

MADRAS RECORD OFFICE.

Government of Madras.

Indial DEPARTMENT.

G.O. No. <i>293</i>	Press ~~Mis.~~
Dated <i>28. 2 - 19 86</i>	

237-242

13/14

Not to be folded or roughly handled

*Proceedings of the Madras Government, Judicial Department,
28th February 1866.*

Read the following papers:—

No. 239. MINUTE by the Honorable the PRESIDENT, dated 24th February 1866.

I have read carefully the Minute of the Governor General, in which a sketch is given of certain measures intended to facilitate the establishment, on a satisfactory basis, of a system for ensuring proper care and supervision of the Public Health.

2. The Governor General says that the primary object which the Government had in view, when it established Sanitary Commissions in the three Presidencies, was the improvement of the sanitary state of the Army, but that this object could not be fully attained unless measures were also taken to guard against the numerous removable causes of disease which almost every where exist outside the limits of our Cantonments.

3. He says that it was desirable to proceed gradually, and to learn by experience what was the character of the measures which ought to be adopted, and he considers that this experience has now been gained, so that the time has arrived when the Government ought to take further steps for establishing a system which shall ensure constant attention to the requirements of the Public Health throughout India; and he proceeds to state the mode in which the local Governments and Administrations can be furnished with the necessary machinery for the introduction of sanitary improvements among the Civil population. Before I discuss the quality of this machinery, I must be allowed to say a few words upon the general question.

4. I may observe, in the first place, that the Sanitary Commissions have not, in my opinion, added a single fact to our knowledge either of the state of health of the civil population, or of the remedies which would tend to improve this. The members have generally contented themselves with a sort of *rechauffee* of the experience of others. They appear to have assumed, somewhat hastily, that, because, in the tropical climate of India, the European becomes more liable to certain types of disease than he was in his native country, the Native of India must, to a certain extent, partake of this liability. They have also assumed that the rules which have been found applicable to Europeans, with reference to prevention of disease by ventilation, &c., are equally applicable to Asiatics.

5. Now, I am not disposed to admit the correctness of either of these assumptions. I am not, it is true, in a position to deny, *positively*, their correctness, for we have not the data, which only proper statistical returns can afford, to enable us either to affirm or deny any thing which may be propounded as to the health of the population. We know nothing of the rate of mortality, the proportion of births to deaths, the causes of death, and the age at which people marry or die. We have not, in point of fact, any information which might enable us to establish the average duration of life, or to affirm, with regard to this or that employment, or this or that locality, that it produces an effect upon the population which tends to lower, or to enhance that average. We are, in point of fact, working altogether in the dark.

6. While, however, we have no positive information upon which to base sanitary theories, we have certain facts tending to prove that the Natives of India are differently constituted from the Europeans. Their houses are constructed upon plans, probably handed down to them by their forefathers, which contrast most curiously with those adopted by the Europeans. The Native studiously excludes the air from his dwelling, while the only object of the European is to leave as many openings for its entrance and exit as possible, and to keep it in motion by punkahs. The Native is altogether indifferent to the action of the sun.

*Proceedings of the Madras Government, Judicial Department,
28th February 1866.*

A baby, but a few days old, will be carried by its mother with its bare head exposed to the action of the sun during the hottest part of the day, and this exposure, which would very soon kill an European, does no harm to the Indian infant. In point of fact, the whole physical constitution of the Native differs from that of the European, and may fairly be inferred to demand a special form of treatment.

7. While, then, I do not object to the extension of sanitary supervision to the Native bazaars in the immediate vicinity of Military Cantonments, and to the application of such *well devised* and CAUTIOUSLY APPLIED REMEDIES as may seem likely to improve the state of things in these bazaars, I am altogether opposed to the adoption of any general system, such as that sketched out by the Governor General in his Minute.

8. I need hardly observe that in this Presidency the Districts are too extensive to admit of the supervision of the Zillah Surgeon being in any way effective; neither need I remark upon the statement of the Governor General that the cost of works of sanitary improvement must necessarily fall upon Local Funds. I will only say that any attempt to force upon the people habits in any great respect different from those to what they have been accustomed, to press upon them changes in their domestic arrangements, and, for the purpose of carrying these out, to force upon them a system of taxation for which they are not prepared, would, in my opinion, lead to very disastrous results.

9. I think it would be wiser to content ourselves with the steps already taken under the new Cantonment Act, and to await the result of some years analyses of the effects produced by this, before we attempt any more general scheme of *sanitary reform*.

(Signed) W. T. DENISON.

No. 240. MINUTE by the Honorable T. PYCROFT, dated 24th February 1866.

It seems to me that the Sanitary Commission in this Presidency has done as much as could be expected of it, considering the short time that it has been in operation, and the limited funds available for carrying out its objects. I do not doubt that the extension of its operations to the civil population of the Presidency, if effected gradually and judiciously—as, if left to Mr. Ellis, I feel assured it will be—will prove of the utmost advantage to the country.

2. The plan which appears to be recommended in the Despatch to the Secretary of State, 22nd January last, or that of separating Civil from Military sanitation, and placing them under different Officers, seems to me faulty, as likely to lead to collision and conflict of authorities, in place of unity of administration. I should much prefer the course proposed in His Excellency Sir J. Lawrence's Minute, under which the President of the Sanitary Commission will also have charge of the Sanitary duties connected with the Civil Department.

3. I much regret that the Honorable Mr. Ellis' proposal for the establishment of a Public Health Service for the Madras Presidency, as modified by this Government, has not met the approval of the Government of India. Looking to the size of the Madras Districts, averaging some 80 or 100 miles in length by as many in breadth, it is out of the question that the Zillah or Civil Surgeon can efficiently perform the duties of District Health Officer, or that, tied as he must be to his station, and to the charge of the public servants, dispensaries and jails there, he can "make himself acquainted with the sanitary conditions and requirements of his

*Proceedings of the Madras Government, Judicial Department,
28th February 1866.*

District, and advise the local authorities accordingly." The only result of imposing these duties upon him will be that they will not be done at all, or done so superficially as to be worse than useless.

(Signed) T. PYCROFT.

No. 241. MINUTE by the Honorable H. D. PHILLIPS, dated 24th February 1866.

There is so much truth in what is written in the Minute of His Excellency the President that I am unwilling to withhold my concurrence in his remarks, although, perhaps, the point immediately under notice may be determined without our bringing under consideration what is the real value of the past labors of the Sanitary Commission.

2. So far as this Presidency is concerned, I feel extremely doubtful whether the assignment of the duties of a District Health Supervisor to the Medical Officers in charge of the Jails in our widely spread Districts, added to the ordinary daily duties of a Jail and Zillah Surgeon, will be attended with the beneficial results which appear to be anticipated. Certainly, in neither of the six Districts where I have served for several years consecutively will it be practicable for the same man properly to discharge the various duties he will be called on to perform, and I should have much preferred the adoption by the Supreme Government of the plan of a public Health Service, such as Mr. R. S. Ellis prepared and proposed, and which this Government sent on, with their own strong recommendation that it might be sanctioned and carried into effect.

3. It seems to me to be further extremely doubtful whether the Inspector General of Jails in this Presidency, will be able efficiently to discharge the additional duty now expected from him, as Superintendent of the sanitary measures connected with the civil administration of his range. My strong impression is that, with the wide area over which his superintendence extends, good work, as Sanitary Supervisor, cannot be hoped for, and I think that, if it be attempted, it will be badly done.

4. I am quite of opinion with Mr. Pycroft, as stated in paragraph 2 of his Minute, as to the difficulties likely to arise from the division of the work of the Sanitary Commission into Military and Civil Departments, under control by two different Officers.

(Signed) H. D. PHILLIPS.

No. 242. To the Secretary to the Government of India, Home Department, dated Fort Saint George, 28th February 1866, No. 293.

I am directed to acknowledge the receipt of your letter of the 7th instant, No. 1225, intimating that the Governor General in Council has been pleased to authorize the grant of a salary of Rupees 1833-5-4 per mensem to Lieutenant Colonel Wilson, as Inspector General of Jails, on the understanding that he is eventually to undertake, also, if required, the duties of Civil Sanitary Commission for the Madras Presidency, in addition to the Jail duties, and without additional pay, and forwarding, for the information of the Madras Government, copies of a Minute by the Governor General, and of a Despatch which has been addressed by the Government of India to the Secretary of State, regarding the salaries to be assigned to the Inspectors General of Jails in the several Presidencies and Provinces, and the arrangements to be made with the view of establishing, on a satisfactory basis, a system for ensuring proper care and supervision of the Public Health in India.

2. I am directed to observe that there would seem to be a discrepancy of some importance between the proposals made in the Minute of His Excellency the Governor General, regarding the supervision of the Public Health Department in the Madras and Bombay Presidencies, and those submitted in the Despatch to the Secretary of State, which refers to Sir John Lawrence's Minute as containing the details of the measure which it is proposed to adopt. The Governor General, in the 4th paragraph of the 4th page of his Minute, after adverting to the fact that in Madras and Bombay there are separate Armies under the control of the local Governments, which is not the case with the other local Governments and Administrations, recommends that the arrangements for the supervision of the Public Health under the Madras and Bombay Governments should be placed upon a footing similar to that which it is proposed to adopt under the Government of India, viz., that the President of the Sanitary Commission should become Sanitary Commissioner for the Army and should make his reports to the local Government in the Military Department, and that he should also be appointed a Deputy Secretary to Government for the discharge of the Sanitary duties connected with the Civil Departments. "The plans proposed regarding District Health Officers would," the Governor General observes, "be equally applicable in Madras and Bombay, and the Sanitary Commissioner, in his capacity of Deputy Secretary to Government, would discharge the duties which, under the local Governments in the Bengal Presidency, will fall to the Inspector General of Jails, as Principal Officer of Health." It is to be inferred from the latter remark that it was the intention of the Governor General that in Madras and Bombay the Inspector General of Jails should not perform the duties of Principal Officer of Health, but that, on the contrary, those duties should be performed by the Sanitary Commissioner. This intention, however, would seem to have been overlooked, or, at all events, to have been departed from, in the letter addressed to the Secretary of State, in the 8th paragraph of which it is proposed that a separate and additional salary should be assigned to each Inspector General, as Principal Health Officer of the Province, and the amount is specified which it is proposed so to assign in Madras and Bombay, as well as in the other Presidencies and Administrations.

3. His Excellency the Governor in Council has thought it right to bring this apparent discrepancy to the immediate notice of the Government of India, as it has an important bearing on the arrangements to be made in this Presidency, and he desires me to add that, in the opinion of the Madras Government, the arrangement proposed in Sir John Lawrence's Minute is far preferable to that recommended in the letter to the Secretary of State.

4. I am to add that, looking to the size of the Districts in this Presidency, and the duties which devolve on the Civil Surgeons, most of whom have charge of the Jails at the head quarter stations, the Governor in Council considers it impossible for those officers to exercise any effective supervision over the sanitary arrangements of any other towns, or villages, than those in which they actually reside. Copies of Minutes recorded by His Excellency the Governor and the Civil Members of Council are annexed.

(Signed) A. J. ARBUTHNOT,
Chief Secretary.

Ed. J. H. Burns.

Minute

473
I have read carefully the Minute of Mr. Goode's in which a sketch is given of certain measures intended to be adopted to place the Establishment on a satisfactory basis a system for ensuring proper care & supervision of the Public Health. —

The Gov. Gen. says that the primary object which the Govt had in view when it established Sanitary Commissions in the three Presidencies was the improvement of the sanitary state of the Army, but that this object could not be fully attained unless measures were also taken to guard against the numerous removable causes of disease which almost everywhere exist outside the limits of the Cantonments. — He says that it was desirable to proceed gradually, and to learn by experience what was the character of the measures which ought to be adopted, and he considers that this experience has

now been pained so that
the time has arrived when
the Govt ought to take for:
= the steps for establishing
a system which shall
excite constant attention
to the requirements of the
Public Health throughout
India, and he proceeds
to state the mode in which
the local Govts and admin:
= strations can be furnished
with the necessary machinery
for the introduction of
sanitary improvements
among the civil population.
Before I discuss the quality
of this machinery, I
must be allowed to say
a few words upon the
general question -
I am driven in this part
to state that the sanitary
authorities have not
in my opinion added
a single fact
to our knowledge of the
state of health of the civil
population, or of the
remedies which would
tend to improve this.
The members have, perve-
= rally, contented them-
= selves with a sort of

rechauffe of the experience
of others. They appear to
have assumed, somewhat
hastily, that because in
the tropical climate of
India the European be-
= comes ^{more} liable to certain
types of disease than he
was in his native country
the nature of India must
be a certain extent positive
of the liability. They have
also assumed that the
rules which have been
found applicable to
Europeans with reference
to prevention of disease by
ventilation, &c, are equally
applicable to Asiatics.
Now I am not disposed to admit
the correctness of either of these
assumptions. I am not, so
to speak, in a position to
deny, positively, their correct-
= ness, for we have not the data,
which proper statistical returns
can afford, to enable us either to
affirm or deny anything
which may be propounded
as to the health of the population.
We know nothing of the rate
of mortality, the proportion of
births to deaths, the causes
of death, the age at which
people marry or die - we have

not in point of fact any
information which might
enable us to establish the
average duration of life, or
to affirm, with regard to this
or that employment, or this
or that locality, that it pro-
duces an effect upon the
population which tends to
lower, or to enhance that
average - We are in point
of fact working altogether
in the dark -
While however we have
no positive information
upon which to base some-
thing theories - we have
certain facts tending to prove
that the natives of India are
differently constituted from
the Europeans - Their
houses are constructed
upon slabs, probably
handed down to them by
their forefathers, which
contrast most curiously
with those adopted by the
Europeans - The native
sturdily excludes the
air from his dwelling, while
the only object of the European
is to leave as many openings
for its entrance & exit as
possible, and to keep it
in motion by smoke.
The native is altogether in-
different to the action of the sun

& of the sun but a few days
will be carried by its mother
with its bare head exposed to
the action of the sun during
the hottest part of the day. &
this exposure which would
very soon kill an European
does no harm to the Indian
infant - In point of fact
the whole physical consti-
tution of the native differs
from that of the European
and may fairly be as-
sumed to demand a
special form of treatment
While then I do not object to
the extension of the sanitary
superintendence to the native
Bazaar in the immediate
vicinity of military canton-
ments, and to the application
of such well devised, and
cautiously applied remedies
as may seem likely to
improve the state of things
within Bazaar, I am
altogether opposed to the
adoption of any general
system such as that sketched
out by the Govt Genl in his
minutes - I need hardly observe that
in the Presidency the
districts are too extensive
to admit of the supervision
of the Bazaar system being

in any way effective. neither
need I remark upon the
statement of the Gov Gen
that the cost of working drain-
=tains improvement must
necessarily fall upon local
Funds. - I will only say
that any attempt to force
upon the people habits
in any part respect differ-
=ent from those to which
they have been accustomed,
to prepare them changes
in their domestic arrange-
=ments, and for the purpose
of carrying these out, to
force upon them a system
of taxation for which they
are not prepared. would
in my opinion lead to very
disastrous results.

I think it would be wiser
to content ourselves with
the steps already taken under
the new Comptrolment act
and to await the result of
some years analysis of the
effects produced by these
before we attempt any
more general scheme of
Sanitary Reform

W. D. Carson

It seems to me that the ¹⁵6
Sanitary Commission
in this Presidency has
done as much as could
be expected of it, consid-
=ering the short time
that it has been in operation
and the limited funds
available for carrying
out its objects. I do not
doubt that the extension
of its operations to the
civil population of the
Presidency if effected
gradually and judi-
=ciously, as it has been
in this I feel assured
it will be, will ^{prove} of the
utmost advantage
to the Country -

The place which
appears to be most
=needed in the Despatch
to the Secretary of State
22 January 1881 on
that of reporting kind
for Military Sanitation
and placing them

under different Officers
seems to me faulty as
likely to lead to collision
and conflict of authori-
ties in place of unity
of administration. I
should much prefer
the course proposed in
H.E. Sir J. Lawrence's
Memorandum under which
the President of the
Sanitary Commission
will also have charge
of the Sanitary duties
connected with the
Civil Dept.

I much expect that
H.E. Sir J. Lawrence's proposal
for the establishment
of a Public ^{Health} Service
for the Madras
Presidency as modified
by this note has not
met the approval of
the Govt of India. Look-
ing to the size of the
Madras District and
population some 80 or 100

+ tried as he would
be to his Station and
to the charge of the public
sanitary dispensary
and daily work

8 #
miles in length by any
man in hand it
is out of the question
that the ~~Sanitary~~ ^{Sanitary} Civil
Station can efficiently
perform the duties of
District Health Officer
or that he can make
himself acquainted
with the sanitary condi-
tions and require-
ments of his District
and advise the Local
Authorities accordingly.
- 3. The only result of
imposing these duties
upon him will be that
they will not be done
at all, or done so
superficially as to
be worse than useless.

24/2/66. J. H. M. S.

There is so much truth
in what is written in
the Memorandum of H.E. Sir
J. Lawrence - that I have

unwilling to withhold
my concurrence in his remarks,
although, perhaps, the point
immediately under notice, may
be determined without our
bringing under consideration
what is the real value of
the past labors of the
Sanitary Commission.

So far as the President
is concerned, I feel naturally
doubtful, whether the
appointment of the duties of
a District Health-Supervisor,
to the medical officer in
charge of the sick in our
widely spread districts, added to
the ordinary daily duties of a full
Zyrtar Surgeon, will be attended
with the beneficial results which
appear to be anticipated. Certainly,
in neither of the six districts where I
have served for several years consecutively,
will it be practicable for the same man
properly to discharge the ^{various} duties;
he will be called on to perform - and I should
have much preferred the adoption of the Sub:
Com. of the plan of a public Health Service,
such as Mr. R. T. Allen proposed & proposed, with
the Com. sent on with their own strong
recommendation that it might be
sanctioned & carried into effect.

as stated in
para 2 of his
minutes;

9th
It seems to me the further
intensity doubtful whether the Sub:
General of Sick in the Presidency,
will be able efficiently to discharge
the additional duty now imputed
from him. no Superintendent of
the Sanitary measures connected
with the Civil Administration of
his camp. Very strong impression
is made with this wide area over
at his Superintendence talents,
lost work, as Sanitary Supervisor
cannot be hoped for and I think
that if it be attempted it will
be badly done -

24 Feb 06

W. D. Allen

Sanitary of opinion with
Mr. T. G. Allen as to the difficulties which
arise from the division of the
work of the Sanitary Comd. - into
military & civil departments under
control by two different officers.

W. D. Allen

24 Feb 06

1886 Sept 8

Minute by the Honorable
President

7th/86 No 442

Minute by the Honorable
J. P. P. P.

24th/86 No 443

Minute by the Honorable

H. R. Phillips

24th/86 No 444

Respecting the establishment

ment of a public

Health Service in the

Presidency.

deposited with
annexures.

To

The Secretary to the Government
of India,

Home Department.

Sir,

I am directed to acknow-
ledge the receipt of your letter
of the 7th instant No. 1225, in-
timating that the Governor
General in Council has
been pleased to authorize
the grant of a salary of
Rs. 1833. 5. 4. per mensem
to L. Col. Wilson as Inspector
General of Sails, on the
understanding that he is
eventually to undertake also
if required, the duties of
Civil Sanitary Commissioner
for the Madras Presidency
in addition to the Sail duties
and without additional pay,
and forwarding for the
information of the Madras
Government copies of a Minute
by the Governor General and

W. H. P.

W. H. P.

of a Despatch which has been addressed by the Govt of India to the Secretary of State regarding the salaries to be assigned to the Inspectors General of Sails in the several Presidencies and Provinces and the arrangements to be made with the view of establishing on a satisfactory basis a system for ensuring proper care and supervision of the Public Health in India.

2 I am directed to observe that there ^{was} ~~is~~ a discrepancy of some importance between the proposals made in the Minute of H. B. the Governor General regarding the supervision of the Public Health Department in the Madras and Bombay Presidencies and those submitted in the Despatch to the Secy of State, which refers to Sir John Lawrence's Minute as containing the details of the measure which it is proposed to adopt. The Governor General in the 4th paragraph of the 4th page of his Minute after adverting to the fact that in Madras and Bombay there are separate Armies under the control

would seem to

? adopted under

✓ 410
of the local Governments which is not the case with the other local Governments and Administrations, recommends that the arrangements for the supervision of the Public Health under the Madras and Bombay Governments should be placed upon a footing similar to that proposed with reference to the Government of India viz: that the President of the Sanitary Commission should become Sanitary Commissioner for the Army and should make his reports to the local Govt in the Mil^y Department, and that he should also be appointed a Deputy Secretary to Government for the discharge of the Sanitary duties connected with the ~~San~~ Departments.
"The plans proposed regarding District Health Officers would," the Governor General observes, "be equally applicable in Madras and Bombay, and the Sanitary Commissioner in his capacity of Deputy Secretary to Govt would discharge the duties which under the local Govt in the Bengal Presidency will fall to

"to the Inspector General of Jails
"as Principal Officer of Health."
It is to be inferred from the
latter remark that it was the
intention of the Governor General
that in Madras and Bombay
the Inspector General of Jails
should not perform the duties
of Principal Officer of Health,
but that on the contrary
those duties ~~were~~ ^{should} be per-
formed by the Sanitary Com-
missioner. This intention
however would seem to have
been overlooked or at all events
to have been departed from
in the letter addressed to the
Secretary of State, in the 8th
para of which it is proposed
that a separate and additional
salary should be assigned
to each Inspector General
as Principal Health Officer
of the Province and the
amount is specified which
it is proposed to assign
in Madras and Bombay
as well as in the other
Presidencies and Administrations.

5. His Exy the Governor
in Council has thought it
right

3 8
right to bring this apparent
discrepancy to the immediate
notice of the Government of
India, as it has an im-
portant bearing on the
arrangements to be made
in this Presidency and he
desires me to add that in
the opinion of the Madras
Government the arrangement
proposed in Sir John Lawrence's
minutes is ^{much} preferable to
that recommended in the
letter to the Secretary of
State.

6. I am to add that,
looking to the size of the
Districts in this Presidency
and the duties which devolve
on the Civil Surgeons, most
of whom have charge of
the jails at the head
quarter stations, the

Governor

62
Governor in Council considers
it impossible for those
officers to exercise any
effective supervision over
the sanitary arrange-
ments of any other
towns or villages than
those in which they
actually reside. Copies
of minutes recorded by

His Excellency the Governor
and the Civil members of
Council are annexed.

W. H.

Fort St. George
28 February 1862

18. Minutes
to follow

Salary of Inspector
of Forests

239c 242.

Indial 1866 Departt.

No 293.

27

The Secretary to the Govt
of India

Dated 28 February 1866.

7 Feb 1866 1635 of 1867.

Print
Form