Judicial (1895) Department.

ORDINARY PRINTED.

G.O., No. 2053

DATED 4th Oct 1895

INDEXED.

[Despatch Abstract.]

JAIL DIETARY.

Approving the Inspector-General's proposal to introduce a change in the dietary in force in the Central and District Jails specified by him, and desiring the Inspector-General to watch the results of the experiment with the greatest care and to submit quarterly reports on the subject.

BACK PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

FURTHER PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.
G.O.	725.		16-4-96.				
G.O.	1197.		18-7-96.				
G.O.	1743 R		9-10-96.				
C	77		1897				

Civ 4588/77

No. 2053, JUDICIAL, 4TH OCTOBER 1895.

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS.

JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT.

READ—the following paper :—

From A. G. CARDEW, Esq., M.A., Inspector-General of Prisons, to the Chief Secretary to Government, dated Ootacamund, 20th June 1895, No. 3562.

I have the honour to address the Government on the subject of the dietary in force in central and district jails.

2. The great difference which exists between the dietary of prisoners in the jails of this Presidency and that in force in all other parts of India except Burma consists in meat ration. The following table exhibits at a glance the weekly allowance of meat or fish in the prison dietaries of the seven great provinces of India :—

	Weekly allowance of meat or fish Labouring males.
	oz.
Burma	28
Madras	15
Bombay	4 to 5
Bengal	*Nil.*
Punjab	*Nil.*
North-Western Provinces	*Nil.*
Central Provinces	*Nil.*

Throughout the greater part of India, it will be seen that no meat ration whatever is given.

3. The reason for this difference between Madras and the rest of India is not to be found in any fundamental difference in the habits of the people. There is no reliable evidence that the free inhabitants of Madras eat more meat than those of other portions of the Indian Peninsula and it is unlikely that this is the case. The conditions of Burma differ so widely from those of India proper that it may be put out of account.

4. There is, therefore, no apparent reason why the dietary of Madras jails should differ so materially in this respect from that of the rest of India. Nor has the effect of this dietary on the health of the jails in this Presidency been so uniformly satisfactory or so markedly superior to that produced by the diet scales of other provinces as to show that a dietary containing a meat ration possesses a decided advantage over a dietary without one. At the same time the cost of the meat ration forms a most material item in the expense of maintaining prisoners in this Presidency. Taking the price of mutton at 10lb. per rupee—a fair average—it will be seen that, at 15 ozs. per head per week, the cost of each prisoner's meat ration for the year comes to Rs. 4–14–0, or on a daily average population (1894) of 8,437 convicts and under-trials in central and district jails, the total cost of mutton for a year is Rs. 41,130 out of a gross outlay under rations of Rs. 2,25,268. The mutton ration thus costs 18·3 per cent., or more than one-sixth, of the total expenditure on the food of prisoners in this Presidency.

5. The dietary in force in Madras jails for native convicts contains the following articles in a week of seven days :—

168 ozs.	of grain (flour)—if sentence is under twelve months.
170 „	of „ („)—if sentence is twelve months or over.
22 „	of pulse (dâl).
42 „	of vegetables.
7 „	of salt.
3½ „	each of oil, tamarind, onions and curry powder.
15 „	of meat.

Thus the meat ration does not form more than a one-sixteenth part of the convict's fare, though it amounts to between one-fifth and one-sixth of the cost of that fare.

6. The chemical value of 15 ounces of uncooked meat without bone is 155·2 grains nitrogen and 960 grains carbon (Lewis after Parkes). The chemical value of the articles forming the weekly dietary of a Madras convict, as enumerated in the last preceding paragraph is, as follows:—

	Nitrogen GRAINS.	Carbon GRAINS.
Diet I.—Convicts sentenced to 12 months and over who receive two meals of rice and the rest raggi.	1,664	36,278
Diet II.—Convicts sentenced to under 12 months who receive no rice and all raggi	1,683	35,937
Mean ..	1,675	36,107

It is evident, at a glance, what an extremely small proportion the chemical value of the meat is of the whole ration. It forms about 9·4 per cent. of the nitrogenous constituents of the dietary and 2·6 per cent. of the carbonaceous elements. In other words this article, while costing between one-fifth and one-sixth of the total cost of a prisoner's ration, is equal to only one-sixteenth of its bulk and to between one-tenth and one-fiftieth of its chemical value.

7. In the light of these facts it is difficult to resist the conclusion, which was set forth by the Finance Committee in 1886 (note recorded in G.O., No. 1218, Financial, dated 23rd November 1886), and again by the Jail Committee in 1889 (Drs. Walker and Lethbridge's report, Chapter XX, paragraph 3) that the dietary in force in Madras jails is extravagant, in that it includes an article so expensive as meat, which is neither essential from a chemical point of view nor necessary from regard to the habits of the free population.

8. If the diet scales of the provinces in which no meat is allowed are examined, it appears that, while the cost consequent upon the use of this expensive article is avoided, the nutritive value of the dietaries is as high or higher than in Madras. This will appear from the following figures:—

Provinces,	Nutritive value of diet per diem in grains. Nitrogen.	Carbon.
North-Western Provinces	280	5,268
Punjab	303	5,469
Bengal { Diet I—Bengalies	281	5,803
{ Diet II—Biharis	322	5,803
Central Provinces—		
(with wheat)	314	4,964
(with jowar)	249	4,964
(with rice)	231	4,964
Comp. Madras .. { Diet I	238	5,182
{ Diet II	240	5,134

It will be seen that the nutritive value of the Madras dietary is decidedly less than those of the first three provinces, and about the same as that of the fourth province. The cost of rations in these provinces compares as follows:—

	Rs.	A.	P.
North-Western Provinces (1893)	18	9	7
Punjab (1893)	23	1	2
Bengal (1893)	25	0	9
Central Provinces (1893)	26	11	8
Comp. Madras, . { (1893)	27	15	5
{ (1894)	26	11	3

The fact that the higher cost shown in this Presidency is not due to want of due care and economy in purchase is proved by the facts that the rate exhibited in 1894 is the lowest on record, and that in sub-jails, with a cheaper dietary, the rate was over Rs. 40 a head.

9. In Surgeon-Major Lewis' Memorandum on Dietaries for Labouring Prisoners in Indian Jails, which was commended to the attention of Local Governments in Home Department Resolution, No. 3—114—24, dated 3rd February 1882, a comparison is carried out between the dietaries in force in English and Indian prisons. It is there shown that, taking the average weight of an Indian convict to be 110 lb., the nutritive value of the dietary required for prisoners sentenced to over four months in accordance with the scale in force in English local prisons would be 205 grains nitrogen and 3,948 grains carbon. In 1877 the Jail Conference which met at Calcutta framed a diet scale, which expressly excluded meat as a necessary article of diet and which worked out to an average nutritive value of 223 grains nitrogen and 4,755 grains carbon. Finally, the Committee on English Local Prisons, of 1877–78 stated that "there would be no difficulty in constructing a diet containing nutritive principles equal to those of meat out of oatmeal, peas, beans and fat, and this could be at a third or a fourth of the cost incurred by depending entirely upon the animal kingdom for these alimentary products." If this is possible in England, it is much more possible in India, where a majority of the population does not eat meat.

10. The Northern Provinces of India undoubtedly have an advantage over this Presidency through their being able to procure wheat, but it can easily be shown that this advantage is not so great as to necessitate the ration of meat which is now given. If meat were altogether withdrawn, and if the daily issue of dâl were raised to a uniform amount of 4 oz. per diem, 2 oz. of raggi being added to the daily ration of flour, the result would be a dietary of the nutritive value of 245 grains nitrogen and 5,509 grains carbon. But as the chemical value of the dietary is not an infallible test and has to be considered in relation with the power to digest the food valued, it appears to be the safer course, not at one entirely to abandon the meat ration, but to try the effect of reducing it. By limiting the amount of meat to a single issue once a week, a saving of 10 oz. of mutton will be effected. The issue of dâl should then be raised to 4 oz. per diem on six days of the week, remaining at 2 oz. as at present on the mutton day, while the issue of raggi should be raised by 1 oz. per diem. The nutritive value of this dietary would, then, be 241 grains nitrogen and 5,334 grains carbon against a mean value of 239 grains nitrogen and 5,159 grains carbon at present. It will be seen that the only material change in the chemical valuation is an increase in the carbonaceous elements.

(From the mean of the present two diet scales.)

11. As regards the financial effects which would result from the adoption of this proposal, the following figures show that, on an average population of 9,000 prisoners, it would produce an economy of just Rs. 20,000 per annum. The calculation is as follows:—

	Value.
Saving—10 oz. mutton per week at 10lb per rupee	One anna.
Deduct—4 additional oz. dâl at 24lb. per rupee	Two pies.
7 additional oz. raggi at 45lb. per rupee	1·86 pies.
Net saving per week	8·13 pies.

× 52 × 9000 = Rs. 19,825

There would thus be a material economy by the adoption of this modification, while it may reasonably be urged that the amount of change in the dietary is so small as to render it extremely unlikely that any prejudicial effects on health will follow.

12. It may be objected that in 1888 a somewhat similar experiment in the direction of modifying the Madras dietary was tried and was attended with unfavourable results. It is, however, I think, certain that that experiment was not a conclusive test of the dietary adopted. In the first place, as pointed out by Drs. Walker and Lethbridge (Report, Chapter XX, paragraph 11), the mistake was made of withdrawing the tamarind ration from all prisoners except those on the hardest form of labour. In the second place, the department was undergoing the transition from the contract to the departmental system of supply and neither was in proper working order. In the third place, the experiment was not properly watched, owing to the defective

system of recording weights which was in use; and lastly, in the only jail—that at Trichinopoly—in which there was serious sickness, the Medical officer was clearly to blame, as the facts noticed in Drs. Walker and Lethbridge's report, Appendix A, page CXXIII, prove. If the present proposals are sanctioned the modified diet scale would be introduced into four central jails and five district jails, as marginally noted. The effect on the health of the prisoners in these jails, as evidenced by the fortnightly weighments, would be carefully examined. All these jails are at present in a satisfactory state, and there would be no chance of any deterioration escaping early notice.

Central Jails.

Salem.	Trichinopoly.
Vellore.	Coimbatore.

District Jails.

Vizagapatam.	Tanjore.
Bellary.	Palamcottah.
Nellore.	

13. It will not, I trust, be thought that in submitting this proposal, I have made any rash assumption or have overlooked the value of a scientifically-constructed diet-scale. The modified dietary proposed tested by chemical analysis is in no way inferior to that now in use, while experience in other provinces has shown it to be compatible with good health. The amount of dâl suggested is not excessive, while the increase in grain leaves the total amount much less than in the North-Western Provinces and elsewhere. It is, of course, possible to point out directions in which the dietary could be improved, but such objections would apply equally to the present dietary, which experience has shown to be ample.

14. If approved, I would propose that the modified diet scales be applied at first only to native prisoners, and not to Burmans, who receive rice and whose position would deserve separate consideration. If the diet proved suitable for natives, the same principle might, with due modification, be applied subsequently to Burmese convicts. The calculations given in this letter apply only to hard-labour convicts, but the application of the modified diet-scale for non-labouring natives would be easy.

From Surgeon-Major-General C. SIBTHORPE, F.R.C.P.I., Surgeon-General with the Government of Madras, to the Chief Secretary to Government, dated Ootacamund, 6th August 1895, No. 552-Tour.

With reference to the correspondence on the subject of prison diets forwarded with your endorsement, No. 1534, dated 4th July 1895, herewith returned as requested, I consider the experiment suggested by the Inspector-General of Prisons might be made with advantage, but particular attention ought to be paid by the Medical officers concerned to the weighment records.

Memorandum to the Inspector-General of Prisons, dated 26th August 1895, No. 1989.

From A. G. CARDEW, Esq., M.A., Inspector-General of Prisons, to the Chief Secretary to Government, dated Ootacamund, 29th August 1895, No. 5228.

In reply to Mr. Davidson's memorandum, No. 1989, dated 26th August 1895, I have the honour to state that it is proposed to maintain the existing distinction between male convicts sentenced to hard labour and male convicts not sentenced to labour, female convicts and under-trials, in respect of the allowance of meat; that is to say, while under the proposed scale male convicts sentenced to hard labour would receive five ounces of meat once a week, male convicts not sentenced to hard labour, female convicts and under-trial prisoners would receive four ounces of meat once a week.

Order—No. 2053, Judicial, dated 4th October 1895.

The Inspector-General's proposal to introduce a change in the dietary in force in the Central and District Jails specified in paragraph 12 of his letter meets with the approval of Government. The results of the experiment should be watched with the greatest care, and the Inspector-General should submit quarterly reports on the subject.

(True Extract.)

Chief Secretary.

To the Inspector-General of Prisons.
" Surgeon-General.
" Accountant-General.

Exd. A. Baitt.

Govt. of {1895} Madras.

JUDICIAL.

Issued

Recd. *Encl.*

G.O., No. 2053, 4th October 1895.

OCTOBER.

Jail Dietary.

Approving the Inspector-General's proposal to introduce a change in the dietary in force in the Central and District Jails specified by him, and desiring the Inspector-General to watch the results of the experiment with the greatest care and to submit quarterly reports on the subject.

Gl: No. 3/106 JUDICIAL. Dept.

JAIL (1895) DEPARTMENT.

CURRENT No. 3003

From

THE INSPECTOR-GENERAL OF PRISONS,

Madras,

To

THE CHIEF SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT,

CHIEF SECRETARY'S OFFICE
22 JUN. 1895
GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS

Dated 20th June 1895.
Despatched
Received 22nd
Regd 24th

No. 3562

OFFICE OF SURGEON-GENERAL
-2 AUG. 95
WITH GOVT. OF MADRAS.

ENCLOSURES. Nil.

Subject.

Submitting with remarks a modified diet-scale to be introduced into the Central and District Jails and stating that if approved, it will be introduced first in 4 Central and 5 District Jails which are at present in a satisfactory state.

R 28/6.

23/11/86 No. 218 Jail Circular
20/2/82 No. 239 Jail S.C.

G.O. 1012: 16-5-93 Nil
467/8: 3-mar-93 Sc
110: 18 Jan 93 do
1804/5: 18 Nov 90 Sc
1219: 17 Aug 89 Sc
337: 22 Feb 89 Sc
1989: 19-9-88 Nil
1605: 31-7-88 Nil
1504: 14-7-88 "
903: 16-4-88 "
777: 31-3-88 "
2839: 21 Nov 87
2334: 17 Oct 87
2315: 13 Oct 87.
2286/7: 4 Oct 87 and
M'Carthy's Jail Report

Endorsement No. 153A

Referred to the Surgeon-General for remarks.

3/7/95 (By order)
Daniel Davidson
30-6-95
Asst. Under Secretary

Noted & recommended
4th July 1895
28/6/95.
To the Surgeon-General.

TO BE RETURNED WITH REPLY.

[Form No. (4)—250—1-1-95.]

CURRENT NO. 3003

No. 3562. OFFICE OF THE INSPECTOR-GENERAL OF PRISONS, MADRAS.

Dated Ootacamund, the 20th June 1895.

From

A. G. CARDEW, ESQ., M.A.,

INSPECTOR-GENERAL OF PRISONS,

MADRAS,

To

THE HONOURABLE MR. *T. F Price CSI*

CHIEF SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT,

SIR,

Enclosures.

I have the honour to address the Government on the subject of the dietary in force in Central and District Jails.

2. The great difference which exists between the dietary of Prisoners in the Jails of this Presidency and that in force in all other parts of India except Burma consists in Meat Ration. The following table exhibits at a glance the weekly allowance of meat or fish in the Prison dietaries of the seven great provinces of India:—

	Weekly allowance of meat or fish Labouring males.
Burma	28 ozs
Madras	15 ozs
Bombay	4 to 5 ozs
Bengal	Nil
Punjab	Nil
North Western Provinces	Nil
Central Provinces	Nil

Throughout the greater part of India, it will be seen that no meat ration whatever is given.

2. The reason for this difference between Madras and

and the rest of India is not to be found in any fundamental difference in the habits of the people. There is no reliable evidence that the free inhabitants of Madras eat more meat than those of other portions of the Indian Peninsula and it is unlikely that this is the case. The conditions of Burma differ so widely from those of India proper that it may be put out of account.

4. There is, therefore, no apparent reason why the dietary of Madras Jails should differ so materially in this respect from that of the rest of India. Nor has the effect of this dietary on the health of the Jails in this Presidency been so uniformly satisfactory or so markedly superior to that produced by the diet scales of other Provinces as to show that a dietary containing a meat-ration possesses a decided advantage over a dietary without one. At the same time the cost of the meat ration forms a most material item in the expense of maintaining prisoners in this Presidency. Taking the price of mutton at 10 lbs per rupee, a fair average, it will be seen that, at 15 ozs per head per week, the cost of each prisoner's meat ration for the year comes to Rs 4/14, or on a daily average population (1894) of 8,437 Convicts and undertrials in Central and District Jails, the total cost of mutton for a year is Rs 41,130 out of a gross outlay under Rations of Rs 225,268. The mutton-ration thus costs 18.3 per Cent or more than one-sixth of the total expenditure on the food of prisoners in this Presidency.

5. The dietary in force in Madras Jails for Native Convicts contains the following articles in a week of 7 days:—

168 ozs of grain (flour) - if sentence is under 12 months.
170 ozs of grain (flour) - if sentence is 12 months or over.
22 ozs of pulse (dâl)
42 ozs of Vegetables
7 ozs Salt
3½ ozs each of oil, tamarind, onions and Curry powder
15 ozs of meat.

Thus the meat-ration does not form more than a one-sixteenth part of the Convicts fare, though it amounts to between one-fifth and one-sixth of the cost of that fare.

6. The chemical value of 15 ozs of uncooked meat without bone is 155.2 grains nitrogen and 960 grains carbon (Lewis after Parkes). The chemical value of the articles forming the weekly dietary of a Madras Convict, as enumerated in the last-preceding paragraph, is as follows:—

		Nitrogen grains.	Carbon grains.
Diet I	Convicts sentenced to 12 months and over who receive 2 meals of rice and the rest raggi	1,664	36,278
		238	5,183
Diet II	Convicts sentenced to under 12 months who receive no rice and all raggi	1,683	35,937
	Mean	1675	36,107

It is evident, at a glance, what an extremely small proportion the chemical value of the meat is of the whole ration. It forms about 9.4 per Cent of the nitrogenous constituents of the dietary and 2.6 per cent of the carbonaceous elements. In other words this article, while costing between one-fifth and one-sixth of the total cost of a Prisoner's ration, is equal to only one-Sixteenth of its bulk and to between one-tenth and one-fiftieth of its chemical value.

7. In the light of these facts it is difficult to resist the conclusion, which was set forth by the Finance Committee in 1886 (Note recorded in G.O. 23rd November 1886 No 1218 Fmce) and again by the Jail Committee in 1889 (Drs Walker and Lethbridge's Report—Chapter XX - para 3) that the dietary in force in Madras Jails is extravagant, in that it includes an article so expensive as meat, which is neither essential from a chemical point of view nor necessary from regard to the habits of the free population.

8. If the diet-scales of the Provinces in which no meat

meat is allowed are examined, it appears that while the cost consequent upon the use of this expensive article is avoided, the nutritive value of the dietaries is as high or higher than in Madras. This will appear from the following figures:—

Provinces.	Nutritive value of Diet per diem in grains	
	Nitrogen	Carbon.
North western Provinces	280	5,268
Punjab	303	5,469
Bengal Dist I Bengalis	281	5,803
—do— Dist II Baharis	322	5,803
Central Provinces (with wheat)	314	4,964
(with jowar)	249	4,964
(with rice)	231	4,964
Comp Madras Dist I	238	5,782
Dist II	240	5,734

It will be seen that the Nutritive value of the Madras dietary is decidedly less than those of the first three Provinces, and about the same as that of the fourth Province. The cost of rations in these Provinces compares as follows:—

North western Provinces (1893) — Rs. 18-9-7
Punjab (1893) — Rs. 23. 1. 2
Bengal (1893) — Rs. 25-0-9
Central Provinces (1893) — Rs. 26-11-8
Comp Madras { 1893 — Rs. 27-15-5
1894 — Rs. 26-11-3.

The fact that the higher cost shown in this Presidency is not due to want of due care and economy in purchase is proved by the facts that the rate exhibited in 1894 is the lowest on record, and that in Subjails, with a cheaper dietary, the rate was over Rs. 40/ a head.

9. In Surgeon Major Lewis' Memorandum on Dietaries for Labouring Prisoners in Indian Jails, which was commended to the attention of Local Governments in Home Department Resolution No 3-114-24 dated 3rd February 1882, a comparison is carried out between the dietaries in force in English and Indian Prisons. It is there shown that taking the average weight of an Indian Convict to be 110 lbs, the nutritive value of the dietary required for prisoners sentenced to over 4 months in accordance with the scale in force in English Local Prisons would be 205 grains nitrogen and 3948 grains Carbon. In 1877 the Jail Conference which met at Calcutta framed a diet scale, which expressly excluded meat as a necessary article of diet and which worked out to an average nutritive value of 223 grains Nitrogen and 4755 grains Carbon. Finally the Committee on English Local Prison of 1877-78 stated that "there would be no difficulty in constructing a diet containing nutritive principles equal to those of meat, out of oatmeal, peas, beans and fat, and this could be done at a third or a fourth of the cost incurred by depending entirely upon the animal kingdom for these alimentary products". If this is possible in England, it is much more possible in India, where a majority of the population does not eat meat.

10. The northern provinces of India undoubtedly have an advantage over this Presidency through their being able to procure wheat, but it can easily be shown that this advantage is not so great as to necessitate the ration of meat which is now given. If meat were altogether withdrawn, and if the daily issue of dâl were raised to a uniform amount of 4 ozs per diem, two ozs of raggi being added to the daily ration of flour, the result would be a dietary of the nutritive value of 245 grains nitrogen and 5,509 grains carbon. But as the chemical value of the dietary is not an infallible test, and has to be considered in relation with the power to digest the food valued, it appears to be the safer course not at once entirely to abandon the meat ration, but to try the effect of reducing it. By limiting the amount of meat to a single issue once a week, a saving of 10 ozs of Mutton will be effected. The issue of dâl should then be

(From the mean of the present two diet scales).

be raised to 4 ozs per diem on 6 days of the week, remaining at 20 ozs, as at present on the mutton day, while the issue of raggi should be raised by one oz: per diem. The nutritive value of this dietary would, then, be 241 grains nitrogen and 5334 grains carbon against a mean value of 239 grs nitrogen and 5759 grains carbon at present. It will be seen that the only material change in the chemical valuation is an increase in the carbonaceous elements.

11. As regards the financial effects which would result from the adoption of this proposal, the following figure show that, on an average population of 9000 prisoners it would produce an economy of just Rs. 20,000 per annum. The calculation is as follows:—

	value
Saving 10 ozs Mutton per week at 10 lbs per rupee —	one anna.
Deduct 4 additional ozs dâl at 24 lbs per rupee	two pies
" 7 additional ozs raggi at 45 lbs. per rupee	1·86 pies
Net saving per week —	8·13 pies

×52×9,000 = Rs. 19,825

There would thus be a material economy by the adoption of this modification, while it may reasonably be urged that the amount of change in the dietary is so small as to render it extremely unlikely that any prejudicial effects on health will follow.

12. It may be objected that in 1888 a somewhat similar experiment in the direction of modifying the Madras dietary was tried and was attended with unfavourable results. It is, however, I think certain that that experiment was not a conclusive test of the dietary adopted. In the first place, as pointed out by Drs Walker and Lethbridge (Report Chapter XX para 11) the mistake was made of withdrawing the tamarind ration from all prisoners except those on the hardest form of labour. In the second place the department was undergoing the transition from the contract to the departmental system of supply and neither was in proper working order. In the third place the experiment was not properly watched, owing the defective system of recording weights which was in use; and lastly, in the only Jail, that at Trichinopoly in which there was serious sickness, the Medical officer was clearly to blame, as the facts noticed in Drs Walker and Lethbridge's Report, Appendix A page CXXIII prove. If the present proposals are sanctioned the modified diet scale would be introduced into 4 Central Jails and 5 District Jails, as marginally noted. The effect on the health of the prisoners in these Jails, as evidenced by the fortnightly weighments, would be carefully examined. All these Jails are at present in a satisfactory state, and there would be no chance of any deterioration escaping early notice.

Central Jails: Salem, Vellore, Trichinopoly, Coimbatore.

District Jails: Vizagapatam, Bellary, Nellore, Tanjore, Salamcottah.

13. It will not, I trust, be thought that in submitting this proposal, I have made any rash assumption or have overlooked the value of a scientifically constructed diet-scale. The modified dietary proposed tested by chemical analysis is in no way inferior to that now in use, while experience in other provinces has shown it to be compatible with good health. The amount of dâl suggested is not excessive, while the increase in grain leaves the total amount much less than in the North-Western Provinces and elsewhere. It is, of course, possible to point out directions in which the dietary could be improved, but such objections would apply equally to the present dietary, which experience has shown to be ample.

14. If approved, I would propose that the modified diet scales be applied at first only to Native prisoners, and not to Burmans, who receive

receive rice and whose position would deserve separate consideration. If the diet proved suitable for Natives the same principle might with due modification, be applied subsequently to Burmese Convicts. The Calculations given in this Letter apply only to hard labour Convicts, but the application of the modified diet scale for Non. labouring natives would be easy.

I have the honour to be,
Sir,
Your Most Obdt. Servt.

A. G. Cardew
Inspr. Genl. of Prisons.

CURRENT NO. 3739

OFFICE OF SURGEON-GENERAL
WITH THE GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS,

No. 1015
Encl. 532

Ootacamund 6th August 1895.

From

SURGEON-MAJOR-GENERAL C. SIBTHORPE, F.R.C.P.I.,
SURGEON-GENERAL WITH THE
GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS,

To

~~Madras,~~

THE Hon'ble the Chief Secretary to Government.
Judicial Department.

SIR,

With reference to the correspondence on the subject of Prison diets forwarded with your Endorsement No. 1534 dated 4th July 1895; herewith returned as requested, I consider the experiment suggested by the Inspector General of Prisons might be made with advantage but particular attention ought to be paid by the Medical officers concerned to the weighment records

I have the honour to be,
Sir,
Your most obedient Servant,

C. Sibthorpe
Surgn.-Major-Genl.,
Surgeon-General with the Govt. of Madras,

10 S.G.—1,500—2-2-95.

CURRENT NO. 3739

Judicial (1895) DEPARTMENT.

Ref. to 3003 1534/95

Papers

From

SURGEON-MAJOR-GENL. C. SIBTHORPE, F.R.C.P.I.,

SURGEON-GENERAL WITH THE

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS,

~~Madras~~,

To

No. Jail 532

ENCLOSURE. C.No. 3003 etc.

Dated 1st August 1895.

Received 7th

No.

CHIEF SECRETARIAT MADRAS 7 AUG 95

SUBJECT.

Returns & endorsement No. 1534 of 4th July 1895 re. the modified diet scale to be introduced into the Central & District Jails with remarks

Copy then to print with the papers

[illegible] 9/8/95

To be put in type.

9/8/95

[G/69]

1,000—18-3-95.

Judl. DEPARTMENT.

CHIEF SECRETARIAT MADRAS.

Memorandum. C. Nos 3003 & 3739. No. 1989

dt 26-8-95

Read the following

& vide Jail Code Rule 428.

It is observed that, under the existing scale, meat ration is now allowed at 6 oz. to native male convicts sentenced to rigorous imprisonment at the rate of 5 oz a day, and 6(2) undertrial prisoners, native female convicts, & male convicts sentenced to simple imprisonment at the rate of 4 oz a day. The Govt. of Madras is requested to report, with reference to para 10 of his letter dt 20. June 95. No 3562, whether it is proposed to maintain this distinction as regards the issue of meat to these classes of prisoners in future or [illegible]

Re Jail retary

unless they are restricted to five ounces per week. of 5 oz a week to which reference is intended to apply to all convicts and undertrial prisoners confined in central & District Jails

A.
24/8/95
To Mr Dgl. y Prisons

A.
24/8/95

Copy
Mr
5/8/95

Form No. 1-A—1,000—25-10-93.

4161

Ootacamand Prisons
Office of Inspector-General of ~~Jails~~,
Dated 29th August 1895.

No. 5228

From

A. G. CARDEW, Esq., M.A.,

Inspector-General of ~~Jails~~, Prisons.

To

The CHIEF SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT.

Sir,

Enclosures.

In reply to Mr Davidson's Memorandum, No 1989, dated 26th August 1895, I have the honour to state that it is proposed to maintain the existing distinction between male Convicts sentenced to hard labour and male convicts not sentenced to labour, Female Convicts and Undertrials in respect of the allowance of meat, that is to say while, under the proposed scale male Convicts sentenced to hard labour would receive 5 ozs of meat once a week, male Convicts not sentenced to hard labour, Female Convicts and Undertrial prisoners would receive 4 ozs of meat once a week.

I have the honor to be,

Sir,

Your most obedient Servant,

A G Cardew
Inspector-General of ~~Jails~~ Prisons.

4161 Rpt. No. 939/95 + papers.

JUDICIAL.

JAIL (1895) DEPARTMENT.

From

THE INSPECTOR-GENERAL OF ~~JAILS~~, Prisons

To

THE CHIEF SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT.

CHIEF SECRETARY 30 AUG. 1895 GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS

Dated 29th
Despatched } August 1895.
Received 30

Rep. 3/9

No. 5228

ENCLOSURES. nil.

Subject.

States that it is proposed to maintain the existing distinction between Male Convicts sentenced to hard labour and male Convicts not sentenced to labour Female Convicts and Under-trials in respect of the allowance of meat.

(4 Oct.) 1 p 53

TH AUGUST 1895, No. , JUDICIAL.

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS.

JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT.

READ—the following paper:—

From A. G. CARDEW, Esq., M.A., Inspector-General of Prisons, to the Chief Secretary to Government, dated Ootacamund, 20th June 1895, No. 3562.

I have the honour to address the Government on the subject of the dietary in force in central and district jails.

2. The great difference which exists between the dietary of prisoners in the jails of this Presidency and that in force in all other parts of India except Burma consists in meat ration. The following table exhibits at a glance the weekly allowance of meat or fish in the prison dietaries of the seven great provinces of India:—

	Weekly allowance of meat or fish. Labouring males.
	oz.
Burma	28
Madras	15
Bombay	4 to 5
Bengal	*Nil.*
Punjab	*Nil.*
North-Western Provinces	*Nil.*
Central Provinces	*Nil.*

Throughout the greater part of India, it will be seen that no meat ration whatever is given.

3. The reason for this difference between Madras and the rest of India is not to be found in any fundamental difference in the habits of the people. There is no reliable evidence that the free inhabitants of Madras eat more meat than those of other portions of the Indian Peninsula and it is unlikely that this is the case. The conditions of Burma differ so widely from those of India proper that it may be put out of account.

4. There is, therefore, no apparent reason why the dietary of Madras jails should differ so materially in this respect from that of the rest of India. Nor has the effect of this dietary on the health of the jails in this Presidency been so uniformly satisfactory or so markedly superior to that produced by the diet scales of other provinces as to show that a dietary containing a meat ration possesses a decided advantage over a dietary without one. At the same time the cost of the meat ration forms a most material item in the expense of maintaining prisoners in this Presidency. Taking the price of mutton at 10lb. per rupee—a fair average—it will be seen that, at 15ozs. per head per week, the cost of each prisoner's meat ration for the year comes to Rs. 4-14-0, or on a daily average population (1894) of 8,437 convicts and under-trials in central and district jails, the total cost of mutton for a year is Rs. 41,130 out of a gross outlay under rations of Rs. 2,25,268. The mutton ration thus costs 18·3 per cent., or more than one-sixth, of the total expenditure on the food of prisoners in this Presidency.

5. The dietary in force in Madras jails for native convicts contains the following articles in a week of seven days:—

168 ozs.	of grain (flour)—if sentence is under twelve months.
170 „	of „ („)—if sentence is twelve months or over.
22 „	of pulse (dâl).
42 „	of vegetables.
7 „	of salt.
3½ „	each of oil, tamarind, onions and curry powder.
15 „	of meat.

Thus the meat ration does not form more than a one-sixteenth part of the convict's fare, though it amounts to between one-fifth and one-sixth of the cost of that fare.

6. The chemical value of 15 ounces of uncooked meat without bone is 155·2 grains nitrogen and 960 grains carbon (Lewis after Parkes). The chemical value of the articles forming the weekly dietary of a Madras convict, as enumerated in the last preceding paragraph is, as follows:—

	Nitrogen GRAINS.	Carbon GRAINS.
Diet I.—Convicts sentenced to 12 months and over who receive two meals of rice and the rest raggi.	1,664	36,278
Diet II.—Convicts sentenced to under 12 months who receive no rice and all raggi	1,683	35,937
Mean ..	1,675	36,107

It is evident, at a glance, what an extremely small proportion the chemical value of the meat is of the whole ration. It forms about 9·4 per cent. of the nitrogenous constituents of the dietary and 2·6 per cent. of the carbonaceous elements. In other words this article, while costing between one-fifth and one-sixth of the total cost of a prisoner's ration, is equal to only one-sixteenth of its bulk and to between one-tenth and one-fiftieth of its chemical value.

7. In the light of these facts it is difficult to resist the conclusion, which was set forth by the Finance Committee in 1886 (note recorded in G.O., 23rd November 1886, No. 1218, Financial), and again by the Jail Committee in 1889 (Drs. Walker and Lethbridge's report, Chapter XX, paragraph 3) that the dietary in force in Madras jails is extravagant, in that it includes an article so expensive as meat, which is neither essential from a chemical point of view nor necessary from regard to the habits of the free population.

8. If the diet scales of the provinces in which no meat is allowed are examined, it appears that, while the cost consequent upon the use of this expensive article is avoided, the nutritive value of the dietaries is as high or higher than in Madras. This will appear from the following figures:—

Provinces.	Nutritive value of diet per diem in grains. Nitrogen.	Carbon.
North-Western Provinces	280	5,268
Punjab	303	5,469
Bengal { Diet I—Bengalies	281	5,803
Bengal { Diet II—Biharis	322	5,803
Central Provinces—		
(with wheat)	314	4,964
(with jowar)	249	4,964
(with rice)	231	4,964
Comp. Madras .. { Diet I	238	5,182
Comp. Madras .. { Diet II	240	5,134

It will be seen that the nutritive value of the Madras dietary is decidedly less than those of the first three provinces, and about the same as that of the fourth province. The cost of rations in these provinces compares as follows:—

	Rs.	A.	P.
North-Western Provinces (1893)	18	9	7
Punjab (1893)	23	1	2
Bengal (1893)	25	0	9
Central Provinces (1893)	26	11	8
Comp. Madras { (1893)	27	15	5
Comp. Madras { (1894)	26	11	3

The fact that the higher cost shown in this Presidency is not due to want of due care and economy in purchase is proved by the facts that the rate exhibited in 1894 is the lowest on record, and that in sub-jails, with a cheaper dietary, the rate was over Rs. 40 a head.

9. In Surgeon-Major Lewis' Memorandum on Dietaries for Labouring Prisoners in Indian Jails, which was commended to the attention of Local Governments in Home

Department Resolution, No. 3—114—24, dated 3rd February 1882, a comparison is carried out between the dietaries in force in English and Indian prisons. It is there shown that, taking the average weight of an Indian convict to be 110 lb., the nutritive value of the dietary required for prisoners sentenced to over four months in accordance with the scale in force in English local prisons would be 205 grains nitrogen and 3,948 grains carbon. In 1877 the Jail Conference which met at Calcutta framed a diet scale, which expressly excluded meat as a necessary article of diet and which worked out to an average nutritive value of 223 grains nitrogen and 4,755 grains carbon. Finally, the Committee on English Local Prisons, of 1877–78 stated that "there would be no difficulty in constructing a diet containing nutritive principles equal to those of meat out of oatmeal, peas, beans and fat, and this could be at a third or a fourth of the cost incurred by depending entirely upon the animal kingdom for these alimentary products." If this is possible in England, it is much more possible in India, where a majority of the population does not eat meat.

10. The Northern Provinces of India undoubtedly have an advantage over this Presidency through their being able to procure wheat, but it can easily be shown that this advantage is not so great as to necessitate the ration of meat which is now given. If meat were altogether withdrawn, and if the daily issue of dâl were raised to a uniform amount of 4 oz. per diem, 2 oz. of raggi being added to the daily ration of flour, the result would be a dietary of

(From the mean of the present two diet scales.)

the nutritive value of 245 grains nitrogen and 5,509 grains carbon. But as the chemical value of the dietary is not an infallible test and has to be considered in relation with the power to digest the food valued, it appears to be the safer course, not at once entirely to abandon the meat ration, but to try the effect of reducing it. By limiting the amount of meat to a single issue once a week, a saving of 10 oz. of mutton will be effected. The issue of dâl should then be raised to 4 oz. per diem on six days of the week, remaining at 2 oz. as at present on the mutton day, while the issue of raggi should be raised by 1 oz. per diem. The nutritive value of this dietary would, then, be 241 grains nitrogen and 5,334 grains carbon against a mean value of 239 grains nitrogen and 5,159 grains carbon at present. It will be seen that the only material change in the chemical valuation is an increase in the carbonaceous elements.

11. As regards the financial effects which would result from the adoption of this proposal, the following figures show that, on an average population of 9,000 prisoners, it would produce an economy of just Rs. 20,000 per annum. The calculation is as follows :—

	Value.
Saving—10 oz. mutton per week at 10 lb. per rupee	One anna.
Deduct—4 additional oz. dâl at 24 lb. per rupee	Two pies.
7 additional oz. raggi at 45 lb. per rupee	1·86 pies.
Net saving per week	8·13 pies.

× 52 × 9000 = Rs. 19,825

There would thus be a material economy by the adoption of this modification, while it may reasonably be urged that the amount of change in the dietary is so small as to render it extremely unlikely that any prejudicial effects on health will follow.

12. It may be objected that in 1888 a somewhat similar experiment in the direction of modifying the Madras dietary was tried and was attended with unfavourable results. It is, however, I think, certain that that experiment was not a conclusive test of the dietary adopted. In the first place, as pointed out by Drs. Walker and Lethbridge (Report, Chapter XX, paragraph 11), the mistake was made of withdrawing the tamarind ration from all prisoners except those on the hardest form of labour. In the second place, the department was undergoing the transition from the contract

to the departmental system of supply and neither was in proper working order. In the third place, the experiment was not properly watched, owing to the defective system of recording weights which was in use; and lastly, in the only jail—that at Trichinopoly—in which there was serious sickness, the Medical officer was clearly to blame, as the facts noticed in Drs. Walker and Lethbridge's report, Appendix A, page CXXIII, prove. If the present proposals are sanctioned the modified diet scale would be introduced into four central jails and five district jails, as marginally noted. The effect on the health of the prisoners in these jails, as evidenced by the fortnightly weighments, would be carefully examined. All these jails are at present in a satisfactory state, and there would be no chance of any deterioration escaping early notice.

Central Jails.	
Salem.	Trichinopoly.
Vellore.	Coimbatore.
District Jails.	
Vizagapatam.	Tanjore.
Bellary.	Palamcottah.
Nellore.	

13. It will not, I trust, be thought that in submitting this proposal, I have made any rash assumption or have overlooked the value of a scientifically-constructed diet-scale. The modified dietary proposed tested by chemical analysis is in no way inferior to that now in use, while experience in other provinces has shown it to be compatible with good health. The amount of dâl suggested is not excessive, while the increase in grain leaves the total amount much less than in the North-Western Provinces and elsewhere. It is, of course, possible to point out directions in which the dietary could be improved, but such objections would apply equally to the present dietary, which experience has shown to be ample.

14. If approved, I would propose that the modified diet scales be applied at first only to native prisoners, and not to Burmans, who receive rice and whose position would deserve separate consideration. If the diet proved suitable for natives, the same principle might, with due modification, be applied subsequently to Burmese convicts. The calculations given in this letter apply only to hard-labour convicts, but the application of the modified diet-scale for non-labouring natives would be easy.

From Surgeon-Major-General C. SIBTHORPE, F.R.C.P.I., Surgeon-General with the Government of Madras, to the Chief Secretary to Government, dated Ootacamund, 6th August 1895, No. 552-Tour.

With reference to the correspondence on the subject of prison diets forwarded with your endorsement, No. 1534, dated 4th July 1895, herewith returned as requested, I consider the experiment suggested by the Inspector-General of Prisons might be made with advantage, but particular attention ought to be paid by the Medical officers concerned to the weighment records.

[G/2]
900—23-7-95.

Jail Department.

C. Nos 3003, 3739 & 4161.

FOR ORDERS.

In the first of the foregoing papers the Surgn. Genl of Prisons discusses the question whether the issue of a meat ration is essential to the health of the native Prisoners in the Central & N.W. Jails in this Presy. and arrives at the conclusion that it is not. He compares the nutritive value of the Madras dietary which includes meat, with that of the Dietaries of Bengal, the Punjab, the North-West and the Central Provinces which do not include that ration and demonstrates that, while the cost of the Madras dietary is higher than that of those dietaries of the Provinces, its nutritive value is

P.T.O.

decidedly inferior to those of Bengal, the Punjab and the N.W. and about the same as that of the Central Provinces. With a view therefore of reducing the comparative expensiveness of the Madras dietary without at the same time impairing its nutritive value, Mr Carleton proposes a slight modification in the existing diet scale, by limiting the meat ration to a single issue per week (instead of, as now, to 3 times) and by raising the issue of dâl (pulse) by 2 ozs on the nine days of the week on which the issue of rasi by an oz more on all the days of the week. The Surgeon-General is in favour of dispensing with the meat ration altogether, but, as a measure of precaution ~~as a precaution~~ ~~of the practice~~ ~~suggested in the proceedings~~, he desires first to see the effects of reducing it before recommending the adoption of that course. As an additional precaution he would in the first instance apply the modified diet scale only

FOR ORDERS.

× at the rate of 5 ozs to male convicts sentenced to hard labour & 4 ozs to others.

× Central Jails: Salem, Vellore, Trichinopoly, Coimbatore. District Jails: Nagapatam, Bellary, Cuddapah, Tanjore, Palamcottah.

2

to native prisoners and not to Burman convicts (who now receive rice & whose cases would therefore seem to deserve separate consideration) and would introduce it only into the marginally noted Central and District jails which now appear to be in a satisfactory condition.

2. These proposals were referred to the Surgeon-General who recommends their adoption as an experimental measure. He however desires that particular attention should be paid by the Medical officers concerned to the weighments & records.

3. The present and the proposed diet scales in the Central & the District Jails in this Presidency are compared below: —

P.T.O.

Male 4 as 9th Jail Code

Articles of diet	Present scale	Proposed scale.
	Per week	Per week
Grain (flour)	For male convicts sentenced to rigorous imprisonment for less than 12 months ..... 168 ozs.	" ... Do ..... 175 ozs.
	—— Do —— for 12 months & upwards ... 170 "	" —— Do .... 177 "
	For male convicts sentenced to simple imprisonment for less than 12 months & female convicts under trial prisoners & female convicts —— Do —— for 12 months & upwards — 140 " — 142 "	" —— Do —— ..... 147 " ..... 149 "
Dál (pulse)	" " " 22 "	" " " " 26 "
Oil, tamarind, onions & curry powder.	" " " 3½ "	" " " " 3½ "
Salt	" " " 7 "	" " " " 7 "
Vegetables	" " " 42 "	" " " " 42 "
Garlic	" " " 90 grains	" " " " 30 grains
Meat.	For males sentenced to hard labour ..... 15 ozs.	Do . Do ... . 0 ozs.
	For males —— to simple imprisonment, Undertrials & female convicts — 12 ozs.	—— 4 ozs.

Note

Brahmins and other non-meat-eating castes are allowed 1 oz of Dál per day extra on every day except Sunday and 1 oz of oil extra on meat days in lieu of mutton. (Vide Rule 430 of the Jail Code)

2. From the above it will be seen that the modifications in the existing diet scale consists in the issue of —

(a) grain — 7 ozs extra per week
Dál — 4 " —— do —
to all prisoners in the Central & Dt. Jails

3

(b) meat — 10 ozs less per week to all male convicts sentenced to hard labour.
—— — 8 ozs less per week to all other convicts
Garlic — 60 grains less per week to all convicts.

3. In para 11 of his letter of 20. June last, No 3562, the Insp.-Genl. calculates the financial effects involved in the adoption of his proposals. According to his estimate there will be a net saving of ₹ per week of 8. 13 pies on each convict and the total saving that will accrue on an average population of 900 prisoners will be about Rs 20,000 per annum. This estimate however is not quite correct for the following reasons: —

(i) The saving of mutton has been taken at a uniform rate of 10 ozs per man per week. But, as shown above, this saving will result only in the case of male convicts sentenced to hard labour. In the case of others the saving will be

p.t.

only 8 ozs per man per week.

(ii) The estimate does not take into account the saving in rotten, slight though it may be, in the issue of garlic.

Further, the financial effect has been calculated on an average population of 9000 prisoners, but, considering that a meat ration is not issued to Brahmins & the other non-meat-eating classes and that the proposed dietary is to be introduced at present only in a few Central and District Jails, it would have been better if these factors had been taken into account and the Supdt. Jail had submitted an estimate showing the immediate saving that would accrue by the adoption of his proposals — sufficient data are not available in the office to frame such an estimate, but there seems to be little doubt that the result of the experiment will be

*

Saving — 10 ozs mutton per week value Rs 10 the per rupee — nearly

" — 60 grs or $\frac{3}{350}$ lb garlic per week at 2 annas per lb — ·21 pies

Deduct — 4 ozs dal at 24 lb per rupee — 2 pies

" — 7 ozs rajgi at 45 lb per rupee — 1·87 pies

Net saving per week — 8·34 pies

— per annum — Rs 2-4-2

†

Saving — 8 ozs mutton — 9·6 pies

" — 60 grs or ⅛ oz garlic — " ·21 pies

Deduct — 4 ozs dal — 2 pies

" — 7 ozs rajgi — 1·87 pies

Net saving per week — 5·94 pies

— per annum — Rs 1-9-9

D

a saving to the State of about Rs 2-4-2 per annum per head in the case of male convicts sentenced to hard labour and of about Rs †1-9-9 D in the case of others.

5. A somewhat similar experiment of modifying the dietary was tried in 1888 in certain selected Jails in accordance with S. O. of 13 Oct. 87, No 2315. The experiment however was not everywhere successful and in S. O. of 22 Feb 89, No 337, it was ordered to be abandoned. Mr Carlyle points out that the failure on that occasion was not due to any inherent defect in the dietary adopted, but was attributable to the following causes:—

(a) The withdrawal of the tamarind ration from all prisoners except those on the hardest form of labour;

(b) The transition from the contract to the Departmental system of supply

P.T.O.

which the Jail Department was then undergoing;

(c) the insufficient working of the Dept. as a whole at that time and the defective system of recording weights which was then in vogue.

He adds that the unfavourable results shown by the Trichinopoly Central Jail — which, however, was not the only Jail wherein serious sickness occurred as the I. Genl states — was due to the negligence of the Medical Officer.

His circumstances have since very much altered and the conditions under which the proposed dietary will be introduced will be far different to those which existed ~~existed~~ in 1888. The Departmental system of supply has now been established on a firm footing; greater attention is now bestowed to the treatment of the prisoners in Jails and perhaps a certain

DS

I should let him try the experiment, but he should watch the results closely & report on them quarterly for further orders, until we see what they turn out to be.

DS
27/9/95

more rigorous supervision is exercised over the working of the Dept. The Tamarind rasam is to be continued unaltered in the proposed diet. In these circumstances there will probably be less chance of any unfavourable results attending the experiment escaping notice at the earliest opportunity and there will therefore be less risk in its introduction as proposed by the Surgn. Genl. It may perhaps be desirable to call for half-yearly reports for the present on the working of the new scheme.

D
28.9.95

DS
19/9/95

The proposed change seems certainly a very desirable one of any on the score of making Jail life popular. There can be no doubt that there will be an appreciable saving though no so much as the I.G. anticipates

DS
26/9/95

Jail dietary

A. M.

(From orders)

C 27/9.
BP 28/9

G.O. 2053
4.10.95 Jud.

[G. 24.]
600—8.3.95.

Papers to be read in proceedings: Judl. DEPARTMENT.

18

Again G.O., dated 189 , No.

Again G.O., dated 189 , No.

A — Current No. 3003 of 1895, dated 20.6.95 from I. G. of Prisons

A — " " 3739 " 1895 " 6.8.95 " Surgeon-General

Q Govt. Ref. No. 1989 dated 26.8.95

A Current No. 4161 of 1895, dated 29.8.95 from I. G. of Prisons.

ORDER. 24-10-95 No. 2053

P.S.

The I. G's proposal to introduce a change in the dietary in force in the Central and District Jails specified in para 12 of his letter meets with the approval of Govt. The results of the experiment should be watched with the greatest care and the I. G. should submit quarterly reports on the subject.

(From orders)

D
17/10/95

H
31/10/95.

To

The I. G. of Prisons
The S.G.
Asst Surg

Despd 22/10/95

Jail dietary

(From Orders)

No. 2053, JUDICIAL, 4TH OCTOBER 1895.

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS.

JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT.

READ—the following paper :—

From A. G. CARDEW, Esq., M.A., Inspector-General of Prisons, to the Chief Secretary to Government, dated Ootacamund, 20th June 1895, No. 3562.

I have the honour to address the Government on the subject of the dietary in force in central and district jails.

2. The great difference which exists between the dietary of prisoners in the jails of this Presidency and that in force in all other parts of India except Burma consists in meat ration. The following table exhibits at a glance the weekly allowance of meat or fish in the prison dietaries of the seven great provinces of India :—

	Weekly allowance of meat or fish. Labouring males.
	oz.
Burma	28
Madras	15
Bombay	4 to 5
Bengal	*Nil.*
Punjab	*Nil.*
North-Western Provinces	*Nil.*
Central Provinces	*Nil.*

Throughout the greater part of India, it will be seen that no meat ration whatever is given.

3. The reason for this difference between Madras and the rest of India is not to be found in any fundamental difference in the habits of the people. There is no reliable evidence that the free inhabitants of Madras eat more meat than those of other portions of the Indian Peninsula and it is unlikely that this is the case. The conditions of Burma differ so widely from those of India proper that it may be put out of account.

4. There is, therefore, no apparent reason why the dietary of Madras jails should differ so materially in this respect from that of the rest of India. Nor has the effect of this dietary on the health of the jails in this Presidency been so uniformly satisfactory or so markedly superior to that produced by the diet scales of other provinces as to show that a dietary containing a meat ration possesses a decided advantage over a dietary without one. At the same time the cost of the meat ration forms a most material item in the expense of maintaining prisoners in this Presidency. Taking the price of mutton at 10lb. per rupee—a fair average—it will be seen that, at 15 ozs. per head per week, the cost of each prisoner's meat ration for the year comes to Rs. 4–14–0, or on a daily average population (1894) of 8,437 convicts and under-trials in central and district jails, the total cost of mutton for a year is Rs. 41,130 out of a gross outlay under rations of Rs. 2,25,268. The mutton ration thus costs 18·3 per cent., or more than one-sixth, of the total expenditure on the food of prisoners in this Presidency.

5. The dietary in force in Madras jails for native convicts contains the following articles in a week of seven days :—

{ 168 ozs.	of grain (flour)—if sentence is under twelve months.
{ 170 „	of „ („)—if sentence is twelve months or over.
22 „	of pulse (dâl).
42 „	of vegetables.
7 „	of salt.
3½ „	each of oil, tamarind, onions and curry powder.
15 „	of meat.

Thus the meat ration does not form more than a one-sixteenth part of the convict's fare, though it amounts to between one-fifth and one-sixth of the cost of that fare.

6. The chemical value of 15 ounces of uncooked meat without bone is 155·2 grains nitrogen and 960 grains carbon (Lewis after Parkes). The chemical value of the articles forming the weekly dietary of a Madras convict, as enumerated in the last preceding paragraph is, as follows:—

	Nitrogen GRAINS.	Carbon GRAINS.
Diet I.—Convicts sentenced to 12 months and over who receive two meals of rice and the rest raggi.	1,664	36,278
Diet II.—Convicts sentenced to under 12 months who receive no rice and all raggi	1,683	35,937
Mean ..	1,673	36,107

It is evident, at a glance, what an extremely small proportion the chemical value of the meat is of the whole ration. It forms about 9·4 per cent. of the nitrogenous constituents of the dietary and 2·6 per cent. of the carbonaceous elements. In other words this article, while costing between one-fifth and one-sixth of the total cost of a prisoner's ration, is equal to only one-sixteenth of its bulk and to between one-tenth and one-fiftieth of its chemical value.

7. In the light of these facts it is difficult to resist the conclusion, which was set forth by the Finance Committee in 1886 (note recorded in G.O., No. 1218 (paragraph 7) Financial, dated 23rd November 1886), and again by the Jail Committee in 1889 (Drs. Walker and Lethbridge's report, Chapter XX, paragraph 3) that the dietary in force in Madras jails is extravagant, in that it includes an article so expensive as meat, which is neither essential from a chemical point of view nor necessary from regard to the habits of the free population.

8. If the diet scales of the provinces in which no meat is allowed are examined, it appears that, while the cost consequent upon the use of this expensive article is avoided, the nutritive value of the dietaries is as high or higher than in Madras. This will appear from the following figures:—

Provinces.	Nutritive value of diet per diem in grains. Nitrogen.	Carbon.
North-Western Provinces	280	5,268
Punjab	303	5,469
Bengal { Diet I—Bengalies	281	5,803
Diet II—Biharis	322	5,803
Central Provinces— (with wheat)	314	4,964
(with jowar)	249	4,964
(with rice)	231	4,964
Comp. Madras .. { Diet I	238	5,182
Diet II	240	5,134

It will be seen that the nutritive value of the Madras dietary is decidedly less than those of the first three provinces, and about the same as that of the fourth province. The cost of rations in these provinces compares as follows:—

	Rs.	A.	P.
North-Western Provinces (1893)	18	9	7
Punjab (1893)	23	1	2
Bengal (1893)	25	0	9
Central Provinces (1893)	26	11	8
Comp. Madras.. { (1893)	27	15	5
(1894)	26	11	3

The fact that the higher cost shown in this Presidency is not due to want of due care and economy in purchase is proved by the facts that the rate exhibited in 1894 is the lowest on record, and that in sub-jails, with a cheaper dietary, the rate was over Rs. 40 a head.

9. In Surgeon-Major Lewis' Memorandum on Dietaries for Labouring Prisoners in Indian Jails, paragraph 25, which was commended to the attention of Local Governments in Home Department Resolution, No. 3—114—24, dated 3rd February 1882, a comparison is carried out between the dietaries in force in English and Indian prisons. It is there shown that, taking the average weight of an Indian convict to be 110 lb., the nutritive value of the dietary required for prisoners sentenced to over four months in accordance with the scale in force in English local prisons would be 205 grains nitrogen and 3,948 grains carbon. In 1877 the Jail Conference which met at Calcutta framed a diet scale, which expressly excluded meat as a necessary article of diet and which worked out to an average nutritive value of 223 grains nitrogen and 4,755 grains carbon. Finally, the Committee on English Local Prisons, of 1877–78 stated that "there would be no difficulty in constructing a diet containing nutritive principles equal to those of meat out of oatmeal, peas, beans and fat, and this could be at a third or a fourth of the cost incurred by depending entirely upon the animal kingdom for these alimentary products." If this is possible in England, it is much more possible in India, where a majority of the population does not eat meat.

10. The Northern Provinces of India undoubtedly have an advantage over this Presidency through their being able to procure wheat, but it can easily be shown that this advantage is not so great as to necessitate the ration of meat which is now given. If meat were altogether withdrawn, and if the daily issue of dâl were raised to a uniform amount of 4 oz. per diem, 2 oz. of raggi being added to the daily ration of flour, the result would be a dietary of

(From the mean of the present two diet scales.)

the nutritive value of 245 grains nitrogen and 5,509 grains carbon. But as the chemical value of the dietary is not an infallible test and has to be considered in relation with the power to digest the food valued, it appears to be the safer course, not at one entirely to abandon the meat ration, but to try the effect of reducing it. By limiting the amount of meat to a single issue once a week, a saving of 10 oz. of mutton will be effected. The issue of dâl should then be raised to 4 oz. per diem on six days of the week, remaining at 2 oz. as at present on the mutton day, while the issue of raggi should be raised by 1 oz. per diem. The nutritive value of this dietary would, then, be 241 grains nitrogen and 5,334 grains carbon against a mean value of 239 grains nitrogen and 5,158 grains carbon at present. It will be seen that the only material change in the chemical valuation is an increase in the carbonaceous elements.

11. As regards the financial effects which would result from the adoption of this proposal, the following figures show that, on an average population of 9,000 prisoners, it would produce an economy of just Rs. 20,000 per annum. The calculation is as follows:—

	Value.
Saving—10 oz. mutton per week at 10lb. per rupee	One anna.
Deduct—4 additional oz. dâl at 24lb. per rupee	Two pies.
7 additional oz. raggi at 45lb. per rupee	1·87 pies.
Net saving per week	8·13 pies.

× 52 × 9000 = Rs. 19,817

There would thus be a material economy by the adoption of this modification, while it may reasonably be urged that the amount of change in the dietary is so small as to render it extremely unlikely that any prejudicial effects on health will follow.

12. It may be objected that in 1888 a somewhat similar experiment in the direction of modifying the Madras dietary was tried and was attended with unfavourable results. It is, however, I think, certain that that experiment was not a conclusive test of the dietary adopted. In the first place, as pointed out by Drs. Walker and Lethbridge (Report, Chapter XX, paragraph 11), the mistake was made of withdrawing the tamarind ration from all prisoners except those on the hardest form of labour. In the second place, the department was undergoing the transition from the contract to the departmental system of supply and neither was in proper working order. In the third place, the experiment was not properly watched, owing to the defectiv

system of recording weights which was in use; and lastly, in the only jail—that at Trichinopoly—in which there was serious sickness, the Medical officer was clearly to blame, as the facts noticed in Drs. Walker and Lethbridge's report, Appendix A, page CXXIII, prove. If the present proposals are sanctioned the modified diet scale would be introduced into four central jails and five district jails, as marginally noted. The effect on the health of the prisoners in these jails, as evidenced by the fortnightly weighments, would be carefully examined. All these jails are at present in a satisfactory state, and there would be no chance of any deterioration escaping early notice.

Central Jails.

Salem.	Trichinopoly.
Vellore.	Coimbatore.

District Jails.

Vizagapatam.	Tanjore.
Bellary.	Palamcottah.
Nellore.	

13. It will not, I trust, be thought that in submitting this proposal, I have made any rash assumption or have overlooked the value of a scientifically-constructed diet scale. The modified dietary proposed tested by chemical analysis is in no way inferior to that now in use, while experience in other provinces has shown it to be compatible with good health. The amount of dâl suggested is not excessive, while the increase in grain leaves the total amount much less than in the North-Western Provinces and elsewhere. It is, of course, possible to point out directions in which the dietary could be improved, but such objections would apply equally to the present dietary, which experience has shown to be ample.

14. If approved, I would propose that the modified diet scales be applied at first only to native prisoners, and not to Burmans, who receive rice and whose position would deserve separate consideration. If the diet proved suitable for natives, the same principle might, with due modification, be applied subsequently to Burmese convicts. The calculations given in this letter apply only to hard-labour convicts, but the application of the modified diet-scale for non-labouring natives would be easy.

From Surgeon-Major-General C. SIBTHORPE, F.R.C.P.I., Surgeon-General with the Government of Madras, to the Chief Secretary to Government, dated Ootacamund, 6th August 1895, No. 552-Tour.

With reference to the correspondence on the subject of prison diets forwarded with your endorsement, No. 1534, dated 4th July 1895, herewith returned as requested, I consider the experiment suggested by the Inspector-General of Prisons might be made with advantage, but particular attention ought to be paid by the Medical officers concerned to the weighment records.

Memorandum to the Inspector-General of Prisons, dated 26th August 1895, No. 1989.

From A. G. CARDEW, Esq., M.A., Inspector-General of Prisons, to the Chief Secretary to Government, dated Ootacamund, 29th August 1895, No. 5228.

In reply to Mr. Davidson's memorandum, No. 1989, dated 26th August 1895, I have the honour to state that it is proposed to maintain the existing distinction between male convicts sentenced to hard labour and male convicts not sentenced to labour, female convicts and under-trials, in respect of the allowance of meat; that is to say, while under the proposed scale male convicts sentenced to hard labour would receive five ounces of meat once a week, male convicts not sentenced to hard labour, female convicts and under-trial prisoners would receive four ounces of meat once a week.

Order—No. 2053, Judicial, dated 4th October 1895.

The Inspector-General's proposal to introduce a change in the dietary in force in the Central and District Jails specified in paragraph 12 of his letter meets with the approval of Government. The results of the experiment should be watched with the greatest care, and the Inspector-General should submit quarterly reports on the subject.

(True Extract.)

Chief Secretary.

To the Inspector-General of Prisons.
" Surgeon-General.
" Accountant-General.

Fzd. A. Raitt.

Govt. of {1895} Madras.

JUDICIAL.

Issued

Recd. *Encl.*

G.O., No. 2053, 4th October 1895.

OCTOBER.

Jail Dietary.

Approving the Inspector-General's proposal to introduce a change in the dietary in force in the Central and District Jails specified by him, and desiring the Inspector-General to watch the results of the experiment with the greatest care and to submit quarterly reports on the subject.

First copy sent to Press.

Returned for signature.

Despatched in print.

NUMBER OF COPIES REQUIRED. { Order complete. / Letter only. / Order complete with Letter.

READ AGAIN G.O., No. DATED 189

CURRENT No.

ENCLOSURES TO C. No.

ORDER OF GOVERNMENT

LETTER OF GOVERNMENT.

STATEMENT WITH DITTO.

PAPERS NOT FILED UP, BEING MEANT FOR DISPATCH IN ORIGINAL.

N.B.—

A = Print in full.
B = Not to be printed.
P = Print abstract only.
Q = Print heading only.