PRINTED.

G.O., No. 2464 L. & 2465 L.

DATED 21st Decr. 1895

The Notes
in these Proceedings have been printed.

[Despatch Abstract.]

Local Fund Engineering Department

Forwarding to the Public Works Department for the opinion of the Chief Engineer certain memorials on the subject of the consolidation of the -----, and calling for a report from the Presidents of the District Boards on the matter before 15th February 1896.

Local Fund Engineering Establishments.

Requesting the Governments of Bengal, Bombay, N. Western Provinces and the Punjab to furnish certain information regarding the working of the _____ in those Provinces.

BACK PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

FURTHER PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

LOCAL AND MUNICIPAL.

Issued

ecd. *Encl.*

G.O., No. 2464 L., 21st Dec. 1895.

N. P.

DECEMBER.

8
96
239 to 255

Local Fund Engineering Department.

Forwarding to the Public Works Department, for the opinion of the Chief Engineer, certain memorials on the subject of the consolidation of the — , and calling for a report from the Presidents of District Boards on the matter before ~~1st~~ February 1896.
154

No. 2464 L., 21st December 1895.

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS.

LOCAL AND MUNICIPAL DEPARTMENT.

READ—the following papers :—

Endorsement from the President, District Board, Chingleput, No. 2774 L., dated 11th October 1895.
Memorial from the Local Fund Engineer, Tanjore, dated 7th October 1895.
" " " " Tinnevelly " 7th " "
" " " " Malabar " 11th " "
" " Honorary Secretary, Local Fund Engineers' Association, Tanjore, dated 7th October 1895.
" " Local Fund Engineer, South Arcot, dated 8th October 1895.
" " " " Cuddapah " 26th August "
" " " " Vizagapatam " 11th October "
" " " " North Arcot " 26th August "
" " " Assistant Engineer, Guntúr Range, Kistna, dated 14th October 1895.
" " " Engineer, Trichinopoly, dated 7th October 1895.
Endorsement from the President, District Board, South Canara, No. 1521-D.B., dated 13th October 1895.
Memorial from the Local Fund Assistant Engineer, Tinnevelly, dated 26th August 1895.
" " " Engineer, Gódávari, dated 12th October 1895.
" " " Assistant Engineer, Malabar, dated 26th August 1895.
Endorsement from the President, District Board, Kurnool, No. 50, dated 16th October 1895.
Memorial from the Local Fund Engineer, Kistna, dated 21st October 1895.
" " Acting Local Fund Engineer, Salem, dated 21st October 1895.
" " Local Fund Assistant Engineer, Ellore Sub-Division, Gódávari, dated 26th August 1895.
" from M.R.Ry. R. Subrahmania Aiyar, Local Fund Supervisor, Dindigul, dated 26th August 1895.
Endorsement from the President, District Board, Tanjore, No. 1093-D.B., dated 25th October 1895.
" " " " Coimbatore, No. 1170-D.B., dated 28th October 1895.
" " " " Madura, No. 3838, dated 13th November 1895.
" " " " Madura, No. 3838-A., dated 13th November 1895.
" " " " Ganjám, No. 3265, dated 12th November 1895.

ORDER—No. 2464 L., dated 21st December 1895.

The papers will be forwarded to the Public Works Department with the request that the Chief Engineer will favour Government, at an early date, with his opinion on the subject to which they refer.

No. 2464 L., 21st December 1895.

2. A copy of the memorial, with the accompanying memorandum, will be transmitted to all Presidents of District Boards, who will be requested to at once consult their respective Boards and submit a report on the question of reorganizing Local Fund Engineering establishments, which should reach Government not later than 15th February 1896.

3. The following letter will be addressed to the Governments of Bombay, Bengal, the North-West Provinces and the Punjab.

* * * * *

(True Extract.)

J. F. PRICE,
Chief Secretary.

To the Public Works Department with papers, in original, to be returned.
„ all Presidents of District Boards.

NOTES CONNECTED WITH G.O., No. 2464 L., DATED 21st DECEMBER 1895.

[Subject.—*Memorials from District Board Engineers, etc., regarding the consolidation and reorganization of the Local Fund Engineering establishments in the Presidency.*]

The memorial, it has been ascertained from other sources, was drafted by Mr. Syson, District Board Engineer of Tanjore, who is one of the very few District Board Engineers with any recognized degree in engineering.

2. It will perhaps be admitted that the present system is not working satisfactorily. The great difficulty of getting men of any sort of qualifications for a service in which there is usually no pension is evident from papers that pass through this office every week. It is also perhaps clear that it is neither satisfactory to Presidents of District Boards nor to District Board Engineers that the powers of appointment and dismissal of the latter should rest so largely in the hands of the former.

3. That the subordinate staff is very bad as a rule is also probably notorious.

4. It is perhaps inconsistent that the operations of Grants 2 and 3 should be controlled by a body of Government servants with pensions and proper supervision while Grant 1 is at the mercy of a badly qualified and organized staff.

5. It is impossible to deal with the matter off-hand in a note for orders now, and probably the appointment of a committee, as suggested in the memorial, would be necessary.

6. The difficulties in the way of the scheme would no doubt be many, and one that at once suggests itself is that it would be undesirable were a department of Local Fund Engineers eventually formed, that all the men who are now on the Local Fund Engineer staff should be invited to join it. It is not expedient that any but those whose work has stood several years' trial satisfactorily should be rendered entitled to pension, or should be made more difficult to get rid of than they are at present.

7. Orders are therefore only requested at present as to whether it is considered desirable to enquire into the necessity of a reorganization. It is submitted that it is desirable, and it is proposed that the following officers, who have all had considerable experience of local boards, should be invited to express a full opinion upon all the points raised in the memorial, and to offer any suggestions that may occur to them :—

Mr. Gibson.
„ Arundel.
„ LeFanu.
„ Winterbotham.
„ Willock.

Mr. Thomson.
„ Gabriel Stokes.
„ Wynne.
„ Atkinson.

8. The Government of Bengal might also be asked to give particulars of the scheme which is stated in the last lines of the memorial to be in force there. Upon receipt of replies to these references, and of the opinion of the Chief Engineer which should also, it is submitted, be called for, the matter can come up for discussion in greater detail.

W. Francis—3-10-95.

I can't find the least trace in the budget estimates of any such scheme.
H. W. B[liss].

This point should be hunted up.
W[enlock].

Please see the remarks of the Local Fund Engineer, Coimbatore, in the linked file. Mr. Stephens is an old Public Works officer with a very good professional reputation and an extensive knowledge of both the department with which he was formerly connected and that to which he now belongs. He has very promptly put his finger on the salient blots of Mr. Syson's proposals, and has pointed out what is one of the real reasons—and the main one—for the non-success as a rule of Local Fund Public Works. No doubt Mr. Syson's scheme is one eminently calculated to give satisfaction to him and other Local Fund Engineers, but an introduction of it even in a modified form would have to be preceded by a pretty general sweep of existing Local Fund Engineers many of whom are not worth the pay which they now get.

I submit that the references suggested by the Under Secretary may be made. Colonel Pennycuick will probably strangle this infant at its birth.

J. F. PRICE—13-11-95.

Mr. Syson has been to see me about this and I have had a long talk with him.

2. His main proposal is to form a sort of subordinate Public Works department to deal with local works. This scheme would require legislation, for as the law stands these Local Fund Public Works department men could not be appointed, promoted, etc., as proposed. To legislation, in itself, I see no great objection. It is already proposed to amend the Local Boards Act and the amendments required to enable the Public Works departments of local boards to be officered by a central body of Government servants, at the head of which would be the Chief Engineer, might easily be carried, if the scheme is approved. I am, however, altogether opposed to the scheme. I well recollect the wretched state of affairs which prevailed in years gone by when the only professional agency available for the execution of local works was that of the Public Works department, and the feeling of relief with which I hailed the proposal to disconnect local works from the Public Works department, and to place them under separate Engineers who should be responsible to the people whose money they spent and whose bread they ate. I will have nothing to do with any proposal to revive the old state of things, as it would be revived if Government organized a new (and inferior) Public Works establishment to carry out local works. Mr. Syson and the other gentlemen who have memorialized Government may at once be told that the scheme set out cannot be accepted.

3. I am not prepared to say that the existing system is working well. To a great extent this seems to me to be, because Presidents of Local Boards do not employ suitable persons as District Engineers, Assistant Engineers, etc. They are all always running after Europeans for these posts, and of course for the pay they can give commonly get very inferior Europeans. I think they had far better try to get good natives. Such men exist, I believe. I do not know that there are many native Engineers who are competent to design and supervise large works. Probably they are not, as a rule, sufficiently well educated. But why they should not be able to discharge the usually simple duties of a District Engineer or Assistant Engineer, I cannot see. Natives, if properly selected and properly supervised, do well enough as Divisional officers; and I can't see why they should not do well in the Local Fund Engineering department. Orders have been issued, I believe, as to the examinations to be passed after some future date by persons desiring admission into the Local Fund Engineering department. These ought to secure the appointment of professionally competent persons. As to honesty and industry, Presidents of Local Boards must keep their eyes open and look after their local fund as well as after their other subordinates. This, however, is by the way and need not be referred to in replying to Mr. Syson and the other memorialists.

4. While unable to accept Mr. Syson's scheme, however, I think something might be done to improve the position of the officers whom he represents. Apparently the following points need attention:—

(i) *Audit of accounts by the subordinates of the Accountant-General instead of by those of the Examiner of Public Works Accounts.*—This is the same complaint as recently made by Mr. Brown of Gódávari, in regard to which I have already called for information. I await this. In the meantime, I note that Mr. Syson admits that as the audit staff has gained experience, friction and difficulties have decreased.

(ii) *Pensions.*—Mr. Syson wants a Government pension fund for all districts, consolidated and under Government management. I doubt if this is feasible. I think, however, that there is no doubt—(1) that every district board should have a bonus or provident fund [the grant of pensions has been disallowed in consequence of the indefinite liabilities in which it might involve Local Boards]; (2) that when an officer left one district to take up service in another he should carry on with him all reserve benefits as to bonuses or provident fund, leave, &c., which he had earned by his service in his former district. Please see how far existing arrangements conform to these two *desiderata* and suggest the steps to be taken to make them do so, if such is not now the case.

(iii) *Powers of District Engineers.*—I have dealt with this question on the proposals for the reorganization of the Gódávari Local Fund Public Works establishments which are under disposal and can only repeat what I there said.

5. Mr. Syson also urges that more latitude should be given to district boards to work up to the 20 per cent. which is the maximum allowed on Local Fund Public Works establishments. As to this I can only say that it is open to the boards to bring forward what proposals they please. From what Mr. Syson says the subordinates in Tanjore would seem to be underpaid.

H. W. B[LISS]—23-11-95.

I am hardly prepared to commit myself definetely to any course at present, because I think before anything is done we ought to get the opinions of those interested, as their experience ought to be most useful in coming to a right decision.

2. I would therefore send the memorial to each Local Board President, telling him to consult his board at once, and report their views to Government by 1st February 1896.

3. The papers should also go to Colonel Pennycuick for his opinion. With the opinions we shall thus get placed before us we ought to be able to see what should be done to put matters on a better footing. Things are not satisfactory now, and will not be unless some change is made, whether the Engineers are natives or Europeans. What Mr. Stephens says may be very true as regards himself and to the district in which he may be, but there are several districts where the incompetence of the Engineers would nullify the good effects of any amount of additional funds if placed at their disposal.

W[ENLOCK]—27-11-95.

I agree with the Hon'ble Mr. Bliss that we should not recur to the system which prevailed up to 1880, but the faults of that system resulted chiefly from the facts that the Public Works department men entrusted with local work had other work to do in which they took more interest, that they were transferred from one district to another more frequently than was consistent with local interests, and that the allotments for local works were given out of State funds from a distance. The scheme of the memorialists "does not contemplate interfering in any way with the powers and authority vested in the boards under the Local Fund Act," and this will prevent the repetition of the weakest part of the old system. Even if Local Fund Engineers are placed on one list for the whole Presidency restriction might be placed on the frequency of removals from one district to another. I think it will be better to have provident funds and give bonuses on retirement rather than pensions, but it is possible that whilst Presidents "hanker" after European Local Fund Engineers and local fund boards continue, as is natural, to object to any great increase of pay, pensions may have to be given in some cases. The improvement of the subordinate service is greatly called for, but that is a matter which, in my opinion, can only be dealt with by increasing salaries and must be left entirely to local fund boards. The evils which Mr. Mullaly points out are simply a recapitulation of evils which I have felt myself and heard of again and again from all the Local Fund Presidents I have spoken to about the matter. He mentions the anomaly of exempting the expenditure under Grant 1 from such Government control as is given to expenditure under Grants 2 and 3. It would not be difficult to devise

No.

H. W. B[LISS].

some extent of control. He also mentions the bad policy of making the President nominate and virtually appoint Local Fund Engineers—officers of high pay and position, whose qualification can only be judged by professional men. This, at all events, should be put a stop to. The nomination might be left to a committee at Madras headed by the Chief Engineer.

2. At all events the state of things at present is, as the Hon'ble Mr. Bliss says, unsatisfactory, and I think that, as His Excellency suggests, before any orders are passed we should get the opinion of all local fund boards and the Hon'ble Colonel Pennycuick (I wish we could wait for Colonel Pennycuick's opinion till the reports of the Presidents are submitted, but he will have left us before that time). We should also ascertain what has been done with respect to the local fund part of local fund works not only in Bengal but in the other provinces, what the result has been, and how far it has been found possible to employ natives as Local Fund Engineers.

J. G[ROSE]—30-11-95.

[G.O., No. 2464 L., dated 21st December 1895.]

APPENDIX.

Memorial from Mr. G. D. DWYER, District Board Engineer, Chingleput, to His Excellency the Right Hon'ble Lord WENLOCK, G.C.I.E., Governor in Council, Fort St. George, Madras (through the President, District Board, Chingleput), dated Guindy, 10th October 1895.

RESPECTFULLY SHEWETH,—That the memorialist ventures to submit herewith a memorandum on the subject of the consolidation of the Local Fund Engineering Department of the Madras Presidency, and prays that your Excellency in Council will consider the matter and ascertain how far the consolidation and reorganization of the said department as submitted in the said memorandum is feasible and practicable.

2. That as the memorandum has dealt with the subject as exhaustively as it could be done in a tentative scheme, the memorialist thinks it unnecessary to recapitulate here the circumstances that demand an early reform and reconstitution in this direction.

3. That the department in question is doing a very important portion of the public works of this country is well known, while the prospects held out for those in it are far from encouraging.

4. That in giving effect to a scheme like this the Government will not be making altogether a new departure, as in technical matters such as educational, medical and sanitary law and engineering connected with District Boards and Municipalities, Government often feels it necessary to refer them to the respective technical departments in the Government service not only for advice but also for action.

5. That this being so, the reform suggested in this memorandum is only a request to the Government to proceed but a step farther to efficiently man the Local Fund Engineering service, keep it directly under the control of a Government professional agency, securing for its employés all the advice and encouragement necessary, and effect that unification which is considered so essential to the satisfactory working of all Government departments.

6. That the reform suggested will also introduce into the department a system and order which is now wanting and extend the scope for the prospects and promotion of its officers.

7. That your memorialist begs to reiterate distinctly that the scheme submitted does not in the least interfere with the powers of management and control now vested in the Local Fund Boards over their funds and officers as far as execution of work is concerned, and does not saddle the boards with any considerable or unauthorized additional expenditure in the matter of organizing a Pension Fund—the back-bone of every efficiently-manned service.

8. That the Government will be pleased to refer the memorandum, if they should deem it fit to do so, to the Chief Engineer to Government in the Public Works Department for his opinion, which, if favourable, your memorialist prays that Government be farther pleased to appoint a committee as suggested in paragraph 11 of the memorandum to work out the details and submit a scheme in a practicable form for adoption.

9. That in conclusion your Excellency's memorialist, who belongs to a service no less important than the Civil, Military and Naval services of the country, respectfully prays that your Excellency in Council will graciously be pleased to consider the subject favourably, and to afford him the relief he now stands so much in need of.

For which act of charity and kindness your Excellency's memorialist shall in duty bound, ever pray.

Memorandum on a proposed consolidation scheme for the Madras Presidency Local Fund Engineering Department to accompany the Memorial submitted by Petitioner.

1. To those directly connected with the execution of Local Fund Works, viz., the Engineers, it is apparent that a period has arrived when it is necessary, yea almost imperative, in the interests of all concerned, that the various districts and circles should be consolidated into one department; and that the revenue branch should as

far as possible be separated from the professional agency. It is now close on 16 years since Government decided to hand over charge of all works constructed from, or maintained by Local Funds, to the sole care of the various boards concerned, with the view apparently of making self-Government something more of a reality than it had been, and there can be no doubt that, defective as the machinery is in many ways, the experiment has been very successful. Financially there has been considerable saving both in establishments and cost of works, while roads have been largely extended and improved; many important buildings, such as hospitals, schools, chattrams, &c., have been constructed; the execution of works of all kinds has been facilitated, and closer supervision attained. There is, however, still room for much improvement in the Executive branch, which has been patent to the Engineers for years past, and solitary attempts have from time to time been made to create an interest in the subject in higher quarters, but with no substantial result. This memorandum purposes to explain and propose a remedy for the admitted defects and to sketch a much needed improvement in the status of the Executive staff.

2. The one radical defect when the boards were vested with their present powers was in not placing the control of the Executive branch under Professional agency and for sometime past the work of the department has been so extensive and important, with an ever tendency to increase, that for its more effective and efficient working this should have been remedied long ago. It is notorious also that, besides being hampered with the present complicated and imperfect system, the department is both undermanned and underpaid, while the anomaly of a department of such importance, being without professional control is unprecedented, and under such conditions it cannot be expected to yield the results it would otherwise give, if directed by its own profession.

3. When the separation from the Public Works Department was effected each board was to have its own Engineer, the appointment, however, being vested solely in the Collector-President of the board, and to whom alone the Engineer was to look for orders and guidance. The districts were to be entirely independent of each other, and the expenditure on establishments was not to exceed 20 per cent. on the outlay. These conditions were, as might be expected, as fatal to efficiency as the placing of the department under non-professional control, besides being the cause of hardship to both the superior and inferior branches, and virtually closed all openings to promotion while debarring the boards from a relay of trained men for future vacancies, inasmuch as the appointments were non-transferable, so that men eligible for, and offered better appointments, have either to give up all the benefits and privileges of past service or elect to remain where first appointed. These are hardships of no ordinary kind, and to which no other service in India is subjected; while not only is there not the least necessity for it, but its continuance is against the best and truest interests of the boards. As regards the cost of establishments, viz., 20 per cent. of expenditure, it has never been exceeded unless in solitary and exceptional instances, and certainly the average of the Presidency has never reached that figure. The average of the last five years is 17·40 per cent.

4. Coincident with the introduction of the new *regimé*, a reduction in the Public Works Department enabled many of the Collector-Presidents to secure the services of compulsorily retired men with proportional pensions from that department, while others engaged young men commencing their profession. By the latter, conditions of the service were perhaps not well understood, and as the years pass, and its disadvantages and hardships become apparent, it is becoming increasingly difficult to fill up vacancies satisfactorily. The frequent changes of the last five years clearly indicate this. The Engineers were not at first admitted to any recognised rules as regards leave, promotion, or retiring funds, the one rule to which they were and still are subject being three months' notice to quit from the Collector-Presidents. Any amelioration which has been made in their condition has only applied to each personally and not to the whole as a body.

5. It will be readily understood and admitted that, as the working of the department is at present constituted, each Engineer is at a great disadvantage for

want of a professional superior; much unnecessary responsibility is thereby thrust upon him, and he is under the orders of a non-professional President who, however well intentioned, cannot readily appreciate the Engineer's difficulties in his work or be competent to scrutinize estimates within his power of sanction, or advise him in any way professionally. As regards his more immediate work, friction may and often does arise both in designing and execution; needless labour is not unfrequently entailed on him, more especially by Taluk Boards, in estimating for works that can never be carried out; and delay generally occurs in the sanctioning of estimates scrutinized in the Public Works Department, in repeated correspondence over points which could easily then and there be revised by the scrutinizing agency, if at the head of the department, or explanations simplified. Further the Engineer is hampered in his Accounts Branch by the control of a Revenue Accounts Department which almost seems to delight in complicating that part of his work, so that to keep himself and his office straight, he must devote the major part of his time to work altogether out of his province, or be constantly in hot water with the Inspector of Local Fund Accounts.

6. It is notorious that at present the subordinate staff in every district without exception, only does its work under compulsion and by the constant nagging of the Engineer. Each subordinate knows that, as at present employed, he may be turned out to-morrow without rhyme or reason, and that when turned out of one district another is open to him. There is no encouragement for good men; very limited promotion, and if by accident a good man is picked up he only remains till he can get an appointment in the Public Works Department or anywhere else he can better himself. The Subordinate Department in fact at present may be said to consist largely of the riff-raff of its class, is constantly undergoing changes and is, as a rule, not only untrustworthy, but incompetent and indifferent. It is submitted therefore that if only in common fairness to strengthen the hands of the Engineers and give them such support as they have a right to expect from subordinates, the need for reform and improvement is urgent. It is absurd to suppose that good or even moderately qualified men will long remain in employment, paid at about half the scale of its contemporary, with no retiring benefits that are not amply paid for, and in employment where the work generally is every whit as important, and at present, at least, many degrees heavier. It is no argument to say that men can be got to-morrow to fill up every one of the appointments—inferior and superior—at perhaps less than the present emoluments, as the same might just as safely be asserted of every department in the country. There are doubtless swarms of unemployed men ready to undertake anything and everything on any terms, but if the Boards expect to obtain and keep capable and trustworthy men, they must—and this is much more true of the superior grades—be sufficiently paid. It is the reverse of economy to deal niggardly with the executive staff in such a department.

7. The superior professional staff proposed under this scheme of consolidation is as follows:—

					Rs.		Rs.
One	1st Grade	Superintending	Engineer on	..	1,100	=	1,100
Two	2nd „	„	Engineers	..	1,000	=	2,000
Four	1st „	Executive	„	..	850	=	3,400
Four	2nd „	„	„	..	750	=	3,000
Three	3rd „	„	„	..	650	=	1,950
Nine	4th „	„	„	..	550	=	4,950
Two	1st „	Assistant	„	..	400	=	800
Two	2nd „	„	„	..	300	=	600
Three	3rd „	„	„	..	250	=	750
				Monthly	..		18,550
				Annually	..		2,22,600
Three Superintending Engineers' establishments					..		15,000
Increase under Travelling allowances				..	..	..	15,000

	Rs.
Increase in grading and raising pay of the subordinate establishment and contingencies	50,000
Total ..	3,02,600
Deduct cost of present superior establishment including amount paid to the Public Works Department for scrutiny of estimates.	1,80,000
Total proposed increase ..	1,22,600

8. The average cost of the Presidency Executive Establishments to expenditure during the last five years is 17·40 per cent., the total cost being 5½ lakhs. The increase under this proposed scheme therefore would be slightly over 2 per cent. and the total cost of establishments would still be under the maximum of 20 per cent. prescribed by Government. This does not, however, take into account savings that would be effected in the Account Inspecting Branch, which will be referred to hereafter, or the increased expenditure from the larger incomes of several Boards from the new revenue assessments. It may therefore be safely accepted that the expenditure on establishments would never exceed the prescribed maximum.

9. The Executive Department would be placed under the control of the Chief Engineer to Government in the Public Works Department, in whom the appointments, transfers, &c., would be vested and who would in short be the head of the Executive Branch. The Superintending Engineers' divisions would be "Central," "Southern" and "Northern," the head-quarters of the first being in Madras, and his office being the "Secretariat" to the Chief Engineer, for purposes of gazetting appointments, transfers, leaves, &c. The first Superintending Engineers might be selected from the Public Works Department, and vacancies occuring thereafter to be given to the senior Local Fund Engineers. It is of course not possible, within the limits of this memorandum, to go into the question of how far the subordinate establishment should be strengthened, but it may be stated that the scheme contemplates grading it similarly to the Public Works Department; increasing the pay comparatively with the superior grades, making the whole department pensionable, and granting it the leave rules of the Uncovenanted Service.

10. Reference has been made to the increasing difficulties in obtaining duly qualified Engineers for Local Fund employment; but if this scheme was adopted, the Boards might expect the department to be recruited in the same manner as the Public Works Department by men specially trained, viz., from Cooper's Hill College. This could be done by Government offering appointments as men are required, to the men passing out from Cooper's Hill, immediately below those qualifying for the Public Works Department, and though the prospects in Local Fund service would even, under the improved conditions, be much poorer than its contemporary, capable men would be found willing to accept the employment. Both the Boards and Government would thus have a guarantee of obtaining men qualified technically, and who, entering at the lowest grade in the superior service, would acquire the training necessary for and have the prospect of promotion to the higher grades, the want of which advantages are at present so fatal to the efficiency of the department.

11. As to the financing and working of the scheme there should be no serious difficulties, and both might readily be devised by a Committee consisting of the Chief Engineer to Government in the Public Works Department, the Member of Council in charge of Local Funds, and a Public Works Examiner, with whom might be associated two or three of the senior Local Fund Engineers. Meantime the following suggestions are made:—

(*a*) That the various Boards be empowered and directed to make the full contribution of 20 per cent. on expenditure towards cost of establishment. It may at once be admitted that this would be a considerable increase in some cases, but it must also be maintained that in cases where it is greatly under this percentage, the Executive branch is

altogether inadequate to requirements, or the staff remunerated quite incommensurate with its work and responsibility. The increase therefore would be fully compensated for in improved establishments, apart altogether from the benefits to the Boards referred to in the foregoing, while it would still be considerably less than previously paid to the Public Works Department. It may be as well here to state that this scheme does not contemplate interfering in any way with the powers and authority vested in the Boards under the Local Fund Act, but only to put the Executive branch under effective control. The powers of the Board as to the execution of work, sanctioning of estimates, &c., would remain exactly as at present with the Collector-President also in the same position, except as regard appointments, transfers, &c., of the Executive Department.

(*b*) That the present complicated and expensive Inspecting Accounts Department be abolished, and the accounts placed under the Public Works Examining Department on a percentage contribution for the work to be done. There can be no doubt that there would be considerable saving under this head, while it would greatly relieve the department of existing and unnecessary harassments.

12. When this unification has been accomplished, the consolidated establishment would become pensionable as in the case of all other Government services. The objection of Government to this just claim has practically been removed and the way paved to it by the establishment of Provident Funds in several of the districts, and whether unification takes place or not, such Funds must ultimately be adopted in all districts. It may therefore be taken for granted that Government having recognised the necessity of reward for approved service and permitted certain Boards to accept the small liability involved in the scheme of Provident Funds, it should not be adverse to any proposals which do not exceed such liability. Government has hitherto declined to entertain proposal to pension the Local Fund Service on the ground that it would commit the Boards to unknown future liabilities and burdens, but this can now be defined within the limits of the cost of a Provident Fund to a consolidated department.

13. The contribution of the Boards towards the Provident Fund bonus is 6¼ per cent. of establishment charges, and this would suffice to form a sound and adequate Pension Fund. The present cost of establishments is 5½ lakhs and would be fully 6 lakhs under the unified scheme. Taking the latter therefore for purposes of calculation, the consolidated contribution on it at 6¼ per cent. would be Rs. 37,500 annually. It would be quite 12 years at least from the year 1896 before any Local Fund servant would be entitled to pension, and by that time the Fund would have accumulated at compound interest to not less than 5½ lakhs; and the annual interest on that sum at 3½ per cent. would then be Rs. 19,250, which added to the annual contributions of the Boards at 6¼ per cent., viz., Rs. 37,500, which would make a total of Rs. 56,750 available for payment of pensions, before any could become due. There could hardly at any time be more than six Engineers on the Fund, which would be equivalent to say Rs. 30,000 annually, leaving Rs. 26,750 for pensions to subordinates, without touching the capital fund. Though these figures are given as a mere rough outline to indicate how readily a Pension Fund could be accomplished without increasing the burdens of the Boards or committing them to unknown liabilities, it will be conceded that they do not over-estimate possibilities from the Boards' point of view.

14. A consolidated department such as this scheme contemplates is eminently desirable if only in the interests of the Boards, apart altogether from the crying necessity for improvement in the status of the executive staff. It would be graded from the lowest to the highest as in the case of similar departments under Government; all employés in it would be transferable; and instead of the difficulties now experienced in filling up, satisfactorily, vacancies of all kinds and more particularly *those in the higher grades*, trained and experienced men would be always available, new blood being constantly introduced at the lowest point in each grade for training as vacancies occurred. It is needless to comment on the vast improvement this would

make in the efficiency of the executive staff and consequent benefit to the Boards concerned, whilst it would at once abolish the grievances of want of prospects of promotion, loss of privileges earned in making an exchange, and give every servant of the Board the anticipation of the reward he has a right to expect from long and approved service.

15. There would of course be many details to work up, these remarks and suggestions not being at all exhaustive but merely the broad outlines to indicate the feasibility of the scheme; and that the need for it is urgent both in the interests of the Boards and for the amelioration of the executive staff whose lot is a hard one in every way there can be no two opinions. That the department has done its work creditably in the past in the face of great difficulties and impediments cannot be questioned—the results speak for themselves—and it has a just title to look to Government for early and liberal relief. We are aware that it is with the Boards that ultimate action in this matter must lie, but meantime Government can do much by recognising the necessity for reform and insisting that they shall take it in hand. It is therefore suggested that Presidents be requested to put the subject before their Boards in consultation with their Engineer and formulate some scheme either on this or similar lines, or that Government itself will take direct action in the matter. It is understood that the executive staff of the Local Fund Department has in Bengal been constituted somewhat after the manner herein suggested, and the methods of its working might be ascertained to assist in drawing up a scheme for this Presidency.

GUINDY,
10*th October* 1895.

(Signed) G. D. DWYER,
District Board Engineer, Chingleput.

Exd. S. J. Pereira.

Govt. of {1895} Madras.

LOCAL AND MUNICIPAL.

Issued

Recd. *Encl.*

G.O., No. 2464 L., 21st Dec. 1895.

DECEMBER.

Local Fund Engineering Department.

Forwarding to the Public Works Department, for the opinion of the Chief Engineer, certain memorials on the subject of the consolidation of the —, and calling for a report from the Presidents of District Boards on the matter before ~~1st~~ 15th February 1896.

2

No. 2464 L., 21st December 1895.

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS.

LOCAL AND MUNICIPAL DEPARTMENT.

Read—the following papers :—

Endorsement from the President, District Board, Chingleput, No. 2774 L., dated 11th October 1895.
Memorial from the Local Fund Engineer, Tanjore, dated 7th October 1895.
" " " " Tinnevelly " 7th " "
" " " " Malabar " 11th " "
" " Honorary Secretary, Local Fund Engineers' Association, Tanjore, dated 7th October 1895.
" " Local Fund Engineer, South Arcot, dated 8th October 1895.
" " " " Cuddapah " 26th August "
" " " " Vizagapatam " 11th October "
" " " " North Arcot " 26th August "
" " " Assistant Engineer, Guntúr Range, Kistna, dated 14th October 1895.
" " " Engineer, Trichinopoly, dated 7th October 1895.
Endorsement from the President, District Board, South Canara, No. 1521-D.B., dated 13th October 1895.
Memorial from the Local Fund Assistant Engineer, Tinnevelly, dated 26th August 1895.
" " " Engineer, Gódávari, dated 12th October 1895.
" " " Assistant Engineer, Malabar, dated 26th August 1895.
Endorsement from the President, District Board, Kurnool, No. 50, dated 16th October 1895.
Memorial from the Local Fund Engineer, Kistna, dated 21st October 1895.
" " Acting Local Fund Engineer, Salem, dated 21st October 1895.
" " Local Fund Assistant Engineer, Ellore Sub-Division, Gódávari, dated 26th August 1895.
" from M.R.Ry. R. Subrahmania Aiyar, Local Fund Supervisor, Dindigul, dated 26th August 1895.
Endorsement from the President, District Board, Tanjore, No. 1093-D.B., dated 25th October 1895.
" " " " Coimbatore, No. 1170-D.B., dated 28th October 1895.
" " " " Madura, No. 3838, dated 13th November 1895.
" " " " Madura, No. 3838-A., dated 13th November 1895.
" " " " Ganjám, No. 3265, dated 12th November 1895.

Order—No. 2464 L., dated 21st December 1895.

The papers will be forwarded to the Public Works Department with the request that the Chief Engineer will favour Government, at an early date, with his opinion on the subject to which they refer.

No. 2464 L., 21st December 1895.

2. A copy of the memorial, with the accompanying memorandum, will be transmitted to all Presidents of District Boards, who will be requested to at once consult their respective Boards and submit a report on the question of reorganizing Local Fund Engineering establishments, which should reach Government not later than 15th February 1896.

3. The following letter will be addressed to the Governments of Bombay, Bengal, the North-West Provinces and the Punjab.

* * * * *

(True Extract.)

J. F. PRICE,
Chief Secretary.

To the Public Works Department with papers, in original, to be returned.
„ all Presidents of District Boards.

APPENDIX.

Memorial from Mr. G. D. DWYER, District Board Engineer, Chingleput, to His Excellency the Right Hon'ble Lord WENLOCK, G.C.I.E., Governor in Council, Fort St. George, Madras (through the President, District Board, Chingleput), dated Guindy, 10th October 1895.

Respectfully Sheweth,—That the memorialist ventures to submit herewith a memorandum on the subject of the consolidation of the Local Fund Engineering Department of the Madras Presidency, and prays that your Excellency in Council will consider the matter and ascertain how far the consolidation and reorganization of the said department as submitted in the said memorandum is feasible and practicable.

2. That as the memorandum has dealt with the subject as exhaustively as it could be done in a tentative scheme, the memorialist thinks it unnecessary to recapitulate here the circumstances that demand an early reform and reconstitution in this direction.

3. That the department in question is doing a very important portion of the public works of this country is well known, while the prospects held out for those in it are far from encouraging.

4. That in giving effect to a scheme like this the Government will not be making altogether a new departure, as in technical matters such as educational, medical and sanitary law and engineering connected with District Boards and Municipalities, Government often feels it necessary to refer them to the respective technical departments in the Government service not only for advice but also for action.

5. That this being so, the reform suggested in this memorandum is only a request to the Government to proceed but a step farther to efficiently man the Local Fund Engineering service, keep it directly under the control of a Government professional agency, securing for its employés all the advice and encouragement necessary, and effect that unification which is considered so essential to the satisfactory working of all Government departments.

6. That the reform suggested will also introduce into the department a system and order which is now wanting and extend the scope for the prospects and promotion of its officers.

7. That your memorialist begs to reiterate distinctly that the scheme submitted does not in the least interfere with the powers of management and control now vested in the Local Fund Boards over their funds and officers as far as execution of work is concerned, and does not saddle the boards with any considerable or unauthorized additional expenditure in the matter of organizing a Pension Fund—the back-bone of every efficiently-manned service.

8. That the Government will be pleased to refer the memorandum, if they should deem it fit to do so, to the Chief Engineer to Government in the Public Works Department for his opinion, which, if favourable, your memorialist prays that Government be farther pleased to appoint a committee as suggested in paragraph 11 of the memorandum to work out the details and submit a scheme in a practicable form for adoption.

9. That in conclusion your Excellency's memorialist, who belongs to a service no less important than the Civil, Military and Naval services of the country, respectfully prays that your Excellency in Council will graciously be pleased to consider the subject favourably, and to afford him the relief he now stands so much in need of.

For which act of charity and kindness your Excellency's memorialist shall in duty bound, ever pray.

Memorandum on a proposed consolidation scheme for the Madras Presidency Local Fund Engineering Department to accompany the Memorial submitted by Petitioner.

1. To those directly connected with the execution of Local Fund Works, viz., the Engineers, it is apparent that a period has arrived when it is necessary, yea almost imperative, in the interests of all concerned, that the various districts and circles should be consolidated into one department; and that the revenue branch should as

far as possible be separated from the professional agency. It is now close on 16 years since Government decided to hand over charge of all works constructed from, or maintained by Local Funds, to the sole care of the various boards concerned, with the view apparently of making self-Government something more of a reality than it had been, and there can be no doubt that, defective as the machinery is in many ways, the experiment has been very successful. Financially there has been considerable saving both in establishments and cost of works, while roads have been largely extended and improved; many important buildings, such as hospitals, schools, chatrams, &c., have been constructed; the execution of works of all kinds has been facilitated, and closer supervision attained. There is, however, still room for much improvement in the Executive branch, which has been patent to the Engineers for years past, and solitary attempts have from time to time been made to create an interest in the subject in higher quarters, but with no substantial result. This memorandum purposes to explain and propose a remedy for the admitted defects and to sketch a much needed improvement in the status of the Executive staff.

2. The one radical defect when the boards were vested with their present powers was in not placing the control of the Executive branch under Professional agency and for sometime past the work of the department has been so extensive and important, with an ever tendency to increase, that for its more effective and efficient working this should have been remedied long ago. It is notorious also that, besides being hampered with the present complicated and imperfect system, the department is both undermanned and underpaid, while the anomaly of a department of such importance, being without professional control is unprecedented, and under such conditions it cannot be expected to yield the results it would otherwise give, if directed by its own profession.

3. When the separation from the Public Works Department was effected each board was to have its own Engineer, the appointment, however, being vested solely in the Collector-President of the board, and to whom alone the Engineer was to look for orders and guidance. The districts were to be entirely independent of each other, and the expenditure on establishments was not to exceed 20 per cent. on the outlay. These conditions were, as might be expected, as fatal to efficiency as the placing of the department under non-professional control, besides being the cause of hardship to both the superior and inferior branches, and virtually closed all openings to promotion while debarring the boards from a relay of trained men for future vacancies, inasmuch as the appointments were non-transferable, so that men eligible for, and offered better appointments, have either to give up all the benefits and privileges of past service or elect to remain where first appointed. These are hardships of no ordinary kind, and to which no other service in India is subjected; while not only is there not the least necessity for it, but its continuance is against the best and truest interests of the boards. As regards the cost of establishments, viz., 20 per cent. of expenditure, it has never been exceeded unless in solitary and exceptional instances, and certainly the average of the Presidency has never reached that figure. The average of the last five years is 17·40 per cent.

4. Coincident with the introduction of the new *regimé*, a reduction in the Public Works Department enabled many of the Collector-Presidents to secure the services of compulsorily retired men with proportional pensions from that department, while others engaged young men commencing their profession. By the latter, conditions of the service were perhaps not well understood, and as the years pass, and its disadvantages and hardships become apparent, it is becoming increasingly difficult to fill up vacancies satisfactorily. The frequent changes of the last five years clearly indicate this. The Engineers were not at first admitted to any recognised rules as regards leave, promotion, or retiring funds, the one rule to which they were and still are subject being three months' notice to quit from the Collector-Presidents. Any amelioration which has been made in their condition has only applied to each personally and not to the whole as a body.

5. It will be readily understood and admitted that, as the working of the department is at present constituted, each Engineer is at a great disadvantage for

want of a professional superior; much unnecessary responsibility is thereby thrust upon him, and he is under the orders of a non-professional President who, however well intentioned, cannot readily appreciate the Engineer's difficulties in his work or be competent to scrutinize estimates within his power of sanction, or advise him in any way professionally. As regards his more immediate work, friction may and often does arise both in designing and execution; needless labour is not unfrequently entailed on him, more especially by Taluk Boards, in estimating for works that can never be carried out; and delay generally occurs in the sanctioning of estimates scrutinized in the Public Works Department, in repeated correspondence over points which could easily then and there be revised by the scrutinizing agency, if at the head of the department, or explanations simplified. Further the Engineer is hampered in his Accounts Branch by the control of a Revenue Accounts Department which almost seems to delight in complicating that part of his work, so that to keep himself and his office straight, he must devote the major part of his time to work altogether out of his province, or be constantly in hot water with the Inspector of Local Fund Accounts.

6. It is notorious that at present the subordinate staff in every district without exception, only does its work under compulsion and by the constant nagging of the Engineer. Each subordinate knows that, as at present employed, he may be turned out to-morrow without rhyme or reason, and that when turned out of one district another is open to him. There is no encouragement for good men; very limited promotion, and if by accident a good man is picked up he only remains till he can get an appointment in the Public Works Department or anywhere else he can better himself. The Subordinate Department in fact at present may be said to consist largely of the riff-raff of its class, is constantly undergoing changes and is, as a rule, not only untrustworthy, but incompetent and indifferent. It is submitted therefore that if only in common fairness to strengthen the hands of the Engineers and give them such support as they have a right to expect from subordinates, the need for reform and improvement is urgent. It is absurd to suppose that good or even moderately qualified men will long remain in employment, paid at about half the scale of its contemporary, with no retiring benefits that are not amply paid for, and in employment where the work generally is every whit as important, and at present, at least, many degrees heavier. It is no argument to say that men can be got to-morrow to fill up every one of the appointments—inferior and superior—at perhaps less than the present emoluments, as the same might just as safely be asserted of every department in the country. There are doubtless swarms of unemployed men ready to undertake anything and everything on any terms, but if the Boards expect to obtain and keep capable and trustworthy men, they must—and this is much more true of the superior grades—be sufficiently paid. It is the reverse of economy to deal niggardly with the executive staff in such a department.

7. The superior professional staff proposed under this scheme of consolidation is as follows:—

					Rs.		Rs.
One	1st Grade	Superintending	Engineer on	..	1,100	=	1,100
Two	2nd ,,	,,	Engineers	..	1,000	=	2,000
Four	1st ,,	Executive	,,	..	850	=	3,400
Four	2nd ,,	,,	,,	..	750	=	3,000
Three	3rd ,,	,,	,,	..	650	=	1,950
Nine	4th ,,	,,	,,	..	550	=	4,950
Two	1st ,,	Assistant	,,	..	400	=	800
Two	2nd ,,	,,	,,	..	300	=	600
Three	3rd ,,	,,	,,	..	250	=	750
				Monthly	..		18,550
				Annually	..		2,22,600
Three Superintending Engineers' establishments					..		15,000
Increase under Travelling allowances				..	..	..	15,000

	RS.
Increase in grading and raising pay of the subordinate establishment and contingencies	50,000
Total ..	3,02,600
Deduct cost of present superior establishment including amount paid to the Public Works Department for scrutiny of estimates.	1,80,000
Total proposed increase ..	1,22,600

8. The average cost of the Presidency Executive Establishments to expenditure during the last five years is 17·40 per cent., the total cost being 5½ lakhs. The increase under this proposed scheme therefore would be slightly over 2 per cent. and the total cost of establishments would still be under the maximum of 20 per cent. prescribed by Government. This does not, however, take into account savings that would be effected in the Account Inspecting Branch, which will be referred to hereafter, or the increased expenditure from the larger incomes of several Boards from the new revenue assessments. It may therefore be safely accepted that the expenditure on establishments would never exceed the prescribed maximum.

9. The Executive Department would be placed under the control of the Chief Engineer to Government in the Public Works Department, in whom the appointments, transfers, &c., would be vested and who would in short be the head of the Executive Branch. The Superintending Engineers' divisions would be "Central," "Southern" and "Northern," the head-quarters of the first being in Madras, and his office being the "Secretariat" to the Chief Engineer, for purposes of gazetting appointments, transfers, leaves, &c. The first Superintending Engineers might be selected from the Public Works Department, and vacancies occuring thereafter to be given to the senior Local Fund Engineers. It is of course not possible, within the limits of this memorandum, to go into the question of how far the subordinate establishment should be strengthened, but it may be stated that the scheme contemplates grading it similarly to the Public Works Department; increasing the pay comparatively with the superior grades, making the whole department pensionable, and granting it the leave rules of the Uncovenanted Service.

10. Reference has been made to the increasing difficulties in obtaining duly qualified Engineers for Local Fund employment; but if this scheme was adopted, the Boards might expect the department to be recruited in the same manner as the Public Works Department by men specially trained, viz., from Cooper's Hill College. This could be done by Government offering appointments as men are required, to the men passing out from Cooper's Hill, immediately below those qualifying for the Public Works Department, and though the prospects in Local Fund service would even, under the improved conditions, be much poorer than its contemporary, capable men would be found willing to accept the employment. Both the Boards and Government would thus have a guarantee of obtaining men qualified technically, and who, entering at the lowest grade in the superior service, would acquire the training necessary for and have the prospect of promotion to the higher grades, the want of which advantages are at present so fatal to the efficiency of the department.

11. As to the financing and working of the scheme there should be no serious difficulties, and both might readily be devised by a Committee consisting of the Chief Engineer to Government in the Public Works Department, the Member of Council in charge of Local Funds, and a Public Works Examiner, with whom might be associated two or three of the senior Local Fund Engineers. Meantime the following suggestions are made:—

(*a*) That the various Boards be empowered and directed to make the full contribution of 20 per cent. on expenditure towards cost of establishment. It may at once be admitted that this would be a considerable increase in some cases, but it must also be maintained that in cases where it is greatly under this percentage, the Executive branch is

altogether inadequate to requirements, or the staff remunerated quite incommensurate with its work and responsibility. The increase therefore would be fully compensated for in improved establishments, apart altogether from the benefits to the Boards referred to in the foregoing, while it would still be considerably less than previously paid to the Public Works Department. It may be as well here to state that this scheme does not contemplate interfering in any way with the powers and authority vested in the Boards under the Local Fund Act, but only to put the Executive branch under effective control. The powers of the Board as to the execution of work, sanctioning of estimates, &c., would remain exactly as at present with the Collector-President also in the same position, except as regard appointments, transfers, &c., of the Executive Department.

(*b*) That the present complicated and expensive Inspecting Accounts Department be abolished, and the accounts placed under the Public Works Examining Department on a percentage contribution for the work to be done. There can be no doubt that there would be considerable saving under this head, while it would greatly relieve the department of existing and unnecessary harassments.

12. When this unification has been accomplished, the consolidated establishment would become pensionable as in the case of all other Government services. The objection of Government to this just claim has practically been removed and the way paved to it by the establishment of Provident Funds in several of the districts, and whether unification takes place or not, such Funds must ultimately be adopted in all districts. It may therefore be taken for granted that Government having recognised the necessity of reward for approved service and permitted certain Boards to accept the small liability involved in the scheme of Provident Funds, it should not be adverse to any proposals which do not exceed such liability. Government has hitherto declined to entertain proposal to pension the Local Fund Service on the ground that it would commit the Boards to unknown future liabilities and burdens, but this can now be defined within the limits of the cost of a Provident Fund to a consolidated department.

13. The contribution of the Boards towards the Provident Fund bonus is 6¼ per cent. of establishment charges, and this would suffice to form a sound and adequate Pension Fund. The present cost of establishments is 5½ lakhs and would be fully 6 lakhs under the unified scheme. Taking the latter therefore for purposes of calculation, the consolidated contribution on it at 6¼ per cent. would be Rs. 37,500 annually. It would be quite 12 years at least from the year 1896 before any Local Fund servant would be entitled to pension, and by that time the Fund would have accumulated at compound interest to not less than 5½ lakhs; and the annual interest on that sum at 3½ per cent. would then be Rs. 19,250, which added to the annual contributions of the Boards at 6¼ per cent., viz., Rs. 37,500, which would make a total of Rs. 56,750 available for payment of pensions, before any could become due. There could hardly at any time be more than six Engineers on the Fund, which would be equivalent to say Rs. 30,000 annually, leaving Rs. 26,750 for pensions to subordinates, without touching the capital fund. Though these figures are given as a mere rough outline to indicate how readily a Pension Fund could be accomplished without increasing the burdens of the Boards or committing them to unknown liabilities, it will be conceded that they do not over-estimate possibilities from the Boards' point of view.

14. A consolidated department such as this scheme contemplates is eminently desirable if only in the interests of the Boards, apart altogether from the crying necessity for improvement in the status of the executive staff. It would be graded from the lowest to the highest as in the case of similar departments under Government; all employés in it would be transferable; and instead of the difficulties now experienced in filling up, satisfactorily, vacancies of all kinds and more particularly *those in the higher grades*, trained and experienced men would be always available, new blood being constantly introduced at the lowest point in each grade for training as vacancies occurred. It is needless to comment on the vast improvement this would

make in the efficiency of the executive staff and consequent benefit to the Boards concerned, whilst it would at once abolish the grievances of want of prospects of promotion, loss of privileges earned in making an exchange, and give every servant of the Board the anticipation of the reward he has a right to expect from long and approved service.

15. There would of course be many details to work up, these remarks and suggestions not being at all exhaustive but merely the broad outlines to indicate the feasibility of the scheme; and that the need for it is urgent both in the interests of the Boards and for the amelioration of the executive staff whose lot is a hard one in every way there can be no two opinions. That the department has done its work creditably in the past in the face of great difficulties and impediments cannot be questioned—the results speak for themselves—and it has a just title to look to Government for early and liberal relief. We are aware that it is with the Boards that ultimate action in this matter must lie, but meantime Government can do much by recognising the necessity for reform and insisting that they shall take it in hand. It is therefore suggested that Presidents be requested to put the subject before their Boards in consultation with their Engineer and formulate some scheme either on this or similar lines, or that Government itself will take direct action in the matter. It is understood that the executive staff of the Local Fund Department has in Bengal been constituted somewhat after the manner herein suggested, and the methods of its working might be ascertained to assist in drawing up a scheme for this Presidency.

GUINDY,
10*th October* 1895.

(Signed) G. D. DWYER,
District Board Engineer, Chingleput.

Exd S. J. Pereira.

urgent 10

Govt. of {1895} Madras.

LOCAL AND MUNICIPAL.

For A.S
Proof for approval.
11-1-96.

Issued

Recd. Press Please strike off 480 copies. Inds 11/1 Encl.

G.O., No. 2464 L., 21st Dec. 1895.

Original not received 11/1

DECEMBER.

Local Fund Engineering Department.

Forwarding to the Public Works Department, for the opinion of the Chief Engineer, certain memorials on the subject of the consolidation of the —, and calling for a report from the Presidents of District Boards on the matter before 15th ~~1st~~ February 1896.

Proof

11

No. 2464 L., 21st December 1895.

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS.

LOCAL AND MUNICIPAL DEPARTMENT.

Read—the following papers :—

Endorsement from the President, District Board, Chingleput, No. 2774 L., dated 11th October 1895.
Memorial from the Local Fund Engineer, Tanjore, dated 7th October 1895.
" " " " Tinnevelly " 7th " "
" " " " Malabar " 11th " "
" " Honorary Secretary, Local Fund Engineers' Association, Tanjore, dated 7th October 1895.
" " Local Fund Engineer, South Arcot, dated 8th October 1895.
" " " " Cuddapah " 26th August "
" " " " Vizagapatam " 11th October "
" " " " North Arcot " 26th August "
" " " Assistant Engineer, Guntúr Range, Kistna, dated 14th October 1895.
" " " Engineer, Trichinopoly, dated 7th October 1895.
Endorsement from the President, District Board, South Canara, No. 1521-D.B., dated 13th October 1895.
Memorial from the Local Fund Assistant Engineer, Tinnevelly, dated 26th August 1895.
" " " Engineer, Gódávari, dated 12th October 1895.
" " " Assistant Engineer, Malabar, dated 26th August 1895.
Endorsement from the President, District Board, Kurnool, No. 50, dated 16th October 1895.
Memorial from the Local Fund Engineer, Kistna, dated 21st October 1895.
" " Acting Local Fund Engineer, Salem, dated 21st October 1895.
" " Local Fund Assistant Engineer, Ellore Sub-Division, Gódávari, dated 26th August 1895.
" from M.R.Ry. R. Subramania Aiyar, Local Fund Supervisor, Dindigul, dated 26th August 1895.
Endorsement from the President, District Board, Tanjore, No. 1093-D.B., dated 25th October 1895.
" " " " Coimbatore, No. 1170-D.B., dated 28th October 1895.
" " " " Madura, No. 3838, dated 13th November 1895.
" " " " Madura, No. 3838-A., dated 13th November 1895.
" " " " Ganjám, No. 3265, dated 12th November 1895.

Order—No. 2464 L., dated 21st December 1895.

The papers will be forwarded to the Public Works Department with the request that the Chief Engineer will favour Government, at an early date, with his opinion on the subject to which they refer.

2. A copy of the memorial, with the accompanying memorandum, will be transmitted to all Presidents of District Boards, who will be requested to at once consult their respective Boards and submit a report on the question of reorganizing Local Fund Engineering establishments, which should reach Government not later than ~~1st~~ February 1896.

3. The following letter will be addressed to the Governments of Bombay, Bengal, the North-West Provinces and the Punjab.

× × ×

(True Extract.)

for *Chief Secretary.*

To the Public Works Department with papers, in original, to be returned.
„ all Presidents of District Boards.

APPENDIX.

Memorial from Mr. G. D. DWYER, District Board Engineer, Chingleput, to His Excellency the Right Hon'ble Lord WENLOCK, G.C.I.E., Governor in Council, Fort St. George, Madras (through the President, District Board, Chingleput), dated Guindy, 10th October 1895.

Respectfully Sheweth,—That the memorialist ventures to submit herewith a memorandum on the subject of the consolidation of the Local Fund Engineering Department of the Madras Presidency, and prays that your Excellency in Council will consider the matter and ascertain how far the consolidation and reorganization of the said department as submitted in the said memorandum is feasible and practicable.

2. That as the memorandum has dealt with the subject as exhaustively as it could be done in a tentative scheme, the memorialist thinks it unnecessary to recapitulate here the circumstances that demand an early reform and reconstitution in this direction.

3. That the department in question is doing a very important portion of the public works of this country is well known, while the prospects held out for those in it is far from encouraging.

4. That in giving effect to a scheme like this the Government will not be making altogether a new departure, as in technical matters such as educational, medical and sanitary law and engineering connected with District Boards and Municipalities, Government often feels it necessary to refer them to the respective technical departments in the Government service not only for advice but also for action.

5. That this being so, the reform suggested in this memorandum is only a request to the Government to proceed but a step farther to efficiently man the Local Fund Engineering service, keep it directly under the control of a Government professional agency, securing for its employés all the advice and encouragement necessary, and effect that unification which is considered so essential to the satisfactory working of all Government departments.

6. That the reform suggested will also introduce into the department a system and order which is now wanting and extend the scope for the prospects and promotion of its officers.

7. That your memorialist begs to reiterate distinctly that the scheme submitted does not in the least interfere with the powers of management and control now vested in the Local Fund Boards over their funds and officers as far as execution of work is concerned, and does not saddle the boards with any considerable or unauthorized additional expenditure in the matter of organizing a Pension Fund—the back-bone of every efficiently manned service.

8. That the Government will be pleased to refer the memorandum, if they should deem it fit to do so, to the Chief Engineer to Government in the Public Works Department for his opinion, which, if favourable, your memorialist prays that Government be farther pleased to appoint a committee as suggested in paragraph 11 of the memorandum to work out the details and submit a scheme in a practicable form for adoption.

9. That in conclusion your Excellency's memorialist, who belongs to a service no less important than the Civil, Military and Naval services of the country, respectfully prays that your Excellency in Council will graciously be pleased to consider the subject favourably, and to afford him the relief he now stands so much in need of.

For which act of charity and kindness your Excellency's memorialist shall in duty bound, ever pray.

Memorandum on a proposed consolidation scheme for the Madras Presidency Local Fund Engineering Department to accompany the Memorial submitted by Petitioner.

1. To those directly connected with the execution of Local Fund Works, viz., the Engineers, it is apparent that a period has arrived when it is necessary, yea almost imperative, in the interests of all concerned, that the various districts and circles should be consolidated into one department; and that the revenue branch should as

far as possible be separated from the professional agency. It is now close on 16 years since Government decided to hand over charge of all works constructed from, or maintained by Local Funds, to the sole care of the various boards concerned, with the view apparently of making self-Government something more of a reality than it had been, and there can be no doubt that, defective as the machinery is in many ways, the experiment has been very successful. Financially there has been considerable saving both in establishments and cost of works, while roads have been largely extended and improved; many important buildings, such as hospitals, schools, chatrams, &c., have been constructed; the execution of works of all kinds has been facilitated, and closer supervision attained. There is, however, still room for much improvement in the Executive branch, which has been patent to the Engineers for years past, and solitary attempts have from time to time been made to create an interest in the subject in higher quarters, but with no substantial result. This memorandum purposes to explain and propose a remedy for the admitted defects and to sketch a much needed improvement in the status of the Executive staff.

2. The one radical defect when the boards were vested with their present powers was in not placing the control of the Executive branch under Professional agency and for sometime past the work of the department has been so extensive and important, with an ever tendency to increase, that for its more effective and efficient working this should have been remedied long ago. It is notorious also that, besides being hampered with the present complicated and imperfect system, the department is both undermanned and underpaid, while the anomaly of a department of such importance, being without professional control is unprecedented, and under such conditions it cannot be expected to yield the results it would otherwise give if directed by its own profession.

3. When the separation from the Public Works Department was effected each board was to have its own Engineer, the appointment, however, being vested solely in the Collector-President of the board, and to whom alone the Engineer was to look for orders and guidance. The districts were to be entirely independent of each other, and the expenditure on establishments was not to exceed 20 per cent. on the outlay. These conditions were, as might be expected, as fatal to efficiency as the placing of the department under non-professional control, besides being the cause of hardship to both the superior and inferior branches, and virtually closed all openings to promotion while debarring the boards from a relay of trained men for future vacancies, inasmuch as the appointments were non-transferable, so that men eligible for, and offered better appointments, have either to give up all the benefits and privileges of past service or elect to remain where first appointed. These are hardships of no ordinary kind, and to which no other service in India is subjected; while not only is there not the least necessity for it, but its continuance is against the best and truest interests of the boards. As regards the cost of establishments, viz., 20 per cent. of expenditure, it has never been exceeded unless in solitary and exceptional instances, and certainly the average of the Presidency has never reached that figure. The average of the last five years is 17·40 per cent.

4. Coincident with the introduction of the new *régime*, a reduction in the Public Works Department enabled many of the Collector-Presidents to secure the services of compulsorily retired men with proportional pensions from that department, while others engaged young men commencing their profession. By the latter conditions of the service were perhaps not well understood, and as the years pass, and its disadvantages and hardships become apparent, it is becoming increasingly difficult to fill up vacancies satisfactorily. The frequent changes of the last five years clearly indicate this. The Engineers were not at first admitted to any recognised rules as regards leave, promotion, or retiring funds, the one rule to which they were and still are subject being three months' notice to quit from the Collector-Presidents. Any amelioration which has been made in their condition has only applied to each personally and not to the whole as a body.

5. It will be readily understood and admitted that, as the working of the department is at present constituted, each Engineer is at a great disadvantage for

want of a professional superior; much unnecessary responsibility is thereby thrust upon him, and he is under the orders of a non-professional President who, however well intentioned, cannot readily appreciate the Engineer's difficulties in his work or be competent to scrutinize estimates within his power of sanction, or advise him in any way professionally. As regards his more immediate work, friction may and often does arise both in designing and execution; needless labour is not unfrequently entailed on him, more especially by Taluk Boards, in estimating for works that can never be carried out; and delay generally occurs in the sanctioning of estimates scrutinized in the Public Works Department, in repeated correspondence over points which could easily then and there be revised by the scrutinizing agency, if at the head of the department, or explanations simplified. Further the Engineer is hampered in his Accounts Branch by the control of a Revenue Accounts Department which almost seems to delight in complicating that part of his work, so that to keep himself and his office straight, he must devote the major part of his time to work altogether out of his province, or be constantly in hot water with the Inspector of Local Fund Accounts.

6. It is notorious that at present the subordinate staff in every district without exception, only does its work under compulsion and by the constant nagging of the Engineer. Each subordinate knows that, as at present employed, he may be turned out to-morrow without rhyme or reason, and that when turned out of one district another is open to him. There is no encouragement for good men, very limited promotion, and if by accident a good man is picked up he only remains till he can get an appointment in the Public Works Department or anywhere else he can better himself. The Subordinate Department in fact at present may be said to consist largely of the riff-raff of its class, is constantly undergoing changes and is, as a rule, not only untrustworthy, but incompetent and indifferent. It is submitted therefore that if only in common fairness to strengthen the hands of the Engineers and give them such support as they have a right to expect from subordinates, the need for reform and improvement is urgent. It is absurd to suppose that good or even moderately qualified men will long remain in employment paid at about half the scale of its contemporary, with no retiring benefits that are not amply paid for, and in employment where the work generally is every whit as important, and at present, at least, many degrees heavier. It is no argument to say that men can be got to-morrow to fill up every one of the appointments—inferior and superior—at perhaps less than the present emoluments, as the same might just as safely be asserted of every department in the country. There are doubtless swarms of unemployed men ready to undertake anything and everything on any terms, but if the Boards expect to obtain and keep capable and trustworthy men they must—and this is much more true of the superior grades—be sufficiently paid. It is the reverse of economy to deal niggardly with the executive staff in such a department.

7. The superior professional staff proposed under this scheme of consolidation is as follows:—

					Rs.		Rs.
One	1st Grade	Superintending	Engineer on	..	1,100	=	1,100
Two	2nd „	„	Engineers	..	1,000	=	2,000
Four	1st „	Executive	„	..	850	=	3,400
Four	2nd „	„	„	..	750	=	3,000
Three	3rd „	„	„	..	650	=	1,950
Nine	4th „	„	„	..	550	=	4,950
Two	1st „	Assistant	„	..	400	=	800
Two	2nd „	„	„	..	300	=	600
Three	3rd „	„	„	..	250	=	750
					Monthly	..	18,550
					Annually	..	2,22,600
Three Superintending Engineers' establishments						..	15,000
Increase under Travelling allowances							15,000

make in the efficiency of the executive staff and consequent benefit to the Boards concerned, whilst it would at once abolish the grievances of want of prospects of promotion, loss of privileges earned in making an exchange, and give every servant of the Board the anticipation of the reward ~~they have~~ a right to expect from long and approved service.

15. There would of course be many details to work up, these remarks and suggestions not being at all exhaustive but merely the broad outlines to indicate the feasibility of the scheme; and that the need for it is urgent both in the interests of the Boards and for the amelioration of the executive staff whose lot is a hard one in every way there can be no two opinions. That the department has done its work creditably in the past in the face of great difficulties and impediments cannot be questioned—the results speak for themselves—and it has a just title to look to Government for early and liberal relief. We are aware that it is with the Boards that ultimate action in this matter must lie, but meantime Government can do much by recognising the necessity for reform and insisting that they shall take it in hand. It is therefore suggested that Presidents be requested to put the subject before their Boards in consultation with their Engineer and formulate some scheme either on this or similar lines, or that Government itself will take direct action in the matter. It is understood that the executive staff of the Local Fund Department has in Bengal been constituted somewhat after the manner herein suggested, and the methods of its working might be ascertained to assist in drawing up a scheme for this Presidency.

GUINDY,
10*th October* 1895.

(Signed) G. D. DWYER,
District Board Engineer, Chingleput.

Ed. S. J. Pereira.

To First Asst Clerk
L. & M. Dept

Copies of Notes connected with G.O. No. 2464 L. of 21/12/1895 were struck & despatched to you on the 4th August 1903.

Please let me know why this cracked proof was sent to the press? I received a telephone to effect that proof was sent. PJW 11/8/3

1 19

A. Ruthnaswamy 3-8-03

LOCAL AND MUNICIPAL DEPARTMENT.

I G.O., No. 2464 L., DATED
MBER 1895.

l Engineers, etc., regarding the consolidation Engineering establishments in the Presidency.]

ined from other sources, was drafted by anjore, who is one of the very few District ree in engineering.

e present system is not working satisfactorily. sort of qualifications for a service in which n papers that pass through this office every neither satisfactory to Presidents of District at the powers of appointment and dismissal ands of the former.

oad as a rule is also probably notorious.

e operations of Grants 2 and 3 should be vants with pensions and proper supervision qualified and organized staff.

natter off-hand in a note for orders now, and e, as suggested in the memorial, would be

he scheme would no doubt be many, and one uld be undesirable were a department of Local at all the men who are now on the Local Fund Engineer staff should be in... in it. It is not expedient that any but those whose work has stood several years' trial satisfactorily should be rendered entitled to pension, or should be made more difficult to get rid of than they are at present.

7. Orders are therefore only requested at present as to whether it is considered desirable to enquire into the necessity of a reorganization. It is submitted that it is desirable, and it is proposed that the following officers, who have all had considerable experience of local boards, should be invited to express a full opinion upon all the points raised in the memorial, and to offer any suggestions that may occur to them:—

Mr. Gibson.	Mr. Thomson.
„ Arundel.	„ Gabriel Stokes.
„ LeFanu.	„ Wynne.
„ Winterbotham.	„ Atkinson.
„ Willock.	

8. The Government of Bengal might also be asked to give particulars of the scheme which is stated in the last lines of the memorial to be in force there. Upon receipt of replies to these references, and of the opinion of the Chief Engineer which should also, it is submitted, be called for, the matter can come up for discussion in greater detail.

W. FRANCIS—3-10-95.

I can't find the least trace in the budget estimates of any such scheme.

H. W. B[LISS].

This point should be hunted up.

W[ENLOCK].

Please see the remarks of the Local Fund Engineer, Coimbatore, in the linked file. Mr. Stephens is an old Public Works officer with a very good professional reputation and an extensive knowledge of both the department with which he was formerly connected and that to which he now belongs. He has very promptly put his finger on the salient blots of Mr. Syson's proposals, and has pointed out what is one of the real reasons—and the main one—for the non-success as a rule of Local Fund Public Works. No doubt Mr. Syson's scheme is one eminently calculated to give satisfaction to him and other Local Fund Engineers, but an introduction of it even in a modified form would have to be preceded by a pretty general sweep of existing Local Fund Engineers many of whom are not worth the pay which they now get.

I submit that the references suggested by the Under Secretary may be made. Colonel Pennycuick will probably strangle this infant at its birth.

J. F. PRICE—13-11-95.

Mr. Syson has been to see me about this and I have had a long talk with him.

2. His main proposal is to form a sort of subordinate Public Works department to deal with local works. This scheme would require legislation, for as the law stands these Local Fund Public Works department men could not be appointed, promoted, etc., as proposed. To legislation, in itself, I see no great objection. It is already proposed to amend the Local Boards Act and the amendments required to enable the Public Works departments of local boards to be officered by a central body of Government servants, at the head of which would be the Chief Engineer, might easily be carried, if the scheme is approved. I am, however, altogether opposed to the scheme. I well recollect the wretched state of affairs which prevailed in years gone by when the only professional agency available for the execution of local works was that of the Public Works department, and the feeling of relief with which I hailed the proposal to disconnect local works from the Public Works department, and to place them under separate Engineers who should be responsible to the people whose money they spent and whose bread they ate. I will have nothing to do with any proposal to revive the old state of things, as it would be revived if Government organized a new (and inferior) Public Works establishment to carry out local works. Mr. Syson and the other gentlemen who have memorialized Government may at once be told that the scheme set out cannot be accepted.

3. I am not prepared to say that the existing system is working well. To a great extent this seems to me to be, because Presidents of Local Boards do not employ suitable persons as District Engineers, Assistant Engineers, etc. They are all always running after Europeans for these posts, and of course for the pay they can give commonly get very inferior Europeans. I think they had far better try to get good natives. Such men exist, I believe. I do not know that there are many native Engineers who are competent to design and supervise large works. Probably they are not, as a rule, sufficiently well educated. But why they should not be able to discharge the usually simple duties of a District Engineer or Assistant Engineer, I cannot see. Natives, if properly selected and properly supervised, do well enough as Divisional officers; and I can't see why they should not do well in the Local Fund Engineering department. Orders have been issued, I believe, as to the examinations to be passed after some future date by persons desiring admission into the Local Fund Engineering department. These ought to secure the appointment of professionally competent persons. As to honesty and industry, Presidents of Local Boards must keep their eyes open and look after their local fund as well as after their other subordinates. This, however, is by the way and need not be referred to in replying to Mr. Syson and the other memorialists.

4. While unable to accept Mr. Syson's scheme, however, I think something might be done to improve the position of the officers whom he represents. Apparently the following points need attention:—

(i) *Audit of accounts by the subordinates of the Accountant-General instead of by those of the Examiner of Public Works Accounts.*—This is the same complaint as recently made by Mr. Brown of Gódávari, in regard to which I have already called for information. I await this. In the meantime, I note that Mr. Syson admits that as the audit staff has gained experience, friction and difficulties have decreased.

(ii) *Pensions.*—Mr. Syson wants a Government pension fund for all districts, consolidated and under Government management. I doubt if this is feasible. I think, however, that there is no doubt—(1) that every district board should have a bonus or provident fund [the grant of pensions has been disallowed in consequence of the indefinite liabilities in which it might involve Local Boards]; (2) that when an officer left one district to take up service in another he should carry on with him all reserve benefits as to bonuses or provident fund, leave, &c., which he had earned by his service in his former district. Please see how far existing arrangements conform to these two *desiderata* and suggest the steps to be taken to make them do so, if such is not now the case.

(iii) *Powers of District Engineers.*—I have dealt with this question on the proposals for the reorganization of the Gódávari Local Fund Public Works establishments which are under disposal and can only repeat what I there said.

5. Mr. Syson also urges that more latitude should be given to district boards to work up to the 20 per cent. which is the maximum allowed on Local Fund Public Works establishments. As to this I can only say that it is open to the boards to bring forward what proposals they please. From what Mr. Syson says the subordinates in Tanjore would seem to be underpaid.

H. W. B[LISS]—23-11-95.

I am hardly prepared to commit myself definetely to any course at present, because I think before anything is done we ought to get the opinions of those interested, as their experience ought to be most useful in coming to a right decision.

2. I would therefore send the memorial to each Local Board President, telling him to consult his board at once, and report their views to Government by 1st February 1896.

3. The papers should also go to Colonel Pennycuick for his opinion. With the opinions we shall thus get placed before us we ought to be able to see what should be done to put matters on a better footing. Things are not satisfactory now, and will not be unless some change is made, whether the Engineers are natives or Europeans. What Mr. Stephens says may be very true as regards himself and the district in which he may be, but there are several districts where the incompetence of the Engineers would nullify the good effects of any amount of additional funds if placed at their disposal.

W[ENLOCK]—27-11-95.

I agree with the Hon'ble Mr. Bliss that we should not recur to the system which prevailed up to 1880, but the faults of that system resulted chiefly from the facts that the Public Works department men entrusted with local work had other work to do in which they took more interest, that they were transferred from one district to another more frequently than was consistent with local interests, and that the allotments for local works were given out of State funds from a distance. The scheme of the memorialists "does not contemplate interfering in any way with the powers and authority vested in the boards under the Local Fund Act," and this will prevent the repetition of the weakest part of the old system. Even if Local Fund Engineers are placed on one list for the whole Presidency restriction might be placed on the frequency of removals from one district to another. I think it will be better to have provident funds and give bonuses on retirement rather than pensions, but it is possible that whilst Presidents "hanker" after European Local Fund Engineers and local fund boards continue, as is natural, to object to any great increase of pay, pensions may have to be given in some cases. The improvement of the subordinate service is greatly called for, but that is a matter which, in my opinion, can only be dealt with by increasing salaries and must be left entirely to local fund boards. The evils which Mr. Mullaly points out are simply

No.
H. W. B[LISS].

a recapitulation of evils which I have felt myself and heard of again and again from all the Local Fund Presidents I have spoken to about the matter. He mentions the anomaly of exempting the expenditure under Grant 1 from such Government control as is given to expenditure under Grants 2 and 3. It would not be difficult to devise some extent of control. He also mentions the bad policy of making the President nominate and virtually appoint Local Fund Engineers—officers of high pay and position, whose qualification can only be judged by professional men. This, at all events, should be put a stop to. The nomination might be left to a committee at Madras headed by the Chief Engineer.

2. At all events the state of things at present is, as the Hon'ble Mr. Bliss says, unsatisfactory, and I think that, as His Excellency suggests, before any orders are passed we should get the opinion of all local fund boards and the Hon'ble Colonel Pennycuick (I wish we could wait for Colonel Pennycuick's opinion till the reports of the Presidents are submitted, but he will have left us before that time). We should also ascertain what has been done with respect to the local fund part of local fund works not only in Bengal but in the other provinces, what the result has been, and how far it has been found possible to employ natives as Local Fund Engineers.

J. G[ROSE]—30-11-95.

[G.O., No. 2464 L., dated 21st December 1895.]

LOCAL AND MUNICIPAL DEPARTMENT.

NOTES CONNECTED WITH G.O., No. 2464 L., DATED 21ST DECEMBER 1895.

[SUBJECT.—*Memorials from ~~Local Fund~~ District Board Engineers, etc., regarding the consolidation and reorganization of the Local Fund Engineering establishments in the Presidency.*]

The memorial, it has been ascertained from other sources, was drafted by Mr. Syson, District Board Engineer of Tanjore, who is one of the very few District Board Engineers with any recognized degree in engineering.

2. It will perhaps be admitted that the present system is not working satisfactorily. The great difficulty of getting men of any sort of qualifications for a service in which there is usually no pension is evident from papers that pass through this office every week. It is also perhaps clear that it is neither satisfactory to Presidents of District Boards nor to District Board Engineers that the powers of appointment and dismissal of the latter should rest so largely in the hands of the former.

3. That the subordinate staff is very bad as a rule and also probably notorious.

4. It is perhaps inconsistent that the operations of Grants 2 and 3 should be controlled by a body of Government servants with pensions and proper supervision while Grant 1 is at the mercy of a badly qualified and organized staff.

5. It is impossible to deal with the matter off-hand in a note for orders now, and probably the appointment of a committee, as suggested in the memorial, would be necessary.

6. The difficulties in the way of the scheme would no doubt be many, and one that at once suggests itself is that it would be undesirable were a department of Local Fund Engineers eventually formed, that all the men who are *now* on the Local Fund Engineer staff should be invited to join it. It is not expedient that any but those whose work has stood several years' trial satisfactorily should be rendered entitled to pensions, or should be made more difficult to get rid of than they are at present.

7. Orders are therefore only requested at present as to whether it is considered desirable to enquire into the necessity of a reorganization. It is submitted that it is desirable, and it is proposed that the following officers, who have all had considerable experience of local boards, should be invited to express a full opinion upon all the points raised in the memorial, and to offer any suggestions that may occur to them :—

Mr. Gibson.
,, Arundel.
,, LeFanu.
,, Winterbotham.
,, Willock.

Mr. Thomson.
,, Gabriel Stokes.
,, Wynne.
,, Atkinson.

8. The Government of Bengal might also be asked to give particulars of the scheme which is stated in the last lines of the memorial to be in force there. Upon receipt of replies to these references, and of the opinion of the Chief Engineer which should also, it is submitted, be called for, the matter can come up for discussion in greater detail.

W. FRANCIS—3-10-95.

I can't find the least trace in the budget estimates of any such scheme.

H. W. B[LISS].

This point should be hunted up.

W[ENLOCK].

Please see the remarks of the Local Fund Engineer, Coimbatore, in the linked file. Mr. Stephens is an old Public Works officer with a very good professional reputation and an extensive knowledge of both the department with which he was formerly connected and that to which he now belongs. He has very promptly put his finger on the salient blots of Mr. Syson's proposals, and has pointed out what is one of the real reasons—and the main one—for the non-success as a rule of Local Fund Public Works. No doubt Mr. Syson's scheme is one eminently calculated to give satisfaction to him and other Local Fund Engineers, but an introduction of it even in a modified form would have to be preceded by a pretty general sweep of existing Local Fund Engineers many of whom are not worth the pay which they now get.

I submit that the references suggested by the Under Secretary may be made. Colonel Pennycuick will probably strangle this infant at its birth.

J. F. PRICE—13-11-95.

Mr. Syson has been to secure about this and I have had a long talk with him. see me/

2. His main proposal is to form a sort of subordinate Public Works department to deal with local works. This scheme would require legislation, for as the law stands these Local Fund Public Works department men could not be appointed, promoted, etc., as proposed. To legislation, in itself, I see no great objection. It is already proposed to amend the Local Boards Act and the amendments required to enable the Public Works departments of local boards to be officered by a central body of Government servants, at the head of which would be the Chief Engineer, might easily be carried, *if the scheme is approved*. I am, however, altogether opposed to the scheme. I well recollect the watched state of affairs which prevailed in years gone by when the only professional agency available for the execution of local work and was that of the Public Works department, and the feeling of relief with which I hailed the proposal to disconnect local works from the Public Works department, and to place them under separate Engineers who should be responsible to the people whose money they spent and whose bread they ate. I will have nothing to do with any proposal to revive the old state of things, as it would be revived if Government organized a new (and inferior) Public Works establishment to carry out local works. Mr. Syson and the other gentlemen who have memorialized Government may at once be told that the scheme set out cannot be accepted.

3. I am not prepared to say that the existing system is working well. To a great extent this seems to me to be, because Presidents of Local Boards do not employ suitable persons as District Engineers, Assistant Engineers, etc. They are all always running after Europeans for these posts, and of course for the pay they can give commonly get very inferior Europeans. I think they had far better try to get good natives. Such men exist, I believe. I do not know that there are many native Engineers who are competent to design and supervise large works. Probably they are not, as a rule, sufficiently well educated. But why they should not be able to discharge the usually simple duties of a District Engineer or Assistant Engineer, I cannot see. Natives, if properly selected and properly supervised, do well enough as Divisional officers; and I can't see why they should not do well in the Local Fund Engineering department. Orders have been issued, I believe, as to the examinations to be passed after some future date by persons desiring admission into the Local Fund Engineering department. These ought to secure the appointment of professionally competent persons. As to honesty and industry, Presidents of Local Boards must keep their eyes open and look after their local fund as well as after their other subordinates. This, however, is by the way and need not be referred to in replying to Mr. Syson and the other memorialists.

4. While unable to accept Mr. Syson's scheme, however, I think something might be done to improve the position of the officers whom he represents. Apparently the following points need attention:—

(1) *Audit of accounts by the subordinates of the Accountant-General instead of by those of the Examiner of Public Works Accounts.*—This is the same complaint as recently made by Mr. Brown of Gódávari, in regard to which I have already called for information. I await this. In the meantime, I note that Mr. Syson admits that as the audit staff has gained experience, friction and difficulties have decreased.

(*ii*) *Pensions.*—Mr. Syson wants a Government *pension* fund for all districts, consolidated and under Government management. I doubt if this is feasible. I think, however, that there is no doubt (1) that every district board should have a *bonus* or *provident* fund [the grant of *pensions* has been disallowed in consequence of the indefinite liabilities in which it might involve Local Boards]; (2) that when an officer left one district to take up service in another he should carry on with him all reserve benefits as to bonuses or provident fund, leave, &c., which he had earned by his service in his former district. Please see how far existing arrangements conform to these two *desiderata* and suggest the steps to be taken to make them do so, if such is not now the case.

(*iii*) *Powers of District Engineers.*—I have dealt with this question on the proposals for the reorganization of the ~~G.E.~~ Local Fund Public Works establishments which are under disposal and can only repeat what I there said.

5. Mr. Syson also urges that more latitude should be given to district boards to work up to the 20 per cent. which is the maximum allowed on Local Fund Public Works establishments. As to this I can only say that it is open to the boards to bring forward what proposals they please. From what Mr. Syson says the subordinates in Tanjore would seem to be underpaid.

H. W. B[LISS]—23-11-95.

~~Submitted to His Excellency the Governor.~~

~~J. P. PRICE—25-11-95.~~

I am hardly prepared to commit myself definetely to any course at present, because I think before anything is done we ought to get the opinions of those interested, as their experience ought to be most useful in coming to a right decision.

2. I would therefore send the memorial to each Local Board President, telling him to consult his board at once, and report their views to Government by 1st February 1896.

3. The papers should also go to Colonel Pennycuick for his opinion. With the opinions we shall thus get placed before us we ought to be able to see what should be done to put matters on a better footing. Things are not satisfactory now, and will not be unless some charge is made, whether the Engineers are natives or Europeans. What Mr. Stephens says may be very true as regards himself and ~~to~~ the district in which he may be, but there are several districts where the incompetence of the Engineers would nullify the good effects of any amount of additional funds if placed at their disposal.

W[ENLOCK]—27-11-95.

~~Submitted to Hon'ble Mr. Grose.~~

~~W. W. PHILIPS—28-11-95.~~

I agree with the Hon'ble Mr. Bliss that we should not recur to the system which prevailed up to 1880, but the faults of that system resulted chiefly from the facts that the ~~District Magistrates~~ entrusted with local work had other work to do in which they took more interest, that they were transferred from one district to another more frequently than was consistent with local interests, and that the allotments for local works were given out of State funds from a distance. The scheme of the memorialists "does not contemplate interfering in any way with the powers and authority vested in the boards under the Local Fund Act," and this will prevent the repetition of the weakest part of the old system. Even if Local Fund Engineers are placed on one list for the whole Presidency restriction might be placed on the frequency of removals from one district to another. I think it will be better to have provident funds and give bonuses on retirement rather than pensions, but it is possible that whilst Presidents "hanker" after European Local Fund Engineers and local fund boards continue, as is natural, to object to any great increase of pay, pensions may have to be given in some cases. The improvement of the subordinate service is greatly called for, but that is a matter which, in my opinion, can only be dealt with by increasing salaries and must be left entirely to local fund boards. The evils which Mr. Mullaly points out are simply

No.

H. W. B[LISS].

a recapitulation of evils which I have felt myself and heard of again and again from all the Local Fund Presidents I have spoken to about the matter. He mentions the anomaly of exempting the expenditure under Grant 1 from such Government control as is given to expenditure under Grants 2 and 3. It would not be difficult to devise ~~sum~~ extent of control. He also mentions the bad policy of making the President nominate and virtually appoint Local Fund Engineers—officers of high pay and position, whose qualification can only be judged by professional men. This, at all events, should be put a stop to. The nomination might be left to a committee at Madras headed by the Chief Engineer.

2. At all events the state of things at present is, as the Hon'ble Mr. Bliss says, unsatisfactory, and I think that, as His Excellency suggests, before any orders are passed we should get the opinion of all local fund boards and the Hon'ble Colonel Pennycuick (I wish we could wait for Colonel Pennycuick's opinion till the reports of the Presidents are submitted, but he will have left us before that time). We should also ascertain what has been done with respect to the local fund part of local fund works not only in Bengal but in the other provinces, what the result has been, and how far it has been found possible to employ natives as Local Fund Engineers.

J. G[ROSE]—30-11-95.

Doult ?

2464-L

[illegible] on 4-8-[illegible]

28 28

Read
~~Letter~~ Endorsement from the President, District Board, Chingleput, ~~Dy.~~ No. 2774 L dated 11th October 1895.
Memorial " " Local Fund Engineer, Tanjore, dated 7th October 1895.
" " " " " Tinnevelly, " 7th October 1895.
" " " " " Malabar, " 11th " "
" " " Honorary Secretary, Local Fund Engineers' Association, Tanjore } " 7th " "
" " " Local Fund Engineer South Arcot. " 8th " "
" " " " " Cuddapah " 26th August "
" " " " " Vizagapatam " 11th October "
" " " " " North Arcot " 26th August "
" " " " " Asstt. Engr. Guntur Range, Kistna " 14th October "
" " " " " Engineer. Trichinopoly " 7th " "
Endorsement " " President, District Board, South Canara No. 1521 D.B. dated 13th " "
Memorial " " Local Fund Asstt. Engr., Tinnevelly " 26th August 1895
" " " " " Engineer, Godavari " 12th October "
" " " " " Asstt. Engr., Malabar " 26th August "
Endorsement " " President, District Board, Kurnool No. 50 " 16th October "
Memorial " " Local Fund Engineer, Kistna, dated 21st " "
" " " Ag. Do. " " , Salem , " 20 " "
" " " Local Fund Asstt. Engr. Ellore Sub Dn. Godavari } " 26th August 1895
Memorial " M.R.Ry. R. Subramania Aiyar, Local Fund Supervisor, Dindigul } " " "
Endorsement " " President, District Board, Tanjore No. 1093 D.B. " 25th October "
" " " " " Coimbatore, No. 1170 D.B. 28th October "
" " " " " ~~Madura, No. 3838 A~~, 13th November "
" " " " " Madura, No. 3838 A " " "
" " " " " Ganjam, No. 3265 12th " "

Notes connected with G.O. No 2464 L. & M. 21-12-1895

33

LOCAL AND MUNICIPAL DEPARTMENT.

Again G.O., dated

Current No. 2957, 2980 to 2984, 2998, 3010 to 3013, 3030, 3040 to 3042, 3054, 3108, 3109, and 3143, L. of 1895

189 , No.

Subject

Memorials from Local Fund Engineers, &c. regarding the consolidation and reorganization of the Local Fund Engineering establishments in the Presidency.

5 Pica

FOR ORDERS.

1 Pica

Mr. Tyson has been to see me about this & I have had a long talk with him.

His main proposal is to form a sort of Subordinate P.W.D. to deal with local works. This scheme would require legislation, for as the law stands these L.F. P.W.D. men could not be appointed, promoted &c as proposed. To legislation in itself I see no great objection — Mr. [illegible] already proposed to amend the Local Bds Act & the amendment required to make the P.W. Depts of local Bds to be officered by a Central body of Govt. Servants, at the head of which would be the C.E., might easily be carried, if the scheme is approved.

I am however, altogether opposed to the scheme — I well recollect the wretched state of affairs which prevailed in years gone by when the only professional agency available for the execution of local works was that of the P.W.D., and the feeling of relief with which I hailed the proposal to disconnect the local works from the P.W.D. and to place them under separate Engineers who should be responsible to the people whose money they spent & whose bread they ate. I will have nothing to do with any proposal to revive the old state of things, as it would be revived if Govt. organized a new (and inferior) P.W. Estt. to carry out local works — ~~[illegible]~~ Mr. Tyson & the other gentlemen who have memorialized Govt. may at once be told that the scheme set out cannot be accepted.

I am not prepared to say that the existing system is working well — To a great extent this seems to me to be because Prests. of L. Bds do not employ suitable persons as Dist Engrs, Asst Engrs &c — They are all always running after Europeans for these posts, & of course for the pay they can give commonly get very inferior Europeans — I think they had far better try to get good natives — Such men exist, I believe — I don't know that there are many Native Engrs who are competent to [illegible] design & supervise large works — Probably they are not, as are sufficiently [illegible]

The memorials, it has been ascertained from other sources, were drafted by Mr. Tyson, Dt. Bd. Engineer of Tanjore, who is one of the very few Dt. Bd. Engineers with any recognized degree in engineering.

It will perhaps be admitted that the present system is not working satisfactorily. The great difficulty of getting men of any sort of qualifications for a service in which there is usually no pension is evident from papers that pass through this office every week. It is also perhaps clear that it is neither satisfactory to Presidents of Dist. Bds. nor to Dt. Bd. Engineers that the powers of appointment & dismissal of the latter should rest so largely in the hands of the former.

That the subordinate staff is very bad as a rule is also probably

notorious.

It is perhaps inconsistent that the operations of Grants II & III should be controlled by a body of Govt. servants with pensions & proper ~~control~~ supervision while Grant I is at the mercy of a badly qualified and organized staff.

It is impossible to deal with the matter off hand in a note for orders now, & probably the appointment of a Committee, as suggested in the memorial, would be necessary.

The difficulties in the way of the scheme would no doubt be many, & one that at once suggests itself is that it wd be undesirable, were a Dept. of L.F. Engrs eventually formed, that all the men who are now on the L.F.E. Staff should be invited to join it. It is not expedient that any but those whose work has stood several years trial satisfactorily should be rendered entitled to pensions, or should be made more difficult to get rid of than they are at present.

Orders are therefore only requested at present as to whether

well educated. — But why they shouldn't be able to discharge the usually simple duties of a Dist. Engr. or Asst. Engr., I cannot see — natives, if properly selected & properly supervised, do well enough as Divl. officers; & I can't see why they shouldn't do well in the L.F. Engg dept. — Orders have been issued I believe as to the examns. to be passed after a competitive date by persons desiring admission into the L.F. Engg Dept. — These ought to secure the appt. of professionally competent persons. As to honesty & industry, Prests of L. Bds must keep their eyes open & look after their L.F. as well as after their other subordinates. This, however, is by the way & need not be referred to in replying to Mr. Tyson & the other memorialists.

While unable to accept Mr. Tyson's scheme, however, I think, something might be done to improve the position of the officers whom he represents. Apparently the follg. points need attention:—

Audit of accounts by the Subordinates of the A.G. instead of by those of the Examr. of P.W. Accts. This is the same complaint as recently made by Mr. Brown of Godavari, in regard to which I have already called for infn. I await this. In the meantime, I note that Mr. Tyson admits that as the audit staff has gained experience friction & difficulties have decreased.

Pension. Mr. Tyson wants a Govt. pension fund for all districts, consolidated & under Govt. management. I doubt if this is feasible. I think however that there is no doubt (1) that every Dt. Board should have a bonus or provident fund [the grant of pensions has been disallowed in consequence of the indefinite liabilities in which it might involve Local Bds]; (2) that when an officer left one district to take up service in another he should carry on with him all vague benefits as to bonuses or provident fund, leave &c which he had earned by his service in his former district. Please see how far existing arrangements conform to these two desiderata & suggest the steps to be taken to make them do so, if such is not now the case.

Powers of district Engrs. I have dealt with this question on the proposals

In the reorganization of the Sy L.F. P.W. Estts which are under discussion I can only repeat what I have said.

Mr. Tyson also urges that more latitude should be given to Dt. Bds to work up to the 20% which is the maximum allowed on L.F. P.W. Estts. As to this, I can only say that it is open to the Bds to bring forward what proposals they please. From what Mr. S. says, the subordinates in Tanjore wd. seem to be underpaid —

[illegible]
23/11/95

I am hardly prepared to commit myself definitely to any course at present - because I think before anything is done we ought to get the opinions of those interested - as their experience ought to be most useful in coming to a right decision.
I would therefore send the memorial to each Local Board President, telling him to consult his Board at once, and report their views to Govt. by Feb. 1. 1896.
The papers should also go to Col. Pennycuick for his opinion. With the opinions

I can't find the least trace in the Budget Estts of any such scheme -
[illegible]

This point shd. be hunted up. We shall thus get placed before us - we ought to be able to see what should be done to put matters on a better footing. Things are not satisfactory now - and will not be unless some change is made - whether the Engineers are natives or Europeans. What Mr. Stephens says may be very true as regards himself & the district in wh. he may be - but there are several districts where the incompetence of the engineers would nullify the good effects of any amount of additional funds if placed at their disposal.

27 Nov

it is considered desirable to enquire into the necessity of a reorganization. It is submitted that it is desirable, & it is proposed that the following officers, who have all had considerable experience of Local Boards, should be invited to express a full opinion upon all the points raised in the memorial, & to offer any suggestions that may occur to them:—

Mr. Gibson
" Arundel.
" Le Fanu.
" Winterbotham. / Willock
" Thomson
" Gabriel Stokes
" Wynne
" Atkinson.

marg. x The Govt. of Bengal might also be asked to give particulars of the scheme which is stated in the last lines of the memorial to be in force there.x Upon receipt of replies to these references, and of the opinion of the Chief Engineer which should also, it is submitted, be called for, the matter can come up for discussion in greater

x See separate paper [illegible] 30/11/95

2

36

Detail.

4 Pica

W 31/10/95

Please see the remarks of the L. F. Engr. Coimbatore in the linked file. Mr Stephen is an old D.P.W. Officer with a very good professional reputation and an extensive knowledge of both the Depts. - with which he was formerly connected and that to which he now belongs. He has very promptly put his finger on the salient blot of Mr. Gyrons proposal, and has pointed out what is one of the real reasons - and the main one - for the non success as a rule of L. F. Public works. No doubt Mr Gyrons scheme is only eminently calculated to give satisfaction to him & other L. F. Engineers but an introduction of it even in a modified form would have to be preceded by a pretty general sweep of existing L. F. Engrs many of whom are not worth the pay which they now get.

I submit that the references suggested by the U. S. may be made. Col Pennycuick will probably strangle this infant at its birth

L.D.

13/11/95.

2957 L.

FOR ORDERS.

8 Pica

Submitted to H.E. the Govr.

L.D.

25/11/95.

Submitted to Hon. Mr Grose

W.H.D.

25/11/95

10 Pica

37

11 Pica

No

margin

2957 L.

I agree with the Hon Mr Bliss that we should not recur to the system which prevailed up to 1880, but the faults of that system resulted chiefly from the facts that the D.P.W. officers entrusted with local work had other work to do in which they took more interest, that they were transferred from one district to another more frequently than was consistent with local interests, & that the allotments for local works were given out of State Fund from a distance. The scheme of the memorialists does not contemplate interfering in any way with the powers and authority vested in the Bds under the "Local Fund Act", & this will prevent the repetition of the weakest parts of the old system. Even if L. F. Engineers are placed on one list for the whole Presidency restriction might be placed on the frequency of removals from one district to another. I think it will be better to have provident funds & give bonuses on retirement rather than pensions, but it is possible that whilst Presidents "hanker" after

3

Europeand L. F. Engineers & L. F. Boards continue as is natural, to object to any great increase of pay, pensions may have to be given in some cases. The improvement of the Subordinate service is greatly called for, but that is a matter wh, in my opinion, can only be dealt with by increasing salaries & must be left entirely to L. F. Bds. The evils wh Mr Mullaly points out are simply a recapitulation of evils wh I have felt myself and heard of again & again from all the L. F. Presidents I have spoken to about the matter. He mentions the anomaly of exempting the expenditure under Grant I from such Govt Control as is given to expenditure under Grants II & III. It wd not be difficult to devise some extent of control. He also mentions the bad policy of making the President nominate & virtually appoint L. F. Engineers, — officers of high pay and position, whose qualification can only be judged by pro-

12 Pica

fessional men. This, at all events shd be put a stop to. The Nomination might be left to a Committee at Madras headed by the C. E.

At all events the state of things at present is, as the Hon Mr Bliss says, unsatisfactory & I think that, as H. E. suggests, before any orders are passed we shd get the opinion of all L. F. Bds. & the Hon Col Pennycuick (I wish we could wait for Col Pennycuick's opinion till the reports of the Presidents are submitted, but he will have left us before that time). We shd also ascertain what has been done with respect to the L. F. part of Local Fund works not only in Bengal but in the other Provinces, what the result has been, & how far it has been found possible to employ Natives as L. F. Engineers.

JG

30/11/95

Europeand L... + L.F.
Boards con...
ral, to ...
increase ...
may have ...
some ca...
of the ...
is great...
is a m...
can ...
increa...
be left...
the co...
out a...
of ...
...
& org...
presu...
abo...
the ...
the ...

Order

~~A copy of the memorial with the accompanying memorandum will be forwarded to all Presidents of Dt. Boards, who will be requested to consult their boards at an early date & report their views on the subject to the Govt. by 1st Feby. 96.~~

~~2. The papers will be forwarded to the P.W.D. with the request that the Chief Engineer will favour Govt. at an early date with his opinion on the question of reorganizing the L.F. Engineering Establishments of~~

~~3. Letter "~~

40

Re-organization Engineering Estts: of L.F.

From Orders.

H.M.

Encl in G.O. 2464 L / 21-12-95

[G./24]
500—26-6-94.

41

DEPARTMENT.

Papers to be read in Proceedings:—

3.P

Again G. O., dated 189 , No.

Again G. O., dated 189 , No.

Current Nos 2957, 2980, 2981, 2982, 2983, 2984, 2985, 3010 to 3013, 3030, 3040 to 3042, 3054, 3108, 3109 of 189 , dated from — Memorials from L.F. Engineers re Reorganization of their ~~department~~ Establishments.

Current No. 3143, 3166, 3169, 3189, 3381, 3382, 3395 of 1895, dated from

ORDER. No. 2464 L.P. D 21. 12. 1895

The papers will be forwarded to the P.W.D. with the request that the Chief Engineer will favour Govt. at an early date with his opinion ~~of~~ on the subject to which they refer.

2. A copy of the memorial, with the accompanying memorandum, will be ~~forwarded~~ transmitted to all Presidents of Dt. Boards, who will be requested to at once consult their respective Boards, & submit a report on the question of reorganizing Local Fund Engineering Establishments, which should reach Government not later than ~~1st~~ 15th February 1896.

3. The following letter will be addressed to the Governments of Bombay, Bengal, the North-West Provinces, & the Punjab.

WWD
11-xii. 95

[initials] 18/12/95

To
The Public Works Deptt. with papers in orig. & the returned } Despd 15/1/96
All Presidents of Dt. Bds } Despd 18/1/96

P.T.O.

Draft print

No 2465 d/ 21 - XII - 1895

Letter to

The Chief Secretary to { Bombay / Bengal / N.W.P / Punjab } Govt.

Sir,

A proposal having been made to reorganize the Local Fund Engineering Establishment in this Presidency, I am directed to request that with the permission of { H.E. the Govr. of Bombay in Council / His Hon. the Lieut. Govr. of Bengal / " " " the N.W.P / " " " the Punjab }

this Govt. may be furnished with information as to the organization & working or control of these establishments in { Bombay / Bengal / the N.W.P / the Punjab }

2. It is further requested that information may be given as to whether, as this Govt. is informed, any scheme is in force or under contemplation in Bengal, whereby the whole Local Fund Engineering Establishment is made pensionable

42

43

[G. / 24.] 1,000—15-11-95.

DEPARTMENT.

Papers to be read in proceedings :—

Again G.O., dated 189 , No.

Again G.O., dated 189 , No.

Current No. of 189 , dated , from

" " " 189 , " , "

" " " 189 , " , "

ORDER.

and formed into one consolidated Department which is to be placed under a professional Superintending Agency, appointed by Govt., & if such scheme is in force, as to the working of it.

I have &c

Para 2 to Bengal only

Ld 19/12/95

(from orders)

WWD

11-XII-95

Despd 11/1/96

Re-organization of L. F. Inquiries Sctts:

44

FROM ORDERS.

~~O. S.~~ H. M.

Please see the notes of H.E. the Governor & Hon. W. Grose within, upon which this Draft has been based.

W.W.D.
11.xii-95

Seen
H.P.
20/12/95