[L. & M.
9,000-8-8-96.]

Local & Munl. (1896) Department.

MISCELLANEOUS.

G.O., No. 313 L

DATED 14th February 1896.

[Despatch Abstract.]

Petition.

Informing Ch. Benjamin Joel late Head Clerk of the District Surgeon's office Masulipatam that no appeal lies to Government in the case of his dismissal from the above post.

BACK PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

FURTHER PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

[G/9]
4,000—28-1-96.

Current No. ~~417~~ ~~Pub~~

L&M DEPARTME

Local & Municipal Dept.
CURRENT No. 356 L

From

Ch: Benjamin Joel
Late Head Clerk of the
Dist. Surgeon's Office
Masulipatam

No.

Dated 28 } January 96
Received 31 }

Registered 1. 2. '96

Enclosures 20 20

SUBJECT.

Appealing against the orders of dismissal passed on him by the President, Dt Board, Kistna.

R
Misc.

Order No. 313 L&M
14-2-96

The petitioner will be referred to G.O. No. 1612 L dated 4th September 1895 in which he was informed that no appeal lies to Government in his case.

I.R.
13/2/96

WWD
14.ii.96

To
The Petitioner

Desp. 15/2/96

App
14/2

(With order)

(C)

True extract from Dispatch letter book.

No:	Date	To whom (A)	Purport.	Rets:
1306.	8/11/93.	Dy. Sanitary Commissioner Madras.	Forwarded ~~for favourable consideration~~. If the applicant is chosen for the post of Dy: Inspr: of Vacci: I should wish him to go for good and all, and not to return to my Office, as constant changes in the clerks is very detrimental to Office work.	4718

a false interpolation made by the 2nd C
sd/ W.F.T. 3.5.94

/True Copy/

W. Tickell Captain
Surgeon-~~Major~~,
Ag. District Medical & Sanitary Officer,
KISTNA.

Initials "W.F.T." are those of Surgeon-Major W. F. Thomas.

6
Puf
20
417

20/3586/96

(C)

Proceedings of the president District-

(B) (13) Office of Sanitary Commissioner
Fort St George 28th Nov 1893

No 1706
6

Memorandum

Your application for the post of Deputy Inspector of Vaccination.

You are informed that your application has been registered

(By order)
(Sd) T. Balasundram
Manager and Assistant,
Office of Sanitary Commissioner, Madras

To

Ch. Benjamin
Head Clerk,
District Surgeon's Office
Masulipatam

(True Copy)
Ch. Benjamin Joel

(True Copy)
Kirlio

Ch. Benjamin Joel

(C)

Proceedings of the president District Board Kistna, dated March 1894 No.

(C)

Read letter from the District Medical & Sanitary Officer Kistna No. 3813 dated 17th March 94 informing that, with the approval of the Sanitary Commissioner, he has directed his Head Clerk Ch. Benjamin Joel, to act for Suryanarayana Deputy Inspector of Vaccination M. R. on privilege leave for three months on half pay.

order Dis No $\frac{477}{22 \cdot 3 \cdot 94}$

The acting appointment of Ch. Benjamin Joel is approved

2. G. Kamaraju will act for Benjamin Jo

(Sd) J. W. Hughes
for President

To
The District Medical and Sanitary Offic

True copy forwarded to Benjamin Joel Ag. Deputy Inspector of Vaccination M. R.

(Sd) Lakshuman perumall pillay
Assistant Surgeon
Medical Charge
Kistna

(True Copy)

(Initialled) L.P.L
Assistant Surgeon
Kistna

(True Copy)

Ch. Benjamin Joel

(D)

Proceedings of the President, District Board, Kistna, dated 24th March 1894.

Read this office Proceedings dated 22nd March 1894 Dis No 477 approving the appointment of Ch. Benjamin Joel, Head Clerk of the District Surgeon's Office, as acting Deputy Inspector of Vaccination, Masulipatam Range, during the absence of the permanent incumbent, R. Suryanarayana, on privilege leave for three months.

Read also papers connected with the allegation of misappropriation of money made against Benjamin Joel by the Masulipatam Municipal Council in the year 1891-92.

Order dated 24th March 94 Dis No 478

A very grave suspicion exists against Benjamin Joel of having misappropriated or connived at the misappropriation of Municipal money and he should not therefore be appointed to any position of trust under the District Board.

2. The Sanitary Commissioner, Madras has been requested to make another appointment.

3. The acting appointment of Benjamin Joel as Deputy Inspector of Vaccination is hereby cancelled.

(Signed)

(Signed) J. N. Atkinson
President

(True Copy)

Communicated to the District Medical and Sanitary Officer, Kistna for information and guidance.

(Signed) Syedally.
24/3
for President

1896
Pub Dept.
Enclos: No 17
O. No 417

No: 53
8.2.93.

(E.)

To
The Treasury Deputy Collector
Kistna District.

Sir,

I have the honor to request sanction to pay all moneys for the credit of the Municipality into the Taluq Treasury. The chairman has consented to it if you have no objection. My reason for asking this is that we have constantly to remit money to the Municipal office, realized by sale of medicines, rent of Police Hospital, etc: and frequently no receipt is given; and the peon has to call several times for it and in one recent case from forgetting to apply for a receipt; the receipt of the money was denied, though the despatch book bears the signature of the manager to the receipt of the letter and money and the exceeding unpleasantness of my clerk and peon being charged with misappropriation of funds has been made by the Chairman of the Municipality

I have etc:
Sd/ J. B. Thomas
&c.

(True copy.) / W. Vickers
Captain
Surgeon-~~Major~~.
a/g District Medical & Sanitary Officer,
KISTNA.

No: 178
20.5.93.

(7)

To

The Chairman.
M.C.
Masulipatam.

Sir,

In reply to your letter No: 152 D/16.5.93 I have the honor to inform that Shaik. Hussain late peon of this Hospital having received the amount of Rs: 32: 2: 9 for payment to the Manager Municipal Office Masulipatam according to his own admission in his deposition before you has been directed by me to pay up the amount within 10 days from this day.

Sd/ C. Muniswamy
&c &c:

/True Copy./

W. Nickles
Captain
Surgeon-~~Major,~~
a.q. District Medical & Sanitary Officer,
KISTNA.

15/56

1896
Pul Dept.
Bndle No. 15
417

No: 245 / 4·7·93.　(G)

To

The Chairman,

Municipal Council,

Masulipatam.

Reference { This office letter No: 178 / 20·5·93.

Sir,

I have the honour to remit herewith Rs. 32. 2. 9 Rupees Thirty two annas two and pies nine only being the amount recovered from Shaik Hussain peon of the Animal Vaccination depôt Civil Dispensary Masulipatam.

2. An acknowledgment is requested in duplicate.

I have etc. etc.

S/ C. Muniswamy.

&c.

/True Copy/

W. Vickers.

Captain

Surgeon-~~Major~~,

a.g. District Medical & Sanitary Officer,

KISTNA.

/True Copy/　D.H.L　Surgeon Major

Asst Surgeon　A/ Dt. Surgeon

1897
Pub. Dept.
14
To
417

No 168
11.5.93 To

The President
District Board
Kistna

Sir,

I have the honor to forward the accompanying petition applying for a post in the District Board's office received from Ch. Benjamin Joel Head clerk in my office for your favorable consideration

2. I need not speak further as to the clerk's abilities and character as he holds the highest testimonials from all his Superiors

I have the honor to be
Sir
Your most Obedient Servant
(Sd) J. B. Thomas
Brigade Surgn Lt. Col.
District Medical and Sanitary Officer
Kistna

(True Copy)

Ch. Benjamin Joel

(True Copy)
T. R. L.
Asst Surgeon
Surgeon Major

1896
Pul Dept.
Enclos. No 13
To
417

(9)

Memo

D. Reg: No 11 L.X accounts
27. 5. 93

Ch. Benjamin Joel Head Clerk, District Surgeon's office Kistna, on Rs 25 to act as Second Local Fund Account on Rs 35 vice L. Sreeramulu.

True Extract

(Sd) J. H. Atkinson
Ag: Collector

(S)

Through the District Surgeon Kistna

Copy communicated to Ch. Benjamin Joel Head Clerk District Surgeon's office Kistna for information (To join forthwith)

Kistna Collectorate
Masulipatam
25th May 1893

(Sd) Ch. Venkatachelam
Deputy Collector
for acting Collector

(True Copy)

Ch. Benjamin Joel

(J)

No 196
7.6.93

Endorsement on District Surgeon Head Clerk Benjamin Joels petition dated 7th June 1893 addressed to the President District Board Kistna.

~~Forwarded~~ for favorable consideration. He richly deserves promotion; and I am fully confident that he will discharge the duties of a Deputy Inspector of Vaccination to the entire satisfaction of all his superiors.

(Sd/ C. Munisawmy
Ag: District Surgeon
Kistna

(True Copy(

Ch. Benjamin Joel

(K)

Serial Number	The Charge	Sections I.P.C	Courts	Result
1	Forgery of a Voucher	467	S.S. Magistrate Gudivada	Was withdrawn by the President District Board Kistna
2	Defamation	500	Head of Deputy Magistrate Kistna	Was discharged by the Deputy Magistrate Kistna
3	Forgery of a Certificate	465	Sessions Court Bunder	Discharged by the District & Sessions Judge Kistna
4	Misappropriation	403	S.S. Magistrate Bunder	Was withdrawn by the President District Board Kistna
5	Do & Forgery	465, 403	Sessions Court Bunder	Acquitted by the District and Sessions Judge, Kistna

A. Benjamin Joel

1897
Pub Dept.
10
417

No 3962 (L)

Office of District Medical
and Sanitary Officer
Kistna, Masulipatam
Dated 26. 3. 1894

From

The District Medical
and Sanitary Officer
Kistna

To,

The President
District Board
Kistna

Enclosures

Reference {

Sir,

With reference to your Proceedings No 477/22.3.94, cancelling the appointment of Ch. Benjamin Joel as acting Deputy Inspector of Vaccination, I regret to state that I have already on the 21st Instant with your approval ordered him to take charge. I have also communicated to him your Proceedings dated 24th March and his explanation is herein enclosed.

2. As regards the Serious Suspicion of misappropriation I find that the records in the Office do not bear out the allegation / vide enclosed copies of letters Nos 53/8.2.93, 179/20.5.93 and 245/4.7.93 addressed to the Treasury Deputy Collector and chairman Municipal Council Masulipatam

3. In the enquiry about the matter

then held the peon openly acknowledged having taken the money from Ch. Benjamin Joel and as such it is impossible to lay the suspicion at his door. Moreover it plainly appears from enclosures 2 and 3 that the deficit was made good not by Benjamin but by the peon himself.

4. From the office records and his Service Register Benjamin appears to have discharged his duties with straightforward honesty and even after this affair, he was once appointed as Second Local Fund Accountant on a Salary of Rupees 35/ per mensum and later on his name was sent up by you to the Sanitary Commissioner for the place of Deputy Inspector of Vaccination Guntoor Range in May last. He was also strongly recommended to the Sanitary Commissioner Madras for the appointment of the Deputy Inspector of Vaccination by Dr Sturmer in the month of November 1893 and the enclosed Copy of Memo No 1706 / 28.11.93 is the reply to it. This present acting appointment was favoured by the Sanitary Commissioner on my recommendation.

5. From what I know and hear

of him and from the copies of his testimonials shown to me I find him to be a respectable and honest man. He seems to be holding position of honor and trust in the C. M. S. mission here (vide para 9 of the explanatory letter submitted by him.

6. Under these circumstances I request you to retain his acting appointment

I have the honor to be,
Sir
Your most Obedient Servant
(Sd) T. R. Lackshmana Perumaul Pilley
Assistant Surgeon,
in Medical Charge, Kistna

True Copy/
(Initialled/ T.R.L.
Ass Surgeon
Kistna

(True Copy/

Ch. Benjamin Joel

1896
Pub Dept
Enclos. No 9
to
C. No 417

(Kr)

No 3968

Office of District Medical
and Sanitary Officer
Kistna, Masulipatam
dated 27.3.1894

From

The District Medical
and Sanitary Officer
Kistna

To,

The Sanitary Commissioner
for Madras

Enclosures. 6

1. Copy of this office letter No 3962/26.3.94 addressed to the President of Board Kistna
2. True Copy of letter dated the 26th March 94 Submitted by Ch. Benjamin Joel to the Dt Surgeon
3. Copy of this office letter No 53/8.8.93 addressed to the Treasury Deputy Collector
4. Copy of letter No 178/20.5.93 addressed to the Chairman Municipal Council
5. Copy of letter No 245/4.7.93 do do
6. Copy of memo No 1706 dated 28.11.93 addressed to Ch. Benjamin Joel

Reference {

Sir,

In forwarding the marginally noted correspondence about Benjamin Joel's appointment to the place of Deputy Inspector of Vaccination Masulipatam Range, I have the honor to state that as far as I can understand the office records, this clerk is not at all implicated in the alleged misappropriation, as the peon through whom the money was sent openly admitted at the enquiry then held, that he received the money from the hands of the clerk

2. Benjamin Joel has done excellent Service for 15 years and his Character is beyond all question very good and there is not the slightest reason

1897
Pub
417

Dt Surgeon's office
No 491 dated 3.5.94

From
The District Medical and
Sanitary officer
Vizilia

To
The President
District Board
Vizilia

Sir

With reference to your letter No 547/DB of 1894 dated 24.4.94, I have the honor to state that in the office record of Endorsement No 1306 dated 8.11.93 the words "for favourable consideration" is interpolated in the handwriting of the 2nd Clerk of the office. Hence this false interpolation was copied and forwarded to you. The 2nd Clerk has been severely reprimanded and warned that ~~such~~ similar faults will be dealt with instant dismissal.

2. In this respect then Benjamin Joel though Head Clerk was ignorant of this false endorsement I have warned him that I shall take serious steps if such mistakes and false endorsements emanated from this office in future

3. In conclusion you will be aware that this Endorsement (8.11.93) was made when I was not District Medical officer. my late reply to

E Benjamin Joel

your memo is due to the fact of my being on tour of inspection

I have &c &c

(Sd) W. F. Thomas
Surgeon Major
Ag: District Surgeon
Kistna

True Copy/

(Sd) T.R. Lackshmana Perumaul Pillay
Asst Surgeon
Kistna

True Copy/

A. Benjamin Joel

1896
Pub Dept.
Wholes. No. 7
To
No. 47

No. 717 (N/K) dated 14.5.94

To

The President
District Board
Kistna

Sir

With reference to your Office Memo No 547/D.B. dated 11.5.94 after looking into the Case, pros & cons, I have the honor to recommend that my 1st Clerk Benjamin Joel be fined RS. 12. and my 2nd Clerk be fined RS. 7.

2. As I am new to this Office, having assumed Medical Charge on 12.4.94 and as all the anual Reports for the Administration Report of the District Board have to be ~~the~~ prepared, I cannot recommend suspension or dismissal either of which punishment both Clerks deserve. I therefore recommend the above named fines to be inflicted in the present Case.

3. Your 25 Enclosures are herewith returned

I have &c.

(Sd) W. F. Thomas
Surgeon Major
A/. Dt. Surgeon

(True Copy/
(Initialled)
T.R.L
Asst Surgeon
Kistna

True Copy/
A. Benjamin Joel

(C)

Charge against Ch: Benjamin Joel,
Head Clerk in the office of the District
Medical & Sanitary Officer, Kistna Dt.-

That you caused a false entry to be made in the Register of letters sent from the office, by interpolating against No: 1306 dated the 8th November 1893. the words "For favourable consideration" which words do not appear in the orl to endorsement sent to the Sanitary Commr.

You are hereby called on to explain this, and show cause why you should not be dismissed from Service.

Sd/ E.C. Rawson
President
Dt. B.d.
7/6/94.

"True Copy"

E C Rawson
President

1896 6
Pub 14
5
417

5/18 6/96

(P/ (P) Dis No 805/D3 894

Proceedings of the President, District Boar
Kistna. Dated 8-6-94. Desp^d 12-6-94

It is untrue
In November last I applied generally to give me a post & there was no vacancy among the Deputies then in the District

The facts of this case are as follow:-

There being an acting vacancy in November of last year among the Deputy Inspectors of Vaccination, Ch. Benjamin Joel, Head Clerk in the District Surgeon's office, applied to the Sanitary Commissioner for the appointment. His petition was forwarded by the late District Surgeon Dr. Sturmer with the endorsement "Forwarded. If the applicant is chosen for the post of Deputy Inspector of Vaccination, I ~~would~~ should wish him to go for good & all and not to return to my office, as constant changes in the clerks is very detrimental to office work".

The alleged misappropriation of Municipal money was thrown upon me and the proof finding no other safe gate to escape and East Indian +

This endorsement is dated the 7th November 1893. The appointment having received the approval of the Sanitary Commissioner was also approved by the then President Mr. Atkinson; but this approval was immediately afterwards withdrawn owing to its having come to Mr. Atkinson's knowledge that Joel had been mixed up in a case of misappropriation of Municipal money. There being, in Mr. Atkinson's opinion, very grave suspicion against appreciated the extreme gravity of the charge against these two men. The case against them is that they have deliberately made a false entry in a public record. For such a thing as this fines of 12 Rupees & 7 Rupees are obviously inadequate.

Joel's explanation of the matter is that he knows nothing about the false entry, and only became aware of it on the 3rd of May 94. That this explanation is absolutely false is shown by the fact that in the Assistant Surgeon's letter of the 26th March 94 (already referred to) it is stated that Joel had been "strongly recommended" by Dr. Sturmer." Joel in his explanation now says this was a mistake. Then there is the fact that the interpolation was obviously made for the benefit of Joel, and for no one else.

Yes

Yes. I omitted to mention the names of Drs J B Hume & C Manners unfortunately.

The second clerk Raghavandra Row says that he wrote the false entry at the dictation of ~~the~~ Joel, and that he did not see the original endorsement. He says he wrote the entry on the 8th November 93. Joel denies that he dictated the endorsement. Raghavandra Row moreover had previously told Dr. Thomas and the assistant Surgeon that he had copied

He admitted before the Dt S that he himself wrote by mistake & the Dt S wrote the [illegible] to that effect.

the endorsement direct. It is moreover clearly untrue that the false entry was made in the register on the 8th November 93. There was no necessity whatever for making it then. The necessity arose after Mr. Atkinson had on reading the Assistant Surgeon's letter of the 26th March 1894, to the effect that Joel had been "strongly recommended by Dr. Sturmer", called for a copy of the endorsement. It seems certain, therefore, though the matter is not susceptible of strict proof, that the false entry was made between the time when Mr. Atkinson called for the copy, and the time it was furnished i.e. about the beginning of April 1894. The false entry was evidently made to support the statement in the assistant Surgeon's letter.

As the case happening previous to March & Apl there would have been no necessity of making the interpolation about the beginning of Apl 94 knowing it would affect me. The Endt entd in the despatch register was seen by the Asst Surgeon on the 8th March & then placed himself in communication with the Principal about my appt [illegible]

The false entry was admittedly made by Raghavandarow, and that it was made at the instigation of Joel does not admit of doubt. It would be satisfactory if they could be prosecuted but the definition of a "false document" in the Penal code is so technical, that I am afraid the offence does not amount to Forgery. If it could be strictly proved that the interpolation was made after the endorsement had been entered in the register, then the offence would of course be complete (See 5464 para 2) But I have said above this, though morally certain, is not provable, & I do not think therefore that prosecution would lead to very good result—

Prosecution would have well lead me to escape from the unsafe yoke as this.

It is clear however that Ch. Benjamin Joel, who is clearly guilty of instigating the falsification of his office records for his own ends, can no longer be permitted to remain in the Service of the District Board. I therefore, hereby dismiss him.

I have got already my name registered for the post of Dy. Inspector of Vacin the S. C.'s Office Madras & nothing more is right to make me qualified for the post.

I am disposed to look somewhat more leniently on the conduct of the 2nd clerk, Raghavandra Row. He is young clerk of only 5 years service, and what he did was done not apparently for any advantage he himself would derive from it, but at the instigation and possibly by the orders of the Head clerk. At the same time he has been guilty of a gross piece of misbehaviour, and I accordingly suspend him for 2 years—

Sd/ E. C. Rawson

Copy Surgeon Major W. F. Thomas, who is requested to nominate a Successor to Ch. Benjamin Joel, and some one to act in place of Raghavandra Row at a very early date; so that the services of these men can be dispensed with at once—

Sd/ E. C. Rawson
President
8/6/94

Copies of charge, defence, and this orders to Joel and Raghavandra Row.

Sd/ E. C. Rawson
President
8/6/94

"True Copy"

E C Rawson
President

DISTRICT SURGEON, KISTNA. 13 JUN. 91

Remarks by H.C. Comp. [illegible]

Ch. Benjamin Joel
Head clerk, Dt. Surgeon's Office
Thro'
The District Surgeon
Kistna.

Mr. J. Thomas S.S. Surg. Major [illegible]
13/6/94

6
Pub
Enclos. No. 4
C. No. 417

4/35643

To
Ch. Benjamin Joel
Head Clerk, Dt. Surgeon's office
Thro' The District Surgeon
Kistna

No. 1630
25-6-94

(G)

(G)

Masulipatam
25th June 1894

~~From~~

T. R. Lakshumana perumaul pillay
avergal L. M. S.
Ast. Surgeon & Ast. to Dt. Surgeon
Kistna

To

The President
District Board
Kistna

Sir

With reference to the latter part of para 6 of your proceedings dated the 8th June 1894, I have the honor to state that the last sentence of the said para seems to imply that I endorsed on Ch. Benjamin Joel's application without personally referring to the office records. I clearly remember that I did refer to the records before recommending but had no reasons then to suspect that the entry was false.

2. Under the circumstances of the case I request you to be good enough to with that portion of the paragraph referred to.

I am sorry I was not able to reply you immediately as I had been to Madras on leave

I have the honor to be
Sir
Your most Obedient Servant
(Sd) T. R. Lakshumana Perumell Pilley
Assistant Surgeon
Kistna

(True Copy)
(Initialled) T.R.L.
Assistant Surgeon
Kistna

(True Copy)
Ch. Benjamin Joel

189 6
Pub Dept.
3
Enclos. No.
To
417
C. No.

I.

True Extracts from the Historical Register of Local Fund Board Medical classes Masulipatam Circle 1877-78.

Cherukury Benjamin Joel Senior Medical student was under my instructions for about 3 months, during that time he conducted himself to the full satisfaction of his superior; and showed much zeal in his studies. His knowledge of the English is very fair. He is a quiet, steady, intelligent and respectable lad.

Masulipatam:
15th March,
1877.

(Sd.) C. H. Day, B. A.
Surgeon,
Zillah Surgeon.

II.

Ch. Benjamin was a student of the Masulipatam Local Fund Board Medical classes for about 18 months, during which time he showed much zeal in his studies. He is a quiet and hard working young man of excellent character. He has got a fair knowledge of English language; and he excells every one reading with him. I think his qualifications are superior to those of a Matriculate. He takes much interest with the education of English and I think in times he will succeed well in his profession.

Masulipatam:
15th March,
1878.

(Sd.) F. J. Farrell, M. B.
Surgeon,
Acting Zillah Surgeon.

(True Copies.)

I am
you
o

(Signed.) W. H. Thornhill M. D.
Surgeon,
Acting District Surgeon.

III.

Ch. Benjamin was a student of the Masulipatam Local Fund Board Medical classes for about 18 months; during which time he showed much zeal in his studies. He has got a fair knowledge of English language. He is a very honest young man; and I trust that he will do well in any department where he many get an employment.

Masulipatam :
26th November,
1877.

(Sd.) Mocsmankhan,
2nd Class Hospital
Assistant and Teacher of
Masulipatam Local
Fund Board Medical Classes.

IV.

C. Benjamin, Hospital writer, was appointed by me in March 1879. He had been a medical pupil under me and the late Dr. Farrell. He is a quiet, steady, and respectable lad and does all he can to please his superiors. He writes very nicely and would do very well for a post in the Cutchery.

Masulipatam :
5th Nov. 1879.

(Sd.) H. D. Cook,
Late Zillah Surgeon.

V.

Ch. Benjamin Joel the Hospital writer is a very careful and pains-taking young man of excellent character. All the Annual Returns were examined by him (of more than 12 Hospitals) this year, and none returned for correction from the Surgeon-General's Office.

Masulipatam :
18th March 1884.

(Sd) C. R. G. Parker,
Surgeon-Major.

VI.

I have much pleasure in certifying that C. Benjamin has acted as Local Fund writer in the District Surgeon's office during the past year. He did his duties in a very satisfactory manner; and very frequently Municipal Dispensary work also. He is very correct, seems to thoroughly understand the returns, reports required for each despensary. He is a steady well educated young man of excellent character.

Masulipatam :
10th March,
1882.

(Sd.) W. H. Thornhill, M. D.
Surgeon,
Late Acting District Surgeon.

VII.

C. Benjamin was head-writer in my office during my sojourn here. I can testify to his good abilities and un-

I am
you

remitting attention to his work.

(Sd.) F. J. Doyle,
Acting Civil Surgeon.

Masulipatam :
12th April 1884.

VIII.

Extract from the Acting District Surgeon's Administration Report for the Calendar year 1882 :—

* * *

Ch. Benjamin the Managing clerk of the Local Fund Department under my orders has performed his duties during the year to my entire satisfaction. He is well fitted for the post. I have recommended an increase of Rs. 10 to his present salary of Rs. 20 from the next officia year.

(Sd.) H. Carruthers,
Surgeon,
Acting District Surgeon.

Masulipatam :
28th February,
1883.

IX.

District Surgeon's Office :
Masulipatam,
dated 6th October 1883.

No. 1068.
From
The District Surgeon,
Kistna.

To
The President and Collector,
Kistna District.

Sir,

I have the honor to forward herewith the accompanying papers relative to an application for 2nd class Deputy Inspector of Vaccination in the Kistna District received from Ch. Benjamin Head Clerk in my office for favour of your kind remarks and early return.

2. The applicant has been known to me for the past eighteen months. He is a smart, intelligent man with a good knowledge of English. He is steady and I believe thoroughly trust worthy.

I think he is likely to prove a valuable assistant.

I have the honor to be
Sir,
Your Most Obedient Servant.

(Signed.) H. Carruthers,
Surgeon,
Acting District Surgeon.
Kistna.

I shall be glad to hear of the petitioner's success, as he deserves it.

Sunday
7-10-83.

(Sd.) Austin,
President.

X.

District Surgeon's Office:
Masulipatam,
dated 3rd October 1883.

No. 1075.

FROM
The District Surgeon,
Kistna.

To
The Deputy Surgeon-General M. C. Funnell,
M. D., F. R. C. S.
Sanitary Commissioner Madras.

SIR,

I have the honor to enclose herewith an application for appointment of 2nd class Deputy Inspector of Vaccination in the Kistna District received from Ch. Benjamin Head Clerk in my office. The applicant has been known to me for the past eighteen months. He is a smart, intelligent man with a good knowledge of English. He is steady and I believe thoroughly trust worthy.

I think he is likely to prove a valuable assistant.

I have the honor to be
SIR,
Your Most Obedient Servant.
(Sd.) H. CARRUTHERS,
Surgeon,
Acting District Surgeon,
Kistna.

XI.

District Surgeon's Office:
Masulipatam,
dated 2nd November 1883.

Ch. Benjamin has been my head clerk for the last twety months, and with *one exception has given me every satisfaction. He is a hard working man, and fairly punctual. He understands the working of the office thoroughly and is well up in all orders &c., connected with his work. From what I have seen of him I feel sure that he would give satisfaction and prove trust worthy in a much more responsible post than he now fills, and I shall be glad to hear of his success. He writes a good hand, has an excellent knowledge of English and composes very fairly. He is also good at figures.

Masulipatam :
28th February
1883.

(Sd.) H. CARRUTHERS, I. M. D.
Surgeon,
Acting District Surgeon,
Kistna.

XII.

Recommendatory note of the 2nd November 1883, addressed to the Collector of Kistna :—

MY DEAR AUSTIN,

The bearer is my late head clerk Ch. Benjamin.

---

* The medical indent of the Gudivada despensary was not properly checked.

He is the man of whom I spoke so highly to you, and in whom you kindly said you would take an interest and endeavour to forward.

Believe me
Yours sincerely
(Signed.) H. Carruthers'

XIII.

W. Austin Esq.

True extract taken from the service register:—

I had found him during my term of office (20 months) to be a hardworking and excellent writer.

8th November 1883. (Sd.) H. Carruthers,
Surgeon I. M. D.

XIV

This is to certify that Ch. Benjamin, now clerk in District Surgeon's office Masulipatam, was a pupil of mine in the Local Fund Medical School (1877-78) (which was abolished): but not until all the pupils that attended it; and (Ch. Benjamin was one of them) had been taught the elements of Vaccination, Hygiene, Anotomy, Physiology, Materia Medica; and all could then have passed a very fair examination on any of the above subjects.

Calicut, 27th May 1884. (Sd.) H. D. Cook, M. B.
Late Civil Surgeon.
Masulipatam.

XV.

District Surgeon's Office:
Masulipatam,
dated 16th August 1884.

No. 1405.

From
The District Surgeon
Kistna.

To,
The Inspector of Vaccination and Deputy Sanitary Commissioner, Madras.

Sir,

I have the honor to forward for your favorable consideration the petition of Ch. Benjamin, head clerk in my office here. I have known him since 1882, and would be sorry to lose so smart and intelligent a lad. He is able to make out all returns well and possesses some knowledge of Medicine having been for two years a Medical pupil. I request you will register his name as a candidate for any probable vacancy occuring among the Deputy Inspectors of Vaccination. He has produced evidence of having attended a course of lectures on Vaccination, Hygiene, Anatomy, Physiology, and Materia Medica. Vide true copy of the certificate given by Surgeon-Major H. D. Cook.

I have the honor to be
Sir,
Your most Obedient Servant,
(Sd.) F. J. Doyle,
Acting Civil Surgeon.

XVI.

Office of District Surgeon,
and Sanitary Medical Office, Kistna,
Masulipatam,
dated 28th November 1884.

No. 1676.

From
The District Surgeon and Sanitary
Medical Officer Kistna.

To
Dr. H. Laing
Inspector of Vaccination and Deputy
Sanitary Commissioner, Madras.

SIR,

I have been requested to invite your attention to this office letter No. 1405 dated 16th August 1884 wherein you are besought to give a place in the Vaccination department to my Head Clerk Ch. Benjamin. He is a hard working man and has given me, every satisfaction and is deserving of promotion.

I have the honor to be
SIR,
Your most Obedient Servant,
(Sd.) F. J. DOYLE,
Surgeon.

Acting District Surgeon
and Sanitary Medical Officer,
Kistna.

XVII.

Office of Sanitary Commissioner
Madras 12th December 1884.

No. 1195.

From
The Inspector of Vaccination and Deputy Sanitary Commissioner
Madras.

To,
The District Medical and Sanitary Officer
Kistna.

SIR,

Your letter No. 1967 dated 28th Ultimo.

In reply I have the honor to state that the name of Ch. Benjamin has been registered in this office among other applicants for appointments, but no hope can be held out to him now.

I have the honor to be
SIR,
Your Most Obedient Servant,
(Sd.) JAL. ANDERSON LAING,
Surgeon-Major

Inspector of Vaccination and
Deputy Sanitary Commisioner.

XVIII.

Ch. Benjamin has been the dispensary writer, Bander for several years and has twice served under me. I have much pleasure in testifying to his good character and steadiness, he is well up in his office work and understands how returns should be prepared. I consider him deserving of a better post.

Masulipatam :
18-12-1884.

(Sd.) F. J. DOYLE,
Acting District Surgeon.
Kistna.

XIX.

True extract taken from the Service Register.

Benjamin writer has served twice under me. I have much pleasure in testifying to his good character, he is a good painstaking writer and has given me every satisfaction.

17th December
1884.

(Sd.) F. J. DOYLE,
Surgeon I. M. D.

XX.

C. Benjamin writer to the District Surgeon Kistna knows his duties well and performs them very satisfactorily. He has a good knowledge of English, is punctual, hard-working and a most steady young man of excellent character.

Bander,
24th Nov. 1885.

(Sd.) R. BUTLLER,
Assistant to the District Surgeon,
Kistna.

XXI.

Masulipatam,
22nd April 1885.

D./O. letter.

To
DR. LAING,
Deputy Sanitary Commissioner,
Madras.

My writer Benjamin is very anxious to get an appointment as 2nd Class Deputy Inspector of Vaccination. The present incumbent at Vinukonda is transferred or likely to be so shortly. As a careful writer and a most accurate man for figures I har l never met his equal and will give satisfaction if you can kindly give him any appointment. My leave is granted; and I hope to see you when I come to Madras.

With kind regards
Yours sincerely
(Sd.) J. B. THOMAS,
Surgeon Major.

Madras,
6th May 1885.

To,
MR. C. JOEL BENJAMIN,
Writer to District Surgeon,
Kistna.

I asked Dr. Laing about you he says there are no vacancies but he has registered your name. He remembered that Dr. Cook had also written about you. We shall leave tomorrow.

Kind wishes to the Dressers and Mr. Gurusingh

Your well wisher
(Sd.) J. B. THOMAS.

XXII.

Mr. Ch. Benjamin Joel has been senior writer of the Local Fund Dispensaries in this District for five years and has, as his testimonials show, given universal satisfaction to his superiors and all with whom he has to do. I have not known a single instance of any errors in his work since I have been District Surgeon 16 months.

Masulipatam,
23rd April
1886.

(Sd.) J. B. Thomas,
Surgeon Major,
District Surgeon.

XXIII.

To

Mr. Ch. Benjamin,
Writer to District Surgeon,
Kistna.

I telegraphed to Dr. Laing to consider your claims.

Calicut,
16th Nov. 1886.

(Sd.) H. D. Cook.

XXIV.

District Surgeon's Office,
Masulipatam.
No. 678 dated 4th September 1886.

To

J. A. Laing Esquire,
Surgeon Major, Inspector of Vaccination,
and Deputy Sanitary Commisioner,
Madras.

Sir,

With reference to your letter No. 1194 dated the 9th December 1884. I have the honour to request that you will kindly offer an appointment of Deputy Inspector of vaccination to my office managing clerk, Ch. Benjamin in this District, as the Masulipatam Range Deputy Inspector of Vaccination Bapanayya Naidu applied for pension in his letter No. 132 dated 30th Ultimo (Sent to you on the 1st Instant.)

This clerk has been known to me for the past 7 months. He is a smart, intelligent man with a fair knowledge of English and possesses some knowledge of Medicine having been for two years a medical pupil in the Local Fund Board medical class, which was formed by Dr. Cook in Masulipatam in the year 1877. He is quiet, steady and I believe thoroughly trust worthy. He produced evidence of having attended a course of lectures on Vaccination, Hygiene, Anatomy, Physiology and materia medica. Vide true copy of the certificate given by Surgeon Major H. D. Cook District Surgeon Malabar. This clerk was highly spoken of by Dr. Thomas on several occasions especially on the day giving over medical charge of the station to me in April last, and he was also ~~thoroughly~~ strongly recommended by him to you in D/o letter dated 22nd April and personally when he came to Madras on his way to

I am

you

England. The reply sent to this clerk by Dr. Thomas on leaving Madras for England is as follows "I asked Dr. Laing about you, he says *he has registered your name,* he remembered that Dr. Cook had also written about you."

A printed book containing the testimonials and office records of this clerk is herewith enclosed for your perusal and favour of return when it is no longer required by you, and these testimonials given universal satisfaction to his superiors.

I have &c.
(Sd.) A. Gurusingh,
B. A., M. B., M. C.

XXV.

No. 984 dated 15th December 1886.

To

Surgeon D. G. Dymott M. B.
Acting Inspector of Vaccination
and Deputy Sanitary Commissioner,
Madras.

Reference. This office letter No. 1075 of 3rd October 1883 and letter No. 1404 dated 16th August 1884.

Sir,

I have the honor to request that you will kindly take into consideration the qualifications of Ch. Benjamin District Surgeon's clerk for the post of Deputy Inspector of Vaccination, I believe his name has already been registered in your office. As he has had about two years training in

Vaccination, Hygiene &c. in the late Local Medical School he is well fitted to look after the Sanitation of Villages, which is now one of the chief duties of Deputy Inspectors. I need not speak further as to his abilities as he holds the highest testimonials from all his former superiors. He is willing to accept an acting appointment at Vinukonda, Guntur or elsewhere.

I have &c.
(Sd.) H. F. Staunton,
M. B. M. C.
Ag. District Surgeon.
Kistna.

XXVI.

No. 1181 dated 1st February 1887.

To

Dr. J. A. Laing,
Sanitary Commissioner,
Madras.

Reference. This office letter No. 984 dated 15th December 1886 addressed to the Inspector of Vaccination and Deputy Sanitary Commissioner, Madras.

Sir,

I have the honor to request your attention to the above as there are still vacancies for the post of Deputy Inspector of Vaccination and I do not think a better man than the applicant could be found.

I have &c.
(Sd.) H. F. Staunton, M. B. M. C.
Acting District Surgeon.
Kistna.

XXVII.

No. 1420 dated 3rd March 1887.

To

The President District Board,
Kistna.

Enclosures 2.

Sir

With reference to the enclosed post card No. 60 dated 28th Ultimo from the Civil Surgeon Guntur, I have the honor to recommend my writer Ch. Benjamin for the place of Deputy Inspector of Vaccination at Guntur Range I have already written about him to the Inspector of Vaccination but received no reply. H has always done his work well and holds the best certificates as to character &c. Vide this office letter No. 1072 dated the 10th January 1887 and therefore request that you will be so good as to recommend him for that post.

I have the honor to be,
Sir,
Your most obedient servant
(Sd.) H. F. Staunton, M. B.
Acting District Surgeon.
Kistna.

XXVIII.

No. 1426 dated 7th March 1887.

To

The Inspector of Vaccination
and Deputy Sanitary Commissioner,
Madras.

Reference. Your letter No. 94 dated 2nd March 1887.

Sir,

On enquiry I find that N. V. Subbarayudu Naidu who on sick leave died at Ellore on the 16th January. As I have already recommended my clerk Ch. Benjamin to you and to the President District Board Kistna for the post, vide my letters Nos. 984 and 1181 dated 15th December 1886 and 1st February 1887 respectively. Shall I appoint him to the place? His name has been registered in your office.

I have &c.
(Sd.) H. F. Staunton,
Ag. District Surgeon.
Kistna.

XXIX.

D./O.

Masulipatam,
25th April 1887.

My dear Staunton,

I have come to the conclusion that your Head Clerk is about the best of the men who have applied for the vacancy in my office, and I shall be glad to take him on trial as you kindly said you would allow, as soon as you can make arrangements to let him come.

Yours Sincerely
G. Humprey.

XXX.

Ch. Benjamin has done his duties as District Surgeon's clerk most excellently; he writes a neat hand and is very careful, so that none of his duties are neglected or letters left unanswered. He is worthy of a better place and I shall be glad to hear of his being made Deputy Inspector of Vaccination or getting some other Government post.

17th August 1887.

(Sd.) H. F. STAUNTON,
Late Ag. District Surgeon.
Kistna.

XXXI.

True extract taken from the service register.

Ch. Benjamin is an intelligent hard working clerk and has carried on his duties to my thorough satisfaction.

17th August 1887.

(Sd.) H. F. STAUNTON,
Ag. District Surgeon.
Kistna.

XXXII.

Ch. Benjamin is a neat writer and well up in departmental rules &c. While acting at Masulipatam I was much pleased with the way he performed his duties.

COCONADA. }
3rd August 1888. } (Sd.) H. F. STAUNTON, M. B.
Ag. District Surgeon.

XXXIII.

Mr. Ch. Benjamin Joel, clerk to the District Surgeon Kistna for 8 years, has asked me for a recommendation to enable him to obtain a better paid appoinment than his present one. I have known him for 3 years and have found him invariably accurate in all his returns willing to oblige, and without exception the best clerk I have known in India in 22 years service. His conduct has been exemplory. His promotion will be a great loss to my office but I do not wish him to suffer on that account.

MASULIPATAM,
17th November 1890.

(Sd.) J. B. THOMAS,
Brigade Surgeon.
District Surgeon.
Kistna.

XXXIV.

To
The Sanitary Commissioner
for Madras.
Madras.

SIR,

I have the honor to request that you will kindly take into consideration the qualifications of Ch. Benjamin District Surgeon's Clerk, for the post of Deputy Inspector of Vaccination. I believe his name has already been registered in your office. As he has had about 3 years' training in Vaccination, Hygiene &c. in the late Local Medical School at this station. He is well fitted to look after the sanitation of villages which is now one of the *chief duties* of Deputy Inspectors. I need not speak further as to his abilities as he holds the highest testimonials from all his superiors.

I have &c.
(Sd.) J. B. Thomas,
Brigade Surgeon.
District Surgeon.
Kistna.

XXXV.

To
The President,
District Board
Kistna.

Sir,

I have the honor to forward the application of Ch. Benjamin clerk of the District Surgeon's office for your favorable consideration. Dr. Thomas has strongly recommended him to the Sanitary Commissioner for promotion to the grade of Deputy Inspector of Vaccination and a true copy of his letter is herewith enclosed. He is fit to discharge the duties of Deputy Inspector of Vaccination.

I have &c.
(Sd.) C. Muniswami,
Ag. District Surgeon.
Kistna.

XXXVI.

Office of Sanitary Examiner,
Fort St. George, 24th January 1891.
No. 258.

From
Surgeon D. F. Dymott M. B.
Inspector of Vaccination and
Deputy Sanitary Commissioner,
Madras.

To
The Vice President
District Board
Kistna.

Sir,

With reference to your letter No. 273 dated 14th January 1891, I have the honor to state that I have no objection to the District Surgeon's proposal and should be very glad to see Ch. Banjamin act for the Vinukonda Deputy while on privilege leave.

I have the honor to be,
Sir,
Your most obedient Servant,
(Sd.) Donald F. Dymott M. B.
Surgeon.
Inspector of Vaccination and
Deputy Sanitary Commissioner.

XXXVII.

No. 269.

True copy forwarded to the District Surgeon Kistna for information with reference to his letter No. 1156 dated 12th Instant to the President District Board.

(Sd.) Donald F. Dymott,
Surgeon.
Inspector of Vaccination
and Deputy Sanitary
Commissioner.

XXXVIII.

Proceedings of the President District Board, Kistna dated.

Read letter from the Deputy Inspector of Vaccination Vinukonda Range requesting to grant him two months' privilege leave.

Read this office No. 273 dated 14th January 1891 sanctioning two months' privilege leave to the Deputy Inspector and forwarding the application of Ch. Benjamin clerk under the District Surgeon for the Deputy Inspector's post.

Read letter from the Inspector of Vaccination and Deputy Sanitary Commissioner No. 268 dated 24th January 1891 stating that he has no objection to the appointment of Ch. Benjamin as Acting Deputy Inspector of Vaccination, Vinukonda Range.

Order No. 1478.

T. Ramaswamy Naidu is granted two months' privilege leave on half pay.

Mr. Ch. Banjamin, Clerk under the District Surgeon, is appointed to act as Deputy Inspector of Vaccination. He should draw his pay viz. Rs. 25 and acting allowance.

Kistna District Board's
Office, Masulipatam.
7th February 1891.

(Sd.) Ch. VENKATACHELLAM,
Vice President.

189
Dept.
Enclos. No
To
C. No

24th January 1891.
258.

istna

ation
nths'

1891
puty
amin
pec-

and
Ja-
in-
of

ivi-

on,
on.
ice.
AM,
nt.

No. 2956

Memo.

With reference to your applications for the post of Deputy Inspector of Vaccination you are informed that with the sanction of the Sanitary Commissioner you have been appointed to the 2nd Class Grade of Deputy Inspectors and posted on probation to the Ongole Range, Nellore District

2 you will, with the permission of the District Medical and Sanitary officer make arrangements to proceed without delay to Ongole and take up your new appointment from the Vaccinator in charge.

Office of Sanitary Commissoner
Fort St. George
5 - 3 - 93

(Sd.) F Donald—
Dymott Surgeon
Inspector of Vaccination and
Deputy sanitary Commissioner.

To
Ch. Benjamin
District Surgeons Clerk
Kistna.

This is to certify that Cherukuri. Benjamin joel Deputy Inspector of Vaccination is a member of the church of England and a communicant of this congregation

I have known Benjamin garu for many years, in fact from his childhood; and I look upon him as a respectable and respecte member of this congregation. I have always heard him well spoken of by the officials with whom he has to do, and I can testify to the exemplory character of his private life

Masulipatam |
Octoer 23 rd 1891 |
(sd.) J. E. Padfield B. D.
Missionary C. M. S.

I do hereby certify that I have known Mr Ch. Benjamin as Head Clerk of the District Surgeons' office at Masulipatam for the past three years. He is a conscientious and hard-working clerk. He has given me entire satisfaction in the discharge of his duties, whenever I had occasion to act as District Surgeon of this place. In consideration of his faithful service, merit and ability, he was deservingly appointed as Deputy Inspector of Vaccination for Ongole Range in Nellore District; and I have every confidence he will discharge his new duties to the satisfaction of his superiors.

ctober 1891 }
tam. }
(Sd) C Muniswamy
Assistant Surgeon
Kistna District

5. 92

ement on petition submitted by Ch. Benjamin Joel
Head Clerk Kistna to the Inspector of Vacci-
Sanitary Commissioner Madras
the Inspector of Vaccination and Deputy

Sanitary Commissioner Madras for favorable consideration.

2 Clerk Ch. Benjamin is fit to discharge the duties of Deputy Inspector of Vaccination

(Sp). E. Levenge
Surgeon Major
ag: District Surgeon
Kistna

No 437
Memorandum
offiice of Sanitary Commissioner
Fort St. George,
11th May 1892

Your application for the post of Deputy Inspector of Vaccination dated 7th May 1892.

You are informed that your letter has been received and your claims will be considered

By order
(Sd) S. Balasundaram
ag: manager & asistant
office of sanitary Commissioner
Madras

No. 168
District Surgeon's office
Masulipatam
dated 11th may 1893

Class Vaccinators fit to act for the Deputy Inspector of Vaccination, Guntur Range I have no objection to the appointment of Benjamin joel to act

I have the honor to be

Sir

Your most obedient servant

(Signed) F Donald Dymott

Surgeon Major

Inspector of Vaccination and

Deputy Sanitary Commissioner

No 196 of 7-6-93

Endorsement on District Surgeon Head Clerk Benjamin joels petition dated 7 th June 1893 addressed to the President District Board Kistna.

Forwarded for favorable consideration. He richly deserves promotion, and I am fully confident that he will discharge the duties of a Deputy Inspector of Vaccination to the entire satisfaction of all his superiors.

(Sd) C. Muniswamy Modaliar
Ag. District Surgeon
KISTNA

1/3549

1896
Pub Dept.
Enclos. No 1
To
G. No 47

Byrava Press,

Enclosures to
memorial dated 28th
December 1895

CHIEF SECRETARY
31. JAN. 1896
GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS

CURRENT No. 47 Rl

Local & [illegible] Dept.
CURRENT No. 3562

To

His Excellency
The Governor in Council
Fort St George.

Enclosures. 21), Sent by packet post
Only 20 enclosures

The humble memorial of Ch. Ijamin Joel Late Head Clerk of the District Surgeon's office Masulipatam.

May it please your Excellency,

Humbly believing that a mere statement of ~~an~~ unvarnished true facts will attract your Excellency's attention and lead to the doing of justice I beg humbly to lay before your Excellency a full but brief story of how a poor christian of long and unspotted service has been persecuted even in this justice-loving age.

History of my case in a Nut Shell

Application for Deputy Inspector of Vaccination. 8-11-93

2. On 8th November 1893, I submitted an application for the post of Reserve Deputy Inspector of Vaccination and is was sent to the Sanitary Commissioner for Madras with the following endorsement by Dr. A. J. Sturmer "Forwarded. If the applicant is chosen for the post of Deputy Inspector of Vaccination I should wish him to go for good and all and not to return to my office as Constant change in the clerks is very detrimental to my office work" (Vide enclosure A)

Registered by Sanitary Commissioner, Madras.

3. To the above application I received from the Sanitary Commissioner, Madras, the following reply dated 28th November 1893 No 1706 Your application for the post of Deputy Inspector of Vaccination. You are informed that your application has been registered". (Vide enclosure B)

4. As I was not well I was granted sick leave for 3 months and I availed myself of the same from 16th January 1894

My sick leave time for other influences.

5. As I was appointed by the District Surgeon as acting Deputy Inspector of Vaccination, for Masulipatam Range during the absence of the permanent incumbent on three months privilege leave, with the sanction of the Sanitary Commissioner Madras and the approval of the President District Board. (Vide enclosure C) I had to cancel the remaining period of my sick leave and join the District Surgeon's office on 10th March 1894 and I handed over charge of the District Surgeons' Head clerk to the Meteorological observer Seshageri bw Puntulu on 21st March 1894.

First shock

6. On 27th March 1894 to my great surprise and disappointment I received an order from the president that the apointment was cancelled on the plea that I was not fit for a position of trust under the District Board in consequence of a certain allegation of misappropriation of Municipal money (Vide enclosure D). It was not proved against me that the money in question was misappropriated by me but the Chairman of the Municipal council passed a resolution that the money must be made good by the clerk and the peon.

Based on alleged Municipal fraud already proved false

7. With regard to the alleged misappropriation the following points are worthy of notice.

Innocence vindicated

(a). The manager has signed in the Despatch book to the receipt of the covering letter which was sent with the money (Vide enclosure E).

(b). The peon admits having received the money from my hands (Vide enclosure F).

(c). In the enquiry by the Chairman then instituted (1892) it was decided that the peon and the clerk should pay the deficit.

(d). The deficit was made good by the peon and not by me (Vide Enclosure G).

(e) When such are the facts, your excellency's humble memorialist was charged with this heinous offence two years after the enquiry and final decision. From this the motive of persecution is visible.

Places of trust recommended since

8. From this it will plainly appear that I had nothing to do with it; and it is humbly submitted that opinion of the President was formed on no evidence whatever but through the misrepresentation of people who were and are working for my utter ruin. If there had been the slightest suspicion on me, I would not have been recommended for places of trust under the District Board as was really the case (e,g) Local Fund Accountant Rs 35 in 1893 by J. B. Thomas Esquire Brigade Surgeon Lt: Col: late District Surgeon Kistna [Vide Enclosures H & I], Deputy Inspector of Vaccination in 1892 & by J. B. Thomas Esquire Brigade Surgeon Lt: Col: late District Surgeon & C. Muniswamy Modelliar Esquire L. M. S. Assistant Surgeon and acting District Surgeon [Vide Enclosure J]. It may be noted that all these were on promotion as I was only drawing Rs 25.

District Surgeon's certificate after the alleged fraud.

9. J. B. Thomas Esquire Birgade Surgeon Lt: Col: who was for Eight years District Medical and sanitary officer of Kistna [from 1st January 1885 to 12th May 1893] certifies of me thus—

> "Mr. Ch. Benjamin Joel, clerk to the District Surgeon Kistna for 8 years, has asked me for recommendation to enable him to obtain a better paid appointment than his present one. I have known him for 3 years and have found him invariably accurate in all his returns willing to oblige and without exception the best clerk I have known in India in 22 years service. His conduct has been exemplory. His promotion will be a great loss to my office but I do not wish him to suffer on that account".

(Signed] J. B. Thomas.
Surgeon Major.
District Surgeon.

29th February 1888
Masulipatam.

> "I still am of the same opinion".

[Signed] J. B. Thomas.
Brigade Surgeon
District Surgeon
Kistna.

17th November 90

> "A further knowledge of ten [10] months has not altered my opinion"

[Signed]
J. B. Thomas
Brigade Surgeon Lt: Col:
District Surgeon
Kistna

12th May 93
Masulipatam.

[This certificate was given after the alleged misappropriation]

Such being the appreciative words of one of the oldest members of the Indian medical service, it is for you excellency to judge of the merits and faithful service

How the wind blew. The Key to the rest.

10. The acting appointment of Deputy Inspector of Vaccination was given to a first class Vaccinator Koka Veeraraghavulu Naidu a *Kinsman* of M. R. Ry. Koka Narayanaswamy Naidu garu, the *Collector's Shirastadar*. Once before also the same relation of the Shirastadar under similar circumstances was appointed Deputy Inspector of Vaccination. Unfotunately the said Koka Veeraraghavulu Naidu was found fault with by the District medical and Sanitary officer Kistna and pronounced to be incompetent to hold the acting appointment. The all powerful Shirastadar found it very hard to bear this obstruction in his way and seems to have thought that I was somehow or other instrumental in passing that order. His wrath fell on my devoted head and the result now is I was first recommended for fine but dismissed and yet vengence is being taken in the form of some number of prosecutions cooked up and hatched long after my leaving the office and which prosecutions are not able to bear the light of justice. [Vide enclosure K]

How the endorsement affair began.

11. On this that is the cancelling of my appointment I appealed to the President, setting forth my claims and qualifications. This was forwarded with a covering letter by the acting District Surgeon who had written among other things that even Dr Sturmer strongly recommended me for a Deputy Inspector's post (Vide enclosure L)

Ser: No.	Date & month.	To whom addressed	Purport.	Regd No.

12. The President replied that he consulted Dr. Sturmer who is at Madras and he had written to say that he endorsed the word "Forwarded" on my application and nothing else and asked the acting District surgeon to send a copy of Dr. Sturmer's Endorsement.

13. Endorsements are not kept copied Verbatum in any book in the District Surgeon's office, but the purport or précis is entered in the Despatch register in the form noted in the margin, and is not signed or certified by the District surgeon or his assistant as true Copies.

14 The whole endorsement of Dr. Sturmer instead of the purport as usual, was unfortunately written by the second clerk with the additional words "for favourable consideration" after the word "Forwarded"

Unsigned office copy of endorsement.

15. A copy of the above extract was sent to the President District Board as requested by him, but in so doing the acting District surgeon certified it as a true copy as if signed by Dr. Sturmer; whereas there is no signature of Dr Sturmer or the entry made with the words signed A. J. Sturmer. This copy was prepared by the second Clerk who also took the responsibility adding the words signed. A. J. Sturmer which are not found in the Despatch register. Upon this the President sent for the original from the Sanitary Commissioner Madras, and found the words "for favourable consideration" missing in it. A mere reference to enclosure A will show how it was done by the second clerk.

Inquiry by District Surgeon.

16. The President sent the original endorsement and asked the District surgeon to enquire into the case of descrepancy and report.

Second clerk admits 3rd May 1894.

17. The District surgeon when he asked the second clerk he told him that he copied the endorsement on the 8th November and entered the words "for favourable consideration" through oversight and he also, to a question of the Assistant surgeon distinctly stated that he was not dictated by me to enter the words in question. A report was sent accordingly on 3rd May 1894 by the District surgeon stating that I was ignorant of the wrong entry made by the second clerk (Vide enclosure M)

Denies 5th May 1894.

18. After receiving the report N Atkinson Esquire C. S, the President ordered me and the second clerk to appear before him. On 5th may 1894 the 2nd clerk through the ill advice of some one or through fear or more probably to get my appointment when I am transferred gave a statement before the President that he made the entry of the endorsement with the words "for favourable consideration" on the 8th November 1893 and at the dictation of the Head clerk

19. On 7th May I appeared before the President and pleaded my ignorance as to the entry of the words "for favourable consideration" and that I had no benefit by the simple entry of those words in the despatch register as I was fully qualified for the post of Deputy Inspector and had received a favourable reply already from the sanitary Commissioner Madras.

Inquiry (?) again

20. The District surgeon was asked as Mr Atkinson was going away to England to enquire into the case again and recommend the necessary punishment.

District Surgeon fines to satisfy powers that be.

21. On 14th May 1894 the District surgeon without taking any further statement but simply going over the correspondence that passed between the District surgeon and the President, wrote a letter fining me 12 Rupees and the second clerk Rs 7 and observing that although we both deserved heavier punishment he could not spare us. (Vide enclosure N). At the same time he personally assured us that it would end with the fine and no further action will be taken in the matter by the higher authorities.

22. On 28th May the President Mr Rawson asked the District surgeon to send us both before him.

Innocence destined yet to bleed.

23. On 7th June I appeared before the acting President Mr Rawson and a charge was put into my hands that I caused a false entry to be made in the register of letters in the District surgeon's office by interpolating the words "for favourable consideration" and to explain and to show cause why I should not be dismissed (Vide enclosure O)

24. I explained what I have stated already in para *supra* and brought to his

notice my long continued1 unspotted service of 18years and the high opinion entertained by one and al my superiors.

Mr. Rawson's Judgment in severe mid-summer.

25. But to my greatisfortune Mr Rawson passed an order that the false entry of the words "for favoura consideration" though *not strictly proved*, was caused to be entered, by the seco clerk about the beginning of April 1894, by me, after the recommendation of the Assant Surgeon to serve my own ends and therefore found me guilty and passed the veryvere sentence of dismissal (Vide enclosure P)

Mr. Rawson compelled to admit Judgment as incorrect, in letter to Assistant Surgeon.

26. The Asst. surgeorotested in his letter No 1630 Dated 25-6-94 against Mr. Rawson's insinuation thatie false entry was made between the time when Mr. Atkinson called for the copand the time that it was furnished *ie.* about the beginning of April 1894 to support t statement of the Assistant Surgeon that Dr. Sturmer strongly recommended me ide enclosure G)

27. The President wobliged to withdraw the objectionable portion para six of the Proceedings dated 8June 1894

But appeal confirmed.

28. I appealed to the esident District Board but in the meeting on the 18th August 1894 the dismissalrder was confirmed to my utter misfortune (Vide enclosure 2)

O! Justice! where art thou?

29. These are the plaifacts of my case. A perusal of all the references will make the matter clearer. Myismissal is based on sheer presumption and without the least evidence that I instigat the second clerk to enter the words "for favourable consideration" in the Despat register and his making a precis which is not approved by the President.

Yet, Duty my watchword.

No pay for work-done-Height of injustice.

30. In conclusion I maadd that although I received the dismissal order on the 13th June 1894 the District sgeon would not let me go from the office on account of the exigencies of service till rieved by a clerk on 26 July 1894. Dr. Thomas ordered me to continue in the post thaI would draw my salary as usual. But on leaving office when I asked him my salary fthe above period I was quietly told that I was not entitled to any pay and therefe I would not be paid for the months of June and July 1894. I have not been paithe same even to the present moment.

31. From the above it wiappear that there is not even a shadow of evidence to think that I have caused the eny to be made, because.

(1) There is *no direct ridence* to the fact.

(2) The endorsement orather the precis is in the *admitted hand writing of the second clerk.*

(3) As I am already quafied for the post of Deputy Inspector of Vaccination and had even acte once in Nellore District as Deputy Inspector of Vaccination, there ws certainly *no need* for additional strong recommendations.

(4) Moreover an *office coy* of an endorsement which need not see the light of day cannot be said t be for my benefit.

eculiar principle measuring out injustice.

(5) In every fault, the principal actor deserves more punishment. The second clerk wrote itIf a clerk who admittedly wrote it is let off as almost a innocent how can anbody be held responsible for what he does. If I had told him to commit forgery would he have done it. The second clerk is an intelligent man and not a mere boy. He probably did it to pave his way to my place.

(6) The only person whoe evidence is against me is the second clerk, who was *interested* in shifing the blame from his shoulders. Certainly in a court of justice his evdence will have very little weight.

(7) No weight has been gven to the explanation given by the same second clerk, when asked by the District Surgeon. When he had no time to concoct he stated the truth; but when he saw it was serious he tried to shift the blame. The District Surgeon plainly wrote to the President on 3rd May 1894 that the secoilerk explained the discrepancy on the score of oversight.

!!!

(8) Is it possible to believe thin any office one clerk will *dictate an endorsement* of a single lindThis will mean that the clerks have no work. If it is to be believeat I dictated this endorsement only, the second clerk's suspicion muave been at once roused.

(9) The President has now witawn the portion referring to the Assistant Surgeon. This *is enough toke the foundation of the whole theory of probabilities* of unwarranteresumptions on which he built the charge.

(10) If I have had behaved ba before, there might have been some reason for any presumption againse; but I have had an unspotted service of 17 years. (vide enclosed vice register and printed copies of testimonials.) my service registwill speak that I was not even once fined or warned on any account.

not yet returned by the Sessions Judge.

32. As I entered into service bre the G. O. of 1881 promulgating the principle that those who had entered pious to that date have pensionable service, my long service of 15 years counts towls pension and by this injustice I am not only dismissed and thereby debarred fn getting any decent appointment but am also left without any provision which tmerciful Government had provided. Your excellency can therefore understand thend of persecution I am undergoing.

The only hope-the sheet anchor

33. My only hope therefore is thyour excellency moved by a sense of British Justice and fair play will call for the ere record and consider my case as a special one. I humbly hope that Justice can beot at least from the highest tribunal and in that hope address this humble memori

I most humbly beg to remain,
Your excellency's most obedient servant

Masulipatam
28th December 1895

Ch. Benjamin Joel
Late Head Clerk, District Surgeon's Office

CHIEF SECRETARY
31 JAN 1896
GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS

When given for copying ___	189 .
When copied ___	
When examined ___	
When signed ___	

READ AGAIN G.O., No. DATED
189 ,

CURRENT No.

ENCLOSURES TO C. No.

ORDER OF GOVERNMENT .. .. .. A A A A A A A

LETTER OF GOVERNMENT.

STATEMENT WITH DITTO.

PAPERS NOT FILED UP, BEING MEANT FOR DESPATCH IN ORIGINAL.

N.B.—
A = Copy in full.
B = Not to be copied.
P = Copy abstract only.
Q = Copy heading only.