Educational (190 /) Department.

ORDINARY PRINTED.

G.O., No. 764

DATED 18 12 01

INDEXED.

9

[Despatch Abstract.]

Examinations for admission to the Public Service

Copy to the D.P.I & the Board of Revenue, for report Ltr from the govt of India on the subject Examinations for entry into Govt Service, & inviting the suggestions & opinion of the High Court in the matter.

BACK PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

FURTHER PAPERS.

G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.	G.O.	No.	Department.	Date.

Government {1901} of Madras.

EDUCATIONAL.

Recd. } 1901. *Enclosures*

Regd. *Spare copies*

ORIGINAL

G.O., No. 764, 18th December 1901.

N. P.

DECEMBER.

Examinations for admission to the Public Service.

Communicating to the Director of Public Instruction and the Board of Revenue for report letter from the Government of India on the subject of examinations for entry into Government service, and inviting the suggestions and opinion of the High Court in the matter.

GOVERNMENT OF MADRAS.

EDUCATIONAL DEPARTMENT.

Read—the following paper:—

From J. P. HEWETT, Esq., C.S.I., C.I.E., Secretary to the Government of India, Home Department (Education), to the Secretary to the Government of Madras, Educational Department, dated Calcutta, 27th November 1901, No. 526.

In continuation of my letter No. 466, dated the 6th November, I am directed to address the Government of Madras on the subject of examinations for entry into Government service, and to forward for information a copy of the resolutions passed by the Educational Conference recently held at Simla relative thereto.

2. In paragraph 7 of his despatch No. 42, Public (Educational), dated the 5th April 1900, the Secretary of State for India referred to the question how far the system of public instruction in India served the important purpose of providing a class of officials able and willing to render efficient and loyal service to the State. His Lordship observed that there might be some truth in the contention that higher education chiefly attracts aspirants to Government service, and that the disappointment resulting from the number of candidates exceeding the number of posts available for them constitutes a political danger. He went on to mention the argument that the practice of accepting a University degree as a qualification for public employment deprives the Government of the opportunity of fixing its own standard of fitness, and he asked for the opinion of the Government of India on the suggestion that, if separate examinations were held for admission to the public service, the universities would be relieved of a number of mere office seekers, while the Government would be able to secure a fuller control over the training of its own servants. This portion of the despatch was circulated in October 1900 for an expression of the views of local Governments and Administrations, and they were asked to furnish information showing the offices in respect of which the fact that a person has passed the Matriculation examination of an Indian University or has obtained a degree is either (i) accepted as the sole qualification for employment under Government, or (ii) prescribed as a condition antecedent to his admission to a further test of fitness for the public service. The replies to this reference have now been received, and the various questions raised by the correspondence were very fully discussed at the Educational Conference that recently met at Simla. The information now before the Government of India is complete enough to render it possible to examine the whole subject of the method of making appointments to the public service in its political, educational and administrative aspects with reference both to the suggestion mentioned by the Secretary of State and to the opinions expressed by the conference; and I am accordingly to address you on the matter.

3. First, as to the political aspect of the question, there seem to be no grounds for believing that the number of persons attracted to the university merely by the prospect of obtaining Government employment is materially greater than might naturally be expected in a country where commercial openings are few and imperfectly developed, and where the larger and more profitable undertakings are to a greater extent still in the hands of foreigners. Nor is it established that the proportion of Indian graduates, whose expectations of obtaining a Government appointment

are disappointed, is as yet large enough to constitute in any sense a political danger. In the case of Madras it is stated that the majority of the university graduates have succeeded in obtaining some kind of employment, and that the alleged political evil has not yet arisen; while in the North-Western Provinces, the Punjab, the Central Provinces and Burma no mention at all is made of its existence. Even in Bombay, where the elements of political discontent are for historical reasons stronger and less dependent on artificial stimulus than in any other part of India, it is not alleged that the number of unsuccessful graduates is sufficient to create uneasiness, and it is suggested, apparently with some reason, that such discontent as exists may be due to the fact that the winning of university distinctions is followed by imperfect recognition, and that appointments are given indiscriminately to any one who has got a degree. In Bengal there is said to be some discontent, not wholly confined to those who have failed to obtain Government appointments, but this is probably due in the main to the character of the people themselves who have hitherto shown little aptitude for the industrial pursuits into which the educated classes of Bombay have entered with success. It seems not improbable that the opinion that the unemployed graduate is a source of political danger to India may be an overhasty generalization from what is alleged to be the state of affairs in Bengal.

4. In any case it appears that the evil would be aggravated rather than cured by establishing separate Government examinations for the public service. In no province could such examinations be conducted on the principle of unrestricted competition, since this would result in giving to one or two classes a virtual monopoly of all the appointments for which they might choose to compete. The test must therefore be a qualifying one, and, although the standard might be fixed high, it is practically certain that the number of candidates who passed would greatly exceed the number of appointments available. Whatever precautionary declarations might be made, the mere fact of Government holding such an examination would be construed as pledging it to provide an appointment of some kind for every candidate who passed; those who failed to obtain appointments would charge the Government with breach of faith; they would have the fullest sympathy from their countrymen; and their grievances would be a source of constant embarrassment. This was in fact the result produced on a small scale by the Native Civil Service examination established in Bengal by Sir George Campbell some thirty years ago. It satisfied very few, and, although it was soon abolished, the claims which it created continued to give trouble to the Government until they were finally disposed of under the new system introduced in 1890. The character of the examination itself would lend some colour to the discontent which it would cause. It would of necessity apply, not merely a general test but a special test, and, as the North-Western Provinces Government points out, "the sense of failure would be aggravated, as those who did not succeed would be turned adrift less qualified even than at present to command success in other employments". For the same reason again the examination would from the first be regarded with suspicion as an attempt to tamper with higher education and to mould the thought of the rising generation into forms bearing the stamp of official approval. That such an idea should get abroad—and once started it would spread rapidly—would constitute a far more serious political evil than the existence of a few disappointed graduates whose number might at any moment be reduced if the universities were to raise their present standards.

5. On the educational side of the subject it may first be observed that the establishment of a separate examination, admittedly as a substitute for, and not merely as supplementary to, the university course, would be inconsistent with the principles now recognized in England in such matters. It is true that in England separate examinations are held for Government appointments, but the necessity for this arises from social and political conditions which do not exist in India. And of recent years at any rate so far from there being any idea of substituting the Government examinations for University tests and thus relieving the Universities, the tendency has been in the opposite direction. The examinations for the higher kinds of appointments are now held at a comparatively late period with the express object of securing for the service of the State men who

have passed through the full university course. In India the institution of a separate examination for Government service, designed to take the place of the university standards, would meet with the strongest opposition from the highest educational authorities, and there is good reason to believe that it would be injurious to the prospects of education itself. The subjects would necessarily differ from those prescribed by the University, and two distinct courses of study would thus exist side by side, only one of which would lead to Government service. If students attempted to compete in both lines, the strain of excessive examinations, already the subject of complaint, would be greatly intensified; while, on the other hand, if the bulk of them were attracted by the prospect of obtaining Government appointments, the result would be a system of universal cramming concentrated upon whatever lines the Government examinations might take, and accompanied by forfeiture of such intellectual improvement as is at present achieved. The universities themselves would be crippled by the loss of the examination fees which provide a large proportion of their income; and there can be little doubt that many of the affiliated colleges and the schools which feed them would degenerate into cramming institutions of the worst kind, while those which endeavoured to maintain a high standard would lose many of their pupils. Success in the Government examination would become the sole standard of culture, the influence of the universities would decline and the value of their degrees would be depreciated, and the main stream of educational effort would be diverted into a narrow and sordid channel. Such a degradation of the educational ideals of the country could hardly fail to react upon the character of the public service itself. The improved tone of the native officials of the present day dates from, and is reasonably attributed to, the more extended employment of men who have received a liberal education in the universities and have imbibed through the influence of their teachers some of the traditions of English public life. It can hardly be supposed that the influence of the professional crammer would tend to maintain these traditions unimpaired.

6. Nor is there any reason to believe that, by introducing its own examinations, the Government would raise the standard of fitness or secure better men for the public service than it obtains under the present system. There is a general consensus of opinion among the Governments consulted that no examining board would do better than the universities. The Madras Government quote with approval the opinion of the Director of Public Instruction that the only tolerably well educated men in the Presidency are from college, and that the best officials are those who have received a university training. Similar testimony comes from Bombay, where, on the two occasions when a competitive examination was held for the Provincial Civil Service, the results are said to have been in conformity with those of the university examinations. It must further be borne in mind that an examining board would be an elaborate and expensive organization. The requirements of the different departments of the public service vary greatly; no single examination would meet them all; and there must either be a number of separate examinations, or one examination divided into a number of branches. The work would therefore be heavy; it could not be imposed on officials in addition to their own duties; and the control which the universities now exercise for nothing would have to be specially paid for probably at a comparatively high rate. At the same time the responsibility for conducting the complicated process of a series of huge examinations would be shifted from the universities to Government, which would become the direct object of whatever dissatisfaction was created by the results.

Having thus examined the proposed change of system from several points of view the Governor General in Council is satisfied that it would increase rather than diminish the political danger which it is intended to remedy, that its effect upon the education of the country would be highly prejudicial, and that there would be great administrative difficulty in carrying it out.

7. In considering to what extent effect can be given to the recommendations of the conference as regards examinations for Government service, it will be convenient to deal first with the higher classes of appointments of which the Provincial Service is a type. These appointments are referred to in resolutions Nos. 1 and 4. The first

of these merely affirms the conclusions set forth in the preceding paragraphs; while the second states the principles recommended for the consideration of Government in making appointments to the higher posts. There appears at present to be considerable variety of practice in different provinces as regards the extent to which competitive examination is resorted to as a means of selecting candidates. In Madras, for example, admission to the Provincial Service is said to be dependent on the passing of a competitive examination open to none but graduates in arts. In Bombay competitive examinations seem to have been held only in 1897 and 1900, the results on either occasion merely confirming those of the university examinations. In Bengal half the vacancies in the executive branch of the Provincial Service have, since 1890, been filled by unrestricted competition, the other half being reserved for nomination from among those candidates who have obtained one-third of the maximum number of marks. Appointments to the judicial branch of the service are made by nomination. The Government of the North-Western Provinces and Oudh, on the other hand, "trusts to the educational system of the province to furnish the necessary guarantee of the educational qualifications of candidates; for the other qualifications requisite it relies on a system of selection combined, in most cases, with further test examinations." In the case of the Provincial Service three deputy collectors are annually appointed by competitive examination, but only selected graduates of the Allahabad University are admitted to compete, and the Lieutenant-Governor "does not, at present, see his way to a further extension of competitive examinations." Under the system in force in the Punjab about one-fourth of the vacancies in the executive branch of the Provincial Service are filled by competition among registered candidates selected from those graduates who "have obtained a fairly good position" in the university examinations; while in the judicial branch one-half of the vacancies are reserved for competition. In Burma, the Central Provinces and Assam competitive examinations have not been introduced.

8. Without insisting upon rigid uniformity, the Government of India are of opinion that it is desirable that the system of making appointments to the Government service should proceed, as far as possible, on the same general lines in all provinces, especially in respect of the extent to which open competition is admitted. The principle of competition for Government appointments was unknown in India until a few years ago; it does not spring from the traditions of the people; and it is without the safeguards by which its operation is contro" d in England. In India the well considered exercise of the legitimate patronage f the State is an important function of Government, and ought not to be exclusively or mainly committed to the chances of the examination room merely because unrestricted competition is or has been one of the ideas of the day in a country where the conditions are absolutely different. By abdicating this function the Government no doubt saves itself trouble, but it also deprives itself of the power of allotting its patronage equitably among the different races and religions, of rewarding loyal service, and of securing the men best fitted to fill particular posts. It seems to the Governor General in Council that some Governments have already gone too far in this direction, and that greater attention is required to the principles laid down by the conference. In the present state of collegiate education in India it is clear that all subjects which form part of either general or special education are sufficiently well taught by the universities to make it possible in the majority of cases for the Government to accept the various forms of university degrees and distinctions as indicating that their holders possess the amount of knowledge *prima facie* requisite to enable them to fill particular appointments. In most, if not in all cases, they will also have to master the laws, rules and regulations of the particular department in which they will be employed, but this knowledge can in all probability most profitably be acquired during a period of probation at the close of which it could be tested by a searching examination, continued failure in which would be visited by forfeiture of the appointment. It does not appear to be essential that the special knowledge, which is of advantage only in a particular career, should be acquired in a theoretical fashion before it is needed for use, nor that it should be tested by a separate examination before appointment. Government may even itself be the loser by insisting upon this; since there are grounds for believing that some of the best men who leave the universities are deterred from entering the

executive branch of the Provincial service by their reluctance to undergo an extra and arduous examination, involving another year of hard study, on the chance of getting a good appointment, and possibly also by their inability to support themselves after their university scholarships have expired.

9. I am accordingly to invite the special attention of the Governor in Council to the resolutions that were passed by the conference on this subject, and to ask in what manner and to what extent the Government of Madras think it desirable or possible to give effect to the abolition of competitive examinations as the qualifying test for the higher grades of appointments. In considering the question of their elimination or reduction the following suggestions may appropriately be borne in mind:—

(1) Appointments might be made by selection on the basis of university degrees and distinctions, or of equivalent educational qualifications.

(2) The standard of educational qualifications need not, and probably cannot, be the same for the several races and classes from which it is desirable to recruit; and different standards would require to be laid down, though not necessarily published, for Hindus, Muhammadans, Europeans and Eurasians, and probably also for natives, whether Hindus or Muhammadans, of the comparatively backward parts of a province, such as Orissa and Behar in Bengal, Sind in Bombay, and so on.

(3) Within the limits of each standard, regard would be paid to the comparative value of the educational qualifications attained, so that, other things being equal, a graduate in honours should be preferred to a pass-man and a pass-man of a higher division to one of a lower division.

(4) Value would be attached to the recorded opinions of collegiate and school authorities regarding the proficiency and conduct of candidates during their school and college career.

These are the principles that should probably underlie the substitution to any marked extent of selection for competition. In what degree, if adopted, they should be supplemented by examinations, directed to the special circumstance of an office or a department, is a matter upon which the Government of Madras are invited to report, bearing in mind the general desire of the Government of India to reduce the examination evil in this country.

10. As regards the middle grades of Government service, the conference considered that the school final examination should, in ordinary circumstances, provide a convenient test, and the Governor-General in Council is disposed to accept this recommendation. In order to enable the test to be applied with discrimination the certificate of having passed the examination should state the marks obtained in various subjects, and there should be attached to it a certificate by the headmaster of the school regarding the conduct and amenability to discipline of the candidate during his school career. There may, however, be cases, such as that of police sub-inspectors, in which it would be of advantage to constitute an advisory committee for the purpose of examining qualifications and reporting to the head of the department with whom the final decision would rest.

11. In the case of the lower grades of the Government service the recommendation that school certificates of proficiency and conduct should be accepted in lieu of examinations as a qualification for Government service is a necessary consequence of the recommendation that inspections *in situ* should take the place of public examinations below the standard of the school final examination. Inspections or departmental examinations *in situ* will be directed rather to ascertaining the general efficiency of the school than to testing *seriatim* the degree of knowledge acquired by each and all of the pupils, and, as a rule, the inspectors who conduct them will not grant certificates of having passed a given standard to individual pupils. It might, however, be arranged that at such inspections the certificates of proficiency and conduct prepared by the headmaster for the pupils who have completed their studies should be brought up and endorsed by the inspector after testing the attainments of the recipients. Such an arrangement would probably tend to keep the schools up to the mark and would add materially to the value of the certificates.

12. The attention of the local Government is invited to those resolutions of the conference which relate to a knowledge of the vernacular in relation to the public service. These resolutions are heartily endorsed by the Government of India.

———

Order—No. 764, Educational, dated 18th December 1901.

Communicated to the Board of Revenue and to the Director of Public Instruction for report.

2. The Governor in Council desires to be favoured with the suggestions and opinions of the Honourable the Judges of the High Court in this matter.

(True Extract.)

C. J. WEIR,
Ag. Secretary to Government.

To the Honourable the Chief Justice, with C.L.
„ Board of Revenue (Land Revenue).
„ Director of Public Instruction, with one enclosure.

Ed. A. F. Eccleston.

EDUCATIONAL DEPARTMENT.

NOTES CONNECTED WITH G.O., No. 764, EDUCATIONAL, DATED 18TH DECEMBER 1901.

[SUBJECT.—*Examinations for admission to the Public Service.*]

From the Government of India, dated 27th November 1901, *No.* 526, *Education.*

As Government cannot very well "request" Secretariat departments of their own to make "remarks," and as general circulation to all heads of departments is not desirable and will cause delay and a deal of writing, it is proposed to issue the draft above and then to send the order unofficially to all departments of the Secretariat, with suggestion that if any heads of departments have to be consulted, such *e.g.* as the Inspector-General of Police, that should be done at once. The remarks of the Secretariat departments themselves will be invited (and will most conveniently be given) when the matter is taken up after receipt of the report by the Director of Public Instruction and the High Court's and Revenue Board's remarks.

A. T. PRINGLE.
11-12-01.

Assistant Secretary—

Yes. I think the above proposal will be the best for getting the matter ready for disposal within a reasonable time. What are we to do about paragraph 12? We can't I suppose send outside the office the resolutions of the Conference. The Board and High Court are sure to ask what they are—on this subject.

C. J. WEIR.
12-12-01.

Should not the Board and High Court get copy of the resolutions of the Conference? There seems to be no objection to send it to them.

P. T. THARYAN.
12-12-01.

Secretary—

I think they should receive them but feel doubt as to the High Court.

A. T. PRINGLE.
13-12-01.

Honourable Member—

We had better wire and ask Government of India if they object to the resolutions being communicated to the Board of Revenue and High Court as we wish to consult them on this reference. I can't help thinking these resolutions are kept strictly confidential by mistake: meanwhile the order may issue.

C. J. WEIR.
13-12-01.

I agree.

J. T[HOMSON].
16-12-01.

Telegram to the Government of India, Home Department, dated 17th December 1901.

Your letter 526, 27th ultimo. Is there any objection to communicating resolutions [of] Conference enclosed to Board [of] Revenue and High Court as Government desire [to] consult them.

P. T. THARYAN.
17-12-01.

For the Assistant Secretary—

The telegram printed above has been despatched.

The Secretary says that pending receipt of a reply from the Government of India the order may issue, but as the resolutions of the Conference in this matter have to go to the Board and High Court (if at all) with the order, may we not wait for the reply?

P. T. THARYAN.
18-12-01.

Issue to Director of Public Instruction.

C. J. WEIR.
18-12-01.

Telegram from the Government of India, Home Department, dated Calcutta, 2nd January 1902.

No. 1 Education. Your telegram 55, dated 17th December. Government of India have no objection to Board of Revenue and High Court being consulted on their letter 526 of 27th November, but they would prefer that text of resolutions of Educational Conference should not be sent outside Secretariat.

Please see the reply from the Government of India. The order may now go to A | the Board and High Court with the address as altered. Copies of the resolutions have gone to the Director of Public Instruction and copies of two out of the three sets have gone to the Hon'ble Mr. Nicholson. The Director was a member of the Conference and no objection can be raised to his having copies of the resolutions. Should the copies sent to the Hon'ble Mr. Nicholson be recalled?*

* No.
A. T. PRINGLE.
3-1-02.

P. T. THARYAN.
3-1-02.

As at **A**.

A. T. PRINGLE.

H.Ct & Board of Rev. Shd. be consulted

the Director also I presume.

To circulate to H.E. & Hon'ble members.

Cno 1673 Educational Dept.

p 764 18/12/01

Non-confidl.

Sent with a separate confidl. enclosure

A 5-12-01

6.12.01 2.12.01

No. 526

FROM

J. P. HEWETT, ESQ., C.S.I., C.I.E.,

Secretary to the Government of India,

HW 6-12-01

TO

The Secretary to the Govt. of Madras, Educational Department.

764 18-12-01

Home Department.
Education.

ASSISTT SECY TO GOVT & EXT. 21 DEC 1901 INWARD

Calcutta, the 27th *November* 1901.

SIR,

IN continuation of my letter No. 466, dated the 6th Nov/01, I am directed to address the Government of Madras on the subject of Examinations for entry into Government service, and to forward for information a copy of the Resolutions passed by the Educational Conference recently held at Simla relative thereto.

2. In paragraph 7 of his Despatch No. 42-Public (Educational), dated the 5th April 1900, the Secretary of State for India referred to the question how far the system of public instruction in India served the important purpose of providing a class of officials able and willing to render efficient and loyal service to the State. His Lordship observed that there might be some truth in the contention that higher education chiefly attracts aspirants to Government service, and that the disappointment resulting from the number of candidates exceeding the number of posts available for them constitutes a political danger. He went on to mention the argument that the practice of accepting a University degree as a qualification for public employment deprives the Government of the opportunity of fixing its own standard of fitness, and he asked for the opinion of the Government of India on the suggestion that, if separate examinations were held for admission to the public service, the Universities would be relieved of a number of mere office seekers, while the Government would be able to secure a fuller control over the training of its own servants. This portion of the Despatch was circulated in October 1900 for an expression of the views of Local Governments and Administrations, and they were asked to furnish information showing the offices in respect of which the fact that a person has passed the Matriculation Examination of an Indian University or has obtained a degree is either (i) accepted as the sole qualification for employment under Government, or (ii) prescribed as a condition antecedent to his admission to a further test of fitness for the public service. The replies to this reference have now been received, and the various questions raised by the correspondence were very fully discussed at the Educational Conference that recently met at Simla. The information now before the Government of India is complete enough to render it possible to examine the whole subject of the method of making appointments to the public service in its political, educational, and administrative aspects, with reference both to the suggestion mentioned by the Secretary of State, and to the opinions expressed by the Conference; and I am accordingly to address you on the matter.

3. First, as to the political aspect of the question, there seem to be no grounds for believing that the number of persons attracted to the University

merely by the prospect of obtaining Government employment is materially greater than might naturally be expected in a country, where commercial openings are few and imperfectly developed, and where the larger and more profitable undertakings are to a greater extent still in the hands of foreigners Nor is it established that the proportion of Indian graduates, whose expectations of obtaining a Government appointment are disappointed, is as yet large enough to constitute in any sense a political danger. In the case of Madras it is stated that the majority of the University graduates have succeeded in obtaining some kind of employment, and that the alleged political evil has not yet arisen; while in the North-Western Provinces, the Punjab, the Central Provinces, and Burma no mention at all is made of its existence. Even in Bombay, where the elements of political discontent are for historical reasons stronger and less dependent on artificial stimulus than in any other part of India, it is not alleged that the number of unsuccessful graduates is sufficient to create uneasiness, and it is suggested, apparently with some reason, that such discontent as exists may be due to the fact that the winning of University distinctions is followed by imperfect recognition, and that appointments are given indiscriminately to any one who has got a degree. In Bengal there is said to be some discontent, not wholly confined to those who have failed to obtain Government appointments, but this is probably due in the main to the character of the people themselves, who have hitherto shown little aptitude for the industrial pursuits into which the educated classes of Bombay have entered with success. It seems not improbable that the opinion that the unemployed graduate is a source of political danger to India may be an overhasty generalization from what is alleged to be the state of affairs in Bengal.

4. In any case it appears that the evil would be aggravated rather than cured by establishing separate Government examinations for the public service. In no Province could such examinations be conducted on the principle of unrestricted competition, since this would result in giving to one or two classes a virtual monopoly of all the appointments for which they might choose to compete. The test must therefore be a qualifying one, and, although the standard might be fixed high, it is practically certain that the number of candidates who passed would greatly exceed the number of appointments available. Whatever precautionary declarations might be made, the mere fact of Government holding such an examination would be construed as pledging it to provide an appointment of some kind for every candidate who passed; those who failed to obtain appointments would charge the Government with breach of faith; they would have the fullest sympathy from their countrymen; and their grievances would be a source of constant embarrassment. This was in fact the result produced on a small scale by the Native Civil Service Examination established in Bengal by Sir George Campbell some thirty years ago. It satisfied very few, and, although it was soon abolished, the claims which it created continued to give trouble to the Government until they were finally disposed of under the new system introduced in 1890. The character of the examination itself would lend some colour to the discontent which it would cause. It would of necessity apply, not merely a general test but a special test, and, as the North-Western Provinces Government points out, "the sense of failure would be aggravated, as those who did not succeed would be turned adrift less qualified even than at present to command success in other employments." For the same reason again the examination would from the first be regarded with suspicion as an attempt to tamper with higher education, and to mould the thought of the rising generation into forms bearing the stamp of official approval. That such an idea should get abroad—and once started it would spread rapidly—would constitute a far more serious political evil than the existence of a few disappointed graduates whose number might at any moment be reduced if the Universities were to raise their present standards.

5. On the educational side of the subject it may first be observed that the establishment of a separate examination, admittedly as a substitute for, and not merely as supplementary to, the University course, would be inconsistent with the principles now recognized in England in such matters. It is true that in England separate examinations are held for Government appointments, but the necessity for this arises from social and political conditions which do not exist

in India. And of recent years at any rate so far from there being any idea of substituting the Government examinations for University tests and thus relieving the Universities, the tendency has been in the opposite direction. The examinations for the higher kinds of appointments are now held at a comparatively late period with the express object of securing for the service of the State men who have passed through the full University course. In India the institution of a separate examination for Government service, designed to take the place of the University standards, would meet with the strongest opposition from the highest educational authorities, and there is good reason to believe that it would be injurious to the prospects of education itself. The subjects would necessarily differ from those prescribed by the University, and two distinct courses of study would thus exist side by side, only one of which would lead to Government service. If students attempted to compete in both lines, the strain of excessive examinations, already the subject of complaint, would be greatly intensified; while, on the other hand, if the bulk of them were attracted by the prospect of obtaining Government appointments, the result would be a system of universal cramming concentrated upon whatever lines the Government examinations might take, and accompanied by forfeiture of such intellectual improvement as is at present achieved. The Universities themselves would be crippled by the loss of the examination fees which provide a large proportion of their income; and there can be little doubt that many of the affiliated Colleges, and the Schools which feed them, would degenerate into cramming institutions of the worst kind, while those which endeavoured to maintain a high standard would lose many of their pupils. Success in the Government examination would become the sole standard of culture, the influence of the Universities would decline and the value of their degrees would be depreciated, and the main stream of educational effort would be diverted into a narrow and sordid channel Such a degradation of the educational ideals of the country could hardly fail to react upon the character of the public service itself. The improved tone of the native officials of the present day dates from, and is reasonably attributed to, the more extended employment of men who have received a liberal education in the Universities and have imbibed through the influence of their teachers some of the traditions of English public life. It can hardly be supposed that the influence of the professional crammer would tend to maintain these traditions unimpaired.

6. Nor is there any reason to believe that, by introducing its own examinations, the Government would raise the standard of fitness or secure better men for the public service than it obtains under the present system. There is a general consensus of opinion among the Governments consulted that no Examining Board would do better than the Universities. The Madras Government quote with approval the opinion of the Director of Public Instruction that the only tolerably well educated men in the Presidency are from College, and that the best officials are those who have received a University training. Similar testimony comes from Bombay, where, on the two occasions when a competitive examination was held for the Provincial Civil Service, the results are said to have been in conformity with those of the University examinations. It must further be borne in mind that an Examining Board would be an elaborate and expensive organization. The requirements of the different departments of the public service vary greatly; no single examination would meet them all; and there must either be a number of separate examinations, or one examination divided into a number of branches. The work would therefore be heavy; it could not be imposed on officials, in addition to their own duties; and the control, which the Universities now exercise for nothing, would have to be specially paid for, probably at a comparatively high rate. At the same time the responsibility for conducting the complicated process of a series of huge examinations would be shifted from the Universities to Government, which would become the direct object of whatever dissatisfaction was created by the results.

Having thus examined the proposed change of system from several points of view the Governor General in Council is satisfied that it would increase rather than diminish the political danger which it is intended to remedy, that its effect upon the education of the country would be highly prejudicial, and that there would be great administrative difficulty in carrying it out.

7. In considering to what extent effect can be given to the recommendations of the Conference as regards examinations for Government service, it will be convenient to deal first with the higher classes of appointments of which the Provincial Service is a type. These appointments are referred to in Resolutions Nos. 1 and 4. The first of these merely affirms the conclusions set forth in the preceding paragraphs; while the second states the principles recommended for the consideration of Government in making appointments to the higher posts. There appears at present to be considerable variety of practice in different Provinces as regards the extent to which competitive examination is resorted to as a means of selecting candidates. In Madras, for example, admission to the Provincial Service is said to be dependent on the passing of a competitive examination open to none but graduates in Arts. In Bombay competitive examinations seem to have been held only in 1897 and 1900, the results on either occasion merely confirming those of the University examinations. In Bengal half the vacancies in the executive branch of the Provincial Service have, since 1890, been filled by unrestricted competition, the other half being reserved for nomination from among those candidates who have obtained one-third of the maximum number of marks. Appointments to the judicial branch of the service are made by nomination. The Government of the North-Western Provinces and Oudh, on the other hand, "trusts to the educational system of the Province to furnish the necessary guarantee of the educational qualifications of candidates; for the other qualifications requisite it relies on a system of selection combined, in most cases, with further test examinations." In the case of the Provincial Service three Deputy Collectors are annually appointed by competitive examination, but only selected graduates of the Allahabad University are admitted to compete, and the Lieutenant-Governor "does not, at present, see his way to a further extension of competitive examinations." Under the system in force in the Punjab about one-fourth of the vacancies in the executive branch of the Provincial Service are filled by competition among registered candidates selected from those graduates who "have obtained a fairly good position" in the University examinations; while in the judicial branch one-half of the vacancies are reserved for competition. In Burma, the Central Provinces and Assam competitive examinations have not been introduced.

8. Without insisting upon rigid uniformity, the Government of India are of opinion that it is desirable that the system of making appointments to the Government service should proceed, as far as possible, on the same general lines in all Provinces, especially in respect of the extent to which open competition is admitted. The principle of competition for Government appointments was unknown in India until a few years ago; it does not spring from the traditions of the people; and it is without the safeguards by which its operation is controlled in England. In India the well considered exercise of the legitimate patronage of the State is an important function of Government, and ought not to be exclusively or mainly committed to the chances of the examination room merely because unrestricted competition is or has been one of the ideas of the day in a country where the conditions are absolutely different. By abdicating this function the Government no doubt saves itself trouble, but it also deprives itself of the power of allotting its patronage equitably among the different races and religions, of rewarding loyal service, and of securing the men best fitted to fill particular posts. It seems to the Governor General in Council that some Governments have already gone too far in this direction, and that greater attention is required to the principles laid down by the Conference. In the present state of Collegiate education in India it is clear that all subjects which form part of either general or special education are sufficiently well taught by the Universities to make it possible in the majority of cases for the Government to accept the various forms of University degrees and distinctions as indicating that their holders possess the amount of knowledge *primâ facie* requisite to enable them to fill particular appointments. In most, if not in all, cases, they will also have to master the laws, rules and regulations of the particular department in which they will be employed, but this knowledge can in all probability most profitably be acquired during a period of probation at the close of which it could be tested by a searching examination, continued failure in which would be visited by forfeiture of the appointment. It does not appear to be

essential that the special knowledge, which is of advantage only in a particular career, should be acquired in a theoretical fashion before it is needed for use, nor that it should be tested by a separate examination before appointment. Government may even itself be the loser by insisting upon this; since there are grounds for believing that some of the best men who leave the Universities are deterred from entering the executive branch of the Provincial Service by their reluctance to undergo an extra and arduous examination, involving another year of hard study, on the chance of getting a good appointment, and possibly also by their inability to support themselves after their University scholarships have expired.

9. I am accordingly to invite the special attention of the Governor in Council to the Resolutions that were passed by the Conference on this subject, and to ask in what manner, and to what extent the Government of Madras think it desirable or possible to give effect to the abolition of competitive examinations as the qualifying test for the higher grades of appointments. In considering the question of their elimination or reduction the following suggestions may appropriately be borne in mind:—

(1) Appointments might be made by selection on the basis of University degrees and distinctions, or of equivalent educational qualifications.

(2) The standard of educational qualifications need not, and probably cannot, be the same for the several races and classes from which it is desirable to recruit; and different standards would require to be laid down, though not necessarily published, for Hindus, Muhammadans, Europeans, and Eurasians, and probably also for natives, whether Hindus or Muhammadans, of the comparatively backward parts of a Province, such as Orissa and Behar in Bengal, Sind in Bombay, and so on.

(3) Within the limits of each standard, regard would be paid to the comparative value of the educational qualifications attained, so that, other things being equal, a graduate in honours should be preferred to a pass-man, and a pass-man of a higher division to one of a lower division.

(4) Value would be attached to the recorded opinions of collegiate and school authorities regarding the proficiency and conduct of candidates during their school and college career.

These are the principles that should probably underlie the substitution to any marked extent of selection for competition. In what degree, if adopted, they should be supplemented by examinations, directed to the special circumstance of an office or a department, is a matter upon which the Government of Madras are invited to report, bearing in mind the general desire of the Government of India to reduce the examination evil in this country.

10. As regards the middle grades of Government service, the Conference considered that the School Final Examination should, in ordinary circumstances, provide a convenient test, and the Governor General in Council is disposed to accept this recommendation. In order to enable the test to be applied with discrimination the certificate of having passed the examination should state the marks obtained in various subjects, and there should be attached to it a certificate by the headmaster of the school regarding the conduct and amenability to discipline of the candidate during his school career. There may however be cases, such as that of Police Sub-Inspectors, in which it would be of advantage to constitute an advisory committee for the purpose of examining qualifications and reporting to the head of the department with whom the final decision would rest.

11. In the case of the lower grades of the Government service the recommendation that school certificates of proficiency and conduct should be accepted in lieu of examinations as a qualification for Government service is a necessary consequence of the recommendation that inspections *in situ* should take the

place of public examinations below the standard of the School Final Examination. Inspections or departmental examinations *in situ* will be directed rather to ascertaining the general efficiency of the school than to testing *seriatim* the degree of knowledge acquired by each and all of the pupils, and, as a rule, the Inspectors who conduct them will not grant certificates of having passed a given standard to individual pupils. It might, however, be arranged that at such inspections the certificates of proficiency and conduct prepared by the head-master for the pupils who have completed their studies should be brought up, and endorsed by the Inspector after testing the attainments of the recipients. Such an arrangement would probably tend to keep the schools up to the mark and would add materially to the value of the certificates.

12. The attention of the Local Government is invited to those Resolutions of the Conference which relate to a knowledge of the vernacular in relation to the Public Service. These Resolutions are heartily endorsed by the Government of India.

I have the honour to be,

SIR,

Your most obedient Servant,

A. Arbuthnot

Offg. Secretary to the Govt. of India.

2 6

9

brought up and endorsed by the inspector after testing the attainments of the recipients. Such an arrangement would probably tend to keep the schools up to the mark and would add materially to the value of the certificates.

12. The attention of the local Government is invited to those resolutions of the conference which relate to a knowledge of the vernacular in relation to the public service. These resolutions are heartily endorsed by the Government of India.

ORDER—No. 764, Educational, dated 18th December 1901.

Communicated to the Board of Rev & to the Director of Public Instruction for report.

2/8 The Governor in Council ~~will be glad to receive remarks from~~ desires to be favored with the suggestions & opinion of the Honourable the Judges of the High Court ~~and from the Board of Revenue~~ in this matter.

~~(True Extract.)~~

A.S. 16.12.1

~~Asst. Secretary to Government.~~

To the Honourable the Chief Justice, with C.L.,
" Board of Revenue (Land Revenue), ~~with one enclosure.~~
" Director of Public Instruction, with one enclosure.

Despd in MSS. 9/1/02

18/12

12-12-01

18/12/1

Notes connected with GO no 764 Ed d 18-12-01 [Subject: Exam. for admission to the public service]. From the G of I. no 526 Education d 27-11-01

Note.

As Govt. cannot very well "request" Secrett depts. of their own to make "remarks", & as general circulation to all heads of depts. is not desirable & will cause delay & a deal ~~of paper~~ of writing, it is proposed to issue the draft above & then to send the order unofficially to all depts. of the Secretariat, with suggestion that if any heads of depts. have to be consulted, such e.g. as the Inspector General of Police, that should be done at once. The remarks of the Secretariat depts themselves will be invited (& will most conveniently be given) when the matter is taken up after receipt of the report by the D.P.I. & the H.C's & Rev. Bd's remarks.

11.12.01 A.S.

3

Cr Secy

Yes. I think the above proposal will be the best for getting the matter ready for disposal within a reasonable time. What are we to do about para. 12. We can't I suppose send outside the Office the Resolutions of the Conference. The Bd & H. Ct are sure to ask what they are on this subject.

C.F.W.
12.12.07

For the A.S.

Should not the Board and High Court get copy of the resolutions of the conference? There seems to be no objection to send it to them.

12/12/07

Secy I think they should receive them but feel doubt as to the H.C.

A.S.
13.12

H.M.

We had better wire & ask Govt of India if they object to the Resolutions being communicated to the Bd of Rev. & H. Ct as we wish to consult them on this reference. I can't help thinking these Resolutions are kept strictly confidential by mistake. Meanwhile the order may issue.

J.W.
13.12.07

Tel[illegible] to 16.12.07

First copy sent to Press.

Returned for signature.

Despatched in print.

NUMBER OF COPIES REQUIRED. { Order complete. 80 / Letter only. / Order complete with Letter.

READ AGAIN G.O., No. 190 . DATED

60

Print with notes & show first

3-1-07

CURRENT NO.

ENCLOSURES TO C.NO.

ORDER OF GOVERNMENT.

LETTER OF GOVERNMENT.

STATEMENT WITH DITTO.

PAPERS NOT FILED UP, BEING MEANT FOR DESPATCH IN ORIGINAL.

N.B.—

A = Print in full.
B = Not to be printed.
P = Print abstract only.
Q = Print heading only.