

(1) Number of pages 110
(2) Date of repair 18/7/72
(3) Initials of the Referencer PR

TAMIL NADU ARCHIVES

GOVERNMENT OF TAMIL NADU

Public Works DEPARTMENT

G.O. No.	2223-24 W	Press
B.P. No.		Mis.
Dated	21 July	1888 1885

1888

to be folded or roughly handled

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS.
PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

General
Establishment.

READ—the following paper :—

From G. H. D. WALKER, Esq., Under-Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department (General), to the Secretary to the Government of Madras, Public Works Department, dated Simla, 15th June 1888, No. 1432 G. :—

In the report issued by the Public Service Commission, copy of which has already been forwarded to you by the Home Department, the following recommendations are made regarding the Engineer establishment of the Public Works Department in chapter X, paras. 91—98 of the report :—

- (1) That the Engineer establishment of the Public Works Department should consist of an Imperial Branch and of Provincial Branches.
- (2) That the Imperial Branch should consist of such a number of Royal Engineers as may be required as a reserve for military purposes over and above the officers employed in the Military Works Branch and of Civil Engineers recruited in England.
- (3) That the strength of the Imperial Branch should not be greater than is necessary for purposes of control and direction, and for the execution and repair of works calling for high engineering skill, and that the recruitment from the Coopers Hill Royal Engineering College, which appears at present excessive, should be regulated accordingly.
- (4) That the conditions of service in the Imperial Branch should be fixed with a view to secure the necessary qualifications in England, and should, as far as possible, be uniform for all officers employed in it.
- (5) That the Provincial Branches should be of a strength adequate for the construction and maintenance in the several provinces of works not ordinarily calling for high engineering skill.
- (6) That the recruitment for the Provincial Branches should be made by the direct appointment to the lowest grades of qualified Engineers from the Indian Engineering Colleges, and in exceptional cases by promotion from the Upper Subordinate grades.
- (7) That there should be at least one college in India thoroughly well equipped for providing a high education for Engineers for the Provincial Branches, and that such college should be open to all classes of Her Majesty's subjects.
- (8) That the conditions of service as to pay, furlough and pension should be fixed for the Provincial Branches without reference to those of the Imperial Branch.

2. I am directed to request that these recommendations may be considered by the Government of Madras in the light of the suggestions put forward in the accompanying memorandum, which has been prepared in this office as a basis for carrying out in their practical application the recommendations of the Commission.

3. The chief points on which definite proposals are required are enumerated in the first paragraph of the memorandum, and are fully discussed and proposals suggested in the succeeding paragraphs.

4. In regard to the first point, the recommendations of the Government of Madras are particularly requested as to the number of charges, if any, that must be held by men of the Imperial establishment in Madras; in other words, what figures are recommended for the establishment of Madras to be placed in column D of table A in substitution of those tentatively inserted by this office.

I am also to inquire whether, in your opinion, the Engineers of the Railway Branch should be wholly Imperial, or whether there might be a mixture of Provincial men.

5. An equally important question is whether, in the opinion of His Excellency the Governor in Council, a Provincial Service should be created between the proposed Imperial Service and the existing Subordinate Service, or whether the present Upper Subordinate Staff, if increased in numbers and perhaps improved in training, would suffice to perform the duties of the Provincial Service.

6. I am further to inquire whether, with reference to the 7th recommendation quoted above, the Government of Madras is satisfied with the training of the Indian College* from which it now receives such of its recruits as are educated in this country, or would desire any other mode of recruitment for the Provincial Service, or any alteration in the system of education pursued in the college with which the province is connected.

7. On these as well as on the other subjects mentioned in the memorandum, and also on any other points touched upon by the Public Service Commission, the views and recommendations of His Excellency the Governor in Council are solicited by the Government of India, and I am to request that a reply to this inquiry may be furnished at the earliest possible date, and that, if possible, its return to this office may not be delayed beyond the 15th July.

ENCLOSURE.

Scheme for a separate Imperial and Provincial Establishment, Public Works Department, prepared with reference to proposals by the Public Service Commission.

Assuming that separate Imperial and Provincial establishments are to be organised, as recommended by the Public Service Commission, the points which have to be authoritatively settled are the following:—

1st.—What, looking into the far future, is to be the respective strength of each establishment? Does table A (see paragraph 2) give a fair distribution for the two services, and is the future Railway Branch to be wholly Imperial?

On this decision depends the rate of recruitment to be now ordered in substitution for the present rate.

2nd.—What are the rates of pay and promotion for the Provincial establishment to be?

3rd.—Are the superior appointments to be on one scale of pay and open by selection to Imperial and Provincial men alike?

4th.—In distributing the present establishment between Imperial and Provincial, at what grade are we to draw the line of separation in regard to men who are classed as "Indian Engineers;" and how far are we to give better prospects as regards pay to the men now in Government employ who may be placed in the Provincial establishment than to men in future entering the establishment?

5th.—Looking to the smallness of the numbers in each service (as in statement A) in even the largest provinces, and still more in the smallest, is it possible to work them as separate and independent services, or should they be placed as regards promotion on a general list for all India, though without liability to transfer from one province to another, except in the cases of the Local Administrations? These points are discussed with tentative suggestions in detail below.

SUB-HEAD 1.—Strength of each Establishment.

2. In order to illustrate what may be taken as a possible distribution of the present (revised) charges and posts of the several Provincial lists of the Public Works Department between an Imperial and Provincial establishment, a table marked A has been prepared.

3. Columns B and C show the revised strength as far as it has been settled and the number of Executive charges on these lists, which include all but the Railway and Military Works Department lists.

4. The important columns upon which the rest are based are columns D and E. These distribute the Executive charges between Imperial and Provincial Engineers. The distribution must be more or less arbitrary. In provinces where, as in Bombay and Madras, there is no marked line between Buildings and Roads and Irrigation and there is a good deal of irrigation, a slight preponderance is given to Imperial. For Bengal Buildings and Roads, only three Imperial charges are allowed, viz., for the Presidency divisions and Under-Secretary; the Irrigation establishment is equally divided between the two so as to give a good leaven of Imperial. For Buildings and Roads Branch in the North-Western Provinces, Punjab, and Burma, there must probably be for some considerable time a good proportion of Imperial men, and the charges are divided equally. For the purely Irrigation charges of the North-Western Provinces and the Punjab, a slight preponderance is given to Imperial. The Buildings and Roads charges of the smaller administration are assigned wholly to Provincial.

5. In fixing the total strength of the Imperial establishment, it is necessary to provide that there should always be a sufficient number of Assistants in training for the Imperial Executive charges, the number of which is suggested in column D. It has long since been laid down as an axiom that this training in the Assistant class should not last more than 8 to 10 years, and to induce this rate of advancement the proportion of Assistant to Executive Engineers must be as 2 to 3. The total effective strength, as in column F, and the distribution of the whole strength, including allowance for absentees, as in columns H and I, are deduced accordingly from the number of Executive charges in column D by allowing the necessary proportion to induce this rate of promotion.

6. The balance of the establishment, according to the revised strength in column B, must be Provincial, and this establishment must fill the balance of Executive posts which remain after providing for the Imperial establishment, and the rest must be Assistant Engineers. This is worked out in columns J to N. It will be observed that in the Provincial establishment the Assistants greatly exceed the Executives, that is, we sacrifice the Provincial to the Imperial. It is reasonable that the rate of promotion in responsibility and pay (which depends on this distribution) for the Provincial establishment should be slower than for the Imperial, but probably some device would be necessary to accelerate it.

7. The general result of the table, however, is that for these Provincial lists we require the following establishment of Executive and Assistant Engineers, including allowances for absentees:—

	Executives.	Assistants.	Total.
Imperial	95	66	161
Provincial	126	213	339

8. There then remain the Railway and Military Works Department lists, the former of which, we may tentatively assume, must be manned wholly by Imperial Engineers, viz., Coopers Hill and Royal Engineers, and the latter by Royal Engineers. If we assume that these lists must be manned throughout by Imperial Engineers, we may neglect the question of charges, and assume that, irrespective of the charges held, they must be divided into Executive and Assistant classes in the proportion necessary to give the proper flow of promotion.

9. The actual present strength calculated for the Railway Branch is 145, and 52 for the Military Works Department; and adding 15 per cent. to each for absentees, the establishment will be—

	Executives.	Assistants.	Total.
Railway	99	67	166
Military Works Department	36	24	60
and adding all the lists as above together we get as the total strength of Executives and Assistant Engineers for India—			
Imperial	230	157	387
Provincial	126	213	339
Grand Total	356	370	726

10. Next, as to the superior posts above the rank of Executives and Assistants which may be taken as 80. The distribution by classes of lists for these posts may be taken as follows:—

Provincial lists—Buildings and Roads and Irrigation	46
Railway Branch	27
Military Works Department	7

And assuming, solely for purposes of establishing the strength, that these posts would fall to Imperial and Provincial in proportion to their strength in the several lists, we should have—

	Imperial.	Provincial.	Total.
Provincial lists ...	...	...	...
Railway ...	15	31	46
Military Works Department ...	27	...	27
...	7	...	7
...	49	31	80

or, in round numbers, 50 superior posts fall to Imperial and 30 to Provincial.
11. Allowing again 15 per cent. for absentees in these posts, the strength for Imperial and Provincial would be—

	Executives and Assistants.	Superior posts.	Total.
Imperial ...	387	58	445
Provincial ...	339	35	374
...	...	...	819

12. Now the above total strength is not far off the number (800) to which our present rate of recruitment is understood to be leading us; but there is considerable difference in the distribution of the Imperial and Provincial element, which at present is as follows:—

	Recruits.	Ultimate strength.
Imperial—		
Coopers Hill ...	...	...
Royal Engineers ...	...	15
Provincial—		
Indian Colleges ...	...	6
...	...	9
...	30	800

That is, instead of tending to an establishment of 430 Imperial and 370 Provincial, as approximately worked out above, we are tending to one of 560 Imperial and 240 Provincial.

13. Again, if we take our present establishment of about 1,000 men, we find that it consists of 745 European Engineers, who answer to the Imperial, and of 255 Indian Engineers, who answer to the Provincial establishment.

If, then, we intend to take steps to remodel the establishment in the direction indicated, we must modify our rate of recruitment.

14. Our present rate of recruitment is confessedly a reduced one, the full rate being 33 for a strength of 880 men, and the reduction was obtained by decreasing the number of Royal Engineer recruits from 9 to 6. It will probably be considered inadvisable, under present circumstances, to increase the total recruitment; but in making any modification we should recruit (if we can) up to the full ultimate Royal Engineer strength of about 250, as arranged with the Military Department in communication with the Home Government. The revised recruitment and strength according to the accepted estimates would then be—

	Recruits.	Estimated strength.
Imperial—		
Coopers Hill ...	...	...
Royal Engineers ...	...	7
Provincial—		
Indian Colleges ...	...	9
...	...	14
...	30	800

15. According to this proposal, Coopers Hill, which began some years ago with an annual number of 40 or 45 appointments to the Public Works Department, now reduced to 15, would come down to 7.

16. The above conclusions and proposals may be summed up as follows:—

1st.—That, according to present estimates of strength and requirements of the different lists, we might work the Public Works Department with 430 Imperial (European) and 370 Provincial (Indian) Engineers.

2nd.—That we should so organise the Imperial establishment rearranged under the first proposal as to give what is considered the essential rate of promotion in the Executive grades.

3rd.—That if we decide to take this step, we should considerably increase the Indian recruitment and reduce the Coopers Hill element.

17. It is assumed that the Local Governments will be content to supply their Provincial services by recruits from the four Indian Colleges (Rurki, Sibpur, Poona, Madras), but if any

other source of recruitment is advocated, or if any change should be made in the system there pursued so as to provide a higher education for Provincial Engineers than they now get, its nature should be explained in the reply to this memorandum.

SUB-HEAD 2.—Rates of Pay and Promotion of the Provincial Establishment.

18. The Provincial establishment, according to the suggestions made above, will be organised on the following main lines:—

Superior posts ...	30
Executive posts ...	127
Assistants ...	213
...	370

The above ratio between Executives and Assistants would give promotion from one class to the other in about the 16th or 17th year of service.

19. Then as to the rate of pay for this establishment, the Public Service Commission recommends that it should be fixed without reference to that of the Imperial establishment.

As we shall have to commence the establishment with a very few men all in the lower grades, and as it will gradually increase to a considerable strength under the influence of an increased number of recruits, it will probably be better to give an incremental scale; in fact, the only alternative to this would be a graded scale adjusted periodically to give approximately the same rate of promotion as that which the incremental scale will give.

20. If the rate of pay of the Provincial Service is fixed on the same sort of scale as has hitherto been current, then the salaries of the Executive and Assistant grades might be as follows; but this is merely put forward as a suggestion on which to work, and because some definite proposals are required:—

	Period in grade.	Promotion possible at end of
Apprentice on Rs. 100 ...	1 year	1st year.
Assistant Engineer Class—		
2nd grade, Rs. 125—25—250 ...	5 years	6th year.
1st do. Rs. 275—25—400 ...	5 "	11th "
Executive Engineer Class—		
2nd grade, Rs. 450—30—600 ...	5 years	16th year.
1st do. Rs. 600—30—750 ...	5 "	21st "
An increment of Rs. 50 after two years...	2 "	23rd "
Do. of „ 50 do. ...	2 "	25th "

The maximum pay thus obtainable by men in the 1st grade of Executives would be Rs. 850, and they would attain this about the end of the 47th year of their age at the earliest, that is, after passing through the grades as fast as they could. The above arrangement of grades would distribute Executives and Assistant Engineers in about equal proportions, and would perpetuate the present anomaly of giving men the pay and rank of Executives and the work of Assistants. If the ratio of 127 Executives to 213 Assistants, as in para. 18, is to be maintained, the period of service in the class of Assistant Engineer must be considerably enlarged; temporary promotions from class to class should be allowed only for change of duties.

21. It is probable, however, that some instructions of a general character may be issued by the Government of India regarding the scale of salaries to be allotted to the Provincial Service in all departments; and as the question of the pay of this branch of the Public Works Department does not press so urgently for a solution as does that of the number of posts to be set apart for them on which an early decision as to future recruitment depends, it may perhaps be convenient if an answer on this sub-head be deferred till the Government of India has declared its opinion on the general question.

22. It is possible, moreover, that Local Governments may hold that it is not necessary to create a new Provincial Service between the Imperial and the present Subordinate Service, but that all the work for which the Imperial Service is not required can be effectually performed by an enlargement of the upper ranks of the present Subordinate Service and without alteration of their present salaries. If this view is entertained, it is hoped that definite proposals as to the number, grades, and recruitment of this Upper Subordinate Service will be submitted in replying to this memorandum.

SUB-HEAD 3.—Whether the Superior Appointments are to be on one scale of Pay and open without distinction to Imperial and Provincial men.

23. Another question to be decided is whether the superior appointments above the Executive grade should carry the same pay, whether held by Provincial or Imperial men, and

whether men of each establishment should be appointed by selection to these posts, or whether there should be any reservation of a proportionate share of the posts for each establishment.

24. It would be easier to allow a separate scale of pay for these posts if there were any prospects of working Provincial establishments without any admixture of Imperial men; for there may be some difficulty in making an Imperial Executive Engineer on Rs. 1,000 work under a Provincial Superintending Engineer on Rs. 900, or an Imperial Superintending Engineer on Rs. 1,600 under a Provincial Chief Engineer on Rs. 1,500. It would be probably equally difficult to arrange that Provincial men shall only serve under Provincial, and Imperial men under Imperial, when men of both services are employed in the same branch.

25. This will be seen at once from the figures below, which are based on the supposition that the superior posts are divided between Imperial and Provincial men approximately according to the numerical proportion of each:—

						Chief Engineers.	Superintending Engineers.
<i>Buildings and Roads Branch—</i>							
Imperial	...	...	...	...	...	6	5
Provincial	...	...	...	...	...	2	21
<i>Irrigation—</i>							
Imperial	...	...	...	...	...	3	3
Provincial	...	...	...	...	...	...	6
Total	...	...	...	...	...	11	35

That is to say, in the Buildings and Roads Branch the bulk of the Superintending Engineer appointments would be held by Provincial men who would thus come into contact with Imperial men, while it would be difficult to prevent the Chief Engineers of the Provincial establishment from being placed over Imperial men. In the Irrigation Branch, the Provincial and Imperial Chief Engineerships. On the whole, the probable conclusion seems to be that unless an establishment can be wholly worked by Provincial or by Imperial men, it will be simpler to have only one scale of pay for the superior appointments. This uniformity of pay is irrespective of the question whether a fixed proportion of the superior appointments should be given to Provincial men, or whether no proportion of the whole number of superior appointments dependent on the strength of each should be laid down for either establishment, but the best men should be selected from either class with due regard to the claims of seniority.

SUB-HEAD 4.—*Distribution of the present Establishment between Imperial and Provincial, and transition from the present to the new organisation.*

26. The present distribution of the establishment between European and Indian Engineers, which two classes are ultimately to correspond with the Imperial and Provincial, is as follows:—

	European.	Indian.	Total.
Chief Engineers and officers ranking as such	24	...	24
Superintending Engineers and officers ranking as such	49	7	56
Executive Engineers	354	106	460
Assistant Engineers	318	142	460
As compared with our ultimate scale of	745	255	1,000
	430	370	800

It may be calculated roughly that if we alter the rate of recruitment as suggested in para. 14, we should increase the Indian establishment to the revised number of 370 by about the year 1905, and that similarly the European establishment would be considerably reduced by the same period and would be approximating to the ultimate number.

27. The difficulty is where and how to start the Indian establishment as a separate organisation to the European; when and where to draw the line.

28. The position is that we have now one establishment of European and Indian Engineers on one scale of pay, and we want to divide this establishment into two separate establishments, one of which will be on a lower scale of pay. It is also very desirable, in order to hasten the new organisation, that the separation should include some of the present establishment.

29. The problem is how to make this separation equitably. In the first place, the line between each class, the European and Indian Engineers, though clearly marked in the lower grades, which are filled by men recruited in definite proportions from Coopers Hill and from Indian Colleges, is not so clearly marked in the upper grades; and the men in these upper grades would look upon it as a very great grievance and slur upon them to be placed in a class

which must inevitably be looked upon as the inferior class. Some of them, though not a very large number, are men whose domicile is in England. It is thought therefore, irrespective of any question of altering the rate of pay of present incumbents, that none of the men now in the higher grades can be placed in the inferior service. It is suggested, however, that all the Indian Engineers may be placed below this line in a separate list, which will be the commencement of our Provincial establishment. All the men below the line, with very few exceptions, if any, are Natives, Eurasians, or Europeans whose domicile is in India.

30. It does not follow, however, that relegation to the inferior establishment must of necessity mean decrease of even prospective pay to all. The following compares the present rates common to the whole establishment with the rate proposed for the new class:—

						Present scale. RS.	Suggested Provincial. RS.
Apprentice	...	...	...	...	...	100	100
Assistant Engineer, 4th grade	...	...	...	...	...	...	125
Do. 3rd do.	...	...	...	...	...	250	250
Do. 2nd do.	...	...	...	...	350 to 400	...	275
Do. 1st do.	...	...	...	...	500	...	400
Executive Engineer, 4th do.	...	...	...	...	600	...	450
Do. 3rd do.	...	...	...	...	700	...	600
Do. 2nd do.	...	...	...	...	800	...	600
Do. 1st do.	...	...	...	...	950	...	850

31. The proposal is that men below the present 3rd grade, that is, men on Rs. 600, Rs. 500, Rs. 350, Rs. 250 and Rs. 100 should pass over to the new Provincial establishment; but to prevent inequitable reduction in their prospective pay, it might be provided that two additional increments of Rs. 50 each should be allowable to men of the present 4th-grade Executive and 1st and 2nd grade Assistant so as to bring their pay ultimately up to Rs. 950. Meanwhile all would pass into the new grades, that is, the 4th-grade Executive Engineer, after completing five years on Rs. 600, would be eligible for promotion to the Rs. 600—850 grade, and by further periodical increments might rise to Rs. 950. Similarly, the 1st-grade Assistant would pass into the new Rs. 450—600 grade, and would receive increments and be eligible for promotion in due course. The 2nd-grade Assistant would pass into the Rs. 275—400 grade, and would rise on the same principle. The 3rd-grade Assistant should be promoted to the Rs. 275—400 grade on the same conditions as they would have been promoted to the present 2nd grade on Rs. 350, and should then go on regularly through the new grades; but there is no need, it is thought, to give them increments beyond the new scale as in the case of the other two grades.

32. Summarising, the proposals are as follows:—

- (1) To place about 80 men of the 1st, 2nd, and 3rd grades of Executives, notwithstanding that they are Indian Engineers, in the Imperial list of Engineers, and to place them on exactly the same footing as regards pay as the European Engineer. Their pensions to follow the same rules as now.
- (2) To place 23 4th-grade Executives, 98 1st grade and 29 2nd grade Assistants, who are Indian Engineers, in the new Provincial list, but to allow them to draw up to Rs. 950 in the 1st grade.
- (3) To put 15 3rd-grade Assistants and apprentices wholly on the new rates of pay proposed for the Provincial establishment; in other words, to deal with them as with the recruits.

33. The effect of the above proposals would be to modify the immediate distribution of the Imperial and Provincial establishments as follows:—

	Imperial.	Provincial.	Total.
Chief Engineers and officers ranking as such	24	...	24
Superintending Engineers and officers ranking as such	56	...	56
Executive Engineers	437	23	460
Assistant do.	318	142	460
	835	165	1,000

SUB-HEAD 5.—*Whether the several Lists can be worked as separate and independent Services.*

34. The Provincial establishment being at present so small would have probably to be organised for some years to come as one list. Its distribution at the present moment, as

ORDER—dated 21st July 1888, No. 2223 W., Public Works.

Ordered that the following reply be sent:—

(Here enter No. 2224 W., dated 21st July 1888.)

(True Extract.)

(Signed) J. O. HASTED Colonel, R.E.,
Secretary to Govt., P.W.D.

LETTER—to the Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department, dated Ootacamund, 21st July 1888, No. 2224 W.

With reference to your letter No. 1432 G., dated 15th June 1888, I am instructed to offer the following observations, referring in succession to the sub-heads into which the "Scheme for a separate Imperial and Provincial establishment, Public Works Department," submitted with your letter is divided:—

Sub-head 1.—Including the lately-formed new division in the Kistna and the temporary divisions of Rushikulya; Ramnad and Periyár, there are 30 divisions in the Madras Presidency; the Ramnad division will, however, be abolished next year, leaving 29 divisions, which agrees with the number given in the statement accompanying the scheme; two of these probably being retained for the next five years only. The utmost care has been taken in distributing the divisions between Imperial and Provincial, and the accompanying statement gives the result finally determined. With the exception of the Nilgiris, all the divisions, classed as Imperial, contain either very important irrigation works or large military buildings, and in some cases both, and it would be objectionable, in the opinion of this Government, to entrust their charge to officers of the Provincial Service. On the Nilgiris there are Government House and Military head-quarters, and there are other obvious reasons why this station should be kept for officers recruited in England. The Buckingham Canal has been classed as Provincial, but until the completion estimates are worked out, it must be an Imperial charge. Madura must become an Imperial charge when the Periyár project is completed and absorbed in it, but by that time there will probably be some other temporary division and possibly there may be some Provincial officer competent to hold one of the charges now classed as Imperial. This Government will certainly do their best to provide for the Provincial men. The figure in column D of table A, from which the figures in subsequent columns are deduced, is therefore 20 instead of 15.

This Government concurs in the view that Assistant Engineers in the Imperial class should be promoted to Executives in 8 or 10 years at latest; but they are of opinion that Assistants in the Provincial class should attain their promotion before they are 16 years in the service; otherwise, in many instances, a man will be past his prime before he is promoted, and an Executive Engineer should possess considerable energy and activity.

As regards the source from which the Provincial service should be recruited, this Government are of opinion that, as a rule, Assistant Engineers should be obtained from the Civil Engineering colleges in India, but that, in special cases, it will be advisable to promote from the subordinate grade. They are of opinion, however, that in view of the present facilities for travelling in India considerable economy may be effected by confining the higher education necessary for Provincial Engineers to a single college in India, and they would suggest Poona, being the most centrally situated, as its most convenient location. The other colleges would then be restricted to the course of education necessary for admission to the upper subordinate grades.

Sub-head 2.—As regards the rates of pay and promotion of the Provincial establishment, this Government are of opinion that the pay of Assistant Engineers and Executive Engineers may be fixed without reference to that of the Imperial establishment, but that the scale given in para. 20 of the "Scheme" commences too low, with the exception of the apprentice grades, which, it is presumed, corresponds with that of men under practical training; and the system of yearly increments does

not commend itself to them. If, as suggested above, upper subordinates are, in special cases, to be promoted as Engineers, the grade from which they would be promoted would probably be that of Supervisor, 1st grade, which would contain men of considerable experience, and yet not too old for advancement, and in that case the pay of Assistant Engineer, 2nd grade, must be at least equal to that of Supervisor, 1st grade. If yearly increments are given, the pay might commence at Rs. 200, but if, as this Government would prefer, no increments are given, the pay of Assistant Engineer, 2nd grade, should be Rs. 250. An Assistant Engineer, 1st grade, would then receive Rs. 350, and there might be four grades of Executive Engineers, each step of promotion giving an increase in pay of Rs. 100. After two years in the highest grade an addition of Rs. 50 might be made, and after another two years, a further addition of Rs. 50 as suggested.

Sub-head 3.—The superior appointments above the grade of Executive Engineer are always made by this Government by selection, and this being the case, the Government are of opinion that these appointments should be open without distinction to men on Imperial and Provincial lists, and that there should be one scale of pay for them.

Sub-head 4.—Without interfering with the prospects of men who entered the service with certain expectations, it will be extremely difficult to effect the transition to the new organisation. To those, however, who have lately entered the service, the prospect of some reduction has not probably appeared uncertain. This Government are therefore of opinion that the pay above the rank of Assistant Engineer on the Provincial service might be fixed on the new scale, and that there is no reason why the Provincial should not be at once separated from the Imperial list, so long as present incumbents in grades above Assistant Engineer are secured the present scale of pay up to date of retirement.

Sub-head 5.—The suggestion in the scheme is apparently to form an amalgamated Provincial list, which would be retained while the numbers on the list are small, but when the numbers are much increased to split it up, making over the portions to the Provincial Governments, while the Imperial lists, which would then be reduced, should be amalgamated. On the subject of amalgamating the Imperial lists, this Government has already expressed an opinion in letter No. 3391 W., dated 12th December 1887, and they are willing to defer further consideration of the subject until the Imperial lists are very considerably reduced; but they are of opinion that it will be best in every way to start and continue the Provincial establishment under the Provincial Governments, who would work it as one list with the existing Imperial establishment.

As regards the question whether the men on the Provincial establishment should be pensionable or not, this Government entertain no doubt that they must receive pensions, and that the rules of the Uncovenanted Service should apply to them.

2. In the above the questions asked in paras. 2 to 7 of your letter under reply have been answered, with the exception of that in the latter part of para. 4. with respect to which I am to say that this Government inclines to the opinion that, for some time to come at all events, the Engineers of the Railway Branch should be wholly Imperial. There are, however, only three, the Consulting Engineer and two Deputies, under this Government.

(Signed) J. O. HASTED, Colonel, R.E.,
Secretary to Govt., P.W.D.

Exd. F. R. Bantleman.

Spare Copies

IMPERIAL.

	Divisions.		Divisions.
Godávari	3	Chingleput	1
Kistna	3	Presidency	1
Nellore	1	Presidency Workshops	1
Rushikulya	1	Tanjore	1
Bellary	1	Negapatam	1
West Coast	1	Consulting Architect	1
Periyár	1		—
Nilgiris	1		20
North Arcot	1		—
South Arcot	1		

PROVINCIAL.

	Divisions.		Divisions.
Ganjam	1	Tinnevely	1
Vizagapatam	1	Buckingham Canal	1
Cuddapah	1	Coimbatore	1
Kurnool	1		—
Trichinopoly	1		9
Madura	1		—

GENERAL
ESTABLISHMENT.

Gobt. of (1888) Madras.
PUBLIC WORKS.

Dated July, 21st.

Recd.

Encl.

G.O., 21st July 1888, Nos. 2223,
2224 W.

JULY.

Public Works Department
Establishment

Offering certain observations with regard
to the proposed "Scheme for a separate
Imperial and Provincial establishment,
Public Works Department."

No. 1432 G.

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

GENERAL.

To

THE GOVERNMENTS OF MADRAS, POMBAY, BENGAL, THE NORTH-WESTERN PROV-
INCES AND OUDH, AND THE PUNJAB.
THE CHIEF COMMISSIONERS OF THE CENTRAL PROVINCES, BURMA, AND ASSAM.
THE RESIDENT AT HYDERABAD.
THE AGENT TO THE GOVERNOR-GENERAL FOR CENTRAL INDIA AND RAJPUTANA.

Simla, the 15th June, 1888.

SIR,

In the report issued by the Public Service Commission, copy of which has
already been forwarded to you by the Home Department, the following recom-
mendations are made regarding the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works
Department in Chapter X, paragraphs 91—98 of the Report:—

- (1).—That the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department
should consist of an Imperial Branch and of Provincial branches.
- (2).—That the Imperial Branch should consist of such a number of Royal
Engineers as may be required as a reserve for military purposes over
and above the officers employed in the Military Works Branch and
of Civil Engineers recruited in England.
- (3).—That the strength of the Imperial Branch should not be greater than
is necessary for purposes of control and direction, and for the
execution and repair of works calling for high engineering skill, and
that the recruitment from the Coopers Hill Royal Engineering
College, which appears at present excessive, should be regulated
accordingly.
- (4).—That the conditions of service in the Imperial Branch should be fixed
with a view to secure the necessary qualifications in England, and
should, as far as possible, be uniform for all officers employed in it.
- (5).—That the Provincial branches should be of a strength adequate for
the construction and maintenance in the several provinces of works
not ordinarily calling for high engineering skill.
- (6).—That the recruitment for the Provincial branches should be made by
the direct appointment to the lowest grades of qualified engineers
from the Indian Engineering Colleges, and in exceptional cases by
promotion from the Upper Subordinate grades.
- (7).—That there should be at least one college in India thoroughly well
equipped for providing a high education for Engineers for the Pro-
vincial branches, and that such college should be open to all classes
of Her Majesty's subjects.
- (8).—That the conditions of service as to pay, furlough and pension should
be fixed for the Provincial branches, without reference to those of
the Imperial Branch.

13884 1.6.86
33 9/11/11-12-87

2. I am directed to request that these recommendations may be considered by the *Government of Madras* in the light of the suggestions put forward in the accompanying memorandum, which has been prepared in this office as a basis for carrying out in their practical application the recommendations of the Commission.

3. The chief points on which definite proposals are required are enumerated in the first paragraph of the memorandum, and are fully discussed and proposals suggested in the succeeding paragraphs.

4. In regard to the first point, the recommendations of the *Government of Madras* are particularly requested as to the number of charges, if any, that must be held by men of the Imperial Establishment in *Madras*

in other words, what figures are recommended for the establishment of *Madras* to be placed in column D of Table A, in substitution of those tentatively inserted by this office.

I am also to enquire whether, in your opinion, the Engineers of the Railway Branch should be wholly Imperial, or whether there might be a mixture of Provincial men.

5. An equally important question is, whether, in the opinion of *H.E. the Govt in Council* a Provincial Service should be created between the proposed Imperial Service and the existing Subordinate Service, or whether the present Upper Subordinate Staff, if increased in numbers and perhaps improved in training, would suffice to perform the duties of the Provincial Service.

6. I am further to enquire whether, with reference to the 7th recommendation quoted above, *the Government of Madras* is satisfied with the training of the Indian College^s from which *it* now receive *such of its* recruits as are educated in this country, or would desire any other mode of recruitment for the Provincial Service, or any alteration in the system of education pursued in the College with which the Province is connected.

7. On these as well as on the other subjects mentioned in the memorandum, and also on any other points touched upon by the Public Service Commission, the views and recommendations of *H.E. the Govt in Council* are solicited by the Government of India; and I am to request that a reply to this enquiry may be furnished at the earliest possible date, and that, if possible, its return to this office may not be delayed beyond the 15th July.

I have the honour to be,

SIR,

Your most obedient Servant,

G. H. Walker

Under-Secretary.

Documents accompanying
Memorandum referred to.

Govt. C. Press, Simla. - No. 348 P. W. D. - 16-6-88 - 265.

To
The Secretary to the Government of Madras
Public Works Department

12 25P

Scheme for a Separate Imperial and Provincial Establishment, Public Works Department, prepared with reference to proposals by the Public Service Commission.

Assuming that separate Imperial and Provincial Establishments are to be organised, as recommended by the Public Service Commission, the points which have to be authoritatively settled are the following:—

1st.—What, looking into the far future, is to be the respective strength of each establishment? Does table A (see paragraph 2) give a fair distribution for the two services, and is the future Railway Branch to be wholly Imperial?

On this decision depends the rate of recruitment to be now ordered in substitution for the present rate.

2nd.—What are the rates of pay and promotion for the Provincial Establishment to be?

3rd.—Are the superior appointments to be on one scale of pay, and open by selection to Imperial and Provincial men alike?

4th.—In distributing the present establishment between Imperial and Provincial, at what grade are we to draw the line of separation in regard to men who are classed as "Indian Engineers;" and how far are we to give better prospects as regards pay to the men now in Government employ who may be placed in the Provincial Establishment than to men in future entering the establishment?

5th.—Looking to the smallness of the numbers in each service (as in statement A) in even the largest provinces, and still more in the smallest, is it possible to work them as separate and independent services, or should they be placed as regards promotion on a general list for all India, though without liability to transfer from one Province to another, except in the cases of the Local Administrations?

These points are discussed with tentative suggestions in detail below.

Sub-head 1.—STRENGTH OF EACH ESTABLISHMENT.

2. In order to illustrate what may be taken as a possible distribution of the present (revised) charges and posts of the several Provincial lists of the Public Works Department between an Imperial and Provincial Establishment, a table marked A has been prepared.

3. Columns Band C shew the revised strength as far as it has been settled, and the number of Executive charges on these lists, which include all but the Railway and Military Works Department lists.

4. The important columns upon which the rest are based are columns D and E. These distribute the Executive charges between Imperial and Provincial Engineers. The distribution must be more or less arbitrary. In provinces where, as in Bombay and Madras, there is no marked line between Buildings and Roads and Irrigation, and there is a good deal of irrigation, a slight preponderance is given to Imperial. For Bengal Buildings and Roads, only three Imperial charges are allowed, viz., for the Presidency Divisions and Under-Secretary; the irrigation establishment is equally divided between the two, so as to give a good leaven of Imperial. For Buildings and Roads Branch in the North-Western Provinces, Punjab, and Burma, there must probably be for some considerable time a good proportion of Imperial men, and the charges are divided equally. For the purely Irrigation charges of the North-Western Provinces and the Punjab, a slight preponderance is given to Imperial. The Buildings and Road charges of the smaller administration are assigned wholly to Provincial.

5. In fixing the total strength of the Imperial Establishment, it is necessary to provide that there should always be a sufficient number of Assistants in training for the Imperial Executive charges, the number of which is

suggested in column D. It has long since been laid down as an axiom that this training in the Assistant class should not last more than 8 to 10 years; and to induce this rate of advancement, the proportion of Assistant to Executive Engineers must be as 2 to 3. The total effective strength, as in column F, and the distribution of the whole strength, including allowance for absentees, as in columns H and I, are deduced accordingly from the number of Executive charges in column D by allowing the necessary proportion to induce this rate of promotion.

6. The balance of the establishment, according to the revised strength in column B, must be Provincial, and this establishment must fill the balance of Executive posts which remain after providing for the Imperial Establishment, and the rest must be Assistant Engineers. This is worked out in columns J to N. It will be observed that in the Provincial Establishment the Assistants greatly exceed the Executives—that is, we sacrifice the Provincial to the Imperial. It is reasonable that the rate of promotion in responsibility and pay (which depends on this distribution) for the Provincial Establishment should be slower than for the Imperial, but probably some device would be necessary to accelerate it.

7. The general result of the table, however, is that for these Provincial lists we require the following establishment of Executive and Assistant Engineers, including allowances for absentees:—

	Executives.	Assistants.	Total.
Imperial	95	66	161
Provincial	126	213	339

8. There then remain the Railway and Military Works Department lists, the former of which, we may tentatively assume, must be manned wholly by Imperial Engineers, namely, Coopers Hill and Royal Engineers, and the latter by Royal Engineers. If we assume that these lists must be manned throughout by Imperial Engineers, we may neglect the question of charges, and assume that, irrespective of the charges held, they must be divided into Executive and Assistant classes in the proportion necessary to give the proper flow of promotion.

9. The actual present strength calculated for the Railway Branch is 145, and 52 for the Military Works Department; and adding 15 per cent. to each for absentees, the establishment will be—

	Executives.	Assistants.	Total.
Railway	99	67	166
Military Works Department	36	24	60

and adding all the lists as above together we get as the total strength of Executives and Assistant Engineers for India—

	Executives.	Assistants.	Total.
Imperial	230	157	387
Provincial	123	213	339
Grand Total	356	370	726

10. Next, as to the superior posts above the rank of Executives and Assistants, which may be taken as 80. The distribution by classes of lists for these posts may be taken as follows:—

Provincial lists—Buildings and Roads and Irrigation	46
Railway Branch	27
Military Works Department	7

And assuming, solely for purposes of establishing the strength, that these posts would fall to Imperial and Provincial in proportion to their strength in the several lists, we should have—

	Imperial.	Provincial.	Total.
Provincial lists	15	31	46
Railway	27	...	27
Military Works Department	7	...	7
	49	31	80

or, in round numbers, 50 superior posts fall to Imperial and 30 to Provincial.

11. Allowing again 15 per cent. for absentees in these posts, the strength for Imperial and Provincial would be—

	Executives and Assistants.	Superior Posts.	Total.
Imperial	387	58	445
Provincial	339	35	374
			819

12. Now the above total strength is not far off the number (800) to which our present rate of recruitment is understood to be leading us; but there is considerable difference in the distribution of the Imperial and Provincial element, which at present is as follows:—

	Recruits.	Ultimate strength.
Imperial—	15	400
Coopers Hill	6	160
Royal Engineers	...	...
Provincial—	9	240
Indian Colleges	...	...
	30	800

That is, instead of tending to an establishment of 430 Imperial and 370 Provincial, as approximately worked out above, we are tending to one of 560 Imperial and 240 Provincial.

13. Again, if we take our present establishment of about 1,000 men, we find that it consists of 745 European Engineers, who answer to the Imperial, and of 255 Indian Engineers, who answer to the Provincial Establishment.

If, then, we intend to take steps to remodel the establishment in the direction indicated, we must modify our rate of recruitment.

14. Our present rate of recruitment is confessedly a reduced one, the full rate being 33 for a strength of 880 men; and the reduction was obtained by decreasing the number of Royal Engineer recruits from 9 to 6. It will probably be considered inadvisable under present circumstances to increase the total recruitment; but in making any modification we should recruit (if we can) up to the full ultimate Royal Engineer strength of about 250, as arranged with the Military Department in communication with the Home Government. The revised recruitment and strength according to the accepted estimates would then be—

	Recruits.	Estimated strength.
Imperial—	7	190
Coopers Hill	9	240
Royal Engineers	...	...
Provincial—	14	370
Indian Colleges	...	...
	30	800

15. According to this proposal, Coopers Hill, which began some years ago with an annual number of 40 or 45 appointments to the Public Works Department, now reduced to fifteen, would come down to seven.

16. The above conclusions and proposals may be summed up as follows:—

1st.—That, according to present estimates of strength and requirements of the different lists, we might work the Public Works Department with 430 Imperial (European) and 370 Provincial (Indian) Engineers.

2nd.—That we should so organise the Imperial Establishment re-arranged under the first proposal as to give what is considered the essential rate of promotion in the Executive grades.

3rd.—That if we decide to take this step, we should considerably increase the Indian recruitment and reduce the Coopers Hill element.

17. It is assumed that the Local Governments will be content to supply their Provincial services by recruits from the four Indian Colleges (Rurki, Sibpur, Poona, Madras), but if any other source of recruitment is advocated, or if any change should be made in the system there pursued so as to provide a higher education for Provincial Engineers than they now get, its nature should be explained in the reply to this memorandum.

Sub-head 2.—RATES OF PAY AND PROMOTION OF THE PROVINCIAL ESTABLISHMENT.

18. The Provincial Establishment, according to the suggestions made above, will be organised on the following main lines:—

Superior posts	...	...	...	...	30
Executive posts	...	...	...	...	127
Assistants	...	...	...	...	213
					370

The above ratio between Executives and Assistants would give promotion from one class to the other in about the 16th or 17th year of service.

19. Then as to the rate of pay for this establishment, the Public Service Commission recommends that it should be fixed without reference to that of the Imperial Establishment.

As we shall have to commence the establishment with a very few men all in the lower grades, and as it will gradually increase to a considerable strength under the influence of an increased number of recruits, it will probably be better to give an incremental scale; in fact, the only alternative to this would be a graded scale adjusted periodically to give approximately the same rate of promotion as that which the incremental scale will give.

20. If the rate of pay of the Provincial Service is fixed on the same sort of scale as has hitherto been current, then the salaries of the Executive and Assistant grades might be as follows; but this is merely put forward as a suggestion on which to work, and because some definite proposals are required:—

	Period in grade.	Promotion possible at end of
Apprentice on Rs. 100	...	1 year 1st year.
Assistant Engineer class—		
2nd grade, Rs. 125—25—250	...	5 years 6th "
1st " Rs. 271—25—400	...	5 " 11th "
Executive Engineer class—		
2nd grade, Rs. 450—30—600	...	5 " 16th "
1st " Rs. 600—30—750	...	5 " 21st "
An increment of Rs. 50 after two years	...	2 " 23rd "
" " "	...	2 " 25th "

The maximum pay thus obtainable by men in the 1st grade of Executives would be Rs. 850, and they would attain this about the end of the 47th year of their age at the earliest, that is, after passing through the grades as fast as they could. The above arrangement of grades would distribute Executives and Assistant Engineers in about equal proportions and would perpetuate the present anomaly of giving men the pay and rank of Executives and the work of Assistants. If the ratio of 127 Executives to 213 Assistants, as in paragraph 18, is to be maintained, the period of service in the class of Assistant Engineer must be considerably enlarged; temporary promotions from class to class should be allowed only for change of duties.

21. It is probable however that some instructions of a general character may be issued by the Government of India regarding the scale of salaries to be allotted to the Provincial Service in all Departments; and as the question of the pay of this branch of the Public Works Department does not press so

urgently for a solution as does that of the number of posts to be set apart for them, on which an early decision as to future recruitment depends, it may perhaps be convenient if an answer on this sub-head be deferred till the Government of India has declared its opinion on the general question.

22. It is possible moreover, that Local Governments may hold that it is not necessary to create a new Provincial Service between the Imperial and the present Subordinate Service, but that all the work for which the Imperial Service is not required can be effectually performed by an enlargement of the upper ranks of the present Subordinate Service and without alteration of their present salaries. If this view is entertained, it is hoped that definite proposals as to the number, grades, and recruitment of this Upper Subordinate Service will be submitted in replying to this memorandum.

Sub-head 3.—WHETHER THE SUPERIOR APPOINTMENTS ARE TO BE ON ONE SCALE OF PAY, AND OPEN WITHOUT DISTINCTION TO IMPERIAL AND PROVINCIAL MEN.

23. Another question to be decided is whether the superior appointments above the Executive grade should carry the same pay whether held by Provincial or Imperial men, and whether men of each establishment should be appointed by selection to these posts, or whether there should be any reservation of a proportionate share of the posts for each establishment.

24. It would be easier to allow a separate scale of pay for these posts if there were any prospects of working Provincial Establishments without any admixture of Imperial men; for there may be some difficulty in making an Imperial Executive Engineer on Rs. 1,000 work under a Provincial Superintending Engineer on Rs. 900, or an Imperial Superintending Engineer on Rs. 1,600 under a Provincial Chief Engineer on Rs. 1,500. It would be probably equally difficult to arrange that Provincial men shall only serve under Provincial, and Imperial men under Imperial, when men of both services are employed in the same branch.

25. This will be seen at once from the figures below, which are based on the supposition that the superior posts are divided between Imperial and Provincial men approximately according to the numerical proportion of each:—

	Chief Engineers.	Superintending Engineers.
Buildings and Roads Branch—		
Imperial	6	5
Provincial	2	21
Irrigation—		
Imperial	3	3
Provincial	...	6
Total	11	35

That is to say, in the Buildings and Roads Branch the bulk of the Superintending Engineer appointments would be held by Provincial men, who would thus come into contact with Imperial men, while it would be difficult to prevent the Chief Engineers of the Provincial Establishment from being placed over Imperial men. In the Irrigation Branch, the Provincial and Imperial appointments would be about equally divided, and the Imperial men would generally hold the Chief Engineerships. On the whole, the probable conclusion seems to be that, unless an establishment can be wholly worked by Provincial or by Imperial men, it will be simpler to have only one scale of pay for the superior appointments. This uniformity of pay is irrespective of the question whether a fixed proportion of the superior appointments should be given to Provincial men, or whether no proportion of the whole number of superior appointments dependent on the strength of each should be laid down for either establishment, but the best men should be selected from either class with due regard to the claims of seniority.

Sub-head 4.—DISTRIBUTION OF THE PRESENT ESTABLISHMENT BETWEEN IMPERIAL AND PROVINCIAL, AND TRANSITION FROM THE PRESENT TO THE NEW ORGANISATION.

26. The present distribution of the establishment between European and Indian Engineers, which two classes are ultimately to correspond with the Imperial and Provincial, is as follows:—

	European.	Indian.	Total.
Chief Engineers and officers ranking as such	24	...	24
Superintending Engineers and officers ranking as such	49	7	56
Executive Engineers	354	106	460
Assistant Engineers	318	142	460
	745	255	1,000
As compared with our ultimate scale of	430	370	800

It may be calculated roughly that, if we alter the rate of recruitment as suggested in paragraph 14, we should increase the Indian Establishment to the revised number of 370 by about the year 1903, and that similarly the European Establishment would be considerably reduced by the same period, and would be approximating to the ultimate number.

27. The difficulty is where and how to start the Indian Establishment as a separate organisation to the European; when and where to draw the line.

28. The position is that we have now one establishment of European and Indian Engineers on one scale of pay, and we want to divide this establishment into two separate establishments, one of which will be on a lower scale of pay. It is also very desirable, in order to hasten the new organisation, that the separation should include some of the present establishment.

29. The problem is how to make this separation equitably. In the first place, the line between each class, the European and Indian Engineers, though clearly marked in the lower grades, which are filled by men recruited in definite proportions from Coopers Hill and from Indian Colleges, is not so clearly marked in the upper grades; and the men in these upper grades would look upon it as a very great grievance and slur upon them to be placed in a class which must inevitably be looked upon as the inferior class. Some of them, though not a very large number, are men whose domicile is in England. It is thought therefore, irrespective of any question of altering the rate of pay of present incumbents, that none of the men now in the higher grades can be placed in the inferior Service. It is suggested, however, that the line may be drawn below either the 3rd or the 4th grade of Executive Engineers, and that all the Indian Engineers may be placed below this line in a separate list, which will be the commencement of our Provincial Establishment. All the men below the line, with very few exceptions, if any, are Natives, Eurasians, or Europeans whose domicile is in India.

30. It does not follow, however, that relegation to the inferior establishment must of necessity mean decrease of even prospective pay to all. The following compares the present rates common to the whole establishment with the rate proposed for the new class:—

	Present scale. Rs.	Suggested Provincial. Rs.
Apprentice	100	100
Assistant Engineer, 4th grade	250	125
" " 3rd "	250	250
" " 2nd "	350 to 400	275
" " 1st "	500	400
Executive Engineer, 4th grade	600	450
" " 3rd "	700	600
" " 2nd "	800	600
" " 1st "	950	850

31. The proposal is that men below the present 3rd grade, that is, men on Rs. 600, Rs. 500, Rs. 350, Rs. 250, and Rs. 100, should pass over to the new Provincial Establishment; but to prevent inequitable reduction in their prospective

pay, it might be provided that two additional increments of Rs. 50 each should be allowable to men of the present 4th grade Executive and 1st and 2nd grade Assistant so as to bring their pay ultimately up to Rs. 950. Meanwhile all would pass into the new grades; that is, the 4th grade Executive Engineer, after completing five years on Rs. 600, would be eligible for promotion to the Rs. 600—850 grade, and by further periodical increments might rise to Rs. 950. Similarly, the 1st grade Assistant would pass into the new Rs. 450—600 grade, and would receive increments and be eligible for promotion in due course. The 2nd grade Assistant would pass into the Rs. 275—400 grade, and would rise on the same principle. The 3rd grade Assistant should be promoted to the Rs. 275—400 grade on the same conditions as they would have been promoted to the present 2nd grade on Rs. 350, and should then go on regularly through the new grades; but there is no need, it is thought, to give them increments beyond the new scale as in the case of the other two grades.

32. Summarising, the proposals are as follows:—

- (1) To place about 80 men of the 1st, 2nd, and 3rd grades of Executives, notwithstanding that they are Indian Engineers, in the Imperial list of Engineers, and to place them on exactly the same footing as regards pay as the European Engineer. Their pensions to follow the same rules as now.
- (2) To place 23 4th grade Executives, 98 1st grade, and 29 2nd grade Assistants, who are Indian Engineers, in the new Provincial list, but to allow them to draw up to Rs. 950 in the 1st grade.
- (3) To put 15 3rd grade Assistants and apprentices wholly on the new rates of pay proposed for the Provincial Establishment: in other words, to deal with them as with the recruits.

33. The effect of the above proposals would be to modify the immediate distribution of the Imperial and Provincial Establishments as follows:—

	Imperial.	Provincial.	Total.
Chief Engineers and officers ranking as such	24	...	24
Superintending Engineers and officers ranking as such	56	...	56
Executive Engineers	437	23	460
Assistant Engineers	318	142	460
	835	165	1,000

Sub-head 5.—WHETHER THE SEVERAL LISTS CAN BE WORKED AS SEPARATE AND INDEPENDENT SERVICES.

34. The Provincial Establishment being at present so small would have probably to be organised for some years to come as one list. Its distribution at the present moment as compared with the ultimate Provincial Establishment estimated for each list as in table A would be as follows:—

	Engineers, 4th grade.	Assistants.	Total.	Ultimate Total.
Bombay	1	15	16	40
Madras	1	5	6	47
Bengal—Buildings and Roads	3	11	14	14
" Irrigation Branch	2	5	7	28
North-Western Provinces—Buildings and Roads	2	16	18	28
North-Western Provinces—Irrigation Branch	3	9	12	35
Punjab—Buildings and Roads	2	18	20	28
" Irrigation Branch	2	10	12	34
Burma	2	8	10	29
Assam	2	3	5	15
Rajputana and Central India	1	7	8	10
Hyderabad	...	2	2	18
Central Provinces	...	6	6	12
Coorg	...	...	...	1
	19	115	134	339
Railways	4	27	31	...
	23	142	165	339

35. It would be hardly possible, it is thought, with these small numbers to give each list a graded scale on which promotions might be made; but the scale of pay proposed would obviate many difficulties likely to arise on this score. Care would have to be taken, however, by the central authority, that is the Government of India, that the distribution of Executives and Assistants to each list should be reasonable.

36. Summarising again, the proposed organisation would be as follows for some years to come:—

1st.—An Imperial Establishment on separate lists as at present, consisting of all the present European and about 80 Indian Engineers.

This list on the present rate of recruitment being altered from 21 to 16 would gradually decrease from its present number of 835 to 430.

2nd.—A Provincial Establishment on one list, but under the control of the Local Governments, on scale of pay fixed as suggested in paragraph 18.

37. Eventually, as the strength of the Imperial Establishment diminished and that of the Provincial increased under the influence of the altered rate of recruitment, the Provincial list might be split up, and each list made over wholly to the Local Governments, while the Imperial Establishment should be consolidated into one list.

38. In the above proposals nothing has been said about the promotion of Upper Subordinates to the Provincial Establishment which has been recommended by the Commission (paragraph 96, Chapter X). Such promotions would perhaps not be numerous; and they would not materially affect the strength; in fact, at first they would probably be an assistance to the efficiency of the establishment. The men promoted would come in to some suitable place in the Provincial scale, and would rise in it.

39. As regards furlough and pension, it will probably be held that each class of Engineers now in the Department should retain the furlough and pension rules to which they are now liable; that is to say, those who are now classed as European Engineers, and have the more favourable leave and pension rules, or the pension rules only, as the case may be, will retain those rules intact. At the same time those Indian Engineers who, it is suggested, should be classed on special grounds as Imperial Engineers would retain their present rules, which are those of the Uncovenanted Service.

40. The rest of the Indian Engineers now in Government employ whom we propose to class as Provincial would retain their present rules—those, namely, of the Uncovenanted Service.

41. In regard, however, to the men to be hereafter recruited into the Provincial Establishment, the suggestions of Local Governments are invited as to whether they should be pensionable or not; and, if pensionable, whether they should come under the present rules of the Uncovenanted Service or under modified rules; and, lastly, whether those who rise to the superior appointments should be eligible, as now, to the superior scale of pensions for European Engineers.

Table A.

Province or List.	Revised strength, exclusive of absentees.	Total Number of Executive charges.	DISTRIBUTION OF CHARGES.		IMPERIAL STRENGTH DEDUCED FROM D.					PROVINCIAL STRENGTH.			
			Imperial.	Provincial.	Present on duty D + E.	Total strength F + 15%.	Executive Engineer. H.	Assistant Engineer. I.	Present on duty B + F.	Allowance for absentees @ 10%.	Total J + K.	Executive Engineer E + 10%.	Assistant Engineer L + M.
A.	B.	C.	D.	E.	F.	G.	H.	I.	J.	K.	L.	M.	N.
Bombay	64	33	17	16	28	33	19	13	36	4	40	18	22
Madras	68	29	16	14	25	29	17	12	43	4	47	16	31
Bengal—Buildings and Roads	18	9	3	6	5	6	4	2	13	1	14	7	7
Irrigation Branch	37	14	7	7	12	14	8	6	25	3	28	8	20
North-Western Provinces—Buildings and Roads	33	10	5	5	8	9	5	4	25	3	28	6	22
North-Western Provinces—Irrigation Branch	47	16	9	9	15	17	10	7	32	3	35	8	27
Punjab—Buildings and Roads	40	18	9	9	15	17	10	7	25	3	28	10	18
Irrigation Branch	46	17	9	8	15	17	10	7	31	3	34	11	25
Burma	43	20	10	10	17	20	12	8	26	3	29	12	18
Assam	13	11	...	11	...	...	...	...	13	2	15	5	8
Rajputana and Central India	9	4	...	4	...	...	...	...	9	1	10	3	5
Hyderabad	16	7	...	7	...	...	...	...	16	2	18	8	10
Central Provinces	11	6	...	6	...	...	...	...	11	1	12	7	6
Coorg	1	1	...	1	...	...	...	...	1	...	1	1	...
Total mixed list	446	195	84	111	140	161	95	66	306	33	339	126	213

Para 4

The production proposed
is about $\frac{1}{2}$ Subordinate
 $\frac{1}{2}$ Provincial
Judging from the sum that
has been given to the
Indian College and taking
into consideration the
importance of the Division
in Madras 17 of which are
important irrigation works
and 2 of which are schools
I consider the production
of Subordinate should be 3 to
1 Provincial ~~as~~ and
certainly not less than 3
to 2. This fact would
in my opinion be too small
a production.

With regard to the Recruiting
Branch, I cannot see any
reason why if admissible
in principle it is the other
Branches (Irrigation especially)
to employ Provincial men
the same should not be done
in that Branch.

Para 5

In my opinion the present
Upper Subordinate Staff (if
increased) is sufficient and
if ~~not~~ selected men from
the lower grades were
promoted to the vacant
upper carrying higher pay
would suffice to perform

The duties further in
(What is if the numbers
of the P. series are included
the new Provincial Law
the proposed being the
which is the lower
ranker is then too low
consider the attract-geom
room or to allow them
to take the position of
Asst. Eng. as they sh^d do.

The training at the
Academy of Eng. & College
is entirely theoretical
and must be so. I consider
that we must train it
sh^d be adapted as an
Asst. Eng. or high up
in the Officer Subordinate
until he has passed
him by actual work in
the lower grades as ge
action and practical
man

MWH

27/6/00

Letter shown to H. M. who
dislikes it. He said at
once to Mr. H. H. H. H.
He does not think the pay
proposed for Provincial Asst. Eng.
too small

MWH

Notes on
Scheme for a Separate Imperial
& Provincial Select.

Subhead 1. - Strength of each Select.

In the Scheme as illustrated by
Table A it is proposed to
elect 15 Imperial Divⁿ & 14 Prov.
Divⁿ to the Divⁿ. Counting the head
Divⁿ only found in the District
there are known only 27 Divⁿ
but with the temporary Divⁿ of
Peshawar. Planned & Persian
there will be 30. However, it is understood to some
extent that the number of
charges equal with that given
in Table A. A list of the Persa
head Divⁿ is attached & that
case has been given the selection
of those which should be done
as Imperial and it does not
seem possible to elect any of these
Persa as Imperial or as
Provincial Select. which. The large
other systems included in Golestan
District, Helmand, Fergana & Khorasan
must it is considered always be
Imperial. Belling, West Coast,
Persian & Amghat have imperial
Military Building besides in the case
of the first & last named imperial
works of great importance. Helmand
is the best of the for part of the
war & Military Head Quarters.

Note A. & S. must have very
 important instructions, such as
 minute & details as line of the
 longer tasks in the Presidency, and
 the Presidency Watsloffe & President
 Architects. Since must change in
 the Presidency & since must with Capt. and also in
 Imperial, but there have 20 Sept
 & 9 Provincial against 15 & 14, and
 this is doing something and
 the classed as Provincial which cer-
 tainly should not be done until the
 Canal is completed.

The Assistant Engineers in the
 Imperial class should be promoted
 to Genl. in 8 or 10 years is quite
 agreed in, but it is considered that
 if an Assistant in the Provincial ^{class} ~~class~~
 is compared to the marks on Genl.
 Eng. he should not have Genl.
 16 or 17 years for the promotion.
 Most of the Provincial class, it is con-
 sidered in nature the begin to find
 old & often captured better than
 European and a man should be
 at his best in body, young when
 in Genl. Eng.

The Provincial class should it is
 considered be recruited from the Indian
 Colleges, but there is one point in
 connection with these colleges which
 has not been brought to notice. They
 should never be more than one college
 for Engineers in India any more
 than in England. Travelling is
 now a days easy & not so expensive

Newton's is least the highest appoint-
 ments must be able to afford it. &
 they ^{may be} called upon during their service
 to any part of India. It is rather
 for consideration whether the Regius
 College at Rome would not meet the
 requirements of the whole of India,
 the other colleges educating only up
 to the upper Subordinate Standard.
 It is believed that such a course
 would be economical & we should
 get rid of the present very objectionable
 arrangement by which the highest
 student in the class is made an
 assistant Regius while the second
 into the one or two last marks in
 the class being considered himself first.
 But if he can obtain an appointment
 as 3rd paid assistant before leaving
 some months for it.

Sub Head 2. Rates of Pay & Promotion
of Imperial Patels.

Supporting ^{Upper} Subordinate Patels to
 remain as it is the scale of pay
 for expected in 1880 being too
 low. an appointment is given the
 same pay as 1st paid assistant.
 an assistant 2nd paid being a
 lower pay than a Subordinate 2nd paid
 & an A. S. 1st paid a lower
 pay than a Sub. Sup. 2nd paid.
 The double rates of pay ^{expected} for the
 Regius but this must not be

but it is considered that some
 provision should also be made
 for promoting specially deserving
 Subordinates to the higher
 class. and this might be done by
 promoting from the 1st grade Supervisors
 occasionally. Men would ^{not} attain this
 grade without several years experience
 in the Dept. & would not then be too
 old to commence as active business.
 Col. Wood has indeed suggested that
 the Provincial Inf. Service should be
 limited to men from deserving Subordi-
 nates, but ^{new entry to} unless ^{Service} Subordinates are
 also educated up to the higher standard
 it is considered that promotion from
 Subordinates should better ^{be} exception &
 not the rule. If ^{in special cases} men are selected
 from the 1st grade of Capt. whose pay
 is 200 Rs it follows that the pay of
 2nd grade officers should not be less
 than 250 Rs & subsequent promotions
 should be considered for an increase
 of 100 Rs per annum or such ^{amount} as
 would bring the pay of the grade to
 $\frac{2}{3}$ of the present pay.

Sub. Head 3. Whether the Superior
 appointments can be on an scale
 of pay or. The superior app^{ts}
 above the Executive grade are not
 always made by the higher P^{ts} &
 they should be, by election, and
 this being the case, the app^{ts} should

be open about distinction to Dept.
& Provincial level, but feeling that
has been laid down, the pay of the
latest should be only $\frac{2}{3}$ of the former.

Subhead 4. Distinction of Present
Salary & Transition (Relief from Anxiety)

Intense interference with the prospects
of men who entered the Service with
certain expectations it will be extremely
difficult to effect the transition to the
new organization. To those who have
who have lately entered the Service
the prospect of some future reduction
must have appeared more or less
a matter of certainty. The pay therefore
when the rank of Assistant ^{Major} after
Provincial Service might be fixed
after that scale, and there seems to be
no reason why the Provincial should
not be at once left without further
imperial list, so long as present
incumbents in grades above Assistant
Major ^{the} ~~scale of pay~~ can be secured. ^{scale of pay}
~~scale of pay~~ up to date of retirement.
They would be classified after that
list but receive the present scale of
pay as a personal allowance.

Sub Head 5. Whether the Provincial List
can be worked as separate &
independent Service. This is
a large subject but as it involves

the question of an amalgamated
 Imperial list for the India & the
 Egyptian apparently is to make
 an amalgamated Provincial list
 to be let into while the numbers
 on the list are small, but when
 the numbers are much increased the
 Provincial list be split up & the
 portions made out of the Provincial
 list, while the Imperial list which
 used then to have been reduced should
 be amalgamated. I proposed
 of the P. & I. finding other amalga-
 mation of the Imperial list was lately
 under the consideration & in a list?
 after delay it was decided that
 amalgamation of the higher ranks
 alone P. & I. was beginning to be long
 but that the junior officers should
 have separation of different parts of
 India in the first place. As matters
 stand at present a beginning has been
 made in giving officers of the Se: Inf.
 Indian service in different Provinces.
 Madras has had & still has several
 officers from other Provinces filling
 temporary appointments & though at present
 other Provinces do not, as a matter
 of course, give up the services of
 their best men, there seems to be
 no reason why in future not only
 should the Imperial list be supplied in

Supply in one Province meet the
 demand in another, the exchanges
 be made ~~both~~ in the former parts which
 could not fail the of advantage
 the officers & ultimately the pub.
 That eventually an ^{and} list for the
 whole of India will be possible &
 advantageous is admitted and the
 only question seems the whether
 it shall be an Imperial list only
 the Provincial lists being separate
 & under the Provincial Govt. Many
 objections appear to in form of this
 arrangement might be added, but
 it seems best until the time comes
 for making the amalgamation. The
 question need not be considered.
 Meanwhile the Dept. & Prov. lists
 both being under the Prov. Govt. can
 it is considered to best control
 together as one list.

As regards the question whether the
 men in the Provincial lists shall
 be pensionable or not, it is considered
 that they must be pensionable. The
 basis of temporary employment which
 may cease at a month's notice is, in
 a country where so many are attached
 to the taking of bribes, the temptation
 to a man in power to add to his
 gains indirectly. Not pensionable
 service is the strongest inducement
 to honesty, as demanded for dishonesty.

9
K5
Details the loss of everything in
the future. As the scale of pensions
it is considered must be different than
those for different services &
that they should be those of the
unconfronted service and in dealing
with the future the tendency should be
to reduce not to increase the pensions
which, though in language means
of the scale in value of the service, they
cannot be made so much of as
indefinite, as it is considered as
a rather too liberal scale, and
therefore the value of the service
should apply to the appointments

John
9/7/88

For orders

To J

107
My latest advice
states that Colonel
Hastid will be leaving
Bangalore towards the
end of the week - day
not fixed. It would
be safer, perhaps, to
send the papers to meet
him at Madras - where
such information as
may be necessary could
be got ready?

NS

28.11.86

Ops Memo sent to
Madras it is safer

MS

W
27.11.86

NS
28.11.86

103
Pharm. send my Nite
and a copy of Gw of I
letter a note to Ed Husted
at once.

Also a copy of the letter
and Nite of Gw of I
to H. H. and H. E.
with a note that it has
been sent to Ed Husted.

YMA
28/6/08

Imperial 51

Principals

Lochacum	-	3
Kistina	-	3
Kellora	-	1
Mellora	-	1
Bentingham	-	1
Bakany	-	1
Wae Coet	-	1
Pamir	-	1
Cambalun	-	1
Kilgini	-	1
Kint Arcot	-	1
Lint Arcot	-	1
Amjla	-	1
Pesidany	-	1
Pesidany	-	1
Tanjore	-	1
Kegapala	-	1
Candling	-	1
		20
		3

Principals

Gangam	-	1
Kigapala	-	1
Andelapala	-	1
Kumool	-	1
Trichinopoly	-	1
Madura	-	1
Tanjore	-	1
		7
Bentingham	-	1
Cambalun	-	1
		9

of this post to submit their
 change of opinion of the Provincial
 Service. The Buckingham Canal
 has been elected as Provincial on
 the supposition that the scheme could
 be fully introduced at present, until
 the completion estimates are wanted
 but it must be an Imperial charge.
 The figure in Column D of Table
 A from which the ^{figure in} subsequent
 columns are deduced is therefore
 20 instead of 15.

This post concurs in the view that
 Assist. Engrs. ^{in the Imperial class} should be promoted to
 Executives in 8 or 10 years at latest,
 but they are of opinion that
 Assistants in the Provincial class
 should obtain their promotion before
 they are 16 years ^{in the} service, otherwise,
 in many instances a man will be
 past his prime before he is promoted,
 and an Exec. Engr. ^{should} be a man
 of considerable energy & activity.

As regards the manner from which
 the Provincial Service should be
 recruited, this post are of opinion
 that as a rule Assist. Engrs. should
 be obtained from the C.E. Colleges in
 India, but that in special cases
 it will be desirable to promote from
 the Subordinate Staff. They are
 of opinion however that ^{present} existing
 the facilities for recruiting in India

Considerable Economy may be effected by confining the higher education necessary for Post-Graduate Bone College alone in India, and they ^{suggest} Poona as, being the most centrally situated, as ^{its} most convenient location; the other Colleges would then be restricted to the course of education necessary for admission to the upper subordinate grades.

Sub-head 2. As regards the
 rates of pay & promotion of the Provin-
 cial Supts. this is the case of opinion
 that ^{of A.S. & S.S.} ~~the~~ ^{the} pay may be
 fixed while reference of the
 Imperial Supts. but not the scale
 for in para 20 of the "Scheme"
 commences too low, and with the
 exception of the Assistant Supts.
 which it is presumed corresponds with
 that of men under practical training,
 and the system of granting yearly
 increments does not commend itself
 either. It, as suggested above,
 Upper Subordinates are able in
 special cases promoted as Engineers
 the lowest grade the grade from which
 they would be promoted would
 probably be that of Supt. 1st Grade
 which would contain men of considerable
 experience & not too old for the
 work & in any case
 the pay must be at least equal
 to that of Supt. 1st Grade. If

yearly increments are from the pay
might amount to 200Rs, but if, as
this R^t would prefer, the increments
are five, the pay of A.E. 2^d grade
should be 250Rs. An A.E. 1st grade
1st grade would then receive 350Rs
and there might be 4 grades of
less. Each step of promotion
giving an increase in pay of Rs 100.
After 2 years in the highest grade
an addition of Rs 50 might be made
& after another 2 years a further
addition of Rs 50 is expected.

Subhead 3 The Superior adds
above the grade of Executive Eng^r
are changes made by this R^t by
selection, and this being the case
the R^t are of opinion that these
appointments should be open to all
distinction to be on Imperial
& Provincial lists, and that
there should be one scale of pay
for them.

Sub head 4. Instead of interfering
with the prospects of men who
believed the service with certain
expectations it will be extremely
difficult to effect the transition
to the new organization. Those
however who have lately believed
the service the prospect of some
advancement has not been fully explained
in the service. This R^t are therefore of

opinion that the pay, down
the scale of Civil List in the
Provincial Service might be fixed
on the new scale, and that there is
no need on any the Dept. Board
should not be at once separated
from the Dept. List, so long as
present incumbents in grades above
Civil List are secured the present
scale of pay up to date of retirement.

Sub head 5. The suggestion in
the Scheme is apparently to form
an amalgamated Provincial List
which would be retained while the
numbers on the list are small, but
when the numbers are much
increased to split it up, meeting
over the positions of the Provincial
List while the Departmental List
which would then be retained should
be amalgamated. Another object
of amalgamating the Dept. List
this list has already expressed
an opinion in letter 12. 1880
and they would only have one
thing to do for the further considera-
tion of the subject until the
Departmental List are very considerably
increased. But they are of opinion
that it will be best in every
way to start & continue the

6
63
Provincial ^{Right} ~~Left~~ under the Provincial
as we list
fr^{ts} who would work it, with
the existing Left Estate.

As regards the present election
the men on the Prov. Left should
be persuasive on vote, this fr^{ts}
are very things of opinion and
they should become persistent, and
that rules of the Unconv. League
should apply likewise.

2. In the above the questions asked
in paras 2 to 7 of your letter and
reply have been answered, with
the exception of that in the latter
part of para 4, with respect
to which I am sorry that this
fr^{ts} is of opinion that for political
reasons, for some time to come
at all events, the Congress of
the Railway Branch should
be wholly Imperial.

L. C.

16/7/95

63
No. 1432 G.

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

GENERAL.

To

THE GOVERNMENTS OF MADRAS, BOMBAY, BENGAL, THE NORTH-WESTERN PROVINCES AND OUDH, AND THE PUNJAB.

THE CHIEF COMMISSIONERS OF THE CENTRAL PROVINCES, BURMA, AND ASSAM.

THE RESIDENT AT HYDERABAD.

THE AGENT TO THE GOVERNOR-GENERAL FOR CENTRAL INDIA AND RAJPUTANA.

Simla, the 15th June, 1888.

SIR,

In the report issued by the Public Service Commission, copy of which has already been forwarded to you by the Home Department, the following recommendations are made regarding the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department in Chapter X, paragraphs 91—98 of the Report:—

- (1).—That the Engineer Establishment of the Public Works Department should consist of an Imperial Branch and of Provincial branches.
- (2).—That the Imperial Branch should consist of such a number of Royal Engineers as may be required as a reserve for military purposes over and above the officers employed in the Military Works Branch and of Civil Engineers recruited in England.
- (3).—That the strength of the Imperial Branch should not be greater than is necessary for purposes of control and direction, and for the execution and repair of works calling for high engineering skill, and that the recruitment from the Coopers Hill Royal Engineering College, which appears at present excessive, should be regulated accordingly.
- (4).—That the conditions of service in the Imperial Branch should be fixed with a view to secure the necessary qualifications in England, and should, as far as possible, be uniform for all officers employed in it.
- (5).—That the Provincial branches should be of a strength adequate for the construction and maintenance in the several provinces of works not ordinarily calling for high engineering skill.
- (6).—That the recruitment for the Provincial branches should be made by the direct appointment to the lowest grades of qualified engineers from the Indian Engineering Colleges, and in exceptional cases by promotion from the Upper Subordinate grades.
- (7).—That there should be at least one college in India thoroughly well equipped for providing a high education for Engineers for the Provincial branches, and that such college should be open to all classes of Her Majesty's subjects.
- (8).—That the conditions of service as to pay, furlough and pension should be fixed for the Provincial branches, without reference to those of the Imperial Branch.

2

2. I am directed to request that these recommendations may be considered by the suggestions put forward in the accompanying memorandum, which has been prepared in this office as a basis for carrying out in their practical application the recommendations of the Commission.

3. The chief points on which definite proposals are required are enumerated in the first paragraph of the memorandum, and are fully discussed and proposals suggested in the succeeding paragraphs.

4. In regard to the first point, the recommendations of the are particularly requested as to the number of charges, if any, that must be held by men of the Imperial Establishment in

in other words, what figures are recommended for the establishment of to be placed in column D of Table A, in substitution of those tentatively inserted by this office.

I am also to enquire whether, in your opinion, the Engineers of the Railway Branch should be wholly Imperial, or whether there might be a mixture of Provincial men.

5. An equally important question is, whether, in the opinion of a Provincial Service should be created between the proposed Imperial Service and the existing Subordinate Service, or whether the present Upper Subordinate Staff, if increased in numbers and perhaps improved in training, would suffice to perform the duties of the Provincial Service.

6. I am further to enquire whether, with reference to the 7th recommendation quoted above, ^{the Government of} ^{you are} satisfied with the training of the Indian College* from which ^{the} ^{you} now receive ^{such of its} ^{your} recruits as are educated in this country, or would desire any other mode of recruitment for the Provincial Service, or any alteration in the system of education pursued in the College with which the Province is connected.

7. On these as well as on the other subjects mentioned in the memorandum, and also on any other points touched upon by the Public Service Commission, the views and recommendations of the are solicited by the Government of India; and I am to request that a reply to this enquiry may be furnished at the earliest possible date, and that, if possible, its return to this office may not be delayed beyond the 15th July.

I have the honour to be,

SIR,

Your most obedient Servant,

G. H. D. WALKER,
Under-Secretary.

Documents accompanying
Memorandum referred to.

Scheme for a Separate Imperial and Provincial Establishment, Public Works Department, prepared with reference to proposals by the Public Service Commission.

Assuming that separate Imperial and Provincial Establishments are to be organised, as recommended by the Public Service Commission, the points which have to be authoritatively settled are the following:—

1st.—What, looking into the far future, is to be the respective strength of each establishment? Does table A (see paragraph 2) give a fair distribution for the two services, and is the future Railway Branch to be wholly Imperial?

On this decision depends the rate of recruitment to be now ordered in substitution for the present rate.

2nd.—What are the rates of pay and promotion for the Provincial Establishment to be?

3rd.—Are the superior appointments to be on one scale of pay, and open by selection to Imperial and Provincial men alike?

4th.—In distributing the present establishment between Imperial and Provincial, at what grade are we to draw the line of separation in regard to men who are classed as "Indian Engineers;" and how far are we to give better prospects as regards pay to the men now in Government employ who may be placed in the Provincial Establishment than to men in future entering the establishment?

5th.—Looking to the smallness of the numbers in each service (as in statement A) in even the largest provinces, and still more in the smallest, is it possible to work them as separate and independent services, or should they be placed as regards promotion on a general list for all India, though without liability to transfer from one Province to another, except in the cases of the Local Administrations?

These points are discussed with tentative suggestions in detail below.

Sub-head 1.—STRENGTH OF EACH ESTABLISHMENT.

2. In order to illustrate what may be taken as a possible distribution of the present (revised) charges and posts of the several Provincial lists of the Public Works Department between an Imperial and Provincial Establishment, a table marked A has been prepared.

3. Columns B and C shew the revised strength as far as it has been settled, and the number of Executive charges on these lists, which include all but the Railway and Military Works Department lists.

4. The important columns upon which the rest are based are columns D and E. These distribute the Executive charges between Imperial and Provincial Engineers. The distribution must be more or less arbitrary. In provinces where, as in Bombay and Madras, there is no marked line between Buildings and Roads and Irrigation, and there is a good deal of irrigation, a slight preponderance is given to Imperial. For Bengal Buildings and Roads, only three Imperial charges are allowed, viz., for the Presidency Divisions and Under-Secretary; the irrigation establishment is equally divided between the two, so as to give a good leaven of Imperial. For Buildings and Roads Branch in the North-Western Provinces, Punjab, and Burma, there must probably be for some considerable time a good proportion of Imperial men, and the charges are divided equally. For the purely Irrigation charges of the North-Western Provinces and the Punjab, a slight preponderance is given to Imperial. The Buildings and Road charges of the smaller administrations are assigned wholly to Provincial.

5. In fixing the total strength of the Imperial Establishment, it is necessary to provide that there should always be a sufficient number of Assistants in training for the Imperial Executive charges, the number of which is

suggested in column D. It has long since been laid down as an axiom that this training in the Assistant class should not last more than 8 to 10 years; and to induce this rate of advancement, the proportion of Assistant to Executive Engineers must be as 2 to 3. The total effective strength, as in column F, and the distribution of the whole strength, including allowance for absentees, as in columns H and I, are deduced accordingly from the number of Executive charges in column D by allowing the necessary proportion to induce this rate of promotion.

6. The balance of the establishment, according to the revised strength in column B, must be Provincial, and this establishment must fill the balance of Executive posts which remain after providing for the Imperial Establishment, and the rest must be Assistant Engineers. This is worked out in columns J to N. It will be observed that in the Provincial Establishment the Assistants greatly exceed the Executives—that is, we sacrifice the Provincial to the Imperial. It is reasonable that the rate of promotion in responsibility and pay (which depends on this distribution for the Provincial Establishment should be slower than for the Imperial, but probably some device would be necessary to accelerate it.

7. The general result of the table, however, is that for these Provincial lists we require the following establishment of Executive and Assistant Engineers, including allowances for absentees:—

	Executives.	Assistants.	Total.
Imperial	95	66	161
Provincial	126	213	339

8. There then remain the Railway and Military Works Department lists, the former of which, we may tentatively assume, must be manned wholly by Imperial Engineers, namely, Coopers Hill and Royal Engineers, and the latter by Royal Engineers. If we assume that these lists must be manned throughout by Imperial Engineers, we may neglect the question of charges, and assume that, irrespective of the charges held, they must be divided into Executive and Assistant classes in the proportion necessary to give the proper flow of promotion.

9. The actual present strength calculated for the Railway Branch is 145, and 52 for the Military Works Department; and adding 15 per cent. to each for absentees, the establishment will be—

	Executives.	Assistants.	Total.
Railway	99	67	166
Military Works Department	36	24	60

and adding all the lists as above together we get as the total strength of Executives and Assistant Engineers for India—

	Executives.	Assistants.	Total.
Imperial	230	157	387
Provincial	126	213	339
Grand Total	356	370	726

10. Next, as to the superior posts above the rank of Executives and Assistants, which may be taken as 80. The distribution by classes of lists for these posts may be taken as follows:—

Provincial lists—Buildings and Roads and Irrigation	46
Railway Branch	27
Military Works Department	7

And assuming, solely for purposes of establishing the strength, that these posts would fall to Imperial and Provincial in proportion to their strength in the several lists, we should have—

	Imperial.	Provincial.	Total.
Provincial lists	15	31	46
Railway	27	—	27
Military Works Department	7	—	7
	49	31	80

or, in round numbers, 50 superior posts fall to Imperial and 30 to Provincial.

11. Allowing again 15 per cent. for absentees in these posts, the strength for Imperial and Provincial would be—

	Executives and Assistants.	Superior Posts.	Total.
Imperial	387	58	445
Provincial	339	35	374
			819

12. Now the above total strength is not far off the number (800) to which our present rate of recruitment is understood to be leading us; but there is considerable difference in the distribution of the Imperial and Provincial element, which at present is as follows:—

	Recruits.	Ultimate strength.
Imperial—		
Coopers Hill	15	400
Royal Engineers	6	160
Provincial—		
Indian Colleges	9	240
	30	800

That is, instead of tending to an establishment of 430 Imperial and 370 Provincial, as approximately worked out above, we are tending to one of 560 Imperial and 240 Provincial.

13. Again, if we take our present establishment of about 1,000 men, we find that it consists of 745 European Engineers, who answer to the Imperial, and of 255 Indian Engineers, who answer to the Provincial Establishment.

If, then, we intend to take steps to remodel the establishment in the direction indicated, we must modify our rate of recruitment.

14. Our present rate of recruitment is confessedly a reduced one, the full rate being 33 for a strength of 880 men; and the reduction was obtained by decreasing the number of Royal Engineer recruits from 9 to 6. It will probably be considered inadvisable under present circumstances to increase the total recruitment; but in making any modification we should recruit (if we can) up to the full ultimate Royal Engineer strength of about 250, as arranged with the Military Department in communication with the Home Government. The revised recruitment and strength according to the accepted estimates would then be—

	Recruits.	Estimated strength.
Imperial—		
Coopers Hill	7	190
Royal Engineers	9	240
Provincial—		
Indian Colleges	14	370
	30	800

15. According to this proposal, Coopers Hill, which began some years ago with an annual number of 40 or 45 appointments to the Public Works Department, now reduced to fifteen, would come down to seven.

16. The above conclusions and proposals may be summed up as follows:—

1st.—That, according to present estimates of strength and requirements of the different lists, we might work the Public Works Department with 430 Imperial (European) and 370 Provincial (Indian) Engineers.

2nd.—That we should so organise the Imperial Establishment re-arranged under the first proposal as to give what is considered the essential rate of promotion in the Executive grades.

3rd.—That if we decide to take this step, we should considerably increase the Indian recruitment and reduce the Coopers Hill element.

17. It is assumed that the Local Governments will be content to supply their Provincial services by recruits from the four Indian Colleges (Rurki, Sibpur, Poona, Madras), but if any other source of recruitment is advocated, or if any change should be made in the system there pursued so as to provide a higher education for Provincial Engineers than they now get, its nature should be explained in the reply to this memorandum.

Sub-head 2.—RATES OF PAY AND PROMOTION OF THE PROVINCIAL ESTABLISHMENT.

18. The Provincial Establishment, according to the suggestions made above, will be organised on the following main lines:—

Superior posts	...	...	...	...	30
Executive posts	...	...	...	...	127
Assistants	...	...	...	...	213
					<hr/> 370

The above ratio between Executives and Assistants would give promotion from one class to the other in about the 16th or 17th year of service.

19. Then as to the rate of pay for this establishment, the Public Service Commission recommends that it should be fixed without reference to that of the Imperial Establishment.

As we shall have to commence the establishment with a very few men all in the lower grades, and as it will gradually increase to a considerable strength under the influence of an increased number of recruits, it will probably be better to give an incremental scale; in fact, the only alternative to this would be a graded scale adjusted periodically to give approximately the same rate of promotion as that which the incremental scale will give.

20. If the rate of pay of the Provincial Service is fixed on the same sort of scale as has hitherto been current, then the salaries of the Executive and Assistant grades might be as follows; but this is merely put forward as a suggestion on which to work, and because some definite proposals are required:—

	Period in grade.	Promotion possible at end of
Apprentice on Rs. 100	...	1 year 1st year.
<i>Assistant Engineer class—</i>		
2nd grade, Rs. 125—25—250	...	5 years 6th "
1st " Rs. 275—25—400	...	5 " 11th "
<i>Executive Engineer class—</i>		
2nd grade, Rs. 450—30—600	...	5 " 16th "
1st " Rs. 600—30—750	...	5 " 21st "
An increment of Rs. 50 after two years	...	2 " 23rd "
" " "	...	2 " 25th "

The maximum pay thus obtainable by men in the 1st grade of Executives would be Rs. 850, and they would attain this about the end of the 47th year of their age at the earliest, that is, after passing through the grades as fast as they could. The above arrangement of grades would distribute Executives and Assistant Engineers in about equal proportions and would perpetuate the present anomaly of giving men the pay and rank of Executives and the work of Assistants. If the ratio of 127 Executives to 213 Assistants, as in paragraph 18, is to be maintained, the period of service in the class of Assistant Engineer must be considerably enlarged; temporary promotions from class to class should be allowed only for change of duties.

21. It is probable however that some instructions of a general character may be issued by the Government of India regarding the scale of salaries to be allotted to the Provincial Service in all Departments; and as the question of the pay of this branch of the Public Works Department does not press so

urgently for a solution as does that of the number of posts to be set apart for them, on which an early decision as to future recruitment depends, it may perhaps be convenient if an answer on this sub-head be deferred till the Government of India has declared its opinion on the general question.

22. It is possible moreover, that Local Governments may hold that it is not necessary to create a new Provincial Service between the Imperial and the present Subordinate Service, but that all the work for which the Imperial Service is not required can be effectually performed by an enlargement of the upper ranks of the present Subordinate Service and without alteration of their present salaries. If this view is entertained, it is hoped that definite proposals as to the number, grades, and recruitment of this Upper Subordinate Service will be submitted in replying to this memorandum.

Sub-head 3.—WHETHER THE SUPERIOR APPOINTMENTS ARE TO BE ON ONE SCALE OF PAY, AND OPEN WITHOUT DISTINCTION TO IMPERIAL AND PROVINCIAL MEN.

23. Another question to be decided is whether the superior appointments above the Executive grade should carry the same pay whether held by Provincial or Imperial men, and whether men of each establishment should be appointed by selection to these posts, or whether there should be any reservation of a proportionate share of the posts for each establishment.

24. It would be easier to allow a separate scale of pay for these posts if there were any prospects of working Provincial Establishments without any admixture of Imperial men; for there may be some difficulty in making an Imperial Executive Engineer on Rs. 1,000 work under a Provincial Superintending Engineer on Rs. 900, or an Imperial Superintending Engineer on Rs. 1,600 under a Provincial Chief Engineer on Rs. 1,500. It would be probably equally difficult to arrange that Provincial men shall only serve under Provincial, and Imperial men under Imperial, when men of both services are employed in the same branch.

25. This will be seen at once from the figures below, which are based on the supposition that the superior posts are divided between Imperial and Provincial men approximately according to the numerical proportion of each:—

	Chief Engineers.	Superintending Engineers.
<i>Buildings and Roads Branch—</i>		
Imperial	...	6
Provincial	...	21
<i>Irrigation—</i>		
Imperial	...	3
Provincial	...	6
Total	...	11
		35

That is to say, in the Buildings and Roads Branch the bulk of the Superintending Engineer appointments would be held by Provincial men, who would thus come into contact with Imperial men, while it would be difficult to prevent the Chief Engineers of the Provincial Establishment from being placed over Imperial men. In the Irrigation Branch, the Provincial and Imperial appointments would be about equally divided, and the Imperial men would generally hold the Chief Engineerships. On the whole, the probable conclusion seems to be that, unless an establishment can be wholly worked by Provincial or by Imperial men, it will be simpler to have only one scale of pay for the superior appointments. This uniformity of pay is irrespective of the question whether a fixed proportion of the superior appointments should be given to Provincial men, or whether no proportion of the whole number of superior appointments dependent on the strength of each should be laid down for either establishment, but the best men should be selected from either class with due regard to the claims of seniority.

Sub-head 4.—DISTRIBUTION OF THE PRESENT ESTABLISHMENT BETWEEN IMPERIAL AND PROVINCIAL, AND TRANSITION FROM THE PRESENT TO THE NEW ORGANISATION.

26. The present distribution of the establishment between European and Indian Engineers, which two classes are ultimately to correspond with the Imperial and Provincial, is as follows:—

	European.	Indian.	Total.
Chief Engineers and officers ranking as such	24	...	24
Superintending Engineers and officers ranking as such	49	7	56
Executive Engineers	354	106	460
Assistant Engineers	318	142	460
	745	255	1,000
As compared with our ultimate scale of	430	370	800

It may be calculated roughly that, if we alter the rate of recruitment as suggested in paragraph 14, we should increase the Indian Establishment to the revised number of 370 by about the year 1905, and that similarly the European Establishment would be considerably reduced by the same period, and would be approximating to the ultimate number.

27. The difficulty is where and how to start the Indian Establishment as a separate organisation to the European; when and where to draw the line.

28. The position is that we have now one establishment of European and Indian Engineers on one scale of pay, and we want to divide this establishment into two separate establishments, one of which will be on a lower scale of pay. It is also very desirable, in order to hasten the new organisation, that the separation should include some of the present establishment.

29. The problem is how to make this separation equitably. In the first place, the line between each class, the European and Indian Engineers, though clearly marked in the lower grades, which are filled by men recruited in definite proportions from Coopers Hill and from Indian Colleges, is not so clearly marked in the upper grades; and the men in these upper grades would look upon it as a very great grievance and slur upon them to be placed in a class which must inevitably be looked upon as the inferior class. Some of them, though not a very large number, are men whose domicile is in England. It is thought therefore, irrespective of any question of altering the rate of pay of present incumbents, that none of the men now in the higher grades can be placed in the inferior Service. It is suggested, however, that the line may be drawn below either the 3rd or the 4th grade of Executive Engineers, and that all the Indian Engineers may be placed below this line in a separate list, which will be the commencement of our Provincial Establishment. All the men below the line, with very few exceptions, if any, are Natives, Eurasians, or Europeans whose domicile is in India.

30. It does not follow, however, that relegation to the inferior establishment must of necessity mean decrease of even prospective pay to all. The following compares the present rates common to the whole establishment with the rate proposed for the new class:—

	Present scale.	Suggested Provincial.
Apprentice	Rs. 100	Rs. 100
Assistant Engineer, 4th grade	...	125
" " 3rd "	250	to 250
" " 2nd "	350 to 400	275 to 400
" " 1st "	500	400
Executive Engineer, 4th grade	600	450 to 600
" " 3rd "	700	600
" " 2nd "	800	to 800
" " 1st "	950	850

31. The proposal is that men below the present 3rd grade, that is, men on Rs. 600, Rs. 500, Rs. 350, and Rs. 100, should pass over to the new Provincial Establishment; but to prevent inequitable reduction in their prospective

pay, it might be provided that two additional increments of Rs. 50 each should be allowable to men of the present 4th grade Executive and 1st and 2nd grade Assistant so as to bring their pay ultimately up to Rs. 950. Meanwhile all would pass into the new grades; that is, the 4th grade Executive Engineer, after completing five years on Rs. 600, would be eligible for promotion to the Rs. 600—850 grade, and by further periodical increments might rise to Rs. 950. Similarly, the 1st grade Assistant would pass into the new Rs. 450—600 grade, and would receive increments and be eligible for promotion in due course. The 2nd grade Assistant would pass into the Rs. 275—400 grade, and would rise on the same principle. The 3rd grade Assistant should be promoted to the present 2nd grade on the same conditions as they would have been promoted to the present 2nd grade on Rs. 350, and should then go on regularly through the new grades; but there is no need, it is thought, to give them increments beyond the new scale as in the case of the other two grades.

32. Summarising, the proposals are as follows:—

- (1) To place about 80 men of the 1st, 2nd, and 3rd grades of Executives, notwithstanding that they are Indian Engineers, in the Imperial list of Engineers, and to place them on exactly the same footing as regards pay as the European Engineer. Their pensions to follow the same rules as now.
- (2) To place 23 4th grade Executives, 98 1st grade, and 29 2nd grade Assistants, who are Indian Engineers, in the new Provincial list, but to allow them to draw up to Rs. 950 in the 1st grade.
- (3) To put 15 3rd grade Assistants and apprentices wholly on the new rates of pay proposed for the Provincial Establishment: in other words, to deal with them as with the recruits.

33. The effect of the above proposals would be to modify the immediate distribution of the Imperial and Provincial Establishments as follows:—

	Imperial.	Provincial.	Total.
Chief Engineers and officers ranking as such	24	...	24
Superintending Engineers and officers ranking as such	56	...	56
Executive Engineers	437	23	460
Assistant Engineers	318	142	460
	835	165	1,000

Sub-head 5.—WHETHER THE SEVERAL LISTS CAN BE WORKED AS SEPARATE AND INDEPENDENT SERVICES.

34. The Provincial Establishment being at present so small would have probably to be organised for some years to come as one list. Its distribution at the present moment as compared with the ultimate Provincial Establishment estimated for each list as in table A would be as follows:—

	Engineers, 4th grade.	Assistants.	Total.	Ultimate Total.
Bombay	1	15	16	40
Madras	1	5	6	47
Bengal—Buildings and Roads	3	11	14	14
" Irrigation Branch	2	5	7	28
North-Western Provinces—Buildings and Roads	2	16	18	28
" Irrigation Branch	3	9	12	35
North-Western Provinces—Buildings and Roads	...	18	18	28
Punjab—Buildings and Roads	2	10	12	34
" Irrigation Branch	2	8	10	29
Burma	2	3	5	15
Assam	1	7	8	10
Rajputana and Central India	...	2	2	18
Hyderabad	...	6	6	12
Central Provinces	...	...	...	1
Coorg	...	...	...	...
	19	115	134	339
Railways	4	27	31	...
	23	142	165	339

35. It would be hardly possible, it is thought, with these small numbers to give each list a graded scale on which promotions might be made; but the scale of pay proposed would obviate many difficulties likely to arise on this score. Care would have to be taken, however, by the central authority, that is the Government of India, that the distribution of Executives and Assistants to each list should be reasonable.

36. Summarising again, the proposed organisation would be as follows for some years to come:—

1st.—An Imperial Establishment on separate lists as at present, consisting of all the present European and about 80 Indian Engineers.

This list on the present rate of recruitment being altered from 21 to 16 would gradually decrease from its present number of 835 to 430.

2nd.—A Provincial Establishment on one list, but under the control of the Local Governments, on scale of pay fixed as suggested in paragraph 18.

37. Eventually, as the strength of the Imperial Establishment diminished and that of the Provincial increased under the influence of the altered rate of recruitment, the Provincial list might be split up, and each list made over wholly to the Local Governments, while the Imperial Establishment should be consolidated into one list.

38. In the above proposals nothing has been said about the promotion of Upper Subordinates to the Provincial Establishment which has been recommended by the Commission (paragraph 96, Chapter X). Such promotions would perhaps not be numerous; and they would not materially affect the strength; in fact, at first they would probably be an assistance to the efficiency of the establishment. The men promoted would come in to some suitable place in the Provincial scale, and would rise in it.

39. As regards furlough and pension, it will probably be held that each class of Engineers now in the Department should retain the furlough and pension rules to which they are now liable; that is to say, those who are now classed as European Engineers, and have the more favourable leave and pension rules, or the pension rules only, as the case may be, will retain those rules intact. At the same time those Indian Engineers who, it is suggested, should be classed on special grounds as Imperial Engineers would retain their present rules, which are those of the Uncovenanted Service.

40. The rest of the Indian Engineers now in Government employ whom we propose to class as Provincial would retain their present rules—those, namely, of the Uncovenanted Service.

41. In regard, however, to the men to be hereafter recruited into the Provincial Establishment, the suggestions of Local Governments are invited as to whether they should be pensionable or not; and, if pensionable, whether they should come under the present rules of the Uncovenanted Service or under modified rules; and, lastly, whether those who rise to the superior appointments should be eligible, as now, to the superior scale of pensions for European Engineers.

Table A.

Province or List.	Revised strength, exclusive of absentees.	Total Number of Executive charges.	DISTRIBUTION OF CHARGES.		IMPERIAL STRENGTH DEDUCED FROM D.				PROVINCIAL STRENGTH.				
			Imperial.	Provincial.	Present on duty D + 3.	Total strength F + 15%.	Executive Engineer.	Assistant Engineer.	Present on duty B + F.	Allowance for absentees @ 10%.	Total J + K.	Executive Engineer E + 10%.	Assistant Engineer L + M.
A.	B.	C.	D.	E.	F.	G.	H.	I.	J.	K.	L.	M.	N.
Bombay	64	33	17	16	28	32	19	13	36	4	40	18	22
Madras	68	29	15	14	25	29	17	12	43	4	47	16	31
Bengal—Buildings and Roads	18	9	3	6	5	6	4	2	13	1	14	7	7
Irrigation Branch	37	14	7	7	12	14	8	6	25	3	28	8	20
North-Western Provinces—Buildings and Roads	33	10	5	5	8	9	5	4	25	3	28	6	22
North-Western Provinces—Irrigation Branch	47	16	9	7	15	17	10	7	32	3	35	8	27
Punjab—Buildings and Roads	40	18	9	9	15	17	10	7	25	3	28	10	18
Irrigation Branch	45	17	9	8	15	17	10	7	31	3	34	9	25
Burma	43	20	10	10	17	20	12	8	26	3	29	11	18
Assam	13	11	...	11	...	...	...	...	13	2	15	12	3
Rajputana and Central India	9	4	...	4	...	...	...	...	9	1	10	5	5
Hyderabad	16	7	...	7	...	...	...	...	16	2	18	8	10
Central Provinces	11	6	...	6	...	...	...	...	11	1	12	7	5
Coorg	1	1	...	1	...	...	...	...	1	...	1	1	...
Total mixed list	446	195	84	111	140	161	95	66	306	33	339	126	213

75

10 9 34 29 23 16 34 37 10 27

Copy submitted for the
information of the Hon.
Mr. P. F. Stutchens, C. S. J.,
with remarks that the
paper has been sent to
Colonel Hasted for disposal

 Col R. E.
Jt. Secy to Gov. P.W.

Read letter from the
Govt. of India No. 1432-G. of
15 June 1886.

For orders Note on 22

Scheme for a separate Imperial
and Provincial Establishment

Sub-head 1. Strength of each
Establishment.

In the scheme as illustrated
by Table A it is proposed
to allot 15 Imperial Divisions
and 14 Provincial Divisions
to Madras. Counting the
new Divisions lately formed
in the Districts there are however
only 27 Divisions, but with the
temporary Divisions of Noolikuly,
Kannad + Periyar there will
be 30. Kannad will however,
it is understood be soon
handed over to the Zamindar,
which would make the number
of charges agree with that

given in Table A. A list
of the permanent divisions
is attached and great care
has been given to the selection
of those which should be
classed as Imperial and it
does not seem possible to
allot any of those therein
classed as Imperial to a
Provincial Establishment.

The large Delta systems
included in Godavari, Krishna,
Mellor, Tungabhadra & Kalyan
must it is considered always
be Imperial. Bellary, West
Coast, Presidency & Chingleput
contain important military
buildings, besides in the
case of the first and last
mentioned, irrigation works of
great importance. Mysore is

the seat of Government for
part of the year and Military
Head Quarters. North Arcot
and South Arcot have very
important irrigation works, such
as canals and channels and some
of the largest tanks in the
Presidency, and the Presidency
Workshops and Consulting
Architects' Divisions must always
be Imperial, the Lushikere
and Srirangapatna works until completion
must also be Imperial. We
thus have 20 Imperial and
9 Provincial against 15 & 14,
and this is allowing Buckingham
Canal to be classed as Provincial
which certainly should not be
done until the canal is
completed.

That Assistant Engineers

Immanently is also
very doubtful, I
think

in the Imperial class should
be promoted to Executive in
8 or 10 years is quite agreed in,
but it is considered that if an
Assistant in the Provincial
class is ever fit to be made
an Executive Engineer he should
not have to wait 16 or 17 years
for the promotion. Most of the
Provincial ^{Staff} will, it is presumed
be natives who begin to grow
old earlier than Europeans
and a man should be at his
best in bodily vigour when
an Executive Engineer.

The Provincial service
should it is considered be
recruited from the Indian
Colleges, but there is one point
in connection with these
Colleges which has not been

817
The difficulty will be how to
secure an efficient provincial
staff, & a man knowing the
languages of the natives
these are the difficulties about
allowing men going to college
during their service, and of course
if they are to be promoted
it must be noticed.

brought to notice. Why should
there be more than one
College for Engineers in India
any more than in England?
Travelling is now a - deep
easy and not expensive. Native
who seek the higher appointments
must be able to afford it,
and they may be called upon
during their service to go to
any part of India. It is
matter for consideration whether
an Engineer College at
Poona would not meet the
requirements of the whole of
India, the other Colleges
educating only up to the
Upper Subordinate standard.
It is believed that such
an arrangement would be
economical and we should

get rid of the present very objectionable arrangement by which the highest student in the class is made an Assistant Engineer while the second with but one or two less marks in examination may consider himself fortunate if he can obtain an appointment as 3^d grade Overseer, without waiting some months for it.

Sub-head 2. Rates of Pay and Promotions of Imperial Establishment.

Supposing our Upper Subordinate Establishment to remain as it is, the scale of pay suggested in para 20 begins too low - an apprentice is given the same pay as a 1st grade Overseer, a Asst

83
Engineer 2^d grade begins on lower pay than a Supervisor 2^d grade, and an Assistant Engineer 1st grade on lower pay than a Sub Engineer 2^d grade. The double rates of pay suggested for the Engineer Establishment does not however seem a good arrangement.

In a paper submitted by the undersigned some time ago, a suggestion was made regarding the pay that an appointment should carry when held by a native and by a European. It was proposed to fix the scale of pay for natives at say $\frac{2}{3}$ of the pay for Europeans, the rates of pay for all establishments being fixed on the native scale and an

'Indian allowance' of one half
more given to all Europeans
holding the same appointment.
There is no doubt whatever
that a native on 400 Rs a
month is very much better off
than an European on 600 Rs
and the only question is whether
the European is sufficiently
compensated by getting half
as much again as the native.

The difficulties which beset
the dual rate of pay would
vanish if this suggestion
was carried out, but if it
cannot be, separate rates of
pay must be provided for
Imperial and Provincial
Establishments.

What the Provincial scale
of pay should be must,

There is no doubt that the
difference may be tolerated
in a Provincial establishment
than in a central establishment
as a distinction between Imperial
& Provincial establishments
is not a distinction between Imperial
& Provincial establishments
as a distinction between Imperial
& Provincial establishments

to some extent, depend on
how the Provincial Engineer
service is recruited. It has
above been proposed that it
should be recruited from the
Indian Engineer College, but
it is considered that some
provision should also be made
for promoting specially deserving
Upper Subordinates to the
Engineer class, and this might
be done by promoting from
the 1st grade Supervisors -
occasionally - men would not
attain this grade without
several years experience in the
Department and would not
then be too old to commence
as Assistant Engineers.

Colonel Mead has indeed

The superior appointments above the executive grade are now always made by the Madras Government, as they should be, by selection, and this being the case, the appointments should be open without distinction to Imperial and Provincial men, but following what has been said above, the pay of the latter should be only $\frac{2}{3}$ of the former.

Subhead 4. Distribution
of the present establishment
between Imperial and Provincial,
and transition from the
present to the new—

organisation.

Without interfering with the prospects of men who entered the service with certain expectations it will be extremely difficult to effect the transition to the new organisation. To those however who have lately entered the service the prospect of some future reductions must have appeared more or less a matter of certainty.

The pay therefore above the rank of Assistant Engineer in the Provincial service might be fixed on the new scale, and there seems to be no reason why the Provincials should not be at once separated from the Imperial List,

89
so long as present incumbents in grades above Assistant Engineers are secured the present scale of pay up to date of retirement. They would be classified on the new lists but receive the difference between the new and present scale of pay as a personal allowance.

Subhead 5. Whether the several lists can be worked as separate and independent services. This is a large subject as it includes the question of an amalgamated Imperial list for all India and the suggestion apparently is to make an amalgamated Provincial list so to be retained while the members

on the list are small, but
when the numbers are much
increased the Provincial list
to be split up and the portions
made over to the Provincial
Governments while the Imperial
lists which would then be
reduced should be amalgamated.

A proposal of the Govt of
India tending to the amalgamation
of the Imperial lists was
lately under consideration
and in a note on the subject
it was stated that amalgamation
of the higher ranks above
Executive Engineers was beginning
at the wrong end, and that
the junior officers should have
experience of different parts
of India in the first place.

The papers on this subject are
being trans-

mitted to the
Governments for their
opinion. It is
generally felt that
the present system
is not satisfactory
and that some
change is necessary.

9
As matters stand at present
a beginning has been made
in giving officers of the
Executive Engineer grades
experience in different Provinces.
Madras has had and still
has several officers from other
Provinces filling temporary
appointments and though at
present other Provinces do not,
as a matter of course, give up
the services of their best men,
there seems to be no reason
why in future not only should
the super-abundant supply in
one Province meet the demand
in another, but exchanges be
made in the junior ranks which
could not fail to be of advantage
to the officers and ultimately

to the Government. That eventually one P.W.D. List for the whole of India will be possible and advantageous is admitted, and the only question seems to be whether it shall be an Imperial List only, the Provincial Lists being separate and under the Provincial Govts. Many arguments in favor of this arrangement might be adduced, but it seems that until the time comes for making the amalgamation, the question need not be considered.

Meanwhile the Imperial and Provincial lists both being under the Provincial Governments can it is considered be best worked together as

one List. 93

As regards the question whether the men in the Provincial Establishment should be pensionable or not, it is considered that they must be pensionable.

The base of temporary employment which may cease at a month's notice is, in a country where no shame attaches to the taking of bribes, the temptation to a man in power to add to his gains indirectly - but pensionable service is the strongest inducement to honesty, as dismissal for dishonesty entails the loss of everything in the future. As to the scale of pensions, it is considered most —

objectionable to have different
rules for different services
and that they should be those
of the Unconvenanted Service,
and in dealing with the future
the tendency should be to
reduce not to increase the
pensions which, though in
consequence mainly of the fall
in value of the Rupee, are
heard so much of as insufficient,
are it is considered, rather
too liberal a scale, and
therefore the rules of the
Unconvenanted Service should
apply to all appointments.

See
10/7/88.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE MADRAS GOVERNMENT.

Under date the

Read the following

From the Government of India (H.E. No. 1432 Gd June 15. 1888)

Ordered that the
following reply be sent:-

(H.E. No. 1432 Gd June 15. 1888)

To The Secretary to the
Government of India, Madras

H.E. and probably like to see
this before it issues.

It embodies the results of
a consultation after
last Council

8/7/88
17/7/88

Sir,
With reference to your letter
No. 1432 Gd dated 15th June 1888, I am
instructed to offer the following
observations, referring in succession
to the subheads into which the
'scheme' for a separate Imperial
and Provincial Establishment P.W.
Dept. submitted with your letter
is divided.

Subhead 1. Including the lately formed new Divisions in the Krishna and the temporary Divisions of Anshikulya, Sammad and Sereas there are 30 Divisions in the Madras Presidency; the Sammad Division will however be abolished next year, leaving 29 Divisions, which agrees with the number given in the statement accompanying the scheme, two of these probably being retained for the next five years only. The utmost care has been taken in distributing the Divisions between Imperial and Provincial and the accompanying statement gives the result finally determined. ^{with the exception of the Nilgiris} All these Divisions classed as Imperial contain either very important irrigation works or large Military buildings ~~Government~~ ^{Government} ~~houses~~, and in some cases both, and it would be objectionable in the opinion of this Govt. to entrust their charge to officers of the Provincial

On the Nilgiris there are fort. houses & military headquarters and there are ^{other} obvious reasons why this station should be kept for officers recruited in England.

service. The Buckingham Canal has been classed as Provincial on the supposition that the scheme cannot be fully introduced at present, ^{but} until the completion estimates are worked out it must be an Imperial charge. The figure in column D of Table A from which the figures in

Madras must become an Imperial charge when the Periar project is completed & attached in it, but by that time there will probably be some other temporary Division & possibly then may be some Provincial Officer competent to hold one of the charges now classed as Imperial. This Govt. will certainly do their best to provide for the Provincial men.

subsequent columns are deduced is therefore 20 instead of 15. This Government concurs in the view that Assistant Engineers in the Imperial class should be promoted to Executives in 8 or 10 years at latest, but they are of opinion that Assistants in the Provincial class should attain their promotion before they are 16 years in the service, otherwise, in many instances a man will be past his prime before he is promoted, and an Executive Engineer should be ^{of} ~~be~~ ^{possess} ~~possess~~ of considerable energy and activity.

As regards the source from which the Provincial service should be recruited, the Government are of opinion that as a rule Assistant Engineers should be obtained from the Civil Engineering Colleges in India, but that in special cases it will be advisable to promote from the Subordinate grades. They are of opinion, however, that ~~considering~~ ^{in view of} the present facilities for travelling in India considerable economy may be effected by confining the higher education necessary for Provincial Engineers to ^{a single} College alone in India, and they would suggest Poona, being the most centrally situated, as its most convenient location. The other colleges would then be restricted to the course of education necessary for admission to the Upper Subordinate grades.

Subhead 2. As regards the rates

of pay and promotion of the Provincial Establishment, the Govt are of opinion that the pay of Assistant Engineers & Executive Engineers may be fixed without reference to that of the Imperial Establishment, but that the scale given in para 20 of the 'Scheme' commences too low, with the exception of the Apprentice grades, which, it is presumed, corresponds with that of men under practical training; and the system of granting yearly increments does not commend itself to them. If, as suggested above, Upper Subordinates are to be in special cases promoted as Engineers the grade from which they would be promoted would probably be that of Supervisor 1st grade, which would contain men of considerable experience and

and yet not too old for advancement, and in that case the pay of Assistant Engineer 2^d grade must be at least equal to that of Supervisor 1st grade. If yearly increments are given the pay might commence at 200th, but if, as this Government would prefer, no increments are given, the pay of Assistant Engineer 2^d grade should be 250th. An Asst. Engineer 1st grade would then receive 350th, and there might be four grades of Executive Engineers, each step of promotion giving an increase in pay of £100/. After two years in the highest grade an addition of £50 might be made, and after another two years a further addition of £50, as suggested.

Subhead 3. The superior

appointments above the grade of Executive Engineer are always made by this Govt by selection, and this being the case the Govt are of opinion that these appointments should be open without distinction to men on Imperial and Provincial Lists, and that there should be one scale of pay for them. Subhead 4. Without interfering with the prospects of men who entered the service with certain expectations it will be extremely difficult to effect the transition to the new organisation. To those however who have lately entered the service the prospect of some reduction has not probably appeared uncertain. This Govt are therefore of opinion that the pay above the rank of Assistant Engineer on the Provincial service might

be fixed on the new scale, and
that there is no reason why the
Provincial should not be at once
separated from the Imperial
List, so long as present incumbents
in grades above Assistant
Engineers are secured the present
scale of pay up to date of
retirement.

Subhead 5. The suggestion in
the scheme is apparently to form
an amalgamated Provincial list
which would be retained while
the numbers on the List are
small, but when the numbers are
much increased to split it up,
making over the portions to the
Provincial Governments while the
Imperial lists which would then
be reduced should be amalgamated.

On the subject of amalgamating
the Imperial Lists this Gt.
has ^{already} expressed an opinion in
letter N° 3391 W. of 12th Decr 1887

103/111P
and they are willing to defer
the further consideration of the
subject until the Imperial
Lists are very considerably
reduced - but they are of opinion
that it will be best in every
way to start and continue the
Provincial Establishment, and
the Provincial Gt. who would
work it as one List with the
existing Imperial Establishment.

As regards the question
whether the men in the Provincial
Establishment should be
pensionable or not, this Gt.
^{entertain no doubt}
are very strongly of opinion
that they ^{must} receive
pensions, and that ^{the} rules of the
Unencumbered Service should
apply to them.

2. In the above the
questions asked in paras 2 to 7
of your letter under reply have

been answered, with the exception
of that in the latter part of
para 4, with respect to
which. I am to say that this
Govt ^{inclined to the} is of opinion that, for
political reasons, for some time
to come at all events, the
Engineers of the Railway
Branch should be wholly
Imperial. There are however only
three, the Consulting Engineer &
two Deputies, under the Government.

J.H.
16/1/35

cc
cc
21/7

Argent
H. No.

16. VII. 88

<u>Imperial</u>		13
	102	<u>13</u>
Godavari	_____	3
Kistna	_____	3
Nellore	_____	1
Luchikulya	_____	1
Bellary	_____	1
West Coast	_____	1
Penner	_____	1
Nilgiris	_____	1
North Arcot	_____	1
South Arcot	_____	1
Chingleput	_____	1
Presidency	_____	1
Presidency Workshops	_____	1
Tanjore	_____	1
Nagapattinam	_____	1
Consulting Architect	_____	1
		<u>20.</u>
<u>Provincial</u>		
Ganjam	_____	1
Vizagapatnam	_____	1
Cuddalore	_____	1
Thurcoot	_____	1
Pichinopoly	_____	1
Madurai	_____	1
Trincomelly	_____	1 X
Buckingham Canal	_____	1 X
Coimbatore	_____	1
		<u>9</u>

Case
11.7.

forwarded to Hon. Mr. Fisher
for it not be well to have
the same in the list
of letters after comment

1274

Given as amended

See

18/7/58

143.6
10/7
1958

7607

Sept. 6th 1888 Madras.

PUBLIC WORKS.

(110)

110/11/11

Dist.

Dist.

Dist.

Go. 21st M. Cy 1888, No. ²²²³ 2224 W

Public Works Department
Establishment

Ordered that the Government
of India be addressed on the
Subject of the proposed
Scheme for a Separate Imperial
and Provincial Establishments
Public Works Department

Public Works Department
Establishment

Offering certain observations
with regard to the proposed
Scheme for a Separate
Imperial and Provincial
Establishments. Public
Works Department.

Under 'Confidential'

No. 2522. W of 17-8-88

110/11/11

800
11/17
P. 20/7