M.R.O. 1—10,006—28-2-50.

(1) Number of pages_____

(2) Date of repair_____

(3) Initials of the Referencer_____

MADRAS RECORD OFFICE

Government of Madras

Public Works DEPARTMENT

G.O. No. / ~~B.P. No.~~ 106-6609	2220-21	Press / ~~Mis.~~
Dated	8-9.	~~105~~ 873

Not to be folded or roughly handled

Read the following papers :—

No. 106. Despatch from the Right Honourable the Secretary of State for India.

Public Works.

INDIA OFFICE, LONDON, *4th June* 1873.

No. 8.

MY LORD,—With reference to your Public Works letter No. 3 of 23rd January, and your Revenue letter No. 3 of 7th February 1873, relative to the Madras Waterworks Project, I transmit herewith a copy of a despatch* which I have this day addressed to the Government of India on the subject.

I have, &c.,
ARGYLL.

* No. 54.

His Excellency the Right Honourable
The Governor in Council, Fort St. George.

From the Right Honourable the Secretary of State for India, to His Excellency the Right Honourable the Governor General of India in Council, dated India Office, London, 4th June 1873, Public Works, No. 54.

I HAVE had before me in Council your Excellency's letter No. 34 of the 26th March last, and papers therewith transmitted, from which it appears that, in the matter of the Madras Waterworks Project, Mr. Thornhill, formerly Collector of the district, and Mr. Fraser, Executive Engineer, have both been exonerated from blame, the Madras Government taking upon itself the responsibility of having omitted to verify the calculations of the last named officer.

2. Under this explanation, the censure which, relying on the representation of the case originally made to me, I had passed on Mr. Thornhill, is withdrawn; and the subject might be allowed to drop, but for the singular statement with which the Madras Government have qualified their assumption of responsibility in regard to it. "At the time that the Madras Waterworks Project was brought forward," they observe, "there was no one whose special duty it was to examine completely its several bearings, and to take care that all requisite information with regard both to its engineering and revenue details was duly obtained and reviewed." I had previously been under the impression that the special duty referred to devolved in all cases, not on one person only, but on a whole series of authorities; on the Superintending or other Engineer, in the first instance, by whom the project was prepared; then on the Chief Engineer and Secretary by whom it was placed before the Government; and finally, on all the members of the Government individually and collectively. If this has not always been the custom, I trust that it has now become so; but, if so, I shall be glad to be informed in what precise manner the change has been effected, the state of affairs represented as having hitherto prevailed being anything but satisfactory.

No. 107. From Colonel J. W. RUNDALL, R.E., Deputy Secretary to the Government of India, Public Works Department, (Irrigation,) to Lieutenant-Colonel J. MULLINS, R.E., Joint Secretary to the Government of Madras, Public Works Department, (Irrigation Branch,) dated Simla, 7th July 1873, No. 428 I.

I AM directed to request that, with the permission of His Excellency the Governor in Council, a report may be submitted to the Government of India on the points adverted to in paragraph 2 of Secretary of State's despatch,* No. 54 of the 4th ultimo, copy of which was transmitted to the Government of Madras with despatch from His Grace, No. 8, of the same date.

* *Subject.*
Exoneration from blame of Messrs. Thornhill and Fraser in the matter of the Madras Waterworks Project.

Proceedings of the Madras Government, Public Works Department, 8th September 1873.

No. 108. ORDER THEREON, 8th September 1873, No. 2,220.

IRRIGATION, No. 8.

ORDERED that the following letter be sent:—

(Here enter No. 2,221, dated 8th September 1873.)

(True Extract.)

(Signed) G. W. WALKER, Colonel, R.E.,
Secretary to Government.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT,
OOTACAMUND, *8th September* 1873.

No. 109.

No. 2,221.

FROM

COLONEL G. W. WALKER, R.E.,
Secretary to the Government of Madras,
Public Works Department.

To

THE SECRETARY TO THE GOVERNMENT OF INDIA,
Public Works Department.

IRRIGATION, No. 9.

SIR,—I am directed to acknowledge receipt of your letter, No. 428 I of 7th July 1873, requesting that a report may be submitted to the Government of India on the points adverted to in paragraph 2 of the Secretary of State's Despatch, No. 54 of the 4th June.

2. In that paragraph the Secretary of State remarks that "the subject might be allowed to drop, but for the singular statement with which the Madras Government have qualified their assumption of responsibility in regard to it. 'At the time that the Madras Waterworks Project was brought forward,' they observe, 'there was no one whose special duty it was to examine completely its several bearings, and to take care that all requisite information with regard both to its engineering and revenue details was duly obtained and reviewed.' I had previously been under the impression that the special duty referred to devolved in all cases, not on one person only, but on a whole series of authorities; on the Superintending or other Engineer, in the first instance, by whom the project was prepared; then on the Chief Engineer and Secretary by whom it was placed before the Government; and finally, on all the members of the Government individually and collectively."

3. Upon this I am to submit that to say that a particular duty devolved upon "a whole series of authorities" including "all the members of the Government individually and collectively" is to say that it did not devolve *specially* upon any one of those authorities; and this is all that the Government of Madras intended to affirm.

4. Arrangements have now been made for ensuring a thorough practical examination of the accuracy and value of the data, on which irrigation projects may be recommended for sanction, by the appointment of a Chief Engineer for Irrigation whose business it is to examine and report fully on all schemes of this kind. The Madras Waterworks Project was sanctioned before this appointment was made, and though several authorities were, in various degrees, responsible that no matter of importance in connection with the scheme was overlooked, there was really no one who could devote to it as a whole the time and attention necessary for such a searching examination and personal verification of the data afforded as was needful to secure this object, and now renders such mistakes as occurred in this instance virtually impossible.

I have the honour to be,
Sir,
Your most obedient servant,

Colonel, R.E.,
Secretary to Government.

Exd. S. T. Austin.
Spare Copies.

Proceedings of the Madras Government, Public Works Department, 28th April 1873.

No. 471. Read the following endorsement of the Officiating Deputy Secretary to the Government of India, No. 188-89 I:—

Despatch from the Government of India, Public Works Department, (Irrigation,) to the Secretary of State for India, dated Fort William, 26th March 1873, No. 34.

With reference to paragraph 7 of your Grace's Despatch, No. 35, of the 18th April last, we have the honour to forward, for the information of Her Majesty's Government, copies of the correspondence noted below on the subject of the erroneous estimate of the anticipated returns from the Madras Water Works Project.

2. Your Grace will percive from these papers that Mr. Thornhill, the Collector of the District, as well as Mr. Fraser, the Executive Engineer, have both been exonerated from blame in the matter, the Madras Government taking on itself the responsibilty of the error in having omitted to verify the calculations of the latter Officer.

Documents Accompanying.

1.—From Madras, No. 1,169, dated 7th August 1872, and enclosure.
2.—To Madras, No. 768 I, dated 9th September 1872.
} Pros. (Irrigation) September 1872, Nos. 73—5.
3.—From Madras, No. 2,521, dated 25th October 1872, and enclosure.
4.—To Madras, No. 1,021 I, dated 28th November 1872.
5.—From Madras, No. 172 I, dated 18th January 1873, and enclosure.

Copy forwarded to the Department of Agriculture, Revenue, and Commerce, and the Government of Madras in the Public Works Department, for information.

(Signed) J. W. RUNDALL, Colonel, R.E.,
Offg. Dy. Secy. to the Govt. of India.

No. 472. Order thereon, 28th April 1873, No. 1,211.

IRRIGATION, No. 28.

Communicated to the Revenue Department, the Chief Engineer for Irrigation, and Mr. Fraser.

(True Extract.)

(Signod) G. W. WALKER, Colonel, R.E.,
Secretary to Government.

To the Revenue Department.
,, Chief Engineer for Irrigation.
To Mr. Fraser.

Exd. S. T. Austin.

India Office,
London, 4th June 1873.

Public Works,
No. 54

To His Excellency The Right Honourable The Governor General of India in Council.

My Lord,

Para. 1. I have had before me in Council your Excellency's Letter, No. 34, of the 26th March last, and papers therewith transmitted, from which it appears that, in the matter of the Madras Waterworks Project, Mr. Thornhill, formerly Collector of the District, and Mr. Fraser, Executive Engineer, have both been exonerated from blame, the Madras Government taking upon itself the responsibility of having omitted to verify the calculations of the last-named Officer.

2. Under this explanation, the censure which, relying on the representation of the case originally made to me, I had passed on Mr. Thornhill, is withdrawn; and the subject might be allowed to drop, but for the singular statement with which the Madras Government have qualified their assumption of responsibility in regard to it. "At the time that "the Madras Waterworks Project was brought forward," they observe, "there was no one whose special duty it was to examine completely its "several bearings, and to take care that all requisite information with "regard both to its engineering and revenue details was duly obtained "and reviewed." I had previously been under the impression that the special duty referred to devolved in all cases, not on one person only, but on a whole series of authorities; on the Superintending or other Engineer, in the first instance, by whom the project was prepared; then on the Chief Engineer and Secretary by whom it was placed before the Government; and finally, on all the members of the Government individually and collectively. If this has not always been the custom, I trust that it has now become so; but, if so, I shall be glad to be informed in what precise manner the change has been effected, the state of affairs represented as having hitherto prevailed being anything but satisfactory.

I have the honour to be,
My Lord,
Your Lordship's most obedient, humble Servant,
(Signed) ARGYLL.

1182

No 6.

Copy Public Works despatch to the Govt of India No 54, dated 4th June 1873.

Referred to in Public Works Letter to Madras, No 8, dated 4th June 1873.

1182

IIV

Public Works.
No 8.

India Office.
London 4th June 1873.

My Lord,

With reference to your Public Works' Letter, No 3, of 23rd January, and your Revenue Letter, No 3 of 7th February 1873, relative to the Madras Waterworks' Project, I transmit herewith a copy of a despatch which I have this day addressed to the Government of India on the subject.

I have the honor to be,
My Lord,
Your Lordship's most obedient humble Servant,

[signature]

+ No 54.

His Excellency,
The Right Honorable,
The Governor in Council
Fort St George.

No 5.

Govt. of Bombay Public Works Dept.
4th June 1873.
Rec'd 25th August 1873.
Letter to Govt St George
No 8.
Encl.

Forwarding a copy of a Despatch which has been addressed to the Govt of India on the subject of the Madras Water Works Project.

A. 2220-2221-8 Sept 8/73.

No 6

Public Works Dept

No 428 I. dated 7th July 1873.

Sir

I am directed, in reply to your letter, No 428 I. of the 7th July 1873, to remark, with reference to para 2 of the Despatch from the Secretary of State, therein referred to, that the way in which provision has been made for ensuring, (as far as may be possible) a sufficient examination of

15V

To
The Secretary to the
Govt of India.

of the accuracy of the data, on which irrigation projects may be recommended for sanction, is by the appointment of a Chief Engineer for Irrigation whose business it is to report fully on all (considerable) schemes of this kind. (I am further to observe that had it been possible to deal effectively with such projects without strengthening the administrative staff of the P.W.D., the creation of this appointment would not have been justifiable.) The Madras

Should report to Govt. in case of failure to do so

Madras Irrigation project was sanctioned before this appointment was made, and though several authorities here, in England may have been nominally responsible that no matter of importance in connection with the scheme was overlooked, there was really no one who could devote to it the attention necessary for such searching examination as was needful to secure this object.

Lm. 29/7/73

and have rendered such assistance as we deemed in their instances virtually impossible.

To
The Secretary to the
Government of India
P.W. Dept.

Sir,

I am directed to
reply to your letter No.
428 I of the 6th July 1873,
to remark, with refer-
ence to para 2 of the
despatch from the
Secretary of State,
therein referred to, that
the way in which provision

Recd 30th July.

I did not understand
to say
I am to state
receipt of your letter
No 428 I dated 6th July 1873
but a Despatch sub-
mitted the
Govt of India
funds credited to
in para 2 of the letter
of State's despatch

has been made for ensuring a thorough practical examination of the accuracy and value of the data, on which irrigation projects may be recommend-ed for sanction, & by the appointment of a Chief Engineer for Irrigation whose business it is to examine and report fully on all schemes of this kind-

No. 54 of the 1st Abstract.

In that para. Sec. 7. of the Madras Famine Commission remarks that "the most impossible "duty allowed to devolve "upon the Famine "Officer is the "individually "collective

Must it not be laid down specially upon any one of these authorities: and this is all that the Madras Govt. intended to affirm.

Arrangement has now been made for ensuring it (vide the Draft.)

The Madras Water Works project was sanction-ed before this ap-pointment was made, and though several authorities were, in various degrees res-ponsible that no matter of importance in connection with the scheme was over-looked, there was really no one who could devote to it as a whole the time and attention

necessary for such a searching Examination and personal verification of the data afforded as was needful to secure this object, and how renders such mistakes as occurred in this instance virtually impossible -

Cir 16th Aug.

Proceedings of the Madras Government

No 2220 Jur Pwd 23V

Read the following:

Despatch from Secy of State — Jur No 874 dated 4 June/72

Secy to the Govt of India PWD — (Jur No 428 I. dated 7 July 1873) Ordered that the following letter be sent Jur No 87

To

The Secretary to the Government of India

Pr Dept.

No 2221

Sir

I am directed to acknowledge receipt of your letter No 428 I of 7th July 1873, requesting that a Report may be submitted

to the Government of India on the points adverted to in para 2 of the Secretary of State's Despatch No 54 of the 12th ultimo. J.M.C.

In that para the Secretary of State remarks that "the subject might be allowed to drop, but for the singular statement with which the Madras Government

"have qualified their
"assumption of respon-
-sibility in regard
"to it. At the time
"that the Madras
"Water Works Project
"was brought forward,
"they observe, there
"was no one whose offi-
-cial duty it was to
"examine completely
"its several bearings,
"and to take care that
"all requisite inform-
-ation with regard both

"to its Engineering
"and Revenue details
"was duly obtained
"and reviewed - Had
"previously been under
"the impression that
"the special duty
"referred to devolved
"in all cases, not on
"one person only, but on
"a whole series of
"authorities; on the
"Superintending or
"other Engineer, in the
"first instance, by

"whom the project was
"prepared; then on the
"Chief Engineer and
"Secretary by whom
"it was placed be-
-fore the Government,
"and finally, on all the
"Members of the Go-
-vernment individ-
-dually and collect-
-ively"

Upon this I am
to submit that to
say that a particu-
-lar duty devolved
upon "a whole series

"of authorities" including "all the members "of the Government "individually and "collectively" is to say that it did not devolve specially upon any one of those authorities: and this is all that the Government of Madras intended to affirm. Arrangements have now been made for ensuring a thorough practical Examination of the accuracy and value of the data on which irrigation projects may be recommended for sanction, by the appointment of a Chief Engineer for Irrigation whose business it is to Examine and Report fully on all Schemes of this kind. The Madras Water Works project was

sanctioned before
this appointment was
made, although
several authorities
were, in various de-
-grees responsible that
no matter of importance
in connection with
the scheme was
overlooked, there
was really no one
who could devote
to it as a whole
the time and attention
necessary for such

a searching Examin-
-ation and personal
verification of the
data afforded as
was needful to se-
-cure this object,
and now renders
such mistakes as
occurred in this
instance virtual-
-ly impossible -

G.W.W.

26

S.C. visits 12/9/73

8 & 4687

Govt. of {1873} Madras.

PUBLIC WORKS.

1. Sec. of State to the Govt of India

Dated 28.11

Recd. Pass' Encl. 1

G. O. 8 Sept. 1873, No. 2220.
2221.

Nos. 106 & 108/109

Madras Water Works Project

Passing orders on papers on the subject of the Madras Water Works Project -

Reporting on the points adverted to in para 2 of the Secy of State's despatch No