the optional branches.

From H. O. C. CARDOZA, Esq., Superintendent, Madras Survey, to the Secretary to Government, Revenue Department, dated Camp Huvinahadgalli, 27th August 1888, No. 125-G.

I have the honor to report that in G.O., No. 299, dated 10th February 1863, surveyors, draftsmen and lithographers were exempted from passing examinations. Reference G.O., No. 4643, dated 7th August 1888, forwarding, for remarks, Proceedings in the Educational Department, No. 401, dated 11th July 1888, regarding the High School examination scheme. The circumstances under which this exemption was granted no longer exist and the exemption should, I think, be withdrawn.

2. With reference to paragraph 10 of the draft notification, candidates for employment in all grades need not be required to pass in optional branch No. 3, mensuration, or No. 7, surveying and levelling. Surveyors should be required to pass in both these branches; computers in No. 3, mensuration, and No. 1, mathematics; draftsmen in No. 20, drawing; printers and lithographers in No. 23, printing, which, I presume, includes lithography; and clerks and accountants in No. 27, correspondence and business transactions.

From the Inhabitants of Cuddapah Town, to His Excellency the Right Honorable the Governor in Council, Fort St. George, dated Cuddapah, 5th September 1888.

The humble memorial of the undersigned educated classes residing in the Cuddapah Town.

MOST RESPECTFULLY SHEWETH,

That your Excellency's memorialists understand from the notification, dated 11th July 1888 (published in the *Fort St. George Gazette*, dated 7th August 1888), that your Excellency has been pleased to sanction the institution of an examination styled the High School examination: A candidate passing the said examination is declared competent for admission to the special tests, higher or lower grades.

2. That with reference to the above concession your Excellency's humble memorialists beg to observe as follow.

A candidate for this High School examination is required to pass in the compulsory and optional subjects noted in the margin to qualify himself for the public service and for admission to the special tests, higher or lower grades, as mentioned above. Under the existing rules a matriculate (with hand-writing test) who, though he has already passed the same compulsory subjects as are prescribed for the High School examination, is not competent for admission to the Special test, higher grades, *i.e.*, Civil or Revenue higher grades.

Subjects.

Compulsory—

- I. English (first language).
- II. Second language.
- III. Mathematics.
- IV. History and Geography.

Optional—

Any three of the twenty-eight optional subjects referred to in the Notification, dated 11th July 1888 (published in the *Fort St. George Gazette*, dated 7th August 1888).

3. That your Excellency's memorialists beg therefore to submit the following points for the favorable consideration and orders of your Excellency in Council:—

- (a) Why not a matriculate (with hand-writing test), who has, of course, already passed the same compulsory subjects as are prescribed for the High School examination, be allowed to go up for special tests, lower and higher grades, as a high school candidate is allowed to do?
- (b) If not, how is he eligible for admission to the higher grades. Is he required to pass the whole examination again, though he has already passed the compulsory subjects at his University entrance examination?
- (c) As going up for the whole subjects is seemingly unnecessary, why not (if at all necessary) he be allowed to appear for any three (3) of the optional subjects referred to in the notification and declared eligible, after passing the said subjects, for higher grades and then placed in the same standard as a high school candidate?
- (d) Why not a matriculate, who has passed all the marginally-noted tests prescribed for the post of Tahsildar, be allowed to go up for higher grades—without passing the optional subjects of the High School examination, if necessary—as in

Tahsildar's Test.

1. Translation test (Lower grade).
2. Précis-writing test (Higher grade.)
3. Criminal test (Lower grade).
4. Revenue test (do.)

the case of a high school candidate who has not (it should be borne in mind) still passed the revenue and criminal tests, lower grades, and who, therefore, evidently possesses less proficiency than a matriculate above referred to.

4. That your Excellency's humble memorialists, in conclusion, trust that the above points will be fully discussed in the Council and requisite orders passed early on the subject.

For which act of kindness your Excellency's humble memorialists shall, in duty bound, ever pray.

Proceedings of the Board of Revenue (Settlement, Land Records and Agriculture), dated 6th September 1888, Mis. No. 2456.

Read—Proceedings of the Madras Government, dated 7th August 1888, Mis. No. 4643.

Resolution—dated 6th September 1888, Mis. No. 2456.

The facts and figures set forth in paragraph 11 of the Committee's report show that the supply of candidates for the public service, and the consequently increased demand for employment in the public service, is so great that the Government may reasonably lay down a higher standard of qualification for even the lower grades than has hitherto been deemed sufficient. The Board accept the conclusions of the committee, therefore, as recorded in paragraph 12 of the report.

2. They do not agree with them, however, in their recommendations as to the Matriculation and F.A. examinations. It is possible that, from various and unforeseen causes, a lad, who has elected to read for a degree, may be unable to continue his studies. Why should all the time spent on them be lost to him? The Board agree, therefore, in the first minute of dissent, which would allow the Matriculation and F.A. examinations their *pro tanto* value, so as to excuse from re-examination in the same and equivalent tests in the High School Examination scheme.

3. The Board view with favor the suggestion of Mr. Adam in paragraph 3 (*ad finem*) of his minute of dissent regarding the division of the Service into two branches, to the upper one of which only graduates would, after a time to be fixed, be admitted, and they most cordially subscribe to his protest against the levy of differential fees from candidates coming from other than "recognized" schools. In this they think that every consideration of justice and fairness demands that *all* candidates should pay alike, "irrespective of the place or manner" in which they may have been educated.

(True Extract.)

(Signed) P. RAJARATNA MUDALIAR,
Secretary.

To the Secretary to Government, Revenue Department.

From the Acting Registrar of the High Court of Judicature, Appellate Side, dated Madras, 6th September 1888, No. 2283.

ABSTRACT.—Forwarding a transcript of the minutes recorded by the Honorable Justices Muthusami Aiyar, Parker and Wilkinson on the proposals in the High School Examination scheme affecting District Munsifs, and stating that the Honorable the Chief Justice and the other Honorable Judges have made no observations.

ENCLOSURE.

Mr. Justice Muthusami Aiyar.—As a general rule, I would not appoint a non-graduate as a district munsif if a graduate competent to do the work devolving on a district munsif is available. Though there is no restriction at present, such as is suggested in these papers, on our choice of district munsifs, I believe there is a large number of graduates among them. Valuing highly as I do academical honors and special tests devised as tests of fitness for special appointments in the public service, I think that efficiency and integrity of character, tested by actual service, are not altogether to be overlooked. Cases may arise after 1890, as they have arisen heretofore, in which an undergraduate or even a matriculate who entered the public service after 1890 may have better proved his fitness by work done whilst in service or by advocacy as a pleader than a graduate. The committee seem to me to assume that no such contingency will ever arise, but I am not without apprehension that they are a little over sanguine. The High Court cannot pledge itself to appointing as district munsif a graduate who may happen to be a clerk in a District Court in preference to an undergraduate who may have done good work as a first-grade pleader or

as a Court Sheristadar. It seems to me that the proper mode of encouraging University degrees is, not to invest them with an artificial value and credit those who possess them with aptitude for work which requires a special course of practical training, but to leave it to the High Court and Government to prescribe the B.A. degree as the educational test necessary to appearing for the first-grade pleaders' examination, when they are satisfied that the step can be taken without hampering those who are responsible for selecting the best men available as judicial officers. I am not therefore in favor of adopting the suggestion of the committee without any qualification.

Mr. Justice Parker.—I am opposed to the proposals of the committee in paragraph 22 so far as they relate to district munsifs. If carried out, the selection of the High Court would be very much limited to High Court vakils, and large numbers of first-grade pleaders in the districts would be excluded as well as Court servants. It is quite right to require some test of general education (say F.A.) from candidates for legal employment, but I think it would be unreasonable to lay down the rule that no one should be appointed to a judicial office unless he had taken a University degree. No such rule obtains in England, where it would be regarded as absurd that a distinguished lawyer should not be promoted to the bench because he did not happen to have gone to a University in his youth. I think the committee entertain an exaggerated view of the value of a degree and its importance in after-life.

The proposal would unduly hamper the High Court's power of selection, and prevent the appointment of really well qualified men in the mofussil.

Mr. Justice Wilkinson.—It is proposed that after 1892 no one should be appointed a district munsif, except for distinguished service, unless he is a graduate and was employed in the public service prior to 1st January 1890. This would unduly restrict our choice of men for the post of district munsif, and it may be open to doubt whether it would be possible to find qualified men for the post. I do not think the proposal a fair one, and, if accepted, the dates would have to be changed and considerably postponed. It is, however, open to doubt whether a University degree is so essential as the committee appear to think. Many of our best munsifs at present are men who have never graduated, and I think the adoption of the proposal would give undue value to the mere taking of a degree.

From the Rev. Dr. MILLER, Principal of the Madras Christian College, to the Chief Secretary to the Government of Madras, dated Burgo Park, 25th September 1888.

I have the honor to address you regarding G.O., No. 401, of date 11th July 1888, and bearing on the High School Examination scheme. I regret that I am compelled to do so hurriedly, as the Government Order has only just reached me, and the time allowed for the expression of opinion will have expired before this communication can be laid before Government.

I have the honor to express the hope that the time allowed for the expression of opinion on the scheme will be greatly extended. I do so on the ground that three months is quite insufficient for the wide and repeated consultation which must take place among those interested in education if their suggestions are to be of value; and also on the ground that the scheme now proposed will profoundly affect the education and history of Southern India for generations, and ought to be very fully discussed before it is introduced. I trust that some consideration will be given to the present letter, even though it be somewhat later of reaching you than the appointed time.

The following are the remarks which I have the honor to submit upon the scheme:—

(1) I greatly approve of some scheme of the kind being introduced at a fitting time and in a prudent way. An examination like the Matriculation examination of the University, which is not meant to test anything but fitness to begin a certain course of training, is necessarily but ill adapted to test fitness for entering on the practical work of life. In the very nature of the case the introductory fragment of a higher kind of education should not be put, longer than is unavoidable, in the place of a complete education of an inferior description. Whatever kind of education is given to a pupil ought, as far as possible, to be complete within itself. For reasons such as these, I entirely sympathize with the objects proposed in the present scheme.

(2) I have the honor to say that the details of the scheme seem to me to be capable of considerable improvement, but that I shall not enter at present on any consideration of details, partly because, in order to do so profitably, I should need to consult both men and documents that I have no access to in this country, but chiefly because I feel that in present circumstances my primary duty is to beg the attention of Government to a question of infinitely greater moment than any re-arrangement of details.

(3) I have the honor to say that the introduction of the scheme of examination at the time and in the way proposed by the majority of the committee will, in my opinion, be simply ruinous to the education of Southern India. I need not enlarge on the reasons why this is my unhesitating conviction, because many of the chief of them have been well stated already by Mr. Adam in his minute of dissent. With the general course of reasoning in paragraphs 1 to 6 of that minute, I absolutely agree. The suddenness of the change which it is proposed to make will be not less destructive to higher education as it exists at present, and to all the interests depending upon it, than Mr. Adam represents. This is a point on which I am convinced that there will be virtual unanimity among those responsible for the management of colleges and secondary schools, and those who come into personal contact with boys and lads who are now receiving education. It is significant that Mr. Adam is supported by every member of the committee (except the Secretary) who has had any experience of managing a high school for native boys.

It will doubtless be said that University education must be a weak thing if it is to fall to ruin as soon as it ceases to be an avenue to the Service of the State. But, whether the reproach be merited or not, the facts as they are must be faced. And the plain fact is that, if the proposals of the majority of the committee be adopted, the whole present scheme of liberal education, including the University, its affiliated colleges and dependent high schools, will be brought to the verge of ruin. Liberal education may indeed revive on some new footing in course of time; but that continuous development which is so important in educational matters will have been destroyed. And, in the whole circumstances, I do not regard it as any great reproach to the University, or its authorities, or its students, that such loss should be the inevitable result of a sudden change like the one proposed. It might have been better if the University had never been so much of an avenue to Government employment as it has been. In that case, its growth would have been slower, but it would have stood more than it does in its own natural strength. But, in point of fact, the extraordinary increase in the number of students in the last fifteen or twenty years has been mainly caused by the action of Government in connecting the examinations of the University so immediately with admission to its service. It should not be surprising that the sudden withdrawal of an influence which has caused abnormally rapid increase should cause almost irreparable injury. It may be best for a young plant that it be left to grow without props or artificial stimulus. But if props and stimulus are supplied so that it grows with unnatural rapidity, even a healthy plant will droop and perhaps die if the external influences which have forced it on are torn away completely in a moment. Now I have the honor to point out that the recommendations of the majority of the committee amount to the *complete and immediate* tearing away of the support which liberal culture has hitherto received from its being the only way of admission to the Service of the State. The committee say that they do not wish to remove the Matriculation and F.A. examinations "too suddenly from the list of qualifying examinations." But the proposal of the majority is that these examinations be so removed at the end of 1891. Now, one who is to be eligible for Government service in 1892 must, according to the scheme, begin to study for the new examination at the commencement of 1889, so that from the beginning of next year, study for the lower examinations of the University will count nothing towards Government employment. In other words, those who have already begun to prepare themselves under the direction of the University for the service of Government, are not to be turned back and compelled to take the new road towards their end; but henceforward no one is to be permitted to take the old road. I fail to see how any change could be more sudden. It is true that the course for Matriculation is nominally

only two years, so that a boy beginning to study for it in 1890 may, theoretically, become eligible for Government employment by passing in 1891. This makes a difference of a year in theory. But in point of fact it takes three years' study for boys to pass the Matriculation examination in all but a few exceptional cases. But the majority of the committee would probably deny that the separation between the liberal culture of the University and Government employment is so complete as I represent. No doubt they suppose that, by reserving certain specified offices and all appointments carrying salaries above Rs. 250 *per mensem*, they have established a sufficient connection between the two. This connection might perhaps be of some value if the proviso "except for distinguished service" had not been inserted. Now, I should be sorry indeed to see it made impossible for any but a graduate to hold high office under Government. I am quite of opinion that "distinguished service" should qualify for all possible promotion. Still, the effect of the distinct statement of this proviso should be taken into account. I believe few officials will ever come in sight of offices carrying salaries of Rs. 250 *per mensem* who will not have influence enough—unless they have been notoriously inefficient—to have their services pronounced "distinguished." I believe, therefore, that if the proposals of the majority were ever carried out, the restriction of high offices to University men would be on the whole a dead letter. But whether I am right or wrong in this belief, the important fact is that the same belief will certainly be entertained by the lads—and even more by the parents of the lads, who will have to select whether they are to enter the University or to aim at Government employment. Those who know anything of the sentiments of native students and their parents, will agree with me in saying that not one in ten of them will doubt that, when the time comes, the man who has entered Government service by the common route will find himself in as favorable a position for reaching the highest office as the man who possesses a University degree. Thus the separation between Government service and liberal culture would be virtually complete from the time when these proposals are carried into effect. Their practical result would be that, from the beginning of next year, none will enter the University except those who have decidedly made up their minds to become lawyers, doctors, or teachers, and those who seek for knowledge and training without regard to the positions they are to fill in after-life. I believe this last class to be on the increase and to be larger than is commonly supposed; but all these classes taken together will supply a number of students small indeed compared with those passing through the University course at present. The difference will be so great as to amount to nothing less than the ruin of the present scheme of education. That that scheme is far from perfect, I at once admit; but that it has been a failure on the whole, or that it is incapable of all needed improvement, I emphatically deny. But even if it be held that it is so bad as to need entire removal, I have the honor to submit that its removal should be effected in a method more direct and open than is now proposed.

(4) I have the honor to ask attention further to a point which is but little adverted to by Mr. Adam. The educational policy laid down in 1854, and approved of repeatedly and very recently by the Government of India, is that of relying on private effort, aided, organized and directed by the State, for the supply of the means of education. This policy depends for success on the willing co-operation of private parties. Such co-operation cannot be expected if changes are forced on managers which involve either immediate and complete remodelling of their institutions or their virtual extinction, especially if such changes are forced on them at a moment's notice and without previous consultation. So far as I can gather, there has been no consultation with managers as to the changes now proposed. Private effort is represented, it is true, by a small minority of the committee whose report is under consideration; but that committee expressly states that their function is limited "to elaborating the scheme sketched by the Director of Public Instruction and to preparing a draft notification embodying the same." I have little doubt that, if properly consulted and allowed sufficient time, managers of schools will gladly consent to, and co-operate in, the wise and gradual introduction of changes similar to those proposed; but I have the honor to express the opinion that the course recommended by the majority of the committee (that of Government simply forcing changes which will revolutionize all secondary

education at a stroke, and suddenly empty institutions for collegiate education) would fatally discourage private effort and amounts to a virtual reversal of the educational policy to which Government has once and again announced its determination to adhere.

(5) The question thus arises how the desired changes can be effected without driving private parties from the educational field, and without destroying the educational system that has grown up in connection with the university? This may be done in various ways. One such way is sketched by Mr. Adam in paragraph 6 of his minute of dissent. Another way might be the early removal of the Matriculation examination from the list of examinations qualifying for Government service, but the retention of the F.A. examination for a longer period and for a period left in the meanwhile undefined. A third, and probably a preferable method, would be to leave the University examinations on their present footing until the new course is introduced in some of the secondary schools, and has produced men actually trained in it, but to offer special aid and special recognition to such institutions as would at once establish classes preparing for the proposed service examination. I am certain that some institutions would gladly begin classes of this kind at once, and that a scheme allowed thus to find its own way will in the end produce more lasting and more salutary results than one which is forced on reluctant managers simply because it is theoretically complete. Yet another method in which the transition may be effected gradually, and, therefore, safely, would be to announce that from 1895 or 1896 (1891 being in every point of view impracticably soon), the lower examinations of the university should cease to have any connection with Government employment, but to announce at the same time that in ordinary circumstances only those who had received a liberal university education would be eligible for posts carrying salaries of Rs. 120 *per mensem* and upwards. This is the method which I am most inclined to favor. The practical effect of fixing the limit at Rs. 120 will be totally different from that of fixing it at Rs. 250. Young men and their parents will in that case understand that university men are really to be preferred. The fixing of the limit at Rs. 120 would induce a very large number to study for the new examination and yet would not suddenly empty the institutions dependent on the university. Graduates will ere long be available for all the higher posts under Government, and it will be best for the public service in the long run that these posts should be filled by those who have been liberally educated rather than by those who have received a lower, though practical, training.

I am not blind to the defects of our present graduates. The training afforded by the university does not as yet do them all the good that a liberal training should do. But the university has been only thirty years in existence. It has had to grapple with countless difficulties and has had to gain experience in untried circumstances. It is unreasonable to demand that it should be already all that it ought to become. But in schemes like the present a long future should be taken into account, and there is reason to believe that the university will steadily improve until the culture it affords becomes all that liberal culture should be.

I am not prepared to urge the adoption of any one of these four schemes rather than another. I could not even make up my own mind as to which of them should be preferred without full consultation with those acquainted with schools and colleges in all parts of Southern India. All that I have the honor to urge at present is that one of these schemes, or some other that will have a similar effect, must be adopted if the transition which I am as anxious as the committee to see made is to be beneficial. An attempt to force on a sudden transition without regard to practical necessities would produce evils which Government and others who have the good of the country at heart would lament when it was too late to remedy them.

(6) With regard to the question of the recognition of schools, dealt with in paragraph 25 of the committee's report, I have the honor to express my entire concurrence with the principle on which the committee proceed, viz., that it is "one of the highest and most sacred duties of the Government of a country . . . to ensure to the people educating agencies which fulfil all the conditions which are

necessary for the healthful development—intellectual, physical and moral—of its youth.” One of the chief reasons for the declared policy of the State in withdrawing from the direct maintenance of educational institutions has always seemed to me to be the far greater power which it can exercise over all classes of institutions when it is not itself a rival manager. But I venture to think that the application which the committee recommend Government to make of the principle they lay down is far from adequate. The difference between an institution that is approved and one that is not approved is by no means sufficiently marked by making the admission fee of pupils from the one Rs. 10 and that of pupils from the other Rs. 20. The only adequate way of carrying out the principle laid down by the committee is that candidates should be admitted to the examination from recognized schools *alone*. Exceptional cases will occur, but these should be dealt with as avowed exceptions in some such way as the university grants special exemptions from its ordinary rules requiring attendance at an affiliated institution. To admit pupils from a school, though at an enhanced fee, is to recognize that school. To call a school from which pupils are admitted “unrecognized” seems to me a confusion of terms. There is no way by which proper training can be secured for candidates for Government employment except to see that some considerable part of their scholastic years is spent under good and healthful influence. Proper training cannot be secured by means of examinations alone. Perhaps it will be said that I am proposing to introduce a new principle. This, however, is not the case. It is the principle on which the university is bound to act by its Act of Incorporation, and on which it has been acting for many years. The university does not indeed deal with secondary schools, because over these it has no control. But it provides that from the time when a student comes under its authority he must, in all ordinary cases, attend a college for whose fitness to educate and train him it makes itself responsible. I simply recommend that Government should do for those preparing for its examinations what the university does for those preparing for its final examinations, viz., see that their preparations are carried on in institutions which aim at real education and training.

At the same time I would not have the conditions of recognition for the High School examination made very stringent all at once. I think it should suffice to lay down a few simple conditions bearing on such matters as the staff of teachers employed, the accommodation provided, sanitation and provision for gymnastic exercise, the adoption of inter-scholastic rules for admission and promotion, and the charging of a certain minimum fee. At present, this last is particularly important, because it is by unlimited under-selling that institutions of the highest class are just now in most danger of being injured. If a minimum fee is insisted on in all recognized schools, the best schools will soon charge a fee larger than the minimum, in fact as large a fee as they safely can. I think that the conditions of recognition should in the meantime be fixed so low that every, or almost every, existing high school could obtain recognition if it wanted it. As time passes and secondary education becomes better organized, the conditions of recognition may be prudently and slowly raised and greater efficiency secured. But the only worthy application of the committee's principle, and the only means by which Government can effectually provide good training for those who do not go on to the higher training of the university and its affiliated colleges, is that in all ordinary cases candidates shall be admitted to the High School examination from recognized schools alone.

(7) The only other point to which I have the honor to ask attention in this necessarily hurried communication is the proposal to continue to impose the Middle School examination even after it has ceased to be an avenue to Government employment. It is something that the committee propose to exempt boys preparing for the Matriculation examination from the necessity of passing the Middle School examination. This will make it possible that an exceptionally strong headmaster may, in exceptionally favorable circumstances, train his pupils as boys should be trained for entering the university. I regard the proposed concession, however, both as being, and as intended by the committee to be, of little practical importance. The committee desire and expect that the great bulk of secondary education should henceforth be regulated by the new examination. They would even relegate preparation for the university to a few “institutions of a central character.” If nearly all secondary

schools are compelled to send up their pupils to the Middle School examination, the permission accorded to a few exceptional ones to act differently will not be even sought to be taken advantage of unless the headmaster or managers hold particularly strong views and are of particularly determined character. Besides, in the case of boys from ten to thirteen, the age at which they are preparing for the Middle School examination, it will very seldom be decided whether they are to enter the university or not. Therefore, if the recommendations of the committee be acted on, most boys will wish to appear, and will be instructed by their parents to appear, for the Middle School examination. Thus schools looking mainly to the university will, in practice, be under as great a necessity as others to send up their pupils for public examination at this wholly premature stage. This is an element in the case which I can scarcely suppose that the committee overlooked. The other concession recommended, viz., that well conducted institutions should be permitted to promote their pupils when they fail without sanction from the Director is useful in a subordinate way, but is of no value as regards the main question. For the really important objection is to children of thirteen being forced to appear for a public examination, not to the results which the examiners happen to arrive at. Thus the concessions made by the committee are on the whole illusory.

I have the honor to request that Government would not settle this all important point without consulting those who have had personal experience of the effect of compulsory appearance at the Middle School examination on the minds and characters of boys—an experience which few indeed of the members of the committee have had.

There are two, and so far as I am aware only two, lines of argument by which the imposition of the Middle School examination can be defended. The one is that it brings schools absolutely under the control of the Civil Service Commissioner as regards their curriculum, text-books and all their internal arrangements. The other is that it gives some kind of guarantee that no school is totally inefficient. With reference to the first of these, I have the honor to submit that unless *some* freedom and *some* responsibility be left to managers, no school can really flourish, and that the new examination alone will give to the Commissioner quite as much power over the internal arrangements of schools as it is either necessary or desirable that he should have. With reference to the second line of argument, I have the honor to submit that any advantage of the kind claimed is too dearly bought by the deterioration of the whole tone of education and the dragging down of the best schools to the level of the lowest.

On this whole question, I may at least be allowed to place on record here the assured conviction of one who has taken for a quarter of a century a deep personal interest in secondary education in Madras and in the boys who have received it. That conviction is that the forced subjection of boys of from twelve to fourteen years of age to a public examination is doing more than any other agency to damage the physical and mental fibre of the youth of Southern India, to lower the whole character of instruction, and to make the universal substitution of cram and the passing of examinations for real education all but absolutely inevitable. There are many reforms needed in our system of education, but not one so urgently as that boys should be left to the influence of their own schools and their own teachers until they are fit to stand and to profit by the ordeal of a public examination.

Proceedings of the Board of Revenue (Land Revenue), dated 12th October 1888, Mis. No. 6084.

Read—G.O., dated 7th August 1888, Mis. No. 4643, Revenue.

Resolution—dated 12th October 1888, Mis. No. 6084.

The Board beg to reply to G.O., dated 7th August 1888, Mis. No. 4643.

2. They are not competent to discuss the technical details of the new scheme, but approve generally of the proposed High School examination.

3. One of its advantages will be that it will encourage not a so-called liberal education as the University degree does, but a general and practical education, which will be of use in every-day life and assist in the gaining of a livelihood even should Government service fail; such an education is particularly necessary in this country. Another will be that it is a breaking away from the university curriculum and will import a certain amount of variety to the education of the country, a fault of which has been, the Board think, its absolute and unhealthy uniformity.

4. It aims, however, at a high standard, much higher than that which is now required, and the evils therefore of a mere examinational entrance into the public service will be intensified. They are (1) that certain races, somewhat dull intellectually perhaps, but possessing qualifications that render their employment in the public service undeniably expedient, are excluded from public service to the disadvantage of the State, and (2) that the more backward districts are similarly excluded, and the public service becomes the monopoly of a few more forward districts and a few special schools—a matter of political inexpediency. As a remedy against this, the privilege of exemption must, at any rate, at first be very liberally conceded in favor of Muhammadans and men of the Ceded and Northern Districts.

5. To the proposal made in paragraph 22, that all the best paid posts should be reserved for graduates simply because they are graduates, the Board object very strongly; the value of a Madras University degree is no doubt very great, but it would need to be even greater than it is to justify Government in declaring that henceforth from the holders of it alone shall all the more trusted and responsible officers be selected; it is only a few colleges that teach up to the B.A. standard, and in the hands of the students of these few colleges, therefore, is it proposed that in future all power shall be concentrated. Such a scheme, even without the experience of the past few years, is on the face of it impolitic. All men in service will already have passed the fairly severe High School examination; this is sufficient, and there is no further advantage gained in insisting that they shall also be graduates.

6. University education in this country is not what it is at home; it is book-learning, pure and simple, and a Madras B.A., though he may be more learned, need not for the mere matter of his degree be a whit abler or more fitted to cope with difficulties than his brethren without it; it is to the credit of the class that so many of them turn out so well, but this does not necessitate Government tying itself down to the selection of its officers from among them, and, if there is no such necessity, the proposal amounts to a bribe to a university education, undesirable in itself and unfair to that portion of the community which either cannot or do not wish to take advantage of it. The concession to non-graduates of "distinguished service" is not enough; it is exceptional and liable to abuse.

7. The retention of the Matriculation examination for anything more than the first few preliminary years, just to break the change, would, the Board think, nullify the whole of the advantages which the bifurcation is intended to obtain, and they therefore side in this matter with the majority. If the Senate considers that the maintenance of separate high school and matriculation classes will be too much for most schools, and that the latter will suffer, it can accept the High School examination in place of the Matriculation; but there seems no reason why Government should reverse the process and accept for the High School an examination lower in standard and conducted apart from their control.

8. In regard to the recognition of schools, the Board are disposed to side with Mr. Adam; there is, no doubt, much to be gained in the tone of a good school, but the Board doubt if mere "recognition" has much to do with this tone, and, if it has not, the advantages in the way of emulation and variety to be gained by the establishment of private schools are so great that the Board think they should not be discouraged.

9. Subject to these remarks, the Board approve of the new scheme and consider that it will bring into the public service men who have passed not only a higher, but a more useful examination; the number of men available may not be so great as

the committee anticipate, for the calculation made in their paragraph 11 is open to criticism, but the ordinary "passed candidate" will probably pass the new test just as he passes the present one, and the backward races who will not pass it do not pass the one now in force and must be exempted, then as now, liberally if the privilege and right of sharing in the service of the State is not to be practically refused to them.

10. In reply to paragraph 2 of the Government Order, the language test, if examination in reading the *written* character is included, will be a convenient substitute for the lower language test fixed in paragraphs 38 and 54 of the Forest Code, while the preliminary higher and advanced higher survey examinations, if the subjects of the syllabus within brackets are included and not excluded, will be a convenient substitute for the lower and higher standards of paragraphs 43 and 44 of the Forest Code.

(True Extract.)

(Signed) H. A. SIM,
Acting Secretary.

To the Secretary to Government, Revenue Department.

From the Inam Commissioner, dated Madras, 13th November 1888, No. 431.

ABSTRACT.—States that, having in his capacity as Land Revenue Commissioner, in Board's Proceedings, Mis. No. 6084, dated 12th October 1888, expressed his views on the scheme for the proposed High School examination, he does not propose to offer any further remarks as Inam Commissioner.

From KRISTNA AIYAR, Joint Secretary, Triplicane Literary Society, to the Chief Secretary to Government, dated Madras, 12th December 1888.

We, the members of the Triplicane Literary Society, have the honor to request you will be good enough to lay before His Excellency the Governor in Council the following suggestions of the society anent the report of the committee appointed by G.O. No. 458, dated 24th August 1887, to consider and report upon the High School examination scheme submitted by the Director of Public Instruction.

2. In the opinion of the members, the tests at present prescribed by Government for entrance into the public service—the Matriculation and Middle School examinations—are not, taking into consideration the present state of education in the Presidency, sufficiently high. It must therefore be conceded that the spread of education and the existence of a large number of suitable candidates for the public service would justify the Government in raising the minimum standard of the educational qualifications of its servants in the interests of the public service and of general education alike. The members admit also that the standard of efficiency implied in the committee's scheme (both in its compulsory and optional branches) may safely be expected from persons desirous of entering the public service.

3. It is with regard to the *modus operandi* which has been proposed for the purpose of testing whether a candidate possesses the requisite qualifications that the members feel constrained to differ from the recommendations of the committee. The members feel no doubt that the Government will admit that any scheme of examinations for admission to the public service should be framed so as not to interfere with the progress of general education in the country and so as not to increase the number of public examinations for young men. Viewed in this light, the scheme appears to the members to be objectionable.

4. The proposed scheme is intended to bifurcate the studies of the school-going population at too early a stage. At the early age of 10 or 12, the young boy will have to determine whether he should enter the university course or the High School examination course. At such an

The proposed bifurcation will compel a choice at too early a stage; university course will become in attractive and will suffer.

age the natural proclivities of the student could not have developed themselves sufficiently to enable either the boy or the parent to adjudicate on the future plan. The result will be disastrous to higher education in general. If the lower university examinations be declared useless for admission into the public service, many a youth of intelligence and general ability, but of poor means, will be obliged to relinquish the university course lest his means may not enable him to go up to the degree; whereas, if the lower examinations of the university be declared to qualify for the public service, many would continue in the university course, leaving it to their pecuniary means and other attendant circumstances to break them off from that career at what stage they may. The proposal to reserve certain high appointments to graduates alone will not in itself prove a sufficient inducement to attract any appreciable number of capable young men to the university course under the circumstances above referred to. Moreover, the bifurcation will have the effect of deteriorating the value of education in the eyes of students and parents. Instead of superadding special tests to the university examinations, when a demarcation is drawn between the education which will bring in Rs. 15 and upwards and that which will enable students to earn Rs. 200 and upwards per month, it will assuredly have a demoralizing effect upon education in general. For the above reasons, the members are strongly of opinion that the bifurcation recommended by the committee to the elimination of university tests is calculated to strike at the progress of higher education and to present it in an uninviting shape to the public.

5. The next objection relates to the multiplicity of examinations. If a candidate

It adds to the number of existing examinations, and must be given up; the Middle School examination also should be given up.

defers to make a choice between the university and the high school course, he will have, while undergoing tuition in the high school course, to pass the Matriculation and the other examinations in

addition to the one he is preparing for. The influential protest of the most eminent educationists which has appeared in the November number of the Nineteenth Century appears to the members to be especially applicable to the course of examination pursued in this Presidency. The evils of the Middle School examination, coming as it does at too early an age of a boy's career and necessitating a good deal of "cram," are sorely felt by many a parent in that its deteriorating effects on the physical and mental capabilities of our youths are too well known and have been more than once brought to the notice of Government; and now that its retention as a passport for entrance into the public service is proposed to be given up, the members feel no doubt that its place in the educational scheme of this Presidency as a public test, serving the objects of class promotion even, is dangerous to the cause of education and to the development of youthful intelligence.

6. Believing as they do that the standard of educational qualifications for the

University tests can be moulded to correspond to the compulsory branch of the high school scheme.

2. As regards optional branch, special departmental examination can be devised.

3. The Government have a direct control over the selection of their servants inasmuch as they control the university.

practically take in the curriculum proposed for the high school course; a comparison of the subjects to be taught under the new scheme and of the subjects of the matriculation course will show that very little difference exists between the two examinations and that there is a possibility of so raising the matriculation standard as to make

it coeval with the compulsory branch of the high school course. The members feel confident that the university authorities will gladly assent to this most reasonable request. If the university will be disinclined, the Government can superadd to the existing university tests such a test of general culture and capability as will raise them to the level of the High School test in its compulsory branch. This will leave young students unfettered to persevere in but one course of study without entailing upon them the necessity for an early bifurcation and certainly conduce to the cause of higher education. In respect of the special subjects comprised in the optional branch of the scheme—a knowledge in which the committee deem necessary for employment in special departments—the members are of opinion that they may be left to be tested by special departmental examinations with a reservation that certain University tests alone will enable the candidate to appear for such examinations. The observation of the committee that the Government should have a direct control in the selection of their servants is practically answered by the fact that the university is virtually under the supervision and control of Government.

7. At any rate, the general educational qualifications possessed by a First-in-

F.A. men to be exempted from the compulsory branch of the High School examination.

Arts man of this university are so far superior to those aimed at to be secured for the High School examinee in the compulsory branch that the members

fail to see on what ground his claims for first employment can be overlooked. The members therefore beg to submit that the First-in-Arts men should be exempted from passing the compulsory branch of the High School examination, even if such an examination should be instituted.

8. Should the Government determine upon adopting the recommendation of the

Viva voce should be given up at any rate.

committee in substance, the members would respectfully invite the attention of the Government to some of the features

of the scheme which are more objectionable than others and whose adoption is altogether unsuited to the educational requirements of this Presidency. The committee recommend that *viva voce* examination should form part of the tests prescribed by the high school course. This most unsatisfactory mode of testing efficiency has been protested against and the result has been that it ceased to be a test so long ago as 1877 in the B.A. examination. Even in B.L. test, where it may be expected to find a more appropriate place than in other tests, its retention has been pronounced against: what possible good such a *viva voce* test in clerks expected to draw Rs. 15 and upwards will do to the public service is difficult to see. On the other hand, it is likely to exclude deserving young men whose nervousness or want of forwardness will be no disqualification for their otherwise discharging their duties honestly and efficiently.

9. The system of recognition recommended by the committee is altogether a

The system of recognition objectionable.

retrograde step, and especially that feature of it which enacts that candidates appearing for examination from other

than recognized schools should be made to pay double the examination fee is open to the objection that the Government regard non-compliance with certain of their regulations could be condoned by the payment of a penalty. This will work hard upon poor students who could not afford to study in recognized schools and is against the principle enunciated by the Educational Commission that the education should wherever possible be left in the hands of the people. The members express no opinion as to whether Government should not interfere with schools conducted in a locality which does not conform to certain sanitary requirements, but they feel bound to enter a protest against a system of recognition which would allow its regulations to be set at naught by the payment of a penalty.

10. In conclusion, the members of the "Triplicane Literary Society" respect-

Conclusion.

fully beg to draw the attention of the Government to the momentous issues involved in the inauguration of the new

scheme and only express their disappointment that a subject of such vital importance was not left to the deliberations of a committee more fully representing the non-official and indigenous element of the Presidency.

From R. RUNGA ROW, B.A., Secretary to the Mylapore Athenæum, to the Chief Secretary to Government, dated Mylapore, 25th December 1888.

I am directed by the Mylapore Athenæum to submit, for the consideration of His Excellency the Governor in Council, their views upon what is now generally known as the High School examination scheme. The Athenæum has discussed the scheme and the resolutions of the Government thereon at about ten meetings and its conclusions are embodied in the following resolutions, most of which were adopted by large majorities:—

- I. That the present standard of qualifications for admission into the public service requires to be raised and that the Middle School and Matriculation examinations as at present conducted are not adequate tests of such qualifications.

Having regard to the needs of the public service, to the fact that these examinations, which guarantee but a small modicum of general capacity and knowledge of English, are qualifying tests for all appointments in the Uncovenanted Service and that the standard of these examinations has gradually become lowered during the last few years, and, lastly, to the already numerous and evergrowing body of candidates for public employment, the Athenæum feels itself justified in supporting the views of the committee who prepared the scheme under consideration that the time has come when a higher standard of general attainments may safely be insisted on for admission into the public service.

- II. With regard to the general knowledge required for admission into the public service, the institution of the High School examination is neither necessary nor desirable.

- III. That in case the High School examination is instituted, the F.A. examination or the Matriculation, first class, or, in case the standard of the Matriculation examination be raised by the university, the Matriculation itself be retained as test of *general* capacity for entrance into the public service.

The Athenæum does not think it necessary to state its reasons at length for the above conclusions at which it has arrived, for they are substantially the same as those that have been set out by other bodies who have addressed the Government expressing the same views. The Athenæum is convinced that, in the present state of English education in this country, the scheme, if set on foot on the lines laid down, will affect the interests of the university and of higher education and deal a blow at all liberal culture, that it brings no advantage in its train, that everything that, in the opinion of its projectors, it is likely to secure may be attained by the adoption of the suggestion contained in the above resolutions and the next following one:—

- IV. That candidates for the public service be required to pass examinations in special branches of knowledge which may be prescribed by the Government for the various departments, and that they be required to undergo a course of study in schools before passing the examinations and that means for this purpose may be provided if they do not already exist.

A knowledge of some of the subjects enumerated as optional branches in the scheme will, in the opinion of the Athenæum, increase the usefulness of the candidate in any department of the public service. The Athenæum is of opinion that the present machinery for testing the necessary special and technical knowledge of candidates for employment in the various departments of the public service, except that of law, is very imperfect. It is also of opinion that no examination, however carefully conducted, can be of much use unless the candidates, who are required to pass them, have undergone a course of training in their subjects in some properly constituted and efficient institution. Many may pass the most difficult examination

in any subject without possessing much real or practical knowledge of it. It is therefore absolutely necessary that a change should be introduced in this respect and candidates for public employment should be required to study in some school or college, where technical education is imparted, before passing the prescribed examinations.

The Athenæum is opposed to the increase of examinations which serve but to cramp the intellects of the unfortunate victims and unanimously suggests

- V. The abolition of the Middle School examination.

The interests of the public service do not require it and with the disappearance of the only justification for its existence as a qualifying test for public employ, the Athenæum hopes that it may altogether cease to exist. In making this recommendation, the Athenæum considers it unnecessary to recount the many evils, of which, by the almost universal verdict of all thinking men, the Middle School examination has been the chief cause.

The rules and principles of recognition have been also discussed by the Athenæum and it respectfully craves the attention of His Excellency in Council to the following resolutions:—

- VI. That conformity to the school-fee notification be not insisted on as a condition of recognition.

- VII. That the same examination fee be levied from all candidates for the High School examination (if it be instituted) whether they come up from a recognized school or not.

A great deal has been said against the school-fee notification which need not here be repeated. The Athenæum is of opinion that the fee for an examination which is a test of fitness for the public service should not be made to vary with the class of school from which the candidate comes. Whatever the conditions of recognition may be it is a mistake to punish a candidate by charging an extra fee for the fault of the manager of the school which is not recognized.

The Athenæum recognizes the necessity for some regulations with regard to the numerous schools that spring up all round. Every school, whether it is called recognized or unrecognized, should afford healthy accommodation to the students that resort to it. The Athenæum has therefore resolved to suggest

- VIII. That it is desirable that a provision should be enacted by the legislature that the manager or proprietor of any school, whose premises or physical surroundings are in such a condition as to be injurious to the health of the boys attending it, shall be liable on conviction by a Magistrate to pay a certain fine.

The Athenæum has carefully considered the responsibility of making this suggestion and it is in view to the suppression of some schools, which, it must be admitted, do not pay sufficient attention to the comforts and conveniences of the boys attending them and whose very existence is injurious to the health of some portion of the school-going community that the Athenæum makes this suggestion. The Athenæum believes that this is the only effectual means of meeting an evil against which the rules of recognition as they now obtain make no provision.

In conclusion, the Athenæum thinks that the High School examination scheme, which has given rise to a feeling of consternation in many quarters and may tend in its present shape to unsettle the state of education in this country, will, freed from all the objectionable features indicated in the foregoing paragraphs, and, with the modifications suggested therein, help on the progress of education and the interests of the public service.

From W. H. WILSON, Esq., Registrar of the University of Madras, to the Chief Secretary to Government, dated Madras, 28th January 1889, No. 439.

I have the honor to inform you that G.O., dated 11th July 1888, No. 401, passing orders upon the proposed new High School examination, was placed before the Senate, who appointed a Committee, consisting of the twelve Fellows of the University

whose names are attached to the report herewith submitted, to consider and report upon the scheme. The Committee's report was discussed by the Senate at meetings held on the 17th, 24th and 25 instant, and the following resolutions adopted:—

- (1) While the Senate do not endorse all the arguments of the Committee, they are, nevertheless, of opinion that the report presented does not exaggerate the serious effects upon liberal education likely to follow the adoption of the High School scheme in its present form; and agree to recommend the report to the careful attention of Government. (Carried by 19 to 7).
- (2) The Senate are, however, in entire agreement with the Committee that no public examination that is to be enforced as a test of general or technical education should be directly connected with the public service. (Carried by 21 to 3).

Additional copies of the report can be supplied should they be required.

ENCLOSURES.

REPORT of the Committee appointed by the Senate on the 6th September 1888 "to consider the reference made by Government in their Order, dated 11th July 1888, No. 401, Educational, on the High School Examination Scheme, and to draft a reply thereto, to be submitted to the Senate at the earliest possible date."

To

THE REGISTRAR OF THE MADRAS UNIVERSITY.

SIR,

We, the Committee appointed as above, have the honor to submit the following report.

2. It may be premised that we have considered the question both in its bearings on the University and on education generally.

3. We would remark at the outset that the title proposed to be given to the new examination appears to us to be a misnomer. To call it "the High School examination" is to imply that it holds the same relation to High Schools that the Middle School examination does to schools of a lower grade, and that the proper end and aim of a fully developed High School should be to prepare candidates for it, while the class of High Schools that have hitherto existed and that serve to prepare for the University Matriculation examination are either totally ignored, or have only a secondary importance assigned to them. In the interests of education, it is a matter of quite as much moment that High Schools should continue to train candidates for the Matriculation examination as that they should endeavor to impart technical or professional knowledge and ability. We are of opinion that the designation given to the new examination should be such as not to involve any misconception in regard to the place of technical education and the value of the higher University examinations.

4. The first question considered by us was the desirability of, or the necessity for the entire exclusion of the University Matriculation and First in Arts examinations from the general education tests to be henceforth accepted as qualifying for admission to the service of Government. We shall consider later on the bearings and effects of such exclusion on the University, on collegiate education, and on education in general, and shall confine our attention in this and the eight succeeding paragraphs to the main recommendations that the new examination is supposed to have in the eyes of its advocates, viz:—

- (i) That it is necessary in the interests of the public service, as the time has come for demanding from candidates for employment in the service of the State not only a higher standard of general attainments than is at present demanded, but also a certain amount of knowledge in subjects purely technical.
- (ii) That High Schools imparting instruction in technical subjects will be unable to hold their own against High Schools preparing students for the Matriculation examination, unless the former are invested with a privilege denied to the latter;—the privilege of qualifying for admission to the public service.
- (iii) That to recognise the First in Arts examination as a qualifying test for admission to the public service is to put a premium on collegiate or University education, and to interpose obstacles in the way of the development of technical education.

5. In regard to the first of these points, the Committee after a careful discussion came to the unanimous conclusion that any such new test of general education as the compulsory portion of the proposed High School examination is, in the main, intended to be, is unnecessary, but that the Matriculation examination, with some modifications, is capable of meeting all requirements in this direction in the future as it has met them in the past. Of the four compulsory branches comprised in the scheme of the proposed High School examination, English—the first branch—contains general and special subjects. The general subjects are grammar and language, paraphrase and composition, advanced spelling, and handwriting. The special subjects are elementary précis-writing, and translation of an official paper from English into the vernaculars and from the vernaculars into English. The *visà voce* examination is reserved for special comment. In Branch II.—the second language—the subjects are handwriting, spelling, grammar, text-book and language, and composition. The only thing of a special character in this branch is the drafting of a letter or report in the usual official forms on a given subject. The subjects of Branch III. are arithmetic, algebra, and elementary geometry, and those of Branch IV., history and geography. It will thus appear that the general subjects of the compulsory portion of the High School examination cover very nearly the same ground as the University Matriculation examination, the chief difference between them being that two subjects of no small importance—Chemistry and Physics—which are included in the latter are excluded from the former. We refer here to the subjects only, and not to the standards of the examinations, which will be considered later on. The only general subjects not comprised in the present Matriculation course are handwriting and advanced spelling, and any objection based on the absence of these subjects is easily overcome by the University holding an examination in these subjects, and granting certificates to those who have passed in them. As to the special subjects, they seem to this Committee to be as little connected with secondary education in technical subjects as with secondary education preparatory to collegiate education. We are strongly of opinion that the proper mode of testing a knowledge of these subjects is by means of *Special Test Examinations*, held exclusively for such as wish to qualify themselves for the public service, and not by an examination like the High School examination.

6. On the question of standards, we are at one with the High School Committee in thinking that, while to the existing subjects for the Matriculation examination are added handwriting and advanced spelling, the standard itself may advantageously be raised, especially in English composition, by requiring higher minima of marks for passing than are prescribed at present. The details of what we propose in this direction will appear in the sequel.

7. As to the optional branches, the function of testing a knowledge of these, so far as eligibility for admission to the public service goes, properly belongs to Government; and may be efficiently discharged by adding to the number of Special Test examinations. It may, however, be thought necessary to have a final school examination in technical subjects, irrespective of the exigencies of the public service. If the condition of technical education should render such an examination necessary, this Committee sees no objection to, or difficulty in either the University or the Education Department conducting such examination, the option of either adopting such examination or holding a separate examination in regard to public service resting with Government.

8. The report of the High School Committee contains abundant evidence to show that the exclusion of the Matriculation and First in Arts examinations from the tests qualifying for admission to the public service is in no small measure due to an unfounded notion that the interests of technical education are best promoted and conserved by imposing disabilities on the lower University tests. We are of opinion that no antagonism of the kind contemplated by the High School Committee exists between technical education and University education. Whether the efforts made to establish technical education on a firm basis succeed or not, will depend on how far such education is in practice found necessary for the material well-being of the country, and not on any adventitious encouragement afforded to it by coupling it with the public service. The question whether such combination is really advantageous to technical education is considered in a separate paragraph. It will be sufficient to say here that technical education is of such immense practical value in itself that there is no danger that a course of training which will secure a competence in life will be neglected or undervalued.

9. With reference to the third point, the Committee would observe that even if the ideal standard aimed at by the High School Committee is attained, a youth who has passed the First in Arts examination is certain to be in many respects superior to one who has passed only the High School examination. The interval between the Middle School examination and the proposed High School examination will be three years, whereas the interval between the Middle School examination and the First in Arts examination is four years, and if our proposals in regard to the Matriculation examination are adopted, the interval would be increased to five years. Not to lay stress on the fact that the standard of the F.A. examination is much more advanced than that of the High School examination, it will be generally conceded that collegiate instruction under competent professors and lecturers must of necessity be of a higher order than any instruction that even a well-equipped High School can afford. This aspect of the question will also be

found to gain much strength from the fact that a certain proportion of the candidates for the B.A. degree examination must fail to pass that examination. These, who are popularly known as "failed B.A.'s," cannot but be superior to those who have only passed the High School examination, seeing that they are likely to have had at least four years' training in a college. It seems to us that it would be injudicious in the extreme to deprive the State of the services of this large class of students, and that any slight advantage derivable from such exclusion for technical education is not to be set against the great injury certain to be inflicted thereby on University education.

10. While we agree with the High School Committee in thinking it highly desirable that greater attention should be paid to technical education, we are of opinion that this ought to come after Matriculation, and not in a course alternative with preparation for that examination. The contention that the Matriculation course is "purely literary" seems to us to be based either on a misapprehension, or on a false analogy. That course comprises all the subjects which are universally recognized as constituting general education; and none of them could be omitted without leaving a deficiency in that general education. The 'purely literary,' that is, 'classical' education, which in times past formed, and still, to a large extent, forms the staple of education in an English 'Grammar School,' has no counterpart in this country, unless in the Sanskrit and Arabic colleges, which have no connection with the University, or, in fact, with the general education of the country. The Matriculation course of the University is in close conformity with what is known as the 'Modern Side' of an English school; and the standard of general education indicated by it should certainly be reached before children (as they are) should be allowed, or their parents be allowed for them, to specialize.

11. From what has been said above, it will appear that the University Matriculation examination, and the Special Test examinations multiplied and developed to meet all the requirements of the public service, can between them accomplish all that the new High School examination is intended to do for the public service. We would in this connection most emphatically urge the undesirability of establishing additional examinations, unless the necessity for them is beyond all doubt. It is said that, especially within the last ten years, the number of examinations young men have to undergo has been rapidly increasing, and that the systematic persistency with which this policy has been pursued has wrought immense mischief to sound education, the result being that the true aims and objects of education have been, to a great extent, lost sight of in the struggle to pass these ever-multiplying examinations. It need hardly be said that examinations alone do nothing to extend and improve the knowledge which they are established to test, and that there is an irresistible tendency in course of time to lower all examinations to the level of the capabilities of the candidates appearing for them, instead of raising the examinees to their own nominal standard. All real improvement in the quality of the knowledge possessed by the pupil depends on the efficiency of the teacher. The teachers being what they are, however many new examinations may be instituted, there can be no real improvement in knowledge. The great desideratum of the times is a better class of teachers, especially science teachers, for the school-classes. This want, in so far as it lies in the power of the University to provide for it, will, we hope, in course of time, be supplied; but it will be a great mistake to imagine that the establishment of any new examination, unless accompanied by an improvement in the existing teaching agency, will effect the least improvement in the character of secondary education. One of the worst aspects of the proposals we are considering is that they will, if adopted, result in the efficiency of a great majority of the existing High Schools being lowered partly by throwing on the present teachers additional work, and work which they have not been trained to perform, partly by creating an increased demand for teachers and at the same time, by reducing the number of those who pass through a University course in order to qualify for the profession, diminishing the supply.

12. The scheme submitted by the High School Committee has apparently a twofold object in view, though one of these objects has far greater prominence given to it than the other. While the institution of a qualifying test for the public service, better than any that exists at present, is the guiding and governing principle of the recommendations made by the Committee, testing by a public examination the results of the instruction imparted in High Schools is at least a secondary object with the Committee. It seems to this Committee that the scheme under examination owes its most objectionable features to this unhappy combination of purposes which should, as much as possible, be kept distinct and separate. The assumption that one and the same test might be made to serve the needs of the public service on the one hand, and of High Schools on the other, seems to this Committee to be radically unsound, and that for the following reasons:—

- (i) That no examination conducted either by the Education Department or the University should be identified with the public service, since such identification will work injuriously on the examinations to which a similar recognition is not accorded.
- (ii) That appropriate as drafting an official letter, making a précis, and translating an official paper may be in connection with the public service, they are by no means

a necessary part of a course of technical instruction, nor can it be held that they form an element of general educational fitness. This being so, such subjects should not be made compulsory.

- (iii.) That the standard of attainments in languages proposed by the High School Committee is perhaps not too high in regard to the requirements of the public service, but it is too high in regard to schools intended to impart efficient instruction in technical subjects. While it may be readily conceded that every candidate passing the final examination for the technical High Schools should possess a fair knowledge of the English language and of a vernacular language, it is a matter of grave doubt whether there is any necessity for insisting on so high a standard of general attainments as in the proposed High School examination. It is important to observe that the higher the standard of general educational attainments required, the less will be the time left for technical subjects, and the smaller the degree of proficiency attainable in such subjects. The interests of the public service may justify and demand the prescribing of as high a standard of general attainments as is consistent with a sufficient supply of qualified candidates for the public service, but the interests of technical education will be best promoted by making the standard of general attainments as low as possible, the only limitations in this case being a sufficient knowledge of the language used as the medium of instruction. The pupil anxious to acquire technical knowledge should be allowed ample time and scope for cultivating subjects of a technical nature both theoretically and practically, and not be hampered by and overloaded with a number of general knowledge subjects. The scheme submitted by the High School Committee is a medley of subjects, general, special, and technical, which may all be essential for the public service, but which do not form an essential part of a scheme of technical instruction.

- (iv) If bifurcation of studies is to be a reality, if technical instruction is to be placed on a sound basis side by side with general education, the interests of technical education ought not to be subordinated to the interests of the public service; and an examination of which the entire nature and the many component parts are determined by, and made to chime in with the exigencies of the public service, should not be made the final test whether for High Schools preparing candidates for the University Matriculation examination, or for High Schools that adopt the bifurcated course in which technical knowledge is to be of primary importance. The object of the Education Commission and of the Government of India in recommending a bifurcation of studies was to produce a class of men who would devote themselves to industrial and commercial pursuits and thus indirectly to diminish the numbers of those who now hanker after appointments in the public service. If the unlimited multiplication of this class of office-seekers is an evil—and that it is so is generally admitted—no examination connected with schools or with the University should be identified with the public service. A High School examination for the public service will intensify the evil that already exists, and deprive the scheme of bifurcation of what should constitute its chief merit.

13. It will appear from the foregoing remarks that, in the opinion of this Committee, the proposed High School examination will be injurious to the interests not only of University education, but also of technical education. The association of technical education with the public service may be an advantage to technical education to the extent to which the proposed High School examination will attract students by opening up a means of entering the public service, but even this advantage is not to be set against the serious evil of technical instruction being thrust into the background and of technical subjects not being studied with that zeal and thoroughness which alone can make technical knowledge practically useful.

14. In this and the two succeeding paragraphs, we shall endeavour to trace the effects of the High School examination, if adopted, on the Matriculation, First in Arts, and B.A. degree examinations. In our opinion the almost certain effect of adopting the proposal to entirely substitute the High School examination for the lower Arts examinations of the University would be not simply to divert a certain number of students, but to change the whole direction of education. The High School Committee quote the following words from the letter to Government of the first Director of Public Instruction when he proposed the examination scheme of 1861:—

"I think it is very desirable that the University examinations should be more closely and more obviously connected, than they are at present, with the scheme of examinations now under consideration. Owing probably to the advantages as regards eligibility for admission into the public service, which are conferred by passing according to the lower test, being equal to those conferred by the University Matriculation examination, the number of candidates for the latter has not increased as rapidly as might have been expected, with reference to the number of schools now in operation, which educate up to that standard. It must not be forgotten that in this country the success of such an institution, or, in other words, the extension of advanced education depends in a great measure upon the extent to which it facilitates the admission of its

recipients into the public service; and while it is not possible to demand from all candidates for public employment the attainments which are very properly required by the University as a test of fitness to enter upon the higher studies which its degrees and honors are designed to encourage, it is of great importance that no means should be omitted of ensuring to those who pass the University examinations a reasonable prospect of being preferred for employment over those who are content with passing what I may designate as the service test."

The High School scheme now proposed proceeds on the assumption that the close and obvious connection of the University examinations with the scheme of special tests advocated by Mr. Arbuthnot is no longer necessary or even desirable. Of the soundness of this assumption we entertain the gravest doubts. Notwithstanding the very large numbers that have now for some years entered for the Matriculation and First in Arts examinations, we fear that these examinations would immediately be given up by the large majority, with the necessary result that the numbers proceeding to a degree would be so reduced that higher education in the Madras Presidency would dwindle to insignificant proportions.

15. In regard to the very probable effect of the proposed High School examination on the number of candidates appearing for the University examinations, it appears to the Committee that the number of candidates appearing for the Matriculation examination must and will fall off considerably, and the greater the efficiency and success of the proposed examination as a qualifying test for the public service, the larger will be the numbers diverted from the Matriculation examination to the new High School examination. In view of the fact that a certain number of candidates passing the Matriculation examination stop at that stage, and do not carry their education beyond, it may be held with some plausibility that a reduction of numbers in the Matriculation examination is rather advantageous than otherwise; and so it may be conceded to be, if the candidates for the High School examination may be assumed to be only those who do not intend or are not able to obtain collegiate education. It has already been pointed out that the High School examination will have a far greater attraction than the higher examinations of the University, and no one acquainted with the character of Indian youth will seriously maintain that the longer and more difficult course, with the chances of failure, will be deliberately preferred to the shorter and easier course, and thus it is clear that, not only will there be a falling off in the numbers appearing for the Matriculation examination, but many of the most promising students will be drawn away from the University course. This deterioration in quantity and quality will have the most disastrous effect on the higher University education. Not only will there be fewer candidates for the First in Arts and the B.A. degree examinations, but such as do appear will cease to be the pick of the youth of the country. We are convinced that most exaggerated notions are held regarding the existence of a great disparity between the numbers appearing for the Matriculation and the higher Arts examinations. The report of the High School Committee has the following words:—

"We are unanimously of opinion that the practice of making the Matriculation and First in Arts examinations serve as tests for admission to the public service, and not as steps towards the attainment of a degree, is a serious evil which should be avoided if possible."

That this evil is less than the High School Committee imagines is evident from the following considerations. An inspection of the University registers shows that from 1869 to 1885, inclusive, the numbers that passed the Matriculation examination were 16,880, whilst the numbers that appeared for the First in Arts examination from 1871 to 1887, inclusive, were 12,676. In 1869 there were 401 candidates who passed the Matriculation examination, and two years later 205 candidates, or 51 per cent. of the former number, appeared for the First in Arts examination. The corresponding figures for the years 1885 and 1887—the last of the series—are 1,895 and 1,772, which is equal to 93 per cent. Of course a certain proportion of the candidates appeared more than once, but the figures may be taken to show that a very decided majority of those passing the Matriculation examination have continued their studies beyond that stage, and that the proportion so doing has in the last ten years undergone a very great increase.

These figures, it may be remarked, do not compare at all unfavorably with those of London University, where, from the foundation of the University in 1838 to the end of last year, 19,515 candidates matriculated, whilst in the same period but 5,821 appeared for the Bachelor of Arts degree examination. The Matriculation examination would thus appear to have been regarded as a mere qualifying examination for the Government service a great deal less than has been generally supposed. True as it was ten years ago that the numbers appearing for the higher examinations were disproportionately small as compared with the numbers passing the Matriculation examination, the Committee have reason to think that this state of things is tending to pass away, and will in course of time cease to exist if the present organisation, both of the University and of education, be not interfered with. Absolute equality there cannot be for obvious reasons, and in the opinion of this Committee, the steady, gradual, and marked increase during the past decade in the numbers appearing for the F.A. and B.A. examinations carries with it a promise of a fair equilibrium being established between secondary and collegiate education at no distant future.

16. We have shown that the adoption of the proposals of the High School Committee would seriously reduce the number of candidates for the several Arts examinations of the University. This of itself would be a heavy blow to education. But besides the almost certain decrease in the numbers receiving the higher education, there would be a substantial injury to the University in the matter of its finances, which it seems necessary to bring prominently to notice. The fees levied for admission to the degree examinations taken as a whole have been for the last year or

	Fees paid by candidates.	Salaries of Examiners.
	RS.	RS.
1883-84	15,090	21,411
1886-87	29,953	28,596

two about equal in amount to the salaries paid to the examiners who conducted these examinations, but this result has only recently been attained, as the figures in the margin testify, and is due entirely to the large increase which the last few years have witnessed in the number

Examination.	Fees paid by candidates.	Salaries of Examiners.
	RS.	RS.
M.A.	1,857	17,678
B.C.E.	780	3,480
M.L.	200	2,400
Total	2,831	23,558

of candidates appearing for the B.A. and B.L. degree examinations. The salaries of examiners, however, do not by any means represent the whole cost of the examinations, and it would therefore be erroneous to suppose that the degree examinations have reached the self-supporting stage that the lower examinations attained some years ago. Several of the degree examinations which the University is bound to maintain in the highest degree of efficiency involve an expenditure enormously in excess of the fees realized, as the figures in the margin, which refer to the last three years, indicate, and if, through any cause whatever, the candidates for the B.A. degree examination were reduced to the numbers of a few years ago, there would again be the same disparity that existed in 1883-84 between income and expenditure under this head. Although in that year the degree examinations entailed a loss of over Rs. 6,000 to the University, the year's operations resulted in a surplus of over Rs. 4,000, and this result is to be attributed entirely to the Matriculation and First in Arts examinations. Upon these examinations the financial prosperity of the University entirely depends. The fees paid for them last year amounted to the large sum of Rs. 1,23,132, the income of the University from all sources during the same period being Rs. 1,70,191, whilst the net amount realized under this head, after deducting the salaries of examiners, was Rs. 68,445. It is the revenue thus obtained which enables the University not only to conduct the higher examinations and to multiply and extend and improve these examinations, but which defrays the cost of the establishment, maintains and keeps in repair the Senate House, and pays the annual assessment, amounting to Rs. 1,800, upon that building, and still leaves a yearly increasing surplus with which a reserve fund is being gradually built up. Any measure which produces a considerable diminution in the number of candidates for these examinations will be, from a financial point of view, ruinous to the University, as such a diminution would not be accompanied by a corresponding reduction in expenditure; on the contrary, the chief sources of expenditure would remain unchanged, and the result would be that in a few years the reserve fund would be swallowed up, and with it would disappear all plans and schemes for employing that fund for extending the influence and usefulness of the University, whilst at no distant date the position of financial dependence upon Government which existed prior to 1880 would be again reached. It may be well to recall the fact that for the last eight years during which the University had a yearly deficit, its cost to Government amounted to over Rs. 88,000, and if the Matriculation examination is to be superseded by the High School examination whilst the degree examinations are maintained on their present footing, it seems to us quite certain, however unwelcome the prospect may be both to Government and the University, that before the High School examination has been many years in operation the burden of expenditure imposed upon Government will be heavier than it ever was in the past. If the number of candidates diminishes, the pecuniary loss cannot be compensated for by a proportionate increase in the fees charged for admission to the examinations. The fees are already higher than in any other Indian University. In the Universities of Calcutta, Bombay, and the Punjab, it costs the candidate Rs. 60 to obtain the Bachelor of Arts degree, whilst in Madras the sum of Rs. 72 has to be paid for the same purpose. We are of opinion that the fees are already on a level with the capacity of the great majority of the candidates to pay them, and that, notwithstanding the advantages attached to the possession of the University certificates and diplomas, and the eagerness displayed to obtain them, any sensible increase in the fees would impose a serious check upon the numbers presenting themselves for the University examinations, and would result in the practical exclusion from the benefits of a University education of many who now avail themselves of it. If, along with an increase of the fees, the examinations ceased to qualify for admission to the public service, it requires no prophet to foretell that, at no very distant date, the University would find its occupation completely gone. We hold very strongly that if the University is to expand and develop into a great national institution, its financial position ought to be assured, and this position can never be attained so long as its expenditure exceeds its income, and the deficiency has to be supplied by Government, who may at any time be compelled on financial grounds to order the University to effect a reduction in its expenditure. Such

pressure cannot be resisted, but to yield to it may be extremely prejudicial to the interests the University exists to promote. The Universities of Calcutta and Bombay possess, in this respect, great advantages over the Madras University. Whilst the former is in the enjoyment of endowments exceeding 5½ lakhs of rupees, and the latter's endowments at present amount to between four and five lakhs, to which must be added benefactions exceeding five lakhs in value, the Madras University can congratulate itself on being the possessor of endowments amounting to but little more than half a lakh. These facts are mentioned merely to show how entirely dependent the University is upon its fee income, and how fatal to its prosperity any measure which resulted in a diminution in the number of candidates entering for its lower examinations would be. They further illustrate the necessity for building up a reserve fund which will in some measure compensate the University for the almost total absence of those benefactions and endowments derived from private sources, which add so largely to the dignity, influence, and usefulness of the corresponding institutions in the other provinces of India.

17. Enough has already been said on the probable effects that the adoption of the High School examination will exercise on the University, its Arts examinations and its finances. A very brief statement of the effects on secondary and collegiate education will therefore suffice. The almost immediate effect of the exclusion of the Matriculation and F.A. examinations from those qualifying for admission to the public service would be to reduce the numbers of students in the fifth and sixth classes of existing High Schools, unless they put themselves in a position to meet all the requirements of the new High School examination at an immense cost of money and with considerable dislocation of existing arrangements. While we are not prepared to acknowledge any vested interest in any class of existing educational institutions, we cannot but feel anxious about the future when it is proposed to lay the axe at the very root of collegiate education by setting up a rival examination to the Matriculation, and by proposing to bolster up that examination with exceptional privileges. We would draw special attention to the fact that schools and colleges have been established and conducted by individuals and by public bodies on the understanding that such institutions will have a certain amount of work to do, and may expect for doing such work a certain monetary return. Now while the institutions are more efficient than ever in regard to the work they have undertaken to do, a mine is, as it were, sprung on them in the form of the High School examination: their arrangements are disturbed, the market value of their work is reduced, and their finances are crippled. It need hardly be said that a new departure involving such injurious consequences demands very serious consideration before being decided on.

18. The reservation of certain appointments for graduates, as proposed in paragraph 22 of the High School report, we entirely approve of. We would, however, propose that the limit of Rs. 250 in connection therewith be changed to Rs. 200, as it seems to us that a higher general education than even the modified Matriculation examination will test should be demanded for posts above Rs. 200. We would, however, remark that, though the reservation, in theory, is equitable and reasonable, yet, in practice, it is liable to abuse and may open a wide door to influence and favoritism. Liberal as the privilege conferred on graduates may seem, the appointments reserved are limited in number; the number of vacancies occurring annually will be small, and the number of graduates likely to be benefited will be but an insignificant fraction of the total number passed annually by the University. The prizes being few, the competition keen, and the chances of failure great, the stimulus thus intended to be given to higher education will have a very limited scope and influence. Only those are likely to venture to study for the degree examinations who can afford the time and the money for risking failure. It is necessary to observe in this connection that, for appointments with a salary not exceeding Rs. 250, the High School examination is a sufficient qualification. The number of appointments on a salary of Rs. 250 or under is many times as large as the number on a salary exceeding Rs. 250. This being so, and graduates not having a preferential claim over others to the lower appointments, it is clear that so far as these appointments are concerned, the proposed High School examination would have a far greater attraction to students than the University degree examinations. The course for the B.A. degree examination will occupy, at the least, three years more than the course prescribed for the proposed High School examination. With the present limit of age for entering the public service, it is a matter of grave import whether the qualifying examination is passed at 18 years of age or at 21. Three years devoted to study or three years lost in watching for an opportunity for entering the public service. Add to these important differences the fact that one who has passed the High School examination is on a footing of equality with the graduate in regard to the lower appointments, and can by meritorious service make his way into the higher ranks of the service, and it must be clear that only a few students will have the courage and the means to elect the longer and more difficult course, and in case of success gain but a precarious advantage, while in case of failure the loss will be certain and often irremediable.

19. We wish, in this connection, to express our decided opinion that the establishment of a huge examination with the one object of testing candidates for Government service is likely to intensify an evil already too great, and to prove a political mistake. There can be no objection

to Government holding examinations for filling up vacancies in the public service, but the High School examination will go far beyond this. It will supersede the Matriculation examination, and the thousands who pass it will imagine that thereby they have acquired a claim to Government employment, much discontent among all except the few who obtain such employment being thereby created. Whilst the High School examination is intended to be primarily and chiefly a test qualifying for Government service, in the Matriculation examination this consideration occupies a secondary and subsidiary position. The new scheme has for one of its objects the diversion of students from purely literary to practical and technical education, but any one unacquainted with this fact would hardly gather it from the report of the Committee. The one thing therein set forth is *the Government service and its requirements*. On this ground, among others, we consider the University examinations should still be recognized by Government as the tests of general education; and there is little doubt that the Senate would be prepared to make all reasonable modifications that Government might regard as necessary.

20. The desirability of centring *all* examination work in the University has been repeatedly enunciated by the Government of India, and this view has been urged on the attention of local Governments not only with reference to examinations gauging the results of general education, but also with reference to examination in technical and practical subjects. The latest expression of the opinion of the Government of India on the matter, to which we have access, is in the "Note on Technical Education," where it is said on page 67:—

"The public examinations in technical and practical subjects, which it is proposed to inaugurate, should be conducted *not* by Government, but by the University."

And again on page 68:—

"The University should institute an alternative entrance examination."

Though we feel firmly persuaded that a very strong case can be made out in favor of the University undertaking examinations in technical and practical subjects, we refrain from enlarging on the subject, as we are not called upon to do so; nor shall we pause to discuss the propriety of making the examination in technical and practical subject alternative with the entrance examination instead of supplementary to it. The state of English education in this Presidency seems to us to be such as would justify the making of the Matriculation examination, modified as we suggest, the universal test of general education, and any examination on technical and practical subjects coming after the Matriculation examination would thus be made alternative with the F.A. examination, and might even be a better preparation for some optional branches of the B.A. degree examination than the First Examination in Arts. It is unnecessary to discuss at any length the grounds on which it is considered desirable that all examinations, general and technical, should be in the hands of the University. They are briefly given below:—

- (i) That if the University should exercise control over both general and technical examinations, it would be possible so to arrange the details as to avoid any injurious clashing and conflict of interests.
- (ii) That such concentration of work would avoid to some extent the need for the employment of a double set of machinery, and would thus economize the expenditure of energy and money.
- (iii) That the financial position of the University would thereby be greatly improved and strengthened.
- (iv) That the friction, and disagreement, and division of authority and responsibility, that would inevitably attend the scheme of putting the Education Department or any other department in injurious competition with the University, might be avoided.
- (v) That the selection of examiners, especially in a variety of scientific and technical subjects, would be better made by the Syndicate of the University, a board of men selected for their capacity and character by the whole Senate, than by any one individual, more particularly as such individual is likely as a rule to be a member of the Syndicate.
- (vi) And lastly that it is extremely undesirable that Government should hold *any but Special Test examinations* for its own employes. Any departure from this principle we regard as an usurpation by Government of the legitimate functions of the University.

21. The High School Committee appear to lay great stress on a *viva voce* examination in English. We have the gravest doubts in regard to the feasibility of such a test, and even if by the employment of a numerous agency the test is rendered feasible, it needs no argument to show that it can hardly be fair or equitable. The addition of such a test as part of the Matriculation examination, we regard as utterly impracticable. If, therefore, it be considered essential as a test for admission into the public service, it must, in our view, go with the Special Tests, and be conducted under the same direction.

22. It only remains for us to state what modifications in the Matriculation examination seem to us to be necessary and desirable. These modifications are proposed not simply with the object of making the modified Matriculation examination about equivalent to the proposed High School examination, but also because the progress of secondary education during the last decade justifies the raising of the Matriculation standard, and because there is a general agreement among teachers at colleges that students in the junior F.A. classes would profit more by collegiate instruction, if they had a better knowledge, especially of English. The recommendations we unanimously agree in making are—

- (i) The introduction of handwriting and spelling as subjects of examination, it being laid down by Government that only such candidates as obtain 50 per cent. of the marks in each of these subjects are eligible for examination in tests for the public service.
- (ii) The raising of the minimum for passing in the English language to 40 per cent.
- (iii) Making the minimum in every other subject 33 per cent.
- (iv) Requiring, on the whole, as the minimum for a second-class pass 40 per cent., for a first class 50 per cent. The present requirements are one-third in English and the optional language, one-fourth in every other subject, and one-third on the whole.

These proposals would obviously have the effect of raising the standard of the Matriculation examination, besides introducing the essential subjects of handwriting and spelling. The Matriculation examination, modified as herein recommended, would require a higher standard of general education than the general part of the proposed High School test would do. It would also involve a three years' school course between the Middle School examination and Matriculation—a change long advocated—and thus secure students better fitted to profit by a College course than a great proportion have been in the past. The interests of Government and those of general education would thus both be benefited, Government obtaining men of higher education for its service, and the University securing students better qualified to profit by its higher course.

23. It may be noted that the protest to the High School Committee's report, signed by Mr. Grigg, Mr. Cooper, and the Rev. Dr. Jean, expresses the opinion that "if the Matriculation examination is modified at any future time so as to make its tests in any branch of study a satisfactory equivalent for any branch in this scheme, we see no objection to certificates for these portions of the tests being accepted, &c."

In principle, this is precisely identical with our recommendations, which, however, have the merit of going further, by making the Matriculation *entirely* instead of partially the test of the general education laid down in the High School scheme.

24. The views and conclusions contained in this report may be summarised thus:—

- (a) That the name 'High School Examination' is a misnomer.
- (b) That the compulsory part of the High School examination and the Matriculation examination cover much the same ground.
- (c) That the combination proposed of a test for High Schools with the public service test will in reality be injurious to technical education itself.
- (d) That the proposed High School examination would to a certainty diminish the number of candidates for the Arts examinations of the University, and also injuriously affect their quality.
- (e) That the present financial independence of the University will be imperilled and rendered impossible, and thus a part of the University expenditure will become a charge on Provincial revenues.
- (f) That the reserving of certain appointments for graduates of the University is undoubtedly a gain, but not so great a gain as the High School Committee would have it.
- (g) That the institution of the new examination coupled with the exclusion of the lower Arts examinations from qualifying tests will put the whole machinery of education as it exists at present out of gear, and thus seriously retard the progress of higher education.
- (h) That it is desirable that all public examinations, general if not also technical, should be centred in the University.
- (i) That the *vice roce* examination recommended by the High School Committee is a practical impossibility.
- (j) That the adoption of the modifications in the Matriculation examination proposed by this Committee will not only do away with the necessity for the general education portion of the High School examination, but also give a powerful impulse to higher education.

J. T. FOWLER.
P. RANGANADAM.
D. SINCLAIR.
&c. &c. &c.

APPENDIX.

The proposals of the High School Committee have been considered by the Executive Council on Aided Education, and this Committee is of opinion that it would be well were the Senate acquainted with the views which that body hold with regard to the measure. They have accordingly resolved to place before the Senate, as an appendix to their report, some extracts from a very able letter addressed by the Council to the heads of aided institutions and others, in which certain aspects of the question, especially the effect which the proposed examination is likely to have on High Schools and Colleges, are examined in greater detail than in their report. With the conclusions arrived at by the Council this Committee thoroughly concurs.

The Council writes as follows:—

As at present advised, the Council cannot look with favor upon the scheme. If sanctioned in its present form, the benefit that education will derive from it is at best problematical, while the injury that it will inflict upon existing institutions is certain. In order to make clear the effects which it seems to the Council calculated to produce, it will be necessary to view it in its relation, (1) to Secondary, and (2) to Collegiate education.

Before doing this, however, a few preliminary remarks on some general aspects of the whole scheme are needful.

- (a) It subordinates the general interests of popular education to the needs of the public service. The report of the Committee appointed by Government makes it abundantly clear that the interests of the public service were the main consideration throughout their discussions. Now it is undoubtedly true that for the past quarter of a century the hope of public employ has been a great stimulus to education in this Presidency. The Court of Directors in their Despatch of 1854 foresaw that it would be a stimulus, and desired that it should be used to the utmost; but they did *not* desire that education should be moulded and directed merely with the view of supplying Government with efficient servants; and any scheme which is based on such a conception of the functions of education stands, in our view, self-condemned. At present the desire for public employ is far too keenly felt, and education will never be on a really sound and healthy basis so long as there is any tendency to regard it merely as a door to the public offices. Anything which strengthens this tendency is an evil, and the present scheme will, in our opinion, strengthen it by associating ideas of public service, even to the extent of distinctions between different offices, with the work of every high school.
- (b) Those who speak of this scheme as merely the introduction of a *modern* side into Indian schools, are led astray by a false analogy. The University classes in a Madras high school are as much modern in the ordinary English acceptance of that term as the modern side in any public school in Britain. The classical side of an English public school has indeed no counterpart in this country outside the Sanskrit Colleges. The modern side at home differs from the classical in the fact that modern languages and science take the place, wholly or partially, of purely classical studies. Now not one-fifth of the boys who go up for the Matriculation examination at Madras take any classical work at all, either European or Asiatic. The new High School course, therefore, can be logically differentiated from the present University course only by the inclusion of subjects which ought to form part of *special* and not of *general* education.
- (c) A great evil involved in the working out of the new scheme will be that boys must practically determine the course of their future life at much too early an age. As soon as they have passed the Middle School examination two paths will be open to them, one leading to the High School examination and the other to the University. When a boy has once entered either of these paths, it will not be easy for him to cross the barrier that separates him from the other. The Director tries to show that this would not be difficult, but it may be pointed out that in so far as he minimizes the difficulty does he destroy the *raison d'être* of bifurcation itself. Now twelve or thirteen years is a not uncommon age for a boy to pass the Middle School examination. At that age then, before his special powers have had time to show themselves, he is to be called upon to make a choice on which his whole life will depend; from that moment his thoughts and aspirations must be turned towards a definite end; from that moment, before his intellect has fairly expanded, he is to be made acquainted with the narrowing influences of official routine. Any system which involves such a process of unnatural forcing will, in our view, be seriously prejudicial to the highest ends of true education.
- (d) Another general objection to the scheme to which we attach great weight is the absolute impossibility of conducting a *vice roce* examination in English by means of Local Committees with any approach to evenness of standard. Under the most

favorable circumstances *vidæ voce* examinations in language are the most difficult of all examinations to conduct with fairness and efficiency. The High School Committee quote with approval the example of Bombay. Few Bombay men would do this. It must not be forgotten that the Madras University had at one time *vidæ voce* examinations in English. But they were found, even with the limited number of candidates appearing for the B.A. degree, so utterly unsatisfactory, that they were wisely discontinued. If a *vidæ voce* test be introduced into the High School examination in the way in which the Notification proposes, then the standard in the language branch of that examination will be at the mercy of the Local Committees.

Turning now to the effect which the scheme in its present shape might be expected to have upon the various educational institutions of the country, it is to be observed that those schools and colleges would be least affected, for good or evil, that are situated at large centres of population and are themselves vigorous and popular. In schools whose fifth and sixth classes are already large enough to be worked in two sections, it would be a comparatively simple thing to make one section the University side, and the other the High School side of the class. And provided that the demand for the two courses was approximately equal, there would be no serious inconvenience and not much additional expense. But would the demand be equal? In answer to Question II of our circular of November 12th, 1887, a large number of the leading educationists of South India give it as their opinion that over 75 per cent. of the boys who now study for the Matriculation examination would choose the High School course if Matriculation ceased to qualify for Government service. Some of them even go so far as to put the percentage down at over 90. We are ourselves of opinion that a very large majority of students would, under the conditions assumed, choose the High School course. It might thus occasion considerable inconvenience and difficulty even in large schools.

When, however, we come to consider the case of the smaller High Schools in the Mofussil, very different conditions present themselves. The average strength of Matriculation classes throughout the Presidency is under thirty, and in the Mofussil alone, we believe, under twenty. In such classes it will be manifestly impossible for both courses to be worked; and if, as we anticipate, a majority of students choose the High School course, that must be the one adopted by the managers. In towns where only one High School exists,—and probably also where there are two or three—boys who would have wished to take up the University course will perforce have to be content with the other. Now it is just in these smaller towns that education needs to be most carefully guarded. Is it likely, we would ask, that the whole course of higher instruction can be suddenly turned into a channel wholly new and strange without sustaining a shock from which it will take years to recover!

If in towns where the classes are somewhat larger an enterprising manager divides his two highest classes and makes provision for both courses, how is he to bear the additional financial burden that will inevitably fall upon him? The majority of those who answered the circular above referred to were of opinion that no increase in the number of pupils would follow such a division. Therefore no assistance could be expected from increased fees. In response to a request for an estimate of the extra cost they would incur by bifurcation in their town schools, the lowest estimate submitted is Rs. 600 per annum, and the highest Rs. 3,600, while the average is about Rs. 1,800. In very few of the cases could bifurcation be contemplated unless the Government were prepared to bear the largest share of this extra expenditure. Would Government consent to this? We fear not. The Director promises liberal help towards the establishment of High School classes, but the utmost that he would be able to give would fall far short of the demands. Grants have, moreover, been so severely reduced of late, often with little or no notice, that public confidence in Government aid is justly shaken. We are persuaded that few managers of the class of schools of which we are now speaking would be found willing to attempt to carry on both courses, unless Government could guarantee, for a term of years, additional grants to the amount of one-half or two-thirds of the extra cost; and it would not be possible for Government to do this without a considerable increase in the allotments for secondary education.

Another difficulty of a very practical kind which confronts us at this stage is the provision of teachers. The proposed High School course covers at least three years, while the Matriculation course covers only two. Therefore, in all schools giving up the latter in favor of the former there will be at least one extra class, while in those which adopt both courses there will be three extra classes. Where are the teachers for these classes to be found? Men with the requisite educational qualifications are difficult to obtain even now. So large and so sudden an increase of employment would inevitably lower the average standard of the men employed, and consequently of the instruction given.

But prejudicial as the effects of the new scheme would be upon secondary schools, it would act still more prejudicially upon collegiate education. The Director contemplates with equanimity a reduction in the number of candidates for the F.A. examination which would inevitably close the collegiate department in the majority of the 29 * second-grade colleges now affiliated to

* The number is now 30.

the Madras University. According to the report of the Syndicate for 1887-88, out of the 1,706 candidates who were sent up to the F.A. examination from the various colleges of the Presidency in 1887, 954 came from the first-grade colleges alone. The seven largest second-grade colleges sent up 413, leaving only 339 for the 22 smaller second-grade colleges—an average of 15.4. Now there can be little doubt that the first colleges to succumb to adverse influences would be the weaker second-grade colleges. If, therefore, the number of candidates for this examination be reduced by 30 per cent.—and in our opinion the reduction would be much greater than this—it seems a fair deduction that at least 75 per cent. of the mofussil colleges would have to be given up. Now, altogether apart from the question whether the Government is prepared to close the second-grade colleges which during the past ten or twelve years it has, at great cost, established throughout the Presidency, what is to be said of the injustice that will be done to all private institutions by this sudden reversal of policy! Many of these have been established at considerable cost to the promoters, who have been led to undertake a heavy responsibility, largely by the encouragement and approval of the Director of Public Instruction himself; and now a change is proposed which will render their past expenditure to a large extent useless. Such a change can be justified only by the most urgent and unavoidable necessity, and if it be allowed to take effect, it is at least an open question whether the managers of some of the institutions thus crippled will not have a fair and equitable claim upon Government for pecuniary compensation.

Nor would it be the second-grade colleges alone that would suffer from the proposed change. It must be remembered that of recent years the University has, with the full approval of Government, made the course of study for the B.A. degree much more complicated and costly, by the introduction of five optional branches. Now, unless this development in the highest department of education is to become practically nugatory, at least two or three of the larger colleges ought to be in a position to offer instruction in all these branches. But they cannot possibly do this without large B.A. classes. Even under the most favorable circumstances these classes must always be extremely costly. With the most economical management the fees received can never be expected to cover more than a small fraction of the expenditure, and managers must always be more or less dependent upon the excess of fees received in the larger and less costly F.A. classes. Now the new High School scheme would, we are confident, so largely reduce all collegiate classes that managers of even the largest first-grade colleges would be crippled in their resources, and would be compelled to discontinue two or three of the optional branches for the B.A. degree, unless the Government came to their aid with much more liberal grants than would be justifiable on any grounds of public policy. This is, on the whole, one of the most serious and far-reaching aspects of the proposal under discussion, for no more pernicious and fatal policy could be adopted than that which sets one branch of the educational system of the country in direct and inevitable antagonism to another.

Such a reduction in the amount of collegiate education would seriously intensify the difficulty referred to above by still further reducing the supply of well-educated men willing to qualify as teachers. It is from the ranks of those who have passed the F.A. and B.A. examinations that the best of our school teachers are drawn. Thus the present scheme, if put into effect, will on the one hand increase the demand for teachers, and on the other diminish the supply. To this it will no doubt be replied that the increased demand will attract more men to the profession, and in so far will tend to alleviate the evil effects which we anticipate for colleges. But this can only result from an increase in the salaries offered sufficient to make the profession more attractive—a contingency which will depend almost entirely on an increase of Government aid. It is unfortunately true that at the present time very few of those who prosecute their studies to the standard of the B.A. degree do so with a view to the scholastic profession. The prizes of the profession are few, the labor is constant and severe, the average remuneration precarious and scanty. They are stimulated as a rule by other hopes and aims, and fall back upon teaching as a *pi aller*. None the less, however, do they make the best teachers we have got. There is at this moment nothing more desirable than that the profession of education should be made in itself attractive, but this is a consummation that will certainly not be hastened by a scheme which is calculated to throw additional financial burdens upon every manager.

Such are the views which the Council takes of the results likely to be achieved by the High School examination if sanctioned in its present form.

(Signed) S. MUTHUSAMI AIYER.

From the Honorary Secretary to the Executive Council on Aided Education,
dated Madras, 29th January 1889.

ABSTRACT.—Forwarding a memorial on the proposed High School examination.

To

HIS EXCELLENCY THE GOVERNOR IN COUNCIL,

Fort St. George.

The Memorial of the undersigned Representatives
of Aided Education and others.

HUMBLY SHEWETH,

That your Memorialists have read with alarm the proposals of the Director of Public Instruction for the establishment of a High School Examination as contained in G.O., No. 401, 11th July 1888, and desire humbly to ask the attention of Your Excellency in Council to the disastrous effects which this scheme, if sanctioned, seems calculated to have upon liberal education in this Presidency. Before proceeding to do this, however, Your Memorialists beg to assure Your Excellency that they are not animated by any antagonism to technical or practical education as such. They most cordially agree with Your Excellency's Government and Government of India that the time has come when some steps should be taken in this Presidency to give effect to the recommendation of the Education Commission by making provision for education of a more practical character, intended to fit youths for commercial and other non-literary pursuits, and they are prepared to give their hearty support to any wise measure for this end. But it is impossible that they should acquiesce in the scheme now before Your Excellency. Your Memorialists submit that that scheme is revolutionary in its character, and calculated to prove disastrous alike to liberal education and to private enterprise. They, therefore, feel it their duty strenuously to oppose it, and humbly but earnestly to pray that Your Excellency in Council will refuse to sanction it.

2. In order to make clear to Your Excellency the grounds upon which Your Memorialists base this prayer, it is necessary that they should enter at some length into the effects which in their opinion the scheme, if sanctioned, seems likely to have (1) upon Secondary education and (2) upon Collegiate education. But before doing this, they would beg Your Excellency's attention to some general aspects of the whole scheme.

- (a) It subordinates education to the needs of the public service. The report of the Committee appointed by Your Excellency's Government makes it abundantly clear that the interests of the public service were the main consideration throughout their discussions. Now it is undoubtedly true that for the past quarter of a century the hope of public employ has been a great stimulus to education in this Presidency. The Court of Directors in their Despatch of 1854 foresaw that it would be a stimulus, and desired that it should be used to the utmost, but Your Excellency's Memorialists submit that the Directors did not desire that education should be moulded and directed merely with the view of supplying Government with efficient servants; and any scheme which is based on such a conception of the functions of education stands self-condemned. At present the desire for public employ is far too keenly felt, and education will never be on a really sound and healthy basis so long as it is regarded merely as a door to the public offices. Anything which strengthens the present tendency so to regard it is an evil, and the scheme now before Your Excellency will strengthen this tendency by directly and intimately associating ideas of public service with the work of every High School. As soon as a youth has passed through the Middle School, he will, according to the scheme now under discussion, be required to determine what optional branches he will take up in the High School course. These branches are numerous and various. Some of them, such as Engraving and Etching, must always be confined to special institutions, but about fifteen out of the twenty-eight optional branches specified might conceivably be taught in institutions established for general education. In a very large school it is possible—but barely possible—that provision might be made for instruction in all these subjects, but the vast majority of schools would be able to offer instruction in three or four of them at the most. In either case then a choice would have to be made—in the first instance by the pupils themselves, in the second by the managers of the school in question. And on what grounds must this choice be made? Inevitably on the value of the various branches in preparation for the public service. Under Article 11 of the Draft Notification, special branches will be prescribed for different offices; and as the High School scheme would not destroy the prevailing desire for public employ, but merely divert it into a new channel and greatly intensify it, both schoolmasters and pupils must and will be guided in their choice of optional branches mainly by the prospects offered to aspiring youths by this or that department of the public service. Thus in a large school such as Your Memorialists have supposed, the higher classes would be split up into sections according to the office for which each youth was preparing, and amongst smaller schools we should have one preparing only for the Salt Department, another for the Public Works Department, and so on. In the humble

opinion of Your Memorialists any scheme which involves such results deliberately sets aside what should ever be the main end of all education.

- (b) A great evil involved in the working out of the proposed scheme will be that boys must practically determine the course of their future life at much too early an age. As soon as they have passed the Middle School Examination, two paths will be open to them—one leading to Government service, and the other to a liberal education. When a boy has once entered either of these paths, it will not be easy for him to cross the barrier that separates him from the other. The Director tries to show that this would not be difficult, but it may be pointed out that in so far as he minimizes the difficulty does he destroy the *raison d'être* of bifurcation itself. Now twelve or thirteen years is a common age for a boy to pass the Middle School Examination. At that age then, before his special powers have had time to show themselves, he is to be called upon to make a choice on which his whole life will depend; from that moment his thoughts and aspirations must be turned towards a definite end; from that moment, before his intellect has fairly begun to expand, he is to be subjected to the narrowing influences of official routine. Such a process of unnatural forcing will, in the opinion of Your Excellency's Memorialists, be seriously prejudicial to the education of the country, and will ultimately injure, rather than benefit; the public service.
- (c) Those who speak of this scheme as merely the introduction of a modern side into Indian schools are led astray by a false analogy. The classes in a Madras High School which prepare students for the University are as much modern, in the ordinary English acceptance of that term, as the modern side in any public school in Britain. The classical side of an English public school has indeed no counterpart in this country outside the Sanskrit colleges. The modern side in Britain differs from the classical in the fact that modern languages and science take the place, wholly or partially, of purely classical studies. Now not one-fifth of the boys who go up for the Matriculation Examination in Madras take any classical work at all, either European or Asiatic. The proposed High School course, therefore, can be logically differentiated from the present University course only by the inclusion of subjects which ought to form part of special and not of general education.

3. Turning now to the effect which the proposed scheme in its present shape might be expected to have upon the various educational institutions of the country, it is to be observed that those schools and colleges would be least affected, for good or evil, that are situated at large centres of population and are themselves vigorous and popular. In schools whose fifth and sixth classes are already large enough to be worked in two sections, it would be a comparatively simple thing to make one section the University side and the other the High School side of the class. And, provided that the demand for the two courses was approximately equal, there would be no serious inconvenience and not much additional expense. But would the demand be equal? In answer to a question addressed to them by the Executive Council on Aided Education in November 1887, a large number of the leading educationists of South India gave it as their opinion that if the Matriculation Examination ceased to qualify for Government service, over 75 per cent. of the boys who now study for the Matriculation Examination would choose the High School course. Some of them even go so far as to put the percentage at over 90. It might thus occasion great inconvenience and difficulty even in large schools.

When, however, we come to consider the case of the smaller High Schools in the mofussil, very different conditions present themselves. The average strength of Matriculation classes throughout the Presidency is under thirty and in the mofussil alone under twenty. In such classes it is manifestly impossible that both courses should be worked, and if, as Your Memorialists anticipate, a majority of students should choose the High School course, that must be the one adopted by the managers. In towns where only one High School exists—and probably also where there are two or three—boys who would have wished to take up the University course would have to be content with the other. Now it is just in these smaller towns that education needs to be most carefully guarded. Is it likely, Your Memorialists would respectfully ask, that the whole course of higher instruction can be suddenly turned into a channel wholly new and strange without sustaining a shock from which it will take years to recover?

And even in towns where the classes are somewhat larger, if an enterprising manager were to divide his two highest classes and make provision for both courses, how could he bear the additional financial burden that would inevitably fall upon him? The majority of those who answered the question above referred to were of opinion that no increase in the number of pupils would follow such a division. Therefore no assistance could be expected from increased fees. In response to a request for an estimate of the extra cost they would incur by bifurcation in their own schools, the lowest estimate submitted was Rs. 600 per annum, and the highest Rs. 3,600, while the average was about Rs. 1,800. In very few of these cases could bifurcation be contemplated, unless the Government were prepared to bear the largest share of this extra expenditure. We fear Your Excellency would not consent to this. The Director of Public Instruction promises liberal help towards the establishment of High School classes, but the utmost that he

will be able to give would fall far short of the demands. Grants have, moreover been so severely reduced of late, often with little or no notice, that public confidence in Government aid is justly shaken. Your Memorialists are persuaded that few managers of the class of schools of which they are now speaking would be found willing to attempt to carry on both courses, unless Your Excellency's Government could guarantee, for a term of years, additional grants to the amount of one-half or two-thirds of the extra cost—a guarantee that would involve an enormous increase in the allotments for secondary education.

4. But prejudicial as the effects of the new scheme would be upon secondary schools, it would act still more prejudicially upon collegiate education. The Director of Public Instruction contemplates with equanimity a reduction in the number of candidates for the F.A. Examination which, Your Memorialists submit, would inevitably close the collegiate department in the majority of the 30 second-grade colleges now affiliated to the Madras University. According to the report of the Syndicate for 1887-88, out of the 1,706 candidates who were sent up to the F.A. Examination from the various colleges of the Presidency in 1887, 954 came from the first-grade colleges alone. The seven largest second-grade colleges sent up 413, leaving only 339 for the 22 smaller second-grade colleges—an average of 15.4. Now there can be little doubt that the first colleges to succumb to adverse influences would be the weaker second-grade colleges. If, therefore, the number of candidates for this examination be reduced by 30 per cent.—and in the opinion of Your Memorialists the reduction would be much greater than this—it seems a fair deduction that almost all the mofussil colleges would have to be given up. Now altogether apart from the question whether Your Excellency's Government is prepared to destroy the second-grade colleges which at great cost were established throughout the Presidency by Your Excellency's predecessors, and which have now for the most part been handed over to the management of Municipalities and other public bodies, Your Memorialists respectfully submit that a great injustice would be done to all private institutions by any such sudden reversal of policy. Many of these institutions have been established at considerable cost to the promoters, who have been led to undertake a heavy responsibility largely by the encouragement and approval of the Director of Public Instruction himself; and the change now proposed would render the past expenditure of many of them entirely useless.

Nor would it be the second-grade colleges alone that would suffer from the proposed change. It must be remembered that of recent years the University has, with the full approval of Your Excellency's Government, made the course of study for the B.A. degree much more complicated and costly by the introduction of five optional branches. Now, unless this development in the highest department of education is to become practically nugatory, at least two or three of the larger colleges ought to be in a position to offer instruction in all these branches. But they cannot possibly do this without large B.A. classes. Even under the most favourable circumstances, these classes must always be extremely costly. With the most economical management the fees received can never be expected to cover more than a small fraction of the expenditure, and managers must always be more or less dependent upon the excess of fees received in the larger and less costly F.A. classes. Now the proposed High School scheme would, Your Memorialists are confident, so largely reduce all collegiate classes that managers of even the largest first-grade colleges would be crippled in their resources, and would be compelled to discontinue two or three of the optional branches for the B.A. degree, unless Your Excellency's Government came to their aid with much more liberal grants than would be justifiable on any grounds of public policy.

5. Such are the views which Your Memorialists take of the effects likely to be produced by the scheme which it is proposed to introduce so suddenly. Your Excellency will perceive that in the opinion of Your Memorialists these effects would amount to nothing short of the virtual destruction of liberal education throughout this Presidency—a result that will produce the greatest possible dissatisfaction in the community at large. So firmly, indeed, are Your Memorialists assured that this would be the result of the scheme, that they are compelled to declare that if it had been devised with this set object, it could hardly have been more perfectly adapted to its end. It will, if put into effect, cripple for many years to come both the University and all First Grade Colleges, and shatter at one stroke ninety per cent. of the Second Grade Colleges and High Schools. It may be that in the past a liberal education has been sought too much as a means of entry into the public service; it may be that under the influence of this stimulus both the University and its affiliated Colleges have grown too rapidly, and that they now exhibit the weakness incident to too rapid growth. Into these questions it is not necessary for us now to enter; for were these evils even greater than they are, they could, in Your Memorialists' view, present no justification for the wholesale abolition now contemplated. For it must not be forgotten that, as Your Memorialists have shown above, the new scheme depends for its encouragement and success upon the very stimulus which the Director holds has operated prejudicially upon the present system. If it is an evil that liberal education should be stimulated by the hope of Government employ, still more will it be an evil that that stimulus should operate in the lower school classes, and become the predominating influence in all education. For a long period it has been the deliberate and avowed policy of the Government to encourage liberal education by making it the main avenue, not only to posts of honour and emolument, but also

to the lower grades of its services. Under this encouragement, the University and the whole educational apparatus of the country have become what they are. If the policy of Government is now to be reversed, it must be by slow and gradual changes, and not by a revolution that would be productive of incalculable dislocation and waste, and that would throw back the liberal education of the country at least a generation.

6. Your Memorialists are further of opinion that the new scheme, if sanctioned, would fatally discourage all private enterprise in education, and would be in this respect a reversal of the wise policy first laid down in the Despatch of 1854, reiterated by the Education Commission, and repeatedly avowed by the Government of India and Your Excellency's predecessors. Your Memorialists do not believe that Your Excellency's Government has any wish to reverse a policy so often and so recently approved, but they beg respectfully to point out to Your Excellency that every scheme that is revolutionary in its nature is in effect a reversal of it. Private effort of every kind depends most of all upon the continuity of the educational policy of the Government. No liberality of Government aid will suffice to attract private enterprise if managers cannot depend upon the persistence of Government in any policy that it lays down. The proposed scheme if carried into effect will inflict serious financial loss upon all private agencies now in the field; many will be driven away, and others that might enter it will be effectually deterred from doing so. And just as in other respects the scheme will—as Your Memorialists have pointed out—tell most hardly upon those schools which most require fostering support, so here that branch of private effort will be most crippled which it is the avowed policy of the Government most to encourage. Roughly speaking, private effort may be divided into two classes—that which is supported by agencies which draw much of their support from Britain, and that which is indigenous to the country and takes its rise in the enterprise and public spirit of the Native community. As a rule the latter is circumscribed by much narrower financial limits than the former, and difficulties that the former might surmount would be utterly destructive to the latter. Your Memorialists submit that particularly in the interests of this class of private effort, a wise policy should avoid any hasty or great changes in educational rules. It is of incalculable importance to the country as a whole that every such effort should be generously met and encouraged, for if ever the educational needs of the country are to be adequately provided for, it must be by this indigenous agency, fostered, organized, and directed by the Educational Department.

7. In conclusion, Your Memorialists beg to repeat that they are in no way opposed to technical or practical education, and to assure Your Excellency that the representatives of Aided Education will, if consulted (in conformity with Recommendation 14, Chapter VI, of the Education Commission's Report), gladly co-operate with the officers of the Education Department in devising and carrying out some wise and feasible measure. They are convinced that the ends which Your Excellency's Government has in view may be attained without the aggravated dislocation of present methods inseparable from the revolutionary scheme now before Your Excellency. They therefore humbly pray that Your Excellency in Council will be pleased to withhold sanction from the proposed scheme, and to appoint a truly representative Committee to deal with the question *de novo* in consultation with those who have had most experience in the work of education. Your Memorialists humbly submit that in this way alone can a measure be devised which will give effect to the policy of Your Excellency's Government, and yet conserve those interests which, they believe, it is not Your Excellency's purpose to sacrifice, and which, at the same time, will evoke that hearty co-operation of all classes of educationists on which the effectual carrying out of any such measure must wholly depend.

And Your Memorialists, as in duty bound, will ever pray, &c.

(Signed) GEORGE MILNE RAY,
Secy., Free Church of Scotland Mission.
(") J. HOWARD BULLIVANT, M.A.,
Principal, S. P. G. College, Madras.
(") WALTER JOSS,
Principal, L. M. S. Institution, Madras.
&c. &c. &c.

From M.R.Ry. K. P. SANKARA MENON, Secretary to the Council of the Madras Graduates' Association, to the Chief Secretary to Government, dated Myslapore, 30th January 1889, No. 63-C.

The Council of the Madras Graduates' Association direct me to state that they feel deeply thankful to His Excellency the Governor in Council for having complied with their request that the Graduates' Association and other public bodies in Madras

should be allowed a sufficient time for considering the proposed High School Examination in all its bearings, and for giving expression to their convictions and feelings on this vital question. The opportunity so generously accorded has enabled the Council to consider the subject with great care and minuteness. The paragraphs that follow embody the sense of the resolutions they have arrived at after a thorough discussion of the subject in a variety of aspects.

2. One observation that the Council feel compelled to make is that a Committee appointed to consider so important and comprehensive a subject as the proposed High School Examination should have been composed of a much larger number of members than nine, so that every phase of opinion and every variety of interest might have been adequately represented by it. Of the nine members that formed the Committee, only three can be rightly said to be non-official members. In the humble opinion of the Council, the non-official element should have borne a larger ratio to the official than that of one to two. They have nothing to say against any individual member of the High School Committee, but it appears to them that that Committee as a whole was not so constituted as to give a fair chance of representation and advocacy to views opposed to those held by the Director of Public Instruction. Indeed it appears to them that a Committee appointed to consider an educational question of such importance should not have had the Director of Public Instruction for its President. It is much to be regretted that this question was not submitted for consideration to an educational conference like the one that considered the far less important subject of school fees. Then only is there a fair prospect of every side of a subject being properly considered, when the highest official authority on it holds a neutral attitude in its discussion.

3. The title given to the examination proposed is somewhat misleading. It is called the *High School Examination*, and yet it is connected only with pupils of a particular class of High Schools. It is presumably not the intention of the High School Committee that no High Schools should prepare students for the University Matriculation Examination. They can only be taken to mean that, in the place of the existing High Schools, three classes of schools should come into existence,—High Schools teaching for the Matriculation Examination,—High Schools teaching for the proposed High School Examination—and High Schools that in separate departments teach for both the examinations. If this view of the case be correct, the designation given to the new examination is inaccurate, inappropriate, and positively mischievous. More need not be said about the inaccuracy and inappropriateness of the designation, but the Council would observe regarding its mischievousness that a new examination like the one proposed should not by its very name be made so to overshadow the University Matriculation Examination as to make it appear almost as if the High Schools that had hitherto been preparing candidates for the Matriculation Examination had missed their proper vocation, and had been doing a work which they had better not have done.

4. The able report submitted by the High School Examination Committee contains abundant reasons for demanding as a qualification for employment in the Public Service a higher standard of attainments than the present Middle School or Matriculation Examination is competent to secure. On the necessity for such a demand, there can be no difference of opinion. The time has assuredly come for the abolition of the Middle School Examination as a public service test. While, therefore, this Council are prepared to admit the necessity for instituting a public service test of a higher standard than the Middle School Examination, they fail to see any wisdom in the policy of associating such a service test with one particular class of High Schools to the exclusion of others, and of giving this service test the invidious and objectionable title of the High School Examination. Such a title will and must carry with it the implication that a High School proper is one in which the subjects of examination for this new test are taught, and that a school in which these subjects are not taught does not deserve to be called a High School. This implication is much to be deprecated, as a Director of Public Instruction who recognises only one particular class of High Schools as High Schools proper is very likely, in perfect obedience

to the dictates of a clear conscience, to ignore the value of other classes of High Schools, and to deny to them their fair share of Government aid and encouragement.

5. The strongest recommendation that the proposed High School Examination has is that it is designed to carry into effect a suggestion made by the Education Commission that there should be a bifurcation of studies at some stage antecedent to the Matriculation Examination. The object with which this suggestion was made was not to throw any obstacle in the way of the further progress and development of collegiate education, but to introduce into the existing system of secondary education an element necessary to give it completeness and practical usefulness in the case of those pupils whose education stops at the High School stage. There is no room for doubt in regard to the soundness of the position that a course of a more practical kind than the University Matriculation Examination will answer the purposes of life better than the smattering of general knowledge possessed by the majority of Matriculates at present. If with the object of carrying out the scheme of bifurcation, the Committee had proposed that the Educational Department should in future recognise two kinds of High Schools—the Collegiate* High School and the Technical High School,—that while the work done in Collegiate High Schools is tested by the University Matriculation Examination, the work of the Technical High Schools should be tested by a Departmental Examination under the control and management of the Director of Public Instruction, and if, even going further, the Committee had suggested that, as the funds at the disposal of Government for granting aid to secondary education are very limited, and as Collegiate High Schools in most districts of the Presidency have reached the self-supporting state, the Technical High Schools should be aided with a larger portion of the funds available than Collegiate High Schools, the Council should in all this find nothing to condemn or protest against. On the contrary, the Council would heartily welcome a change which would tend to give to secondary education greater breadth, variety, and completeness than it now possesses. The Council concur with the High School Committee in thinking that only those pupils who intend after matriculating to prosecute their studies in an Arts College should study for the Matriculation Examination. Those who must give up their studies after passing through the highest class of a secondary school will undoubtedly be far better equipped for the business of life by preparing for and passing an examination like the proposed High School Examination. But while agreeing with the Committee to this extent, the Council cannot too strongly condemn the impolicy of coupling together a High School test and a public service test, and of giving the combined test the name of the “High School Examination.” As in the past, so in the future, the emoluments, the influence, and the dignity attaching to service under the State will act as powerful incentives, and no policy can be characterised as wise which bears even the appearance of showing to one particular examination, connected with secondary schools, a favor and a privilege denied to the rest. Before concluding their remarks on this aspect of the question, the Council wish to urge on the attention of Government that, while Government is certainly entitled to devise such methods as would secure a supply of efficient public servants, and to carry out those methods through the agency of the Educational Department, Government cannot divest itself of the solemn responsibility of acting as the custodian of the existing system of education. Measures may be adopted for obtaining a higher class of public servants, and for making a new departure in secondary education; but in the humble opinion of the Council, it would be most unwise and undesirable for Government to give color and strength to the supposition—not to call it suspicion—that Government is in favor of the proposed High School Examination, as Government will not be sorry to find the progress of higher education checked by the institution of the new examination, and by the diversion thereby caused from the liberal culture which collegiate instruction alone can afford to a lower standard of education sufficient to render its recipient eligible for employment in the public service. Great as is the need for efficient instruction in practical subjects in secondary schools, even this very urgent need will be supplied at too great a cost, if any measure which is likely to have the effect of diminishing the scope and reducing

* Collegiate in the sense of leading up to education in a College.

the value of collegiate education should receive the sanction of Government. The University should, in the interests of liberal education and in view to the various classes of the native community being elevated in literary and scientific tastes, in social union and sympathy, in moral tone and in political aspirations, be allowed to do the great and good work it has been doing. The Lower University Examinations, viz., the Matriculation Examination and the First Examination in Arts, should as heretofore be recognised as qualifying tests of general education, and those who have passed these examinations should be required to complete their qualifications by passing special tests in subjects not comprised within the University course. Nothing short of this will secure University education from the danger of being depreciated and neglected by a great majority of students.

6. It has been said that those who maintain that the University system of education should suffer no discouragement and depreciation really claim for the University a monopoly of the public service. The Council of the Graduates' Association claim no such monopoly for the University. Far from doing this, they would regard with approbation and satisfaction a public service test, unconnected with all systems of education, and entirely independent of both the University and the Educational Department. The practical difficulties of such a public service test are not unknown to the Council. An independent test like the one proposed could be properly worked only if it could be determined with tolerable precision annually how many are to be selected for employment. What the Council contend for is that no middle course is safe between a Public Service test in no way connected with schools, and the admission of tests, both University and Departmental, as qualifying to a greater or less extent for employment in the public service. There was a time when the General Test Examination had nothing to do with the system of education imparted in secondary schools; but when the Director of Public Instruction became also the Commissioner for the U. C. S. Examinations, the most objectionable method of combining the General Test and the Middle School Examinations at once suggested itself. The proposed High School Examination is calculated to raise this evil to its highest pitch of intensity. The identification of the General Test Examination with the Middle School Examination did comparatively small harm, as the attainments and qualifications of those who had passed only the General Test Examination were decidedly inferior to those of the young men who had passed any University Examination. But the new High School Examination professes to be superior to the Matriculation Examination, and it is because such a superiority is assumed to exist that it becomes all the more necessary that the well-being of the University system of education should be conserved by the value of the Matriculation and the First-in-Arts Examinations being duly recognised as tests of general education. The Council will in a subsequent paragraph discuss the question of the expediency from a political point of view, and the wisdom from an educational point of view, of identifying any departmental examination with the public service. They would in this connection content themselves with remarks that to disqualify Matriculates and First-Examination-in-Arts men for the public service would virtually involve the "disestablishment" of the University. The Council have come to this conclusion from the knowledge that they possess of native modes of thought and feeling, and not out of any unreasoning prejudice or bias in favor of the University. They are proud to own that they are so far biassed in favor of the University as to think that all who can afford to carry their education to a high standard should aim at the acquisition of academical distinctions; but they are keenly alive to the necessity of a large number of pupils having to face the stern realities of life without the literary culture and the intellectual training that collegiate education affords. For such as these, a new type of secondary education is an indispensable necessity. The Council would entreat Government to adopt some method of supplying this want which does not imperil the advancement of higher education.

7. The Council will next proceed to consider whether it is politically expedient or educationally sound to make the proposed High School Examination the one test for the public service, subject to the concession in favor of graduates as regards appointments on a salary of Rupees 250 and upwards. In regard to the political

expediency, the Council would draw the attention of Government to the fact that for more than a decade past, the Indian press has been loud in the condemnation and exposure of the most unhealthy longing that exists after appointments in the service of Government. Unhealthy the longing may be, but there is nothing unnatural about it. Even yet the glamour of attraction possessed by an appointment in the service of the State exists. In the existing condition of things, it is incumbent on Government to see that no measure comes into operation which will have the inevitable tendency of aggravating the unhealthy symptoms to a tenfold extent. Such a remedy will be worse indeed than the disease. Liberal as the recognition of the merits of educated natives has been in the past, there never was a possibility of anybody passing a comparatively high examination being in a position to say with reason that he had suffered a cruel disappointment at the hands of the State. Those who passed the Middle School Examination might consider themselves fit for employment in the service of the State, but they could not rightly complain of being passed over in favor of men of admittedly higher qualifications. As to those who passed the University Examination, there was no pledge given or prospect held out to them that they would obtain appointments in the service of Government. The state of things that will be brought about by the proposed High School Examination in a few years after it comes into force, it is not difficult to imagine. The examination may go by the name of the High School Examination, but that will not conceal the fact of its being a complete and direct test for determining eligibility for employment in the service of Government. It seems to the Council that it would be a great political blunder to multiply to an unlimited extent the number of men who may feel themselves entitled to enter the public service. Far better that the discontentment, if such a thing is real, should be confined to men who have enjoyed the benefits of collegiate education, and who may be reasonably assumed to know aright their privileges and responsibilities, than that it should spread over a much wider area, and make its influence felt in a dozen times as many places as at present. The very object and meaning of a bifurcation of studies, anterior to the Matriculation Examination, is to reduce this class of office-seekers and not to increase their number. The institution of the proposed High School Examination will more directly and fully qualify men for employment, and will in consequence intensify in a direct ratio to its success the unwholesome desire for such employment. What the country sadly needs is, not a larger number of men who have passed an examination in docketing, précis-writing, and official correspondence, but a class of men whose secondary education will render them fit to devote themselves to industrial, agricultural, and commercial pursuits. Let there be a new departure in secondary education calculated to accomplish this very desirable result, but not a departure which brings the public service into undue prominence and injurious rivalry with University education. It has been stated that the great educational despatch of 1854 lays stress on the requirements of the public service, and doubtless it does so, seeing that in 1854 the education of the Presidency had but recently begun, and the recruitment of the public service with efficient men was far more difficult than now. But things have changed so greatly since 1854 that even granting that the great despatch puts the public service first and the liberal education of the people second, the right view of the situation in 1889 is to subordinate the needs of the service to the interests of sound learning and liberal culture. Great as is the prominence given in the despatch to the exigencies of the public service, it is scarcely necessary to observe that that despatch contemplated the establishment of Universities and the promotion of liberal education by means of Colleges and High Schools. The policy of Government has so far been to stimulate and encourage a desire for University education, and the intellectual and moral progress of the country requires that this policy should be steadily adhered to. The proposed examination is in appearance innocent and even beneficial, but the nature of the subjects prescribed for it and the privileges attached to it are such as to make it in effect a reversal of this policy. The Council do not wish to impute any but the purest and most philanthropic motives to the advocates of the High School Examination scheme, but their duty to the country compels them to say that it is hard to conceive a more ingeniously devised contrivance for dealing a severe blow on University education under the appearance of giving an impulse to technical education.

8. To turn to the consideration of the High School Examination scheme from an educational point of view, it has been already observed that that scheme has been specially framed with a view to meet the requirements of the public service. As a necessary consequence of its adaptation to this end, the High School Examination for technical schools, instead of being, so to speak, a sort of Higher Middle School examination in general subjects *plus* an examination in technical subjects, is admitted and intended to be a higher test than the present Matriculation examination in general subjects. The Council are quite prepared to concede that everything contained in the compulsory portion of the scheme, including even the *viva voce* examination, is necessary in the interests of the public service; but they are by no means convinced of the universal necessity for, and efficacy of, subjects like *précis*-writing and official correspondence, and translation of an official document. A clerk in a public office or a mercantile firm may be much the better for passing an examination in these subjects, but the large class of men whom technical instruction should reach, and who, by possessing the benefit of such instruction, are expected to turn their attention to, and engage themselves in, independent occupations for earning the means of livelihood, do not require a knowledge of things purely official. The Council are quite willing to admit that the standard of attainments in general subjects for the High School Examination should be higher than for the existing Middle School Examination, but the scheme under consideration seems to make the standard in general and compulsory subjects so high as not to give a fair field to the technical subjects. It is needless to enlarge on this topic, as any one, examining the scheme without reference to the public service, will not fail to recognise the utter inappropriateness of some of the compulsory subjects in an examination for testing the pupils of technical high schools. These subjects should, in the opinion of the Council, be eliminated from the compulsory portion of the examination, and be made to form the subjects of a Special Test Examination, entirely unconnected with schools, and controlled by the Commissioner for the Uncovenanted Civil Service Examinations.

9. It is needless for this Council to dwell at any length on the prejudicial influence that the proposed High School examination will exercise on the University or on collegiate education. The Senate of the University of Madras will doubtless consider that aspect of the question, and submit for the consideration of Government their conclusions and their apprehensions. As regards the influence on secondary education, enough has been already said to show that, while this Council strongly advocates a real bifurcation of studies, they totally condemn the High School scheme as interfering injuriously with existing arrangements, and as tending to produce a most undesirable association in men's minds of high school education with the public service. The managers and principals of aided schools will, the Council have reason to believe, state their view of the case to Government, and protest against the injurious extent to which the High School scheme will disturb the existing state of things. On this subject, the Council will content themselves with observing that if the public examination for technical high schools placed under the control of the Education Department, and if the University Matriculation Examination, are both allowed to qualify for admission to the public service, after those, who have passed either of these examinations, pass also the special tests and the examination in optional branches that may be prescribed for service under Government, the evil of disturbing the existing system of education will be reduced to a minimum, and the two systems of secondary education will work side by side and advance hand in hand. In the opinion of the Council, this is the only solution of the difficulty that avoids an injurious clashing of interests.

10. While the Council are firmly and strongly convinced that the exclusion of the Matriculation Examination from the body of examinations qualifying for admission to the public service will produce the most disastrous results; they are equally well convinced that the standard of the Matriculation Examination is not sufficiently high, especially in English. If, therefore, the University Matriculation Examination is to be accepted as a qualifying test of general education, it is absolutely necessary that its standard should be raised by papers of a more testing character than at present being set and by the minima required in the different subjects for passing

being increased. There is a very general impression that the Matriculation Examination is not sufficiently searching, and that it does not weed out all who have not the natural talent and the acquired capacity for benefiting by collegiate education. Raising the standard of the Matriculation Examination will thus be a great gain to the University. If the Senate of the University of Madras with the sanction of the Governor in Council carry out these desirable reforms in the Matriculation Examination, and if in addition they undertake to subject candidates for matriculation to a test in hand-writing and spelling, the last vestige of a reason for ignoring the value of the Matriculation Examination would disappear, and Government cannot, in fairness to the University and to existing High Schools, deny to Matriculates and to the First-in-Arts men the privilege of being admitted to the examination in optional subjects and to the Special Tests. In regard to the admission of Matriculates and First-in-Arts men to the Special Tests and to the examination in optional subjects, the Council are of opinion that such candidates should be required to produce a certificate of having received instruction in the special and optional subjects for a period of at least six months in a recognized institution after passing the Matriculation Examination.

11. The Council do not feel themselves called upon to consider the objection that it is most undesirable that the University should have the entire control and regulation of secondary education, as all that the Council contend for is that the University is rightly entitled to mould and govern only one branch of secondary education. That branch of secondary education which, by partaking largely of a practical and technical character, is directly connected with bread-winning pursuits, may, in the opinion of the Council, lie outside the province of the University. The Educational Department, whose obvious duty it is to support and promote all kinds and types of education, should be fit to discharge the responsible function of holding the scales even between alternative systems of secondary education, and the Council will be glad to see such a harmonious adjustment between the functions of the University on the one hand and the Educational Department on the other that each may go on doing its proper work without injury or obstruction to the other. If, as it has been observed, it is undesirable that secondary education should take its form and character entirely from the University, it is in the opinion of the Council still more undesirable that its nature should be determined by the requirements of the public service. The University may as a corporate body be conservative and averse to change as change, but that pupils in secondary schools should in large numbers look forward to qualifying themselves for service under Government as the goal of their ambition and the reward of their labors is a serious political evil. The University has its proper function in regulating that system of secondary education which is the fittest preparation for a course of studies at college, and the Educational Department has to discharge the sacred trust of seeing that practical and technical education does not suffer by the preponderating influence of the University. The University and the Educational Department can best discharge their respective duties by keeping themselves aloof from the very delicate question of the public service. On the question of the public service, the fact of the Directorship of Public Instruction and the Commissionership for the Uncovenanted Civil Service Examinations being held by the same officer should not be allowed to have the most pernicious result of mixing up things which are best kept apart. The service of the State should be open to all alike according to their respective qualifications. A pupil who passes the proposed High School Examination is not necessarily superior to one who has passed the University Matriculation or First-in-Arts examinations, and it is most unjust and ungenerous to punish a student, who is actuated by the laudable desire of winning academical distinction, by disqualifying him for employment in the public service, unless he either passes the B.A. Degree Examination, or, failing that, goes down in the scale, and passes the new High School Examination.

12. Considerable emphasis has been laid on the recommendation of the High School Examination Committee that appointments on a salary of Rs. 250 and upwards should be reserved for the Graduates of the University, except in the cases in which a person in the subordinate ranks of the service has by exceptional merit and distinguished service rendered himself eligible for promotion without holding a degree. This is, in one point of view, undoubtedly a valuable concession; but in another point

of view, it is nothing more than a provision for enabling the State to obtain its money's worth from the servants it employs. Adverse as the views of the High School Committee are in regard to the lower University Examinations, it is a matter of some satisfaction that the possession of a University degree does count for something with them. But the boon conceded will be found on close examination to be small indeed. The number of appointments on a salary of Rs. 250 or upwards that are likely to become vacant in a year is very small as compared with the number of men that annually pass the B.A. Degree Examination. So the concession granted may benefit a few graduates, but a large majority will have to start life in the lower rounds of the official ladder, and take their chance of promotion with men of inferior culture, but, it may be, of greater influence and of a more ingratiating disposition.

13. On the question of recognition, the Council have, after a very careful consideration of the subject, and after holding consultation with persons whose educational position entitles their opinion to be received with respect, arrived at the conclusion that adherence to the terms of the fee notification should not be insisted on as a *sine qua non* for recognition. The Council approve of the action of the Educational Department in prescribing certain scales of fees for the schools and colleges that come under its purview. It is only fair that institutions which care to have the advantage of being aided by Government, or of being inspected by Government Educational Officers, should prove their fitness for enjoying such privilege by charging the prescribed rate of fees. But it is too late a day to go back to the system of protection in matters educational. If the system of protection had been resorted to twenty years ago, there would have been a reasonable suspicion that Government wished to favor their own schools at the expense of indigenous schools, but fortunately this danger has been completely warded off by the policy, since the days of the Education Commission, of handing over charge of High Schools to Municipalities, and Local Boards, public or private. Any hard and fast rules in regard to recognition can at present be only understood to indicate an inclination to favor the schools that exist against the schools that may spring into existence. The Council are not unaware of the mischief wrought by "adventure schools" as they have been called. But the mischief of stifling the growth of local independence, discouraging the action of local enterprise, and paralysing the efforts of indigenous agency, seems to them to be a far more serious matter. It should be remembered in this connection that there are many districts and portions of districts which owe their education to the agency of Christian Missionaries. The Council are duly grateful to the Missionary bodies for the philanthropic work that they have been doing, but surely this gratitude is not inconsistent with a desire that the people of Southern India should in a matter of such vital moment as the education of their children be able to shift for themselves. Let the school fee notification be enforced on such institutions as apply for any sort of aid or advice from Government; but why, in the name of simple justice and fairness, should schools and colleges that find their own funds and seek no assistance from the Educational Department be handicapped as it were in the race, and be made to appear less deserving of recognition and sympathy? It is at once the interest and the duty of Government to encourage the springing-up of institutions that are able to maintain themselves. Any injury to education worked by an "adventure school" can only be temporary. Free trade in education is not less trustworthy than free trade in commerce. It therefore appears to the Council that the conditions of recognition should be few and simple, and that the school-fee notification should cease to have any connection with recognition. Of course, every school that comes into existence should not by the mere fact of its existence be entitled to recognition. The question "what right have you to be" is a very proper question to put in the case of schools and colleges. Every school that deserves to be recognised by the Educational Department should fulfil the necessary conditions as regards accommodation, sanitation, and tutorial staff. These conditions being fulfilled, it is clearly not the interest of the Educational Department to insist on the school-fee notification being conformed to, except it is an object with the Department that schools conducted by Christian Missionaries should be strengthened and countenanced to such an extent as to extinguish indigenous schools. The Council have not the remotest suspicion that the Educational Department has any such object in

view, but the action of the Department of recent years has been such as to justify such a suspicion, except in the minds of those who have been able to find out the true cause, viz., a desire to leave no educational agency in the country uncontrolled. The Council would urge upon the attention of Government the necessity and the desirability of legislating in a simple and unambiguous way as regards the conditions of recognition. The school-fee notification may undergo modifications in the future, as it has almost quinquennially done in the past. The interests of education, and more particularly of a national and indigenous system of education, require that there should be permanence and fixity in regard to the conditions of recognition, and such permanence and fixity can only be secured by means of a legislative enactment which would authoritatively decide what classes of schools deserve to be recognized by the Educational Department, and what do not deserve to be recognised. The Council make this recommendation notwithstanding the fact of their being opposed to the multiplication of laws, because they are convinced of the imperative necessity for such legislation.

14. The Council are also of opinion that if the High School Examination is to be directly connected with the public service, and if the conditions of recognition remain as at present, candidates from all schools, recognised or unrecognised, should be eligible for admission to the examination; and that the fee charged for such admission should be the same for all schools. They urge this change, not out of a desire to secure mere theoretical equality, but because in practice the way in which schools have been denied recognition has been somewhat capricious and arbitrary. Should, however, the conditions of recognition be simplified and minimized in difficulty, and made fixed by suitable legislation, so as to guard against arbitrary and tyrannical action on the part of inspecting officers, the Council would go far beyond charging a differential rate of fee. They hold that in the long run, it would be a sound and wise policy to keep out altogether candidates from unrecognised schools. A school either deserves or does not deserve recognition. If it does not deserve recognition, it is palpably absurd to allow its pupils to appear for examination, no matter what fee they pay. The Educational Department may rightly refuse grant-in-aid to a school which does not obey the fee notification, but the Council are at a loss to see the justice of the department refusing recognition to such a school for the purpose of sending in candidates to a public examination. In this connection, the Council would entreat Government to clear up once for all by an authoritative decision the uncertainty and the irregularity incidental to so important a matter as recognition being allowed to remain undefined, except in the manner in which the Director of Public Instruction chooses to interpret it from time to time.

15. Para. 7 of the notification in the report of the High School Committee concludes with the words "and if a native, the vernacular chosen must be his own vernacular, unless he is specially permitted to substitute for it another South Indian vernacular." With reference to this recommendation of the Committee, the Council cannot help observing that the restriction imposed seems to them unwise and uncalled for. It is uncalled for inasmuch as either from the public service or even from an educational point of view, all that is absolutely necessary is that the candidate should bring up a second language, and it is a matter of little consequence whether that language is Tamil or Telugu, Kanarese or Malayalam. But there is a far more serious objection than this. There are numerous cases in which it is really not easy to decide which is a pupil's vernacular language. There are also cases of Tamil parents living in the northern districts, and teaching Telugu to their children; and of Telugu parents living in the southern districts, making Tamil the vernacular of their children. As regards the public service, it is a distinct advantage that a candidate should bring up a language other than his own vernacular, as thereby a knowledge of two languages is secured. The only point of view in which the restriction suggested by the Committee seems desirable is that if it is insisted on that a candidate must bring up his own vernacular, he is likely to know that language better than any other. Nobody acquainted with the state of vernacular education in the country will seriously maintain that Indian youths study their own vernacular better than they study either English or any other vernacular. Moreover the Dravidian languages are so intimately

connected in vocabulary, structure, idiom and literary forms as to make it possible for any vernacular to be studied with no greater labor than any other.

16. The foregoing remarks are made on the supposition that the proposed High School Examination will, in its present form, receive the sanction of Government. The same supposition is involved in the remarks that follow on the proposal that the candidates for the High School Examination should undergo a *viva voce* examination. If argument were needed to show that the requirements of the public service have been suffered to cast a baleful shadow on the High School Examination, which should essentially be an alternative to the Matriculation Examination, the institution of the *viva voce* examination would of itself be sufficient. A scheme that the University, with the comparatively small number of candidates for the B.A. Degree Examination, has renounced as impracticable, is revived, and declared feasible. What can such a declaration mean except that University methods have been a sad failure? If the advocates of the High School Examination sincerely think that the *viva voce* test can be conducted in an *efficient* and *equitable* manner, the Council can only say that the age of miracles is not yet gone, and that there is a sovereign virtue in official machinery which no non-official body can hope to attain. The Council feel fully convinced that this *viva voce* test will be either a farce, or a fiery ordeal; and that in either case it can serve no useful purpose in regard to the development of practical education. It would almost appear as if a method that had been renounced by the University was resuscitated with the deliberate purpose of driving the University out of the field of competition.

17. A minor modification that the Council would suggest in the curriculum is the omission of European History. The Council make this suggestion, not because they are wanting in a due appreciation of the value of the political lessons to be learnt from a proper study of European History, but because they know that at this stage of education, history means little more than committing to memory the most important facts and dates. Studied in this unsatisfactory way, two histories are no better than one. They are, therefore, of opinion that one history is quite enough for the West and one for the East. In regard to Indian History, the "rise of the British Empire in the East" is a very indefinite description. The "rise" may easily be made to include much more than the "rise," and the growth is far more important than the rise. They would therefore propose that, as a compensation for removing European History, the History of the British Empire in the East be prescribed.

18. There is but one subject more on which the Council wish to express an opinion, and that is the desirability or otherwise of retaining the present Middle School examination as a test either for admission to the public service, or for promotion to the High School classes. In regard to its being retained as a test for admission to the public service, the Council may content themselves with observing that its knell has been rung by the High School Committee itself. That committee consider even the present Matriculation examination unfit. The Council will, therefore, confine their attention to the other point of view. In this connection, the Council are anxious to state their strong conviction that the action of the Educational Department during the last fifteen years has been such as to produce the most detrimental results. It is in the ordinary course of nature that every department should establish its *raison d'être*. The Government Education Department strives to prove the necessity for its being by multiplying examinations *ad libitum*, and by endeavouring to make its influence felt over as wide an area as possible. Different individuals may be successive Directors of Public Instruction, but the policy remains the same. The form, of course, is different, but the ultimate effect is to reduce all education to one narrow type, and to invent a very bed of Procrustes to the great detriment of that freedom and elasticity which are so essential in all education. The country stands sadly in need of rest in matters educational. The Council cordially support a change in the direction of practical education, but with regard to literary and scientific education, they would urge as strongly as they may that existing methods are enough. These methods need to be developed without much outside interference. A new examination covering exactly the same ground as the existing examinations, and having at the apex of the pyramid a small modicum of technical knowledge, will, without in any beneficial way affecting

secondary education, simply add to the number of educational torments that have of late years had so depressing and injurious an influence on sound education. On the question whether the Middle School Examination should be retained as a test for promotion to High School classes, the Council need say no more than that it has been such only in theory, and that the managers and head masters of schools have never had any difficulty in promoting to the Vth class pupils that the Middle School Examiners had declared unfit for promotion. An examination that decides nothing is worse than useless. A school examination of this kind to serve any useful purpose should be confined to a limited area. The Council can understand the need for a Comparative Examination of the Upper IVth Classes being held in each inspectorate, but a Middle School Examination for the whole Presidency is useless and positively injurious—useless as a test for admission to the public service, and injurious as a test of promotion from class to class.

19. The Council have already urged on Government the justice and the utility of recognising all suitable examinations, University or Departmental, to qualify more or less for admission to the public service. They have also dwelt upon the necessity for all such tests being of set purpose left incomplete as public service tests, and for the qualification being completed by passing Special Tests conducted by Government through the agency of the Commissioner for the U. C. S. Examinations. There is one great advantage belonging to this method that the Council would press on the earnest attention of Government. If at any future time, it should be found that the number of men qualifying themselves for entering the public service was far in excess of the demand [and Matriculation and First-in-Arts men have been, even under existing circumstances, described to be a drug in the market], the number of passes in the final examination for completing the qualification, which would be the public service test proper, might be regulated according to the demand, either by the standard of that examination being raised, or by the examination being made competitive, and only a certain select number being chosen every year, and the rest being declared to have failed. This view of the question seems to the Council to deserve careful consideration.

20. The views expressed, the conclusions arrived at, and the prayers contained in the foregoing paragraphs may be briefly summed up in conclusion as follows:—

- (1) That no public examination under the control and management of the University or the Educational Department should exclusively, directly, and completely qualify for admission to the public service.
- (2) That the lower University Examinations, viz., the Matriculation and First-in-Arts Examinations, should not cease to qualify for admission to the public service as tests of general education.
- (3) That if the proposed High School Examination is to come into force, subjects like *précis*-writing, official correspondence, and translating an official paper, should be removed from the curriculum, and should be made the subjects of a Special Test Examination conducted by the Commissioner for the U. C. S. Examinations.
- (4) That an enhancement of the standard of the Matriculation Examination is necessary, not only in the interests of the public service, but in the interests of collegiate education.
- (5) That candidates for the Special Test Examinations in official and technical subjects should, in case they have passed the University Matriculation Examination, be required to produce a certificate of having studied these subjects in a suitable institution for a period of at least six months.
- (6) That the term "recognition" be defined by Government.
- (7) That the Middle School Examination be no longer retained either as a test for admission to the public service, or as a test for regulating promotion from class to class.

From H. B. GRIGG, Esq., Director of Public Instruction, Madras, to the Chief Secretary to Government, dated Madras, 14th February 1889, No. 1242.

I have the honor to reply to Government Orders, Educational, No. 401, dated 11th July 1888, and No. 556, dated 22nd September 1888.

Among the questions raised by the report of the Committee on the High School scheme, which the Government declared in their former Order would demand "the closest examination and most careful decision," were (1) "the retention as a condition of entrance into the public service, temporarily or otherwise," of the Matriculation examination; (2) the retention of the Middle School examination for the same purpose; (3) the need of the further maintenance of the Middle School examination; and (4) the system of recognition of schools by the department to the disadvantage of unrecognised schools. Ample opportunity has now been given for the discussion of these questions by all interested in education. I have sought the opinions of the Inspectors, of the Principals of Government Colleges, and of the Managers of Colleges and High Schools; and have been favored with the opinions of the representatives of some forty institutions. The most noteworthy of these I give as an appendix to this letter. The opinions, however, relate mainly to questions (2), (3), and (4). The University has also expressed by a large majority an opinion adverse to the High School examination scheme in its present form; and also to associating any examination for technical or general education with the public service. I shall probably submit my views on the resolution of the Senate in a separate communication, and shall not, therefore, discuss in this letter the objections which have been raised to the draft notification of the High School examination.

I proceed to remark in the order noted above on the questions to which the Government have drawn especial attention.

2. The retention of the Matriculation examination is discussed in paragraphs 18 and 20 of the High School Committee's

Report. The Committee recommended its Retention of the Matriculation examination. exclusion on two grounds, (a) that the State should, unless certain specified conditions are fulfilled by other public examinations, retain within its own control examinations which qualify for admission to its service; (b) that the Matriculation examination, as it now stands, is not a suitable test. As regards the first point, there has been great diversity of opinion; the opinion of the majority of educationists, however, appears to be that the State, as represented by the Commissioner for the U.C.S. Examinations, should not conduct "general" test examinations, but that the regulation of such examinations should be left to the indirect agency of the University, and to the direct agency of the Education Department. As regards the second point, there is, I think, a general consensus of opinion that the examination, as it now stands, is quite unfit to be accepted as a suitable test of general education of the standard it professes to test. My opinion will be found in my minute of dissent on para. 21 of the High School Committee's Report. As things now stand, assuming that the Government will adhere to their Order, No. 401, dated 11th July 1888, determining to establish a High School examination, I would strongly advise them to state definitely that they will not accept the Matriculation examination in its present form at all, after the close of 1891 or 1892; but that they will be prepared to consider the propriety of retaining it as a general test for admission to their service, either wholly or in part, after the Senate has decided on the changes which shall be made in the subjects, scope, and standard of the examination. This determination will strengthen the hands of those members of the Senate, who are anxious to make this examination fulfil its proper office, which is not, and ought not to be, mainly a *leaving* examination, that is, a *terminus ad quem* for secondary education, but an *entrance* examination to a higher course in letters and in science. No one can be more anxious than I am to see higher literary culture strike deeper root and become a greater reality in the land, and regarding the question from the point of view of the University, I believe that higher literary and scientific culture, as represented by the University, would gain by the total and permanent exclusion of the Entrance examination from the list of examinations qualifying for admission to the public service, because I feel sure that, whilst it has the public service as one of its chief objects, it will necessarily fall short of its true end and object, viz., the due preparation for beginning a University course. The minds of lads will be unduly directed to a standard and kind of knowledge which is most suitable for those ending their education at this stage; but in some respects unsuitable for those who intend seeking

higher knowledge in language, in literature, in science, and in law. To give an example, it is of the first importance that a young man seeking service as a clerk should be good at arithmetic and in hand-writing; but these qualifications are of minor importance as regards higher education, and are often conspicuously absent in young men of high intellectual capabilities. But the question cannot be dealt with solely in the interests of the University. The wishes of those engaged in secondary education should, however, be favorably considered so far as this can be done without seriously injuring higher education. The course of action which I advise will, I submit, do this effectually, for, by encouraging the University to revise this examination, those managers who wish to work up to the Entrance examination, but who are dissatisfied with that examination, will have the opportunity which they so rightly and wisely seek of extending the course of secondary education leading to the University by one year, and of thus placing it on a level with the standard of the High School examination as regards the *quality*, though not as regards the *scope*, of the knowledge tested. The great benefit, however, that will accrue, from the partial acceptance by Government for its service of a pass in the Entrance examination, to those interested in secondary education, is that lads reading for the University, should in circumstances require them to change their course of education, will have the full benefit of such knowledge as they may have acquired, e.g., knowledge of language, which is as useful for the University course as for Government or Commercial service. The time during which I propose to retain the Entrance examination as a test for Government service should amply suffice for the University to make such arrangements as it may consider necessary for the improvement of the examination. Subsequently, the Director might be aided by a representative committee in advising the Government how far the revised Matriculation examination may be accepted for its service.

3. Before remarking on the second question, I think it desirable that the Government should be reminded of the Brief Sketch of the Middle School examination. chief facts connected with the history of this examination. The following is a brief historical sketch of the Middle School examination:—

So far back as the year 1869, Government contemplated the establishment of a public examination for middle schools. In G.O., No. 174, dated 17th May 1869, Government called upon the Director of Public Instruction to report upon the expediency of establishing a system of scholarships for middle class schools to be determined by means of an examination conducted by the Educational Department. The establishment of such an examination, they considered, would not only be a means of testing and stimulating the progress of middle schools, but would also enable Government and the public to judge of the comparative merits of these schools. The scheme proposed was somehow not given effect to that year, nor was the question taken up till in October 1875, when Colonel Macdonald, the then Director of Public Instruction, brought before the Syndicate of the Madras University a proposal to institute an examination for middle class schools on the model of the local examinations of Oxford and Cambridge. The following were some of the reasons which he adduced for the necessity for establishing such an examination:—(1) the staff of inspecting officers was not sufficient to examine thoroughly and efficiently all the middle schools; the work was done very imperfectly, and several schools were not even visited by the inspecting officers; (2) the examination, if instituted, would be a fit substitute for a number of examinations * more or less of the same standard, which he considered unnecessary; (3) the middle class examination, as it was then called, would test adequately the fitness of a candidate to enter the preparatory matriculation class of a Government or aided school; (4) a scheme of scholarships might be established in connection with this examination; (5) the institution of such an examination would greatly reduce the

- * (1) Uncovenanted Civil Service, English and Anglo-Vernacular branches.
- (2) Teachers' Certificate examination, Fourth Grade.
- (3) Medical College, Second Department, Entrance examination; also examination for hospital apprentices.
- (4) Civil Engineering College, Second Department, Entrance examination.

cost of normal schools training pupils for the IVth standard, as the work of such schools would be confined to training men for teachers.

The question of establishing a middle class examination was discussed at two meetings of the Senate, but the proposal was rejected by eleven votes to eight. Colonel Macdonald then came to the conclusion that such an examination might be worked without the aid of the University. In the meantime, the Committee assembled under the order of the Government of India of 3rd July 1875 to propose revised forms for the submission of statistical returns also recommended strongly the establishment of such an examination. Their resolution embodying this recommendation runs as follows:—

"In every province standards of examination shall be fixed, corresponding with the above grades or divisions of schools. These shall be called the Middle School examination, the Primary School examination, and the Lower Primary School examination. The Middle School examination shall qualify for admission to a High School, the Primary School examination for admission to a Middle school, and the Lower Primary School examination for admission to the upper division of a Primary school).

The object of the Committee was clear. They aimed at introducing into the educational system throughout the country somewhat uniform standards, and these standards, they considered, it would be impossible to reach unless there was a uniform system of examinations for testing pupils at each definite stage of instruction. In the rules the Committee framed for the preparation of statistical returns, the definition of a middle school runs as follows:—"Middle schools shall include pupils who have passed the Upper Primary School examination, and are reading for an examination to be styled the Middle School examination." In fact, the standard of a middle school was to be determined by a Middle School examination.

It was, however, only in 1877 that the proposal to institute such an examination for middle schools came up definitely before Government. Colonel Macdonald, in the month of April (*vide* his letter, No. 1716, dated 20th April 1877, embodied in G.O., No. 242, dated 9th June 1877), submitted a draft notification embodying the details of the scheme. He proposed that the examination should be thrown open to girls as well as to boys, and that the standard should correspond with that of the Upper IVth class of a Government or aided school. He also suggested certain alternative subjects, such as Physical Geography and Physiology or Hygiene being substituted, instead of Vernacular, Euclid and Algebra. Government, in their order referred to above approved of the principles of the examination, and believed that the "system would conduce to public convenience;" but they considered that the University should co-operate in the scheme; for they remarked, "it would be a matter of regret to the Government if the University should not take, as in England, the most prominent part of the conduct of such an examination."

The question, therefore, came up again before the Senate, but the proposal was rejected this time also. The Senate remarked that they had "to deal only with examinations which are avowedly part of or preliminary (as Matriculation) to a University course, but cannot undertake examinations to test the progress of teaching at a more immature stage of study, and which are not undergone as a preliminary to a University course." The opposition of the Senate to the introduction of the examination seems to have been strong, for the Vice-Chancellor, the Hon'ble Mr. Justice Innes, writing to Government, said that, "many members of the Senate of considerable experience in education objected to it, on the ground that its probable effect upon real sound teaching would be injurious." Colonel Macdonald, in August 1877, brought the subject again before Government, and asked for sanction to introduce the examination in the form originally proposed, but Government declined to move in the matter then. (*Vide* G.O., 23rd August 1877, No. 323.)

At the beginning of 1879 he once more brought up the scheme before Government with reference to the resolutions of the Simla Conference referred to already. He suggested that the Middle School examination might take the place of the general test, and be placed under the Commissioner for the Uncovenanted Civil Service Examinations, as the latter test had failed to serve the ends for which it was instituted.

He also recommended that this examination should be considered a service test for appointments of Rs. 15 and upwards, but not exceeding Rs. 30. Government were disposed to allow the Middle School examination to supersede the general test, but final orders were not passed till September 1879.*

* *Vide* G.O., dated 24th September 1879, No. 364. The Middle School examination was held, for the first time, in January 1880, under Government Notification of

17th October 1879. For this examination, 1,769 male and 9 female candidates appeared, of whom 1,050 and 8 passed, respectively. There was a second examination held that year in December, and since then eight examinations have been held, one in each year. The following are the numbers that have appeared and passed annually at the Middle School examination since it was first instituted:—

Year.	Number examined.		Number passed.	
	Males.	Females.	Males.	Females.
1880	1,769	9	1,050	8
1881	6,089	174	3,126	68
1882	6,645	245	2,484	104
1883	6,832	200	4,265	157
1884	7,780	275	3,771	188
1885	8,082	276	4,704	191
1886	7,564	324	2,551	89
1887	7,724	458	3,716	281
1888	8,244	469	3,623	265
1889	9,214	423	4,304	287

The Middle School examination scheme has undergone several changes since its institution in 1879. In July 1880, Latin and Sanskrit were added to the list of optional subjects.† The very same year

a vigorous protest was sent by the Missionary Education Committee against the examination. They stated that there was no public test necessary in the case of the middle departments of high schools, and that heads of institutions were the proper persons to test the fitness of candidates for promotion from the middle to the high school department. They also proposed, in case the examination was retained, certain changes in the scheme, as, for example, the lowering of the standard in some subjects. Colonel Macdonald, in replying to the protest, showed clearly the absolute necessity for retaining the examination, and the Government, in their order,‡ expressed their agreement with the Director throughout.

† G.O., No. 298, dated 7th August 1880, embodying Colonel Macdonald's letter, No. 174, dated 27th April 1880.

‡ G.O., No. 212, dated 29th June 1881.

In June 1881, Tamil, Telugu, &c., were made compulsory, and Huxley's Introduction to Science was substituted for Hygiene.§

In 1882, the following additional changes were introduced: (1) the number of branches to be brought up was reduced; (2) provision was made for bringing up extra branches, *e.g.*, Astronomy and Botany; (3) greater prominence was given to Vernacular exercises and to translation; (4) an intermediate class of passed candidates was also introduced.||

¶ G.O., No. 221, dated 18th August 1882. The first change was made to promote greater thoroughness in instruction in Language, Mathematics,

History and Geography, while the second was introduced with the object of encouraging the study of special subjects. As Vernacular translation and Vernacular composition were more or less neglected in all English schools, the third was intended to remedy this defect, and the last was introduced to utilise the examination for purposes of class promotion. No changes of importance were made during the year 1883-84 in the scheme of the examination; but in July 1884, Needle-work and Drawing were

added to the optional subjects, and French and German were included among the second or optional languages in view of the introduction of these languages into the Matriculation examination.* But the

* G.O., No. 404, dated 22nd July 1884.

found desirable that the education of the youth of the country should be diverted into

† *Vide* my letter of 27th December 1884, No. 9000, recorded in G.O., 23rd January 1885, No. 54, Educational.

that were added to the scheme :—Geology, electricity and magnetism, music, modelling and wood-engraving, domestic economy, carpentry, ironsmiths' work, jeweller and silversmiths' work, printing, tailoring, boot and shoe making, industrial needle-work, telegraphy; and the following commercial branches were added subsequently :—Short-hand, book-keeping, mercantile arithmetic, commercial correspondence, commercial geography, fire, life and marine insurance, and advanced spelling and superior penmanship. These important changes were framed in harmony with my proposal for the higher examinations in science, arts and industries, introduced subsequently on 31st March 1886, under the new scheme for the development of technical education, as they enabled pupils, more especially those in technical institutions, to lay the foundation for a practical education at an early stage of their career. In September 1886, lace-making, weaving and rattan-work were also

‡ G.O., No. 583, dated 10th September 1886.

education is clearly seen from the readiness with which schools have adapted themselves to the practical side of the scheme. In the report of the Commissioner for the U.C.S. Examinations for the year 1886-87, he remarks: "The Middle School examination scheme provides for the examination of candidates in certain branches of science, art, industry, and commerce, and although the knowledge intended to be tested at this early stage is necessarily of a very elementary character, it is of no little value even if the pupil does not proceed beyond this stage, and of great value if he does. One hundred and ninety-four candidates appeared in art and industrial subjects, which were first added to the list of subjects in the notification in 1885; and the number of passes is, on the whole, satisfactory, especially when it is borne in mind that one or two of these subjects were added to the list only a year before the examination. For, in estimating the extent of the movement which has begun in the direction of a more practical education, it must not be forgotten that the middle school test is the final examination for courses of instruction extending, in most subjects, over three and four years." The following statement gives the number of candidates that have appeared for the Middle School examination in the various special subjects, and is also a sufficient gauge of the influence of the examination in the promotion of special and technical education :—

Optional Subjects (Special and Technical).	Appeared in 1886-87.	Appeared in 1887-88.	Appeared in 1888-89.
Physical Geography	293	319	262
Physiology	82	41	38
Agriculture	3	3	7
Botany	2	2	1
Industrial Needle-work	..	4	9
Drawing	27	76	69
Needle-work	181	254	270
Silversmith's work	..	3	..
Modelling	5	2	4
Wood-engraving	2	..	2
Printing	3	1	4
Book-keeping	1	31	48
Political Economy	4	26	4
Domestic Economy	74	98	108

Optional Subjects (Special and Technical).	Appeared in 1886-87.	Appeared in 1887-88.	Appeared in 1888-89.
Music	10	18	10
Commercial Arithmetic	44	110	73
Do. Correspondence	70	87	93
Phonography	36	17	17
Carpentry	1	8	6
Astronomy	1	..	1
Lace-making	..	14	3
Weaving	..	6	4
Tailoring	..	5	5
Rattan-work	..	1	..
Boot and Shoe making	..	1	1
Telegraphy	..	..	2
Electricity and Magnetism	..	..	2
Geology	..	..	16
Mensuration	..	..	4
Blacksmith's work	..	..	5
Total	839	1,027	1,068

4. Such is briefly the history of the examination, and it will help, I trust, to the formation of a sound opinion on question (2) as well as on question (3). I am in this paragraph concerned with the former question only. The views of the High School Committee are given in paragraph 19 of their report. If I were about to propose that the examination should continue on its present lines, I would still adhere to the views I have therein expressed; but as I contemplate considerable changes in some portions of the scheme, I would advise the Government to retain the 1st class for admission to their service on salaries of Rs. 15 and upwards so long as the entrance examination, as it now stands, is retained; or until the scheme of the examination has been recast. I would further recommend that a pass in this examination be always retained as qualifying for admission to the public service in grades to which the primary examination just established admits. This course is most desirable, if due encouragement is to be given by the State to secondary education in the vernacular, for which the Middle School examination now provides on its vernacular side. For it goes without saying that for a considerable portion of the people an efficient system of vernacular education cannot stop at so low a point as the IVth standard, *i.e.*, at the 10th or 11th year of a child's life, but should be carried on to a stage represented by the VIIth standard, *i.e.*, to the 13th or 14th year. This condition is also necessary in the interests of the inferior Government service, more especially the Revenue and Educational, because, as the Government are aware, *curmams* and similar officials will require a higher standard of general knowledge, especially as regards arithmetic, to pass the special tests which will gradually be laid down for them as supplementary to the primary examination. Again, primary teachers of the higher grade, *i.e.*, teachers who are of a standard capable of teaching the IVth standard, must have passed the VIIth standard at least in the Vernacular to make them efficient teachers. These teachers will be required as servants by Boards in hundreds, perhaps in thousands, and will also be required by Government for their own primary schools. There are other branches of the Government service, such as compounders in the Medical Branch, attenders in the Courts, copyists, for which this standard of knowledge would be very desirable. Consequently, it seems to me clearly in the interests of the State that the examination, as it may hereafter stand, should be retained as a public service test, supplementing the *Primary*, not the High School examination. The existence of such an advanced lower service test will, I am sure, have a beneficial and wholesome effect, and will help to bridge over the great gulf of 6 or 7 years between the Primary and High School examinations, in a way which will especially strengthen the course of elementary education as contrasted with that of higher education. This state of things will be in accordance with what I believe to be the policy of Government, *viz.*, the advancement in general knowledge of the

great mass of the population. In this connection, I cannot refrain from quoting the following weighty remarks from Dr. Duncan's letter :—

"I fully admit that the desire to pass a public examination is not the ideally highest and purest motive for either pupil or teacher. But it is a dictate of prudence to do the best one can with lower motives when the higher are inoperative. Now there can, I think, be no question that without the guidance and stimulus of public examinations, education would not have made the progress it has done in India. Equally clear it is to my mind that we are yet a long way from the time when we can in this country dispense with these inferior motives and helps."

5. To decide about the further maintenance of the Middle School examination,

The need of the further maintenance of the Middle School examination.

it is necessary to ascertain precisely and exactly what service to education this examination is performing, whether that service is one which can or cannot with

advantage to education be dispensed with, and, lastly, whether such service, as is ascertained to be indispensable, can be better performed by any modifications in the present scheme. The service the examination performs may be regarded as follows :—

- (1) as a test for admission to the public service;
- (2) as a test marking a final and intermediate stage in secondary education;
- (3) as a means of promoting and gauging technical education;
- (4) as a test for admission to the junior departments of the Medical, Engineering and Agricultural Colleges;
- (5) as a test for primary teachers of the higher grade;
- (6) as a test in special qualifications for technical teachers, receiving grants under the Code;
- (7) as a means of class promotion;
- (8) as a test affording relief to inspecting officers.

(1) I have already in the preceding paragraph dealt generally with this question;

As a test for admission to the public service. but I would add here that besides service in connection with general education, as connected with the public service, this examination will afford the means of examining public servants in an advanced stage in the special subjects of the primary examination, *e.g.*, Drawing, Hygiene, Agriculture and Mensuration. In this respect, it will do work which no other examination does, and this function cannot be dispensed with without the loss of a stimulus to increased efficiency on the part of Government servants in special knowledge. It will achieve what the provision in the high school notification relating to self-improvement is calculated to achieve, but in a lower sphere.

(2) The examination has, it seems to me, been performing a very useful service

As a test marking a final and also an intermediate stage in secondary education. I have already pointed out in paragraph 4 that this was one of the chief reasons for the

Government of India recommending the institution of such an examination in each of the great provinces. The experience of most of the great educational authorities is also in favor of a public examination of some description to serve the purpose of a *terminus ad quem* for students whose circumstances in life demand that they should stop their regular course of school instruction at the earliest age at which intellectual qualities as opposed to manual become valuable from a commercial point of view, *i.e.*, speaking generally at the threshold of adolescence. The junior local examinations held by the authorities of the Universities of Cambridge and Oxford and other British Universities were, I believe, mainly intended to meet the wants of the public in this respect. Examinations for a similar purpose are held at public institutions in Germany by representatives of the State and of the Universities. In Scotland, quite recently, the Committee of Council on Education have, with the concurrence of some of the Universities and at the express desire of "those who are responsible for some of the largest and most prosperous higher class schools" in that country, instituted an examination for granting "certificates of two grades, the first or higher grade aiming

at the standard maintained in the senior local examination of the Universities, or the examination preparatory to the three-year course; and the second or lower grade corresponding as nearly as possible with the junior local examination." Here is Scotland now introducing a system which is, in some respects, precisely what this Government has in part organised for several years past, and which is in part what I have now advised the Government to adopt in instituting the High School examination, although, to make the comparison complete, the University should accept the High School examination certificates as well as the Government. One of the reasons for the institution of these examinations is expressly stated by their Lordships to be that "the school authorities declare that the absence of any definite reward or aim set before the peoples, deprives the present inspection of some of its reality and of the stimulating influence which it might otherwise exercise." They remark elsewhere that "the lower grade would, they believe, be a satisfactory proof that the pupil had made good use of such restricted time as he had spent in a Secondary school, and might be accepted as a qualification for entering with advantage upon certain careers in life." In this connection, the following observations of Dr. Duncan deserve notice :

"The interests of Middle Schools proper and of pupils whose schooling ceases, when they have gone through the upper IVth class, should also be considered. It is too much the fashion to look upon Middle Schools and Classes merely as stages on the way to the High School and the College. For pupils who cannot hope to enter a High School and for Middle Schools proper, it is expedient that there should be such a public test of efficiency as the Middle School examination affords."

I would also draw the careful attention of Government to the following remarks of Mr. Marsden, Inspector of the Western Circle :—

"A third and most important purpose served by the examination is, that it is a final test for the large number of Middle Schools in the country not connected with High Schools. For example, in this district there is a large and flourishing Middle School at each of the five taluk head-quarters, while there are no High Schools out of the Town of Mangalore, the capital. In Mangalore itself there are several large Middle Schools not directly connected with any High School. To all these institutions the Middle School examination is very valuable. It is held at the end of the school-year. The examiners are appointed by Government, and being quite unconnected with the district, cannot be suspected of any partiality. They are paid for their work, and are therefore bound to do it well. Careful criticism may, indeed, show that the valuation of the papers has not been in every case absolutely perfect, that the results vary somewhat unaccountably from year to year, and that the standard held in view by different Examiners is not always the same; but, for all that, the masters and managers of these schools have confidence in the examination, and prefer it to any other that could be held. If it be abolished, what is to take its place? A comparative examination by unpaid Examiners is, for many reasons, unsatisfactory. Little, if any, confidence would be reposed in an examination of this sort. After the re-organization, Assistant and Deputy Inspectors are to examine the Middle Schools, but these officers will take the schools in turn; some will be examined at the beginning, some in the middle, and some at the end of the school-year. For obvious reasons, the final examination ought not to be left to the head master, and yet if the Middle School examination be abolished, who else is to do it?"

"For many years to come, the highest school in a taluk and in many a large town must be a Middle School. The development of such an institution into a High School would involve the employment of three more teachers corresponding to the three years of a High School course, one or more of these teachers being a graduate, and the considerable additional expense which would be necessary a great number of these schools are not at present prepared to meet. If the Middle School examination be abolished, it is to be feared that some, probably many, of them will gradually decline to the primary standard, the richer or more promising boys going to large High Schools in towns and the others stopping short at the new Upper Primary examination, which is to qualify for the lower grades of Government service.

"In the interests, therefore, of all these schools, which look to the Middle School examination as their final test, I would earnestly deprecate the abolition of this examination."

In the replies which I have received, the opinion regarding the retention of the examination is about equally divided for and against; but in all, save a very few cases, the adverse opinion is based on the inexpediency of having two Government examinations qualifying for superior Government service, and of instituting a public examination for purposes of class promotion. These arguments do not, in the least, apply

to the retention of the examination as a final test of middle education, the certificates of which will, at all events, prove of some service to young people going out to work for their living. To deprive this very large class, numbering some two thousand annually, of some such testimony as regards their educational attainments is to inflict on them a serious injury,—an injury which is not, and cannot be, fully and duly appreciated by those who are engaged in higher education, whose vision is apt to be dimmed by the glamour of the University in regard to meaner educational matters, and the humbler ambitions of the great mass of the rising generation.

The usefulness of this test as a final examination is most prominently noticed in regard to girls' schools, for which it is, and must be for many years to come, the goal of the educational race. When it is remembered that over 1,600 girls have qualified for this test since it was first instituted, that throughout the Presidency a large number of girls' schools have been organized with the sole object of meeting the requirements of this examination, and that the numbers appearing for it in almost each successive year have been increasing, it will be seen clearly that the middle school test has become part and parcel of the educational machinery of Southern India. The great service, therefore, it has rendered to the cause of secondary female education cannot be overestimated. Mr. Margoschis, a capable and experienced educationist, connected with the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel, puts this point very forcibly:

"The retention of the Middle School examination is of vital interest to the cause of female education. The standard of education amongst girls is much lower than that amongst boys, and there are many and various difficulties, which prevent mushroom growth in the education of females in India. Nor, indeed, is such a course desirable were it possible. Many girls have to be content with the Special Upper Primary examination, and especially Hindus and Muhammadans. A few more, with great difficulty, go on for the Middle School examination, and their number is gradually increasing. The abolition of the latter examination, at this juncture, would give a decisive blow to female education, and would be a great discouragement to the teachers and the taught. Girls who read for Matriculation are also better prepared in every way by having previously passed the Middle School examination. It is an important link in the chain, and I earnestly hope, in the cause of female education in this Presidency, that it will be retained."

I endorse every word in the above extract. Mr. Margoschis's views are shared by many others engaged in female education. I would also draw the attention of Government to a momentous fact, which has been ignored or forgotten by many, if not every person consulted, viz., that the examination corresponds to the VIIth Standard under the Results System, Chapter III of the Code. The whole Results System works up to this examination as its end; in fact, the examination is part and parcel of that scheme. Consequently, if the examination is abolished, another examination would have to be devised for the VIIth Standard, for to dispense with a VIIth or final standard, would be to make the Results scheme a body without a head, and render it abortive and a mockery. The examination, as it now stands, was framed with especial reference to the subsidiary standards and as an essential part of the Results System, which, after all, represents the Vernacular side of education. It is serving its purpose well, more especially as regards girls' schools. I do not say that it cannot be modified with advantage, but I do say that whatever modifications it may undergo, the first and foremost consideration must be its relation to the subsidiary results standards.

(b) As marking an intermediate stage in school-life, the examination also serves a useful purpose. This purpose has been objected to on the ground that public examinations for class promotion are objectionable; but the objectors forget that this is the principle on which the Matriculation and the F.A. examinations have been worked. It is true that the check on the upward movement is applied lower down in the child's life; but if this check is applied with due consideration to the needs of children of the age concerned, it cannot be objected to on any sound principle. It is also true that the less strain and publicity there is about a test of the kind at this comparatively early age, the better; but unfortunately in this country the conditions of management of many institutions

render it impossible or unadvisable that the test should be applied internally instead of externally. Moreover, if the test is made so elastic as to impose the least possible restraint on the individuality of schools, the evil complained of will disappear altogether, although it must be admitted that the Middle School examination, even as it is, though sufficiently definite and testing in character, imposes few regulations that fetter the freedom of schools. Again, the advantage which institutions under imperfect management derive from such an examination is admitted on all hands. But the managers of great institutions, who believe, and believe, I think, in many cases, rightly, that they can do without this assistance, are not content with the liberty that has been accorded to them,—of dispensing with the examination, but would abolish it because,—forsooth, their pupils demand that they should be sent up for it, and thus compel them to make use of the examination against their will. To yield to the demand of the managers in such cases seems to me to involve the sacrifice of the interests of the weaker institutions for the benefit of the stronger. Moreover, when the examination ceases to be a test for superior Government service, the pressure of pupils on managers will be relaxed, so that we may safely infer that no manager will send in pupils for the examination, unless he finds the doing so to the interest of his institution. This is as it should be. The examination should be purely voluntary, so far as high schools working for the University are concerned, but those schools which elect to regulate their promotions from the lower to the upper secondary department by it, should be entitled to certain definite privileges as against those who utilize the examination simply for individual pupils. I would note here that the objection brought against the examination as a regulator of class promotion is hardly correct, for it is not really a class examination, as pointed out by Dr. Duncan and several others, but as much a departmental examination as the Matriculation or the F.A. examination.

Looking at the examination in this connection, I would observe that it tends to check excessive crowding in the highest class of the upper secondary department. This is one of the greatest services which the examination has done for education. As the Government are aware, pupils seek admission to the VIth class, although they may be utterly unfit to read in that class, whilst managers and parents often, it is feared, for paltry reasons, encourage or take advantage of the evil habit. The result is that in many schools, but notably in unrecognised institutions, the VIth class is crowded to a ruinous and suicidal extent, whilst the Vth class is sparsely attended. The result is utterly mischievous from every point of view. The pupil is sacrificed to his greed to pass the Matriculation examination, and the University suffers through the admission of many such ill-trained and ill-educated young men to its affiliated colleges. Now the Middle School examination has been the only check upon this unwholesome and destructive tendency; and by its means the greater number of existing high schools have been saved from demoralization.

I claim, too, for this examination that it has steadied, in a wonderful way, attendance in middle schools, in which, speaking generally, the strength is fairly distributed among the three classes comprised in that department. There was a time, in the early days of the test, when there was overcrowding in the Upper IVth class as there is now in the VIth class; but I rejoice to say that this evil has almost disappeared; the Upper IVth class is, it is true, often stronger than the Lower IVth, but this is mainly due not to the desire to pass the Middle School examination, but to the lengthened preparation required for admission to the upper secondary department. If this examination is abolished, and the Matriculation is retained as a public test in the majority of schools, all this steady work will be undone and scattered to the winds, and the rush into the VIth class will be as great in many public institutions as it is now in private and unrecognized schools. I know full well that institutions under strong managers can, to some extent, resist the current, but the rank and file of secondary schools will not be able to do so. Laws are made to protect the weak and not the strong. This beneficent work the Middle School examination has always done, and will continue to do, if permitted to do so. I will refer to this subject again presently.

(3) As pointed out in the summary in paragraph 4, the chief object for which the middle school scheme has been recast,

As a means of promoting and gauging technical education.

was to promote technical and elementary scientific education,—not for the definite bifurcation of studies at this early age,

but to make middle education more diversified and more suitable to the various requirements of the country. It was also the special object of the revised scheme to provide suitable tests for examination in the subjects taught in industrial and special schools, which had hitherto been almost without any definite standards to aim at. Any system of examination, which omits examinations in subjects that are taught in schools for useful ends, must be a defective means of promoting education, because it does not provide that education with the stimulus to exertion, which the pupils in such schools need, nor with the means of gauging the results of the teaching work for which they pay. Looked at, too, from a financial point of view, it is defective, in that the Government have not the most effective means of judging whether the public money is well spent, and whether the teaching is efficient. Short, very short, though the time is since this examination has been established, it has been doing very useful work in improving the character of instruction in special schools, directly and indirectly. It constitutes the final standard of a few years' course in many subjects, and, consequently, as only three years have elapsed since the introduction of the scheme, the influence it has exerted in promoting the upward movement cannot yet be adequately gauged. Again, to disturb it will be to disturb the revised organization of all institutions that have this examination on its technical side as their chief goal. I refer especially to the Lawrence Asylum; the School of Arts (Junior Classes); the Industrial School, Madras; the Industrial and Arts School, Nazareth; the Reformatory School; the Maistry classes at the College of Engineering, and a dozen or more industrial schools or classes, including a few art classes. I might also, I think, add the Victoria Technical Institute just established.

Mr. Margoschis, whose opinion in this matter is entitled to very great weight, observes:—

"Especially is it important to retain the Middle School examination in connection with Art, Industrial and Technical Schools. I have had considerable experience in this particular branch of education, and I must say that the Middle School examination scheme is almost as perfect as it is possible to make it, and more particularly when regarded as a step leading up to the High School examination. It would very much increase our difficulties, instead of lightening them, if there were no Government examination like that of the Middle School before the High School examination, or the Higher Examinations in Science, Arts and Industries. The Middle School examination now prepares the pupils and acts as a spur and stimulus to them to prosecute their work, which encouragement would not exist if the examination were abolished, and the managers of schools would have to provide a substitute which would probably not work so well as the present plan adopted by Government, and it has been found by experience to work very well."

I would add here that if the technical side of the examination is abolished, the work thrown upon the inspecting agency will be much increased, which means extra cost to Government, whilst the pupils now bear the cost of the examination. But not only will the cost be greater, but the tests applied will be uneven, of varying scope and more or less irregular. The value of the certificates to the holder will be proportionately decreased. In fact, as the examiners may or may not be specially fitted to examine,—Inspectors are not Artists or Engineers or Mechanics,—the certificates will cease to have any special value, which assuredly is not the case now.

(4) This examination serves a very useful purpose in qualifying for admission to the Medical Schools for training for the

As a test for admission to the junior department of the Medical, Engineering, and Agricultural College.

grade of Hospital Assistants; for the Draughtsmen's and Surveyors' classes in the College of Engineering; and for the junior department of the College of Agriculture.

By being utilised as the general test for all the higher tests in Science, Arts and Industries (under Notification, 31st March, 1886), the examination is really the general test for admission to the higher technical institutions, with the single exception of the Medical Schools, where a partially alternative test exists. There are no

other means of testing the candidates for admission to the above institutions so that if the Middle School examination is abolished, separate examinations will have to be instituted in general knowledge at this stage; for it is manifest that it is impossible to make the Matriculation or the High School examination take the place of the Middle School examination in this connection, as these examinations represent two different and distinct stages of knowledge. The abolition of the Middle School examination will result in the return to the old state of things which Government thought fit to put a stop to in 1879 by instituting the Middle School examination. The existence of this public examination saves labor, expense, and trouble, besides affording a fairly satisfactory and adequate test of fitness.

(5) If, for no other reason, the Middle School examination should at least be

As a test for Teachers of the Primary Grade, Higher.

retained for this important function, because this function is of a kind which, in its standards and application, must be connected directly with public schools,

and must be public in its character. This function will become more and more important as primary education advances, because the class of teachers, whose general and whose technical qualifications will be tested by the Middle School examination, will be in ever increasing demand for Upper Primary schools, *i.e.*, schools capable of preparing pupils for the new Primary examination. In connection with this I would note an important point, *viz.*, that a large and rapidly increasing proportion of such schools are "board" schools, and that, consequently, the teachers concerned are public servants; so that in respect of such the Middle School examination is serving practically, even viewed as an educational test alone, the purposes of a general test examination, and thus affords the means of encouraging and gauging the improvement of the class of men,—village teachers, upon whom the progress of education amongst the masses must mainly depend. Such being the nature and scope of the examination, I need not enlarge on the expediency, I might say, the necessity of its standards being uniform and their application equal. These conditions would not be fulfilled if the examination were to become a mere *quasi*-public departmental examination instead of a public test, for the moment the examination loses its public character, the confidence of the people in its soundness will be much impaired, whatever care may be taken in framing the regulations to secure a uniform standard test. The service to be performed is public, why then, I submit, should the tests applied not be public? If they are not, I know full well that the recipients of the certificates will soon cease to hold an assured position; and for what class of servants of the public do the interests of society more urgently demand a highly respected position than for the teachers of the children of the peasants, of the artisans, and of the humbler sorts and conditions of men? The status of their teachers guarantees in a way their own status. The test should also be connected with "public" schools, because in this way it becomes part and parcel of the school system, and loses much of the exciting and disturbing elements of an examination, which is virtually competitive; moreover, in this country the pupil passes usually straight to the vocation of teacher, except when he submits, by attendance in a Normal School, to a course of preparation for that vocation. By connecting this examination with the school, the teacher and the pupil are aided in giving or acquiring knowledge suitable to the circumstances of the case, having the assurance that for no useful knowledge soundly mastered will there not be an appropriate recognition.

(6) The growing demands of the country for knowledge of a more varied kind

As a test in the special qualification of technical teachers.

than that hitherto provided in public institutions postulates a supply of teachers capable of providing that instruction.

The Grant-in-Aid Code in Chapters II and V more especially provides for the grant of aid for such teachers, and lays down certain conditions under which the Director can aid teachers according to their special qualifications. There are also provisions in the Notification relating to the Higher Examination in Science, Arts, and Industries regarding these qualifications. Now for the elementary teachers of special schools, there are at present no other tests than those provided in the Middle School

Notification. Tests, however, are essential to ensure efficiency and to prevent the waste of public money. So that if the Middle School examination is abolished, new tests will have to be devised for this purpose also. But the provision of new separate tests will only increase the number of special examinations, and will be open to all the objections I have stated in connection with the tests already referred to, whilst there is ground for thinking that these tests will be less satisfactory than at present.

- (7) A great deal has been said on this subject, but, as already pointed out, most of the objectors seem to forget that the examination is really from department to department and not from class to class, As a means of class promotion.

any more than the higher examinations are. Of its efficacy in schools without strong management, I have already spoken; but I would here add that it is a safe and effective protection for headmasters not only against the importunity of ill-prepared pupils for promotion, but against the importunity of ignorant or ill-advised managers, who not unfrequently put considerable pressure on their headmasters to promote lads who are not fit for promotion. Often and often have schoolmasters expressed to me their obligations to the Government for affording them this support. These points are laid stress on in several of the papers printed in the appendix. I would especially invite the attention of Government to the letters of Drs. Duncan and Hoene, Messrs. Adam, Nagoji Rau, Marsden, Sharrock and of several others.

It has been contended that an examination, which does not absolutely preclude the promotion of boys who do not pass, is a mistake. This argument, so far from telling against the examination is, to my mind, one of the best characteristics of the Middle School examination; because it would be most unwise that a boy that fails through some accident or through slight weakness in a subject should be kept down for a year. A provision of the scheme allows, under certain conditions, a discretion which every sensible headmaster exercises when he promotes on the results of class examination. The permission to promote does not carry with it a pass in the examination. The heads of large institutions exercise the power rightly without reference to the Director, whilst other institutions require his sanction, which is not often asked without good grounds and never refused unless the case is one in which no experienced headmaster would allow promotion. It has been here urged that the concession lessens the force of the examination as a stimulus to exertion. That also is in its favor, because, on all hands, is it admitted that at this early stage the less unhealthy stimulation and excitement there is about the examination, the better for all concerned.

I am, therefore, with those who think that the examination should be retained, though not perhaps altogether, in its present form for promotion to the upper secondary department; but I would make it even more a matter of option than it now is with institutions to send in their pupils for the examination and to regulate their promotion thereby. And I have little doubt that when the examination ceases to be a test for the service of Government in appointments of Rs. 15 and over, it will be utilised only by those who feel and appreciate the intrinsic benefits which it is calculated to confer. The examination, viewed as a means of promotion, has, I am convinced, done much to improve instruction in lower secondary schools; and I should regard as a very retrograde step the loss of this important function. It is strange that whilst we are discussing here the abandonment of such a means of regulating promotion, those entrusted with higher education in England, should have recently contrived to establish a somewhat similar test. If the function is useless, it will die; and by making its use voluntary, this question will very soon settle itself. This point I would earnestly press on the Government. Why should the prayer of those who would retain the examination, and they are at least a moiety of those interested, be of less avail than that of those who would abolish it? Each section of the educational world should, I submit, be left free to choose its course in the matter.

The affording of relief to Inspecting Officers. (8) Dr. Duncan very rightly draws attention to this point in the following extract:—

"On page 176 of the Report on Public Instruction for 1875-76, Colonel Macdonald pointed out that the institution of the Middle School examination would relieve Inspectors of the duty of examining the Upper IVth class. In 1888 even more than in 1876, it is desirable to diminish the work, and with it the cost of inspection. If the Middle School examination were abolished, I doubt whether the present staff of inspecting officers would be able to accomplish the additional work that would be thrown on them by having to examine the Upper IVth class of aided schools. As to the suggestion made by Government, whether a comparative examination conducted by school managers would not be sufficient for purposes of class promotion, I have to reply that I do not think it would. The late comparative examinations did not command the respect and confidence of teachers, and this was one reason among others that induced me to discontinue one of them while I was acting as Director of Public Instruction. The comparative examinations occurring at the end of the years immediately before and after the Middle School examination were what I had chiefly in view in my answer to question 62 before the Education Commission. A comparative examination could not, in my opinion, be substituted for the Middle School examination without borrowing from the latter all the main features which now characterise its point. Moreover, the reasons which would justify the holding of a comparative examination of the kind suggested for the purpose of regulating promotion from the Upper IVth to the Vth class, would equally justify the holding of such an examination at the end of every school year from the infant class up to the preparatory matriculation class. Any increase in the number of public examinations I would strongly deprecate."

I entirely endorse what he says. The work of the inspecting officers is now very heavy, and it is yearly increasing. It is, therefore, all the more necessary to relieve them as much as possible of class examination work in their annual inspection. When a class is presented, I would observe, for a public examination, the Inspector is only required to examine it cursorily, though he is expected to pay particular attention to Reading, Note-books, Physical exercises, &c. The abolition of the comparative examinations has already in one way added to their work, and I should much regret any course of action which would have a similar effect. The abolition of these examinations was partly due to their failure to command the confidence of the public, as they were lacking in those elements which give prestige to the Middle School examination. In middle schools, if the latter examination is also abolished, the work would devolve on the Assistant Inspectors. Government are well aware how onerous the duties of these officers are under the new scheme, and how undesirable it is to add thereto in the matter of secondary education, which means less time for the inspection and supervision of primary schools. The Upper IVth class being the first and most important in the lower secondary department would demand especial care in examination on the part of these officers.

6. In the foregoing paragraphs I have endeavored to note the most important reasons why the Middle School examination should not be abolished; and I have also pointed out that its abolition will not produce the desired end, a decrease in the number of public examinations, but the converse, increase and multiplication,—a result to which I am strongly opposed, unless the demand for a new examination, as in the case of the High School examination, is one that cannot be ignored without crippling and retarding the progress of sound and useful education in the country. But whilst I hold this opinion I am far from thinking that the Middle School scheme cannot be simplified in some respects and improved, so as to make it more suitable than at present for the general, special and technical work it has to perform. In ceasing to be a test for admission to the Public service in all departments, save education, for salaries of Rs. 15 and upwards, it will lose one of its most distinguishing features; but the loss of this feature will render it possible to modify it in several ways, and render it a more efficient machine than it now is for the work which will remain. But in two important matters there should be no change: the first, that the examination should continue to be under the Commissioner for the U. C. S. Examinations, and not be transferred to the Director; the second, that it should continue a Public service test for salaries of less than Rs. 15, and for the several special branches or institutions for which it is already a test. In proposing to retain the examination under the Commissioner, I do not mean to ignore the agency of the Education Department. Far from it. I would utilise that department as in the new primary school scheme largely, but the final authority should be the Director in his capacity of Commissioner. I have considered the point whether the examination could be made

a Circle (Educational) Examination similarly to the manner in which the Primary Examination has been made a District examination. But whilst I think that when the examination is used for purposes of promotion only, some arrangements of the kind may, perhaps, be practicable, I do not think it would be practicable or advisable when the other functions of the examination are considered. There is also the serious objection that the decentralization of the examination will increase the work unnecessarily and will throw additional duties on Inspectors, which they have no leisure to perform. I am entirely against burdening the Director's Office with examination work and with its myriad statistics unless a special department is created therein. Nothing is to be gained thereby, whilst the objection that the Director is associated with public examinations will be intensified; and as I have pointed out, it is impossible that Public service work can be, and it is inexpedient that it should be, dissociated from the U.C.S. Examinations. I would add that the conduct of this examination by the Commissioner enables the Government to make it far more unofficial and less departmental in its character, because the services of non-official educationists are utilized for examination work, which could not easily be done if the examination were conducted by the department. If the change were made it would not unreasonably give some force to the cry that the Education Department is ever forcing schools into an official groove, and modelling them according to its own patterns. It was to check this tendency that I, among other reasons, recommended the conduct of the Primary examination being entrusted to the Commissioner.

7. The whole question of revising the Notification, however, may well be considered at leisure by a strong representative committee with Dr. Duncan as President and the Commissioner's Secretary, Mr. Elliot, as Secretary. Among the members there should most certainly be an Inspector, an Assistant Inspector and two gentlemen connected with the Revenue service, who have had large experience of local and municipal educational administration. Dr. Miller and Mr. Adam should, I need not say, be members. The scope of the Committee's work should be clearly defined in the order appointing them. To this Committee I would also entrust the duty of revising Chapters V and IX of the Grant-in-Aid Code, which have special reference to the aid to be given by Government to advance technical education. I reserve to the Director as in the School Fee Committee a free hand in criticising the proposals before they are submitted to Government. I would add that, when the final orders of Government have been issued on the High School scheme, I purpose to invite a Committee of representative educationists to join me in revising the Standing Orders, including the general curriculum, and in considering how effect can best be given to the wishes of those who would extend the secondary course in schools by one year.

8. I now pass to consider the final question, which I have set myself,—the system of recognition of schools by the department to the disadvantage of non-recognised schools. The opinion of the High School examination Committee will be found in paragraph 25 of their report. This portion of the report was objected to by one member only, Mr. Adam. His views are ably set forth in his minute. Mr. Adam has, in his letter printed in the appendix, stated that his remarks apply to the Middle School examination. Before, however, proceeding to discuss the position adopted by him, I would observe that of some seventy officers and representatives of institutions, consulted, only a few can be held to be opposed to the system, whilst the majority are strongly in favor of it many of these representing some of the most important institutions in the country. This expression of opinion, exemplified as it is by the figures in a succeeding paragraph, is worthy of attention, because it shows with reference to paragraph 13 of the minute, that these regulations, as they now stand, do not "produce no other result but dissatisfaction and revolt." Nor does it bear out the conclusion that "to incur so much unpopularity and achieve so little good in return can hardly be deemed politic;" because this system is manifestly not unpopular, whilst we may be sure, if it achieved but "little good," it would be unpopular, and deservedly so. Even an institution, such as the Graduates' Association, which ably represents the opinion mainly of young men deeply

interested in education, whose sympathies are naturally in accord with the perfect freedom in education, do not appear to object to the system, provided the conditions are "few and simple;" the School Fee Notification "cease to have any connection with recognition;" and the terms of recognition are defined by Government. It is also remarkable that the memorial of the Council on aided education and of others, dated 24th January 1889, raises no objection to the High School Scheme on this score. When I recall the outcry a few years ago against the action of Government, the change in opinion is not a little consolatory. Those that have given it a qualified support, qualify that support generally on two points (1) that the conditions are too complicated; and (2) that a difference in examination fee between school pupils and others is not justifiable. Those that support the system urge that the system tends to make secondary education self-supporting; that in the present circumstances of the country, well and long-established institutions need protection against inexperienced youths and speculators, who establish inefficient schools, not to benefit the people, but from motives of rivalry or temporarily to obtain a living; that it protects the people against the false economy of sacrificing their children's education to a fancied saving in the cost; that the Government are bound to support in this way schools that submit to the onerous conditions which the State considers essential to efficiency; that the system has for its prototype the system of affiliation in the University; that schools without this support cannot ordinarily enforce discipline or be efficient. To these arguments I add that it is impossible for the State to render secondary education, now that such schools cannot be materially aided by money grants, efficient without the help of some such system; and that the results of the system, tentative though it hitherto only has been, have been productive of much good to the country.

But before discussing these, I would explain what "recognition," as it now stands, implies. The words of the Middle School Notification are—

The Director of Public Instruction shall not recognise any ordinary school which, as regards management, does not comply with the conditions of Chapter II, Article 1, of the Grant-in-Aid Code, which does not in all departments levy fees in accordance with the provisions of the Gazette notification, which is not provided with an adequate staff of teachers and a fairly suitable building and the necessary apparatus, and which, for the term preceding that in which the examination is held, cannot show an average attendance of 20 pupils. (But in mofussil schools for poor European and Eurasian children the restriction regarding minimum attendance will not be enforced.)

In other words, a school, in order to be admitted to the privileges of recognition, must possess a suitable management, an adequate teaching staff, a suitable building, and the necessary apparatus, and it should levy fees at the rates prescribed by Government. If it complies with these conditions,—which are (by the omission of all the other special conditions of Chapter II) as moderate, it is submitted, as can reasonably be demanded from any school (except in the matter of fees) seeking to rank as a "public" institution,—it has the privilege of detailed inspection by the department; it is entitled to aid under all chapters of the Code, Chapters II, III and IV alone excepted; it is entitled to receive assistance from the department in all the ordinary ways in which assistance can be afforded; its teachers are selected for public examinations; and, lastly, it can send in its pupils for the Middle School examination at a reduced rate of entrance fee. A school, which prefers to remain "unrecognised," is not entitled to the service of detailed examination, but if it be well conducted, it always receives a cursory inspection, and other undefined assistance, but it is not entitled to the other privileges. But there is nothing to guarantee an element of "permanence" in such a school; it can employ as inefficient a staff as it pleases; it can levy what fees it pleases and thus reap the full advantage of carrying on a competition with a "recognised" rival that must charge fairly high fees; and it does so by charging fees lower than the prescribed rates, but still much higher than it could charge, if its rival had a free hand. The burdens imposed by recognition are less than those imposed on a school which receives aid from the State. The privilege of being free from these burdens has been found in most cases less advantageous than having to bear them.

- (9) (a) Now the objectors to the system are of two classes: the first (a very small minority) object to the system absolutely on the ground that it is opposed to free trade in education; the second, those who

Objections to the system.

accept the system, but object to the details, on the ground of their being either too stringent or too lax. As regards the first class of objectors, I would observe that the scheme does not really interfere with free-trade in education. So far from doing so it has had the effect of stimulating it, through the condition relating to school fees, because educational free-traders have been able to charge fees which they could not have demanded, had their rivals not been compelled to charge the State rates. The confidence, which connection with the Government scheme of education inspires, has enabled not merely recognised schools to hold their own, but has induced managers of unrecognised schools in places where there was no competition to seek "recognition," which implies ordinarily increased cost for staff, apparatus, furniture, and accommodation,—an expenditure which far out-balances the small difference which the pupils of one class only have to pay for the privilege of appearing as "pupils," which in the present notification carries with it no privilege as regards minima. Is it probable that a manager would agree to submit to departmental control, which involves charging higher fees to (say) one hundred pupils, when only 20 (say) seek to enter the examination on a lower fee, the difference being more than outweighed by the higher class fees? At the present moment out of a total of 409 recognised schools only 284 are aided and yet the remaining schools have voluntarily sought and obtained the privilege of recognition.

If the examination were closed to outsiders altogether, as so many critics desire it should be, then the absolute free-traders would have a real ground of complaint; but now they have none. In fact, the objection of a few managers to the recognition system seems to me to be based more upon their reluctance to submit to the restriction of the school-fee Notification than to any aversion to the system itself. This is not the place for me to discuss the nature of the restrictions imposed by that Notification on schools. I would only observe here that had it not been for the recognition system, the Government Fee Notification would have, to all intents and purposes, remained practically a dead-letter, and so long as the aid given to secondary schools remains limited as at present, it will only be with the help of the recognition system that Government can prevail upon managers to levy the fee rates which the Government consider right and proper in the interests of education. The help, therefore, which the system has rendered to managers of small schools with limited means at their disposal has been enormous. Without it the fee income of such schools would have been so insignificant as to practically compel the managers to close their schools.

But, assuming that "recognition" involves interference with absolute and unqualified free-trade, I ask can there be any valid objection to a judicious system of protection? Is not the University founded upon this principle, in that it, unless by a special grace, admits no one to its examination, after entrance, who has not read in an affiliated institution. If the operation of the system has been good in this case (it would have done more good had the conditions of affiliation been severer), why should it fail in a lower educational sphere? The system of recognition by pointing out to the people the schools in which they may, with advantage, seek to educate their children, is especially useful in a partially civilised country; because the parents are too ignorant to distinguish the evil from the good. But it has been said by some that there is no difference between "recognised" and "unrecognised" schools. To this statement I can only answer that it is absolutely incorrect in the vast majority of cases. If there is any class of officers that can speak with authority on this point, it is the Inspectors of Schools who have a most intimate knowledge of all classes of institutions, and the opinions of Messrs. Bickle, Fowler, Marsden, Nagojee Rau and others quoted in the appendix clearly show that the line of demarcation between recognised and unrecognised schools is not imaginary. The pressure which the department has brought to bear on managers to seek the due fulfilment of the conditions of recognition, has not been hard and fast and unsympathetic, but gentle, long-suffering, and kind, though firm and persistent. It has "tempered the wind to the

shorn lamb," but in doing so, the necessity for improvement in efficiency has ever been borne in mind. The other course of action would have been most impolitic and unjust. The managers have always been given ample time; recognition has been constantly given conditionally; and has not been withdrawn unless the Inspector has reported that no honest endeavour has been made to fulfil the conditions, and that the progress made has not been reasonably sufficient. The result has been that each year, since the recognition system has been introduced, lower secondary schools have been, speaking generally, improving as regards staff, furniture, accommodation and otherwise. I have been often astonished at the efforts which managers, with limited resources, will make to secure recognition by seeking to improve their schools in the above respects. Of course, there are a few unrecognised schools, whose managers have ample means, which are efficient, perhaps much more efficient than not a few "recognised" schools. But it is not for such that the "recognition" system is required, but for schools which would remain ill-taught, ill-managed, ill-housed, but for the stimulus which the Government now applies. In evidence of this assertion, I can appeal without fear of contradiction to the lamentable condition of most unrecognised high schools, and more especially to—what may be termed—the cram high school, which is a school only in name, as it contains only one substantial class the VIth, the Matriculation, with the shadow of a Vth, the Pre-Matriculation. These schools or classes are admitted on all sides to be doing very serious mischief; because neither the Government nor the University concerns itself with them. One of my chief objects in proposing the institution of a High School examination was to bring these educational marauders (for such, in reality, most of them are) within the bounds of law and order, and to protect an ignorant public.

Another point to be considered in determining this question is, that the Grant-in-Aid Code is virtually a system of protection by bonuses, that is, the State gives assistance in money and by inspection to those managers who fulfil certain conditions, and refuses such assistance to those who do not fulfil these conditions. But this system of protection is growing less effective, owing to the limited means at the disposal of the State for the aid of secondary schools, and to the efficacy of the school fee policy pursued by this Government. Such schools are often now left unaided, or aided to so limited an extent that they may virtually be said to receive no support from the State except that given in the shape of "recognition." The utilization of "recognition" for protection purposes is thus only a new adaptation of the principle of protection already in force. That this assistance is tangible and effective I have endeavoured to show, and that it is so the demand for a more thorough application of the system by most educationists also proves. Why, then, I submit, should those managers who have been loyal to the Government policy, and who have endeavoured to make their institutions such as the State can approve, be deprived of this help, small, according to some, as it is? I have ever held it to be the duty and interest of the State to help those that help themselves; and not to encourage those who trade on popular ignorance or parental parsimony, except when I observed signs of a real desire to adopt a higher and more unselfish line of action. That my efforts have not been in vain is witnessed by the fact that schools seeking recognition have rapidly increased, that some mischievous "adventure" schools have been closed, and that secondary schools connected with the department have been unquestionably improving.

- (b) I now pass to the objection, not to the system, but to its details.

The system, say many, should be simple, but how it can be made simpler than it now is, if it is to be of any use at all, they do not say. I have stated exactly what the Government demand, and I submit that it cannot ask less. Managers have to show that they fulfil the conditions, and, of course, this may sometimes give rise to irritating inquiries by the officers concerned; but I do not believe that this often happens, and if it happens, in well-ordered schools, it can only happen once; for a school once recognised continues in the list unless it voluntarily withdraws, or the Inspector reports that it has ceased to deserve the privilege.

Others contend that the different rates of fee demanded for the Middle School examination should be abandoned, and that all that enter should enter at a uniform

rate. Now, in the first place, I observe that no one who has pressed this point has considered that the class "others" includes not only "pupils" from unrecognised schools, but also persons who are not pupils at all; in fact, this provision of the notification was expressly intended for this class of candidates, and as the Government are not bound to examine these, no principle is violated by their demanding a fee much higher than the cost of examining such candidates, so that it may examine pupils who have had the much heavier cost of preparatory instruction to bear. This principle has always been acted on in fixing the U.C.S. Examination fees and by the University in fixing its Entrance examination fee, at a very much higher figure than the actual cost of examination; so that students, after Matriculation, especially those appearing for the highest examinations, may be examined at a moderate fee; as the actual cost would be otherwise prohibitive. It is an accident that candidates other than *bona fide* pupils of schools should appear for the examination; but it is an accident which, I believe, will to a great extent disappear, on the English side at least, so soon as the Middle School examination ceases to qualify for admission to the higher grades of the public service. In the next place, it is contended that it is too low to be effective. To this I answer that the facts point the other way, for the number of pupil candidates appearing as "others" is comparatively small, whilst the number of those appearing as "pupils" has been rapidly increasing. But if it is contended that the fee should be prohibitive, I would reply that such a course would, in my opinion, be very unwise, for it would exclude from the examination many young people who come from "unrecognised" schools or appear as private students, whilst managers of unrecognised schools and classes would lose the benefit of the stimulus the examination affords to their promising pupils, and the means of gauging their work. There is no shadow of doubt that an unrecognised school which passes several pupils in the first class, obtains a great support in its contest with its rival. To unqualified free-trade in education I very strongly object, but I also object to any system which would absolutely close the door of public examination to persons not educated in schools directly connected with the State or the University.

That the demand for a higher fee from pupils of unrecognised schools is a hardship I cannot admit. In most cases they have paid as schooling for the year an aggregate fee far below what candidates from a recognised school have paid. So that, if the fees were equalised, the pressure of the school fee notification would be doubly severe. The school fee policy of this Government is, I believe, fraught with great benefit to the people, because by it alone can secondary education ever become self-supporting, and cease to be a charge on the tax-payers, *i.e.*, mainly the poor—the class which can derive only an indirect and partial benefit from such instruction. Any system which strengthens the hands of Government in this matter, and renders its policy more effective, should be maintained, if there are no counterbalancing evils, which, I submit, in this case are but few and comparatively insignificant. I would add that whilst the number of private candidates registered for examination in December 1888 was 1,670, the number that came from non-recognised schools, and therefore as private candidates, was 200 only. It may be inferred from this that unrecognised schools take comparatively small interest in the examination, preferring to send their pupils straight for the Matriculation examination. Consequently the higher fee for "others" does not affect them to such an extent as is generally believed. It mainly affects those for whom it was especially intended, *viz.*, adults who seek to pass the examination for admission to the public service.

Again, it is contended that the higher fee drives pupils from unsubsidised to subsidised schools. Of course, it has, to some extent, this effect, but if the schools, whether subsidised or not, to which the pupils pass, are better, is this transfer an evil? But I have endeavoured to show that it is not mainly the difference of fee that has this effect, but the other conditions to which I have referred. In fact, the weighting at present is against the "recognised" and not against the "unrecognised," so that the abolition of the excess payment would have the effect of making this weight "too grievous to be borne." This being so, why, I submit, should the unrecognised school be freed from what has been called a merely "irritating" tax?

The tax serves a useful purpose, far outweighing the irritation—the natural effect of all taxes—and is, I submit, just without being burdensome.

As regards the contention that the examination should be closed to all save pupils of recognised schools, I can only repeat the arguments already used in regard to a prohibitive entrance fee; and to state that it implies the adoption of a system of protection in education far in excess of the necessities of the case and calculated to do injury to the free growth of education in the country.

The next contention is that the conditions as regards sanitation and the qualifications of the staff should be much more stringent. This contention I, in the main, most heartily support; but whilst I give this support, I submit that any hard and fast course of action in this matter would do much harm to the cause of secondary education in backward parts of the country. I think, however, the time has come when the Government should, as regards secondary schools in towns, make it a condition that no school shall be recognised that cannot produce a certificate from the sanitary authorities that its accommodation is sufficient and its sanitary arrangements fairly suitable for a given maximum number of pupils. I also think the time has come for demanding in such schools, not only an adequate staff of teachers, but also requiring that the teachers shall have suitable technical qualifications, or be of approved efficiency. But such a rule can only be gradually made stringent in the rural tracts, and even in towns great discretion must be left to the Department, otherwise much unnecessary hardship must ensue. The course which has been followed of gradually increasing the stringency of these conditions is the wise and merciful one, but the pace may now be quickened.

I would only now, in conclusion, draw the attention of Government to the increasing popularity of the system since it was recast in 1885, as will be seen by the following figures—a popularity which extends to foreign territories, notably Mysore. It will be observed that in the British territory the number of recognised schools has in three years risen by 18 per cent., in Mysore and other Native States the increase being still more striking. Can a system be bad and worthy of abolition which can show such a record? I can only earnestly trust that the action of Government in this most important matter will be so decisive that agitation for its abandonment may cease until changed circumstances of the country demand a change.

Statement showing the number of recognised Schools for the last four years.*

			Colleges.	High Schools.	Middle Schools.	Total.
British Territory	Dec. 1885		20	102	164	286
	" 1886		19	96	204	319
	" 1887		20	86	223	329
	" 1888		22	110	204	336
Mysore	" 1885		4	18	14	36
	" 1886		5	21	19	45
	" 1887		3	14	33	50
	" 1888		3	18	27	48
Hyderabad	" 1885		2	3	4	9
	" 1886		2	8	3	13
	" 1887		2	7	3	12
	" 1888		2	11	8	21
Travancore	" 1885		1	4	7	12
	" 1886		1	6	7	13
	" 1887		1	4	7	12
	" 1888		1	5	8	14
Other States	" 1885		1	3	1	5
	" 1886		1	2	1	4
	" 1887		1	3	3	6
	" 1888		1	3	6	10

* The figures in this statement only include recognised schools that actually sent up pupils for the Middle School examination.

APPENDIX.

From Dr. D. DUNCAN, Principal, Presidency College, Madras, dated 11th December 1888, No. 373.

With reference to paragraph 2 of Proceedings, No. 7752, dated 23rd ultimo, communicating G.O., 22nd September 1888, No. 546, Educational, I have the honor to inform you that the two questions referred to in paragraph 4 of the above-mentioned Government Order were laid before the College Council on the 20th instant, when the following resolutions were adopted:—

"I. Resolved that while it may be advantageous to the department to retain the Middle School Examination—

- "(1) for the purpose of comparing educational attainments at a suitable stage prior to the High School or Matriculation Examination; and
- "(2) for the purpose of determining results grants;

it appears to this Council—

- "(1) that these ends may be secured in some other way;
- "(2) that it is not desirable to make the examination compulsory;
- "(3) that it is not desirable to regulate promotion from class to class by the results of this examination;
- "(4) that, assuming that the examination will cease to be a direct test for Government service, and will be retained as a purely departmental examination, it is desirable that it should be under the control of the Director of Public Instruction."

"II. Resolved that the Council unanimously approve of the principle of recognition, but do not consider the imposition of a higher admission fee on pupils of recognised schools to be the best method of carrying out the principle. In the opinion of the Council the conditions of recognition ought to be few and simple, and the pupils of schools that do not comply with these conditions ought to be absolutely debarred from appearing at the examination."

2. The second Resolution dealing with the question of recognition expresses the unanimous and unhesitating opinion of the College Council. With regard to the retention of the Middle School Examination, which forms the subject of the first resolution, the Council did not find it easy to arrive at a decision. They felt that they were hardly in a position to know and to estimate at their proper value all the reasons in favour of the retention of the examination. It will be seen that, in the opinion of the Council, the examination, if retained, should be modified in its scope and aim, as well as regards the controlling authority.

3. It seems to me that the opponents of the Middle School Examination do not give sufficient weight to the consideration that, the examination having for years been incorporated into our school system, its abolition would, to say the least, disorganize middle school education for some time to come. Without professing to be perfect, it nevertheless furnishes a stimulus to exertion and a standard of excellence to the schools throughout the Presidency.

4. There are two classes of schools which would be particularly affected for the worse by the abolition of the Middle School Examination, namely, girls' schools and schools where industrial branches are taught. The managers of the latter have, during recent years, spent much time and money in organizing their schools to enable them to teach the industrial branches of the Middle School Examination; and they would feel it a hardship if, almost before they had got their classes into working order, the examination were to be abolished. As for female education, the Middle School Examination is at present a *terminus ad quem* to most of the more advanced native girls' schools, few of which can go beyond this standard. The abolition of the examination, in depriving them of a standard to work up to, would, it is feared, seriously check female education. The standard of the Matriculation Examination, or of the proposed High School Examination, will remain an unattainable ideal for the majority of girls' schools for many years to come.

5. The interests of middle schools proper, and of pupils whose schooling ceases when they have gone through the upper fourth class, should also be considered. It is too much the fashion to look upon middle schools and classes merely as stages on the way to the high school and the college. For pupils who cannot hope to enter a high school and for middle schools proper, it is expedient that there should be such a public test of efficiency as the Middle School Examination affords.

6. I fully admit that the desire to pass a public examination is not the ideally highest and purest motive for either pupil or teacher; but it is a dictate of prudence to do the best one can with lower motives when the higher are inoperative. Now there can, I think, be no question

that without the guidance and stimulus of public examinations, education would not have made the progress it has done in India. Equally clear it is to my mind that we are yet a long way from the time when we can in this country dispense with these inferior motives and helps.

7. If the Middle School Examination be the ultimate goal of ambition for the majority of the better class of girls' schools, for the larger number of industrial schools, for middle schools proper, and for boys whose schooling cannot be carried beyond the upper fourth class, its retention seems to me to be not only unobjectionable, but eminently desirable in the present circumstances of this country. I am not at present concerned to show that the existing examination, either in its scope or in the manner of conducting it, meets all the requirements. It is enough to point out that a Leaving Certificate Examination is an appropriate ending to a course of study devised, not solely on the understanding that it is a stepping stone to the high school curriculum, but also in view of the fact that for many it is the completion of their school-life.

8. The College Council, it will be observed, are of opinion that the examination should not be used as a means of regulating promotion from the upper fourth to the fifth class. This opinion is, I believe, entertained by not a few both within and without the educational world. Seeing, however, that the very people who object to the Middle School Examination being used as a means of regulating promotion, unhesitatingly accept the Matriculation and F.A. Examinations as determining promotions, I am led to conclude that there must be some special reasons, arising from the nature and scope of the examination, or from the mode of conducting it, or from the age of the pupils, or from all combined, why promotion from the middle to the high school should not be determined by a public test. I admit that the step from the high school to the college marks a more important scholastic change than that from the middle school to the high school; but I fail to see any difference in character between the step from Lower Secondary to Higher Secondary education through the gateway of the Middle School Examination, and the step from Lower Collegiate to Higher Collegiate education through the gateway of the F.A. Examination. As to the special reasons that may be urged against the Middle School Examination being used for this purpose, I shall content myself with stating three which occur to me at present. The respect due to the examination as a means of determining promotion is diminished, I think, by the discretionary power given in Article 17 of the Middle School Notification. Guard it how one may, the dignity of the examination must be lowered by the permission given in certain circumstances to promote pupils who have failed to pass the test. Another objection I have often met with is that heads of schools and teachers have not sufficient participation in the general control and conduct of the examination, the fate of schools and pupils being, if not directly at least indirectly, in the hands of one person. And this suggests that other point raised by the College Council, namely, the undesirability of retaining an examination which regulates promotion in schools under the control of the Commissioner for the U. C. S. Examinations, who may be an officer entirely unconnected with educational work. If the Middle School Examination is no longer to be a test for admission to the public service, but a purely educational examination, it should, I think, be administered entirely within the Educational Department.

9. On page 176 of the Report on Public Instruction for 1875-76, Colonel Macdonald pointed out that the institution of the Middle School Examination would relieve Inspectors of the duty of examining the upper fourth class. In 1888 even more than in 1876 it is desirable to diminish the work and with it the cost of inspection. If the Middle School Examination were abolished, I doubt whether the present staff of inspecting officers would be able to accomplish the additional work that would be thrown on them by having to examine the upper fourth class of aided schools. As to the suggestion made by Government, whether a comparative examination conducted by school managers would not be sufficient for purposes of class promotion, I have to reply that I do not think it would. The late comparative examinations did not command the respect and confidence of teachers, and this was one reason among others that induced me to discontinue one of them while I was acting as Director of Public Instruction. The comparative examinations occurring at the end of the years immediately before and after the Middle School Examination were what I had chiefly in view in my answer to Question 62 before the Education Commission. A comparative examination could not, in my opinion, be substituted for the Middle School Examination without borrowing from the latter all the main features which now characterize it. Moreover, the reasons which would justify the holding of a comparative examination of the kind suggested for the purpose of regulating promotion from the upper fourth to the fifth class, would equally justify the holding of such an examination at the end of every school year from the infant class up to the preparatory Matriculation class. Any increase in the number of public examinations I would strongly deprecate.

10. As to the cry of over examination of immature minds, I do not attach much weight to it as against the Middle School Examination. Between the Upper Primary and the Matriculation Examinations there is a period of five years, which will be extended to six if the suggestion to extend the high school course from two to three years be carried out. I do not think it is a hardship, or a great strain on immature youths, to call upon them to pass a public examination about the middle of that period, provided the scope and standard of the examination and the mode of conducting it be carefully adapted to the attainments of youthful pupils.

11. The Middle School Examination occurs at a well-marked stage in school life, and the arguments in favour of abolishing it would, if admitted, have a wider application than those who employed them intend them to have.

From W. B. MORREN, Esq., M.A., Secretary, Senatus Madras Christian College.

Extracts from the Minutes of Meeting of Senatus held on October 26th 1888.

III. The reference of the Director of Public Instruction, No. 6578, dated 6th September 1888, having been laid before the Senatus by the Acting Principal, it was resolved to send the following reply:—

(1) The opinion of the Senatus is asked upon two points:

- (a) the advisability or not of retaining the Middle School Examination in case the High School Examination scheme is sanctioned; and,
- (b) as to the conditions of the system of recognition.

(2) As regards (a), the Senatus is of opinion that the Middle School Examination should not be retained. In the report of the Council for 1885, it was remarked: "To make the promotion from class to class of little boys depend on the results of a public examination is most hurtful to all good schools. There may be schools so inefficient that unless pupils and teachers are driven forward by the terrors of a public examination, nothing will be learnt at all. But the plan cannot be a good one which proceeds upon the theory that all schools are of such a character. Apart altogether from its results being satisfactory or unsatisfactory—and it must be admitted that in a majority of years they have been approximately fair—this Middle School Examination is exerting a steadily deteriorating influence upon the whole education and character of Madras schoolboys. Its evil effects are already appearing, and will appear more and more, at those higher stages at which public examinations begin to be necessary, and at which they might be made beneficial rather than injurious if the minds of those subjected to them were not fatally cramped and overburdened in earlier years."

The further experience which has been gained since this was written has only confirmed the Senatus in the views expressed, so that even if the High School Examination were not introduced, the Senatus would advocate the abolition of the Middle School Examination as a compulsory test for promotion to the high school. But with the introduction of the High School Examination, the case against the Middle School Examination becomes even stronger, for it then ceases to be an examination qualifying for Government service, and becomes solely a promotion test. A public examination which takes the responsibility of the internal management of a school off the shoulders of the head master must always be injurious. There can be little doubt that schools do exist in which promotions are made in a manner highly injurious to efficiency, but there can be equally little doubt that this is not the best way to cure such a defect. The suggestions of the Committee that all heads of well-conducted institutions should have the power to promote pupils who intend to proceed to the Matriculation Examination without the sanction of the Director does not remove the objections to the examination. Such a concession would be of very limited practical effect, for few schools would take advantage of it, most pupils desiring to be at least qualified to appear for the High School Examination.

(3) (b) The question of recognition is a much more difficult one. The Senatus is of opinion that some system of recognition is desirable, but holds that a system in which failure to gain recognition is punished simply by inflicting a fine on the pupils coming up for examination is a highly objectionable one. There seems to be no logical alternative to the admission of all candidates on equal terms except the admission of none but those appearing from recognised schools. The infliction of a fine of Rs. 10 at the end of a course of study lasting several years will have practically no effect in reducing the number of inefficient unrecognised schools. What the conditions for recognition should be is a question which can be satisfactorily settled only after consultation with those who are familiar with the needs of secondary education throughout the country. There are, however, certain points to which attention may be called. The existing rules for recognition are certainly too severe in some directions, and have done much to lead the managers of good schools to sever their connection with the department. In many parts of the Presidency it is quite impossible for the manager of a school who follows these rules to compete with unrecognised schools, so that recognition, instead of being an advantage, as it ought to be, is a decided disadvantage. Amongst the conditions that ought to be laid down for recognition there should be attention to sanitary laws, efficiency of the teaching staff, the provision of gymnastic training, and a minimum fee. At present the insistence on a fixed fee is one of the chief difficulties; but this would not be felt if none were admitted to the public examination except those coming from recognised schools, and the suicidal practice of two schools side by side fixing its fees simply with the view of underbidding the other would be, to a large extent at least, done away with.

If a system of absolute recognition is adopted, it will be necessary to make some provision for exempting individuals, but not schools, for special reasons, as is now done in the University.

From Rev. Father J. W. SEWELL, S.J., Manager, St. Joseph's College, Trichinopoly, dated 20th October 1888.

The Middle School examination should be abolished; under the pressure of the anticipated examination, we find it difficult to ground boys thoroughly. Their whole attention is centred on mastering their texts, and there is no time for teaching Grammar thoroughly.

2. Although the recognition system may be undesirable in itself, it seems to us to be necessary, owing to the present state of the country and "false notion of economy existing among the generality of parents," so long as Managers of Aided schools are compelled to levy the higher rate of fees prescribed by Government.

3. That subject to the above restriction, he approves generally of the condition of recognition set forth in Note Clause 3 of Act II of the Draft Notification.

From Dr. J. HOENE, Principal, St. Aloysius' College, Mangalore, dated 4th October 1888.

In reply to No. 6578, dated 6th September 1888, I have the honor to state that in my opinion it is advisable to retain the Middle School examination in case the High School examination is sanctioned. The former examination is a good conclusion for the Lower Secondary Department, and I believe that in general the work in this Department will be all the better done if the pupils have to be presented for a public examination. At the same time, it will prevent not a few good-for-nothing pupils from wasting their time on the school benches if they see that they are debarred from entering the High School. And I believe the rule should be made absolute that no boy who has not passed the Middle School examination can be promoted to that part of the High School which prepares for the High School examination, whereas for the others I think it advisable that the rules which exist at present should be left unaltered.

2. As to the Matriculation and F. A. examinations, they ought to cease to qualify for Government service as soon as the High School examination is introduced. My opinion is that the new scheme will never have a fair trial as long as the former examinations afford the same facility to young men of entering into Government service, and with the advantages held out to graduates I do not apprehend any considerable falling off in the numbers of college students. No doubt some less talented boys will never attempt the University course, but this ought to be looked upon rather as a gain than a loss.

3. The conditions of the system of recognition, no doubt, often prove a great burden to Managers of schools and interfere not a little with the working of the schools, and this chiefly on account of the departmental examinations. There is a public examination at the close of every course, viz., the Middle School and the various University examinations; this ought to be sufficient. As far as my experience goes, Government schools are not interfered with, but are allowed to manage their own affairs—why should not Aided schools if they are known to be in good working order and under trustworthy management? Let there be an inspection by all means, but why a detailed examination? If, as ought to be, periodical examinations are held regularly in the course of the year, and if moreover the papers set and the results obtained are submitted to the Inspector of the Division, this ought to be sufficient for all ends and purposes. As it is at present at least here in Mangalore the departmental examinations take place in a month purposely set apart for a thorough revision of the subject matter gone through in the course of the year, and to interrupt this time by a departmental examination necessarily must prove injurious to the working of the school. Neither is it a good test of the attainments of the scholars, because they are subjected to an examination before they are able to revise the matter gone through. However, in spite of all objections one may raise against the conditions of recognition, under the present circumstances, I think it of absolute necessity that there should be a distinction between recognised and non-recognised schools. And my reason for saying so is, here in India and particularly in the Madras Presidency, education or schooling is looked upon by many as a commercial enterprise. Adventure schools are started everywhere, and Managers on account of their poorly constructed school-houses and other reasons incur small expenses and thus are able to offer their wares at a low price and but too often find ready purchasers. Now these schools prove a great hindrance to the maintenance of a healthy discipline in well-established schools. As soon as a boy gets into trouble, e.g., is found fault with on account of irregular attendance, or habitual laziness, or is not promoted to a higher standard, he leaves his school and finds ready admittance in another school in the same town not bound by any Government regulations. Now to check this evil the only remedy, it seems to me, is to make a distinction in the fees to be charged for the examinations.

From JOHN ADAM, Esq., M.A., Principal, Pachaiyappa's College, dated Madras, 17th December 1888.

In reply to reference No. 6578, dated 6th September 1888, forwarding for opinions G.O., No. 401, Educational, dated 11th July 1888, I have the honor to make the following remarks.

The only point on which I have not, as a member of the Committee, already recorded my opinion, is that as to the advisability of retaining the Middle School examination, and to that question the following remarks are confined.

2. That a test or promotion examination is almost essential at or about the stage at which the Middle School examination is now held, I am quite convinced. It is not *directly* necessary for very large institutions. In Pachaiyappa's, for instance, where we have classes of three or four sections, and three branch schools with large classes, with a good staff of masters, and with masters of the collegiate grade to set papers and superintend the examination, we could conduct a promotion examination for the Upper IV Class as efficiently and strictly as we now do for the Lower IV and V Classes. But these circumstances—and it is from teachers similarly circumstanced that opposition to the Middle School examination mainly comes—are not applicable to the overwhelming bulk of mofussil schools. For these such a test maintains a uniform standard, serves as a guide to parents and guardians, and furnishes a useful spur to the teachers. It should be noted also that promotion does not mean solely promotion within a school itself, but promotion on transfer from a middle school proper to a high school. Without such an examination there would be no general and uniform test of fitness for admission into a V Class of a High School. It is clear, however, that such an examination should be a *non-competitive* examination; and as pointed out in the recent Report of the Royal Education Commission (1886-88), the aim of such an examination should be “to find out what the scholars know, and how they know it, and not to find out what they do not know.”

3. The Middle School examination has attempted unsuccessfully to be at once competitive and non-competitive; to be at once a stringent test to pick out first-class boys for Government service, and a measure of the general advance made by school-boys of no more than ordinary merit. These two aims are incompatible; but the demands of the former have necessarily prevailed. The examination has been far too stringent, far too inelastic, has fostered a most unhealthy system of precocious cramming, and failed to fulfil the proper functions of such an examination. If, however, the High School examination be introduced, and thereby or from other causes the Middle School examination cease to be a qualifying test for Government service, the competitive element can be eliminated, its objectionable features can be removed, and the examination so modified be made to serve a highly useful and indeed necessary purpose.

4. It is not necessary here to suggest the alterations which might be made. They might, however, take the form of allowing a wider range of subjects to choose from; of abolishing classes; of introducing instead of the present minute accuracy of marking a broad division of the answer papers into—say, good, indifferent and bad, and plucking such as get more than one bad, &c. Candidates who desire to have their papers accurately valued and to receive certificates of merit might be put in a division by themselves, and might even receive additional or severer papers, paying, of course, a higher special fee. These details, however, have no important bearing on the general question.

5. I may add that my remarks in my dissent from the Report under reference as to *Recognition* apply to the Middle School examination.

From the Rev. J. A. SHARROCK, B.A., Principal and Manager, Caldwell College, Tuticorin, dated 9th November 1888, No. 130.

I think that important schemes like this, affecting the whole education of the Presidency, should not be carried without first being submitted to a conference of educationists, as recommended by the Educational Commission. What is good for Madras may not be good for the Mofussil.

2. The whole scheme seems to me to err in this point of view—it looks almost exclusively to Government service, as if nothing else need be considered. But few of those educated can be employed by Government, and surely it is unwise that the whole of our educational system should be made subordinate to the needs and narrow limits of Public service.

3. I am, however, decidedly of opinion that the Matriculation examination should not be used permanently as a Government test. It is absurd that thousands of youths should every year matriculate in a University, which they mean to quit the moment they have been admitted.

4. I would venture to suggest that what is wanted after the Middle School examination is a course of *general reading* for two years, after which a bifurcation might take place. Class VI-A would then take up the special subjects of the Matriculation examination, and Class VI-B the special subjects for the High School examination.

5. All that is required on the subject of recognition is that the Government should make up their minds, once for all, either that it is good, or that it is bad. The recognized schools are suffering severely from undue competition with private schools, which can fix their own fees, &c., and can undersell their recognized rivals. If recognition is good, let none of the students from unrecognized schools be admitted to any of the examinations, and give no Government aid to

managers who maintain both recognized and non-recognized schools. If bad, let us all be put on the same footing, and not handicapped, as we are at present, with such burdens as the Fee Code.

The plan I would venture to suggest is (1) that the Fee Code be abolished; and (2) that the Government pick out a certain number of schools—there are far too many now—and give them annually a Block Grant, the amount being based on the report of the Inspector, coupled with the *passes* of the year and the local circumstances.

6. I very much doubt the wisdom of abolishing the Middle School examination. The comparative examinations were weighed in the balance and found wanting. The tendency to hurry is very great and very pernicious to sound education. The Middle School examination does provide a fixed barrier, and so prevents too rapid promotion in many cases. It is also for use as fixing a test for several purposes, such as Normal Schools, &c.

7. This High School Scheme will tend to damage the attendance at many of the smaller colleges, in fact, will, I fear, be fatal to some—

- (1) The change should be made gradually, as many managers will have to feel their way, and precipitancy will be fatal to a beneficial change, especially when such vast interests are affected.
- (2) The tendency will be towards still further centralisation, which may be good, though the present tendency towards it seems to me to be working injuriously. If good, let some one town, not Madras, be chosen as the University Town of the Presidency.
- (3) The scheme may be good in itself, and yet hurtful in its effects on education in general. It may produce a revolution in the educational world, and so should be handled very cautiously and tentatively at first.

From G. BICKLE, Esq., Inspector of Schools, Second Division, Bellary, dated 1st December 1888.

In compliance with your foot note No. 7752, dated 23rd October 1888, to G.O., dated 22nd September 1888, No. 556, Educational, I have the honor to report that I invited the opinions of 21 officials and others whom I considered to be interested in the High School examination scheme, including the Presidents of District Boards, the Presidents of some Taluk Boards, the Chairmen of Municipal Councils, the Managers of High Schools and some others. Only six responses were received from the undermentioned officers:—

Chairman, Municipal Council, Bellary, who convened a special meeting of the Council and invited the attendance of the members of the local Graduates' Association to consider the matter. After a full discussion of the subject, the following resolutions were arrived at:—

- (a) “The introduction of the proposed High School examination is desirable with this modification, *viz.*, that the Matriculation examination with such additional tests as it may be necessary to impose departmentally, continue permanently to qualify for Government Service.”
- (b) “The Middle School examination as a qualifying test continue to be so in the Ceded Districts for five years more.”
- (c) “It is highly desirable that the policy of recognition referred to in Mr. Adam's minute of dissent should be maintained.”

(2) Chairman, Municipal Council, Anantapur, forwarded the following resolutions passed at a meeting of the Council:—

- (a) “That the rules prescribed for the High School examination may come into force as at present proposed, and that there is no necessity for any modifications.”
- (b) “That the Council think that the retention of the Middle School examination after the coming of the High School examination into force is no longer needed.”
- (c) “That the opinion expressed by Mr. Adam cannot be endorsed.”

(3) President, District Board, Anantapur, communicated the following resolution of the Board:—

“The scheme does not seem a desirable one to the Board, as tending to discourage higher education by taking away much of the high value now attributed to the University examinations.”

(4) President, Sidhout and Pullampet Taluk Boards, states:—

- (a) That the introduction of the High School examination scheme as formulated by the committee is unnecessary and undesirable. He would take the Matriculation examination as the general literary test, and require candidates for Government service to pass the additional tests specified in the High School examination scheme.
- (b) The retention of the Middle School examination would be unnecessary if the High School examination were introduced.

(c) He agrees with the views expressed by Mr. Adam in his minute of dissent, more especially the first.

(5) *Manager, Wardlaw Institution, Bellary*, considers—

(a) That the High School examination as the scheme now stands would be impracticable in most colleges and schools. The compulsory subjects might be taught in ordinary colleges and high schools, but the course should be the same for both the High School examination and Matriculation, the University adapting their Matriculation school to that of the High School examination. The optional subjects should be in special schools at convenient centres in the Presidency, which, if private schools, should be largely aided by Government.

(b) If the High School examination were introduced, either as it now stands or in a modified form, the Middle School examination would be unnecessary.

(6) *Manager, Congress High School, Madanapalle*, who consulted the managing committee of the school and the local Debating Society, gives fully his reasons for concluding:—

(a) "It is undesirable to introduce the High School examination."

(b) "The retention of the Middle School examination even now as qualifying for public service is unnecessary, because candidates passing that examination have, in most cases, very poor knowledge and are not competent to enter into the public service."

(c) "There should be no distinction as recognised and unrecognised schools for any examination."

2. The papers conveying the above expressions of opinion are herewith forwarded.

3. My own view of the subject I beg to give as follows:—

(a) While fully admitting that the Matriculation examination as it now stands does not properly qualify for admission to the public service, I think it is to be regretted that a new examination has to be devised, which I think there is little doubt will have the effect of very considerably reducing the strength of the Arts colleges. I believe it to be very unlikely that the great majority of pupils after passing out of the Upper IVth class will commence the course of the High School examination with the view of both matriculating and passing that examination, but the great majority will, in all probability, be content to confine their efforts to passing the examination which qualifies for the public service. There seem to me to be two possible ways in which the results desired to be secured by the High School examination may be attained. The first and most desirable is to induce, if possible, the authorities of the University to raise the standard of the Matriculation examination to the level of that of the High School examination in the compulsory subjects, and to supplement the former by a subsequent examination in the compulsory subjects. This would be a distinct gain to the University as securing a far more competent supply of under graduates than is now the case; and it would not interfere with the present constitution of the high schools. Failing to secure this, I would advise that the High School examination should be made supplementary to Matriculation, and only pupils who have passed the latter examination should be admitted to it. This arrangement would admit of postponing to a more advanced age the decision as to whether a University course should be commenced, or whether qualification for admission to the public service on the lowest possible terms should be the end of a youth's educational career.

(b) With reference to the question whether in case the High School examination should be established it would be desirable to retain the Middle School examination, I am of opinion that, if it were abolished as a public examination, its retention would be unnecessary. But for some years to come I do not think that the necessary number of young men who had qualified according to the High School examination scheme would be available for employment in the Ceded Districts; and hence the lower qualifying test of the Middle School examination will be necessary.

(c) Regarding the recognition of schools, I am of opinion that no pupils should be admitted to the High School examination who do not belong to a recognised school. According to my experience, unrecognised schools are in various respects inferior to recognised ones. Yet when a school of the former class is started, there is usually a considerable number of pupils willing to join it, chiefly because of the lower rates of fee such schools invariably charge, and the very great majority of the natives of this Presidency always purchase in the cheapest market, ignoring the fact that cheap articles are in the long run the dearest. As a protection against the false economy involved in attending an inferior school, I would exclude from the examination all pupils not belonging to recognised schools.

From J. T. FOWLER, Esq., late Inspector of Schools, Presidency Division, Madras, dated 17th December 1888.

In reply to endorsement, No. 7752, of the 23rd October, communicating proceedings of Government on the High School examination scheme, I have the honor to enclose four communications received in reply to my reference.

Mr. Foley, Head Master, Bishop Corrie's School, is strongly in favor of the scheme, for reasons assigned, and considers that "the University should undertake the whole of the High School examination." He also "strongly advocates the retention of the Middle School examination."

Dr. Clough, of Ongole, (1) would retain the Matriculation examination as a condition of entrance into the public service; (2) thinks the Middle School examination might be done away with; (3) highly approves of the system of recognition; (4) thinks the High School examination calculated to secure better trained and better qualified men for the public service.

The Secretary of the Free Church Mission (1) disapproves of the scheme; (2) would abolish the Middle School examination; (3) approves conditionally of recognition.

The Principal of the S.P.G. College, Vepery, does not look with favor on the High School examination in its present form; (2) would do away with recognition.

2. My own views I must express very briefly:—

(a) I consider that the general should be separated from the more special part of the examination, and be tested by the University, only special tests being applied by Government, i.e., by the Commissioner for the U.C.S. Examinations.

(b) I think the Middle School examination might be done away with.

(c) I consider the scheme of "recognition" of great value, and would strongly advocate its retention. The theoretical views printed on pages 16 and 17 of G.O., No. 401, of the 11th July, as to the superiority of non-recognized schools, are according to my experience *pure theory*. In practice, unrecognized schools are *inefficient* and *demoralizing*; they pamper boys, have no real discipline, and place boys exactly where they wish to be placed. Examples could easily be given. They also charge such fees as boys are prepared to pay.

3. The close connection between the proposed High School examination and the public service, I think likely to be very mischievous.

From E. MARSDEN, Esq., B.A., Inspector of Schools, Western Circle, dated Karkal, 21st November 1888.

Although the Middle School examination will cease to be of value as a service test when the High School examination is introduced, there are at least three other very useful purposes it will serve, not directly connected with entry into the Government service. It is a useful preparatory test for the Matriculation. In most high schools, boys are not promoted from the Upper IVth to the Vth class until they pass this examination. Were it otherwise, the number of candidates for Matriculation, already large to excess, would be still larger. Masters are relieved from the odium of not promoting boys who are, in their opinion, unfit for promotion, and the responsibility is thrown upon Examiners wholly unconnected with a school.

2. It is true the University does not recognize this examination, and the rule of not promoting to the fifth class boys who have not passed it, is not obligatory on masters; but it is, I believe, generally adopted by good schools, and if it were abolished, these schools would lose the benefits above noted.

3. Similarly, when the High School examination is in operation, the Middle School examination will prove exceedingly useful in weeding out inefficient candidates. Note 5 to Rule II, which provides that a candidate, to be admitted as a pupil, must have passed the Middle School examination, and have studied for 30 months subsequently in a recognized high school, I regard as most salutary. The rule that no student who has not passed the Middle School examination may be promoted to the Vth class, instead of being adopted by some schools only, will be obligatory on all recognized high schools.

Ignorant pupils will no longer be able to *coerce* masters into promoting them by the threat of joining some other institution.

4. A third and most important purpose served by the examination is, that it is a final test for the large number of middle schools in the country not connected with high schools. For example, in this district there is a large and flourishing middle school at each of the five taluk head-quarters, while there are no high schools out of the town of Mangalore, the capital. In Mangalore itself there are several large middle schools not directly connected with any high school. To all these institutions the Middle School examination is very valuable. It is held at

the end of the school year. The examiners are appointed by Government, and, being quite unconnected with the district, cannot be suspected of any partiality. They are paid for their work and are therefore bound to do it well. Careful criticism may indeed show that the valuation of the papers has not been in every case absolutely perfect, that the results vary somewhat unaccountably from year to year, and that the standard held in view by different examiners is not always the same; but, for all that, the masters and managers of these schools have confidence in the examination and prefer it to any other that could be held. If it be abolished, what is to take its place? A comparative examination by unpaid examiners is for many reasons unsatisfactory. Little, if any, confidence would be reposed in an examination of this sort. After the re-organization, Assistant and Deputy Inspectors are to examine middle schools, but these officers will take the schools in turn; some will be examined at the beginning, some in the middle, and some at the end of the school year. For obvious reasons, the final examination ought not to be left to the head master, and yet if the Middle School examination be abolished, who else is to do it? The case is different where the middle school is a department of a high school or college, for then the head master of the whole institution and the professors or assistants might conduct the annual examination, and for their own sake they would not allow unfit candidates to pass.

5. The argument is still stronger in the case of those schools where optional subjects are taken up. Many of these are technical. The Inspector, Assistant Inspector or Deputy Inspector may not be able to examine in these subjects. Probably the only man able to examine in them is the master who teaches them, and, as said before, he ought not to test his own work. If these subjects are dropped, as they very likely would be, the abolition of the Middle School examination, Government would in consequence stand committed to a distinctly retrograde movement as regards technical education.

6. For many years to come, the highest school in a taluk and in many a large town must be a middle school. The development of such an institution into a high school would involve the employment of three more teachers corresponding to the three years of a high school course, one (or more) of these teachers being a graduate, and the considerable additional expense which would be necessary a great number of these schools are not at present prepared to meet. If the Middle School examination be abolished, it is to be feared that some—probably many—of them will gradually decline to the primary standard, the richer or more promising boys going to large high schools in towns, and the others stopping short at the new Upper Primary examination, which is to qualify for the lower grades of Government service.

7. In the interests, therefore, of all these schools, which look to the Middle School examination as their final test, I would earnestly deprecate the abolition of this examination.

8. Next as regards recognition, I disagree *in toto* with Mr. Adam. His arguments are all directed against the school-fee notification rules. I am convinced that in the main those rules have been of the utmost benefit to education and to teachers. Mr. Adam advocates cheap education. Does he know that cheap education means education which is, in many cases, worthless, and in scarcely any case so good as that for which an adequate price is paid? Every educational officer of any experience in this country knows the state of things which existed previously to the introduction of the school-fee rules. Competition was gradually ruining all sound education. Good schools, of many years' standing, held in airy, comfortable and well-furnished buildings, and conducted by trained and efficient masters, were nearly emptied by "cheap" (and nasty) schools opened by adventurers, who took to the profession of teaching as a temporary means of making a living. When Government itself maintained high and middle schools all over the country, the evil was, to a great extent, lessened by the prestige attached to them as Government institutions; but Government withdrew from the management. It was just then that I was appointed to South Canara. I therefore speak of what I know. One of the five taluk middle schools in the district had gradually become extinct. Two more were on the point of following suit. One was struggling on with difficulty. The fifth alone was in a prosperous condition. The Local Boards to whom these schools were made over declined to spend any money on them. "All our funds," they said, "are wanted for primary education; these middle schools must be self-supporting, or must be closed." But, at the old rates at which fees were levied, they could not be self-supporting. The unfortunate masters were thoroughly disgusted. All who could left the department. Those who were obliged to stay had their pay reduced. In a couple of years, I am quite certain that only one, possibly two, of these schools would have been left. Then came the new fee rules. They were binding on all schools which wished to be recognized for the Middle School examination, and no school which did not send up boys for this examination would have had any pupils. All middle schools in the district and town of Mangalore adopted them. It was impossible for any one school to attract boys from other schools by charging lower fees.* The effect was almost magical. The income of most institutions was doubled. The hands of managers were strengthened. The pay of the teachers has gradually been raised, and will be raised still higher as Local Boards become impressed with the fact that all earnings of a school in the shape of fees and result grants from Provincial Funds must be spent on the school and not

* The only exception is the Municipal Middle School, which is obliged to levy a higher rate of fee than aided institutions, and is heavily handicapped in consequence. I hope to see this restriction, which I do not at all approve of, abolished on the next revision of the Fee rules three years hence.

diverted to other objects, such as roads and hospitals.* The five middle schools mentioned above are now, one and all, flourishing exceedingly.

9. If high schools not "recognized" be allowed to send up pupils for the High School examination, there cannot be the slightest doubt that the school-fee notification will gradually become a dead letter. One school will outbid another till teachers will be reduced to incomes which will bring them to the verge of starvation. Good men will quit the profession in disgust. One or two large institutions in the presidency town may hold on with the help of endowments or subscriptions, but even their resources will be severely crippled. What if a few enterprising graduates started a large school next door to Patcheappa's, and charged a rate of fee 25 or 50 per cent. less than is charged there and succeeded in passing a tolerably fair number of pupils? Would that institution retain its boys?

10. In one point I quite agree with Mr. Adam, who says, "The amount of difference (in the fee to be paid by a pupil and a private candidate) should be such as to be really effective." In the Middle School examination a private candidate pays three times as much. For the High School examination I should advocate that five times as much should be paid, that is, if the regular pupil pays Rs. 10, the private candidate should pay Rs. 50.

From M.R.Ry. C. NAGOJEE RAU, Pantulu Garu, B.A., Acting Inspector of Schools, Northern Circle, dated Bezvada, 14th November 1888.

The retention of the Middle School examination as a test for the public service will be unnecessary after the introduction of the High School examination; but, considering that such subjects as English composition, Translation, and Handwriting are generally neglected in the existing schools, the supply of passed high school candidates may not be sufficient for the requirements of the public service for some years to come. It will also take two or three years for managers of schools to make the changes in the teaching staff of their schools necessary for efficient instruction being given in the subjects prescribed for the High School examination. I would, therefore, propose the retention of the Matriculation examination together with the handwriting test as an examination qualifying for entrance into the public service until December 1892. This last test is decidedly superior to a first class in the Middle School examination.

2. As a test for class promotion, the Middle School examination no doubt serves a useful purpose. It checks indiscriminate promotion, which is sure to occur even in the best regulated schools, in the present unsatisfactory condition of rivalry between public schools and adventure schools. The Middle School examination may be replaced by a comparative examination of the upper fourth class, which may be conducted on the same lines as the present Middle School examination by the Inspector of Schools of each circle. To ensure the work being done well, Examiners should be paid and a small admission fee of Rs. 3 may be charged from all pupils of public schools applying for this comparative examination. If the institution of a comparative examination is not approved of, the only alternative that suggests itself to me as likely to check the promotion of undeserving boys from the middle to the high school is the instance of a middle school certificate granted by the Inspector of the Circle or by the Assistant Inspector, like the upper and lower primary certificates now granted by Deputy Inspectors.

From Mrs. BRANDER, Inspectress of Girls' Schools, Northern, Southern and Central Ranges, dated 24th November 1888.

The High School examination appears to have been framed to test the qualifications of those who have been educated for the Public service or for business, or for technical work. The majority of women, especially in India, do not enter into public life at all, hence the High School examination does not seem to be suited to them.

2. A small but increasing number of women in India become teachers, but, in the present backward condition of their education, only a small number are able to pass the Higher examination for Women, and but one or two are beginning to pass the Matriculation examination each year. The High School examination seems to be, on the whole, more difficult than the latter. I would, therefore, strongly recommend that, for the present at least, it should not be compulsory for secondary grade schoolmistresses to pass it.

3. The Special Upper Primary and the Middle School examinations and the Higher examination for Women seem to me to be fulfilling their purpose as tests of the education of girls and schoolmistresses and a very few of the most advanced girls are beginning to pass the Matriculation examination.

* I am in a separate letter reporting to you the case of one Taluk Board which last year "merged in general taluk funds" about 1,000 rupees earned by its middle school instead of spending that amount on the institution.

4. I would, therefore, strongly recommend that, for girls at least, none of the above examinations should be abolished, and that, for women, they should continue to be recognized as general education tests for teachers, clerks in telegraph and post offices, students in medical classes.

5. Should the High School examination be sanctioned, I would suggest for consideration whether advanced Domestic Economy and skilled Needlework should not be added to the optional subjects for female candidates.

6. As special rates of fees are not compulsory in most girls' schools, the present rules about recognition do not, I think, affect them at all. As regards the general question, I am strongly in favor of allowing to Managers as much freedom from departmental control as is compatible with efficiency in their schools.

7. I have as yet received but three of the opinions I invited. Miss Keely writes—

"I do not see that there is any provision for girls in it either special or general.

"The Middle School examination seems to have answered well, and the Higher examination for Women encourages the further study of those subjects that are fitted for Domestic and Home Life, while for preparation for more advanced study, the Matriculation examination opens the way for those who wish to go in for a collegiate course. I should be sorry if the Higher examination for Women should be done away with. It is a definite point to aim at,—a point, too, at which those who are not scholastically inclined may leave school, having acquired a moderate amount of general knowledge that may or ought to help them to be useful members of society.

"The Middle School examination offers an incentive to perfection (or at least a certain excellency) in needle-work, so necessary a part of a girl's education. Many who do not love work for work's sake would not take up this branch if there were not some such inducement, or this reason, as well as for others, I hope that the Middle School examination may be continued either as a preliminary to a higher education, or as a goal to be reached by those whose circumstances will not permit them to go any further.

"A Middle School certificate has hitherto qualified for admission either to the telegraph or post offices as well as to medical classes. It would be a pity if this ceased to be a qualifying test.

"If the new High School examination and the course of study required for it to be decided on for boys' schools, I would recommend the present system to be retained for girls, permitting them to go in for Middle School and the higher examinations passing through the Matriculation to a College course if desired."

Miss Govindarajulu is of opinion that until the education of caste girls attains a higher standard, the Middle School examination should be retained.

8. I beg to enclose in the original, letter No. 566, dated 21st November 1888, from the Rev. A. Margoschis, Manager of St. John's Female Normal School at Nazareth, and to state that I entirely agree with the views contained in it.

From Rev. A. MARGOSCHIS, Manager, St. John's Female Normal School, Nazareth, dated 21st November 1888, to the Inspectress of Girls' Schools.

In reply to your letter No. 3663, dated 8th November 1888, I have the honor to state:—

That the High School examination scheme does not appear to me to be suitable for introduction into girls' school of this Presidency, for female education is still in its infancy, and the Matriculation examination and higher examination for Women now answer all the requirements for the same. Female education is entirely on a different footing to that of males, and the causes which have led to the desirability of a High School examination for males do not exist amongst females. Literary education amongst native girls has not made much progress, and at any rate, there is no probability in the near future of the market being surfeited with girl matriculates as in the case of males, so that I do not think the High School examination is required for girls. The optional subjects, moreover, for this examination are, as a rule, not suitable for females.

2. The retention of the Middle School examination is of vital interest to the cause of female education. The standard of education amongst girls is much lower than that amongst boys, and there are many and various difficulties which prevent mushroom growth in the education of females in India. Nor, indeed, in such a course desirable were it possible. Many girls have to be content with the Special Upper Primary examination, and especially Hindus and Mahamadanans. A few more, with great difficulty, go on for the Middle School examination, and their number is gradually increasing. The abolition of the latter examination at this juncture would give a decisive blow to female education, and would be great discouragement to the teachers and the taught. Girls who read for Matriculation are also better prepared in every way by having previously passed the Middle School examination. It is an important link in the chain, and I earnestly hope in the cause of female education in this Presidency that it will be retained.

3. The present system of recognition should be observed.

From E. B. HAVELL, Esq., Superintendent, School of Arts, Madras, dated 11th December 1888, No. 729.

With reference to your Proceedings, No. 7752, dated 23rd October 1888, I have the honor to state that as regards Drawing it would not be advisable to substitute a school examination for the present Middle School examination. The standard in the latter is already higher than in the first-grade examination of the Science and Art Department, South Kensington.

2. With regard to the effect of the whole scheme, I would state that any form of Government recognition of the importance of the school-work in the drawing departments will further the object for which the school was instituted, and without such recognition little progress can be hoped for. Even in England, where they have been in existence for more than 40 years and are placed in far more favorable circumstances, Schools of Art are dependent to a very great extent on Government aid and encouragement. Every candidate, even in the first-grade examination, who obtains the mark "excellent" receives a Government prize, which is generally supplemented by a local prize fund. The Government payments on the results generally amount to half the total income of the school. If Government aid were withdrawn, half the Schools of Art in England would be closed at once.

3. The Bombay School of Art is supported by endowments and by the demand for drawing teachers which the Government has itself created by offering liberal grants and prizes to encourage art instruction. Prizes are awarded in the Government examinations, and the school is endowed with handsome prize funds. The Lahore School is also mainly supported by its endowments.

4. In the drawing examinations of this school there are no Government prizes for students to compete for, and there is no private prize fund of any kind. The present prospects of employment as drawing teachers to students of the school are very limited, and, unless the expectations which the recent notifications have created are realised, I do not expect that the present attendance in the drawing classes will be maintained. No doubt a decline in the drawing classes would not much affect the industrial side of the school, but no other Schools of Art in India and very few in Europe are devoted to Industrial work to the same extent as this school.

From Miss E. CARR, Superintendent, Presidency Training School for Mistresses, Madras, dated 3rd December 1888, No. 339.

I do not think it will be advisable to abolish the Middle School examination, especially in the case of girls. Both boys and girls who have passed this examination must have acquired a fair amount of general knowledge, although of an elementary character, and they are thus better prepared to study the various subjects, in a more advanced form, for higher examinations. Again both teachers and managers are only now becoming used to the present system, and to make such changes as would be involved by abolishing the Middle School examination, would thus be a serious check to elementary education generally.

2. The comparative examinations now conducted by school Managers, might be sufficient for purposes of promotion, but I do not think they would ensure the same amount of progress, chiefly because of the greater value everywhere attached to the fact of passing a public examination.

3. To do away with this examination would, however, be a far greater check to female education, especially in its present stage. There is a great deal being said now about the necessity for the higher education of Hindu women, but this can only come through elementary education. Very few Eurasian girls, and hardly any native Christians reach the Matriculation standard, even with the advantage of knowing English; but it is only now that Hindu girls, of whom a small proportion know even a very little English, are beginning to remain in school long enough to pass the Special Upper Primary examination. Very few are induced by scholarships and with the hope of qualifying as teachers to remain for the Middle School examination, and still fewer for the Higher Examination for Women. But even this is a step in the right direction and I would therefore strongly advocate the retention of all these examinations, at all events for native girls, and for some time to come.

4. The recognition of schools is a matter which appears to affect girls' school to a very small degree, but from a general point of view it appears to me that it is advisable to allow as much liberty of action as possible to Managers, providing that they avail themselves of such liberty only for the promotion of education generally.

From T. R. SCOTT, Esq., B.A., Acting Head Master, Government College, Mangalore, dated 8th November 1888.

The retention of the Middle School Examination.—The High School and Elementary Public Service examinations are contemplated, together with the B.A. degree examination of the Madras

University to cover all existing ordinary appointments in the Uncovenanted Civil Service. Hence when the examinations now proposed to be instituted are thoroughly established there will manifestly be no room for the Middle School examination as a service test. It will take some time however before the machinery now existing for the purposes of higher secondary education can be modified and adapted to the requirements of the High School examination and put into proper working order; and till that is done, it will be advisable to continue the Middle School examination as a service test. To abruptly extinguish it as such will be reckoned a hardship under the circumstances. I am of opinion therefore that a first-class certificate in this examination should, for a few years, be accepted as qualifying for admission to Government service, until proper facilities have been established in the various districts of the Presidency for enabling persons to qualify themselves for the High School examination. Further, though the Middle School examination should in a short time cease to be a direct avenue to the Public Service, I am not of opinion that it should be abolished altogether. I would strongly recommend that it be continued as a preliminary and a very necessary preliminary to the High School examination, while serving collaterally for purpose of class promotion. The advantages to be derived from this arrangement are: (1) that the examination, by controlling the admission of persons to the High School and to the High School examination indirectly and at an early stage, regulates the admission of persons into Government service, and as the possession of a Middle School certificate is, in the generality of cases, a guarantee that the holder thereof has been trained in a "recognised" school under the most approved methods of education, it secures a better qualified set of candidates for the High School examination and thence for Government service than would otherwise be obtained; (2) that it will reduce the examination work of the High School examination very considerably by excluding from admission a large number of unqualified persons who undoubtedly would, if there were no such preliminary test to go through, rush in for the service test after a few years of private study, or inadequate training, when they are probably just fit to enter an upper IVth class; (3) that it will strengthen the cause and help the better development of secondary education in its lower stages.

2. *The Policy of Recognition.*—In regard to the general policy of the recognition system, I hold with the members of the High School examination committee that it is absolutely essential in the present condition of the people; and in reference to the High School examination in particular, I think it very necessary that the policy of recognition should be maintained.

It must be admitted that it is "one of the most sacred duties of Government, if it does not itself provide, at least to ensure to the people educating agencies which fulfil all the conditions which are necessary for the healthful development, intellectual, physical and moral, of the youth of the country;" and the system of recognition seems best calculated to secure that end without loss to the State.

Again it must be allowed that Government when it institutes a general service test, has a right, in order to secure the best men for the various branches of its service, to restrict admission to the test, as far as possible, to those who, on passing it, are likely to be best qualified in the fullest sense of the term for Government service, and there can be no better guarantee for the possession of such fitness in those who enter service, than the fact that they have been trained in institutions which are approved by Government and are indirectly under its control, and where education is imparted under the most favorable conditions. Hence it follows that the rules for admission to the test should be such as to encourage those who are desirous of passing it to undergo the requisite training in a "recognised" institution, and to discourage though not altogether exclude, those who are unwilling to go through such training from appearing for the examination. To achieve this end it is proposed to charge the latter class of persons a higher admission fee, but the difference of fee should be very much higher than Rs. 10 to be sufficiently prohibitory, and serve its purpose at all, and it would not be advisable to charge any one a very high admission fee. It seems to me therefore that in the matter of fees all candidates should be placed on an equal footing and that it would be much better to impose an age limit as a substitute for the differential fee. It is desirable that all persons below the age of eighteen should not appear for the examination without undergoing a proper training in a recognised school. I would therefore propose that all candidates below eighteen years of age be required to appear as *pupils* as defined by the notification. This will prevent a large number of boys who pass the Middle School examination between the ages of thirteen and fifteen from endeavoring to rush through the High School course in as short a time as possible by private study or in "adventure schools" and appear for the High School examination as "other persons;" while it will not exclude persons above eighteen from the benefit of a regular training in a proper High School if they choose to enter one. It is manifest also that a rule of this kind will also considerably "strengthen the hands of Managers."

From C. C. FLANAGAN, Esq., M.A., late Principal, Coimbatore College, dated 16th October 1888.

In my opinion the Middle School examination should still be retained, not as a test qualifying for Government service, but as a guarantee for, and a gauge of, work done in all institutions

aided by Government, and further, as a check upon the constantly increasing number of so-called free schools wherein harm rather than good is being done to the cause of education.

It seems to me that it would be an anomaly to allow a first-class pass in the Middle School test to qualify a student for Government service when a pass in the Matriculation examination does not; and therefore I would like to see the above-said examination cease in every sense to be a qualifying test. But it has a distinct value and importance of its own as a factor in educational work, coming as it does about mid-way between the Upper Primary and Matriculation examinations. I consider that it is of essential importance that there should be some means by which Government and the public may, apart from school and other reports which often are of doubtful value, see for themselves tangible proofs of what education is doing. The publication of Upper Primary examination results yearly secures this end so far as primary education is concerned, the Matriculation lists are a satisfactory gauge of high school work; and I hold that the Middle School test should be retained in the same way and for the same purpose in connection with the work of middle schools. If it were done away with, the long lapse of time between the Upper Primary and all Matriculation examinations would produce indifference in both teachers and taught, the motive and incentive to industrious application, which the Middle School examination supplies, would be removed. I would further suggest that the Middle School examination be made compulsory on all students of recognized and unrecognized schools alike. This can be done, and ought to be done, by making the production of a certificate of having passed the Middle School examination a *sine qua non* of admission as a candidate to the High School test. This will be no arbitrary exercise of authority, and there will be no security in it. Government has a perfect right to lay down the conditions under which alone it is prepared to admit candidates as competitors for its emoluments and awards. The difference in fees charged to pupils and non-pupils is "no punishment" of the latter, as it has been termed, inasmuch, as the higher rate does not fall upon them at all, but is so much taken away from the pockets of Managers of unrecognized institutions, who have to charge lower fees to recoup the students for the higher rate charged on them at admission to the Middle School examination.

At present not only are promotions from the Upper IVth to the Vth made indiscriminately from passed and unpassed students, but, in many cases, native high schools do not send up their boys at all to the Middle School examination, and the result is that our VIth classes are filled with boys who are not fit for their position and the University at Matriculation has to examine more than twice the number of candidates, who might, under a more rigid rule, be considered fit to present themselves. To check this state of things I think it absolutely necessary that the candidates for the Middle School examination should be compelled to produce certificates of fitness signed by the Headmasters and that promotions to the High School department be made strictly in accordance with the results of the examination, no unpassed student under any circumstances being allowed to go up to the Vth class.

The reason why at the present time promotions are not strictly made from passed student is that there is a reasonable doubt about the suitability of the Middle School examination as a test of the fitness of students for such promotions. This, in its turn, is due to the fact that the examination has become unmanageably great in its proportions, the number of candidates being so large. But this would, at once, be checked by the institution of such a rule as I have mentioned; and, while the number of examinees would be greatly lessened, I believe the percentage of passes would be increased, for the classes would be smaller and more select and the teachers would be able to do more satisfactory work.

I think that the Matriculation Examination should be retained as a qualifying test for Government service till the year 1891, that it should then cease to be so, and that the F.A. Examination be made in itself absolutely a qualification for Government service. In this way alone can we hope that the students at our disposal will be fairly distributed between the two branches. The F.A. course, it is true, is 4 years, while that for the high school is only three; but I do not think that this will materially affect the case, but I anticipate that the numbers will be pretty equally divided between the High School and F.A. Examinations. If the F.A. examination were to cease to be a qualifying test I apprehend that an immediate rush would be made to the new high school classes, and that great injury would be done to the University, inasmuch as the Arts classes would be abandoned except by a very few.

It is probable, I am afraid, that in a large number of cases in the native High Schools and in some cases in Aided Institutions, an attempt will be made to combine the two courses in one. The native high schools would in the 2nd year after the middle school send up their boys to matriculation, and then still keeping on the students of their 6th class who would otherwise leave at this time, they would teach for another year the special subjects necessary for the High School examination. I do not think that such a combination of the two schemes is likely to conduce to success in either of the examinations, but we know how prone native students are to trust to chances, and it is my opinion that 90 out of 100 would be attracted to such schools as would give them the chance of a shot at the matriculation on their way to the high school test.

That such combination is not impossible, I think will be seen when it is recollected that for both the Matriculation and High School examinations the compulsory subjects are generally the same, and that of three optional subjects required for the latter *Chemistry* is common to both the courses and that *Mensuration* will not need much time to master by students who have already been taught the principles of Geometry.

From Rev. J. BERTHO, Principal, St. Joseph's College, Cuddalore, dated 20th October 1888.

The Middle School examination is a great stimulus to pupils. From the time that they commenced reading to the time when they will appear for the High School examination, it is a long while, covering in most cases a period of ten years. Though in the interval they have some examinations for promotion, the significance attaching to them is comparatively trifling, while the Middle School examination is sure to give to the minds of young pupils habits of moral restraint, obedience to authority and regular attendance.

2. There are also reasons from the point of view of the managers of schools, which lead to the same conclusion in favor of the continuance of the Middle School examination. The finance of the Middle School department is at present in a fair equilibrium; attendance is regular; students do not often decamp from school to school. Will it be so after the abolition of the Middle School examination?

3. The Middle School examination being discontinued, then there will be no proper test for promoting students. It is not necessary to dilate upon that topic. Every manager will at once comprehend the difficulties and trials he will have to undergo, specially in places where there are rival schools.

As regards the conditions of the system of recognition, the correct position seems to be whether recognised schools do not guarantee better teaching and discipline than the unrecognised ones. The question being put thus, a fair conclusion is that between recognition and non-recognition the former is most preferable.

From Rev. C. W. A. CLARK, Principal, Noble College, Masulipatam, dated 30th November 1888.

With reference to your Proceedings, No. 7752, of 23rd October, I have the honor to state that I am of opinion that the Middle School examination should certainly be retained as a Government test of proficiency before students are allowed to proceed further towards the High School examination. If there is no such test between the Upper Primary and the final High School examination, which should involve a period of some six years, there will be a perfect chaos of classes amongst the adventure schools, which are sure to spring up, if a living can be made out of them; this will render it difficult for good schools to maintain a high standard by refusing promotion to pupils, and are unfit for a higher class, as they will simply go off to another school.

I am further of opinion that the system of recognition of certain schools by the department to the disadvantage of unrecognised schools should be maintained as a guarantee of efficiency. But that that recognition should depend as little as possible upon the fulfilment of harassing regulations, and cast-iron rules, where a school has proved itself worthy of recognition by efficiency and good management.

There is no reason why, with a competent staff of Inspectors and Deputy Inspectors, a considerable amount of freedom and self-government should not be allowed to recognise schools; or why recognition should prove a burden too serious to be incurred by any honest manager.

From Rev. L. B. WOLF, M.A., Principal, A. E. L. M. College, Guntur, dated 29th September 1888.

While I am fully convinced of the wisdom of a practical side of education, I am not so sure that the plan proposed, which cannot help disarranging existing methods to an alarming extent, is the best under existing circumstances. In a country like this deliberation, in floating any scheme, should have a first place. Coming from a land, where any change which has for its end the settlement of existing methods, is rather easily wrought on account of the general intelligence of the people, I am yet of the opinion that even there a change, so far reaching in its results, would not be thought of as possible, without a great deal more time than that which is proposed in this scheme. Our up-country schools are just beginning to show vigorous life, and I greatly fear that this new scheme will throw us back and materially affect our schools well-being. Natives have become pretty well satisfied with the existing tests for entrance into Government service; but now the new scheme will, if adopted, to a great extent dislocate all existing tests, and what is still worse the schools, by which these tests were made effective. It were better by

far to modify the existing University Matriculation examination and then encourage schools in different parts of the country to open classes for instruction in the optional subjects; three of which could be easily passed in one year, after a three years' high school course. But you have not asked me for my opinion on the general scheme. To the points under request, I would reply:—

1. *As to retaining the Middle School Examination as a test for Government Service.*—I am of opinion that it should not continue to qualify. This seems to me only fair and just to Matriculation and F.A. boys with whom certainly, in attainments, you cannot compare a 1st-class Middle School boy.

There should be no side-bate to tempt a clever boy's parents to compel their son to discontinue his course of study at so early a stage. Every one who knows anything about the practical working of a school will agree that both for Government ends and for the University and higher educational ends, all lads who can pass 1st class in Middle School should by all means be encouraged to prosecute their studies to the degree examination. These are the men who will make our best teachers if they chose that work, and if they enter Government service, certainly the advantage is evident. Again it would look very strange to allow a first class Middle School lad a place in the Government of such service and shut out first class, and all F.As. I cannot help remarking here that I have not yet found any royal way to get the boys into the possession of a working knowledge of English, and knowing what proficiency lads of average ability show after they have reached their F.A. and how they can talk and write plain, idiomatic English after a four years' course, I am at a loss to see how the new scheme shall be able to produce, what is expected of it in a three years' course. What sort of an example in "advanced composition," can an average F.A. write? We who teach them and examine their work know only too well. If you exclude the F.A. boy then, you cannot in justice allow any one much lower yet to qualify by an examination which does not compare at all with this. I am fully in agreement that for the general good of education, there should be a uniform examination for middle school, but that the heads of institutions should have large concessions granted as regards promotions.

2. *As to retaining the Matriculation Examination as a qualifying test,* I would say that I would do so with certain modifications both of it as the test and of the examination itself. It is just here, I think that this whole new scheme breaks down. Any one who is actively engaged in teaching cannot help seeing that with an extension of one year of the Matriculation examination and a slight modification of a curriculum of study all the ends contemplated in the compulsory branches of the new examination can be attained without very materially interfering with the present arrangement of our schools. If matriculates, who have reached, say, 45 per cent. in English, and 35 per cent. or less, say 30 per cent. in other branches and in total were alone qualified for Government service, it seems to me it would re-act most favorably on our schools, and be a prize to which every boy strives. After having this certificate, boys should be required to enter some school and pass in not less than 3 optional subjects as the scheme proposes and the end of the new scheme would be secured without half the friction which is bound to result from the proposed manner of carrying out the scheme. This, too, would allow lads a better chance to make choice between the University and Government service, and I may just say here, that the most objectionable feature of the whole scheme, is the early age at which it contemplates bifurcation. But if so serious a modification of the plan is too much to be hoped for, then, at all events, it should not be deemed too much for Government to grant that the matriculation should be retained as qualifying test for at least 6 or 7 years yet. This will allow backward districts time to work up to the scheme and will also enable the boys to get the lay of the ground, and learn somewhat of the character of the contemplated New High School examination. To encourage the High School examination it can be notified that in the event of two lads applying for a post, other things being equal, preference shall be given to the New High School man. Some such plan as this, would give us time to adjust ourselves to the new arrangement and would prevent much dissatisfaction, which is sure to result from so sudden a stoppage as that proposed, as 1891. By-and-bye many schools could see their way to introduce three or more of the optional branches, and as finances were forthcoming more could be added. It seems impossible that so far-reaching a scheme should be seriously entertained, and urged upon the community at once when so many things point against it.

3. *As to the system of recognition which is contemplated,* I am in the main issue in agreement with Mr. Adam. If a school wishes to support itself it should receive every encouragement. With the meagre grants, which are at Government disposal, it should certainly welcome, by all means, the private body which is willing to undertake such work. It is not a bit logical to act as the system contemplates, and it is to say the least unfair to punish the boy, who through poverty is driven to a school where fees are lower, by making him pay twice as much fee for his examination. If the Government is willing to give its grants to those who are willing to meet its demands, no one can complain, but it is a different question altogether, to compel schools to accept recognition by making a distinction in favor of recognised pupils as to marks and fees. It seems Government saw the evident injustice of requiring more marks, why follow the fee difference, it should cancel the difference in fees for examinations. As to the vital question of sanitation it should be placed under the district Health Officer with full power to act in all matters relating to school sanitation. I know schools which have been recognised, whose building

do not in the least fulfil the conditions of sanitation, and I am sure the question of health and sanitation will not receive the attention it deserves until it be made the duty of Health Officer of the district to look into that question. I fully agree with Mr. Adam that all difference in fee for the new examination should be cancelled.

From Rev. A. MARGOSCHIS, Manager of Schools, Nazareth, dated 22nd November 1888.

I am in favor of the High School scheme, and regard it as the only *modus vivendi* in the present surfeit of literary education, which has been done to death in this Presidency. The cry of Managers who appear to think that their occupation will be gone when the High School examination is sanctioned, appears to be grounded on a fallacy, viz., that their colleges and schools will be ruined. For one year at the commencement of the working of the High School examination the shoe will pinch, but, unless I am mistaken, it is far better that the difficulty should be faced now than that the evils which the High School examination will remove, should be allowed to go on and to increase. All agree that some remedy is necessary, and the only reasonable and practicable scheme is one such as that proposed, and there is no alternative. The natural dread of change seems to be the chief reason why Managers I have met object to the scheme.

2. With regard to the retention of the Middle School examination, I think it is most important to keep it intact. It is especially valuable for class promotion, which cannot be left to the discretion of Managers themselves, who often promote boys according to their age and to the time they have been in a class instead of according to merit alone.

3. Especially is it important to retain the Middle School examination in connection with Art, Industrial and Technical schools. I have had considerable experience in this particular branch of education; and I must say that the Middle School examination scheme is almost as perfect as it is possible to make it, and more particularly when regarded as a step leading up to the High School examination. It would very much increase our difficulties, instead of lightening them, if there were no Government examination like that of the Middle School before the High School examination; or the Higher examinations in Science, Art and Industries. The Middle School examination now prepares the pupils and acts as a spur and stimulus to them to prosecute their work, which encouragement would not exist if the examination were abolished, and the Managers of schools would have to provide a substitute, which would probably not work so well as the present plan adopted by Government, and it has been found by experience to work very well.

4. I have just returned from a tour in the Bombay Presidency, where there is no Middle School examination or its equivalent, and the result, as it appeared to me, is that pupils who are not eligible are promoted to the High School classes, and the percentage of failures in the Matriculation examination is proportionately large. If there were a Middle School examination there, it would act as a check to premature promotion, and pupils would be better prepared for the higher classes. I saw many young men of 20 and upwards going in for the Matriculation, who in this Presidency would have been reading for the F. A. examination or their degree. This I attribute to the absence of an examination like our Middle School.

5. For female education in this Presidency it is of vital importance that the Middle School examination should be retained. The standard of education amongst girls is much lower than that amongst boys, and there are many and various difficulties which prevent mushroom growth in the education of females in India. Nor, indeed, is such a course desirable, were it possible. Many girls have to be content with the Special Upper Primary examination, and especially Hindus and Muhammadans. A few more with great difficulty go on for the Middle School examination, and their number is gradually increasing. The abolition of the latter examination at this juncture would give a decisive blow to female education, and would be a great discouragement to the teachers and the taught. Girls who read for Matriculation are also better prepared in every way by having previously passed the Middle School examination. It is an important link in the chain, and I earnestly hope in the cause of female education in this Presidency that it will be retained.

6. I think that the present system of "Recognition" should be retained.

7. In conclusion, I beg to submit—

- (1) that the High School examination Scheme is most necessary to provide relief for the present deadlock in literary education;
- (2) that the Middle School examination should be retained, because—
 - (a) it is the best test for class promotion, which cannot safely be left to the Managers, and it serves as a great stimulus to the pupils to have to pass a Government examination of this kind;
 - (b) it is a most necessary preliminary step for the Higher examinations in Science, Art and Industries, and for the proposed High School examination;
 - (c) it is necessary for the welfare of female education as many girls are obliged to finish their education before passing a higher examination.

From Rev. J. W. FOLEY, M.A., Principal, Bishop Corrie's Grammar School, Madras, dated 10th October 1888.

In answer to your communication, No. 6578, of the 6th September 1888, inviting the opinion of Managers of Aided schools "as regards the advisability or not of retaining the Middle School examination in case the High School examination scheme is sanctioned," I write to say that I am strongly in favor of the Middle School examination being retained on the grounds—

- (i) that it affords a public guarantee that a boy is fit for promotion and is in a position to commence a more advanced course of study;
- (ii) that it acts as a check upon the system of unscrupulous promotion which results from undue competition between schools and the now increasing number of private adventure schools. If it is done away with, boys, especially Hindus, will simply go where they can get promotion quickest into the High School classes. Private adventure schools seem to draw largely from those students who cannot obtain promotion. With regard to the recognition of high schools, I am of opinion that the conditions should be strict and that no schools should be recognized unless the Government scale of fees be adhered to from the IVth A Class upwards. Below that class schools might be allowed to charge what fee they pleased. Special concessions might be allowed in poor districts.

From Rev. J. P. JONES, Manager, American Mission High School, Madura, dated 26th November 1888.

In the event of the High School scheme being carried through it seems to me wise to abolish the Government Middle School examination, as the former will practically remove the cause for which the latter was established. The great cost of conducting and consequently of entering this examination is also a strong reason for discontinuing it. I am also of opinion that should it be given up the standard of excellence would be increased on the whole in the students as I hardly think many Managers or Principals would promote boys who did not pass a better examination than many 3rd-class Middle School certificated boys now have done.

2. In reference to Mr. Adam's minute of dissent, I have the honor to state that I disagree with him in both his positions. I have much sympathy with him in his objection to the suddenness with which the service test of Matriculation examination is to be abolished and would like to see the new scheme inaugurated more gradually. *Festina lente*. Still I apprehend that to make a first-class Matriculation pass a partial qualification to the new service test for 10 or 15 years will satisfy no body. The numbers of examinees who will succeed will be so few; or more properly those who fail will be so many, that they will be under the necessity, after, say, even 3 years of study in the High School department, to go back and start in the bifurcated course *de novo* or give up in despair. I am sure that nearly all boys, if they mean to qualify themselves at all for the Government test, would prefer to start early and directly for that examination which is intended to qualify them for that test.

Nor will Mr. Adam's scheme help the Managers, as boys will not easily trust themselves to the contingency (and this a not probable one) of a 1st-class Matriculation pass as even a partial qualification. They will rightly clamour for the new course and will leave that school which does not provide it. Why then adopt a system which will be a painful compromise and will prolong the agony which it is meant to diminish?

3. As regards Mr. Adam's remarks on recognized schools they are sapient enough and probably apply well to his own unrecognized institution. But all unrecognized schools are not Pachaiyappa's institutions; nor do few of them continue unrecognized for the same reason or reasons as Mr. Adam's. In the present state of mofussil institutions the "recognized" system is a very good and necessary one as it aids materially in diminishing those numerous adventure schools which are a curse to well-organized but struggling schools and a bane to the true educational interests of the country.

I think, however, that some of the conditions of recognition are unduly severe and I should be glad to see that clause about submitting to inspection "current endowment and trust accounts" expunged. I think this would both appease the friends of such institutions as Pachaiyappa's and meet the demands of justice.

From M.R.Ry. C. BASHYAM AIYANGAR, Headmaster, High School, Chittoor, dated 1st December 1888.

In reply to your Proceedings, No. 7752, dated 23rd October 1888, requiring the views of the masters of the High School, Chittoor, regarding the retention or otherwise of the Middle School examination after the High School examination should come into force, and whether the policy of

recognition referred to in Mr. Adam's minute of dissent should be maintained, I have the honor to submit:—

- (1) That the Middle School examination may cease to be a service test after 1895.
- (2) That a candidate should secure a pass in the Middle School examination in order to be entitled to apply for the High School examination.
- (3) That the Middle School examination may continue to be a test for promotion to the 5th class.
- (4) That a 1st-class Middle School certificate be accepted as an equivalent to a Fourth-Grade Teacher's Certificate.
- (5) That the 3rd-class of the Middle School examination be dispensed with in order to prevent pupils of very low acquirements from going up to the 5th class.
- (6) That the middle examination serves as a very useful public test of the lower secondary education, and tends to prevent any great inequality among schools imparting instruction up to that standard.
- (7) That, in the interest of sound elementary education it seems indispensable that the conditions of recognition laid down in the High School examination should be enforced with strictness for at least a number of years to come.
- (8) That the conditions of recognition referred to have a most salutary effect, in raising the tone of the schools accepting recognition, and that the unrecognized private schools, with the exception of some very few, are generally adventure schools which only tend to create a very unhealthy competition with other schools, and there are many of them so bad in discipline and the instruction which they do profess to impart that they do not deserve the name of "schools."

From M.R.Ry. S. KRISHNASWAMY IYER, B.A., Headmaster, Town High School, Kumbakonam, dated 30th November 1888.

I am of opinion that the institution of the High School examination renders the Middle School examination unnecessary. It will be good, for the interests of education, to abolish the Middle School test. Thirteen may be taken as the average age of boys on entering the upper fourth class. At this age the most promising boys do not possess that precision of knowledge, and that precision in the expression of their ideas (especially in a foreign tongue), which are presupposed by a written examination. In consequence of this, cramming has to be looked up to by teachers and pupils for the sake of success. Cramming is felt to be the more necessary as the quantity of knowledge that has to be hurried through, for the Middle School examination is too much in proportion to the age and standard of the candidates. I have known many instances in which pupils of the upper fourth class have learnt nothing well, inasmuch as they were forced to learn many things at once; nay, the case is sometimes worse; pupils who have been progressing steadily in their studies till they reached the upper fourth class have been known to become quite bewildered by being presented with so many subjects of examination on entering the upper fourth: the enervation of intellect caused by the unnatural training in the upper fourth class spoils many a boy for all time to come, it being a fact that after the introduction of the Middle School examination, the Town High School has not been able to obtain as good materials for its 5th and 6th classes as in the years anterior to the institution of the Middle School examination. I beg to submit that no examination need be substituted for the Middle School test, as it would be a better and a safer course to regulate promotions from the upper fourth class partly by the personal knowledge possessed by the teachers of the fitness of their pupils for promotion, and partly by the results of a school examination. It is a fact that every year a considerable number of undeserving lads pass the Middle School examination and a considerable number of deserving lads fail.

I believe the principle of recognition is a sound one; but it should be enforced in such a manner as not to unduly affect unrecognized schools. The advantage given to recognised schools in the shape of lower application fees is quite enough. It would be carrying the principle of recognition too far if pupils of unrecognized schools are subjected to a higher minimum of passing marks in addition to having to pay higher application fees. When two candidates, one from a recognized and the other from an unrecognized school, obtain the same number of marks, it would seem unfair to declare one as having passed and the other failed.

From M.R.Ry. B. KRISHNAYAR, Secretary, School Committee, Cuddalore, dated 14th November 1888.

An examination such as that now proposed is necessary, because, in the present state of general education, the Matriculation Examination is too low a standard to be of much service as a general public service test; because it is opposed to the true interests of education to make the

University the manufacturer of public servants, at the various stages of school-life at which boys are tested as a mere passport for their advancement towards the obtainment of a degree; and also because the F.A. Examination, by the extent of knowledge it requires to be brought up in Mathematics, will be too unjust a requisition to make from those aspiring to enter the public service of which the greatest number of appointments cannot require even a hundredth part of this learning.

2. But if this examination is to have any significance, and if it is to be worth the ambition of aspiring young men, it is necessary it should not *prima facie* appear as in any way inferior to the University examinations, which its allocation into the high school will obviously tend to declare. Judged according to the number of years' course as at present, it is inferior even to the F.A. Examination; and it seems inexpedient that a general education test, which is calculated to serve also as a final public service test, should have affixed to it its own stamp of inferiority. Besides, to force it into the school is to shake the present educational foundations, which might better be left to be altered and adjusted naturally by the effect which a declared public service test for all offices under Government will produce on impecunious parents and grown-up young men of average intelligence. Such was the effect produced in its own day, by the now exploded general test; and even as those wishing to become pleaders have turned away from the special tests to the test instituted by the High Court; those desiring to secure the qualifications for employment in the public service will certainly take the way nearer and less costly. Managers now startled, because of the element of *force* in the scheme will be silently driven by the law of supply and demand to reconcile themselves to the inevitable. No manager has ever thought it within his sphere to protest against the 25 years' rule, as tending to affect the cause of higher education; or against the rule granting exemption from passing any examination as discouraging school study; or against the rule that unpassed men may be employed by Local Boards as an injustice to their passed pupils. No manager will be in order in protesting against an examination instituted by Government to secure efficient servants. When the scheme is thus familiarized, it will bring about its own reaction.

3. I therefore consider that the institution of an examination to be called otherwise than the High School examination is all that is now necessary. It should be open to all alike above a certain age. It should appear as in no way inferior to the B.A. or F.A. examination in the acquisition of general knowledge. It should be a less costly concern. Let by all means the B.A. and the F.A., with the translation and *précis*-writing tests, and both with the hand-writing test be declared as good as the new examination. This will in no way be held as aiming at anything and let the managers be left to see what is best for them in the circumstances.

4. The Middle School examination will now become superfluous. Whatever its merits as a public service test, its influence on the school-boys has been baneful. It has subjected many of them to a high-pressure schooling. But for this examination no manager would ever have thought of subjecting the upper fourth class boys to a study of the whole of Indian History and the whole of Geography and the whole of English Grammar. It may well be done away with.

5. The power of recognizing institutions should exist. Some such power is exercised by the University in the case of colleges, and it has not been protested against. For the same reasons, a similar power should be exercised even here. It is of the utmost importance that our future citizens, who are also to become public servants, should be trained in institutions both capable and efficient,—capable to impart the proper instruction, and efficient in imparting the necessary moral tone which adventure schools cannot be trusted to effect. Higher education, unlike the primary education, will greatly suffer if left to have a mushroom origin and growth.

(True Copies.)

(Signed) H. B. GRIGG,
Director of Public Instruction.

From H. B. GRIGG, Esq., M.A., Director of Public Instruction, Madras, to the Chief Secretary to Government, dated Madras, 19th February 1889, No. 1439.

I have been favored with a copy of the memorial submitted to Government by the representatives of aided education and others, protesting vigorously against the High School examination scheme, as contained in G.O., No. 401, dated 11th July 1888. As this protest comes from a very important body of educationists whose views demand the careful consideration of Government, I beg to make the following very brief remarks in addition to what I have said incidentally as regards the High School examination scheme in my letter, No. 1242, dated 14th instant.

2. Before proceeding any further, it is desirable to know how far the views expressed in the memorial referred to above reflect fully and accurately the views of

the representatives of aided education. From G.O., No. 557, dated 24th September 1888, recording the letter from the Rev. J. Patterson, Secretary to the Executive Council on Aided education, I infer that the original circular of the Council was sent out to all managers of aided High Schools and Colleges throughout the Presidency and that this memorial is the outcome of the circular. The signatures attached to the memorial, however, show that the Council had solicited the opinion and co-operation of representatives of unaided institutions, of educationists and missionaries in Native States such as Mysore, Travancore and Cochin, and even of men entirely unconnected with education, e.g., vakils and clerks in Government offices. Roughly speaking the representatives of over 300 institutions must have been consulted. In the Madras Presidency, the number of aided and unaided upper secondary institutions alone amount to 103, and if Board schools are added, the number is 127. Aided and unaided colleges number 21. The signatures attached to the memorial represent 55 different High schools in the Presidency and 15 colleges. The other names are those of professors and teachers in institutions included in the above institutions and of missionaries most of whom are not directly connected with secondary education. Whilst fully admitting the value and importance of the opinions expressed by such an able body of educationists as is represented by the majority of those who have signed the memorial, I cannot help observing that the views embodied in the memorial can by no means be looked upon as reflecting fully and faithfully the *general* opinion of the representatives of aided secondary education. This is fully borne out by the analysis above given.

3. The memorial now submitted is only a reiteration, almost in identical language, of the views expressed in the circular letter of the Executive Council on aided education, a copy of which was forwarded to me by Government. In two important points, however, the memorial differs from the original circular. In the former there is no reference whatever made to the recognition system which the Council in paragraph 6 of their circular letter seem to have objected too strongly. This omission is significant as indicating the real attitude of the "representatives of aided education" as regards "recognition" and shows that the views of the Council on this subject are not endorsed by those who are directly concerned with aided secondary education. The other point of difference is that in the memorial, Government are requested "to withhold sanction from the proposed scheme" and to deal with the whole question *de novo* with the help of a truly representative Committee; whereas in the letter the Council without giving their approval to the whole scheme (*vide* paragraph 11-b) recommended at least its adoption in a modified form and suggest the institution of "an examination of such a nature as to foster commercial and technical education." The criticism of schemes is comparatively easy, but I would add that the course suggested in the memorial, if given effect to, would practically amount to postponing indefinitely the introduction of any measure calculated to qualify youths for practical life. I do not claim for the scheme proposed freedom from imperfection in detail, but I do claim for it the merit of being a well conceived and logical plan, and also that, as yet, it holds the field; and I do sincerely trust that Government will continue to give their support to its main features and not allow the present opposition to lead to their abandonment of a measure well fitted to remedy what they admit to be a most serious shortcoming in the present system of education. The whole scheme now under discussion is the outcome of the recommendations of the Education Commission, and as pointed out in my letter No. O-179, dated 4th July 1887, embodied in G.O., No. 458, dated 24th August 1887, the establishment of the

* Paragraph 21, Government of India Notification No. 10-309, dated 23rd October 1884.

High School examination was proposed "to give effect to the wishes of the Government of India* for the division of general education after the Middle school examination into two branches, one branch having for its end the preparation of students for the University, the other for the preparation of students for commercial and industrial walks of life." It is, moreover, I submit the wiser policy to introduce the scheme, which in outline has already been favored with the approval of Government, and to see how it works, whilst the number

of institutions interested in it is small, so that defects, such as are sure to exist, may be remedied before any change would affect numerous interests. It is also, I submit, expedient that such action as may be taken should be decisive and not such as would tend to keep the subject still, so to speak, *in lite*.

I now proceed to remark briefly on the objections raised to the High School examination.

4. A great deal has been said against the scheme on the ground of its alliance with the public service. In the memorial of the Executive Council on aided education this objection is put strongly. I wish, however, to point out here a serious misconception. By making the High School examination to "be accepted as a sufficient test of fitness for the public service" it was never meant that the practical turn given to education should, as the memorialists make out, "be moulded and directed *merely* with a view to supply Government with efficient servants." The chief objects in allaying the examination with the public service was, first, to secure to the service more efficient servants than at present, and, secondly, to give a stimulus to higher technical studies, which would otherwise never under the present circumstances of the country be possible. The memorialists themselves admit that the hope of public employ has been a great stimulus to education in this Presidency. Why should not this "hope" be utilized to give a more practical turn to education? If in England and Scotland, countries far in advance of India, where more than any where else the people may be expected to pursue knowledge for its own sake, no new departure in education is taken without allaying with it the stimulating influence of a definite reward or aim, is it wrong that a similar course should be taken in India? I fully admit that our having to depend upon such adventitious aids to promote education is, to some extent, to be deplored, but as I said when first proposing the scheme, "to expect many students in this Presidency, especially those who, by failing to secure a first class in the Middle School examination, have not qualified themselves for admission to the public service, to enter on a course of study which comprises no final test qualifying, among other things, for the service of the State, is to expect that which, I fear, will never happen for a long time to come." I claim for the new examination the privilege of admission into the public service for no other reasons than these. I would also invite the especial attention of the Government to provisions of articles 6 and 7 of the Draft Notification, which are especially intended to leave every branch or subject of the examination practically open to every one, who desires to make use of it to test his knowledge, or as a guide to study. It will be seen, therefore, how utterly wide of the mark is the statement that the whole scheme is moulded entirely with a view to supply Government with efficient servants. There is one point, however, which is noteworthy. The very persons who object to the High School examination on the ground of its alliance with the public service are the persons who protest vigorously against the Matriculation or the F. A. examination ceasing to qualify for Government employ. It is strange that those who hold that "no public examination which is a final test of general or technical education should be closely or intimately connected with the public service" should object only to the High School scheme on this ground and not to the Matriculation or F. A. examination. For after all the real evil, if evil it is, does not lie in the examination, but in the way in which students learn to regard an examination. Now unquestionably the large majority of students regard the Matriculation examination with much favor because it is the easiest, easier than the Middle School examination, gate to the public service. Consequently in so far as this is the case such students suffer as much as if the test was not an *entrance* but a *final* examination conducted directly by the State. Again, the finality of the High School examination is one of its merits in that it tends to draw a certain proportion of secondary students towards practical avocations before their practical aptitudes have been weakened by too long a literary course. But even this finality it is in the power of the University at once to remove by recognizing the examination, so far as it goes, as substitute for their entrance examination. For such a course they have the example of the Scotch Universities which accept the new Government final School examination for this purpose. If the remedy is in the hands of the University, what ground of complaint have they, except that fewer rupees will find their way into their coffers,

whilst the country will have the benefit of an independent examination, and will not, as at present, lie helpless in the hands of the University, so far as secondary education is concerned. Is it right or is it politic that the interests of the country should thus be sacrificed to the interests of the University as regards a stage of education in which the claims of higher literary and scientific education (confided to the University) must almost necessarily be far from identical with those of secondary, practical and useful education, which has never as yet (and I trust the day is far distant when it will be) been confided wholly to that body. The new examination will fail in its aim, if whilst supplying the Government with more useful servants, it does not in a still greater degree provide the country with more useful men and women than the Matriculation examination now does.

5. As regards objection (b) I have simply to state that the two paths are not correctly described, as "one leading to Government service, and the other to a liberal education," because the majority of the students on each path will be journeying towards Government service, one by a shorter and more practical, the other by a longer and more literary path. The aims in each case will be mainly other than those connected with the service of the State, whatever the ambition of the runners may be. As to a boy not being able to pass from one path to the other, I can only repeat what I have already stated that, if this difficulty, which is mainly hypothetical and imaginary exists, the University can at once remove it by recognizing the High School examination.

6. As to (c) I do not admit the false analogy; and if it is false the Education Commission have made the same mistake. But English education in India is not modern in the technical sense of the term, but classical in that its object is mainly literary instead of practical. The difference now in England is not so much in the subjects studied, as in the way they are studied, whether the study be language, mathematics, history, geography and even science.

7. I do not propose to discuss the statements made in paragraphs 3 and 4, because they are little more than opinions. The same objections were most fully considered by the High School Committee. Nor have I heard or read anything to lead me to think that that Committee minimized the difficulties referred to. But I would remark that if the scheme has the effect of converting several weak and poorly officered 2nd-grade Colleges into good and useful High schools, it will do a great service to the education of the country, intermediate and collegiate.

8. Finally as regards the position taken up in paragraph 6, that the scheme will "totally discourage all private effort in education," I am at a loss to understand the grounds upon which this serious indictment is based. For the following reasons the charge has no shadow of a foundation: because the change cannot involve a very great increase in the cost of Secondary education, whilst it will probably considerably increase the attendance in Secondary schools and consequently the fee revenue: because there is no valid reason to fear that there will be a material decrease in the number of matriculated students who will read for their degrees, whilst the reverse may be the case: because provision has been made in the educational budget for assisting managers in meeting such increased cost as the changes may involve: because the Government may on certain conditions continue its patronage of the lower examinations of the University: and because, if it does not, the University may still secure many of the High School examination candidates by recognizing that examination.

In no part of India have the Government depended so much on private effort as in Madras, and in no time in the history of education in Madras has private education been more liberally encouraged than in recent years. In proposing this examination, I have been actuated by a desire to extend that agency and to afford it all the moral and material support practicable, and in spite of what earnest but timid educationists may say, I have good reason to believe that the establishment of this examination will advance the present policy of Government.

Demi-official from the Head Master, Chengelroya Naicker's Commercial School, dated Madras, 28th February 1889.

ORDER—dated 20th June 1889, No. 351, Educational.

In a letter, dated the 4th July 1887, No. O-179, the Director of Public Instruction submitted for the approval of Government the outlines of a scheme for the establishment of a new public examination, to be called the High School Examination, the main objects of which were the completion of the bifurcation of studies as recommended by the Education Commission, the substitution, for the Matriculation examination of the University and the Hand-writing test, of a fresh Entrance examination for the public service carrying a higher, and, when required, a more technical qualification, and the extension of the control exercised by Government over Upper Secondary education. In G.O., dated 24th August 1887, No. 458, the Government expressed general approval of the examination thus sketched, and in accordance with the Director of Public Instruction's suggestion, appointed a committee, with power to add to its number, to work out the details of the scheme. The report of the committee is recorded in G.O., dated 11th July 1888, No. 401, Educational. In order that full opportunity might be afforded for the expression of public opinion, the Government therein directed that the draft notification submitted by the committee should be published in the *Fort St. George Gazette*, and the papers laid on the Editors' Table, with an intimation that the matter would not be taken into consideration until after the expiry of 3 months. It was also intimated that the scheme would in no case be given force from an earlier date than the 1st January 1889, and that the claims of those interested in the Matriculation examination would be dealt with in a liberal spirit. By a subsequent order of the 22nd September 1888, No. 556, the period allowed for the consideration of the High School examination was, at the request of the Executive Council on Aided Education, extended from 3 to 6 months, and the Director of Public Instruction was called on to report further on two important points connected with the examination, viz., the retention of the Middle School examination and the policy of recognition.

2. The foregoing papers contain the various replies and opinions which have been received on the subject of the proposed examination, and His Excellency the Governor in Council, having given them his most careful consideration, proceeds to pass orders on the several important and intricate questions raised. In the voluminous discussion which has taken place, two propositions seem to command a more or less general assent, viz., the one that the Matriculation examination of the University as at present ordered is not a satisfactory test either for the public service or for the final stage of secondary education, while its standard is too low even as an entrance test to collegiate education; the other that, in order to carry out the views of the Government of India in regard to the bifurcation of studies in Secondary schools, the establishment of a new examination with a technical or practical side is necessary. In the very able letter submitted by the Council of the Madras Graduates' Association, the conviction is expressed that the present standard of the Matriculation examination is not sufficiently high and needs raising, while one of the most important recommendations presented to the Senate of the University by the committee appointed to consider the High School examination scheme was that the standard of the Matriculation examination should be revised and its curriculum extended. On the other hand, the committee appointed by the Senate does not deny the desirability of carrying out in upper secondary education the bifurcation of studies which was recommended by the Education Commission, and both the Graduates' Association and the memorial of the representatives of aided education agree in welcoming a change which would give greater breadth, variety and completeness to this stage of education. Unless, therefore, the new examination were committed to the University—a proposal which has not been made by the Senate and would probably not find favor with that body—the conduct of the new examination must be undertaken by the Government. No rival scheme to that put forward by the committee appointed in G.O., dated 24th August 1887, No. 458, has appeared, and it appears to His Excellency the Governor in Council that, subject to the remarks made below, the general approval of the scheme expressed in that Government Order should, so far as the list of subjects and nature of the test are concerned, be maintained.

3. Certain objections have, however, been taken to the scheme, both in regard to its curriculum and in regard to its position as a test for the public service. The first and perhaps the most important of these is that, while the new examination professes to be the final test of secondary education, it is in fact devised solely or mainly with reference to the requirements of the public service, subordinates education to the needs of the service, and includes various subjects which should be provided for as hitherto by special tests. After perusing the observations which have been recorded in the several valuable papers before him, His Excellency in Council is of opinion that this objection is not without foundation. The prospect of qualifying, and the desire to qualify, for the public service, already exercises an injurious effect on education. Nothing should be done which can intensify that effect. The objectionable features in the scheme which was drawn up by the committee appointed in 1887 result from the proposal that the new examination should be the sole test other than the degrees of the University for admission to the superior public service, but the Government is disposed rather to agree that no public examination should exclusively qualify, and to consider that the avenues to the service should be as numerous as possible. This question will be referred to again. Meantime, in order to divest the examination of its special character, clause (e) of Branch I of the notification prepared by the committee will be struck out, the reference to an official paper in clause (f) will be removed, and such other portions of the notification as refer to the adoption of an official standard in the curriculum altered. This has been done in the revised notification appended to these proceedings.

4. A second objection which has been raised to the curriculum of the new examination is that the *viva voce* portion is unsuitable to an examination of the kind, and that it will, according to past experience, render the test so uncertain as to be useless and unsatisfactory to school managers and examiners. On reference to the draft notification, it is, however, observed that the *viva voce* portion, to which exception is taken, appears only in the language branches of the compulsory part of the examination, and is limited to writing from dictation, reading aloud, and conversation. The number of marks to be assigned to it has not been specified and it, therefore, will not affect the classification of the candidates. It does not appear to His Excellency in Council that the scope of this *viva voce* portion can be compared with that formerly included in the B.A. or similar examinations, nor is it likely that it will have the effect attributed to it by objectors. The provision of examiners may prove a practical difficulty, but this seems to have been got over in the case of the Technical examinations, and Dictation has always been a part of the Middle School examination in languages. There is, therefore, in the opinion of His Excellency in Council, no sufficient reason to prevent the *viva voce* experiment in the new examination being given a trial. Another and smaller objection is to the inclusion of European history. It is argued that, in the upper secondary stage of education, one history is enough. It does not seem to the Government that this objection is of much weight. The Madras Graduates' Association also has taken exception to the restriction of the first language to the vernacular of the candidates, and points out that in many cases it is not easy to decide what is a pupil's vernacular. His Excellency in Council agrees that there is not sufficient ground for the rule in question, and it will accordingly be omitted. Subject to these modifications, the curriculum of the new examination is approved. In order to obviate the objections which have been taken to the proposed name of "High School Examination," and in order to mark more clearly its relation to the particular grade of education with which it is concerned, the examination will be called the Upper Secondary Examination.

5. A great deal has been written as to the injurious effect which the institution of this examination will have on the University, and this aspect of the question is beyond doubt a most important one. Much stress is laid on this point in Dr. Miller's letter to the Chief Secretary to Government, dated 25th September 1887, and it has been suggested that, if the scheme as originally prepared were carried out, the bulk of the mofussil second-grade colleges would have to be closed. The committee of 1887 recommended that neither the Matriculation nor the F.A. examination should in future qualify for the public service, so that no boy could enter Government employ by

means of a University course unless he succeeded in obtaining a degree in some faculty. The Government concurs with those who consider that this provision would cause too great disturbance in the existing educational system. It is of the first importance that the liberal system of culture imparted under the influence of the University should not be impaired, and His Excellency the Governor in Council could not approve of any scheme which seemed to him likely to put a check on collegiate education or materially lessen the number of students proceeding to a University degree. The modes of entrance to the Government service should be as numerous as possible, and all examinations which guarantee general culture in excess of the minimum which the Government demand should be recognised for this purpose. The Government has accordingly resolved that the F.A. examination shall, as heretofore, qualify for admission to grades of the public service when supplemented by a pass in Translation and to all the special tests except as noted below, while the Matriculation examination will also continue to qualify for Government service, but only for such appointments as do not amount to Rs. 15 in value and for service under local and municipal bodies in such grades as may hereafter be decided.

6. But it seems to His Excellency in Council that some further safeguard is desirable to prevent the reduction of the incentives to students to enter on and complete the University course. With this object the committee proposed that, except for distinguished service, no one should be appointed to the post of Deputy Collector, District Munsif, District Registrar or any ministerial post under Government carrying a salary of more than Rs. 250 per mensem who did not possess a B.A. degree, and the Board of Revenue (Settlement, Land Records and Agriculture) with a similar object has approved a suggestion of Mr. Adam that the subordinate service should be divided into two distinct grades, upper and lower. The first proposal has found favor with no one, and the second could not be introduced within any reasonable time without disappointing many legitimate expectations. Instead, therefore, the Government has resolved to extend the principle which was applied with excellent effect in 1884 to appointments for which the Revenue Special Test, Higher Grade, is prescribed. It was then ordered that after the year 1889, no person who was not either a graduate or had passed the F.A. examination should be admitted to this test; so that, from the current year, no one can expect to rise to the post of Deputy Collector unless he has already qualified or unless he passes at least the F.A. examination of the University. This order has had a marked effect in raising the numbers of candidates proceeding to the F.A. examination. It will now be laid down that, after the 31st December 1893, no candidate shall be admitted to the Revenue Test, Higher Grade, unless he has taken the degree of Bachelor in one of the Faculties of the University, and no one shall be admitted to the Criminal Test, Lower Grade, who has not passed the F.A. examination. By this means, after an interval sufficiently long to give reasonable time to men now in the service to qualify, the post of Deputy Collector will be practically restricted to graduates, and those of Sub-Magistrate, Police Inspector, and Sheristadars and head writers in Courts to persons who have passed the F.A. examination. Under these restrictions, His Excellency the Governor in Council has no doubt that the institution of the proposed new examination, and the removal of the Matriculation examination from the list of those qualifying for superior service, will not in any degree diminish the number of candidates pursuing a course of collegiate instruction. It may be necessary at a later date to admit students of special institutions, such as the Agricultural College and the Engineer subordinate class of the College of Engineering, for entrance to which the new examination qualifies, to the same privileges as those who have passed the F.A. examination, but the number of such students availing themselves of this privilege will always be insignificant.

7. A few minor points connected with the relation of the new examination to the public service must also be noticed. In para. 21 of the draft notification, concessions are proposed to be made in favor of candidates who have passed the Upper Secondary examination and enter certain departments. For the reasons stated in Captain Baddeley's note, dated the 11th August 1888, the clauses relating to the Public Works Department will be struck out, but as regards the Salt and Forest Departments, there is apparently no objection to the proposals in the notification, except that the vernacular

part of the new examination will not include the reading of arziys. It will, however, be open to these departments to carry out this additional test for themselves, if thought necessary. As regards the Educational Department, the Director of Public Instruction will doubtless accept the recommendations made.

8. At the end of paragraph 7 of the High School Examination Committee's report, the question is suggested whether the original intention of the Uncovenanted Civil Service examination scheme should be reverted to, and all examinations for the public service placed under the Commissioner. The Government is not prepared to entertain the suggestion as regards the Pledership examinations. The Examining Board by which these examinations are conducted is certainly as good as any the Commissioner could provide, and there is nothing to be gained by disturbing present arrangements. The Honorable the Judges of the High Court will, however, be moved to direct that, after a sufficient interval—such as 4 years—none but graduates shall be admitted to the First Grade Pledership examination, and that the new Upper Secondary examination shall in future be recognised, either instead of or in addition to the Matriculation examination, as qualifying for admission to the 2nd-grade examination. No change will be made in regard to the Public Works tests, but there seems no reason why the special tests for the Forest and Survey Departments should not be made over to the Commissioner. The Board of Revenue will submit proposals with this object.

9. Certain questions remain which, though of great importance to education, are only indirectly connected with the subject of the Upper Secondary examination. The first of these is that of the continuance in its present form of the Middle School examination. In his letter, No. 1242, dated the 14th February 1889, the Director of Public Instruction has strongly recommended that the examination should be retained in a somewhat modified form, and has summarised in paragraph 5 of his letter the purposes which it at present answers, but, after attentively examining his arguments, the Government is not convinced that they outweigh the strong objections which are urged against the examination. The chief of these is that on which Dr. Miller has laid so much stress, namely, the injurious effect exercised by a great public examination which is compulsory on all boys at the ages of 12 or 13. A further objection is that it carries bifurcation too low down, viz., into the lower secondary classes, the recommendation of the Education Commission having referred only to upper secondary education. Both these objections seem to His Excellency in Council to be well founded, not to have been sufficiently met by the recommendations of the committee towards the close of paragraph 19 of their report, and to be of such primary importance as to outweigh any convenience which might result from the retention of the examination in its present form. The Government has accordingly decided that, after the close of the official year 1890-91, the Middle School examination shall cease to qualify for admission to appointments in the public service classed as "Superior."

10. The Director of Public Instruction has, however, laid particular stress on the usefulness of the Middle School examination as marking a final and also an intermediate stage in secondary education, and it is evident that as a test for the VII standard by results and for certain other purposes, some such examination will continue to be required. The examination will therefore be continued under the name of the Lower Secondary examination, but it will be entirely optional for pupils of institutions possessing an Upper Secondary branch, and ultimately it will render the candidate eligible only for inferior appointments in Government service. The last Middle School examination under existing rules will be held in December 1890. The new Lower Secondary examination will be conducted by local examining committees similar to those constituted for the Primary School examination under G.O., dated 15th January 1889, No. 17, the Commissioner being empowered to employ central boards, when necessary, for technical branches. It will thus continue to be the final test for female lower secondary education, and for middle schools for boys having no higher departments. It will remain also as a test for primary teachers of the higher grade and as a test for special qualifications for inferior technical teachers receiving grants under the Grant-in-Aid Code, but for admission to the junior departments of the Medical, Engineering, and Agricultural Colleges, the Government considers that a higher level

of general knowledge should be exacted, and that the Upper Secondary examination should, as early as practicable, be substituted for it. A revised notification for the regulation of the Lower Secondary examination, giving effect to these changes, should be submitted after consultation with the Surgeon-General and the heads of the special colleges as to the date from which a pass in the Upper Secondary examination can be exacted as a condition of entrance.

11. The Government approves of the Director's suggestion in paragraph 7 of his letter last referred to, that a committee of representative educationists should be appointed to carry out a revision of the standing orders and the general curriculum. This can hardly be completed until the University has disposed of the question of the improvement of the Matriculation examination, but the committee can advantageously begin its work now. The Director of Public Instruction will submit proposals defining more clearly the subjects to be referred to the committee, and nominating a nucleus of representative members, who should have power to add to their number.

12. The last question to be considered is that of recognition, which was raised in Mr. John Adam's minute of dissent appended to the report of the High School Examination Committee recorded in G.O., 11th July 1888, No. 401. As to whether recognition of some sort or other should be maintained, there is very little difference of opinion. It seems clear that the State should not give the *cachet* of a pass at its public examinations to candidates whom it regards as improperly educated, that is, who have studied in schools which do not fulfil elementary conditions of efficiency. But the Government entirely agrees with those who contend that the present plan of enforcing recognition by a differential fee as at the Primary and Middle School examination is indefensible, and considers that the retention of any condition as to the levy of school fees at special rates is wrong. Such conditions as are really essential to efficiency should be plainly laid down and strictly enforced, schools not complying with them being altogether excluded from the public examinations. But the levy of a particular rate of school fee is not a condition which necessarily affects efficiency or needs enforcement otherwise than as a condition of aid. It is the interest of the State that education should be furnished to the people as cheaply as possible, and if the indigenous agency which is now being trained can supply efficient instruction at lower rates than it has hitherto been supplied by a foreign agency, so much the better.

13. The Government is accordingly of opinion that the system of recognition needs complete revision. The Director will, in due course, prepare and submit to Government, in as clear and succinct a form as possible, a statement of those conditions, other than that of a fixed rate of fees, which should, in his opinion, be made a *sine qua non* of recognition by the State and admission to the State-conducted examinations, and these conditions, when settled, will be notified as those to be strictly enforced in future. The immediate abolition of the existing fee notification would, however, be a breach of the pledge given

G.O., 8th January 1887, No. 23.

by Government, when it was published, that it should remain in force for 5 years from that date. Sufficient time must, moreover, be allowed to enable existing institutions to prepare themselves for compliance with the conditions of recognition to be observed in future. No change will, therefore, be made in the existing rules as to recognition until the expiry of the present school fee notification on the 31st of December 1891, after which date the system of regulation of school-fees in institutions not receiving aid under the Code will be abandoned, as well as that of the differentiated fee for admission to the Primary and Upper and Lower Secondary examinations. All schools which fulfil the prescribed conditions will then be recognized. Provision will be made for the admission, by special order of the Commissioner, of *bonâ fide* private students, upon proof shown that they have not attended any school whatever for a period of two years prior to the examination. For others, a period of 30 months' attendance at a recognized school will be adopted. The notification regulating the Primary examination and that now issued constituting the Upper Secondary examination will be revised with effect from the 31st December 1891, so as to give effect to the change of system.

14. But the full benefit which may be expected to result to the cause of education from a stricter enforcement of the conditions essential to efficiency cannot accrue if the enforcement is only partial and is carried out only by the State and not by the University. It is of vital importance to the success of the scheme of recognition above sketched that the University should be prepared to adopt a similar system and should admit to its examinations candidates from none but recognised schools. But as the University possesses no agency by which the observance of the prescribed conditions can be tested, it will be necessary that it should accept the recognition accorded by the Educational Department or the refusal of it, as applicable also to its own examinations. The Senate will be invited to consider this proposal, and to report to Government to what extent it is prepared to accept it.

15. Appended to these Proceedings are two notifications—the first relating to the constitution of the Upper Secondary examination, the other laying down the rules which will in future regulate admission to the public service and special tests.

(True Extract.)

A. G. CARDEW,
Under Secy. to Govt.

To the Departments of the Secretariat.

- " Honorable the Judges of the High Court, with C.L.
- " Director of Public Instruction.
- " Commissioner, Uncovenanted Civil Service Examinations,
- " Registrar of the Madras University.
- " Rev. Dr. Miller, Principal, Madras Christian College.
- " Secretary, Triplicane Literary Society.
- " " Mylapore Athenæum.
- " Honorary Secretary to the Executive Council on Aided Education.
- " Secretary to the Council of the Madras Graduates' Association.

Gobt. of (1889) Madras.
EDUCATIONAL.

Order thereon

No: 1927 to a/17th July/89

Communicated to
officers of the P. W. Dept
for information.

16/ R. N. A. B.

Issued

Recd.

Encl.

G.O., 20th June 1889, No. 351.

JUNE.

Upper Secondary Examination.

Passing orders relative to the constitution of
the new — and the continuance of the Middle
School Examination under the name of the Lower
Secondary Examination.

Ch. Engr. for the
C. E. for the
Supt. Engr.
Ch. to the
H. P. W. auto.
H. P. W. auto.