

Local & Munl. (1898) Department.

MISCELLANEOUS.

G.O., No. 14,45 M

DATED 17-8-98

DESPATCHED
INDEXED.

[Despatch Abstract.]

Ootacamund Lake Reclamation Project.

Communicating to the Municipal Council of Ootacamund, R.D. P.W.D. sanctioning with remarks, revised estimate of Rs 1,99,140 for filling in the upper portion of the Ootacamund Lake, in supersession of the original estimate of Rs 1,00,000.

BACK PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

FURTHER PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

BUILDINGS AND ROADS.
CIVIL WORKS.

Government (1898) of Madras. PUBLIC WORKS.

LOCAL & MUNICIPAL DEPT.
CURRENT No. 2549

Recd.

1898.

Enclosures

Regd.

Spare copies

G.O., No. 1763 W., 12th July 1898.

N
This order No 1445 *Minis* of 17/8/98
Communicated to the municipal
Council of Ootacamund.

JULY. *RR*
12/7/98

ale
17/8/98

To The Chairman, Municipal Council, Ootacamund
thru the Coll. of the Nilgiris
19/7/98

Ootacamund Lake Reclamation Project

Revised estimate of Rs. 1,99,140 for filling in the upper portion of the Ootacamund Lake, sanctioned, with remarks, in supersession of the original estimate of Rs. 1,00,000.

22 JUL 1898

4/4

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS.

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT.

Buildings and Roads.
Civil Works.

READ—the following papers:—

From A. H. GARRETT, Esq., Superintending Engineer, IV Circle, to the Chief Engineer, Public Works Department, dated Coimbatore, 22nd May 1898, No. 275 W.

I have the honour to forward a revised estimate for "Filling in the Ootacamund Lake."

2. The report accompanying the estimate gives a history of the work and explains the necessity for the estimate now submitted.

3. It will be seen that the estimate originally submitted by Mr. deWinton was fairly accurate. Mr. Malet prepared a revised estimate in May 1897, which Mr. Somers-Eve submitted with slight alterations after taking over charge from Mr. Malet. The sections which accompanied this estimate were not signed and Mr. Somers-Eve is unable to say who prepared them. He, however, accepted them as correct, though it is now quite certain that they were very inaccurate, as the quantity of work to be done calculated from them differs very much from the amount given in Mr. deWinton's estimate and that which has actually been executed.

4. The present estimate exceeds that sanctioned by Rs. 93,500 and the report and comparative statement afford the necessary explanation.

5. The rate for earth-work works out to Rs. 17.03 per unit—*vide* items 12, 13 and 26 and in this connection attention is drawn to G.O., No. 1732 W., dated 30th June 1897.

6. There has been a large excess on the item Hutting which in his letter, dated 28th May 1897, Mr. Somers-Eve said would not cost more than Rs. 1,000. The expenditure, however, seems to have been necessary and unavoidable.

7. I am decidedly in favour of the lump sum provision of Rs. 5,000 referred to in paragraph 20 of the report as I think slips are certain to occur during the monsoon.

8. In conclusion I would observe that although the work of the Pioneers has been somewhat expensive, it has been eminently satisfactory in all other respects.

From the Superintending Engineer, IV Circle, dated 26th May 1898, No. 277 W.
" " " " " 2nd June " " 288 W.

NOTE BY THE CHIEF ENGINEER.

Revised estimate of Rs. 1,99,140 for filling in the upper portion of the Ootacamund Lake.

With his letter No. 275, dated 22nd May 1898, the Superintending Engineer, IV Circle, submits a revised estimate of Rs. 1,99,140, together with a comparative statement, for filling in the upper portion of the Ootacamund Lake.

2. The original estimate submitted by the Executive Engineer, Coimbatore division, for this work amounted to Rs. 1,27,900. This provided for 76.3 lakhs of cubic feet of earth-work to be taken partly from the south side of the lake at a rate of Rs. 13-8-0 per 1,000 cubic feet and partly from the north side (Jail Hill) at a rate of Rs. 18 per 1,000 cubic feet. This estimate was reduced in the Chief Engineer's office to Rs. 1,00,000 for reasons given in G.O., No. 3246 W. of 19th December 1895, chiefly by lowering the rate for earthwork to Rs. 11 and by omitting the provision for cross drainage and was sanctioned for this amount in the above-mentioned Government Order.

3. The excess of Rs. 99,140 now submitted for sanction is principally made up as follows:—

Item No.	Description.	Amount of excess.	Remarks.
		RS.	
1	Earthwork ...	39,350	Due principally to raising the rate from Rs. 11 to Rs. 15, the quantity actually executed being only 4 percent. in excess of that originally provided. For reasons for this excess <i>vide</i> report, paragraph 3.
2	Dry stone revetment.	12,089	Not provided in original estimate. This has to be laid all along the toe of the steep scarp on south side of reclamation to prevent slips which have occurred owing to the large amount of water percolating from the bank. This could not have been foreseen before the excavation was made. The item also includes the rough-stone drain at foot of scarp— <i>vide</i> paragraph 10 of report.
3	Hutting and conservancy.	5,500	This expenditure is entirely due to the presence of the Pioneers in Ootacamund, and has greatly exceeded the original amount of Rs. 1,000 mentioned in the Executive Engineer's letter printed with G.O., No. 1587 W. of 11th June 1897. The reasons for this excess are given in paragraph 14 of report attached. Sanction to the employment of the Pioneers was given in G.O., No. 1697 W., dated 25th June 1897.
4	Tramway ...	15,000	The rates provided in the original estimates submitted, viz., Rs. 13-8-0 and Rs. 18 were intended to cover all plant for transporting earth. In addition however to the revised rate of Rs. 15, it has been found necessary to spend Rs. 15,000 on trucks and rails, bringing the actual rate for earthwork up to Rs. 17.03 per 1,000 cubic feet. Details of the excess are given in paragraph 15 of the report.
5	Roads ...	5,010	The original estimate provided only Rs. 500 for metalting and gravelling the short diversion of the road which was then intended. The additional cost is due partly to the fact that principally owing to the purchase of land from Woodcot estate the road diversion has been much more extensive than originally proposed, and partly to the fact that after the diversion was almost complete it was found necessary for the safety of the banks and for general convenience to re-align it in a lower level— <i>vide</i> G.O., No. 788 W. of 23rd March 1898 and paragraph 9 of report.
6	Compensation for land.	2,500	It was originally intended to purchase only the plot of land below Race View for which Rs. 5,000 was provided and Rs. 4,500 paid. It was subsequently decided to purchase part of Woodcot to obtain earth for filling, and for this Rs. 1,500 were paid. The balance of the excess is not explained— <i>vide</i> paragraph 7 of report.

Item No.	Description.	Amount of excess.	Remarks.
		RS.	
7	Turfing and planting grass.	2,500	A great deal more is provided for than was originally contemplated, on Polo ground and slopes of bank, and owing to long drought up to May, much that was done had to be redone. The greater part of this work has still to be done.
8	Rough stone culverts.	1,300	The excess is partly for culverts under new road, and partly to drain old ABC ground when the old drainage channel was blocked (paragraph 11 of report).
9	Filling Polo ground hole.	1,768	The filling had to be continued further east than was originally intended to prevent ponding of water on Polo ground (<i>vide</i> paragraph 8 of report).
10	Drains ...	5,000	Rs. 8,000 were provided in the original estimate, but the amount was cut out by Colonel Pennycook as unnecessary. Owing to the heavy drainage from the scarp on south, it has been found impossible to do without it.
11	Provision for repairing slips in slopes.	5,000	This is a provision for future work if found necessary (<i>vide</i> paragraph 20 of report).
12	Contingencies ...	3,791	Excess due to the long time the work has been in hand.
		98,808	

There are also several minor items of excess and some savings, bringing the total excess to Rs. 99,140.

4. Items 2, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11 and most of 12 may be accepted as unavoidable.

5. With regard to items 1 and 4, it is observed that the original estimate for earthwork was carefully prepared as regards quantity, and the rates were intended to cover all plant and appliances. These rates were calculated by the undersigned when Executive Engineer, Coimbatore division, in communication with Messrs. Mitchell and Mackenzie, to whom it was intended to entrust the work because they have a very great command of labour, and could have brought up 2,000 coolies and completed it in six months. If this course had been followed, it is considered that the work would have been completed long ago for an amount very little, if any, in excess of the original estimate submitted, viz., Rs. 1,27,900. But the undersigned was transferred, the estimate was cut down to a lakh, time was wasted in vain attempts to do the work for the reduced rate, and eventually the rate had to be increased, and the expensive aid of the Pioneers called in, with the result that the work has already taken $2\frac{1}{2}$ years, and is not yet finished and the sanctioned estimate has been nearly doubled.

The fact that the work would cost nearly 2 lakhs of rupees was brought to the notice of Government in the undersigned's inspection notes of last October.

6. Item 3 of the excess is entirely due to the presence of the Pioneers in Ootacamund. There is no doubt that they have done very satisfactory work, but it has proved exceedingly expensive, and their introduction would have been quite unnecessary if well tried contractors, such as Messrs. Mitchell and Mackenzie, had been called in in the first instance and given a reasonable rate.

7. This large excess is principally due to the very unfortunate and impolitic reduction of the rates in the Chief Engineer's office, which made it impossible for any trustworthy contractors to take up the work and directly produced the half-hearted attempts at tackling this big undertaking which characterized the first 15 months of the operations. Credit is due to Mr. Somers-Eve that, on his advent in March 1897, much more vigour was thrown into the work, and it is now approaching a completion which will be very satisfactory in every way beyond the fact that the cost has been so excessive.

8. The revised estimate is recommended for sanction.

29th June 1898,

(Signed) W. B. DEWINTON,
Chief Engineer.

ORDER—No. 1763 W., dated 12th July 1898.

The revised estimate amounting to Rs. 1,99,140, for filling in the upper portion of the Ootacamund Lake, is sanctioned in supersession of the original estimate of Rs. 1,00,000 sanctioned in G.O., No. 3246 W., dated 19th December 1895.

2. The probable outlay on the work to end of 1897-98 amounts to Rs. 1,43,147. A provision of Rs. 44,153 has been made for it in the current year's Provincial Civil Works Budget. The balance of estimate, viz., Rs. 11,840, will, if possible, be allotted later in the year.

3. The sanction accorded in paragraph 1 has been registered as Provincial No. 38 W. of 1898-99, and classified as Miscellaneous Public Improvements—Original Works.

(True Extract.)

Under Secretary to Government.

To the Superintending Engineer, IV Circle,
with enclosures.

Examiner, Public Works Accounts.

Local and Municipal Department, for
communication to the Municipal Council, Ootacamund.

Exd. T. K. Narayana Aiyangar.

When given for copying _____
 When copied _____
 When examined _____
 When signed 18/8) 189 .

Read again G.O., No. _____ DATED _____
 189 ,

CURRENT No.

ENCLOSURES TO C. No.

ORDER OF GOVERNMENT A A A A A A A

LETTER OF GOVERNMENT.

STATEMENT WITH DITTO.

PAPERS NOT FILED UP, BEING MEANT FOR DESPATCH
 IN ORIGINAL.

N.B.—

- A = Copy in full.
- B = Not to be copied.
- F = Copy abstract only.
- Q = Copy heading only.