M.R.O. 1—77,500—8-8-37.

(1) Number of pages 127

(2) Date of repair

(3) Initials of the Referencer

MADRAS RECORD OFFICE.

Government of Madras.

Public works **DEPARTMENT.**

G.O. No. 481 Press ~~Misc~~

206-07

Dated 11 2 1870.

Not to be folded or roughly handled

No. 206. Read the following letter from the Acting Superintending Engineer, 8th Division, to the Acting Chief Engineer and Joint-Secretary to Government, Public Works Department, dated Madura, 6th January 1870, No. 2,277 :—

I HAVE the honour to submit copies of two letters addressed to me by Lieutenant Pennycuick, dated 21st and 29th December 1869, and of my intermediate letter to that Officer, No. 2,230, of the 24th idem.

2. Lieutenant Pennycuick considers that censure has been passed upon him in the Government Order, No. 3,763, of the 26th November 1869, which expresses disappointment that much has still to be done before complete plans and estimates can be prepared for the Perryaur Project. I have conveyed to Lieutenant Pennycuick my reading of the Government Order that there is a distinction between disappointment and disapproval, and that no reflection is cast upon his labours. Lieutenant Pennycuick, however, from his second letter, does not accept what I point out to be the interpretation, and, in paragraph 5, considers it due to himself to furnish explanation of the grounds on which he holds censure to be unjust. A hardworking officer who has devoted himself to his task under peculiarly difficult circumstances may naturally feel discouraged if told that more was expected of him, but I feel sure that as nothing has been expressed, so also nothing is implied to this effect in the Government Order of 26th November.

No. 207. ORDER THEREON, 11th February 1870, No. 481.

IRRIGATION, No. 9.

THE interpretation put upon the order of Government, of the 26th November last, No. 3,763, by the Acting Superintending Engineer, 8th Division, in his letter, No. 2,230, of the 24th ultimo to Lieutenant Pennycuick, is the correct one. The Government were disappointed to find that the Perryaur Project could not be brought forward for sanction as soon as they had expected it would have been ready. The delay was found to be due partly to the necessity for extending the investigations, and partly to the fact that some of the circumstances of the site, having an important influence on the design of the works and perhaps on the arrangement of the project generally, had not been ascertained but assumed, and it became apparent at a later date that the actual, were widely different to the assumed, facts.

2. The Government Order was not intended to express disappointment that Lieutenant Pennycuick and the officers under him had not done their best to push forward the investigations. In the absence of any evidence to the contrary it was assumed that they had done all that was in their power.

3. The Governor in Council is constrained to remark that Lieutenant Pennycuick would have done well to act on the suggestion made to him by the Acting

Proceedings of the Madras Government, Public Works Department,
11th February 1870.

Superintending Engineer that he should withdraw his letter of the 10th December last.

(True Extract.)

(Signed) J. MULLINS, Major, R. E.,
Acting Joint-Secretary to Government.

To the Superintending Engineer, 8th Division.

Exd. E. C. Shunker.

2

From,

Lieutt. J. Pennycuick R. E.
Executive Engineer on Special
Duty

To

The Superintending Engineer
8th Division.

Sir,

In reply to your letter No. 2230 of the 24th Instant, I have the honor to state that I am compelled to adhere to my original reading of the Order of Government No. 3763 of the 26th October.

2. Indeed, if the hope which appears to have been entertained of an early completion of the investigations were well founded, it seems to me that Government would have

done

some cause for displeasure at its not being fulfilled, since the additional investigations ordered by the Chief Engineer for Irrigation have not very much more than counterbalanced the additional assistance which has been rendered by the employment of a third Officer during a part of the season.

3. It therefore became necessary to point out that this hope was not justified by any thing which had appeared in my reports, not, so far as I am aware, by anything ~~arising~~ from yourself or from the Chief Engineer for Irrigation.

4. With regard to the seventh paragraph of my letter of the 21th Instant I must explain that nothing was further from my intention than to "hold out a threat" of taking diminished interest in the project. Such a course would in my opinion be exceedingly foolish, and would be entirely foreign to my own ideas; the paragraph referred to was merely intended to point out (in the interests of Government) that the Order, read as I read it, must inevitably produce the discouraging effect stated.

5. If my interpretation of the order be wrong, the error can easily be corrected; if it be right, a censure upon my conduct has been formally recorded by Government, and I consider it due to myself to explain the grounds on which

which I consider this enclosure to be unjust. I trust therefore that you will consent to submit my former letter, (together with this one, should you consider that it explains any point requiring explanation) to Government.

I have &c.

Madras 29th Dec. 69 — Lt. J. Pennycuick R.E. Asst Engineer on Special Duty.

True Copy

Asst Secy

Captain R.E.

Offg. Superintending Engineer

8th Division.

Enclosure No. 3

In a letter from the Offg. Supg. Engineer 8th Division to the Chief Engineer for Irrigation & Construction to Govt. dated 6th January 1870 No. 2277.

P. W. 134

Copy Lieutt. Pennycuick's letter dated 29th Dec. 1869

No. 2230

Madura
24th December 1869

From

Captain R. L. Pendergast RE
Offg Superintg Engineer 8th Dn

To

Lieutenant J. Pennycuick RE
Executive Engineer On Special
duty

Sir

I am much disinclined to forward to Government your letter of the 21st instant for Read the Order of the 26th November No 2763 in a different light from that in which you have taken it up.

Thus the 1st para says: four Officers of Engineers are employed and on that date the 26th there were the 4 Officers on duty: no mention is made of that number having been employed for any length of time and it was known that Lieutenant Christie had

only recently been appointed.

In G O No 2466 of the 25 July, the expectation is expressed that the scheme will soon be put into shape: in G O 2585 of 6 August the Government hope estimates will be ready for the next Budget - ie the one which has already been despatched to the Government of India. Thus while a sanguine expectation had been entertained regarding the preparation of estimates it is in keeping with the former Orders that there should now be disappointment that the project is not matured.

The Government however do not express any disappointment with reference to what has been done; but that much has still to be done and there is no reflection at all cast upon your labours. That so much remains to be done is attributable not to any past waste of exertion: but to the additional investigations considered necessary by the Chief Engineer and the opinions of that Officer are put forward at a time when the District Budgets had already been submitted.

While then the Government are disappointed that the preparation of the project is found to involve further investigation and labour, there is no expression of disapproval, and no inference to be drawn that less has been done than might have been done. Hence I think, you may on further perusal of the Government Order perceive that paras 6 & 7 of your letter is worded as if there were some fall upon you to defend yourself against imputations: such imputations not being really conveyed; and that it is hardly advisable to hold out the threat in para 7 of taking diminished interest in the project in future.

You will have the opportunity of discussing the Government Order with Colonel Orr and Major Mullins

and I would recommend that the remonstrance as conveyed in your letter of the 21st should not go on to Government. If you still wish it: the letter will be forwarded -

I have &c
Signed H. L. Rendergast Captn. RE
Offg Superintg Engineer 8th Dn

/ True Copy /
H. L. Rendergast Captain RE
Offg Superintg Engineer 8th Dn

From

Enclosure No 2
In a letter from the
Offg. Superintending
8th Dn. to the Chief
Engineer for Irrigation
& Joint Secretary
to Government dated
6th January 1870 No
2277

P. W. 1134
Copy of Captn Rendergasts
letter dated 24th Decr
1869

and I would recommend that the
[illegible] letter
to Government.

From

Lieutt. J. Pennycuick R.E.
Executive Engineer on Special Duty

To The Superintending Engineer
8th Division

Sir,

I have been favored by the Chief Engineer for Irrigation with a copy of his report on the result of his visit to the Periyaur in October last, and of the Order of Government (No 3763 of the 26th November) thereon.

2. Concerning the former, I have at present nothing to say, except that all the practical remarks & suggestions contained therein have received, or will receive in course of time, due attention; but I desire to offer a few remarks on the first paragraph of the order itself -

3

3 It is perfectly true that four Officers of Engineers have been employed on the investigations, but the Government appears to have forgotten, or perhaps are not aware that these four Officers have never yet been at work at the same time.

4 We commenced work this season at the beginning of July[st]. from that time until the 12[th] of August, there were three Officers at work. On the 12[th] of August Lt. Grice was removed to trace the Audubon Ghat, and from then until the 8[th] October, we only had two Officers. On the latter date Lieut[t]. Christie reached the Periyaur; Lieut[t]. Grice returned with Major Mullins & Capt[n]. Prendergast on the 15[th] of the same month & on the departure of the former Officers, Lieut[t]. Coaker went with him to take up the work in the Plains. It thus appears that during the five months, from July to November, we have never had more than three Officers at work on the hills, and during two months out of that five, we have only had two. Moreover Lieut[t]. Coaker has been ill during a considerable portion of this time.

5 I am utterly at a loss to understand on what grounds the Government expected the estimates to be completed by the end of this year. As long ago as last April, I stated that if the lake basin was to be surveyed, the work on the hills alone would occupy two Officers till the end of this working season, that is till the end of February; the assistance of a third Officer during a portion of the season has been far more than counterbalanced

X Paras 56, 57, of report dated 15[th] April, printed with G. O. No 2486 of 28[th] July 1869.

counterbalanced by the additional work caused by the necessity for carrying the investigations to so much greater extent than was at first contemplated. For this the nature of the ground, & not the Officers employed, is responsible.

6. Neither Major Mullins nor the Government appear to have the slightest conception of the amount of work which we have had to do. For the last fourteen months or Lt. Cooker & myself have exerted ourselves in connection with this project to an extent much beyond what the Government could have reasonably claimed from us. We have both suffered in health from the work, myself only slightly as yet, Lieut: Cooker, I fear, seriously, and it is not agreeable to find that our endeavours have only elicited an expression of disappointment that we have not performed an absolute impossibility.

7. I must say that this order does not hold out any great encouragement to us to continue our exertions or to keep up the interest we have hitherto taken in the project.

8. I request that this letter may be submitted to Government.

I have &c.

Madras 21st Dec. 69

/ Sd / J. Pennycuick Lt RE
Exc. Engineer on Special Duty

/ True Copy /
Chas Sandys Capt RE
Offg. Superintending Engineer
8th Division

No 2277 Madura
6th January 1870

From,

Captain A. & D. Pendergast R.E.
Offg. Superintending Engineer
8th Division

To,

Major J. Mullins R.E.
Chief Engineer & Joint Secretary
to Government Public Works

Sir,

I have the honor to submit for information & orders a letter addressed to me by Lieutt. Pennycuick Commanding 2nd Sappers & Miners dated 21st Decr 1869 enclosing a letter from Lieutt. Pennycuick to the Chief Engineer for Irrigation & joint Secretary to Government Public Works dated 21st Decr 1869 and a letter from Lieutt. Pennycuick to the Chief Engineer for Irrigation & joint Secretary to Government Public Works dated 24th Decr 1869 and a letter from Lieutt. Pennycuick to the Chief Engineer for Irrigation & joint Secretary to Government Public Works dated 29th Decr 1869.

2. I beg to state that I have been posted upon these works since the 1st Decr 1869, and that I have not had any intercourse with Lieutt. Pennycuick, the Executive Officer of the Irrigation Works, except on official matters connected with the Irrigation Works.

I have the honor to be,
Sir,
Your most obedient Servant,
A. & D. Pendergast
Captain R.E.
Offg. Superintending Engineer
8th Division

Enclosure No 1
In a letter from the
Offg. Supg. Engineer 8th Dn.
to the Chief Engineer
for Irrigation & joint
Secretary to Govt. dated
6th January 1870 No. 2277

P.W./134

Copy of Lieutt. Pennycuick's
letter, dated 21st Decr
1869.

Perryman project. I have conveyed to Lieutt. Pennycuick my reading of the Government Order, that there is a distinction between disappointment & disapproval: & that no reflection is cast upon his labours. Lt Pennycuick however, from his second letter, does not accept what I point out to be the interpretation, and in para 5 considers it due to himself to furnish explanation of the grounds on which he holds censure to be unjust. A hard working Officer who has devoted himself, to his task under peculiarly difficult circumstances may naturally feel discouraged, if told that more was expected of him: but I feel sure that as nothing has been expressed, so also nothing is implied to this effect in the Government Order of 26th November.

I have &c.

Chas Pemberton Capt. R.E.

Offg Superintending Engineer 8th Div.

Public Works Department
No 4081 13
Proceedings of His Excellency Governor:
Under date the 11th Feby 1870.
Read the following Letter.

From The Offg. Superintending Engr. S.W.C. No 2277 Dated 8th January 1870

8th Division

The interpretation put upon the order of Govt. No 3763 dated 21st November last No 3713, by the Superintending Engineer, 8th Division, in his letter No 2230 of the 24th ultimo to Lieut. Penny-quick is the correct one.

The Govt. were disinclined to sanction that the Ryotwar projects could not be brought forward for sanction as long as they had not received the detailed remarks which they had called for. The delay that has occurred is much to be regretted.

P. W. 1870 Department
Proc. of Govr. for February
No 206
No 134

From
The Offg. Superintending Engineer 8th Division

To
The Actg. Chief Engineer for Irrigation & Inam Secretary to Government PWD Madras

Dated 6th January 1870

Rec'd 19 Cs
do 12
Encl 3

Submits for orders copies of letters from Lt. Pennyquick containing certain remarks on the Order of Government No 3763 of the 26th November 1869

No 687-11-Feby/70-

No 206

Rec'd 20th Jan 1870

to the necessity for extending the investigations, and partly to the fact that some of the circumstances of the case, having an important influence on the design of the works and perhaps on the arrangement of the project generally, had not been ascertained but assumed, and it became apparent at a later date that the actual were widely different to the assumed facts.

2. The Govt. order was not intended to express disappointment that Lieut. Pennycuick and the officers under him had not done their best to push forward the investigations, in the absence of any evidence to the contrary it was assumed that they had done all that was in their power.

3. It is now necessary to notice with dissatisfaction the manner in which Lieut. Pennycuick has expressed himself in his letter of the 20th Ultimo to the Supt. Engineer, and His Excellency the Governor in Council regrets the want of judgment which prevented Lieut. Pennycuick from accepting Captain Prendergast's opinion as to the interpretation of the order, and his advice that a very improperly written letter

[illegible]

To the Supt. Engr. 8th Div.

Dept. 15/2/70.

× I think this is unduly severe. The first para. of his D.O. was in my opinion hastily expressed, and I think Lieut. Pennycuick

[illegible]

Letter should not be forwarded to Government

HH 14/1/70

Lt Tempest who has been working Bird being arranged with H.

I would omit the last part of the para as regarded by Lt Arbuthnot. Lieut Tempest has somewhat overreached himself but he has worked hard and I may be expected to forward amongst all the applications of the distinguishment of Lieut Bird

C. 20 Jan 1870 B Bird Foley

Enc 134

Govt. of Madras.

PUBLIC WORKS.

To The Superintending Engr
8th Division

Dated

Recd.

G. O. 11th Feby 1870, No. 181

Nos. 206-207

Perryam Project Passing orders
on the Allied forms the Supdg Engr
of the 8th Div. regarding the inter-
-pretation put by him on
Govt Order 376 of 1869
relative to the Perryam Project