

12-10-92

No. 3242-3 Wa/14/11/53

11/14/11

87C

10/7/11

Extra Ship Ship.

Madras & Bombay are to be
considered supernumerary
until 30-6-86. As
stated in my previous letter,
were Col. Smith now placed
in the position claimed for
him, he would still find
himself below two officers
on the Railway List, and
below five officers on the
General List who entered
the P.W. Dep't after him.

I am further to remind
the Govt. of India that the
rank of Chief Engineer was,
until 1879, held by the
Com: Engineer to this Govt.;
and that, since that date,
the work devolving on
that officer has increased
largely in all directions.
In the opinion of this Govt.,
it would not be appropriate
to exclude the officer, on
whom such important duties
devolve, from all prospect
of rising to the rank of
Chief Engineer.

7- In view of these considerations, I am directed to express the hope entertained by H.E. in Council that the Govt. of India may be pleased to transfer Lt. Colonel Smith to their Railway List, with the rank of Dep. Engineer 1st Class, ~~free from all conditions~~ without the conditions specified in your letter under acknowledgment; — but, if the Govt. of India adhere to the views therein expressed, I am to state that this Govt. accept on behalf of Lt. Colonel Smith the second of the alternatives set forth in paragraph b thereof, namely, that he should now receive promotion to the rank of Dep. Engineer 1st Class, with the condition that he shall look for no further promotion on the Govt. of India List.

ccur

14/11

LL.

12.11.83.

N^o 3242 W JWB
Secy. of the Madras Govt

Under date the 14th November 1883

Read the following

From the Govt of India (H.E. N^o 1393 Gd/22/10/83)

Ordered that the following
reply be sent.

(H.E. N^o 3243 Wd/14th Nov 1883)

To, The Secy to the Govt

Sir,

I am directed to acknowledge
receipt of your letter dated 22-10-83
N^o 1393 G, in which it is stated
that the S. of I. consider the
proposals of this Govt. respecting
the departmental rank to be
conferred upon Lt. Colonel C. J.
Smith to be too favourable to
that officer, inasmuch as he
would thereby obtain the
advantage of the promotion
which he would have received
from the Govt., and would
moreover gain the advantages
of prospective promotion on
the Govt. of India list.

In the concluding paragraph
of your letter it is stated that,
"if Colonel Smith is promoted
to 1st class Superintending Engineer,

nor could the officers on the Government
of India list reasonably complain that
their prospects of promotion had been
had been sensibly injured. I am to
request that the further views of the
Government of Madras may be communi-
-cated in the light of the above remarks.

I have the honor to be,

Sir,

Your most Obedt servant

M. L. ... Colonel R. E.
Secretary to the Govt of India

N^o 3242-3 Wd/14/11/83

B. H. 2714
2715-17 27.9.83

Oct 38/10

"two alternative courses remain,
 "either that, as regards the Madras
 "Presidency, the amalgamation
 "of the Railway Officers with the
 "Govt. of India List should be
 "wholly cancelled; or that
 "Lt. Col. Smith should receive the
 "promotion claimed for him,
 "with the condition that he
 "should look for no further
 "promotion ^{or} the Govt. of India
 "List."

3. In reply, I am directed to
 state that the main object of
 the proposal made by you in
 November 1881, for the
 amalgamation of the Com:
 Engineer's Dept. of this Govt.
 with the Railway Branch of
 the Govt. of India, was
 understood to be the equalisation
 of the flow of promotion.

In this Presidency, owing to
 the small number of Officers
 in the ^{Railway} Dept., promotion had
 been long stagnant, and
 Lt. Col. Smith had held for
 more than 13 years the post
 of Senior Deputy Consulting
 Engineer. He already

with the rank of Assoc. Engineer
 1st class grade.

mentioned, he had declined
 repeated offers of promotion
 in the General Branch of the
 Madras P. W. Dept., with
 the sole object of succeeding
 to the post of Com: Engineer.

4. In the Railway Branch of
 the Govt. of India, promotion
 was much more rapid; and
 it is understood that no
 Officer of Lt. Col. Smith's
 standing now holds rank
 lower than what was claimed
 for him, namely 1st class
 Sup: Engineer; while some
 who hold that rank are of
 junior standing to him.

5. Taking these points into
 consideration, it does not
 appear to ~~me~~ the Governor
 in Council that to accept
 the proposals made in my
 previous letter would give
 cause for just complaint to
 any Officer on the Govt. of
 India List; especially
 as, in the Resolution of that
 Govt. dated 6-9-83, it is
 distinctly ruled that the
 Officers transferred from

PMC No 9592

nor could the officers on the Government
of India list reasonably complain that
their prospects of promotion had been
had been sensibly injured. I am to
request that the further views of the
Government of Madras may be communi-
-cated in the light of the above remarks. Recd 2/11/13

I have the honor to be,

Sir,

Your most Obedt servant

M. G. S. Colonel R. E.
Secretary to the Govt of India

No 3242-3 Wd/14/11/13

Bt 2714
2715-17 27.983

Old 38/10

as they were, and he would moreover gain the advantages of prospective promotion to the Chief Engineer rank on the Government of India list.

5. To further such a result would, the Government of India is of opinion, not only be to give too great an advantage to Colonel Smith, but would also tend to interfere with the just claims to promotion of Officers on its own list, and would give, not unreasonable, cause for complaint on their part.

6. After full consideration of the whole circumstances it is considered that if Colonel Smith is promoted to 1st Class Superintending Engineer, two alternative courses remain, either that, as regards the Madras Presidency, the amalgamation of the Railway Officers with the Government of India list should be wholly cancelled; or that Colonel Smith should receive the promotion claimed for him, with the condition that he should look for no further promotion on the Government of India list. The latter alternative would, so far as Colonel Smith himself and the effect of his transfer are concerned, leave matters practically as they were before; that is to say he could not complain that his interests had been in any way affected,

nor

rank now asked for.

3. In reply I am to point out that the amalgamation of the Consulting Engineer's Department on the Government of India list was proposed by the Government of India and accepted by the Government of Madras some time ago, and has only been delayed owing to the difficulty of coming to a fair arrangement in regard to the conflicting personal interests involved in the change. Had these delays not occurred Colonel Smith would have been transferred with the rank of Executive Engineer 1st grade long ago, and would, in the ordinary course, have been promoted to the rank of Superintending Engineer 3rd Class. Owing to two accidental circumstances, namely the delay in settling the question of the amalgamation, and the premature retirement of Major General Sankey, a promotion of 3 steps at one time is now claimed for him.

4. If the Government of India were to accept the proposals of the Government of Madras as they stand, it is clear that Colonel Smith would be a gainer in every way, he would obtain the advantage of the promotion, which it is stated, that he would have received from the Government of Madras, had matters been left

as

Paper taken out of the Records from the charge of the Referencer

Press

Miscellaneous

Routine

No. 1000, dated 10-10-1900

No 1393 G.

All communications should be addressed to the Secretary

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT
GENERAL

To
The Secretary to the Govt of Madras,
Public Works Department

Simla, 22 October 1883

Sir,

I am directed to acknowledge the receipt of your No. 2715W dated 27 September 1883, in which you advocate the claims of Lieutenant Colonel C. J. Smith R.E. to be promoted to the 1st Class of Superintending Engineers, consequent on the vacancy caused by the promotion of Colonel Shaw-Stewart R.E. to the post of Chief Engineer and Secretary to the Government of Madras.

2. The arguments advanced in favour of this claim are that Colonel Smith is qualified for such a step by his standing in the Department, that he has declined promotion in the General Branch of the Madras Presidency because he chose to wait for this appointment, and that had the Revolution issued 10 days later, or had Major General Sankar retired 10 days earlier, Colonel Smith would have been transferred to the Government of India list with the rank

Date taken out	For what purpose			Initials of clerk taking the paper or of attender	Date returned	Initials of attender
	Department	C No	Year			
7-1-07	Public Works				10-1-07	

672

10/11

Subd. Secy. Secy.