

(1) Number of pages _____

(2) Date of repair _____

(3) Initials of the Referencer _____

MADRAS RECORD OFFICE.

Government of Madras.

Public works DEPARTMENT.

G.O. No. 451,452	2043	Press Mis.
Dated	21 8	18 19.

Not to be folded or roughly handled

*Proceedings of the Madras Government, Public Works Department,
27th August 1872.*

No. 451. Read the following letter from the Superintending Engineer, 8th Division, to the Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, dated Madura, 2nd August 1872, No. 2,136:—

I HAVE the honour to report, for the information of Government, that Captain J. Pennycuick, R.E., Executive Engineer, has represented to me that the regular work of the Dindigul Range occupies quite as much of his time as the Government can well claim from a Range Officer; and that the additional* work

* *Vide* G. O. No. 1,519, dated 20th June 1872. "thrown upon him by the supervision of the proceedings in connection with the Perryaur project can only be done by an amount of labour much beyond what an officer under ordinary circumstances can reasonably be expected to undergo."

2. Under these circumstances, Captain Pennycuick considers that he is justified in asking what additional remuneration the Government propose to allow him on this account.

3. I need scarcely mention that the Dindigul Range has been recently enlarged* by the addition thereto of the Tiroomungalum Taluq. And considering that Captain Pennycuick will have to perform not only the ordinary range duties, but also that of supervising the Perryaur project work, I am of opinion that it is but equitable that that officer should receive additional remuneration for the increased work thus devolving upon him.

4. I think it only my duty to point out that Captain Pennycuick feels most keenly the want of consideration evinced, in his opinion, towards him in Major Mullins' Note printed with G. O. 4th May 1871, No. 1,236.

5. Few officers who have gone home on sick leave have devoted so considerable a portion of that leave, as five months, to the elaboration of a Government project, and still fewer, I imagine, have reaped less advantage from the same, than Captain Pennycuick has done. For it must be borne in mind that for devoting for the period above named his best abilities, which at least are not inconsiderable, to the elaboration of this project, he received from Government a rebuke which could scarcely have been stronger had he neglected their interests altogether, and remained idle during the interval in question.

6. You are well aware that I speak quite disinterestedly on this subject, as at the period in question I was not in any way connected with the district, but it cannot be wrong in me, on this occasion, to let the Government know what painful feelings were excited at the time in the breasts of all independent officers who have read that order, and the regret which they experienced in that the Government whom they have always been accustomed to look up to for the kind and impartial consideration of their claims should pass an order which would probably have the effect of damping in future all enthusiasm in the service on the part of their Engineer Officers at home on sick leave.

7. I trust that I shall be excused the liberty of mentioning this subject, and that it will be quite understood that I do so in no captious spirit. The matter has been represented to me by Captain Pennycuick with the special view that the

Proceedings of the Madras Government, Public Works Department,
27th August 1872.

Government will be pleased to take the circumstances in question into consideration when determining what remuneration they will be disposed to pass to him for the extra work thrown upon him in connection with the Perryaur project works.

No. 452.

ORDER THEREON, 27th August 1872, No. 2,013.

ESTABLISHMENT, No. 19.

His Excellency the Governor in Council observes that the Goodaloor Ghaut is not being undertaken in connection with the Perryaur project, as erroneously supposed by Lieutenant-Colonel Roberts and Captain Pennycuik, but is being carried out from Provincial Funds in fulfilment of a pledge given by the Government of Madras to co-operate with that of Travancore in opening a direct line of communication between the Madras District and the Western Coast. Hence the work on which Lieutenant Greer is engaged is within the category of ordinary works, such as a Range Officer is generally understood to be competent to supervise, when the services of an able Assistant have been placed at his disposal for its execution. In the event of the Perryaur project being sanctioned the work will be assigned to a special officer; it was never intended that its superintendence should form part of the duties of the Range Officer.

2. The Government regret to learn that Captain Pennycuik has been discouraged by the terms of Major Mullins' Memorandum and of the orders passed thereon by Government. The Governor in Council highly appreciates the zeal and ability invariably displayed by Captain Pennycuik and especially in connection with the Perryaur project.

(True Extract.)

Colonel, R.E.,

Secretary to Government.

To the Superintending Engineer, 8th Division.
" Acting Chief Engineer for Irrigation.

Exd. S. T. Austin.

Superintending Engineer's Office 8th Div.
Madras 2nd August 1872.

No. 2136

From, Lieutenant Colonel R. S. Roberts R.E.

Superintending Engineer 8th Div.

To, Colonel E. W. Walker R.E.

Secretary to Government, P.W.D.
Madras.

Sir, I have the honor to report, for the information of Government, that Captain J. Pennycuik R.E. Executive Engineer has represented to me that the regular work of the Dindigul Range occupies quite as much of his time as the Government can well claim from a Range Officer, and

vide G.O. No. 1519 dated 20th June 1872. that the additional work thrown upon him by the supervision of the proceedings in connection with the Perryaur Project, can only be done by an amount of labor much

"much beyond what an officer under ordinary circumstances can reasonably be expected to undergo."

2. Under these circumstances Captain Pennycook considers that he is justified in asking what additional remuneration the Government propose to allow him on this account.

3. I need scarcely mention that the Dindigul Range has been recently enlarged by the addition thereto of the Tirumungalam Talook. And considering that Captain Pennycook will have to perform not only the ordinary Range duties, but also that of supervising the Perryair Project work, I am of opinion that it is but equitable that that officer should receive additional remuneration for

* G.O. 42586
dated 1st July 1872.

for the increased work thus devolving upon him.

4. I think it only my duty to point out that Captain Pennycook feels most keenly the want of consideration evinced, in his opinion, towards him, in Major Mullins's Note printed with G.O. 4th May 1871, No 1236.

5. Few officers who have gone home on sick leave have devoted so considerable a portion of that leave, as 5 months, to the elaboration of a Government project, and still fewer, I imagine, have reaped less advantage from the same, than Captain Pennycook has done. For it must be borne in mind that for devoting for the period above named his best abilities, which at least are not inconsiderable,

Perryman Project works.

I have the honor to be,

Sir,

Your Most Obedt Servt

Wm A. Roberts

Lieut. Col. A.E.

Superint. Engineer 8th Q^{rs}

Amos
882

P. W. 1842 *Albany*
Aug 11
the 1st August

S. D. D. D.
 The Secretary

Sept 2. *Albany*
 Dec 5. August, 72

Brings forward
 certain facts & Captain
 Pennington's services &
 recommends that the
 remuneration asked for
 may be granted for the
 extra duties in connec-
 tion with the Survey

P. 57

Sept 6. Oct 5. Dec 4. 72

Project
 Oct 12. 27 Aug 72

I have always heard Capt
 Pennington spoken of in high
 terms, as a zealous & able Officer - &
 I should regret that anything should
 be done or said to discourage or
 pain him - At the same time there
 is a limit beyond which Officers - how-
 ever meritorious - cannot be pushed to
 go - and I think that in this matter
 both Capt Pennington & Mr Roberts
 have transgressed that limit.

In the first instance Capt
 P. has represented to the Secy that
 the ^{ordinary} work of the Principal range occu-
 pies quite as much of his time as the
 job can well claim - and that the
 additional work lately thrown on him by

the personal supervision of the food & cook
plant - trace. Survey & so on - (1/2
Limit from R.E. - an able officer) "Can
only be done by an amount of labor
much beyond what an officer under
ordinary circumstances can reasonably
be expected to undertake? - But Capt P.
stopped here, and addressed arguments
& facts in support of his assertion, his
fault could have been found with him.
But was fortunately the person to ask
what extra remuneration he is to
receive for this extra work! This is
the ~~the~~ age of "Strikes" & here we have
the principle in its integrity - the
employee determines off-hand - what
is a fair days work for his wages.

demands payment for all in excess 130
And I admit, that his officer - however
able or feeble or meritorious - should be
suffered to do an act like this without
retribution.
As regards the order of Feb 7 & May 7 - I
readily can see how it is now that
some have been by a claim against it.
Capt P's work had been made in it.
But I cannot for the length of admitting
that it is unjust or a bad from the
of complaint - Capt P. at his own
wish, was entrusted with the task
of elaborating the scheme - and received
very precise instructions - He saw fit
to set them aside - and worked out a
scheme of his own! Major Mullins did
no more than his duty in pointing out
that it was Capt P's "first duty to design

estimate for the work in accordance with
his instructions: any suggestion he might
have added, would have received every at-
tention. This seems to me a dictum which
cannot be disputed - and Capt. P.
has only himself to thank for the result,
which Major M. thus summarizes - "As
it is, after waiting many months, some
of the information expected has not been
furnished yet, in lieu of it, some thing
which was not wanted, has been given."
Capt. P. was an instance of misapprehen-
sion for which he had no right to expect
fault. He wrote that he "worked out a scheme
differing materially from that proposed -
(and) by so doing much reduced the value
of his labors". As I said before I wish
that fault had dwelt more on his labors
and less on his mistakes - but this is

150
2/ Mr. from Albany: that he has
valued himself of our blamable
agencies to put on Major M. Clinton.
The G.O. if I recollect rightly - was
passed in Council, after considerable
discussion between York & Albany
& Col. Canham & Albany. I am
not sure that our own people are
the object. I am to say as plainly
as I can that as any I have seen
come across! He is one that to tell
us that he is free to do in his test
his interests as "amicus curiae" much
like the Chorus in a Greek play - &

"more in town than in any other" and
as a result on the whole about
on the order of 100. Some of our old
friends more than a year ago. It
was quite a long time for Cal. P.
to reconstruct my mind at the order
as it related to him - but I can
not see any basis for the
of participation for Cal. P.
in the business - much less for
the time & limit of his service
there. I think the fact will
be culpably negligent of his
dignity if it allows such a

170
fact to pass uncorrected.
Considering that at least
2 years will elapse before the Project
can be undertaken, I
do not think it advisable that
the school now be left to
trust the work to any one
to whom it is not enough
to say that we have considered it
it will be in the charge of
a subordinate official.

L. O. P.

Memorandum

With reference to the question of supervision of the Perryam Project, when sanctioned the Chief Engineer Department Public Works considers it necessary to bring to the notice of Government that Captain Perryam has never been connected with the Perryam Project as remodelled by Mr. R. Smith. The project with which Captain Perryam was connected was that of a Dam on a totally different site from that discovered by Mr. R. Smith, and the outlet for the Irrigation Water had had to be changed with the Reservoir and Dam site. In Colonel Walker's opinion the failure to

fixe upon the correct site during
the first series of exploration, from
1867 to 1870, was rather a blot
on the management of the Works.
Lieutenant Speer was senior Officer
under Mr. Smith throughout the
2nd series of explorations and Projects
and is spoken of in Mr. Smith's

report in the highest terms -
Under these circumstances,
and considering the presentment
still shown by Captain Penny-
cuck at Saint Collallins
structures, Mr. Walker as Chief
Engineer of the Public Works Dept.
cannot recommend the Government
to commit themselves now to any
pledge.

pledge that Captain Pennycuck,
shall at some future indefinite
time, have consigned to him the
charge of a Project, with working
out the details of which he has
had nothing to do.

Not recommended

August 72

W. Walker C.E.

Chief Engineer D.P.W.

disappointed indeed I had hoped
during this winter some of the
old and at times more with
meant that I had some
and some more.

and of course I had
and of course I had
and of course I had

His Excellency
the Governor in Council
learns from this letter

I cannot ensure in any
part of this draft. I
has made a strong impression of the Sindigul Range,
that it has all along recommended by the
has in fact been (Captain) Superintending Engineer,
Sanyal's thought in the event of the proposed
project being sanctioned. We are interested with the
execution of the project, 1st July 1872 has
to which he has devoted increased the regular
much time & labor. He is a very able officer, work of that Range
thoroughly devoted to his duty, and is deserving to such an extent that
of every encouragement it occupies quite as
from the Government. So responsible him, as much of the Range

Officers' time as the Government can well claim from him, and that Captain Pennington is not disposed to exercise such general supervision over the Trace and Survey and estimate of the Goodaloor Shant as was required of him in P.O. No. 1579 of 20th June, without extra remuneration.

The Governor in Council observes that the Goodaloor Shant is not being undertaken in connection with the

is here proposed, by substituting this important work to a junior officer, in my opinion, at any rate, a very harsh proceeding. If I am not very much mistaken, it will be impossible for any officer, however able and zealous, to carry out the Pennington's additions to the charge of a Range. The proper work, it appears to me, is to have the Pennington's work (if it is) to which Captain Pennington's range and duties are added, and to have his Range work - I would now suggest in place of Robert Roberts that the Shant is left in the hands of the Pennington project and that the remuneration of the work on which it is engaged in connection with the

is not more than the Officer in charge of the Range may reasonably be expected to undertake, but in the event of the Pennington project being sanctioned the work with a special officer is that it is the intention of the Govt. to what Captain Pennington for the duty, and that it will not interfere with the work of the Pennington work should form part of the duties of his Range with the Officer.

I would add that the Govt. ought to have had Captain Pennington has been disappointed by the terms of his appointment and of the remuneration & of the order proposed the more by Govt. & that the Government in Council might be expected to grant a salary to display within the category of the Govt. in connection with the Pennington project.

Pennington Project, as erroneously supposed by Lieut. Col. Roberts and Captain Penny - much, but is being carried out from Provincial Funds in fulfilment of a pledge made by the Govt. of a Machaw to cooperate with that of Travancore in opening a direct line of communication between the Malabar District and the Western Coast. Hence the work on which Lieut. Greer is engaged is within the category of ordinary works, such as

as a Range Officer

is generally understood to be competent to supervise, when the service of an able Assistant have been placed at his disposal for its execution -

my feeling is that the Govt. is to blame for having allowed an order to go out as being his business, which was, of course, not his own, and his appointment to an office which he had devoted his time & his talents & had sacrificed his health & his work, in which manner he had employed a considerable portion of his time in England. I regard

The Governor in Council is not disposed to acquiesce in the most unusual and, he cannot but add, most unbecoming demand for extra remuneration made by Captain Penryenick and supported by Genl Coll Roberts; and as it appears further from

therefore
~~the fact that~~
~~the fact that~~

~~that the~~
~~fact that~~
~~the fact that~~
~~the fact that~~

& Lt Col. Roberts' remarks are substantially just and I entertain a strong conviction that the former are more correct especially in the latter works Dept. in treating their officers with that consideration which any hardworking public servant is entitled to receive. The result will be a feeling of universal disaffection and the consequent derangement in the public work.

A. A.
Under the circumstances stated by Mr. Assistant in the foregoing Memoir, I agree with him as to the course which it is desirable to pursue in this case. I have and recommended

21/10
the letter under review, that Captain Penryenick still betterly presents the amended versions on his proceedings with reference to the preparation of the first Perryam Project, made by the Chief Engineer for the irrigation in which was based Govt. Order No. 1236 of 4th May 1871, he has come to the conclusion that it will not be desirable that that Officer should be employed in carrying out the revised Project when sanctioned

sanctioned. It seems
hopeless to expect that
he will work at it
in such cordial cooperation
with the head of the
Irrigation branch of the
Public Works Dept
under whose direct orders
he would be placed,
as is essentially necessary.
His Lordship in Council
accordingly resolves
to entrust the execution
not only of the Goodaloor
Chaut Works, but of the
Pennyam Project when
sanctioned to Sient
Greer who (it has been
ascertained from Mr
R Smith who elaborated

*Treatment of Mr
in matter is in manner
of public functionary
is prejudicial to the
activity of the Govt
and to the interests
of the public service.*

292
that Project) is tho:
roughly acquainted
with its every detail
and may safely en-
trusted with its charge.
Sient Greer will
carry on his present
duties in connection
with the Chaut, in
direct communication
with the Sup: Engr 8th.
D^y and his future
duties in connection
with the Pennyam Pro-
ject in similar com-
munication with the
Chief Engineer for Engrs.
The Governor in
Council cannot con-
cure with Mr Coll Roberts
on the view that he
puts

~~Not a letter
to be sent
to the Govt~~

puts forward of his
own action in this matter.

As towards the Govt.
he is serving, it is
presumptuous and
insubordinate; as
towards Officers
serving under him it
is injudicious in the
extreme. We cannot
suppose that many
other Officers will
agree in Sir St. Coll
Roberts view of the
wording of the Govt.
order last quoted, and
regards it as clear
evidence of how little
that Officer is himself

qualified for the
higher and more re-
sponsible posts of the
Government service,
in which his indiscreet
action and language
are calculated to act
on those under him
with most mischievous
effect — G.M.W.

Irish copy

A. N.
H. L.
S. O. L.

His Excellency
the Governor in Council
observes that the
Goodaloor Shant is
not being undertaken
in connection with
the Perryaur Project,
as erroneously sup-
posed by Lieutenant
Colonel Roberts and
Captain Penrynick,
but is being carried

out from Provincial
Funds in fulfilment
of a pledge ^{given} made by
the Government of Madras
to cooperate with that
of Travancore in
opening a direct line
of communication
between the Madras
District and the
Western Coast. Hence
the work on which
Lieutenant Greer
is engaged is within
the category of ordinary
works, such as a Range
officer is generally
understood to be
competent to super-
vise, when the services

354
of an able Assistant
have been placed
at his disposal for
its execution.

same point ~~///~~ In the event of the
Perryman Project
being sanctioned
the work will be
assigned to a special
officer; ~~and it is the~~
~~intention of Govt. to~~
~~select Captain~~
~~Perryman for the~~
~~work, but it was~~
~~never intended~~
~~that ^{its} the superintendence~~
~~of the Perryman work~~
should form part

~~See Memorandum
accompanying
G.M.~~

of his duties ^{as} the
Range officer.

The Government
regret to learn that
Captain Pennycuik
has been discouraged
by the terms of Major
Mullins' Memorandum
and of the order passed
thereon by Government.
The Governor in
Council highly
appreciates the zeal
and ability ^{invariably} displayed
by Capt. Pennycuik
in connection with
the Perryam Project.

G.W.

Superintendent
Ch. Secy for 1878.

Will be paid 1/11/78
G.W.

167

1:2043. P.W.D.

370

No. of the head and part.

Read the following:

From the Superint. of the
G.W. - P.W.D. No. 2136 of 1878

His Excellency the
Governor in Council
observes that the Good
look Ghant is not being
undertaken in connection
with the Perryam Project
as erroneously supposed
by Lieutenant Colonel
Roberts and Captain
Pennycuik, but is
being carried out from
Provincial Funds in
fulfilment of a pledge
given by the Government
of Malacca to cooperate
with that of Travancore
in opening a direct line

of communication between the Madras District and the Western Coast. Hence the work on which Lieutenant Green is engaged is within the category of ordinary work, such as a Range Officer is generally understood to be competent to supervise, when the services of an able Assistant have been placed at his disposal for its execution. In the event of the Periyar Project being sanctioned the work will be assigned to a special Officer, it was never intended

that its superintendence
should form part of
the duties of the Range
Officer.

The Government
regret to learn that
Captain Pennycook
has been discouraged
by the terms of Major
Mullins' Memorandum
and of the orders
passed thereon by
Government - The
Governor in Council
highly appreciates the
zeal and ability in-
variably displayed by
Captⁿ Pennycook
and especially in con-
nection with the Perrya
Project.

Sept 2/9/12

G.M.W.

122 C/o 3779

Govt. of 1872 Madras.

PUBLIC WORKS.

To
The Superintendent
of the Division

Dated

Recd.

Encl.

G. O. 27 Aug. 1872 No. 2043.

Nos. 157-157

Capt. Pennington R.E.

Passing orders on
letter from Capt. Pennington
Supt. of the S. D. Comm.
recommending the grant to
Capt. Pennington of a
commutation for the
additional work of duty
on him in the Superintendence
of the Survey and Mapping.